

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 1

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:02.

The Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

SUSPENSION OF RULE 290(2) (a)

(Draft Resolution)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Speaker, I move:

That the House suspends Rule 290(2) (a), which provides, *inter alia*, that the Second Reading of a Bill may not commence before at least three working days have elapsed since the committee's report was tabled, for

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 2

the purposes of conducting the Second Reading, today,
on the Customs and Excise Amendment Bill.

Question put: That the motion moved by the Chief Whip of
the Majority Party be agreed to.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

Question agreed to.

Motion accordingly agreed to.

EXTENSION OF AD HOC COMMITTEE DEADLINE TO 15 MARCH 2019

(Draft Resolution)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Speaker, I move:

That the House extends the deadline by which the Ad
Hoc Committee to Identify Suitable Candidates for

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 3

the Filling of Vacancies in the Commission for Gender Equality has to complete its task to 15 March 2019.

Question put: That the motion moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party be agreed to.

Motion agreed to.

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

- PUBLIC INVESTMENT CORPORATION AMENDMENT BILL

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of vote:

Mr R A LEES: Madam Speaker, when the hon David Maynier and I were appointed to the Standing Committee on Finance, it quickly became evident to us - and the hon Maynier, in particular - that all was not well with the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 4

investments being made by the Public Investment Corporation, PIC.

HON MEMBERS: Hear! Hear!

Mr R A LEES: It seemed to us that the investments were not always following the full due-diligence procedures of the PIC, and that there appeared to be an unwritten agenda to fund very risky projects if these projects were proposed by those with close and cosy relationships with highly placed politicians.

We then initiated a campaign to bring the PIC investment portfolio out into the open so that the validity of suspicions of bad investments could be assessed, and to allow for proper oversight over the operations of the PIC. The public scrutiny was of particular importance with regard to the PIC portfolio of unlisted investments.

Then, unexpectedly, on 7 September 2016, the hon Maynier and I were invited to a meeting in the office of Mcebisi Jonas, the then Deputy Minister of Finance and PIC board

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 5

chair. At this meeting, we were given sight of the full PIC investment portfolio, including unlisted investments. This was a huge credit to Mcebisi Jonas, and to Abel Sithole and Dan Matjila, who were exposing themselves to public scrutiny as never before. A full report on all the PIC investments was subsequently tabled with the Standing Committee on Finance.

This public exposure of the investment portfolio by Dan Matjila seems to fly in the face of the accusations of self-enrichment, and seemed to be an indication of political and ideological interference as being a key factor in bad investments. No doubt, the Mpati Commission of Inquiry will get to the bottom of this vexed question.

The access to the PIC investment portfolio confirmed the massive investment in Independent Media and was the prompt for the DA to find a way of greater parliamentary and public oversight over the operations of the PIC.

After considerable consultation with affected parties, the hon David Maynier introduced the Private Member's Bill that made provision for a public and parliamentary

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 6

role in the appointment of the PIC chair, full annual reports on investments to Parliament, annual reports on requests to the Minister for approval of significant transactions, as well as consultation with Parliament on regulations. It was, and remains our strong view that the PIC board must not have any political interference, and that the appointment of an independent chair of the board was essential to avoid political interference, particularly in the unlisted investment decisions.

This Bill was rejected by the Standing Committee on Finance as being undesirable, and the committee subsequently approved its own Committee Bill that we will deliberate on, later this afternoon. We look forward to further amendments to the Public Investment Corporation Act once the recommendations are received from the Mpati Commission of Inquiry. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

Mr Y I CARRIM: Speaker, comrades and friends, in brief, the fact is that it's not the DA, alone. All of us agreed that there were wrongs and difficulties in the PIC. All of us agreed something needed to be done about it. In

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 7

fact, we all supported the need for openness and transparency, given the constant allegations of wrongdoing in decision-making and the endless in-fighting within the PIC. It was there, in the public domain, staring at us all. No member of the committee could have said no to what the hon Mr Maynier jumped the gun, in fact, and did.

In fact, on 18 October 2017, it was the committee, as a whole, that took a resolution that we needed a committee to address some of these issues that were in the public domain and to which the PIC had failed to give adequate answers. The entire committee agreed on some of the features of the Bill.

A Committee Bill has to go through a particular process. Firstly, it has to go to the House and get, if you like, a motion of agreement that we can go ahead with the Bill. With a Private Member's Bill, you don't need that process. You can go very fast.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 8

So, in fact, the Bill that the hon Mr Maynier brought was, largely, what the committee, as a whole, including the DA ... It was the ANC - in fact, it was the chair of the committee who drafted that resolution. In fact, that was the very resolution that was used by the DA - never mind - by the DA it was used, and a Private Member's Bill was brought before the committee, referred to by us, by the Speaker of Parliament, in late January.

In the meanwhile, being Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS, time, October 2017, being a committee responsible for three Bills that we had to process, as the committee, as a whole, we only got going with our Committee Bill early in 2017. Never mind.

There were some overlaps between the DA Bill and what the committee wanted. Where we disagreed, as has emerged from what the hon Mr Alf Lees has only just said, is they said there should be an independent chairperson of the PIC board. We said the difficulty is that it is a defined benefit pension plan.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 9

That means that if the government's employees, if our employees in the public sector were to lose out, in terms of what they are entitled to in a payout, in terms of their pensions ... If the PIC makes bad decisions, even if the decisions are beyond their control, it is the fiscus that will have to come to the rescue. It is this Parliament that will actually have to find the money for that. Therefore, the Deputy Minister of Finance, as has been the tradition for many years now, should chair the board of the PIC.

We also said that we could, for example, have a Deputy Minister of Finance who was previously in a company that got a loan from the PIC. That person is now appointed as the Deputy Minister of Finance. He or she is made chairperson of the board, but because he or she was involved in a company that took a loan from the PIC previously, there will always be questions about chairmanship of the board by that Deputy Minister.

So, we said in circumstances like those, or for example, in politics in the real world we live in, a Minister may

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 10

not like the Deputy Minister's nose, and therefore decides he or she is not going to appoint the Deputy Minister as the chair of the PIC. We then said if that's the case, the Minister must go to Cabinet and they should, collectively, decide which other appropriate Deputy Minister should chair the board.

We cannot hand R2 trillion over to somebody who may act in good faith as the chair of the board - because ultimately, it's the chair who's accountable - but who is not somebody who represents the government.

We also agreed, given the pressures that were emerging at the time from the Public Servants' Association, PSA, which threatened to withdraw its funds from the Government Employees' Pension Fund, GEPF, and wanted to have nothing to do with the PIC, and Cosatu insisting that it wanted a stop to all of this, we agreed that there should be union representation. Those are issues that Comrade Thandi Tobias will call and I will deal with later.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 11

So, let's not make out this is a DA Bill. It was easier to get a Private Member's Bill off the ground, but it was, actually, our Bill, as a committee. [Interjections.]

Now, when it came to accountability, who has the most to lose, if not the ANC, as a majority? If there is wrongdoing in the PIC ... [Interjections.] ... if that has an effect ... [Interjections.] ... it was Cosatu! It was Cosatu that actually was the main driver of some aspects of this Bill because they actually felt very strongly their money was being abused. This is their money, ultimately, those who are members of these trade unions and those who are beneficiaries of the GEPF. It is their money. So, the depositors must have the main say on how their asset manager ... in fact, a substantial say, almost the whole say, on how the money must be invested.

However, when the PIC appears before our committee, it constantly tells us, as does the GEPF, that when they invest - and this is what the GEPF claims it says to the PIC - they must invest in projects that benefit the beneficiaries and, at the same time, contribute towards

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 12

investment in infrastructure, job-creating growth, transformation, and the like.

