

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 1

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:02.

The House Chairperson Ms M G Boroto took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, the first item ... Ubaba Dlamini and the others, please mute. We are about to start the session. Please mute your gadgets.

Everyone, check your gadgets and mute it. Thank you. The first item on the Order Paper is Members' Statements. Any member of the ANC wishing to make a statement? Are you ready? Rre Mmutle ...

MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

**DEPLOYMENT OF SANDF BY THE PRESIDENT TO DEAL WITH ILLEGAL
MINING**

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 2

(Member's Statement)

Mr T N MMUTLE (ANC): House Chair, the ANC supports the decision by President Cyril Ramaphosa to deploy 3300 members of the SA National Defence Force in co-operation with the SA Police Service to conduct an intensified anti-criminality operation against illegal mining across all provinces in the country from 28 October this year, until 28 April next year.

The President wrote to Speaker of the National Assembly and the Chairperson of the NCOP, Mr Amos Masondo last week, indicating the deployment of the army. In the past 12 months, the country has witnessed an increase in incidents where illegal miners held communities at ransom, committing various violent crimes including murder, rape, and instances where underground gas explosions caused damage to infrastructure.

They are serious criminal activities that the government views in the most serious light, which threatens our national security and thus needs serious intervention.

DEPUTY CHIEF JUSTICE'S IMAGE USED ON AN ANC ELECTION POSTER

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 3

Adv G BREYTENBACH (DA): Hon House Chairperson, on Saturday morning, the 18 November, the first day of the registration weekend, I received a message containing the image of our Deputy Chief Justice, Justice Mandisa Maya, in her constitutional court robes displayed brazenly on an ANC election poster encouraging people to register to vote for the ANC.

Initially, I thought this was a joke, a fake poster. I thought no one would be so brazenly crass as to abuse the image of such an important officer bearer in our constitutional democracy. Contacting the Deputy Chief Justice, she confirmed that she had not authorised the use of her image and also expressed deep shock and concern. But then the ANC took the image down and apologised, thereby admitting culpability for this most egregious abuse.

By compiling and disseminating this truly shocking image, they have successfully undermined - not only the personal and professional integrity of Justice Maya who spent a lifetime building a ... [Inaudible.] ... reputation - but they have reputably damaged the integrity and credibility of the entire judiciary. This demonstrates a total inability to grasp the concept of the separation of powers and the need for a

credible an independent judiciary. You have exposed yourselves. Shame on you! I thank you.

THE COMMUNITY OF NCORA-QUMANCO FIGHT FOR THEIR LAND

(Member's Statement)

Ms N V MENTE (EFF): Hon House Chair...

IsiXhosa:

... le ngxelo yeyabantu baseNcora abaathathelwa umhlaba ngabantu abafuna ukuwuba.

English:

The of Land Restitution Programme was enacted in 1994. Its purpose was to restore the rights to land of black people back to them. The purpose was never to subject our people to further dispossession by a democratic state. Sadly, the department responsible for land restitution in the Eastern Cape has allowed people with nefarious intentions to use this programme to pursue their own selfish needs. The Ncora-Qumanco community in the Eastern Cape is subject to this phenomenon of thuggery.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 5

A group of people assisted by the Deputy Minister Mcebisi Skwatsha, lodged a land claim that excluded many community members using their names without their consent. They received cash compensation with the total value exceeding R200 million. Now, this very same group of people is intending on registering all land in the community as a Communal Property Association, CPA, including land that belongs to the people who are not party to this nefarious claim.

The department has confirmed that they will register all the land under the CPA despite the dispute raised by many community members. Now community members are subjected to raise money for lawyers in order to fight a democratic government. The department is allowing rogue community members to use law and the Land Reform Programme to steal.

IsiXhosa:

Abantu baseNcora bathi isekhona iEFF asokuze babelwe umhlaba.

[Kwaphela ixesha.]

THE ANC WELCOMES RESULTS OF THE QUARTERLY LABOUR FORCE SURVEY

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 6

Mr B A RADEBE (ANC): Hon House Chairperson, the ANC is pleased with the results of the Quarterly Labour Force Survey which suggests that the economy is gradually recovering and starting to create jobs. The report indicates that the number of employed persons increased by 399 000 to 16,7 million in the third quarter of 2023, compared to 16,3 million in the second quarter of 2023. Meanwhile, the number of unemployed people decreased by 72 000 to 7,8 million during the same quarter.

The slight but notable increase in employment and decrease in unemployment rates reflect our government's concerted efforts to address the challenge of unemployment in the country. The results are a testament to the collaborative efforts of the public and private sectors, as well as the hard work and dedication of our citizens. They underscore the progress we are making as a nation in addressing unemployment and fostering employment growth. I thank you, Chair.

ALARMING RISE IN MALARIA CASES AND INCREASING DEATH TOLL

(Member's Statement)

Ms M D HLENGWA (IFP): Hon House Chairperson, I stand before you today on behalf of the IFP to draw urgent attention in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 7

alarming rise in malaria cases and increasing death toll as we approach the summer season. This matter demands our collective focus, swift action and united effort to mitigate the impact of our communities. As the temperatures rise and the summer season approaches, so does the threat of malaria. The recent surge in cases and the unfortunate loss of life serves as a stark reminder of the challenges we face.

The IFP expresses deep concern about the adequacy of our preventive measures, public awareness campaign and the overall readiness of our health infrastructure to combat these seasonal ... [Inaudible.] ... It is disheartening that despite the advancement of medical science and the availability of effective intervention, we find ourselves grappling with a surge in malaria cases. We call upon the relevant authorities to intensify effort to cap the spread of malaria. This includes ... [Inaudible.] ... preventing, ... [Inaudible.] ... such as widespread distribution. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Afrikaans:

Me T BREEDT: Die Departement van Landbou is besig om ons pluimveeboere te versak. Die departement wil die indruk wek dat die jongste uitbraak van voëlgriep, wat sedert April van die jaar die industrie teister, onder beheer is. Dit het tot

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 8

in 'n portefeuljekomitee rapporteer dat die aantal infeksies afneem. Dit is egter voor die hand liggend dat die getalle af sal neem, want daar is nie meer voëls oor wat kan aansteek nie.

In gesprekke met 'n aantal boere oor die siekte en die hantering van die siekte deur onder andere die department, is daar groot kommer uitgespreek en is daar talle vrae wat steeds onbeantwoord is.

'n Groot bekommernis is die feit dat staatsveeartseny kronies onderbeman is, en nie die nodige hulpbronne tot hulle beskikking het, om suksesvol die talle krisisse wat tans ervaar word aan te spreek nie.

Ook word daar buitensporige maatreëls daargestel, wat geweldige finansiële implikasies op boere het. Dit lei tot grootskaalse afname van pluimveeboere, omdat hul doodeenvoudig nie meer kan bekostig om aan te hou boer nie. Die lei weer op sy beurt na verhoogde werkloosheid.

En al wie ryker word is die invoerders en die buiteland van wie ons nou hoenders en eiers moet invoer. Nog 'n leemte is

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 9

dat die riglyne vir die kul van pluimvee nie die nuutste navorsing in ag neem nie en ook teenstrydig is.

Daar moet duidelikheid kom oor die tipe toetse wat aanvaar word oor die opskorting van kwarantyn, oor inentingstoestande waaronder dit toegelaat sal word, en die implikasies op handel.

Agb Minister, hoe gaan jy verseker dat die industrie herstel en herbou word? Ek dank u.

**THE STABBING OF A CAPE PENINSULA UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY
STUDENT AND THE MURDER OF A SIBANYE-STILLWATER EMPLOYEE**

(Member's Statement)

Ms Z A KOTA-MPEKO (ANC): House Chair, the ANC condemns two heinous crimes that shocked the country. The ANC learned with shock the two barbaric incidents that happened recently which left many citizens traumatized. On the first incident, a 30-year-old Ntembeko Mvalo who is a student at the University of Western Cape entered the private residence of the neighbouring institution, the Cape Peninsula University of Technology,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 10

armed with two knives and stabbed his wife 11 times in full view of other students.

We applaud the police for their swift action, which led to the arrest of Ntembeko Mvalo, who according to the video footage, was merciless and barbaric in committing the crime against his spouse. We welcome the bold step taken by the University of the Western Cape to suspend him from its premises.

The second incident was that of an employee at Sibanye-Stillwater in Westonaria, who stabbed his colleague to death. Thereafter, took a selfie next to his body with his stomach tore open and intestines left exposed. We are deeply shocked by these senseless and barbaric incidents that left the country horrified and in disbelief.

We call upon citizens to refrain from capturing sensitive and horrific incidents of this nature and circulate pictures and videos on social media. They must think of those families involved. Thank you.

Afrikaans:

Mnr L J BASSON: Voorsitter, dit is skandelik hoe die ANC se Dr. Ruth Segomotsi Mompoti Distriksmunisipaliteit

belastingbetalers se geld mors, om ANC-kaders te bevoordeel. Terwyl mense wat in die Naledi, Greater Taung, Kagisano-Molopo Mamusa, Lekwa-Teemane Plaaslike Munisipaliteite woon, elke dag sukkel om 'n drupel skoon drinkwater te kry, deur slaggate moet ry, se huise oorstrom word met rou ruool, het die distriksmunisipaliteit besluit om R38 miljoen aan 'n shack call centre in Vryburg te spandeer. Tot op datum bly die R38 miljoen shack call centre gesluit, soortgelyk aan die lewering van dienste regdeur die distrik.

In plaas daarvan om die R38 miljoen te gebruik het om water en sanitasie te verbeter, het die ANC besluit om belastingbetalers se geld te mors, om die sakke van ANC-kaders te vul.

Die DA en die SIU versoek om hierdie onreëlmatige en vrugtelose uitgawe te ondersoek en elke sent wat aan hierdie nuttelose oproepsentrum bestee is, terug te eis.

Ons word oorval met kiesers wat na die DA stroom, om die ANC volgende jaar uit regering te stem en 'n DA-geleide regering te kies, wat water en sanitasie sal lewer en nie geld sal mors nie. Dankie.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 12

WORLD CHILDREN'S DAY

(Member's Statement)

Mr N L S KWANKWA (UDM): House Chair, yesterday we commemorated World Children's Day, a global initiative promoting children's rights, safety, education, health and happiness.

Unfortunately, it comes during a year where Israel's war on Gaza has turned Gaza into a graveyard for children with the death toll of at least 5 500 children since 07 October. The World Children's Day is null and void in Gaza and many parts of the world where innocent children are being killed every day.

Unfortunately, in every war around the world children continue to pay every price. In the Ukraine-Russia war over 1 500 children were killed and injured. During the Tigray War in Ethiopia at least 33 000 children were severely malnourished and faced eminent death without any help. In Sudan armed conflict more than 445 children were subjected to the most inhumane atrocities, and not to mention that 5 700 children were killed and maimed in Afghanistan. Impunity for crimes against children must end as they undermine the UN Security

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 13

Council seeks grave violations against children during armed conflict.

We call on the international community in particular to make sure that all those who commit crimes against children are prosecuted and that sanctions are imposed on countries that mercilessly murder women during the times of conflict, whether it is in Gaza, whether it is in Ukraine and whether it happens in Tigray in Ethiopia. Thank you.

BANKS IN RAND MANIPULATION

(Member's Statement)

Mr M J MASWANGANYI (ANC): House Chair, banks are accused of generating trillions in alleged rand manipulation. The ANC welcomes the decision by the Competition Commission to refer a collusion case by some of the banks to the Competition Tribunal for prosecution. It is believed that the 2013 cartel made a trillion rand a day due to price fixing and market allocation by the 28 local and international banks. They have been accused of contravening section 41(b) of the Competition Act in that they've manipulated the US\$ and the ZAR currency

pair, and that they've divided markets and allocated customers.

Five of the 28 banks have admitted to taking part in the alleged foreign exchange manipulation and others preferred to appeal. The UK headquartered Standard Chartered Bank is the second bank to have entered into a settlement agreement with the Competition Commission. Citibank paid an administrative penalty of R69,5 million in March 2017, while Barclays Capital and Absa were co-operating with the commission to be granted leniency.

Xitsonga:

Ndza khensa, Mutshamaxitulu.

**MOQHAKA LOCAL MUNICIPALITY RESIDENTS RECEIVE BULK
INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECT AND TITLE DEEDS**

(Member's Statement)

Mr M M Z MMEMEZI (ANC): House Chairperson, the ANC welcomes the recent launch of a R430 million bulk infrastructure project and the handing over of 445 title deeds at Moqhaka Local Municipality in the Free State by the Minister of Human

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 15

Settlements and the Premier of the Free State. The bulk infrastructure project for Maokeng Extension 10 and Extension 13 will yield 5 300 serviced stands to benefit locals. This also includes sites for public amenities like schools and recreational facilities.

The Minister and the Premier also interacted with communities on service delivery interventions and cautioning contractors who do not finish their work and leave projects incomplete. Following the launch of the project, the delegation proceeded to Constantia Hall in Kroonstad's Maokeng Township and handed over 435 title deeds to the rightful beneficiaries. This is part of a campaign by the Department of Human Settlements to give back dignity by fast-tracking the issuing of title deeds to the rightful owners. The ANC would like to remind citizens that title deeds are not a licence to sell government-subsidised houses. A title deed is proof of ownership of an asset that must be handed over to future generations. Thank you, Chair.

WESTERN CAPE THIRD QUARTER LABOUR FORCE SURVEY

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 16

Dr M J CARDO (DA): Chairperson, we welcome the fact that yet again the DA-run Western Cape has the lowest unemployment rates of all the provinces according to the Quarterly Labour Force Survey for Quarter 3 of 2023 released last week by the Statistic SA. At 20,2% on the strict definition, the Western Cape unemployment rate is 11,7% points lower than the national equivalence. On an expanded definition, the Western Cape's unemployment rate is half that of the ANC-run North West province.

Over the past year, the DA-run Western Cape contributed 305 000 jobs to the South African economy. That amount to almost one third of the nation's net employment gains. Truly, the DA-run Western Cape is the engine room of employment. It is the country's factory floor. That is because where the DA governs, we create enabling environment that helps to grow the economy and allows businesses to create jobs. It distinguishes the DA governance from the ANC's misrule. The DA opportunity and prosperity contrasting with the ANC's cronyism and collapse. In the next year's elections voters have a golden opportunity to make their mark for the DA governance nationally and in other provinces. It is a chance to rescue South Africa from the ANC and to fire up the engine of job creation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 17

STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE CALL MINISTER OF FINANCE

(Member's Statement)

Mr M MANYI (EFF): House Chairperson, today in the Standing Committee on Finance, we the EFF requested the committee to summon the Minister of Finance, and not the Acting Minister, to account for the rand manipulation. The Minister of Finance must come back from leave unless if it is for medical reasons, hon Radebe, and invites the SA Reserve Bank, the Banking Association South Africa, Basa, and the Competition Commission to come to tell us what the government is doing about the currency crime manipulation in this country.

We are happy that the committee agreed that this request be processed this particular Friday. The committee is very serious about this matter. We will not accept a junior delegation from either the National Treasury or the Reserve Bank. We don't want a mere technocrat, we want answers from the executive authority and to account for this thievery. The reprehensible conduct of currency manipulation amounts to treason, and it is treacherous. It undermines our economy and forms part of a greater scourge of illicit financial flows.

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 18

The fact that the National Treasury and the former Minister of Finance Mr Tito Mboweni treated this matter as a small matter and went as far as trying to protect those involved, should concern all of us. People are making billions upon billions if not trillions through corruption and financial crimes. Once again no one is responsible ... [Time expired.] ... because the banks act as law unto themselves.

BREED VALLEY RECEIVES WORLD-CLASS BATTERY SYSTEM

(Member's statement)

Dr J C NTWANE (ANC): House Chairperson, electricity is a prerequisite these days for a decent life for all of us. The ANC therefore welcomes the launch of Eskom's Hex battery energy storage system, Bess, in the Western Cape's Breede Valley, Worcester. This is a world-class facility, recently launched by the Minister of Public Enterprises, which will allow Eskom to store excess power for use during peak demand.

The Hex site is specifically designed to store 100MWh of energy, enough to power a medium sized town for five hours.

The transformation that is now under way at Eskom, which will see the creation of three wholly owned subsidiaries –

generation, transmission and distribution – demonstrates the ANC government's determination to resolve the energy crisis.

The Bess project is proof that as South Africans, we are capable of innovative and world-class solutions. Thank you, Chair.

VISUALLY IMPAIRED LEARNERS RECEIVE ATTENTION

(Member's Statement)

Ms N G ADOONS (ANC): Chairperson, the visually impaired children across Nelson Mandela Bay received a boost recently with the donation of assistive devices valued at R1 million. We welcome this initiative as it would make studying and classroom participation much easier for these learners. These low vision devices included electronic calculators, dictaphones, talking calculators, large print calculators, three laptops with specialised software and specialised keyboards.

Low vision applies to all individuals with sight who are unable to read the newspaper at a normal viewing distance, even with the aid of glasses or contact lenses. Low vision

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 20

pupils use a combination of vision and other senses to learn, though they may require adaptations in lighting or the size of the print. This is the Eastern Cape Department of Education's second roll-out of assistive devices following last year's pilot project. The 2023 recipients come from a variety of schools across all quintiles. As the we hope that more schools step up in identifying children with visual impairments and provide similar assistance. I thank you, hon House Chair.

THE ANC WELCOMES RESULTS OF THE QUARTERLY LABOUR FORCE SURVEY

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF EMPLOYMENT AND LABOUR: Chairperson, the quarterly labour force survey does assist a great deal in helping the government monitor the impact that our interventions and initiatives are making in denting the unemployment challenge that the country is faced with.

Chairperson, it's a fact that telling progress in the fight against stubborn unemployment will be realised when the country's economy is performing well. With all our programmes, we are doing everything to ensure that we fight this scourge. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 21

GOVERNMENT LOSING THE BATTLE WITH AVIAN FLU NEGATIVELY
AFFECTING THE AGRICULTURAL SECTOR

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, LAND REFORM AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: House Chairperson, thanks to the hon members for their Members Statements.

I would like to respond to the one by hon Breedt on the Avian flu. Just to indicate that we have contained the disease, we are now busy with the cleaning of the facilities, working with the affected farmers.

We will be reporting to the Office International des Epizooties, OIE, (now called World Organisation for Animal Health, WOAHA) the animal health standards setting body, internationally, that we are now free so that it can allow for imports or exports of those who are interested.

With regard to the vaccine, we have indeed looked at the request that was made by the industry for the registration of the vaccine for the N7 and N5.

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 22

With regard to the evaluation that was done, there was not enough documentation for the registration of the N7 vaccine. And it's a matter that, with the industry, we have been working on to look at the possibilities for vaccination and what are the possible risks in doing so.

I want to assure hon Breedts that in every step that government is taking in managing animal diseases in this country we have always worked with the farmers, with the agri-businesses that are involved, together with the private veterinary services that some of the farmers employ. Thank you very much, House Chair.

ALARMING RISE IN MALARIA CASES AND INCREASING DEATH TOLL

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Chairperson, let me thank the hon Hlengwa for raising the issue of malaria ... firstly that the recent reports about malaria were not necessarily in relation to recent outbreaks, it was a report from Gauteng province. They were merely highlighting the risk and they were detailing the incidents and fatalities from malaria over a period of a number of years.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 23

As it is currently, we can say that South Africa ... while we have in three provinces, that's Limpopo, Mpumalanga and the northern part of KwaZulu-Natal, have endemic districts in terms of malaria. We are not really in a very endangered situation. Nevertheless, we still take precautions.

We are committed to the elimination of malaria and we are working with our colleagues in the provinces, but also working with neighbours because there's no way in which we can eradicate malaria when we only do the spraying against the venomous mosquitoes only in South Africa. So, we are working with our neighbours: Zimbabwe, Mozambique, Botswana to some extent, but largely also with eSwatini in this regard.