The very interesting thing is, contrary to the hon Mr Maynier's claims that the reason the PIC does not want to release its investments in unlisted companies is that there is corruption, when the statistics were released, when the information was released, both in a closed meeting and in an open meeting, what did we find? We found that the PIC is doing the very things, for the most part - as wrong as some of the things are - as we have as the list of guidelines. Not criteria, but guidelines that must be taken into account.

Only this morning, the *Business Day* carries a story in which the Companies and Intellectual Property Commission, CIPC, has asked the PIC to return R4,3 billion that was lent to a company, Ayo Technology Solutions, Ayo. That money belongs to the employees. It doesn't belong to us. Ultimately, it is we, in Parliament, that decide on a budget, not the executive. It is Parliament that must hold the executive and the PIC to account because it is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 13

Parliament, not the executive that, ultimately, has to decide on budgets.

The requirements on that Bill are the traditional requirements that any Minister has to offer Parliament. It hasn't been done in the Bill, as a whole. From the time of Jabu Moleketi, we are told, the tradition has been that the person who chairs the board is the Deputy Minister. If that is the tradition, what is the problem with putting it into law? Why not? Ultimately, it is this Parliament and the executive - who we hold to account more than even the PIC board chair - who will have to make up for that. Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

Question put: That the motion moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party be agreed to.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 14

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Will hon members go back to their allocated seats? [Interjections.] Hon members, will you take your seats? [Interjections.] When requested to do so, members must indicate their votes.

[Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: No. No. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes. Yes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: What's going on? [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: No! No! [Interjections.] Vote no!
[Interjections.]

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Speaker, on a point of order ...

HON MEMBERS: Vote no!

The SPEAKER: Who is raising a point of order? Yes, hon member?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 15

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Hon Speaker, I think you must ring the bells again. There is some confusion there on the other side, of the ANC. They don't know how to vote!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, can we take our seats, and when requested, you must vote ...

HON MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: ... according to your ...

HON MEMBERS: Your conscience! Your conscience!

The SPEAKER: ... according to your belief as to what's correct for you to vote. [Interjections.] You must vote yes if you agree with the report, no if you don't agree, and abstain if you wish to abstain. [Interjections.]

Hon members, the question before the House ...

[Interjections.] ... Hon members, the question before the House is that the report of the Standing Committee on Finance on the Report on the Public Investment

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 16

Corporation Amendment Bill be adopted. [Interjections.]

That is the question before the House. [Interjections.]

So, hon members, are you all in your allocated seats?

Hon members, my attention has been drawn to the fact that the Second Reading issue of the hon Maynier is not what is before us.

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: What is before us is the report of the standing committee ... [Interjections.] ... which has not yet been put. Indeed. So, hon members, we are now voting so that we can adopt the report of the standing committee.

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Alright? Voting will now commence.

Mr M WATERS: Madam Speaker, or reject the report, not necessarily adopt it!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 17

The SPEAKER: Hon Waters, please. Let's not disturb ... let's not interrupt the voting. [Interjections.] Voting will now commence.

Question agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

PUBLIC INVESTMENT CORPORATION AMENDMENT BILL

(Second Reading)

There was no debate.

The SPEAKER: As there is no Speaker's List I will now put the question.

Question put: That the Bill be not read a second time.

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the Bill not being read a second time as recommended by the committee?

[Interjections.] Yes, not being read as recommended by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 18

the standing committee. [Interjections.] There is an objection to the Bill not being read a second time as recommended by the committee. Hon Carrim?

Mr Y I CARRIM: Madam Speaker, it needs to be clarified that there are two Bills. One is a Private Member's Bill from Mr Maynier, and the other is a committee Bill. Perhaps it will help if you explained which Bill we are referring to. According to what we were advised by the parliamentary legal services unit, our understanding was that the procedure in a circumstance like this is that you first vote on a Private Member's Bill. Right? Then you vote on the committee Bill. So, Madam Speaker, I take it that we are now voting on the DA ... Mr Maynier's Private Member's Bill.

The SPEAKER: Which the committee is recommending should not be read a second time, and which is what I was telling the House just now. Alright? There is an objection from the DA that the Bill not be read a second time. We note the objection of the DA which in fact opposes the recommendation by the committee.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 19

Mr M WATERS: Speaker, you haven't put the question. However, the DA calls for a division. Thank you.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Colleagues, let's listen to the question from the Chair. Then we will vote accordingly please.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Speaker, how come the ANC's Chief Whip can just tell us what to do? We are not the ANC, chief. We are the EFF. [Interjections.] We are not the ANC, chief.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Singh, welcome to your seat. I would like to remind members that they may only vote from their allocated seats. Members must indicate their vote by pressing the correct button. The appropriate button should be pressed after the question has been put. When members want to agree with the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 20

question they must press the yes button. When they don't agree with the question as put by the Chair they must press the no button. When they want to abstain, press the abstain button.

The question before the House is that the Public Investment Corporation Amendment Bill not be read a second time.

[Voting take in from minutes]

Mr M WATERS: Point of order. Can I get clarity? We are dealing with the Bill. There weren't 201 votes cast in the House, so therefore it still stands. The item does not fall away and the question has not been supported by the committee ... that the Bill is not read a second time. Therefore, the Bill shall be read a second time. [Interjections.] You need 201 votes; you haven't got it.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Hon Speaker, we are very happy that the DA is rehearsing for the future. Thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 21

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I wish to say that what hon Waters said is accurate. We did not have 201 in terms of a majority in the House. Therefore, we postpone the decision on this particular matter and proceed to the Third Order. The secretary will read the Third Order.

As the result of the division showed that there was not a majority of the members of the National Assembly present for a vote to be taken on a Bill as required by Rule 96(a), decision of question postponed.

Mr N SINGH: Madam Speaker, I know you've made a ruling on that but just for clarity. The content of the Bill was financial in nature but it was a Private Member's Bill. Now, is there a difference there? Maybe the Table can advise us later on. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Okay, we'll come back to it later on. Can we now ask the secretary to read the Third Order?

Mr M WATERS: Speaker?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 22

The SPEAKER: Hon Waters, I wish to proceed to the Third Order.

Mr M WATERS: Just a point of clarity. Just a point of clarity if I may because I think this is the first time it's happened in the House.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr M WATERS: What impact does it have on the Public Investment Corporation Bill that we are going to be voting on now ... the fact that the Private Member's Bill still stands?

The SPEAKER: Hon Waters, I told you that we are postponing the decision on that Order and we are moving to the Third Order. We will note the questions that have been raised, and indeed, the Table will advise us.

Mr M WATERS: Okay, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Secretary, read the Third Order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 23

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE
- PUBLIC INVESTMENT CORPORATION AMENDMENT BILL: COMMITTEE
BILL

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I have been informed that Mr W W Wessels has withdrawn his amendments to the Bill that appear on the Order Paper today. I will now put the question. Are there any objections to the Bill being read a second time? [Interjections.]

So, we noted the objections of the DA and therefore that matter was agreed to. Now, the secretary will read the fourth order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 24

The DA members are welcomed back.

The DA MEMBERS: Thank you!

PUBLIC INVESTMENT CORPORATION AMENDMENT BILL

(Second Reading debate)

Ms T V TOBIAS: Hon Speaker, hon Deputy President and hon members good afternoon. Hon members, the President of the Republic of South Africa his Excellency hon Ramaphosa, during the state of the nation address spoke about triumph of hope over despair and he further encouraged us to build South African nationhood and called upon us to restore the integrity of the state institutions. As a Standing Committee on Finance, we are acting in sync with this in juncture.

Hon members, having seen what the DA has done today, I am asking whether the DA is building nationhood, are they ensuring that we triumph on hope and are a responsible party to make sure that the state-owned enterprises

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 25

thrive? [Applause.] In this context, South Africans, be the judge! The ANC is here to restore the integrity of the state-owned enterprises. [Interjections.]

Hon members, let me give context of this Bill. Following various allegations of wrongdoing by the Public Investment Corporation, PIC, in the public domain and the concerns of the trade unions and pensioners in the public sector that the PIC was making questionable investments, and representations by the trade unions, individual pensioners and the PIC to the Standing Committee on Finance, in this regard the committee arranged several briefings with the major parties concerned in 2017 and adopted a resolution on 18 October 2017, to introduce a Bill in Parliament that will seek to address this issues.

Hon members, interestingly that is when hon David Maynier jumped the gun and decided to introduce a private member's legislative proposal to try and triumph over what our own trade unions and the pensioners have instructed us to do as the committee. Therefore the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 26

committee received permission from the National Assembly to process the Committee Bill on 29 May 2018.

Following the committee resolutions of 18 October 2017, to effect amendments to the Public Investment Corporation Act, Mr David Maynier as I said, brought his Bill which the ANC will not support because of a desirability problem. Following this, there were discussions with Mr Maynier to merge his Bill with the Committee Bill, but there was no agreement on this and the committee decided to process both Mr Maynier and the Committee Bill simultaneously.

The committee held meetings with regard to the PIC on 17 October 2017, where it was briefed by the Government Employment Pension Fund, GEPF, the PIC and trade unions. On 18 October 2017, the committee adopted a resolution to receive further briefings and among other decisions, introduced amendments to the Principal Act governing the PIC.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 27

The committee held a follow-up briefing on 14 November where it was further briefed by the PIC, the GEPF, the then Deputy Minister of Finance, Mr Sfiso Buthelezi and the trade unions. On 24 April, the committee received a briefing on the Private Member's Bill and the proposed Committee Bill. The committee then agreed to a legislative proposal to amend the Public Investment Corporation Act through a Committee Bill as required by Rule 273 of the Rules of the National Assembly on 22 May 2018. The committee obtained permission from the National Assembly to process the Committee Bill on 29 May 2018.

Public hearings were held on the two Bills on 31 May and 15 August 2018, respectively. The committee also met on 27 April 2018, to finalise the Bill until February this year.

Here are the key issues in the Bill. Firstly, the Bill seeks to provide greater transparency and better governance in the PIC. Among the key issues are the following: The Minister must appoint 10 nonexecutive

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 28

board members including a representative of the National Treasury, two representatives from the largest depositor and one representative of any depositor whose assets under management by the PIC are at least 10% and I need to elaborate. There is the importance of having the depositors themselves, the trade unions and the pensioners to have a stake in the decisions made in the PIC board. Hence the shareholder compact is very clear about the mandate of the board.

The PIC must invest in projects that will benefit the beneficiaries of the depositors and act in accordance with the instructions of the depositors. I want to explain this point and that is why the DA does not like our Bill. Our Bill gives the workers of South Africa a voice on how their money must be invested.

[Interjections.]

The DA does not want the pensioner's money to be invested in domestic investments! [Interjections.] This is a party that does not like the workers and on the other hand, they want the workers to vote for them, but they do not

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 29

want the workers to have a voice! I hope South African workers will understand that this party sitting on the left does not support South African workers, only the ANC supports the working class. [Applause.]

The Minister must table a report annually to Parliament on all investments of deposits and request for approval of any significant transactions in terms of Public Finance Management Act and must table regulations on the PIC in Parliament.

Hon members, we now thought that the DA will support us on this one that the Minister must report to Parliament! The DA does not want an oversight mechanism, where Parliament has a voice and is able to oversee Ministers, because they are hoping that they will win the Vote and they do not want to be accountable! [Interjections.]

Mr Maynier's Private Member's Bill required the National Assembly to follow a public nomination process to recommend to the Minister a person to be appointed as the chairperson of the board. Other members of the board were

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 30

to be appointed by the Minister in consultation with the Cabinet.

Ms S V KALYAN: Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon Kalyan, on what point are you rising?

Ms S V KALYAN: I would like to ask if the hon member at the podium would take a question?

The SPEAKER: Hon Tobias, are you prepared to take a question?

Ms T V TOBIAS: Yes, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon Kalyan, you can go ahead and ask a question.

Ms S V KALYAN: Thank you, so much. Hon member, you are so convinced of what the PIC investments will do for the poor people of South Africa. Would you care to comment on

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 31

the Surve matter and how he has been enriched?

[Interjections.]

Ms T V TOBIAS: I am not going to comment. What is your question?

Ms S V KALYAN: That is my question.

Ms T V TOBIAS: What is the question? Are you asking for a comment?

Ms S V KALYAN: Would you tell the public, tell South Africans how Mr Surve enriched himself?

Ms T V TOBIAS: Hon Speaker, the hon member is wasting my time. There is no question. Please, can I proceed?

Ms S V KALYAN: I am asking the question, the hon member is not listening. Would the hon member tell South Africa how the PIC investment ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 32

The SPEAKER: Hon Kalyan, it sounds like now your question is leading to a debate with the speaker.

Ms S V KALYAN: I am asking a simple question. She is trying to convince ...

Ms T V TOBIAS: Hon Speaker, I beg for your indulgence. The hon member does not have a question.

Mrs S V KALYAN: Eh, eh, answer the question.

The SPEAKER: Hon Kalyan, it is alright. I think I have heard your question. Let me hear the hon Tobias.

Ms S V KALYAN: [Interjections.] ... because you have no answer. Tell them how Surve used the PIC money to enrich himself.

The SPEAKER: Hon Kalyan! Hon Kalyan, thank you for your question. Hon Tobias, are you making a comment on that issue?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 33

Ms T V TOBIAS: Hon Speaker, the hon Kalyan must be patient enough to listen to my comment. It is in a speech form. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon Tobias.

Ms T V TOBIAS: Thank you, hon Speaker. The majority in the committee decided that the Minister must designate the Deputy Minister of Finance or in consultation with the Cabinet, any other Deputy Minister within the Economic Cluster to chair the board as the public sector employees have a defined benefit, and if the PIC makes losses that reduce the pension benefits of the employees, it is the national fiscus that will have to make up for this.

After public participation process, the committee deliberated and resolved to remove the proposed clause which mandated the PIC to provide housing loans to members of the Government Employees Pension Fund, GEPF, who are in the missing middle with an income too high to qualify for state housing and too low to qualify for a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 34

loan from financial institutions. It was proposed that these housing loans for these members of the GEPF should be dealt with by the GEPF in terms of the Pension Funds Act which the DA does not like. The DA does not like the workers to have access to their pension funds to buy houses! [Interjections.]

The committee strongly believes that the GEPF laws should be reviewed reasonable soon after the new Standing Committee on Finance, Scof, is established in the Sixth Parliament. [Interjections.]

The committee discussed at length whether to postpone processing the Public Investment Corporation Bills before it in view of the commission of inquiry ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Tobias, I regret your time has expired.

Ms T V TOBIAS: I request the House to support this Bill.

I thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 35

Mr R A LEES: These are the wise people but who then are the fools? The fools are those who want to use the money, wisely stored up by working and pensioner members, to gulp it down on wasteful projects such as investments in AYO Technology Solutions amongst others.

We welcome the ruling by the Companies and Intellectual Property Commission, CIPC that the PIC must recover the R 4,3 billion plus interest irregularly invested in AYO Technology Solutions. We hope that the money has not already been spent lavishly and will not be recoverable, and now to borrow from Homer's Odyssey.

The ANC sponsored committee bill to amend the Public Investment Corporation Act is likely a Trojan horse that is the prelude to the introduction of prescribed assets by the ANC.

The offending clause in the PIC Amendment Bill states that the PIC must seek to invest in what on the surface would seem to be nice heart-warming projects, such as

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 36

those that create and protect jobs and those that industrialise the economy.