So, we are very grateful for also the support which we receive from the World Health Organization, WHO, also from the global fund, in terms of making sure that we can eliminate.

So, our target, we remain on course that at the latest, by 2030, but we also envisage that even as close by 2025 we could be in a position to eradicate malaria and we are very optimistic because some of the districts are very, very close, in terms of the elimination of malaria.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 24

The advice to all South Africans is, especially when you travel during the holidays in the rainy season into the eastern part of our country, the northern part of Limpopo, Mpumalanga and the northern KwaZulu-Natal; and if you are traveling also to our neighbouring countries in the east and in the north, please make sure that you take precaution in terms of the prevention of malaria.

But thanks to the hon member for raising this matter. Thank you very much, hon Chairperson.

DEPUTY CHIEF JUSTICE'S IMAGE USED ON AN ANC ELECTION POSTER

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: Hon Chairperson, thank you very much for the opportunity. The ANC, as per the statement of hon Breytenbach, had withdrawn and apologised unreservedly to the Deputy Chief Justice, which has restored the integrity and the dignity of the Deputy Chief Justice and judiciary as a whole.

The ANC has demonstrated, over years, respect for the institutions of the rule of law, for the judiciary and for all

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 25

Chapter 9 Institutions of the country. It cannot be judged on only one error of judgement, that has since been corrected and been dispatched unreservedly as an apology to the people of South Africa.

The ANC has always anchored its programmes, also its political posture on the rule of law, respect for the Constitution and all the institutions that support constitutional democracy.

It is against this background, hon House Chair, that the ANC continue to support a programme of constitutional democracy in a democratic South Africa, and it withdrew that statement.

We, therefore, want to welcome that initiative by the ANC in this House to withdraw and unreservedly apologise, which is a sign of respecting and also its intentions that has been very clear to restore the integrity and the dignity of the judiciary and the trust that the people of South Africa have in the Constitution as the supreme law of the Republic of South Africa. Thank you very much, hon House Chairperson.

THE COMMUNITY OF NCORA-QUMANCO FIGHT FOR THEIR LAND

(Minister's Response)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 26

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, LAND REFORM AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (Mr M Skwatsha): Chairperson, I would like to respond to the statement raised by hon Mente of the EFF. I want to indicate that it might be necessary to inform hon Mente that Certified Public Accountants, CPAs, are registered and considered complaint by the Office of the Director-General in the Republic of South Africa, not by any Minister or Deputy Minister. And, therefore, I have no capacity and ability to register CPAs or members of CPAs as such.

I, therefore, also want to indicate that the portion of land the hon member is referring is part of the restitution process that was launched by Mr Zamayedwa Msefo on 11 December 1998, according to the prescribed laws and the portion of land that Mr Zamayedwa was claiming is called the Ncora Irrigation Scheme.

I, lastly, want to indicated that Ncora is an area that is an ideal one because in spite of all the conflicts around CPAs, it is an area where the Chairperson is deputised by the Chief of the area, Chief Zanemvula.

It is an ideal area and I had an opportunity to go and address a very unified huge meeting in the area of Ncora. If there are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 27

any disputes, disputes are dealt with, not by the Deputy Minister, but proper and wide consultation was undertaken in respect of the claim as mentioned by hon Mente.

I am still at the disposal of the hon member, to assist her in trying to resolve any matter that might be problematic. But the claims are really unfounded and unfortunate. I thank you, hon Chair.

**NORTH WEST GOVERNMENT FAILING TO SUPPLY THE PROVINCE WITH
WATER**

(Minister's Response)

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION (Mr D M Mahlobo):
Chairperson, I want to thank hon Basson. We are all concerned about municipalities, about their ability to perform certain functions, hence our decision to support them.

Working with the provincial government of North West there is a programme of Bulela Metsi, and the areas that we are referring to, last week Minister Mchunu was on the ground with the Mayors there. We were able to intervene, especially the community of Dinokana, in terms of our processes and in terms

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 28

of the infrastructure that must be rolled out, especially by Magalies.

What I don't agree with hon Basson on, Madam Chair, I don't agree with the insinuation to say is because of the ANC and cadre deployment because hon Basson knows well that water knows no boundaries, it knows no ideology. To start to claim easy victories as per his political party that has claimed that there is cadre deployment, when there's a concrete evidence that themselves they have people that they've employed and certain municipalities in their jurisdiction or control, they are failing dismally. One example is the capital city where we are right now, we're in the Minister of Water Affairs, for the first time we're working well with your Mayor there. We are helping, because that's what we do. We know that politically there are elections around the country and the provincial head of your party has chosen to make water an issue, but please don't throw stones when you live in a glass house. Ours, well deliver water as directed by President, and we'll leave nobody behind. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, I want to hear the people on the platform, please. You can't be shouting like that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 29

Hon member ... yes, Nazier?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chairperson, I think you must get someone to go to that Minister, where he is now and do a breathalyser test because he doesn't sound ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Oh, the sound?

Mr M N PAULSEN: No, he sounds drunk.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): What is it?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You see? You are getting out of hand ... [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: He sounds drunk ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I can't hear you ... [Interjections.] ... wait ...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... absolutely talking nonsense ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 30

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): ... let me hear what the hon member is saying.

What are you saying, hon ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... he is talking nonsense, this hon member, he doesn't need to heard, he's drunk himself ...

Mr M N PAULSEN: That Minister is ... his words are slurring ... [Interjections.] ... that Deputy Minister's words are slurring ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You are the one who is drunk ...

Mr M N PAULSEN: So, I think you must ... [Inaudible.] ... sober ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): ... [Inaudible.] ... in front of you. Your member is speaking, I can't hear him.

What are you saying, hon member?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 31

Mr M N PAULSEN: House Chair, he sounds ... his words are slurring and he doesn't sound very sober ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Or is it because of the connections, you think? But we did hear him ...

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: He doesn't even drink, for that matter. You stupid ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): ... it's fine. No, don't worry about that, I think it's fixed ...

[Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: He looks drunk. He looks dru ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): ... no, it's fine ...

[Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: ... I think he's drunk ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): ... it's fine, hon Mahlobo.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 32

Adv M R M MOTHAPO: Hon Chair, I rise in terms of Rule 84.

Where hon member used foul language against Deputy Minister to say he's drunk. He has to withdraw!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Oh, did he say that?

Adv M R M MOTHAPO: Yes!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, did you ...

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, he said so. He must withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay. Please, members. you are now making noise.

Hon Nazier, did you say that? [Interjections.] No, wait.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I said he sounds drunk. I said he sounds drunk.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No. Hon Nazier, please ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 33

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Don't lie, tell the truth

...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): ... withdraw!

Mr M N PAULSEN: I said he sounds drunk ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Ya [Yes], please withdraw!

Mr M N PAULSEN: Okay, he doesn't sound drunk.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, no, no. Withdraw! Withdraw!

Mr M N PAULSEN: [Laughter.] Okay. I said I withdraw. He doesn't sound drunk.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, no, don't talk. Just say I withdraw, please!

Mr M N PAULSEN: Okay, I withdraw.

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 34

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. and don't do that. That is not right.

Hon members, let's respect one another. Let's not make this a playground.

LEARNING MADE EASIER FOR VISUALLY IMPAIRED PUPILS

(Minister's Response)

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chair, as the Department of Basic Education we are prioritising our special schools with the devices because they are very expensive and we said anyone who wants to come and help us, let them start with our special schools because they need tailor-made devices for individual purposes.

So, we want to appreciate what the Department of Education in the Eastern Cape is doing, and we encourage all provinces to say 'let's start with our learners with special needs and the primary schools' so that when they go up to higher grades, to the secondary school, they are already used to these devices and they are already used to the Information and Communications Technology, ICT, and we want to really

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 35

appreciate what the Department of Education in the Eastern Cape is doing. Thank you very much, House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I'm going to use ... I know that we have seven responses but because there's another hand and it's important for information, today I'm using my discretion and allowing the last hand.

Hon Deputy Minister Bapela! Deputy Minister Bapela!

[Interjections.]

Oh, you realised seven have spoken. You withdraw?

[Interjections.] It's fine. I was going to allow you to respond because information is key. Thank you very much.

Hon members, all the seven Ministerial Responses have been done and now we proceed, and that concludes that process of Ministerial Responses.

STATEMENT BY THE MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY ON THE CENSUS 2022

RESULTS

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Madam House Chair; Chief Whip of the Majority Party; Members of the National Assembly;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 36

ladies and gentlemen, the National Statistics Agency plays an important role in the life of any nation in that no nation country can plan and implement its programmes without empirical evidence.

In our case Statistics SA provides such a source of statistical information which helps to know the progress we are making, as well as which areas need attention. Statistics SA has continued in this regard to conduct censuses and sample surveys to keep the nation informed. Census 2022 has become the fourth undertaking under the democratic dispensation to give us a snapshot of how far we have come. On the occasion of the launch of the results of the first ever census under the democratic order on 20 October 1998, President Nelson Mandela on accepting the results said, then him referring to the census 1996 results:

They show a society which had enormous basic needs to be met, whether it be in terms of access to clean water, electricity, telephones or schooling. By measuring the extent of deprivation in October 1996, the results provide us with benchmarks against which our performance, as government and nation, should be measured year by year.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 37

The census 2022 data show how the governing party has fulfilled its promise of a better life for all. Our government's policies and programmes have had positive impacts. We have achieved significant progress in addressing the historical inequalities and although we still face many challenges, we are confident that we are on course to realise the vision of our beloved founding father. The census data clearly proves that our development is not accidental, it is the result of deliberate government interventions since 1994.

The census data reveal how education opportunities have increased over the years. According to Census 2022 Report 3,4 million children aged between zero and four years attended early childhood development, ECD, programmes in 2022 of which 2,5 million attended a crèche or an educare center. Between 1996 and 2022, school attendance for children aged five years and six years increased to almost universal level. More people aged five and 24 are attending educational institutions at 73,4% in 2022. More people are also finishing high school and pursuing higher education.

In 2022, 37,6% of people aged 20 and above had completed secondary education compared to only 16,3% in 1996. This shows a growing interest and investment in education and skills

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 38

development for the future. Gender equality is another aspect of progress that the census data highlights. We are accessing more education and help. Women are accessing more education and healthcare - when I say we it is because I am a woman. In 2011, over 3 million people aged 20 and older had a chosen field of education and this number has increased to 5,2 million in 2022. Three main fields of studies were business economics, management sciences and education. These fields were mostly chosen by female students.

These statistics suggest that society is becoming more inclusive and empowering all individuals regardless of their gender. Hon House Chair, on reconnecting the apt description of President Nelson Mandela when he said that the census 1996 results show a society which had enormous basic needs to be met, whether it be in terms of access to clean water, electricity, telephones or schooling, it feels great to report that South Africa of 2022 is far much better than South Africa of 1996.

The statistics shows that more households are living in formal dwellings from 65,1% in 1996 to 88,5% in 2022. Formal dwellings are houses, flats, townhouses, or other structures made of brick or concrete or located in a backyard. The number

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 39

of people living in informal and traditional dwellings have dropped significantly. The shelf households in informal dwellings went down from 16,2% in 1996 to 8,1% in 2022. The share of people in traditional dwellings decreased from 18,3% in 1996 to 3,1% in 2022. These changes reflect a society that is improving its living standards despite having almost double its number of households since 1996.

These statistics also revealed that nearly quarter of households or 29,9% live in government subsidised dwellings or the Reconstruction and Development Programme, RDP. This could only happen under the ANC. We are fully aware that there is still a high demand for housing and government continues to implement various programmes to develop residential areas, upgrade informal settlements and provide affordable renting options for both the poor and the middle income households. The delivery of basic services has been another priority for our government since 1994. We have made huge strides in providing access to clean water, electricity, sanitation and refuse removal.

In 2022 more than four out of five households or 82,4% had access to pipe water either inside their dwelling or inside their yard. In 2001 only 51,9% of people had access to a flush

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 40

toilet and this has increased to 70,8% in 2022. The census also indicates that the proportion of households using electricity as the main source of energy for lighting rose sharply from 58,1% in 1996 to 94,7% in 2022. The use of paraffin and candles which was common before 1994 has reduced to very low levels.

The government remains hard at work to ensure that electricity load shedding is a thing of the past so that South Africans can go back to enjoying the use of electricity which access is at a universal level. There has also been a noticeable increase in the regular removal of refuse by local authority. In 2022, about two-thirds or 66,3% of households in the country have their refuse removed by local authority once a week, compared to 52% in 1996. In this regard, we call upon South Africans to join the programme to keep our country clean and free from litter by participating in the municipal cleaning and greening initiatives taking place across the country.

These initiatives have already created more than 37 000 work opportunities and they are aimed at clearing the 7 251 illegal dumping hotspots in communities across the country. This includes the cleaning of the streets, cleaning of the coastal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 41

areas and the revitalisation of the parks. Hon House Chair, in an economy that is moving to become digital, the census data also shows how technology and the Internet has transformed society. The percentage of households without Internet access has dropped dramatically from 64,8% in 2011 to 21,1% in 2022. More people can access the Internet for learning, working and creating. This technological change has also improved access to information and services leading to more equality and inclusion.

The government is also progressing the implementation of phase two of the SA Connect programme with 1000 households already connected with broadband and 1000 community Wi-Fi hotspots planned to be installed by December 2023. The project has also rolled-out infrastructure for Internet connectivity that allows households to access Internet at cheaper rates. For R249 per month a subscribing household can have unlimited access to robust Internet with cheaper data costs as low as R5 for a gigabyte per day. It is anticipated that the project will deliver connectivity to more than 5 million households and 32 000 community Wi-Fi hotspots across the country over the next 36 months.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 42

The telecommunications companies will soon commence with connectivity of more than 18 000 schools, 943 libraries, 5 731 health facilities and 8 241 traditional authorities over the next month as part of the social obligations imposed by government during the high demand spectrum auction. Hon members, South Africa along the rest of the globe felt the impact of COVID-19 pandemic and the related containment measures. Hon Chair, before the COVID-19 pandemic employment levels were recorded at 16,4 million in the first quarter of 2020. During the pandemic the employment levels reached 14,1 million which meant a reduction of almost 2 million jobs.

According to quarterly labour force survey for the third quarter of 2023, the number of employed persons increased by 399 000 to 16,7 million as compared to the second quarter of 2022. This is the eighth consecutive increase in employment since the fourth quarter of 2021 and for the first to surpass the pre COVID-19 employment levels of 16,4 million. Employment level is not only the indicator of improvement in the labour market, the volume of actual hours worked has also improved drastically post COVID-19. Despite being in employment numerous workers had to decrease their working hours due to the repercussions of the COVID-19 pandemic while many others faced job losses.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 43

According to the quarterly labour force surveys the total hours worked in the first quarter of 2020 were 1,1% less than in the fourth quarter of 2019 due to the COVID-19 pandemic. There was a significant drop of 28,5% in the number of hours worked between quarter one of 2020 and quarter two of 2020 equivalent to 2,2 million job losses. All industries showed a decrease in the number of hours worked with the highest declines in the hours worked per week in private households and ... [Inaudible.] ... household sitting at 36,8%, construction 36,6%, community and social services at 33,3% and mining at 30,5%.

Since quarter 4 of 2021, actual hours' work has seen a significant recovery. The total number of hours actually worked per week have so far exceeded preCOVID-19 levels by 0,8% between quarter three of 2019 and quarter three of 2023. I must report that all provinces but one has contributed to the 399 000 increases to the number of employed people. We are pleased to report that despite claims that are not supported by evidence strong contributions to additional jobs comes from KwaZulu-Natal, up by 152 000 jobs; followed by Limpopo, up by 17 000 jobs; the North West, up by the 61 000 jobs and Mpumalanga. It is not the Western Cape.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 44

This indicate the gradual but steady realisation of the goal of the Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Programme, ERRP, of rebuilding better stronger and inclusively. This government has achieved these gains with 62 million people living in South Africa and about a quarter of them living in Gauteng which being an economical hub happens to attract many people from within the country and other parts of the world. The Northern Cape with its land marks remains the least populated.

We have faced many challenges and achievements since 1994, but we have always stayed focused on the goal of building a united, prosperous and equal society that worked for the common good. We are committed to delivering services that build strong and sustainable communities. We will keep working for the betterment of our country and our ... [Inaudible.] ... people. Viva, South Africa and God bless South Africa. Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chair, the 2022 Census was met with massive challenges, both avoidable and unavoidable. The global pandemic was one such unforeseen obstacle, however, the consistent, and one may argue, deliberate underfunding of Statistics SA is something we have been lamenting in this House for many years. A census is a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 45

critical tool for government to take stock and to foreground government planning in the ever-evolving population. That is why the integrity of the data must be beyond reproach.

If a government is to be responsive to the growing needs of its population, then great investment must go into ensuring that the entity is tasked with that responsibility is well funded and capacitated. Now, delving deeper into the findings of this census and really studying the numbers, we saw that it shows that South Africa is a great country with great potential but let down by a bad government. No one who is truly invested in the future of this country can look at these figures and arrive at the conclusion that the government of the day that has enjoyed 29 years of uninterrupted governance has served our people well. In fact, the opposite is true. The gains we have made have been despite the ANC and not because of it. While population has increased by 10,9 million people our economy has not grown since the previous census to meet its needs. This has to be the biggest indictment on the ANC-led government. A quality education, an opportunity to find meaningful work and access to basic services is the surest way to ensure that South Africans live a life of dignity. Under this government they do not, and no fudging of the numbers will convince anyone of otherwise. They do not need to be sold

the well painted picture, Minister. They experience the poverty and joblessness every single day.

Now let us look at the numbers. Youth unemployment. South Africa continues to have a young population of a medium age of 28 years old. But this government has failed young people the most with six out of 10 young people without work. I often wonder if...

IsiXhosa:

... la maqabane...

English:

... of the oldest liberation movement on the on the continent, even understand the indignity of...

IsiXhosa:

... ukungaphangeli komntu omtsha. Abantu abatsha bayangqunga kumakhaya abo bephelelwe lithemba lokuba bangaze bawufumane kusini na umsebenzi. Bayatsho kodwa ke bona ukuba bangawo amaqabane...

English:

... of the oldest liberation movement in this whole continent, but...

IsiXhosa:

... benza ntoni...

English:

... with that accolade? While the number of learners in schools have increased to 73,4, a commendable feat Minister, it is completely undermined by the fact that over 80% of learners in Grade 4 cannot read for meaning. Just the other day, the Department of Basic Education, Deputy Minister Regina Mhaule justified or tried to justify in this House that the reason why we are performing so poorly is because we are measuring ourselves against developed countries. What a devastating admission that this government does not believe that our children or the children in this country are deserving the best education the world has to offer? The ANC is only content with shackling an entire group of children to an education that will never allow them any jobs in the market one day. This is another generation of poor black children who have to accept the scraps that this government is prepared to offer them.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 48

According to the census, 94% of South Africans have access to electricity, but once again, Minister, this is undermined and it is the cruellest form of punishment because people may have access to the electricity, but they never have electricity at all. The corruption by this organization has meant that Eskom cannot deliver electricity as people need. In fact, this year as of August, South Africans have sat in the dark for 1 300 hours, which is almost two months collectively, and this is not just about being able to switch the lights on and off. This is a crisis that has destroyed small businesses that has plunged more South Africans deeper into poverty and once again has made people join the unemployment queues. This not just an inconvenience, but it is a matter of life and death for many people.

The ANC will also tell us about how much pipe water they have provided. According to this census, the percentage of households with access to pipe water have halved, which is again commendable but again, a cruel, cruel, cruel indictment when people have access to pipe water. But the pipe water is dirty, the pipe is undrinkable or in some instances in the province where I come from people share drinking water with animals. Instead of committing to building bulk water

infrastructure that will be suitable and sustainable for years to come...

IsiXhosa:

... amaqabane atyisana imali...

English:

... like we saw in the Giyani Bulk Water Project...

IsiXhosa:

... njengomzekelo.

English:

That project went into the millions because of greed, because of selfishness and because of the criminal disregard for the community who have looked to this government for assistance...

IsiXhosa:

... ukususela ngowe-1994.

English:

Now I want to turn my attention to the people who matter the most, the South Africans at home. I want to say not all hope is lost. South Africa is a great country with great potential

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 50

that is let down by a bad government and that is why the Western Cape has leading, in all of these indicators, it is not by accident. It is because it is not by accident. It is because of a government that is committed to serving instead of stealing. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: It is because of a government that is committed to serving instead of stealing. The Western Cape has the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa. These are not just figures, these are brothers, sisters and mothers who are able to provide for their families.

Over and above this, we have invested R1,2 million on the basic education of young children because we do not want to see another generation of young black children who are shackled in poverty like this government is only too happy to have. I want to say South Africa, help is on the way. Change your vote, change your government and change your lives. [Time expired.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 51

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, heckle but do not shout, please.

IsiXhosa:

Nks N V MENTE: Sihlalo weNdlu, masibulise phaya kumongameli we-EFF...

English:

... the commissars, the ground forces, and thank all the one million members of society who have registered to vote for the EFF. House Chairperson, the EFF welcomes the 2022 Census results and we want to take this opportunity to commend the excellent work done by the Statistician-General and in delivering the 4th census since the first one was conducted in 1996. We take this opportunity to commend the hundreds of field workers and everyone who took part in the Census 2022 under the leadership of the Statistician-General of South Africa, Mr Risenga Maluleke. Thank you very much, Bhuti. Most importantly, we were encouraged by the fact that this was the first 100% digital multi-mode option for data collection wherein there was use of face-to-face telephonic and web-based options. We wish that other organizations such as the IEC can strengthen their use of digital platforms and campaigns to research as many of our young people as possible to register

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 52

to vote in as much as we have seen with the Statistician-General and the Census.

Now, in preparation for the EFF-led government of 2024, the EFF has, and its leadership, engaged with the results of the 2022 Census presented by the Statistician-General and our last Central Elections Task Force meeting convened by our Commander-in-Chief and we are happy to see that the Statistics SA's efforts to make the data accessible as possible to all stakeholders, including opposition parties. Such a nonpartisan conduct is commendable. He must never allow himself to be an object of the ANC. We know that there has been a deliberate decapitation of the Statistician General's office. The budget continues to be cut for irrational and senseless reasons. Highly skilled people have been resigning in recent years and their positions were never filled properly.

We have been the only party asking the Treasury office what it wants to achieve by cutting a budget of the Statistics SA office because only through science you can deliver a government properly and successfully. We have called on members of this House to reject any prospect of budget cuts at the office of the Statistician-General. House Chair, we know and have accepted that the government and the governing party

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 53

has no appreciation of the value of officials in the Statistician SA office, and therefore we call upon the members of this House to never allow budget cuts to the office of the Statistician-General.

House Chair as we conclude, we are always guided by science when we make policies. In the absence of knowing the numbers of this country, we are unable to make any legislation and we are unable to pronounce on any policies, because without knowing which household needs water, without knowing which household does not have electricity, without knowing how many children cannot access school, we cannot sit here and speak to ourselves. Simply because the Ministers and the Cabinet of the ANC's children are in private schools. They do not care. They will sit in Cabinet and process a budget cut and even adopt it.

Unfortunately, for general membership it is not the same. Their children still cannot go to school. Their children go to bed hungry and then unemployment is rising in South Africa. It is not me; it is the numbers. Unfortunately, the Statistician-General had to declare the census and its results just before elections. South Africa, you must know unemployment in South Africa is uncontrollable. Young people do not work in South

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 54

Africa. Giyani still does not have water and Giyani's Water boreholes corruption is still not investigated to date. The Ministers that are implicated in that corruption are still not arrested today. [Time expired.]

Ms Z MAJOZI: Hon House Chairperson, I rise today on behalf of the IFP to offer our response to the Minister in the Presidency's statement on the results of the Census 2022. The census is not just a statistical exercise; it reflects the heartbeat of our nation and its findings shape the trajectory of our collective future.

While we appreciate the efforts of the government in conducting the census, we cannot ignore the alarming revelation of more than 31% of our population that was not accounted for in the 2022 count. This significant undercount is deeply troubling and demands our immediate attention. Every unaccounted individual represents a story untold, a voice unheard and a potential need unaddressed.

Of particular concern is the omission of farmers and farm workers - a substantial portion of our population that plays a vital role in sustaining our nation. The fact that these essential contributors were not accounted for raises questions

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 55

about the accuracy of demographic data, which is crucial for informed policy-making and resource allocation.

The ... [Inaudible.] ... of resources between KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng, as revealed by the census is also a matter that warrants quoting it. While these provinces are populous, we must ensure that our nation's resources are distributed equitably, addressing the unique needs of each region.

Furthermore, the deadline in public participation is indicative of a broader issue. A growing lack of faith in government processes, high crime rates, as mentioned by the hon Minister, contribute to citizens' reluctance to engage with census fieldworkers. As public representatives, it is our duty to address this crisis of confidence.

In response to these challenges, the IFP advocates for a comprehensive review of census methodologies. Embracing innovative approaches, leveraging technology and fostering community engagement can enhance the accuracy and inclusivity of future counts. We also stress the importance of public-private participation, to bolster outreach efforts and rebuild trust in the census process.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 56

While we acknowledge the valuable insights provided by the census, we must confront its limitations head-on. As the party, we will remain committed to working collaboratively to address these challenges, to ensure a more accurate representation of our diverse population in future census. The IFP reiterates that government cannot address the needs of a nation whose plight it does not understand, and you cannot understand a nation you do not know. Thank you.

Mrs H DENNER: Hon Chair, no census is ever a full and accurate count of the number of people in a country. Rather, it is, by its very nature, an estimate of the size of the population at any moment in time, especially in the case of any census undertaken in South Africa, with the sheer number of citizens and noncitizens, different living conditions, socioeconomic circumstances and other factors such as language, employment and more. The Minister is of the opinion that the Census 2022 was a successful project that proves the fairy tale of a successful government that she told us here today, ...

Afrikaans:

... maar kom ons bepaal ons eerder by die feite.

English:

The undercount of more than 30%, which is higher than the world average is a worrying number, which leaves a bright red question mark about the accuracy and the implications of the Census 2022 data. With nearly 31% of the population and 30% of households not counted, this is the highest undercount of any postapartheid census survey done to date. So, the Minister's statements on the wonderful successes of the ANC are not at all that accurate.

According to the Post-enumeration Survey, which is done immediately after any census, with the goal of determining how many people were not counted, and to enable Statistics SA to make the necessary adjustments and basically manage the undercount, it is safe to say that adjusting for an undercount of more than 30% may yield some confounding results, just as confounding as the claims made during the opening of this debate.

Afrikaans:

En hoe dan gemaak as die beskikbare sensusdata, wat miljarde gekos het om saam te stel, nie voldoende is nie. Sonder behoorlike, akkurate en betroubare data kan geen begroting, ontwikkeling en beplanning behoorlik geskied nie, nie net deur die regering nie, maar ook deur die privaatsektor, akademie en

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 58

nieregeringsorganisasies, om enkele rolspelers te noem, wat van hierdie belangrike inligting gebruik maak. Dis uiters belangrik dat alles moontlik gedoen word om die akkuraatste moontlike sensusdata te bekom.

Behalwe vir verskeie probleme wat gedurende die 2022-opname ondervind is, wat insluit, maar nie beperk is nie tot foutiewe toestelle, dataprobleme, veldwerkers wat nie betaal is nie, veldwerkers wat hulle mandaat verkeerd verstaan het of oorskry het, ontoeganklikheid van woonhuise en erwe asook woonstelle en meenthuiskomplekse, onwilligheid van sekere burgers om aan die proses deel te neem, en legio ander redes, bestaan daar ook wêreldwyd 'n tendens van mense wat nie meer aan opnames van massamenings wil deelneem nie. Dit beteken dat die wyse waarop sensusdata versamel word, in die toekoms heroorweeg sal moet word.

'n Sensus behels egter nie net populasiesyfers nie. Verskeie ander datastelle word ook gedurende hierdie opname ingewin, wat soos stukkies van 'n legkaart die prenting van die Suid-Afrikaanse samelewing, sy sosio-ekonomiese omstandighede en uitdagings, huislike omstandighede, migrasie en indiensnamepatrone, asook verbruikerspatrone belig.

English:

The language section, for instance, highlights the importance of mother tongue language used in our communities. According to the 2022 survey results, the most spoken languages in South Africa are IsiZulu, IsiXhosa and Afrikaans, as the top three in that order, English being only the fifth most spoken language in the country. This means that the majority of South Africans mostly speak an indigenous mother tongue language and not English. This highlights the importance and need for mother tongue education, something that the ANC government has been failing to institute and promote for 30 years.

Regardless of what the Minister advertised here on behalf of the ANC, why do we go through the trouble of doing the research, if we are not going to heed the results? Thus, it is not only of great importance that census data is accurately collected and presented, but the way in which this data will be collected in the future must also be reconsidered.

Afrikaans:

Die belangrikste van alles is dat beplanning, besteding, regering en bestuur by die Suid-Afrikaanse samelewing moet aanpas en nie andersom nie. Ek dank u.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 60

Mr W M THRING: House Chairperson, the ACDP would like to place on record our thanks and appreciation for the efforts of the Census 22 workers, which resulted in the compilation of these results. The ACDP notes that the 2022 Census was 100% digitalised, and that South Africa's population on 2 February 2022 stood at over 62 million, up from 51,8 million in 2011, reflecting a population increase of 19,8%.

Furthermore, the Census results revealed that there were 17,8 million households in Census 22, an increase of 23,4% from 2011. The ACDP also notes that access to electricity for lighting in South Africa went from 58,1% in 1996 to 94,7% in 2022, and over four-fifths of households in the country had access to pipe water, either inside their dwelling or inside their yard.

And while these statistics are welcomed, what the ACDP indicates is that it is sad that the many great strides made in increasing access to water and electricity have been eroded by higher unemployment, poverty, inequality, corruption and crime, with a declining quality of education and a crumbling structure. It is equally disconcerting that almost 30 years after the dawn of our democracy, this government continues to perpetuate a focus on racial classification, much like the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 61

previous apartheid regime. The ACDP positions that the outcomes of this census must be used to improve the lives, livelihoods and socioeconomic standing of all South Africans, irrespective of race, colour, language, religion or ethnicity.

The 19,8% increase in population and resultant increase in households should sound alarm bells to this ANC-led government who has failed to grow our economy sufficiently over the last decade, they have failed to provide decent housing to growing households, and they have failed to provide jobs to our millions of unemployed, particularly the youth.

The increase in population means that more schools, hospitals, clinics, houses, roads, dams, power stations need to be built, to accommodate the growing population. For this to happen, we need leaders capable of steering our economy on an upward trajectory, leaders who are ethical, moral, trustworthy and certainly not corrupt. The ACDP has such leaders, which is why 2024 will see a shift towards the ACDP. I thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, maybe we should do a census 2023 on what is happening in Palestine, and how many children have been massacred, how many women have been massacred and how many of those in the hospital were massacred

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 62

in cold blood by the barbaric Zionist state of Israel. Then it begs ... to ask the following question. Do we have or is every human being really human, because some people feel nothing not touched ... nothing ... absolutely no movement in them despite the fact that they see women, children and many others being massacred. In terms of the issue of Census 2022 ...

Dr C P MULDER: Chairperson, a point of order.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Should I sit?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): ... [Inaudible.] ... there is a hand. I saw a hand. Yes, take your seat. Dr Corne Mulder?

Dr C P MULDER: Chairperson, once again the hon Shaik Emam finds it impossible to talk about the subject on the Order Paper. He is referring to issues that have been discussed in Parliament ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Mulder, what is your point of order?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 63

Dr C P MULDER: My point of order is that ... [Interjections.] ... the hon Shaik Emam ... Ma'am, there are certain rules in Parliament and while one member is busy with a point of order others should not interrupt, like Mr Mandela.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, I'm being disturbed. I hear that. Can you please come with your point of order, Dr Mulder.

Dr C P MULDER: The point of order is that the hon Shaik Emam has recently started with a process where he ignores the Order Paper and he talks about things that are not being discussed at that moment and which are not relevant to the discussions at the moment. It is a question of irrelevance under the circumstances. Thank you, ma'am.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. Can we allow the hon member to connect? At this stage we are not sure if it is irrelevant. Please proceed, hon member.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Mulder has a problem. His problem is that he is used to the idea of wanting to dictate and have that baas [boss] mentality where he's the boss and others are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 64

the workers. That is his problem. Anyway, coming back to this, in terms of Census 2022, one million people are born ...

Mr S N SWART: Chair, a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Shaik Emam, please take your seat.

Mr S N SWART: ... on Rule 85 that the member is casting aspersions against another member. I would also ask you, yet again, to rule on the point of relevance. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): May I say we that don't even listen. We immediately come with points of order. Yes, the rules are there but we have to be sure that what they are saying is actually irrelevant, because you always make preambles and in your preambles you go all over before you get to the issue. So, why should I immediately rule him out of order today? So, hon members, allow hon Shaik Emam to proceed.

Mr S N SWART: Chair, a point of order. I'm sorry. My apologies for interrupting the speaker but the first point of order related to the casting of aspersions against the hon Mulder.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 65

The casting of aspersions in terms of what the hon member said.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay, I will check on the casting of aspersions. Thank you. Proceed.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chairperson, birds of a feather flock together.

South Africa has a population increase of one million every year and I think Census 2022 gives us an opportunity to identify, together with the rise in the population, what the needs of the country and its people are and how we should address them.

Now, I hear some members come to this podium and we talk about this one didn't do that and that one didn't do that. Let me tell you that today in the Western Cape more and more people are homeless while this Western Cape government takes the land and sells it to its friends in America and all these foreign countries, okay? That is what they do. They don't care about the poor in this country. That's why if you talk about the most unequal society, the Western Cape is the most unequal province anywhere in the country. There's no doubt about it.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 66

If you look at the latest crime statistics in terms of murder, rape, gang violence and gender-based violence, it points to the Western Cape. There's no doubt about it. It's because they spend their money on the rich and the affluent, and they ignore the poorest of the poor. That is the point. So, don't come here and grandstand as if you are giving ...

An HON MEMBER: Nonsense!

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: ... a better quality of life. No, indeed, you are not. Clearly, I can assure you that you are not giving.

Something that we need to address, even from a national perspective, is the sale of the land in this particular province to foreign nationals. You know, there's a video floating around about the corruption with the loans that they took from the USA and how they are selling this province out. I hope that will also be investigated.

Be that as it may, Census 2022 gives us an opportunity to address the needs of this country, find solutions and uplift the living conditions of our people. The NFP thanks the Minister for the statement. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 67

Mr S M JAFTA: Chairperson, the recent Statistics SA census survey results were released 12 years after the last survey which was conducted in 2011. At the time there were 51,7 million South Africans. The recent results reveal that there are now 62 million South Africans of which 28 million of this population receive social welfare grants. The sharp increase, averaging an annual growth rate of 1,8% since 1996, is the first of its kind. The corresponding effect is likely to affect the social and economic status of ordinary South Africans. With strained resources and an increase in the social welfare system, the social decay of our scarce resources is likely to ... [Inaudible.]

The long-term results of this survey in a province like Gauteng, which is the province with the highest population, will be dire. For instance, we are likely to witness social dislocation, rampant crime and resource jostling in the province.

Despite this, there are also benefits to this survey. It reveals a population boom in the region of youthful population. In economies with booming youthful populations, there are corresponding benefits for such economies. If the demographic and population interest is properly harnessed, and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 68

the right policies and institutional actions taken, it will help create the conditions for a high growth demographic dividend.

The other benefit arising from this survey is that they help policy-makers to recalibrate developmental projections to develop new economic and social reforms to respond to a growing population. We must therefore provide improved education and skills for young people so as to allow them to fill the resulting labour force gaps and invest in planning and setting up a conducive environment for development. I thank you, hon Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. Hon members, before we proceed, I don't have much of a problem with people coming onto the platform who might have forgotten to unmute. However, let me warn those that press ... They unmute themselves in order to take part in a debate in which they are not supposed to. You will be taken out immediately, like what happened now to hon Seithholo. So, please don't do that. If you do that I will take you out immediately. The ICT will take you out. It's not as if you forgot to unmute. You just press ... to talk when I am busy and we are busy in the House. Hon Shabalala, please mute. You are not talking. Somebody is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 69

talking. We are in the House. Let's respect these gadgets that we use. We must take it as if we are in the House.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon House Chair, we would like to thank the Minister for his statement. A lot of work must have gone into it and we thank him for his leadership and the leadership of the Cabinet. South Africa now has a good idea of the census statistics.

These statistics will help us with the next Budget. It will also help political parties to formulate their manifesto promises in the next election. Al Jama-ah is going to use the information to go to our constituencies and then push for full employment with decent work in terms of the *International Labour Organisation*, ILO, convention and decent work. Then we are also going to look at the problems we have with water. We want to change the Constitution ... that there must be a right to water and not only access to water. You can't give people access to water as a constitutional right, yet they must walk 10 kilometres for the water. They must have a right to water whenever they need it. So that will be an early heads-up with regard to Al Jama-ah's manifesto - full employment coupled with decent work. We are also going to change the Constitution

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 70

and we are going to use the census information. That is why we thank the Minister for the statement.

The census statistics will help us a lot to improve our position and to win more seats in Parliament and the different provinces. Thank you very much, hon House Chair.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hon House Chairperson, ...

IsiXhosa:

... mandibulele kuPhathiswa ngengxelo ayenzileyo apha...

English:

... it really represents good news, to a point where ...

IsiXhosa:

... akukho kwaqela lezopolitiko elingaphesheya kwiindaba ezimnandi qha ke bazixakekise ngezinye izinto. Siza kwenza le nto siyiqhelileyo thina kwaye sesiqalisile. Siphakathi kwabantu ngoku, singena indlu, nendlu sibaxelela ngemingeni yethu neendaba ezimnandi zobalo lwabantu belizwe. Gwarube.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 71

The Census 2022 outcomes are a critical indicator for the nation to assess progress of a democratic government. Our Constitution implores us to address the injustices of the past, addressing the legacy of colonialism and the exclusion of black and African majority from accessing basic services such as water, adequate human settlement, access to electricity, access to education and many social economic rights enshrined in the Constitution as the priority to the ANC.

We commend the work done by Statistics SA under the most difficult conditions. We must state that Statistics SA undertook this census leveraging digital technology which has led to savings of over R2,2 billion if the census was undertaken through traditional means.

This is a significant milestone demonstrating aspects of the agility of the state. As a nation, we should not affirm a false narrative that argues that South Africa is not a better place. The evidence we get from the census based from the information we get from the people tell us a good story. Gwarube.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 72

South Africa is indeed a better country, relative to other nations in the continent. We have made significant strides.

The Census 2022 debunks the opposition narrative.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Dyantyi, please take your seat. What is it, hon Mcgluwa?

Mr J J MCGLUWA: Hon House Chairperson, I am just checking whether it is parliamentary to call a member on her name or surname?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, yes it should be Ms Gwarube.

IsiNdebele:

Ngimbize kuhle, begodu angisiMxhosa. Hayi baba. Mbize kuhle, bab'Dyantyi. Begodu umbize ngomhlonitjhwa nanyana Kkz.

IsiXhosa:

Mnu Q R DYANTYI: Enkosi, ndiza kugxila apha kuye kuba zikhona izinto ekufuneka ndimshiye nazo apha.

Afrikaans:

Jy mors net my tyd, Mcgluwa.