The reality danger of this clause is that it is an initial step towards the introduction of prescribed assets that is in the ANC manifesto and reads "Investigate the introduction of prescribed assets on financial institutions funds to unlock resources for investments in social and economic development".

It is exactly this political pressure that has got the PIC into such trouble with regard to so-called developmental projects such as investments in AYO Technology Solutions, which not only bring in no returns but simply don't have the value of the massive amounts of money poured into them by the PIC.

The latest indication of the real intention of the ANC is the statement hidden in the 2019 Budget that states that the PIC will consider swapping its Eskom loan debt for equity in Eskom.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 37

It is inconceivable that any reasonable person would give up a loan with interest returns for equity shares in a company that is bankrupt, shockingly managed and has little chance of ever paying any dividends. To top it all there would be no hope of ever selling such shares at all let alone at a profit.

The money in the GEPF belongs to its members and pensioners. The fact that the fund is underwritten by the State does not give the state the authority to determine what the returns on investment may be. It is exactly these returns on investment that determine what annual increases pensioners can affordably be paid.

Any reduction in investment returns reduces the increases that can be paid to pensioners. Simply said the prescription by the state that reduces investment returns is pure theft from pensioners who in any event find their real income decreasing year after year. Of course, this manifesto threat from the ANC is very loosely worded, and will not be restricted to the PIC and the R 2,0 trillion

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 38

plus funds of the Government Employees Pension Fund that it administers.

The wording of the prescribed assets clause in the ANC manifesto leaves the way wide open for a prescribed assets regime to be forced onto all financial institutions including all retirement funds, banks, insurance companies amongst others.

Another ANC clause in the PIC Amendment Bill that clashes with the position of the DA, and which is shared by perhaps the majority of South Africans given the degree of political interference and looting being exposed in the current commissions of inquiry, forces the Minister of Finance to appoint the Deputy Minister of Finance, or in special circumstances another deputy minister from within the economics cluster, as the Chairperson of the PIC board.

The lessons learnt from the sad saga of State Capture must surely be that the chairperson of the PIC board should not be a political figure. That is why the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 39

DA proposed that parliament call for nominations for the PIC board chairperson position. From these nominations Parliament would make recommendations to the Minister of Finance on who should be appointed as the chairperson of the PIC board.

This was rejected by the ANC. The balance of the content of the PIC amendment Bill was lifted, in many cases; word for word from the private members bill including hon Tobias, the representation of pensioners and workers as you put them on the board. That was our idea not yours. And so the accusation that the DA would be opposed to it is laughable. Hon. David Maynier an important changes especially for disclosure where client's funds are invested. Another misrepresentation, I'm afraid hon Tobias, we called for the complete oversight and disclosure. Indeed, I said that in my earlier speech

This disclosure shines light on the long suspected and politically motivated investments such as in the survey Independent Newspapers media house.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 40

Hon Speaker, despite the DA sponsored good parts of the Committee Public Investment Corporation Amendment Bill, and they are there, the DA will not support the Bill with the inclusion, by stealth, of prescribed assets and the entrenchment of political control of the PIC board. I thank you, Madam Chair.

Ms Y N YAKO: The Public Investment Corporations, the PIC, is an important and strategic institution as it deploys more than R2 trillion into the mainstream economy, which is important for South Africa and the rest of the continent.

First and foremost, the decisions of the PIC must at all times benefit workers whose money is managed through Government Employees Pension Fund.

One of the misconceptions which we must disabuse ourselves of is from the narrative that we want to paint the PIC as a corrupt ridden asset management company, an attempt to undermine the achievements of Africa's largest asset manager under African leadership, however,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 41

transparency at the PIC at all levels is non-negotiable. Fit and proper individuals who understand the investment space should constitute the PIC board.

The DA's attempt to de-politicize the PIC, particularly appointments of Board, is misguided and must not be entertained. The notion that politicians are inherently incomplete should be done away with because it is not true.

Maybe it is true for the ruling party because we have seen the results over the years, but when we take over government which is the EFF, we will demonstrate that with competence, the PIC will be guided properly.

The PIC will be guided politically and in consistent with the country's developmental objectives. We cannot make permanent decision because of temporal frustration which will lead to long-term consequences.

We welcome the PIC board and Bill; it will go a long way in improving governance. We welcome the inclusion of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 42

union members in the PIC board and hope that it will lead to meaningful workers representation. We also welcome the requirements for the PIC to report in a transparent manner and we are the first party to make this demand, even when we arrived in Parliament many years ago.

What is unfortunate House Chairperson, and we have also raised this both in Committee and House is the fact that while the PIC makes investments in properties build malls and schools, the people it invest money on behalf of do not have houses.

Majority of public servants do not own houses they stay in and the housing allowance is so insignificant, it's shocking.

Those who can afford to buy houses through mainstream banking institutions such as FNB, ABSA and Nedbank are exploited and made to pay extremely high levels of interests and when they fall into financial difficulties, banks are so quick to repossess their properties.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 43

We have called on GEPF and PIC to work together to develop a funding mechanism to assist public servants to buy and own houses; especially since we will expropriate land without compensation.

Lastly House Chairperson, the EFF government will work with the PIC for the state-owned asset manager to offload assets, where it is overexposed, into the prudently politically insulated management of the Sovereign Wealth Fund.

The EFF government will give asset management companies 12 months to change their ownership to mainly black people, particularly Africans, with adequate ownership by women and people living with disabilities.

The EFF government will give asset management companies six months to change their management to mainly black people, particularly Africans, so that they form the majority at all levels of management, with 50% of management being women and 10% being people living with disability.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 44

The EFF government will establish an incubation programme for black asset managers to increase the share of industry assets managed by black firms to R2 trillion, with 50% being women and 10% being people living with disabilities as owners, by the year 2022.

Mr M HLENGWA: Sekuyi-IFP ke manje, hon Madam Speaker and members at the outset, let me say that the IFP will be supporting the amendment Bill. The challenge is that the PIC and the virtual collapse of controls are the clearest indications that these amendments could not have been more timely.

It is the belief of the IFP that the enormous resignation of the board further highlights the problems which the PIC is saddle with. Therefore the amendment Bill before us puts in place systems for checks and balances which will ensure that we rescue the PIC from the current impasse and from future dangers.

Of course the taste of the pudding will be in eating in terms of how the implementation will go, but we are duty

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 45

bound to pretend the integrity of the portfolio of the PIC for the sake of the workers and the for the sake of the South African's economy; therefore hon madam Speaker it is important and incumbent on this house to ensure that in the exercise of its duties of oversight, we need to ensure that we hold those who must be held accountable to account.

We must ensure that there is strict adherence to all relevant regulations which will keep the PIC afloat but most importantly to ensure that there's consequence management. It is in absence of consequences that people continue to loot, to abuse the system, to have a total disregard for those with which whose interest they are working on behalf.

Therefore Deputy Speaker, we are mindful of the fact that there maybe still be shortcomings and there may still be issues which are outstanding but let's not throw the baby out with the bath water because if we do that and act recklessly on the basis of politicking, we put at risk

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 46

the sustainable livelihood of those who are so dependent on the success of the PIC.

And the fact that we have a board which it's Chairman, the Deputy Minister of Finance had to resign, Deputy Speaker must tell that we need to move closer in terms of oversight. It may have been a noble action, its good that it happened but it's only a symptom, we need to go down to the root course of what fundamentally happened.

What happened was that there was a systematic collapse of governance and, so moving forward we call on the Minister of Finance and future Ministers of Finance and their Deputies, or whoever will be designated to act in the manner which will put the collective interest of the PIC first.