English:

The Census 2022 debunks the opposition narrative. At times supported by the sections of the fourth estate which sometimes alleges that South Africa to be a failed state. There is no shred of evidence which points to our state's trajectory being regressive to an extent of having characteristics of a failed state. We should be cautious about an assertion of a failed state because it seeks to depict a country that has been a beacon of hope in a development in Africa as the failure. In essence, it is an insinuation of a failure of an African state and its people.

We dispel this assertion with the contempt it deserves because it seeks to erase the progressive social transformation of South Africa. Addressing the injustices of the colonial past will not be reversed only in 30 years.

The ANC has placed education as an apex priority because social transformation is about empowering the people for self-liberation. The percentage of individuals without schooling has decreased nearly threefold. From 19,1% in 1996 to 6,9% in 2022. This is a tremendous improvement which improves the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 74

literacy of the country. In 2022, more than 14 million individuals aged 20 years and older had completed secondary education.

Since 1994, our housing programme has led to restoring the dignity of many South Africans. We should also note that a number of households since 1996 has doubled from 9,1 million to 17,8 million as the population grows.

Empirical evidence reflects the improved human settlements conditions with households residing in informal settlements increasing from 65% in 1996 to 88% in 2022. This is progress.

Relative to Rwanda and I chose that country, the majority of the private households in Rwanda is 65% which resides in planned rural settlements called Imidugudu. About 15% are found in the disbursed isolated housing settlements, while 9% in spontaneous squatter settlements.

As a nation, we are currently experiencing load shedding which has a detrimental impact on our economy and social life. The current problem has taught us a particular lesson related to planning for additional generation of capacity as electricity

demand grows and ensuring sufficient maintenance is done consistently.

Census 2022 tells us that electricity lighting has increased from 58% in 1996 to 94% in 2022. Relative to Rwanda again, access to electricity by private households currently in Rwanda is 61%, 47% on grid and 14 on solar panels. We can confidently say that in the coming years, South Africa will have a universal access to electricity.

Access to water has increased with 82% of households having access to piped water. The government has prioritised the Eastern Cape and Limpopo through mega projects infrastructure development projects for bulk water and bulk reticulation developments. The problem we need to address with urgency is ensuring that there is a consistent supply of clean water as water interruption has an impact on the economy and the quality of life.

The census has also indicated that Internet penetration over the period from 2011 to 2022 has significant increase due to technological development in the world with over 60% of South Africans having an Internet connection.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 76

Statistics SA also reported challenges faced in executing the Census 2022 under COVID-19 conditions. We applaud the resilience of Statistics SA in ensuring that the nation gets this valuable data which will heighten efforts of transformation.

This Western Cape run DA, experienced delays which required multiple interventions. We are also concerned about the discrimination experienced by Census 2022 field workers in some instances due to racial connotations in the Western Cape and not in any other province. We condemn racial discrimination as it undermines our efforts to build a nonracial society.

Let us go to the undercount. The next undercount, hon Denner and the hon Majozi, of households at 30,49% was addressed through the United Nations, UN, acclaimed methods to identify those who were omitted or counted more than once during census taking. It is a universal approach.

A Post Enumeration Survey is an independent survey conducted immediately after census as part of the quality of the evaluation for the census. It evaluates the evaluation for the census by measuring the extent of coverage and content errors.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 77

The persons that were missed – listen to this – the persons that were missed were accounted for and account was adjusted. Just get it. The same UN methods are used to assure the quality of key variables and check the veracity of the data.

The Independent SA Statistics Council has also affirmed the validity of Census 2022. Any attempt to discredit Census 2022 outcome is due to an unpatriotic desire from the opposition parties who do not want to acknowledge progress of this government.

Just on that undercount if I were just choose three provinces, you would have an undercount in the Northern Cape due to vastness of that province. You would had an undercount in KwaZulu-Natal due to disasters. However, listen to this you had an undercount in the DA run Western Cape due to manmade problems. In the Western Cape, where field workers could not go to white areas because they were black. This is the Western Cape. In fact if we were to go back to you just on housing, during the time when the ANC was running in this province, every year, it built 42 000 housing opportunities. For 15 years when the DA is running the Western Cape, it is only building 8 000 housing opportunities. Just see the difference. So, we could have been more in terms of this issue of housing

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 78

that the hon member who spoke about the DA run Western Cape is now out here and I wanted him to be here together with you so that you must not try and trivialise and think that the good news must not be the good news because the government that is leading is the ANC.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Dyantyi, just take your seat for a while.

On what point are you rising, hon Whitfield?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hon House Chairperson, I still have ...

Mr A G WHITFIELD: Hon House Chairperson, will the hon Dyantyi be prepared to take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Dyantyi, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I just want to quickly do this and I will give him that.

And so that is the point that I want to make that also, we welcome the work done by patriotic South Africans and the fact

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 79

that there was a donation of a 139 000 tablets to schools to different provinces done by Statistics SA.

Just before I take the question of that hon member, listening to the EFF and the colleagues who are in the committee will say that the hon Manyi, I missed the points that you raised there. It looked like it is different, it is either you went there without a mandate that such a speech today is completely different from the critical issues that you would have raised! I was looking forward to that, but what I got here was something completely different from the EFF. I mean man please!

Hon Whitfield, what is your question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Unfortunately your time is up. Thank you very much.

Mr A G WHITEFIELD: Hon House Chairperson, I have the question ready.

Does the hon Dyantyi know how many millions of South African children are currently starving?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 80

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Whitfield, the hon member's time is up unfortunately.

The hon Minister, it is your time to close the debate.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: House Chair, let's start by acknowledging and appreciating that everybody agrees that the census data is reflective of the situation in South Africa. Even the hon Gwarube, acknowledges that. She then goes and claims that the developments are in spite of government, but she forgot to check the performance indicators that are measured by census 2022, access to water, access to electricity, access to health, housing, education, refuse removal.

Do I need to point out that majority and bulk of those are delivered by government? Therefore, it is to this government that has delivered, the ANC has delivered a greatest performance.

And I also need to appreciate that we are all in agreement and the opposition parties have joined us and the message that has been led strongly by our Deputy Minister Morolong, of the increased funding of Statistics, Stats SA, because we have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 81

been saying there are other indicators that are not being funded like the performance and contributions of Small Medium and Micro Enterprise, SMME, into the economy, which is mostly undercounted and undervalued.

And we've said it's only if there can be an increase in funding that Statistics SA would be able to conduct such surveys and therefore fully account for the contribution of the majority of Black South Africans into the economy, when you quantify the work done by the informal sector in small medium sector, which is predominantly dominated by women, youth, and black people in general.

So, House Chair, let me also deal with the story that youth unemployment, there's nothing that's happening there. I don't think I need to organize through the Minister of Basic Education, a retraining about reading, because it's not only the grade fours that are not reading for meaning, but also some hon members of the House and will come and talk about it.

And then youth unemployment in quarter three alone, saw a decrease by 1,9% from the previous quarter and the previous quarter had also registered a decrease in youth unemployment by 1,5% and in the third quarter, we have received a 237 000,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 82

can I repeat the number 237 000 young people have gained employment.

And that rose the total number of employed youths in the country to 6 000 000 youth in employment. And it's not me, it's the Quarterly Labour Force survey, quarter three, we must read it in its completeness.

And correctly, the so-called Western Cape great performance must be measured correctly hon Gwarube, by the progress of our poorest and weakest. They say we are as strong as our weakest link.

And let me just take one indicator. And this was raised by hon Shaik-Emam. Informal dwelling in the Western Cape was 16,7% in 1996 and has declined to only 11,1% in 2022.

The reason for such a slow decline is because those affected by informal dwelling are located in Langa, in Nyanga, Khayelitsha, Gugulethu, Delft, Elsies, Noordhoek, Mitchells Plain, Vallal Park, Pelican Park, Imizamo Yethu in Hout Bay amongst others.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 83

Why? Because where the DA governs, it governs to improve the lot of white people only and the rich. And where do they come from? They come from South Africa. They are South Africans. We have one country and immigration ... you are not even the largest recipient of immigration in the Western Cape. Gauteng is the largest that receives immigration.

So, where do they come from? It's because you believe that in South Africa, other category of people is called foreigners when they come from another province. No, we are all South Africans, and we are equal.

We are not dreaming on, and I don't think we understood why we do a very ... and it's not bad. We must be commended as South Africans and the government for packing ourselves amongst the best in the world.

South Africa in terms of educational tests and statistics and assessment, we're the only developing country that participates amongst other developed world in terms of measuring the performance of our learners.

We are measured against Australia, Canada, the United States of America, Europe and when we come last, it's not because we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 84

are the worst. We are competing with the best in the in the in the world and that shows that we are not settling for less. We challenge ourselves to deliver higher and push ourselves higher.

And it shows that we don't want to tell ourselves lies. We don't want to claim easy victories. Our goals are the highest and are set against the best.

And we must tell you that even with the registration numbers that you've seen with the young people who are registering. They acknowledge that they've gone to school, funded by National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NFSAS, they have gone to school, and NFSAS did not only fund their education, but it also funded their accommodation. It gave them food; it gave them transport and everything to enable them to get a work and be equipped for the future.

And with that, young people understand that as opportunities for employment and opportunities to start creating their own businesses, young people of South Africa will remain supporting and voting for the ANC. Thank you, House Chairperson.

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 85

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, there is a conversion in this House, that members in the gallery cannot clap. Unfortunately, it's a member sitting there, I mistaken you for that. I don't think the Chief Whip gave you the permission to sit in the gallery. That concludes the responses to the statement. Thank you.

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF
PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HOME AFFAIRS**

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon House Chairperson, I move that the report be adopted.

Declarations of vote:

Ms T A KHANYILE: Hon House Chairperson, appearing before this House in the year 2023 to raise the issue of Home Affairs network that is often offline demonstrate a lack of commitment from the Minister and his department. It was very embarrassing to receive calls on Friday 20 November from frantic residents from various parts of our country advising that the system was offline, just a day before the IEC registration weekend. This caused panic to a lot of citizens who wanted to get their documentation to be able to vote the ANC-led government out. What is more concerning is that four years after Minister

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 86

Motsoaledi made a commitment on 17 July 2019 that. I quote:

“The department will improve system functionality through the introduction of an offline mode facility, which will continue rendering services to clients even if the system is offline.”

The Minister has failed to deliver on his promise. His term of office is nearing its end, and we are still talking about system offline and there is no sensible solution in place. Citizens lose hours of work because of the system that is always offline. Minister, your department has failed dismally to address the issue of people who are charging applicants for a spot in the front of the queue at various home affairs offices. Those who cannot afford to pay will always be pushed to the back of the queue. This very same department boasts about purchasing 100 mobile units and to date we have not been furnished with the schedule to be able to conduct oversight and all our requests have been ignored. The big question is, Minister, what are you hiding?

We also call on the IEC to urgently deal with the issue of demarcation. During the first IEC registration weekend we learned that some residents have been registered to vote in a voting district, VD, that is between 3km and 5km away from their area of residence. The majority of people from our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 87

communities won't be able to reach those VDs. This is also ...

[Time expired.] We call on all voters to vote for the DA.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Hon House Chair, the EFF rejects the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of the Portfolio Committee on Home Affairs. The reality is that the Department of Home Affairs is one of the worst front departments in the country. Almost all their offices across the country are lined with snaking queues from morning till afternoon because of inefficiencies and inability to deliver services promptly.

Applications for IDs, birth registration and asylum applications take months to be finalised. The asylum and refugee units within the department are breeding grounds for corrupt men and women. The Minister has known about these problems for years, and to date he has not initiated a single programme to deal with the inefficiencies of the department. He just makes noise and there is no impact whatsoever on the work of the department. The greatest crime of this department, however, relates to its failures to ensure that all eligible South Africans have identity documents. Thousands of our countrymen and women in rural areas do not have ID documents. This leaves them outside of benefits due to citizens in the country, they cannot vote, and they cannot access other

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 88

benefits. Lastly, the department must reign in the IEC and stop them from using ANC comrades at ... [Inaudible.] ... to preside over elections. Those are not people capable of presiding; they only know about papsak [cheap wine] and voter fraud.

The elections next year will be the most important since 1994 and we must do all in our power to ensure that they are free from manipulation and that the EFF election doesn't get stolen by this ANC or the DA here in the Western Cape. Thank you very much. We reject this report.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon House Chairperson, this BRRR simply underscores what we already know, that the Department of Home Affairs is broken. This department has been crippled by corruption, a lack of fit for purpose staff, doesn't have an adequate budget and it's been unable to modernise. It is notorious for its long queues and its systems being offline.

The recent spotlight on hijacked buildings, cross-border crimes, zama zamas and illegal businesses run by illegal foreigners who sell poisonous goods to our children has once again confirmed that this department has overseen the collapse of the immigration system. This was affirmed by our Minister

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 89

who recently said that his department has got absolutely no idea how many foreign nationals are within our borders.

Imagine a Department of Home Affairs not knowing how many foreign nationals are moving inside of our borders. It is an absolute disgrace.

As the IFP now approaches 2024, this IFP stands ready to govern in case it in KwaZulu-Natal and beyond. The IFP will put South Africans first by ensuring that no skill and low skill job opportunities are reserved for South Africans as well as the spaza shop industry. We will provide sufficient funding for the Border Management Authority; we will fund a stand-alone immigration inspectorate with staff, and we will call for harsh sentences for Department of Home Affairs staff who sell our documents. We will call for a freeze on all visas obtained by foreign nationals and allow for a six-month review period to ensure that the fraudulent visas are cleared out of the system.

Simply put, we will pick up the baton to modernise and fix the Department of Home Affairs, just like its former Minister, the late Prince Mangosuthu Buthelezi, tried to do before the ANC-led government broke this department and so many other state institutions. I thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 90

Mr C P MULDER: House Chairperson, can I ask the member a question, please?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The hon member has already left the podium and her time has expired. Thank you.

Mr F J MULDER: Hon House Chair, in the review process of the department's budget, one should consider the mission of the report, namely, to ensure the efficient determination and safeguarding of the identity and status of citizens and the regulation of migration to ensure security and fulfil South Africa's international obligations.

While digging into the mission of the department, images of long queues at Home Affairs offices, challenges with the issuing of travel documents, work permits and birth certificates comes to mind as well as open borders, illegal immigration and the underfunded Border Management Authority. With a staffing level of approximately 36%, no proper services could be rendered, with the result that the department is failing its mandate.

The Independent Electoral Commission should be capacitated to ensure free and fair elections in 2024.

Afrikaans:

Die verslag voor die Huis vandag lig nie die werklike omvang en die onvermoë van die departement om aan sy grondwetlike mandaat te voldoen uit nie. Hierdie stand van sake beklemtoon die noodsaak van 'n regime verandering na die 2024 verkiesing en daarom kan die VF Plus vandag nie hierdie verslag van die Huis steun nie. Dankie, Voorsitter.

Mr S N SWART: Hon House Chairperson, the ACDP has read the report and appreciates the work that went into it. However, we are all aware of the long queues, service delivery challenges, offices offline, and ID books not being issued. One of the most serious indictments against the Department of Home Affairs is a recent Constitutional Court judgment relating to the Immigration Act. The court expressed a deep satisfaction with what it said was appalling conduct of the department after it took six years for remedial legislation to be tabled. The department had attempted to blame the delay on the COVID pandemic and the fire at Parliament, but the court said this was not acceptable as that took place long after the 24 months deadline. As the sign of the court's displeasure, it ordered both the Minister and the Director-General to pay part of the legal costs personally.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 92

The court did accept the Minister's explanation that he was totally in the dark about the litigation and the shoddy manner in which it was conducted. This leading the court to order that the legal representatives involved should not charge any fee. The ACDP believes that this is a sad indictment again and illustrates the need for Parliament to closely monitor Constitutional Court deadlines for remedial action.

The ACDP would like to commend the Electoral Commission on the relatively successful first voter registration weekend, where over 2 million people visited registration stations and 1 million new registrations took place. The ACDP looks forward to the 2024 elections when it will be filled with honest, trustworthy, hardworking candidates who understand servant leadership and stewardship of state resources, as opposed to the looting and stealing we have seen so far. There will indeed be a shift to the ACDP. I Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chairperson, let me start off by hoping that the Department of Home Affairs will ensure stringent conditions are put in place on Visas for Israelis wanting to enter South Africa, given the barbaric conduct in Palestine. I hear people complaining about Home Affairs. I must admit that there has been significant progress at Home Affairs. Let us

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 93

not deny them. However, the question I want to ask my colleagues is: If Home Affairs only has 42% of human resource capacity and 25% on immigration, how do you expect them to do justice and provide the service?

So, what is our responsibility? It is to ensure that they have this capacity, provide them with the budgets and then you can demand that they provide better services. You can't deny them the budget; they don't have the staff. In both your immigration and the entire department is at a 42% capacity, but you are expecting miracles from them.

At the same time, I can tell you to take the Umgeni Road branch, where I frequent, because you people don't go to this departments, you will only want to talk here. Come with me and I will show you. At Umgeni Road branch, I will give you names of Bonga. Mkhize Zandile, Dlamini - you have mentioned them - and Estella. Go there and see how you can get help, despite the long queues. Yes, is it their fault that the IT system is not working most of the time? It is not their fault. They want it to work; it is not working. We are not doing enough. We are not doing enough to support this department so that they can provide a better service.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 94

So, we need to do a lot more. Let us not come here and keep complaining about it; let's help them by sorting that out. [Interjections.] Well, let [Interjections.] Whether it's foreigners ... [Interjections.] Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. The NFP supports this report and calls on government to provide adequate resources to the Department of Home Affairs so that they would have the necessary human resource and things to provide a better service ... [Time expired.]

Mr S M JAFTA: Hon Chair, the Budget Review and Recommendation Report of the Portfolio Committee on Home Affairs contains a number of recommendations, in so far as the work of the Department of Home Affairs and its entities is concerned. It is common cause that even the imminence of the 2024 General Elections, a lot of emphasis would go to the Independent Electoral Commission.

The IEC is a treasure of statute. Its legislative obligation includes managing elections at national, provincial and municipal levels, ensuring elections are free and fair, and declaring electoral outcomes of results within a period prescribed by national legislation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 95

Other important functions of the commission include, amongst others, ensuring free and fair elections, as well as promoting conditions conducive to free and fair elections, including maintaining a register of parties and compiling and maintaining a voters' roll. In terms of the BRRR report of the committee, part of the core mandate of the IEC relates to its electoral operations, which is a core function accounting for R3,5 billion over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework.

Electoral operations, which involve the procurement, printing, distribution and warehousing of registration and election material. Procurement of electoral materials, such as an additional ballot guide, the appointment and training of an estimated 350 000 electoral and expansion staff.

The maintenance of the voters' roll, technological improvements, such as rewriting candidate nomination, ballot generation and election result system and the procurement of a building for the IEC national office are important markers in running organised general elections. This performance indicator of the ICC must be underpinned by ... [Time experience.] We support the report, hon Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 96

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon House Chair, the Minister of Home Affairs, Dr Aaron Motsoaledi, the chair of the Portfolio Committee on Home Affairs, the Department of Home Affairs Director-General has restored the dignity of Muslim women and children by making it easy to put their knicker at your Muslim marriage on the National Population Register, with an entry on the South African marriage certificate that this type of marriage is a Muslim marriage. Five Parliaments failed, but the 6th Parliament has done the country proud. Now, Muslim wives are no longer regarded as whores or prostitutes, and Muslim kids are no longer regarded as bastards.

The Minister went the extra mile and saved Muslims costs; they no longer will have the notorious deeds and marriage contract because their marriages are out of community property, saving them up to R10 000 rallies. This is very helpful for indigent Muslims. Also, the entry on the digital records can be changed from 'never married' to 'married', so their spouses can also now get South African marriage certificates. This is a success story because of the Minister with a heart. Al Jama-ah support the budgetary view that has now been presented by Home Affairs. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 97

Ms T I LEGWASE: House Chair, I want to start by commending the Department of Home Affairs for taking the initiative to open their offices during the voter registration weekend for the collection of ID and registration of temporary IDs. This is a demonstration of their understanding of the importance of facilitating voter registration and ensuring that everyone has an equal opportunity to exercise their right to vote.

We applaud the IEC also for conducting a successful incident-free voter registration over the weekend. We urge young people to register to vote and be part of the coming elections, in line with the ICC elections theme, "Your democracy; own it!"

We want to urge all political parties to allow the IEC to undertake its recruitment freely without any duress. If political parties have reservations about some of their staff recruited in the IEC, I think they know that they should do it within the agreed procedures outlined in the particular committees.

The ANC support the BRRR of the portfolio committees upon considering the Annual Reports of the Department of Home Affairs, the Government Printing Works, GPW, and the IEC, which we received on the 10th of October 2023. We also

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 98

received a report of the Auditor-General on the Audit Report of the Home Affairs, the IEC and GPW. We noted that the Department of Home Affairs has received 71% of its annual target for the 2023 financial year, as compared to the 69% achievement of 2021-2022 financial year.

We urge the BMA to roll out the 46 ports of entry by incorporating frontline immigration, port health, agriculture and environmental functions into the BMA. We recommend that the BMA should be better funded for the improvement of border control, and management has addressed the border challenges, including the undocumented migrants.

The IEC must address the weaknesses raised by the Auditor-General in the internal controls around process of compiling and collating performance information reported in the performance report. We know the GPW has a challenge of loss of data. However, the GPW needs to work proactively to ensure that it finalises its 2022-2023 annual report, as soon as possible, after receiving its audited report back from the Auditor-General's office. Thank you very much.

Question put: That the report be agreed to.

Objections noted.

Report agreed to (with Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters and Independent Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF
PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON TOURISM**

There was no debate.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY moved: That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of vote:

Mr M S F DE FREITAS: Chair, this government decimated tourism during and since the pandemic, resulting in over 450 000 tourism jobs lost. Government assistance sat on its hands doing nothing to fix this. The portfolio committee as well as my own oversight visits consistently revealed a plethora of tourism sites to either difficult to access, were unsafe, dilapidated and maintained derelict, and or abandoned. Here too, government continued to sit on its hands.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 100

All members of the portfolio committee agree that we need to encourage, grow, and develop tourism in rural areas, townships, and villages. However, this will only happen if this government ensures the required infrastructure that will make this happen in the first place. Tourists will visit these areas only if there is a means to get there, are comfortable and safe when they do get there. Infrastructure such as good roads, access to water and electricity will ensure that new tourism opportunities occur because the infrastructure is in place.

Government should create an environment that will make it more attractive or conducive for businesses in the sector to grow and develop. Of particular concern is that the Auditor-General indicated that financial statements were not prepared in accordance with the Public Finance Management Act, PFMA.

Additionally, the department did not disclose information that the Auditor-General had reported. When it comes to South African tourism, the main concern is a dysfunctional board, an entity that is facing a leadership crisis and operating with the top leadership all in acting positions. This has an impact on the delivery of South African tourism and the Ministers are urged to pay special attention to fix this. However, there's

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 101

hope because next year, all this will be rescued when the DA takes over as government. I thank you.

Tshivenda:

Vho A MATUMBA: Vhathu vha Vleifontein, Ha-Maila, na lothe la Vhembe vha khou vhudzisa uri vha do dzhenelela hani kha vhubindudzi ha vhuendelamashango kha vhupo ha Vhembe ngeno hu si na maḍi. Hone vhaendelamashango musi vho swika vha do nwa mini? Vha do tamba nga mini?

Vleifontein na Makhado ri khou shumisa mabakete u gwedzha mabunga. Ndi zwithu zwine zwi khou vhavha nga maanda.

Nḡe ndo runwa fhanu Phalamenndeni nga vhathu vhe vha voutela EFF na vhe vha si i voutele vhane vha ri zwazwino vha do i voutela ngauri ndi yone ine ya vha ambela fhanu Phalamenndeni. Hu pfi ndi de ndi vhudzise uri maḍi a Nandoni a do swika lini vhathuni ngauri zwa u tshimbidza mabindu a vhuendelamashango zwi toḡa maḍi?

English:

Tim Harris, a former DA Member of Parliament is abusing black professionals at SA Tourism. This guy was deployed by DA to work in Patricia de Lille's office when she was a mayor of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 102

Cape Town, and today she appointed him to chair the interim SA Tourism board. DA racism is very much clear at the SA Tourism. The first thing the DA cadre, Tim Harris did when he arrived at SA Tourism was to take all powers of authority from black professionals, because according to his DA racist mentality, a black person cannot perform independently without the supervision of a white person. Minister de Lille is not appointing the full board because she is enjoying the racism that is taking place at SA Tourism.

As the EFF, we are saying, all senior posts must be filled, and a full board must be appointed instead of a three-member board consisting of DA friends of Minister Patricia de Lille. Tourism is an economic strategic sector which the ANC has surrendered to DA's Tim Harris. As the EFF, we do not support this report. Thank you.

Mr K P SITHOLE: Hon Chairperson, we must discuss crucial issues surrounding the performance of South African's Department of Tourism and its entity SA Tourism. The challenge faced by this entity directly impacts on how the budget for the tourism portfolio is utilized. It is crucial that we explore the governance and operational issues affecting the effective function of these bodies. While the Department of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 103

Tourism received an unqualified audit opinion with noncompliance finding for the 2022-23 financial year, it is disheartening that there has been no improvement from the previous year ... persistent until fundings on compliance with their registrations are concerning.

The IFP is on the view that the damning issues needing immediate attention is the prevalence of vacancies within the department. The absence of key personnel raises questions about the expertise needed for compliance with registrations. The urgency of SA Tourism to finalize its board appointment could do not be overstated. The board must consist of strong expertise ensuring accurate financial statement aligning with the reporting framework. Procurement practices must also be critically examined and rectified to enhance transparency and efficiency.

In conclusion, while the challenge facing by the South African's Department of Tourism and SA Tourism are significant, they are not insurmountable. It is our collective responsible to address these issues directly, fostering renewal commitment to effective governance, transparency, and collaborations. By doing so, we can pave the way for vibrant

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 104

and thriving tourism sector that benefit all South Africans. The IFP do support the report.

Mr I M GROENEWALD: Hon Chair, South Africa has a countryside to be proud of. The country has all the ingredients for a great vacation recipe, but the recipe keeps on spoiling. The ANC is the reason for the failure of great recipe, where taxpayers cannot enjoy a well-deserved break. The ANC government failed to keep safe and suitable travelling environment. The ANC government failed to keep the lights on for businesses to operate. The ANC government failed at local government keeping their environment clean and neat. The ANC government failed at keeping the enjoyable water resources like that of rivers and dams, clean and safe. The ANC government failed at ensuring security and peace of mind, while taxpayers aren't at home or at the vacation destination. The ANC government failed at keeping a growing economy so that those that worked hard can afford a vacation break. The ANC failed at job creation, enabling more people to go on vacation.

Hon Chair, the ANC was successful in creating a country where poverty increased, corruption increased, fraud increased, economic decline, environmental pollution, and a general decay

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 105

of a potential great country. The governance of the ANC is the part of the recipe that went bad. Only the opposition will be able to rebuild the country nearly destroyed by the ANC. In the 2024 elections, the people of the country must choose to rebuild and get rid of the ANC that isn't capable of governing. The ANC is the rot that needs to get rid of to make a successful recipe. Thank you, Chair.

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, the ACDP takes note of this report. Tourism is slowly recovering after one of the world's hardest and longest COVID-19 lockdowns. For tourism to grow, tourists need to be safe in the country. The recent attacks on tourists in the country are deeply concerning. Far more needs to be done to protect our citizens and of course tourists.

One of the greatest concerns is the state of governance at SA Tourism where eight of 12 tourism board members resigned between the 6th and 8th of April this year, after which the board was dissolved, and an interim board was appointed on the 21st of April by the Minister. These governance challenges at SA Tourism must be resolved.

One of the recommendations in the report is a cost benefit analysis of merging SA Tourism and Brand South Africa and this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 106

is something that needs to be considered. The ACDP also commends the Minister on her swift action when the concerns about SA Tourism sponsoring Tottenham Hotspur Football Club at a tune of a huge amount of R910 million and that intervention from the committee and the Minister's intervention led to that proposed deal being halted.

The ACDP believes that there are a number of issues which can continuously be raised by the portfolio committee, by the Minister so that tourism in the nation can reach its full potential which is not only job creation but also collecting revenue from foreign tourists that come in the country and of course domestic tourism as well. I thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chairperson, let me start off by saying that Palestine has a rich cultural heritage, profound history, and natural beauty. However, tourism in Palestine is currently at a standstill because of the barbaric actions of Zionist state of Israel supported by some of my colleagues in this very House.

Chairperson, I think a lot has been done in the country in this particular tourism sector to promote tourism in South Africa. However., the ailing infrastructure and the high

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 107

levels of crime are having a negative impact in terms of tourists coming into the country.

If you take the Western Cape particularly, where a lot of foreign tourists emerge and if you look at the latest crime statistics, it's certainly a deterrent. People will not want to come to the Western Cape even though we have such beautiful spaces in the entire Western Cape, particularly City of Cape Town.

Chairperson, if you have seen the number of those who have visited in the Western Cape and have died because of the high levels crime but then again that goes down to socio-economic conditions of how funds are directed to the rich and the affluent and not to the poor communities and that is why there are such high levels of crime in this particular province.

We must thank the department for putting a stop to the sponsorship to Tottenham Hotspur. I think that indeed that is the right thing to have done. Further to that, we find that the out of court settlement that resolved the interdict against the implementation of the R1,2 billion Tourism Equity Fund and the intervention by committee as I said about the issue of the Tottenham Hotspur for the department. More

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 108

importantly, the Auditor-General has raised certain concerns. We are calling on the department to deal with this, particularly the senior management which has not been sufficiently ... [Inaudible.] The ACDP supports this budget report. Thank you.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon House Chair, the DA cannot be allowed to take over government. Johannesburg was under white rule, and we saw how they messed it up. We cannot allow South Africa next year to be under white rule. Just imagine the hon Steenhuisen to be the only white person to be President of the African country.

A white government will stand with Israel and genocide and take pride in killing babies ... [Inaudible.] ... captives naked like they did during the whole of Gaza. Al Jama-ah is doing its best to save Johannesburg from white rule whether it's Action SA or the DA.

Al-Jama-Ah works in 50 villages. Will must be done to upgrade huts to seven-star status and I want to engage the Minister and the Deputy Minister to do so in Makhado village which has a seaside and an ocean teaming with fish. Deputy Minister Capa

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 109

gave them a fishing vessel. Minister de Lille, please help here. We support this budget review. Thank you very much.

Ms T MAHAMBEHLALA: House Chair, as the Portfolio Committee on Tourism, we deliberated on the annual and quarterly performance reports of both the Departments of Tourism and SA Tourism. The budget recommendations and review report for Vote 38 was adopted by the Portfolio Committee on Tourism on the 20th of October 2023.

The report considered the financial and non-financial performance of both departments and its entity, the SA Tourism. Several governance and operational challenges faced both institutions during the period reviewed resulting in specific recommendations by the Portfolio Committee on Tourism to the Minister of Tourism to ensure that these are addressed timeously.

I will highlight a few issues that have emerged during the period under review that the tourism sector faces. The Portfolio committee commends the department on its efforts to create employment opportunities in the sector during the 2022-23 financial year.

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 110

The department implemented youth skills development and the committee notes that transformation remains a major challenge in the tourism industry. The department had a setback when the Tourism Equity Fund was interdicted. The Minister reported to the committee that an out of court settlement has been reached with the litigants following the Cabinet approval in September 2023 for the revised Tourism Equity Fund, TEF to be implemented.

Applications to fund were opened on the 6th of November 2023. R1,2 billion fund offers immense opportunity for transformation of an inclusive participation in the sector. Chairperson, the ANC supports the review. Thank you very much.

Question put.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF
PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION ON
VOTE 7 OF NATIONAL SCHOOL OF GOVERNMENT**

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 111

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, I move that the report be adopted. Thank you.

Declarations of vote:

Dr M M GONDWE: House Chairperson, the two simple, yet fundamental questions we should be asking ourselves when it comes to the NSG is whether the NSG has been able to firstly build an ethical and capable public service. Secondly, it empowers public servants to be responsive to the needs of citizens. We remain unconvinced that the education and training interventions that the NSG presently has on offer are doing a sufficient amount to build an ethical and capable public service and at the same time empower public servants to be more responsive and sensitive to the needs of citizens.

For example, for the NSG to truly help internalise ethics and integrity in the public service, it must offer more than just a generic or standard ethics programme. In other words, differently, if the energy is to have a concrete and tangible impact on the current state of our public service, then it would need to tailor and offer a much broader range of education and training interventions, which are aimed at internalizing ethics and integrity in the public service.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 112

The NSG would also need to ensure that such training and education interventions are not aimed exclusively or solely at public servants, but also at politicians as well. Because more often than not, public servants who engage in unethical and corrupt behaviour, are acting at the behest or on the instructions of unethical and corrupt politicians. Therefore, as long as we continue to be wrong and lament the corrupt and deplorable state of our public service, public servants that are unresponsive to the pressing needs of our citizens and sometimes desperate needs of our citizens then the clean audit outcomes achieved by the NSG will most definitely not be worth celebrating. I thank you.

Ms R N KOMANE: Hon Chairperson, greetings to the commander-in-chief and the president of the Economic Freedom Fighters, commissars and the ground forces of the EFF. Today, we are debating Budget Vote 11 of the National School of Government, NSG. The NSG has yet failed to implement the Quality Management Plan due to capacity constraints. Yet, we expect the same school to issue public servants and other people with capacity.

The school has to offer accredited training programmes and actual delivery and facilitation, but as of now, they can't.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 113

The question then remains why is energy not prioritizing the policy directive? South Africa is amongst the countries with the highest unemployment rate, yet the NSG has an increasing rate of vacancy from 10,9% in 2021-22 to 17,5% by the end of 2022-23, which is a call for concern while there are capable people, particularly the youth.

The school hasn't met the regulated representation of youth at 30%, while our country is reeling from high youth unemployment. It still holds on to older people until the school meet its representation of youth who warms the streets and opt for alcohol and drugs, then we can engage.

Chair, why did NSG not sign 22 crucial memorandums of agreement with professional bodies like the Chartered Institute and the Institute for Internal Auditors as it was targeted? And how will they address this delay and unmet targets? The accreditation of qualification is the core mandate of the school but because the ANC-led government is so obsessed with the tenders the school has outsourced their services and the process has been unsuccessful. It has been unsuccessful even when there are so many higher education institutions that should have been targeted, but because, as usual, Chairperson, and their friends were not selected.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 114

The Auditor-General has made a recommendation that the inclusion of key performance indicators and strategic targets to implementation ... [Time Expired.]

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, I present this report on behalf of hon Inkosi Cebekhulu who will join us in the next few minutes. Firstly, may I take this opportunity to wish umama, hon MD Hlengwa a very happy birthday today and may you have many, many more years of good health. And Minister Lamola ...

IsiZulu:

... uwumfana nje kodwa.

English:

Hon Chairperson, institutional failures are at the heart of many of the socioeconomic challenges we face in South Africa. And these are borne not primarily of the personalities and characters around them, but of how they have been designed and structured. South African public administrations have been heavily politicized by the government and we have witnessed the effects of things such as cadre deployment, often at the expense of skilled and qualified candidates. Therefore, the professionalization of public service is of utmost importance, as we need to ensure that those appointed to serve the people

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 115

of South Africa have the necessary skills and qualifications to do so. And in a manner that prioritizes the people and not personal and political agendas.

It is with this in mind that the IFP urges the National School of Government, NSG, to start actioning the proposed plans to professionalize the public service sector through signing memoranda of agreement with professional bodies and developing implementation plans to ensure that all public servants are registered with their respective bodies.

To ensure that the proposal of this project is not just lip service to silence our critique, we want to emphasize the committee's recommendation that the NSG, in collaboration with the Department of Public Service and Administration, should ensure that the provisions of the national framework toward professionalizing the public service are brought into operation. The IFP accepts the report. Thank you.

Mrs H DENNER: House Chair, the National School of Government, NSG, derives its mission from Section 195 of the Constitution. This section sets out the fundamental values and principles for public administration. These values and principles include, among others, a high level of professional ethics,

efficient management and effective utilisation of resources, accountability, transparency and responsiveness to the needs of the people.

These principles, of course, apply to all areas of government, state bodies and public enterprises. The NSG must ensure that all these fundamental values and principles are instilled in the value system and performance of all public servants through education, training and development initiatives.

Afrikaans:

Dit alles in ag geneem en sonder om te veralgemeen, duik die gesegde, mens kan 'n perd tot by die water bring maar jy kan dit nie maak drink nie, dadelik by 'n mens op.

English:

The NSG's plan to legislate all mandatory training programmes for all public servants is a step in the right direction, which will encourage enrolment and retention in these very important courses.

Afrikaans:

Maar hoewel artikel 195, soos baie ander wetgewing, fantasties op papier lyk is dit ongelukkig in die praktyk nie so maklik

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 117

om die waardes en beginsels soos hier uiteengesit in die Staatsdiens te kweek nie. Dit maak nie saak hoeveel kursusse, klasse, lesse of programme aangebied word nie. As die kultuur van straffeloosheid en swak standaarde in die openbare sektor nie aangespreek word nie, sal die Nasionale Skool van die Regering nie hond haaraf maak nie.

English:

The committee also observed that accountability within the school is improving, with responsible leadership and management, and that example may actually go much further than any course content ever will. I thank you.

Mr S N SWART: No statement. Thank you, Chair.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, the NFP will support the Budget Report on Public Service and Vote 7 here today. I hear some of my colleagues once again talking about ethics in governance, morals and values, but yet, we support somebody, and Netanyahu has been charged for bribery, accepting bribes, corruption, breach of trust and not on one occasion, on three different scandals. However, my colleagues want to support him. So, we talk about ethics here, but it's ethical for them to support Netanyahu with all this corruption that his own

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 118

people are turning against him by the hundreds of thousands but be that as it may.

Now, the National School of Government spent R222 million or 96,1% of its available budget. What does it tell us? That we must spend our budget on one thing we are good at. So, let's look at whether we're getting value for money, I think that is what is very important. Some of the problems that this department is facing is that there are 42 vacancies alone, and I think that they must be dealt with. If 23 out of the 27 performance targets were met, which is acceptable in terms of my understanding, but very importantly, I think when it comes to ethics and governance, Chairperson, I think we need to look at the corruption that is taking place between the officials that we are employing, particularly, KwaZulu-Natal, is now rotten to the core. I will say it like it is.

You don't want to know how bad corruption is in the KwaZulu-Natal municipalities, and we they are the ones who talk about good governance, yes. So, Chairperson, I think that something must be done. What is the purpose of these Municipal Public Accounts Committees, MPACs, and all these things, which they are controlled, in any case, and hide everything? Therefore, I think that we need to look at them. So, when we come here and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 119

talk about ethics, values and morals, can you please apply and implement them in your own municipalities wherever you govern. The NFP supports this report. Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The IEC. Order, hon McGluwa.

Mr S M JAFTA: No declaration, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The PAC.

Mr M NYHONTSO: No declaration, Chair.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon House Chair, baaskap is the ethos of the DA wherever they rule. The public service must be a professional outfit and not a basskap unit. That the DA wherever they rule will want to put in place a police state, and we thank the Minister of Police for not giving them more power. Where there is one party, public servants are bullied. This is not the case in the City of Joburg, where nine political parties are ruling under the leadership of Al Jama-Ah. Next year, Al Jama-Ah will lead wherever it is called to do so as it fights a return to white rule, a return to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 120

apartheid and they return to the support of ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members, order.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: The deployment of basse, will make cadre deployment look like a teddy bear party. We support the report. Thank you very much.