So in supporting this Bill, we want to issue that caution hon Deputy Speaker and hope that those who will be entrusted with the responsibility of managing the affairs of the PIC will do so in the manner which will inspire confidence, but most importantly take the PIC to greater

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 47

height and it should not be picky-bank for looters, I thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, allow me in absentia to congratulate or commend the Minister of Higher Education and Training. I had a complaint last week about the child that cannot go to the university because her funds were not released. Within two days of me speaking to the Minister of Higher Education and Training, the matter was resolved and the child is back now at the college. Thank you, hon Minister. [Applause.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, the NFP supports this Bill tabled here today but the question we need to ask is why is it necessary to amend this Bill? Let me welcome, on behalf of the NFP, the additional measures that have been put in place, that is, the representation from the unions and representation from the public sector. But one thing that we have forgotten is the challenges that the Public Investment Corporation, PIC faces today as a result. Despite or having the finest oversight mechanisms in the world, it has still failed us. One of the reasons for

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 48

that is that there has never been proper consequence management in South Africa. That is the crux of the problem.

The question that arises is, what makes us to believe - because if you read or following the Zondo Commission of Enquiry into State Capture and the others, there are unions that are involved in corruption, members of the executive involved and members from the public - so does it really mean that with this amendment we have solved the problem? Clearly, we have not. It might go a long way in ensuring that we protect the investments but clearly it is not full proof.

The NFP is urging the government to look at measures - and that is why we proposed at one stage to look at the integrity of people; do vetting but then we forget about it. Many of them come clean and the moment they come in contact with some of us, their hands are dirty and then they become corrupt. What must we do to continue checking? I am not satisfied, on behalf of the NFP, about the annual report. We got quarterly reports for all the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 49

departments and it is not good enough because the first quarterly report comes in the last quarter of the year and it is too late to identify the challenges.

Yes, we support this but we are saying, let us seriously look at how we are going to try and prevent it. Thank you, very much the NFP supports this.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon members, writing to the Public Protector on 18 Jan 2016 President Bantu Holomisa said:

I have anonymously received serious allegations with regard to the possible corruption in the Public Investment Corporation, PIC fund. It looks like the institutionalised corruption, which has resulted to South Africa being downgraded by various global grading bodies, has extended its vicious arm to the pensions of government employees, Judges, Members of Parliament and others who are paid from the public purse.

He continued and said:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 50

An amount of R40 million was transferred from the PIC account to a company whose name is attached herein. This company is known for handling the PIC and government transactions. It is further alleged that this R40 million was meant to fund salaries of the ANC staff members and its birthday anniversary celebrations held on the 8 January 2016.

It is a pity that this correspondence was not responded to despite numerous attempts to try and get the Public Protector to attend to this issue. The bottom line is, you have allegations that certain political parties have actually misappropriated or rather diverted funds from the PIC into a political party and you ask that a member of the executive or Cabinet of that very same organisation chairs the PIC. It is unheard of it and illogical. We need to find a different system and for this reason we have been saying, as the UDM that the chairperson of the PIC should not be a member of the Cabinet. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 51

We do acknowledge that some of the steps taken by the committee to broaden the composition of the board to ensure that even labour is included in that.

IsiXhosa:

UMphathiswa wezeMali utata uTito, bendibulilibala igama lakho mkhuluwa...

English:

... you will agree that in economics there is a concept called moral hazard. Moral hazard occurs when a person takes more risk because someone else bears the costs of those risks. When we are saying, in the event that PIC makes a loss or commits wrong investment decisions the fiscus must kick in to try and make sure that we cover that loss. It makes sense but there must be accountability for those investment decisions. You know what is going to happen is that people are going to invest willy-nilly, making wrong investment decisions because they know that as soon as there is a loss you are going to pick up the tab. It is one of the issues we have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 52

to consider. It means that South African taxpayers will be going to pick up the tab.

Comrades, it cannot be the very same ANC through a Deputy Minister of the Finance Cluster who chairs the board of the PIC.

IsiXhosa:

Sigadisa ikati ngeempuku xa sisenza loo nto. La masela.

[Kwaqhwatywa.]

Ms D CARTER: Hon Deputy Speaker, the funds that administered by the PIC are in part the pension and provident funds of our public servants. The Cope is on record as having been alarmed at matters concerning the PIC and the pension funds of our public servants. This has included, firstly, increasing reports of corrupt and reckless investing by the PIC. Secondly, a lack of effective oversight over the PIC attempts to capture the PIC as part of the state capture looting project. The third point is the unrepresentative composition of the PIC board and lack of transparency and lack of public

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 53

participation in the appointment of the board. Fourthly, lack of the public sector trade union representation on the board and clear attempts by the ANC-led government to nationalise the pension funds administered by the PIC by wanting to prescribe which assets the PIC may invest in. The last point is the speculation that the PIC funds have been earmarked to bailout government and our state-owned enterprises to the detriment of the pensions of our public servants.

Whilst we acknowledge that the Bill presented for adoption thus propose some reforms, the Cope will not support the Bill in its current form. We reject the Bill as it proposes to insist that the Minister of Finance appoints his Deputy Minister as the chair of the PIC Board.

We have seen the dangers of having the politician a deployed member of the ruling party as the chair of the PIC. We support the view of hon Maynier as advanced in his Bill that Parliament should be empowered to consider and make recommendations to the Minister as to who should

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 54

be appointed chair of the PIC. This is not in the best interest of the ruling party because they will not be able to loot if they do that. After all that we have gone through with rampant corruption in state capture, the ANC stance in this matter is worrying and sinister. It proves that if you shroud the wolf in the fleece of a sheep, it remains a wicked wolf at heart.

We are not convinced that the Bill protects the PIC from the ANC's desire as set out in its election manifesto that government should be empowered to prescribe that pension funds held by asset managers must be invested in government identified projects such as the failing state-owned enterprises. To all government officials out there, go and read the ANC Election Manifesto and see what they want to do with your pension fund.

Cope stands against corruption and for the protection of our public servants' pensions. As such, we cannot and we will not support this Bill. I thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 55

Mr S N SWART: Sorry hon Deputy Speaker, according to my list the ANC speaker is before me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is my list that works here Sir. I am afraid, it is not yours. When you make changes, even if you assume you have got the authority to do so, why don't you have the courtesy to let me know that you have made the changes? [Interjections.] I have got a list here do not tell me stories and please keep quite.

Mr S N SWART: Deputy Speaker, I am sorry, on a point of order, I did not make any changes. According to my list here I am after the ANC speaker. So, I would ask you to withdraw that assertion please.

Ms D CARTER: Deputy Speaker, if you speak to the Table staff, you will see that even on our computers right now, the ANC is before the hon Swart. So, honestly, to treat him that way is absolutely wrong.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you have just spoken now. Haven't you had enough airtime?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 56

Ms N P NKONYENI: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Deputy President, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members, comrades and friends, President Fidel Castro of Cuba has this to say on 30 June 1961 when addressing a meeting of cultural figures I quote:

We believe that revolution still has many battles to fight and that our first thoughts and concerns should be: What can we do to assure the victory of the revolution.

As legislators serving in this 5th Parliament, we need to ask ourselves: What have we done to assure the victory of our national democratic revolution? [Interjections.] We have promulgated, amended and also repealed certain pieces of legislations in order to address the issues of inequality, unemployment and poverty. The clarion call made by the ANC through its manifesto is: "Let's grow South Africa together". Let me address you, hon members on what has been the significant role played by the Public investment Corporation, PIC, over a period of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 57

time, in its quest to grow and stimulate our South African economy.

The principle of investing in environmental, social and governance issues was adopted by the PIC and in many ways it resonates with the spirit of attainment of the National Development Plan, NDP, and the Sustainable Development Goals. To respond to the call of the Freedom Charter, which says, "the people shall share in the country's wealth" – the PIC's investments support the expansion of small and medium enterprises, which is key to driving economic development and job creation.