Ms M T KIBI: Hon House Chair, the National School of Government, NSG, is vital in developing skills and enhancing the states capability. The school plays a pivotal role in advancing the professionalisation framework, which is a priority to strengthen the public service. For the year under review, the school has exceeded its performance targets. The school exceeded the target on the revenue generated from the trading account from R101,3 million in the previous year to R115 million revenue in this financial year.

This is a sign that the school is striving towards becoming self-sustainable. The prepaid method of revenue collection is yielding the intended results. The school should be supported to increase its capacity and impact. The school has the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 121

introduction of the ethics course and its uptake by civil servants. The school has introduced an ethics course for public servants to acquire the competencies and moral legitimacy of their decisions, enabling them to apply ethical principles and values in business decision making.

The school has been advancing the process of signing the memorandum of agreements with the professional bodies and developing the implementation plan to ensure that all public servants are registered with their respective bodies based on profession. The professional bodies should assist the government in inculcating ethical values and maintaining professional standards in the public sector. The school has developed multiple Memorandum of Agreement, MOA, ...

[Interjections.] ... of international ... The ANC supports the budget review and recommendation report. [Time expired.]

Question put.

[Take in from Minutes.]

Report agreed to.

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 122

CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF
PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION ON
VOTE 12 OF PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION, PSC, ANNUAL REPORT FOR
2022-23 FINANCIAL YEAR

THE CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: I move that the report be adopted. Thank you, Chair.

Declarations of vote:

Dr M M GONDWE: House Chairperson, we had hoped that the Public Service Commission, PSC, would be allowed to exist and function as the watchdog of our public service and constantly keep it in check. However, that hope was completely dashed on the 6th of June 2023, when this House, despite fervent opposition from the DA, recommended an individual whose sole competence and experience is that of being an ANC cadre for appointment as National Commissioner to the PSC.

What this House in effect did on that fateful day, House Chairperson, by recommending yet another cadre for deployment to the PSC, was to transform what is, essentially, a knowledge-based institution into a political institution.

House Chairperson, the PSC is now so compromised and politicised that even if this House was to take a resolution

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 123

today, that the PSC Bill which is touted to give the PSC greater independence and power to be adopted, this particular Bill will, for all intents and purposes, do very little or nothing to alleviate and remedy the damage that's already been done to the independence and the impartiality of the PSC by cadre deployment.

House Chairperson, we are also concerned that the position of the provincial Commissioner in Mpumalanga province has been vacant since the 1 April 2019. As such, we look forward to the committee intervening in this regard by requesting the Speaker of the National Assembly to engage both the Speaker of the provincial legislature and the premier in that province on the filling of this vacancy as a matter of priority. We know that this may be a wishful thinking, but we genuinely hope that once this vacancy is filled, it will be filled by an individual who has been appointed solely on the basis of merit and not by virtue of him or her being an ANC cadre in need of deployment. I thank you.

Ms R N KOMANE: Chairperson, the Public Service Commission, PSC, must promote the constitutio ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 124

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, just unmute your microphone.

Ms R N KOMANE: ... the PSC must promote the constitutional values and principles of public administration in the public service. Therefore, it is important for the North West Province and Mpumalanga to fill in vacancies which hasn't occurred over a period of time. It is very concerning, Chair, for the PC to discontinue the target and reducing the number of grievances just because they only have delivered 4%. The Public Service Commission should improve on that turnaround time and dealing with the grievances and public administration investigation.

Finally, the Public Service Commission should not only recommend, but it must have tooth to bite. Where there is no improvement, that is, what they recommended to the Department of Public Service and Administration, that the representation of women, in particular, is not met in senior management positions. Therefore, we cannot support this report. Thanks.

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: House Chair, first and foremost I want to commend the Public Service Commission on receiving a clean audit and for achieving 24 out of the 25 targets that were

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 125

also aligned with the 94,34% of the budgetary allocation for the year 2022-23. This comes as the breath of fresh air, as it indicates that a target will... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The hon member is no longer audible. Hon Singh. Hon Cebekhulu, I'm requesting hon Singh to complete your speech on your behalf. You are not audible. Please, proceed, hon Singh.

Mr N SINGH: He did alert me, but then I was surprised that he came on. He was on the second paragraph where he was going to say, however, one has to express concern about the crucial vacancies that have been left unaddressed for prolonged periods, and the hon member before me has also indicated that the vacancy of the Provisional Commissioner in Mpumaanga, which dates back to 1 April 2019, is simply unacceptable. Considering that the role and function of the Commission is to promote the constitutional values and principles of public administration in the public service, we cannot afford not to have Commissioners in all of our nine provinces. Therefore, we call upon the officers of both the Premiers of Mpumalanga, and I understand, even the Western Cape, to start making these vacancies a priority.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 126

Considering this, the IFP is in support of the development of a framework on the renewability of the Commissioner contract, and we believe that the framework of this nature will provide a tool with which to measure the performance of an individual Commissioner and provide a means of determining which Commissioners are eligible for renewal of the contract. In this way, we will also be able to keep some form of continuity and experience within the Commission. The IFP accepts the report. Thank you.

Mrs H DENNER: Hon House Chair, the Public Service Commission, mandated by sections 195 and 196 of the Constitution, which include the values and principles that are expected of the Public Service has the primary task to promote a high standard of professional ethics in the Public Service. The Committee on Public Service and Administration noted that even complements the Public Service Commission for achieving almost all set targets of the Annual Performance Plan for the 2022-23 financial year as well as spending 94% of its overall budget. The PSC had 25 targets and 24 was met. Yet, the South African Public Service remains extremely unprofessional, unethical and corrupt.

Afrikaans:

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 127

Net soos die Nasionale Skool van die Regering wil dit voorkom asof die Staatsdienskommissie ook nie hond haaraf in die Staatsdiens maak nie. Hoekom nie? Want planne op papier en die werklike implementering daarvan verskil hemelsbreed. Woorde wek maar dade strek.

English:

For instance, there's an identified shortcoming with regards to the PSC's direct relationship with human resource directorates or units of department. In order to identify ongoing loopholes in terms of human resource practices in the public sector, yet the PSC already has the power to issue directions regarding compliance with personnel procedures relating to recruitment, transfers, promotions and dismissals. How does the PSC give effect to this power? It is currently unable to identify loopholes in terms of human resource practices, and that leaves a question mark over the PSC's actual achievement of its targets and whether or not the set targets are the correct targets to give effect to the actual mandate of the Commission. Here we have an oversight body ...

Afrikaans:

... 'n waghond wat 'n hoë standaard van professionaliteit en etiek in die Staatsdiens moet bevorder, maar hierdie waghond

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 128

het nie tande nie, en 'n waghond sonder tande is nutteloos. Ek dank u.

Mr S N SWART: No statement.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you, Chairperson, the National Freedom Party will support the report on vote 12 here today. Allow me also to draw the attention to this House on the plight of the people of Palestine wherein food, aid and medicine has to go through the borders. The IDF search every container and in searching every container they remove all the medicine and aesthetic and the food.

Mr S N SWART: Chairperson, I rise on the point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shaik Emam, take your seat please. Why are you rising, hon member?

Mr S N SWART: On the point of relevance ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I can't hear, hon Swart.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 129

Mr S N SWART: Chairperson, it's a point of relevance of the debate before us. I would ask you to rule in that, it has been raised a number of times today. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon members. Hon Shaik Emam, lets concentrate on the item in front of us.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you very much, Chairperson, the truth hurts, certainly it does, right? Okay, the Public Service Commission spent 94,38% of its budget. Second point is that the Public Service Commission had 25 targets and reached almost all of them. Twenty-four of them, was actually achieved. There were 430 complaints on the database, of which 68% were finalised. Now one of the serious concerns that appear here is the disclosure forms, Chairperson. Many, many people are still not declaring their interest in business and other sectors, and I think there is and appears to be a serious concern expressed by the Public Service Commission and they also expressed concern about complaints from service providers wanting where they have to pay bribes, to get paid for monies that are due owing and payable to them. But one of the most important things that this Commission has identified is the number of people employed, officials that are not fit

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 130

for purpose or underqualified to carry out this position. So, the National Freedom Party supports this report, but believe that we need to capacitate and ensure that we have people that are employed in these structures not based on their friend, and let us not believe that ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): And remember, your time has now expired.

Mr S M JAFTA: No declaration Comrade, Chair.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Thank you, hon House Chair, Al Jama Ah supports the report. Thank you.

Ms M M NTULI: Chairperson, thank you, all protocol observed. The democratic dispensation gave birth to quite a number of chapters. For the restoration of the previous disadvantaged people's dignity, PSC is a Chapter 10 Institution enshrined in the Constitution. It is independent, impartial and therefore exercise its functions without fear favour or prejudice in promoting basic values and principles governing public administration. Thus, no organisation or an organ of stage may interfere in this regard. The Public Service Commission achieved almost all set targets of the Annual Performance Plan

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 131

for the 2022-2023 financial year, achieving 24 of the 25 targets. We commend the work that the Commissioners do to ensure Public Service. The Commission has focus on developing a legislative framework to enhance its execution of the mandate of the Commission and to afford its stronger teeth to bite, the Commission has prioritised focused on discipline management, which is critical. We support the efforts of the Commission to continue providing updates through the committee regarding the view of the organisational structure to beef up capacity in the provincial offices an effective Public Service Commission will improve. The Public Service to be effective in providing the service required. Increased support for the Commission will enhance the advancement of global professionalisation framework and it will also enhance the Commission's capabilities. The ANC is supporting the budget review and recommendations report of vote 12.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member, your time has now expired. Thank you.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 132

Freedom Front Plus, National Freedom Party, Al' Jama-ah and African National Congress.

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION REPORT OF
PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION ON
VOTE 11 OF DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION,
AND CENTRE FOR PUBLIC SERVICE INNOVATION 2022-2023**

There was no debate.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, I move:

That the Report be adopted.

Thank you.

Declarations of vote made on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Inkatha Freedom Party,

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 133

Freedom Front Plus, National Freedom Party, Al' Jama-ah and African National Congress.

Declarations of vote(s):

Dr M M GONDWE: House Chairperson, the war against malfeasance and misconduct in the Public Service has been lost, all thanks to the ineffectiveness of the department. The department as a primary custodian of norms and standards in the Public Service has failed our Public Service on two major fronts: Firstly, the department has failed to monitor and exercise oversight over the norms and standards in the Public Service; and secondly, the department has failed to support individual government departments in relation to the enforcement of these norms and standards. These failures by the department have also significantly contributed towards the consequence management and accountability deficit in the Public Service.

To put things into context, the state lost a staggering R1,5 billion to financial misconduct on the part of public servants and paid close to R70 million in salaries for 417 public servants who are currently on suspension with full pay, and the department and the Minister of Public Service and Administration have done nothing quantifiable to address these issues. We call on the department, together with its technical

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 134

assistance unit, to immediately intervene in the two ongoing crises in the Public Service. Namely, the financial misconduct crisis and the discipline management crisis. The two crises are costing the state billions and millions of rands on an annual basis and could have been circumvented had the department been consistently assisting government departments to enforce norms and standards.

We further call on the department to take the lead in relation to the implementation of the framework towards a professionalisation of the public sector. Despite the framework receiving Cabinet approval in October last year, the department has still not published directives on the implementation of the framework and neither has it provided clarity on how the framework will be implemented and whether it will be responsible for the enforcement of the framework. I thank you.

Ms R N KOMANE: House Chairperson, the Auditor-General, AG, has highlighted that this department is failing in its duties to play an oversight. This department has not to an extent that critical targets were not met. Thus, we cannot confirm the stability in the Public Service, and this should concern everyone. This department still doesn't walk the talk in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 135

making sure that Batho Pele principles is adhered to, as witnessed by the portfolio committee doing its oversight, especially in Robert Mangaliso Sobukwe Hospital in the Northern Cape and in the Brits District Hospital in the North West. There are still capacity constraints hence there are delays in developing job competency framework for the public sector.

In Programme 4 the targets were set and none of them was achieved, yet 82% of the budget is spent. It is also very difficult to conclude that the budget was for compensation of employees since this department underspending of R5,5 million under the ... [Inaudible.] ... review. This shows that there's lack of capacity and there's lack of implementation on administrative policies. Yet, there is a well-paid government chief information officer that is the result of the blind cadre deployment by the ANC-led government. Some departments failed to meet all its targets yet expected to oversee the other departments.

The Department of Public Service and Administration failed to meet its target of 30% youth representation as of the 31st of March 2023. Youth constituted 16,45%, which is 13,55 less than the set national target. The department still is not doing

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 136

enough in the protection of the whistleblowers and the junior staff still suffer abuse of the senior managers because they fear to lose their employment or to be victimised. Therefore, we cannot support this budget. Thank you very much.

Prof C T MSIMANG: Hon House Chair, I'm presenting this on behalf of Inkosi R N Cebekhulu, Member of Parliament, MP. South Africans are unfortunately no strangers to inefficiency from the government when it comes to matters of service delivery. While we know theft and corruption are mostly the root cause, we also have to question the material systems that are in place. There seems to be still reliance on paper driven processes in some of our government departments which has often resulted in delayed or no service delivery due to documents having been lost or misplaced. Think of those who applied for Reconstruction and Development Programme, RDP, houses years or even decades ago, but are still waiting, likely, because the lost documents, and all those who have lost jobs are looking to get financial support through Unemployment Insurance Fund.

The Centre for Public Service Innovation is at the head of minimising the service delivery inefficiencies our people are facing, therefore regressing on maintaining a clean audit.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 137

Further exacerbates the challenges faced by South Africans achieving only 17 of the 26 annual targets indicates a clear lack of proper planning from the Centre for Public Service Innovation, CPSI, which is of great concern to us as it leads to questions. How we can trust this entity to come up with more efficient ways of services to be delivered. Therefore, the IFP accepts the report. I thank you, hon House Chair.

[Time expired.]

Mrs H DENNER: House Chair, one of the strategic priorities of this department is intensifying the fight against corruption. Therefore, in its undertaking to promote anticorruption efforts in the Public Service, a database on Public Service employees appointed as board members to entities was developed to track the activities of board members in their governance roles of public entities. Secondly, adherence to policy prohibiting Public Service employees conducting business with the state and to monitor the performance of other remunerative work by Public Service employees is done. And lastly, in line with the Public Service Regulations, PSR, the e-disclosure system enables members of senior management to disclose their financial interests. Yet nearly not a week goes by in this country without some or other corruption scandal involving the Public Service making headlines.

The Thuja Capital Fund scandal involving the Department of Employment and Labour is one of the latest headlines that created quite a stir. Not only is the director of this company, which was not registered with the CIPC, the Chair of the board of an entity of the Department of Employment and Labour, but also did the director-general and Commissioner of the Unemployment Insurance Fund, UIF, apparently pushed through the R5 billion payment for a tender that did not meet the master of the tender process.

However, the real story is that the Minister of Employment and Labour and several other prominent politicians apparently stood to make about R500 million from this deal, and as he said in the media, this is a developing story. The fact of the matter is ... [Inaudible.] ... that the Department of Public Service and Administration can set all the targets in the world. If there's no political will to promote an ethical, honest and professional public administration, it won't happen.

Afrikaans:

'n Vis vrot van sy kop af. Kap korrupsie se kop af deur die ANC te verwyder en slegs dan sal die openbare sektor gered kan word. Dankie Voorsitter.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 139

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chairperson, the NFP will support Budget Vote 11 tabled here today. I think I want to address this through you, Chairperson, I want to remind the Chief Whip, on what she raised the other day, just after we came back from our Ireland and Kenya tour on what people were being paid, particularly Members of Parliament. A level three South African official earned R1 147 million, and a level 16 earned R2 130 million, when Members of Parliament earned just over R1 million or so a month. Unions and many others are raising serious concerns and are attacking Members of Parliament. South African officials are some of the highest paid in the world in terms of the latest report that has been released. Talking about the public sector and salaries, I want to say, once again, that the people of Gaza and Palestine are not able to get paid now because their monies have been cut by the Israeli government.

Let me go on further to say that this department had only achieved 17 out of its 26 targets. More importantly, I think the public ... [Inaudible.] ... received an unqualified audit finding in 2022-23 financial year. The department regressed from maintaining a clean audit, which is a concern to the committee. Further to that is that the committee noted that the contribution of Centre for Public Service and Innovation

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 140

maintaining a clean audit must be welcomed, but very importantly, and again, we are talking about 24 national departments out of 71 provincial departments indicated that they performed lifestyle reviews or were in the process of finalizing them. That's one of the serious concerns. The committee also called upon greater collaboration between the memorandum of agreement that they entered with the Department of Communication and Digital Technologies as well as with Seta. The NFP supports this report. Thank you.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Al Jama-ah supports the report. Thank you very much.

Ms T MGWEBA: House Chair, and hon members, the professionalization of the public service is a critical focus the department has been leading as part of implementing Priority One of the Sixth Administration of building an ethical and capable developmental state. The digitized public service is the programme we have urged the government to speed up towards the approval of the digital government policy framework for the public service to improve co-ordination between the various role-players within the e-government space in the public sector. We have recommended that the Centre for Public Service Innovation should ensure that all successful

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 141

innovation projects aimed at resolving service delivery challenges are replicated in other provinces. The Centre for Public Service Innovation requires additional funding to increase its impact. The tabling of both the Public Service Amendment Bill and the Public Administration Amendment Bill will strengthen the department's mandate and parameters to implement the professionalization framework. We are concerned with the level of noncompliance with legislation in the public service and require that the department ensures consequence management and improved discipline management in the public service. We further recognize progress pertaining to the implementation of the guide to implement lifestyle audits aimed at preventing and detecting fraud and corruption in the public service by the public administration ethics, integrity, and disciplinary technical assistant unit. We support this Budgetary Review and Recommendation report. I thank you, hon Chair.

Question put: That the report be adopted.

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 142

Report accordingly adopted.

**DECISION OF QUESTION ON DRAFT RESOLUTION (MR J S MALEMA):
CLOSURE OF THE ISRAEL EMBASSY IN SOUTH AFRICA AND SUSPENSION
OF ALL DIPLOMATIC RELATIONS WITH ISRAEL**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, the next item on the Order Paper is a Decision of Question on the Draft Resolution in the name of the hon J S Malema. Hon members, I wish to remind you that this Draft Resolution was debated in a virtual mini plenary on Thursday 16, November but that the decision thereon can only be taken in a full plenary. Hon members, I now put the motion:

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Moved as an amendment: That paragraph 9 be amended with the insertion of the following words after "Israel" in the last line:

Until a ceasefire is agreed to by Israel and Israel commits to binding United Nations facilitated negotiations whose outcome must be a just, sustainable, and lasting peace.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 143

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I have been furnished with the proposed amendment as moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party. According to Rule 121, a member may propose an amendment in writing, which has been done, to a Draft Resolution provided that the amendment does not exceed the scope of the resolution or is ruled out or order for any other reason by the presiding officer.

Having considered the proposed amendment moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party, I rule as follows: That the amendment is in order as it only seeks to clarify the circumstances of the closure of the Israeli Embassy and the suspension of diplomatic relations. If any member disagrees with the amendment, they can vote against it or even abstain from it when a division is called.

Having clarified this matter, I rule that we proceed with the question before the House. I also applied my mind to the request for the declarations that have been received. In terms of Rule 108, I will now allow one member from a political member wishing to make a declaration on the proposed amendments to do so. The usual time for declarations will apply. The declarations should focus on the suitability or acceptance or not of the amendment as moved by the Chief Whip

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 144

of the Majority Party, and in no way does it open the debate that was concluded last week, Thursday.

Mr N SINGH: I note the amendment proposed by the ANC, But I think in all fairness, all of us in the House, even though the amendment was furnished to the table, it would have been fair for all members of all political parties to receive the amendment so we could look at the amendment and make a considered decision. This is now being pounced upon us and we are to vote and declare on something that we have just heard. Maybe our members on the virtual platform might not have heard it as well.

I am making an appeal that we find some way of dealing with this matter so that we can take an informed decision in one way or the other.

Mr J S MALEMA: Hon Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, I will recognize you, hon Malema.

Dr C P MULDER: Thank you, hon Chairperson, I am covered by what the hon Singh just mentioned. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 145

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, hon Malema!

Mr J S MALEMA: Chair, we agree with the amendment as made by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party, and that what hon Singh is saying from his own imagination. He is not quoting any law, or he is not referring to any requirement for that matter. It can't be that because I have a different view, the Rules must apply differently. There is no Rule that is asking anyone to speculate anything. The amendment has met the requirements as you have indicated, Chair. That is the beginning and the end of the amendment. We, therefore, support it and we want to applaud the ANC for its maturity on this matter. It doesn't matter how we can disagree politically, but when it come to the issue o humanity, we must protect the human rights of all human beings all over the world. Thank you, ANC, and thanks to EFF's Members of Parliament.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon Malema. Hon members, I must add that in terms of my ruling that I gave, I studied the proposed amendment very carefully, and it does not extend the scope of the resolution. I would implore though in future that this information is shared once submitted to the table, to all the political parties so that they can familiarise themselves with the amendment made to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 146

paragraph 9 of the original resolution. Hon members, is there any other comment or declaration in this regard?

Dr C P MULDER: Hon House Chair, you indicated that you'll allow declarations of vote, are we there now or not yet?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Well, hon member, the different members started expressing themselves. On that part, I will allow if there are declarations on this matter.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Dr C P MULDER: Hon Chairperson, I think your ruling is correct that there should be declarations. The Parliament and the committee did not have the opportunity to discuss or debate the amendment. The amendment was only moved today. The amendment is different from the original motion in the sense that the original motion did ask for the suspension of all diplomatic relations with Israel. Now the amendment is something different and it creates certain conditions. The first condition that it creates, says there should be a ceasefire that Israel agrees to. That is the first precondition that the ANC now sets.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 147

The second one that the ANC now sets, they are now extracting Israel to commit themselves to binding United Nations facilitated negotiations, but it even goes beyond that. They are now binding the United Nations process by also saying the outcome must be just, sustainable lasting peace. So, it is a different motion altogether. The fact of the matter is, once again, the EFF took the lead and the ANC follows. That is quite clear.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!
Order!

Dr C P MULDER: If there was ever a time to keep negotiations and discussions open, it was now. You may not be aware of that but at this moment there are negotiations going on in Israel between Israel and Palestine. You will not know that the first of those negotiations will probably be the release of 50 hostages, women, and children and will not necessarily lead to a ceasefire but it will lead to a suspension of hostilities for approximately five days. So that process is now going on. But the South African government, with this position, have decided ... [Interjections.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 148

Dr C P MULDER: ... that South Africa wants to opt-out. We don't want anything to do, we don't want anything to say in this regard, South Africa will be absent. You have decided to take this responsibility and decision and you must understand that it will have consequences for South Africa, it will have consequences for the role that we play in the international community. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members! Hon Tobias, will you switch off your microphone?

Dr C P MULDER: The motion that you want to adopt will have consequences for the standing of South Africa in the international world. I think it's a mistake and I think we should not proceed with this, but be that as it may, the ANC has followed the EFF. We will vote against this motion and I think we are making a big mistake. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, just calm down. Each party will get an opportunity to make a declaration but let us not drown the speaker on the podium. He has got a right to say what he wants to say and you will also get an opportunity to make your remarks. Are there any further declarations?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 149

Ms N V MENTE: Chair, on a point of order: We cannot allow people to make points of irrelevance. They must talk to the amendments. and not talk about general issues that were debated already. They are wasting our time now.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, I have listened to the hon Mulder, he made a point about why he has certain views around the amendments of the motion. The DA?

Ms E L POWELL: Chairperson, the DA has already fully ventilated its position on this matter, and so I'm just going to take this opportunity to say that this motion runs counterintuitive to the ANC's stated aims of having a genuine stake in negotiating a peaceful resolution to this crisis because by withdrawing the diplomatic representation from Israel and expelling or demarche the Israeli embassy in South Africa, we are severing diplomatic ties and, therefore, we have no genuine stake in playing a meaningful role in negotiating a peaceful resolution.

May I also just say, that there are 25 000 South African citizens in Israel who will now not have any access to consular services, but more so, the South African embassy in Tel Aviv works in tandem with the embassy in Ramallah, and so

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 150

the embassy in Ramallah will now not be able to function and serve people in that territory, so it's having unintended consequences and essentially, citizens living in both Ramallah and in Israel will now have to go to Jordan and Egypt for consular services. So the DA does not support the amendments that have been brought on the floor ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members, order!

Ms E L POWELL: ...and the ANC is essentially scoring an own goal here by having made these proposed amendments. So the DA's position is it's a firm no from us. We need to have a stake in mediating a peaceful resolution to this conflict that culminates in a two-state solution where a free Palestine and a secure Israel can coexist in peace. Thank you, Chair.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon members on the platform, let's not spoil this. You know what the Rules are. Let's stick to the Rules both on the platform and in the House.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 151

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, we learn in Scripture that blessed be the peacemakers, for they will be sons of God. By this amendment, I firmly believe that we are losing the opportunity as South Africa, to be honest brokers in the situation and as we now speak, Israel and Hamas have said a truce and captive release deal is closer than ever and this has been facilitated by third-party countries. South Africa could play that role, but by this amendment, we are basically ... and yes, it is should it pass a motion, it is a call upon the government and the government will then take its decision separately.

I would urge the government to consider and not urge the ANC to consider what the hon Department of International Relations and Co-operation Minister herself said four months into the Russian-Ukraine, she said the international community must focus on finding a sustainable solution that has been South Africa's position on Israel and Palestine continually. The Minister emphasised that a solution will not be found in isolating one party or trying to bring a party to its knees. Yet this is exactly what this amended motion seeks to do.

Thankfully, Minister Pandor, in response to a written question filed yesterday, stated that the breaking of diplomatic ties with Israel would be unlikely and counterproductive. That is,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 152

from the executive's position. Surely ANC Members of Parliament can realise that it is not in the best interest to pursue this motion as amended because of the outcome of the United Nations facilitating negotiation ... yes, it sounds wonderful, but it's going to take time. It's been taking years, and we need to be part of that solution as peacemakers. However, and it's very clear, as we know, the Israeli ambassador has been recalled by Israel already today.

It is so important for us to understand the consequences of this decision, the consequences of being influenced. That's why the Arab countries around Israel have not broken off ties because they want to have the influence. Only one country, Bolivia, has broken off ties. Never before that I can remember South Africa ever breaking off diplomatic ties with a country, and I want to address the ... [Interjections.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members.

Mr S N SWART: ... tens of millions of Christians who love Israel and the Holy Land. A decision to break of diplomatic ties is unprecedented and will make it very difficult to visit the Holy Land. What is this sense of this little country that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 153

is the size of the Kruger National Park ... [Inaudible.] ...

The ACDP will not support this amended motion. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, please stick to the amendments. The amendments have been distributed. In your input keep that in mind, please.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chair, I take it that members who were in the mini plenary last week did hear hon Hlengwa expressed the view of our party on this matter and unfortunately, not all of us could be in that mini plenary, because we had other commitments. However, what we would like to say and see today ... With our hard-fought democracy in South Africa, where thousands of people lost their lives through armed conflict, through an onslaught by the apartheid government, because they had a defence force that was capable of destroying us at that time, our forefathers and our founding fathers considered that the only way for us to achieve what we have today is through peaceful negotiation.

Now, one would understand that the circumstances in Israel and Palestine are somewhat different from what we went through here. The loss of lives is unacceptable on both sides, where women and children are suffering as a result of the fact that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 154

leaders can't come together, and even the United Nations cannot come together, to arbitrate in this matter. We would like to say that we still support a two-state solution, and we feel that we should not play ourselves out of this game, as South Africa.

As we speak, the hon President of our country is leading a Brics delegation, talking about finding a peaceful solution. I believe we should not play ourselves out of the game by not being involved in a peace process through a diplomat that we have in that country. Thank you very much.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Chairperson, firstly, allow me to thank the EFF and the ANC for agreeing on this amended motion. Indeed, this compromise between the two political parties shows that they are focusing on wanting a peaceful solution. Putting pressure on the Israeli government is something that nobody on this left did, other than the EFF. None of these political parties made a single statement, directly condemning and asking Israel to stop blowing up these children and hospitals.

For 75 years, negotiations have been taking place. Nothing has been achieved. So, what negotiations are you talking about?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 155

What do you want to negotiate? The only way you can negotiate is by putting pressure on them to come to the negotiating table. And that is what we are doing. We are now putting pressure to say, let us have a ceasefire. Why is there this thing of going on killing and killing and killing? Why can't we stop it and say, let's sit down and talk about it? If you did not achieve it for 75 years, are we going to achieve it now because the DA or the ACDP or the FF Plus said we must do it?

They could have played a pivotal role in bringing pressure to the Israelis, together with all of us in saying, let us find a peaceful solution. They are not interested in that. Do you know why? It is all about the money that they get. This is what it is. They have sold their souls. That is basically what it is.

So, this is giving us an opportunity. Now, remember, the EFF's motion - and that is what I would have agreed on originally - shut it down and shut it down now. And to the IFP, I want you to remember what happened during the days of apartheid. If you say negotiations on negotiations only, what about the tens of thousands of black brothers and sisters of mine that died, maybe not ... [Inaudible.] but of mine that died? Where did it

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 156

come from? It is the violence that created it. What have you done to stand up, the IFP, and say to the Israeli government, with the relationship you have and the moneys that you receive, can you please stop, let us save these children's lives, let us stop it ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shaik Emam, will you take your seat. Order, hon members! I want to hear hon Singh.

Mr N SINGH: Chairperson, I want to rise on a point of order: The hon member is entitled to his point of view, but he must not make spurious allegations here that we get money from any source. [Interjections.] It is not a political ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order! Order, hon members. Order!

Mr N SINGH: ... it is a direct statement that the IFP receives money from these sources and that's why we are taking the decision, and that is wrong. It has to be withdrawn.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, order! I will check Hansard, because I heard it a bit differently. I

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 157

heard it ... The member made the remark of money, but he did not mention any political party. It is only now later that he is addressing a matter that the NFP has with the IFP and that is normal in the course of debate. Please, proceed, hon Shaik Emam.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chairperson, we say, let's negotiate and yes, I agree. The question I want to ask is: How many more children must die? How many more houses must be demolished? How many more people must die of starvation, before we decide we must do something? So, I want to say, I am so proud today to stand here and be a Member of Parliament of this National Assembly, of this beautiful country, in the stand that we are taking.

Yes, we might be a small, insignificant part of the world to some of them, but the stand we are taking, the principle stand to shut the embassy, until and they decide to bring a ceasefire, will save lives. And we can have a peaceful solution. So, the NFP supports it. Thank you very much.

Mr M NYHONTSO: Hon Chair, we are supporting the motion, the amendment, as tabled by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party. Now, we can vote for the actual motion.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 158

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon House Chair, we have heard about the release of over 100 Hamas Palestinian child hostages that is imminent. As we know, Hamas consults South Africa in everything that they do, especially with the help of Egypt. The motion of the EFF, as amended by the ANC is the most revolutionary motion ever debated in the Sixth Parliament, and must be part of our legacy report, so that future generations can be proud of the Sixth Parliament.

The amendment should have gone further. There is no place for Israel in South Africa, and every trace of Israel must be wiped off our land, South Africa. So, Al Jama-ah will support the amended motion, although we want more. That embassy must get the same fate as the hospitals in Gaza. It must be wiped off the face of the earth and a legal way must be found to wipe the embassy building in South Africa off the face of the earth. We don't want any memories of Israel in South Africa anymore.

Those who commit genocide and other members who support genocide anywhere in the world are the worst of mankind, since the Iron Age of civilization, just like those who are responsible for the holocaust and those still alive responsible for the holocaust must be hunted down. The same

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 159

for those who are responsible for the genocide and their supporters, and there are some in this House.

I would like to apologise to Christians in Gaza for the support of South African Christians for Israel. I and hon Shaik Emam tried to soften their hearts, but we failed. Seven hundred of the most prominent Jews in South Africa have called for an immediate unconditional ceasefire. They are the Jews that South Africa needs now more than ever before. I'm sure there are many other Jews like that.

Al Jama-ah solutes the Commander in Chief of the EFF and thank you to the EFF and the ANC for the support for this revolutionary motion. Thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, it is not surprising that the DA, ACDP, FF Plus were not going to support the motion and the amendment. That is not surprising. We, the people of South Africa, who know exactly what it means when you are killed, when women are killed, when children are killed. We know, we have gone through that, we are victims of that. And therefore, we are not ashamed to fully support Palestine. The hypocrisy that has been shown here, you think that if you quote that the President is doing one, two and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 160

three, we are aware of that. We are an arm of state. We have a right as this Parliament today to express our view on the unfolding genocide that is happening in Palestine. And therefore, ...

IsiXhosa:

... kolu gonyamelo lokubulawa kwabantu ngokungenalusizi ...

English:

... how do you rush to negotiations when there is no ceasefire. You have to level the playing field, ceasefire for you to be able to negotiate. The entire world is faced with the responsibility of bringing an end to genocide, killings and untold human suffering that is happening in Palestine. As we speak now, the President of the Republic of South Africa indeed is chairing an extended meeting of Brics whose objective is to bring about ceasefire. You don't want to go to ceasefire ...

IsiXhosa:

... ningxamele uthethathethwano. Makuqale kuyekwe izixhobo ezi kungabulawa abantu.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 161

As we speak, we have lodged this ... [Inaudible] ... 17 November through our Ambassador to the Netherlands, to the International Criminal Court, ICC Chief Prosecutor Karim Khan, a request to investigate and establish all the facts because we do believe that, in the case of Israel it is their head of state whom we say needs to have an arrest warrant used against him because as we believe the evidence required is overwhelming.

IsiXhosa:

Bobuphi obunye ubungqina esibufunayo abantwana bebulawa kangaka?

English:

Seventy-five per cent of women and children have been killed, displaced, homeless, not allowed to access health care facilities. In Gaza, more than 12 000 people killed. Today, we're supposed to speak in one voice as parties to say ceasefire, free Palestine. But because you benefit out of whatever feels you good, you don't want to support anything.

IsiXhosa:

Asothuki ke thina nto zaziyo. Asothuki ke thina bantu bazana nalo mzabalazo neziva zawo. Sithi ke incedile iEFF yeza naso

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 162

esi siphakamiso, siyasixhasa. Kuni maKrestu ize ningavumi ukulahlekiswa.

English:

Let us be clear that this is not a religious war, as some have tried to tell us this afternoon in this declaration.

IsiXhosa:

Asinguye laa Sirayeli wasebhayibhileni lo, kuyabulawa kulo uSirayeli. Lo ngokaNetanyahu asinguye lowa kaYesu Krestu. Musani ukuhamba nimfifitheka nivalwa amehlo ngabantu abafuna ukusebenzisa ubuKrestu ukucinezela abantu, bathathe umhlaba nezimbiwa babashiye belambile abantu basePalestine.

English:

Our government has withdrawn its diplomats from Israel for the consultation. And we note ...

IsiXhosa:

... ubemele kakade la mthunyuwa wesizwe ukupakisha agoduke, bekungasekho nto yakhe apha. Bekukhalwa ngaye kubuzwa ukuba uhlala njani apha abantu bakubo bebulala abantu, ihlabathi lonke likhala. Ingathi ningakhe nizame ukulunga niyiqonde into yokuba sithetha ngabantu apha.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 163

English:

When we talk these numbers, we are talking human beings that have been killed. Others are still under the rubbles ...

IsiXhosa:

... abakaziwa ukuba baphi na, nina niza kuma apha kule ndawo nithi hayi masingathethi ...

English:

... about the ceasefire and negotiations. Our amendment to the EFF's motion calls ...

IsiXhosa:

... mandiniphindele ...

English:

... calls for a ceasefire to be agreed upon and both parties to the conflict commit to binding United Nations facilitated negotiations whose outcome must be just, sustainable and lasting peace.

IsiXhosa:

Thina sifuna uxolo ehlabathini.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 164

English:

We stand for peace, and everyone that is violating human rights.

IsiXhosa:

Lutshaba lomzabalazo, lutshaba lwesizwe, kwaye thina siza kumanyana naye nabani na ofuna uxolo nofuna ukuba iPalestine ikhululeke.

English:

Free Palestine now! Free Palestine! Ceasefire until this achieved. The Israel Embassy should remain closed.

IsiXhosa:

Bade balunge, bade bayiqonde le nto imbi bayenzayo.

English:

Thank you very much.

Ms B P MABE: Free Palestine!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members.

Order hon members. Order. Hon members, before I put the question, I wish to respond to some direct or indirect

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 165

comments made on the competence of the Assembly to deal with this motion and its amendment. The scope of a resolution must be understood to mean its intent. That is what it seeks to achieve.

The specific question before the House today is whether, based on the grounds advance, the House should call on government to close the Israeli Embassy, and suspend all diplomatic relations with Israel. The Constitution provides not only for the legislative role of Parliament, but also for its oversight and accountability functions, the facilitation of public involvement, co-operative government and international participation.

Members of Parliament represent the interests of people in government, in all these processes. Members are well within their rights to bring such a motion to the House for consideration. The opportunity was given last week and today. All political parties to express their views during this debate. The draft resolution and its amendment takes into account the separation of powers and the role of government in foreign policy formulation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 166

Should members of the House adopt the resolution, it will be conveyed as a formal resolution of the National Assembly to the Executive. Such a resolution will be political persuasive rather than instructive, as would be the case with legislation. If members disagree with the motion, they can of course when the question is put, vote against it or even abstain from voting. Their views will also be recorded in the Minutes of Proceedings, which will be conveyed together with the motion. The motion is thus in order as well its amendment, and I now want the Assembly to consider it. I now put the motion. Are there any objections?

Dr C P MULDER: Chairperson, on a point of order. First you have to put the amendment.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, the amendment to the motion, that's what I was speaking to. Hon members, I want to put the amendment to the motion of the hon Mr. J S Malema, as moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority party. Are there any objections?

Division demanded.

The House divided. (Bells rung or five minutes)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 167

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order hon members, please take up your allocated seats. Order hon members, will you take up your seats so that we can proceed with the voting on this item. Thank you. Hon members, the Speaker has determined that, in accordance with the Rules, a manual voting procedure will be used for this division. In order to establish a quorum, I would request the Table to confirm that we have the requisite number of members physically present in the Chamber and on the virtual platform to take this decision.

Party Whips will then be given an opportunity to confirm the number of their members present and indicate if they vote for or against the question. Order hon members. There are members who are not paying attention. They are simply continuing with their discussions. A member who wishes to abstain or vote against the party vote may do so by informing the Chairperson.

A quorum being present in terms of Rule 98(1), voting commenced.

AYES - 248: (ANC - 200; EFF - 43; ATM - 2; NFP - 1; PAC - 1; Al'Jama-ah - 1).

NOES - 91: (DA - 67; IFP - 11; FF Plus - 9; ACDP - 4).

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 168

Amendment on the motion agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order hon members, order. We are not done yet. We are not done yet, order.

Question put that the motion as amended, be agreed to.

Division demanded.

The House divided. (Bells rung for two minutes.)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order hon members. Hon members, as previously indicated, the manual voting procedure will be used for this division. I have established that we do have a quorum and I will request the party Whips to confirm the number of members present and how they wish to vote. Once again, a member who wishes to abstain or vote against the party vote may do so by informing me when the question is asked. Hon members, the question before the House is that the Motion on the Order Paper as amended, be agreed to. Voting will now commence.