In 2017-18 financial year, the PIC assets under management hit a highest peak of over R2 trillion and grew by R155 billion. This was as a result of good portfolio management. [Applause.]

UNIDENTIFIED MEMBER: Really?

Ms N P NKONYENI: Yes, the PIC has had a huge impact on growing the economy of the country. During the past year

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 58

the PIC invested over R18,5 billion in unlisted investments, targeting mainly sectors such as health care, education, affordable housing, agriculture and agro-processing, financial services, manufacturing and unlisted properties whilst also advancing transformation in least transformed sectors.

Through its black asset managers programme, the PIC has allocated over R100 billion to black asset managers, driving transformation in the financial services. Over 95% of the brokerage spend was allocated to brokers who fall under level 1-4 BEE rating.

Over 150 000 jobs were created and supported, of which over 120 000 were permanent and over 23 000 were youths while 400 employees were people with disabilities across the spectrum. Over 43 600 educational loans were advanced to low and middle income students, 45 300 affordable housing units have been constructed and over 600 projects are underway. Over 12 000 beds for student accommodation have been secured and huge investments in health care have happened and over 3 000 beds and 22 hospital

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 59

projects have been established. [Applause.] Hon members, it is not all doom and gloom in the PIC.

The PIC is also self-sustainable. It has never borrowed funds from the National Treasury. The late president of Burkina Faso, President Thomas Sankara had this to say, "Debt is a cleverly managed reconquest of Africa. It is a reconquest that turns each one of us into financial slavery". He also said: "We must dare to invent the future." Through these proposed amendments, members, we intend to invent the future of our beloved country. [Applause.]

Just the previous financial year, the PIC made a net income ratio of 42%. It is also compliant with all regulations that govern it, including the Financial Sector Conduct Authority, FSCA. The PIC achieved over 90% of its strategic objectives as agreed with the shareholder in the shareholder's compact and corporation plan. The PIC is a transformed company, with a level 2 BEE rating and with 97% of its staff members being black professionals. This corporation has strong track record

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 60

of investing in black-owned businesses through both investment activities and corporate investment.

Hon members, it is not all doom and gloom in the PIC. We appreciate and commend the establishment of the Commission of Enquiry on the PIC regarding alleged corrupt activities which was established by the President of the country, President Cyril Ramaphosa. Meg Whiteman, the chief executive officer, CEO of Hewlette Packard Enterprise, HP once said:

The price of inaction is far greater than the cost of a mistake." and Martin Luther King Jnr also counselled that our lives begin to end the day we become silent about things that matter. [Applause.] Hon members, inaction leads nowhere.

IsiZulu:

Ngakithi kuthiwa zikhonkotha egijimayo. [Ubuwelewele.]

Ngakho ke siyameseka kakhulu uMongameli ngaleli

Khomishana alakhile. Ngakho ke sithi siyi ANC sihambelana

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 61

kakhulu nalo mthethosivivinyo ngoba uzoshintsha izimpilo zabasebenzi. Ngiyabonga.

English:

ANC supports the Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, wait a minute, your time has not expired. Hold on. I want to take a point of order there. Take your seat, hon Nkonyeni.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Deputy Speaker, I think the speaker at the podium wanted to say she supports the General or the UDM for the appointment of the Commission of Enquiry. The reason why there is that a Commission of Enquiry ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kwankwa, you are wasting the time of the hon member here. Finish what you wanted to say Madam. There is still 1:34 minute left for you.

Ms N P NKONYENI: Oh, that's good. I wanted to say this Bill seeks to amend the previous Bill that is there.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 62

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, bengithi mina kumhlonishwa khona into eyisisho sesiZulu kodwa ibuye ibe yinhlamba. Uyabona le nto yokuthi zikhonkotha ehambayo kusho ukuthi yizini zona - yizinja. Inhlamba leyo akayihoxhise ngoba uyazithuka yena uqobo.

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Khawula, that's not a point of order.

IsiZulu:

Lungu elihloniphekile Khawula awuhlale phansi. Uwena okufanele uxolise ukukhuluma weqe ungakhulumi izinto okuyizona

Nk N P NKONYENI: Uma ungasazi phela isintu yindaba yakho leyo, akuyona indaba yami. Ngakho ke siyi-ANC siwesekele kakhulu lo Mthethosivivinywa ngoba uzokwenza izimpilo zabasebenzi zibengcono futhi nokuphathwa kahle kwe-PIC kuzobe kusobala futhi wonke umuntu ekwazi ukukubona.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 63

Ngiyabonga i-ANC iyaweseka lo Mthethosivivinywa.

[Ihlombe.]

Mr S N SWART: Deputy Speaker, just for the record, the desk has confirmed that I was correctly the next speaker and your assertion that I was discourteous to you to you should be withdrawn. However, the ACDP, like others have been very concerned about the revelations at the Public Investment Corporation, PIC, that are now being investigated by Judge Lex Mpati.

In an unprecedented move, the Companies and Intellectual Property Commission, CIPC, has instructed the PIC to recover R4,3 billion it invested in Ayo Technology Solutions. As in making the investment, the directors had knowingly caused harm to the PIC. Now, that is very serious. That is a breach of the Companies Act

In addition, that is a breach of fiduciary duties in terms of the Companies Act. Those directors, besides having to recover that amount can be hold both criminally

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 64

and civil reliable. I am sure you will agree with that, hon Minister.

There can be no doubt then that there is an urgent need to strengthen corporate governance, accountability and transparency at the PIC, notwithstanding that it has had noteworthy and good investment returns over the years. But something has gone wrong. I think all political parties across the board have admitted that and that is why we are sitting with this Bill today.

Given that the PIC is the largest asset management in Africa, it is important to note, of course, that it is a defined benefit pension fund and if it makes losses there have to be brought and borne by the taxpayer. Now, there is no board at the PIC at the moment. That adds to the problems.

The DA's Private Member's Bill covered many of the issues covered in the Bill before us. The ACDP supports this, in particular, the role of the Deputy Minister, given the deep state capture and corruption that we have seen,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 65

particularly under the Zuma administration. Today, Minister, the Mpati Commission heard evidence of the belittling and the accusatory nature of the Deputy Minister and how board members felt ambushed and attacked. We agree that the PIC chairperson should be an independent appointed through a public nomination process to insulate from political interference.

Secondly, is the issue that has been raised by other speakers and that is the issue that the Bill states that the PIC must seek to invest in projects which further the developmental objectives of the country. This is the first step towards prescribed assets. This again, is for us from the ACDP, a matter great concern. Although there is a lot of good aspect in this Bill, these issues outweigh the positives. Therefore, the ACDP will not support this Bill. I thank you.

Dr M J CARDO: Hon Deputy Speaker, the Public Investment Corporation Bill arrives here today in the House following numerous allegations of wrongdoing by the PIC, which are in the public domain and concerns expressed by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 66

a variety of stakeholders that the PIC has been making questionable investments.

In its current form, this Bill – in particular section 10 – may serve to exacerbate the problem, not solve it. Section 10 of the Bill provides investment guidelines that the PIC should take into an account when executing the instructions of depositors.

The DA is concerned that questionable investments can once again be justified by appealing to the listed guidelines. These guidelines state that as far as possible the PIC should seek to invest in order to be in line with the Republic's developmental objectives and transform the economy and society. These provisions are patently open to abuse due to their vague wording. The meaning of the words development and transform are as open to interpretation as to be able to reflect the whims of any factional agenda.

In 2016, Futuregrowth, under Andrew Canter's leadership, was the first large asset manager to announce that it

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 67

would stop lending to SOEs until there was better governance.

Futuregrowth has struck on another insight recently. The asset manager has stated, and I quote: "A risk of prescription is that the definition of "developmental" investments could be factional or politically motivated, rather than based on sound investment principles". That is quiet right. Developmental and transformation are the ultimate ANC weasel words used to justify corruption, state capture, patronage, looting and all manner of related sins.

To include these guidelines is to provide enough rope to be used as a noose for the PIC to hang itself at some point.

The process that gave impetus to this Bill sought to close the gaps the Bill now perpetuates. Dodgy investments such as that into Independent Media were made exactly under the pretext of development and transformation. Investing in healthy, profitable

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 68

investments is good for beneficiaries and good for the market. It sends the right signal by not supporting uncompetitive enterprises.

But, it's about time we stopped facilitating corruption, state capture, looting, patronage and self-enrichment in the names of development, transformation and assisting our people and the poor. For that reason, the DA opposes this Bill. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr Y I CARRIM: Deputy Speaker, Deputy President, comrades and friends, can we start with this? Let me pick up from where Comrade Thandi Tobias-Pokolo left off and what Comrade Peggy Nkonyeni dealt with in passing.

There is a Public Investment Corporation, PIC, Commission report that will shortly be given to the President. This Bill has to be understood in that context. It is, if you like, a transitional Bill. We think for the President to have appointed this commission is a wonderful idea. If it had come in October 2017, it would have saved us a lot of bother. To have a committee Bill is an enormous task for

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 69

a committee to undertake, so it is unfortunate it came late, but it is very good that it had come. So, we are utterly clear: This is a transitional Bill. The Minister will be bringing a Bill shortly.

However, that is for the Sixth Parliament to decide, not us. We looked very carefully on several occasions, no less than I would think - I tried to get the committee chairperson, but it is tough, to look into it - about eight times, Comrade Thandi, and we discussed whether we should proceed with the Bill or not. So, when we chose to proceed with the Bill, it was after very careful reflection, Minister, after very careful consideration. It is not as if we plunged into it in some sort of populist fashion simply because Cosatu and the Public Servants' Association, PSA, were breathing down our necks. No, no, no! We considered it carefully.

As the hon Thandi Tobias was about to say, let's first look at what a commission is, as we understand it. A commission is appointed usually by the executive. It answers to the executive, not to Parliament directly. So,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 70

often you have commissions, in any democracy, that present their recommendations to a minister or a president or a prime minister. Every so often, the government of the day says no thank you to the commission's 10 recommendations. They don't want it. Sometimes, they say they would accept five. So, that is a long process.

As I understand it, the commission will report to the President on 15 April or thereabout. It will then be processed. On the eve of an election, not much can get done, understandably. It will then be referred to the Minister of Finance and to Treasury. They will discuss which of the recommendations of the PIC Commission they will consider, convert it into a Bill, and take it through the Cabinet process, bearing in mind that Parliament will reconvene, probably, end of May or early June and from June to at least August, if I understand correctly, as happened last time, whoever is here will be looking at budgets. A Bill at the earliest will come, no matter how swift the Minister is, around September or

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 71

October. So it should come, and we welcome it. Well, not "we" - whoever is here in Parliament in May this year.

What happens in the mean time? What do we do about the enormous pressure that came and, by the way, it came not just from the nongovernmental organisations, NGOs, not just from Cosatu, a trade union, and Fedusa, the PSA's ... Fedusa is PSA. It came also from pensioners. We got a flood of letters from people complaining. It came from within the PIC. It came from this political party on my right to which I proudly belong also, asking that something has to be done. That is what we did. We didn't just plunge into going ahead.

We also want to be very clear that the same issues will arise, Minister, with your Bill in, let's say, October this year. The same issues are going to arise. The unions are going to demand representation. The NGOs are going to say the same things. The PSA is saying they're withdrawing their money, and Parliament has to hold the Minister and the PIC to account. The same issues are going to arise. Then we said, as the hon Thandi Tobias-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 72

Pokolo was about to say ... we took four things to into account.

Firstly, we spent an enormous number of hours on this Bill. We had three major public hearings. We waited and waited for the President to announce this commission, and then it came to be that the commission will only report on 15 April. Parliament is not going to sit then, so we decided to go ahead with this Bill in the mean time, bearing in mind it is a transitional Bill.

Secondly, we said that all the work we have done will lapse if we do not proceed with the Bill. The new Parliament can revive a Bill if its wants to, but it may choose not to do so and only consider an executive Bill.

Thirdly, given the experience and expertise we had acquired around us, and given the fact the PIC is the organisation within National Treasury that we most brought before this committee, for the reasons set out very vividly by all speakers, we decided that the same issues would arise, that it is a transitional Bill,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 73

Minister, and we look forward to your Bill, and that we - well, whoever is here - will make the changes that are necessary. So, just see it in that way. We want to congratulate this commission. It has an illustrious judge, it has a former Governor of the Reserve Bank, and it has another expert. We look forward to it. It will be important for the Sixth Parliament to look at it and see the changes, but it is also true that, ultimately, it is Parliament, not the executive or a commission, that makes law. So, it may well be that the Minister comes with a Bill, and Parliament may decide to reject that Bill and make the very changes we made anyway. Parliament doesn't derive its mandate from a member of the executive. We derive it from the political party we come from. We answer to study groups, Chief Whips, and the appropriate ANC structures, not to a Minister or the government. So, we must be clear. It may well be anyway that exactly what we got here is what will happen.

Let me also say that we are in agreement with some of the concerns of the DA and other parties about having a Deputy Minister chairing the board. We understand. We are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 74

also aware that they are concerned that the guidelines, as loose as they are, may be used for the wrong reasons. So, that is why we have said, let's have a Deputy Minister, as has been the convention, for the reasons the ANC has set out today, including the fact that it is the fiscus ultimately, this very Parliament, that will have rescued the employees if the PIC makes losses for them.

To balance it out, we said that the PIC and the Minister must report in various ways to Parliament. That is the balance. We are the custodians of the Deputy Minister of Finance chairing that board. So, we are very clear. The second thing is we have proposed that union representatives serve on the board so that they can see the politician who chairs the board does so in terms of the norms, values, and principles of the PIC. Thirdly, we said we have put in a whole lot of provisions that have strengthened the role of Parliament. So, when you see, on the one hand, the Deputy Minister chairing the board for the reasons we want, see on the other hand the oversight role. In fact, if you look at the allegations of corruption, this committee of ours, and this Parliament,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 75

must be held to account. The levels of corruption in this country are largely due to the failure of Parliament to hold people to account. We must take our measure of responsibility. These commissions are a reflection of our failure to effectively carry out our oversight role.

Let us read what the Bill actually says, Dr Cardo and Mr Lees. This is what it actually says:

The corporation must, when investing a deposit on behalf of depositors, invest to the benefit of the members or beneficiaries of the respective depositors.

Then it says, for the purposes of this, that "the corporation must act in accordance with the instructions of the depositors". It must do that. In so doing, it must "seek" - seek, that means it must attempt to, "as far as possible ..." - and look how soft that is, comrade Chief Whip. Yet Cosatu says it is unhappy. The PSA said they are unhappy with this, but we said, look, a Bill has to find balances between competing needs and interests. So,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 76

some of the concerns that the DA and others expressed are catered for in this Bill. We have the Deputy Minister there, but we also have countervailing forces. If Parliament plays its role, no Deputy Minister and no independent chair could do wrong.

What we are saying is it very interesting that the DA keeps talking about AYO Technology Solutions this morning. Fine, we agree that if AYO has wrongly been invested in, the money must be returned, like the Companies and Intellectual Property Commission, CIPC, requires. Interestingly, they say nothing about Steinhoff. They say nothing about the billions of rand the PIC lost through Steinhoff. Why is that?