The doors will remain locked and no members are allowed to enter on the virtual platform until voting is completed. The

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 169

Whips will now confirm the numbers of the members present in the Chamber and on the virtual platform and also indicate if they vote for or against the question.

A quorum being present in terms of Rule 98(1), voting commenced.

AYES - 248: (ANC - 200; EFF - 43; ATM - 2; NFP - 1; PAC - 1; Al'Jama-ah - 1).

NOES - 91: (DA - 67; IFP - 11; FF Plus - 9; ACDP - 4).

Question agreed to.

Motion, as amended, accordingly agreed to.

Hon MEMBERS: Free, free Palestine. Free, free Palestine.

[Interjections.]

**PROFESSOR DIRE TLADI CONGRATULATED ON HIS ELECTION AS JUDGE OF
THE INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr K B PILLAY: *I move without notice* on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

- (1) congratulates Professor Dire Tladi of the University of Pretoria on his election, by the United Nations, UN, as a judge of the International Court of Justice;
- (2) remembers that the court's role is to settle, by international law, legal disputes submitted to it by states and to give advisory opinions on legal questions referred to it by authorised United Nations' organs and specialised agencies;
- (3) recognises that Professor Tladi is a leading international law scholar whose accomplishments span different areas, including academic, government, diplomatic and practice;
- (4) recalls that he has served as Chair of the International Law Commission, an organ of the UN, generally regarded as a feeder body the International Court of Justice;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 171

(5) further recalls that he served as Legal Adviser of the South African Mission in New York and Special Adviser to South African Ministers of International Relations; and

(6) wishes Professor Tladi well as he prepares to contribute to the court and its jurisprudence from the Peace Palace in The Hague, Netherlands.

Agreed to.

**CONGRATULATIONS TO RICARDO MALAJIKA AS INTERNATIONAL BOXING
ORGANIZATION WORLD CHAMPION**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T A KHANYILE: I move without notice on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

(1) notes that Ricardo Malajika, a professional boxer who hails from South Hills in Johannesburg, made the south of Johannesburg and the Republic proud when he won the International Boxing Organization world title, after

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 172

defeating Kevin Luis Munoz from Argentina on 2
September 2023;

- (2) remembers that Malajika won the title after being awarded a unanimous points decision at the Golden Gloves promotion tournament held at the Emperor's Palace in Kempton Park;
- (3) acknowledges that south of Johannesburg is an area with a rich sporting history, particularly in the boxing rings;
- (4) that Malajika is also a former amateur South African multiple weight division champion; and
- (5) congratulates Malajika on his achievements and wishes him well on his journey as a new world champion.

Agreed to.

EFF CONDEMNS ROLL-OUT OF TAVERNS IN GAUTENG TOWNSHIPS

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 173

Ms L H ARRIES: I move without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the House -

- (1) notes that Heineken, together with the Premier of Gauteng, Panyaza Lesufi, announced that they are going to roll out more taverns in Gauteng townships;
- (2) further notes that these taverns have been rolled out with the endorsement of the ANC government in Gauteng;
- (3) acknowledges that alcohol and substance is a big contributor to crime in South Africa, particularly gender-based violence - alcohol and substance abuse in South Africa is a major contributor to the majority of fatal accidents that happen on our roads, killing thousands of people every year;
- (4) further acknowledges that the external costs associated with alcohol abuse far exceeds the revenue collected by the state in all forms, and

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 174

as a result, the country pays the price for a few alcohol companies to make profit;

(5) calls on society to participate in all campaigns against alcohol abuse;

(6) further calls on the House to condemn the popularisation of alcohol by the government when the consequences of alcohol and substance abuse are known.

Motion not agreed to.

**MAMELODI SUNDOWNS CROWNED THE FIRST AFRICAN FOOTBALL LEAGUE
CHAMPIONS**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L S MAKHUBELA-MASHELE: I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 175

- (1) notes that South Africa's Mamelodi Sundowns Football Club were crowned the first African Football League champions after they beat Wydad Casablanca of Morocco 2-0 at Loftus Versfeld Stadium in Pretoria on 12 November;
- (2) acknowledges that goals by Peter Shalulile and Aubrey Modiba ensured that Sundowns became the first team to lift the trophy of the inaugural competition;
- (3) understands that this was the first edition of Africa's effort at launching a super league with a six-week and eight-team knockout tournament;
- (4) recalls that a Super League for Africa was originally suggested by Fifa President, Gianni Infantino, who argued that it could transform the game of soccer in Africa;
- (5) further acknowledges that Sundowns also pocketed R75 million for winning the title; and
- (6) congratulates Sundowns on flying the country's flag high in the continent.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 176

Agreed to.

**CELEBRATES THE SPRINGBOKS OUTSTANDING ACHIEVEMENT IN SECURING
VICTORY AT THE RUGBY WORLD CUP**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N SINGH: I move without notice on behalf of the IFP:

That the House -

- (1) celebrates the outstanding achievement of the South African national rugby team, the Springboks, in securing victory at the Rugby World Cup;
- (2) notes that their triumph in the Rugby World Cup serves as a powerful reminder of the values that bind us as a nation and the potential that exists when we unite for a common purpose;
- (3) acknowledges that our nation's collective heart swelled with pride as we witnessed this exceptional team's determination, dedication and prowess on the rugby field;

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 177

- (4) recognises that the Springboks' success is not only measured by the championship title, but also by the unifying spirit they have ignited across our diverse nation;
- (5) expresses our gratitude to the fans whose unwavering support served as a powerful source of inspiration for the team; and
- (6) calls upon South Africans to join us in expressing our heartfelt congratulations to the Springboks and in extending our best wishes for their continued success in the future.

Agreed to.

**INTERNATIONAL DAY FOR THE ELIMINATION OF VIOLENCE AGAINST
WOMEN MARK THE LAUNCH OF THE UNITE CAMPAIGN**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms C M PHIRI: I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 178

- (1) notes that the International Day for the Elimination of Violence Against Women will mark the launch of the UNiTE campaign from 25 November to 10 December – an initiative of 16 days of activism concluding on the day that commemorates the International Human Rights Day on 10 December;
- (2) further notes that this year's UNiTE campaign theme is "Invest to Prevent Violence against Women and Girls";
- (3) understands that violence against women and girls is one of the most widespread, persistent, and devastating human rights violations in our world today and remains largely unreported due to the impunity, silence, stigma, and shame surrounding it;
- (4) believes that violence against women continues to be an obstacle to achieving equality, development, and peace as well as the fulfilment of women and girls' human rights;
- (5) further believes that the promise of the Sustainable Development Goals - to leave no one behind, cannot be

fulfilled without putting an end to violence against women and girls; and

- (6) calls on all citizens to increase awareness, galvanise advocacy efforts, and share knowledge and innovations to combat violence against women and girls.

Agreed to.

COMMENDS ADMINISTRATORS AND ALL CYCLISTS OF THE AMASHOVA

DURBAN CLASSIC CYCLE RACE

(Draft Resolution)

Mr W M THRING: I move without notice on behalf of the ACDP:

That the House –

- (1) commends the administrators of the Amashova Durban Classic Cycle Race held on 20 October 2023 between Pietermaritzburg and Durban;

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 180

- (2) congratulates all cyclist who completed the race in the most difficult of circumstances with blustering wind, driving rain and treacherous road conditions; and
- (3) calls on the Minister of Sport and Recreation to do more to advance cycling as a sport, particularly in the townships and rural areas, as means of keeping our young people away from criminal activities.

Agreed to.

SA GUIDE DOGS ASSOCIATION CELEBRATION OF ITS 70TH ANNIVERSARY

(Draft Resolution)

Mrs W R ALEXANDER: I move without notice on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the SA Guide Dogs Association celebrated its 70th anniversary of training guide and assistance dogs for persons with disabilities;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 181

- (2) acknowledges that guide and assistance dogs play an important role in enhancing and improving the quality of independent lifestyle for persons with disabilities;
- (3) remembers that the Guide Dogs Association is able to train these puppies to become guide dogs and assistance dogs in a mere two years due to their volunteers' incredible dedication and contribution to the improvement and independence of persons with disabilities must be noted;
- (4) recalls that the SA Guide Dogs Association also provides additional orientation and mobility services, including white canes skills, which aid persons with disabilities to live more independently; and
- (5) congratulates the SA Guide Dogs Association and their volunteers for the role they play in helping persons with disabilities to live independently and wish them success in their future endeavours.

Agreed to.

(Draft Resolution)

Adv B J MKHWEBANE: I move without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the House -

- (1) Notes that the SA Democratic Teachers' Union, Sadtu, is affiliated to Cosatu which is in a tripartite alliance with the ANC that contends elections, and members of Sadtu are directed by union to support the ANC to win elections;
- (2) Further notes that the involvement of teachers, particularly Sadtu members as presiding officers appointed by the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, is a threat to the legitimacy of the elections;
- (3) Acknowledges that elections are South Africa's cornerstone of democracy whose legitimacy and credibility must be protected by all as there is a deficit of trust between the IEC and the community after previous incidents of electoral irregularities;
- (4) Further acknowledges that South Africa has high levels of unemployment and many of the unemployed graduates

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 183

can be employed to serve as IEC presiding officers instead of political party allying teachers;

- (5) Calls on the IEC to publicly disclose how many of the presiding officers employed during the IEC weekend were vetted as teachers and if their association with the union is known;
- (6) Further calls the IEC to refrain from employing teachers at voting stations and IEC regional offices as presiding officers.

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): I put the motion before the House. Is there any objection? [Interjections.] There is an objection. The motion will not be preceded with. Motion without notice will be converted to a notice of a motion.

**EFF SADDENED BY THE PASSING OF THE GIFT OF GIVERS REGIONAL
HEAD IN GAZA, AHMED ABBASI AND HIS BROTHER**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M D MONAKEDI: I move without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the House -

- (1) (1)notes with sadness the passing of the Gift of Givers regional head in Gaza, Ahmed Abbasi, and his brother in a rocket strike, as they returned from morning prayers on Thursday, 16 November 2023;
- (2) remembers that Abbasi was appointed as head of the Gift of the Givers office in the region in 2013 and he served the people of Gaza with distinction;
- (3) further remembers that he was responsible for implementing multiple projects including the care of orphans, widows, the elderly, and the sick;
- (4) recalls that he delivered water through desalination plants, distributed food parcels, provided hot meals, and upgraded damaged homes; and
- (5) conveys its heartfelt condolences to his family, friends, and the Gift of the Givers Foundation.

Agreed to.

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 185

**CALLS ON THE SA POLICE SERVICE TO ENSURE SAFETY OF POLICE
OFFICERS**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: I move without notice on behalf of the NFP:

That the House -

- (1) notes that three police officers were brutally gunned down in the last few days, while two of them were on duty and one off duty;
- (2) further notes that one was gunned down in Tembisa, the second officer was gunned down in Durban outside the Pavilion, and the third in Dunoon, in the Western Cape;
- (3) also notes that police officers have served the SA Police Service in different capacities;
- (4) realises that police officers are vulnerable as a result of them living in informal settlements and traveling to and from work by public transport;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 186

- (5) further realises that the killing of police officers in South Africa appears to be a norm;
- (6) calls upon this honourable House to extend its condolences to the families and friends of the three police officers that were gunned down; and
- (7) calls on the SA Police Service to ensure that police officers live closer to where they work and provide that as protection from criminals.

Agreed to.

WORLD AIDS DAY

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S M DLAMINI: Chair, I hereby move without notice:

That the House-

- (1) notes that World AIDS Day is celebrated around the world on December 1 each year;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 187

- (2) further notes that this day has become one of the most recognised international health days and a key opportunity to raise awareness, commemorate those who have passed on, and celebrate victories, such as increased access to treatment and prevention services;
- (3) understands that as we mark the 35th commemoration of this important day, the theme for this year is "World AIDS Day 35: Remember and Commit";
- (4) ensures that everyone who needs HIV/AIDS treatment has access to treatment;
- (5) further ensures that everyone is empowered and educated to protect themselves from HIV/AIDS infection; and
- (6) calls upon our government, civil society, youth formations, and the community in general, to renew their resolve to fight this epidemic that has claimed millions of lives across the globe, fight against the stigma and discrimination associated with this disease, and restore the dignity and human rights of those affected.

I thank you, Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 188

Agreed to.

PASSING ON OF AMAZULU FOOTBALL CLUB PLAYER

(Draft Resolution)

Adv M R M MOTHAPO: Hon Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House-

- (1) notes with sadness the untimely passing on of AmaZulu Football Club player Bonginkosi "Bongi'Ntuli on Sunday, 5 November, at the age of 32 after being diagnosed with cancer;
- (2) recalls that two months before his passing Bongi Ntuli married the Amazulu Chief Executive Officer Sinenjabulo Zungu in a white wedding;
- (3) further recalls that he passed on the same day the families were supposed to have their umabo—a part of a traditional wedding where the bride presents gifts to the groom's family;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 189

- (4) acknowledges his loyal contribution to the Amazulu Football Club as he has been in the books of Usuthu since 2019;
- (5) remembers that Ntuli's best season was in 2019-20 when he contributed to 70% of AmaZulu's 20 league goals, scoring 13 and assisting once; and
- (6) conveys its condolences to the Zungu and Ntuli families as well as the entire football team.

Agreed to.

COMMEMORATION FOR ARMISTICE DAY

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S J F MARAIS: I hereby move without notice:

That the House-

- (1) notes that the world commemorates Armistice Day which is now commonly known as Remembrance Day on 11 November this year;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 190

- (2) further notes that Remembrance Day is the day of commemoration across all commonwealth countries for all fallen soldiers who have died in the line of duty since World War 1;
- (3) recognises that many South Africans have and continued to dedicate their lives to the defence of our nation and the values enshrined in our Constitution;
- (4) acknowledges the families who have been left behind by those brave soldiers who have lost their lives in the line of duty;
- (5) calls to appreciate our arm forces and our Military Veterans and to ensure that they receive the support and resources they need to fulfil their duties.

Agreed to.

WORLD CHILDREN' S DAY

(Draft Resolution)

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 191

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House-

- (1) notes that 20 November 2023 was World Children's Day declared by the UN General Assembly in 1959;
- (2) further notes that the World Children's Day also marks anniversary of the date that the UN General Assembly adopted the Convention on the Rights of the Child;
- (3) acknowledges that it is the day that presented an opportunity to advocate, promote and celebrate children's rights;
- (4) further acknowledges that the annual World Children's Day creates awareness to end wide spread suffering of children;
- (5) realises that this year World Children's Day falls within the time when thousands of children are being massacred;

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 192

- (6) understands that this year's Theme for World Children's Day: For every child, every right;
- (7) serves as powerful reminder of the suffering of thousands of children who have been denied these rights, and appeal to the South African government as a member state to engage with the international organisation in finding a just solution to end the hostilities and the provisions of human relief to children.

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M Lesoma): I put the motion before the House. Is there any objection? [Interjections.] There is an objection. The motion will not be preceded with. Motion without notice will be converted to a notice of a motion.

SOUTH AFRICAN YACHTSWOMAN KIRSTEN NEUSCHÄFER OF GQEBERHA

(Draft Resolution)

Ms M M RAMADWA: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 193

- (1) notes that South African yachtswoman Kirsten Neuschäfer of Gqeberha was on Tuesday 15 November, named female 2023 Rolex World Sailor of the Year at an awards ceremony in Malaga, Spain;
- (2) further notes that Ms Neuschafer, the first woman to finish first in the solo Golden Globe race earlier this year, beat three other finalists to the award;
- (3) acknowledges that she accomplished what no South African sailor has done before – winning a round-the-world race without the use of modern GPS systems and single-handedly;
- (4) applauds her for her remarkable achievements; and
- (5) sends its heartfelt congratulations to her on adding this prestigious award to her already significant list of accolades.

Thank you.

Agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 194

NOTICES OF MOTION

Ms C M PHIRI: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

Debates Gender transformative training to address toxic masculinity in society to combat negative aspect of patriarchy.

Ms H ISMAIL: I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

Debates the need for all Rand Water reservoirs servicing all affected provinces to be exempt from loadshedding, as access to water is a right enshrined in the Constitution.

Mr E MTHETHWA: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

Debates the plight of artists in rural areas, women in arts who are still expected to pay in kindness in order to access the industry, youth in arts, children in arts who ought to be protected even more than others so that they do not end

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 195

up like Msawawa, our dearly loved veterans who in their living days end up in shacks.

Adv M R M MOTHAPO: Hon Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

Debates increasing and strengthening of interventions geared at minimising the effects of child malnutrition and the right to food, which affects mostly children from poor households.

Thank you.

Ms M D HLENGWA: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the IFP:

Debates the recent revelations of poorly executed circumcision at a clinic in KwaZulu-Natal and the potential repercussions on the trust in medical male circumcision, a practice aimed at reducing the risk of males contracting HIV and other sexually transmitted diseases.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 196

Mr M J MASWANGANYI: Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

Debates strengthening of regulations in order to ensure that spaza shops comply with applicable standards and are not trading without permits and selling counterfeit goods and expired foodstuff.

Xitsonga:

Ndza khensa, Mutshamaxitulu.

Ms M E SUKERS: Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ACDP:

Debates the alarming increase in teenage pregnancies, and the ineffective Comprehensive Sexuality Education curriculum currently taught in our schools, and that according to the Department of Basic Education has been part of the curriculum since early 2000.

Mr B B NODADA: Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 197

Debates the Department of Basic Education's failure to eradicate pit toilets in a timely manner and the danger of unsafe infrastructure in schools for learners overcrowding, lack of labs, no libraries. Schools should not be the graveyards that this ANC government has turned them into.

The ACTING HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms R M M LESOMA): Hon members, just for record purposes, in terms of the schedule that I have I didn't skip anyone. Then I shall proceed. EFF?

Mr M N PAULSEN: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on its next sitting I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House-

debates the adoption and expansion of the civil society programme to create 1 million climate jobs.

Ms A GELA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on its next sitting I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 198

debates increased investment infrastructure to ensure construction of projects is undertaken with the necessary agency in order to improve access to basic services and increase the overall efficiency and competitiveness of our economy.

Mr I M GROENEWALD: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on its next sitting I shall move on behalf of the FF Plus:

That the House-

debates the failure of the Department of Finance over the last 30 years to act on all the red lights, often useful failure in terms of the Municipal Finance Management Act.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on its next sitting I shall move on behalf of the NFP:

That the House-

- (a) deliberates and resolves to put in place stringent visa requirements for Israeli citizens travelling to and from South Africa; and

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 199

- (b) that a process be initiated to identify South African in the Israeli Defence Force responsible for human rights violations and committing atrocities against the Palestinian community and be criminally charged and handed over to the International Criminal Court; and
- (c) That the government announces monitoring capacity to prevent illicit financial flows to and from Israel; and
- (d) that we reconsider the dual citizenship status of South Africans who may take up citizenship in countries that violate human rights.

Ms M M GOMBA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on its next sitting I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House-

debates co-ordinated and sustainable efforts geared at reducing the proliferation of drugs and substance abuse that poses a severe threat to South African communities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 200

Ms M M RAMADWA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on its next sitting I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House-

debates the increase in cash-in transit heists and how to use the comprehensive security and intelligence services to tackle the scourge.

Ms C V KING: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on its next sitting I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House-

debates the critical role of basic and higher education to narrow the skills and unemployment gaps in South Africa.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on its next sitting I shall move on behalf of Al Jama-Ah:

That the House-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 21 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 201

- (a) debates the banning of political parties from propagating and expanding views which support any country from illegally occupying another country;
- (b) such propagation amount to war, incitement of imminent violence, and advocacy of hatred based on race, ethnicity and religion, especially against fellow Christians.

Mr T N MMUTLE: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on its next sitting I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House-

debates the increase in ransom kidnapping and measures to prevent such occurrences.

Business Concluded.

The House adjourned at 18:41.