[Interjections.] Then we go on to state there is nothing inevitably corrupt about the PIC, as has been said. In fact, for all the challenges around the PIC and wrongdoings in respect of bad investments and allegations of corruption - for all that - it is one of the best-performing asset managers. Let's not throw the baby out with the bathwater.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 77

Whatever we think of Dr Daniel Matjila and the previous PIC boards, the truth is that whatever mistakes or otherwise they are responsible for, this asset manager has performed outstandingly. So it should, and that is the responsibility of Parliament, not just the PIC board chair, whoever that is, to ensure that it happens. This PIC is too important to this country. As we all know, it is the largest asset manager. We cannot afford for it to fail. Why don't we just depoliticise this, do our jobs as the parliamentary committee on finance in both Houses of this Parliament, and the problems we are concerned about will be dealt with there?

There are several other things I would like to raise. Regrettably, I have only gone through half my notes here, but I want to assure you that we look forward, Minister, to your Bill. The Sixth Parliament will address it, and if there are issues ... thank you very much, indeed.

[Time expired.] [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 78

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, before the decision of the question on the Public Investment Corporation Amendment Bill, we would like to clarify questions that members have posed here - that the Public Investment Corporation Amendment Bill in the name of the hon Maynier was classified as a section 75 Bill, an ordinary Bill, not affecting the provinces and not a section 77 Bill, a Money Bill, in other words.

Money Bills deal with the appropriation of money and the imposition of taxes, levies, duties, and surcharges. In terms of the passage of the two Bills on the PIC, section 53 of the Constitution states the following:

(1) Except where the Constitution provides otherwise -

(a) A majority of the members of the National Assembly must be present before a vote may be taken on a Bill or an amendment to a Bill.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 79

The Rules also allow a decision on a question to be postponed in the event a quorum is not reached. This is what occurred in the case of Mr Maynier earlier on.

However, this has no consequence for the committee Bill on the PIC, as this Bill is not dependent on Mr Maynier's Bill. The two Bills are distinct. In other words, Rule 90, known as the Rule of anticipation, Rule 120, known as the same question Rule, and Rule 332, which deals with the same Bill being introduced more than once, are not applicable in this case. Thank you, hon members.

Question put: That the Bill be read a second time.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

Ms M R M MOTHAPO: Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no! Please, the bells are being rung already.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 80

Ms M R M MOTHAPO: No, they don't count right! They are only three. They are only three! They are supposed to be four!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, alright! You don't have to scream at us to do it. Please, take it easy. Take it easy.

[Interjections.]

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a second time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Bill will be sent to the National Council of Provinces for concurrence. Hon members, just to remind you formally, we were informed that Mr W W Wessels withdrew his amendments to the Bill that appeared in the Order Paper. We needed to do that formally so that you are aware of it. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 81

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Deputy Speaker, would it not be correct for us to go to the Second Order and dispense with it?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I take advice and then revert back to you? The Secretary will read the Fifth Order.

CUSTOMS AND EXCISE AMENDMENT BILL

(Consideration of Bill and of Report of Standing Committee thereon)

There was no debate.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY: Deputy Speaker, we move that the Report of the committee be adopted by this House.

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Question put. That the Bill be read a second time.

Report accordingly adopted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 82

CUSTOMS AND EXCISE AMENDMENT BILL

(Second Reading debate)

There was no debate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Chief Whip, you will be orderly.

Declaration of Vote:

Mr M SHACKLETON: Deputy Speaker, the proposed Customs and Excise Amendment Bill inset a new provision for the purpose of the administration of the Carbon Tax Act. The DA remains concerned that the Carbon Tax and its administration as proposed, stretches an already overtaxed consumer and corporate taxpayer base as well as a struggling revenue service that battles to collect the taxes already within its remit.

The Carbon Tax must be considered within the context of cumulative impact of other taxes and levies already in place. No taxes have been cut which means that this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 83

increases the overall tax burden in South Africa. Many companies in South Africa are already struggling to turn the profit. It is not clear that all companies affected by the Carbon Tax who had adequate financial and human resources to manage the costs linked to compliance. It is a complex piece of legislation and it is rightly to be a costly exercise for many businesses. Furthermore, the economic impact of the Carbon Tax hinges heavily on the design of the tax and the manner in which Treasury utilises the revenue collected.

As we have previously articulated, there was concern that there is no guarantee that tax collected will be channelled back into the economy. It was suggested via numerous public submissions that revenue collected be ring fenced. Carbon prices generate government revenue which can be used to increase green spending, compensate adversely affected industries and communities or be redistributed to the public.

Numerous studies reveal that the way in which carbon pricing or revenues are spent plays an important role in

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 84

determining whether carbon pricing initiative would be successful. Studies show that ambitious carbon pricing is often correlated with high political trust and low corruption levels. The recommendation is that if trust is low revenue should thus be recycled using a transparent trust boosting strategy to enhance its acceptability. This Bill does nothing to guarantee how carbon revenues would be spent. A key factor in the success of carbon pricing strategies.

In other countries where the Carbon Tax was introduced such as Colombia, regulations made it possible for companies to offset 100% of their tax liabilities by investing in carbon offset projects. The South African Legislative Framework is comparatively inflexible as it does not allow for companies to achieve 100% tax-free status.

A study by the Climate Neutral Group states that allowing a couple 100% as well as non domestic credits during the first the few months of the scheme helps boost market liquidity, crucial in the early stages of any new

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 85

domestic carbon scheme. This Bill in its administration faces obstacles before it even gets out that gate. In that there were the kinds of reservations set out above, as well as those which suggested that tax is much too low to engender any behavioural shift. That is the worst possible outcome of the Bill, that it keeps behaviour unchanged whilst increasing costs.

Of course, this is the sin tax sweet spot for the government. Where sin tax is high enough to generate revenue for government, but too low to drastically alter behaviour. The government can be seen to be doing good while extracting the economic value of sinful behaviour. As usual, the taxpayer gets the sooty end of the deal.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Malibongwe igama le-EFF!

English:

Ms N V MENTE: Deputy Speaker, one of the greatest challenges facing humanity is global warming and scientists from across the world have proven beyond a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 86

reasonable doubt that one of the key causes of global warming is carbon emissions.

South Africa and Africa as a whole has already started to feel the effects of global warming and we need to start cutting carbon emissions drastically. While we have concerns with the Carbon Tax Bill in terms of its failure to place necessary obligations on private companies and the ability of the ANC government to implement the Bill. We did support it for the sake of our common future, which is why we support this amendment Bill. However, this Bill was a wasted opportunity to fix much larger problems around customs, tax and excise duties. For the last 20 years, the SA Revenue Service has not been able to build the necessary capacity needed for maximum revenue collection. Our ports of entry have been neglected. The technology used is of the 20th century. They are understaffed and undercapacitated.

What is needed is a modern, effective, industrial-scale scanners along with the requisite human capacity so that goods that come into our country can be properly

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 87

accounted for? If you go to the ports of entry at Komatipoort and others, you will see that the collapse of our ability to control what goods come into this country and those that are leaving the country. The situation has got to a point where the Zimbabwean side of the border is much more capacitated than us at the south of the Limpopo River and in some instances, the South African customs officials have had to use equipment of their Zimbabwean counterparts.

The lack of scanners, human capacity and resources are why so many counterfeit products are entering our country every day and being sold to our people. If the government wants to stop the proliferation of counterfeit products, the starting point must be the point of entry, not the point of sale. The same applies to the drug trade but customs, tax and excise duty should not only be used to stop goods from entering the country illegally. Customs and excise duty can be a key weapon in a country's arsenal when it comes to industrial policy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 88

Throughout the world, both developing and developed countries use tariffs and excise duty to prop up their local industries and grow the economy. Foreign competitors have tariffs placed on their products, allowing local producers to become competitive and sell their goods to local consumers. Such policies have facilitated industrial growth and job creation throughout the world. If customs and excise duty were used in a progressive manner, as we have proposed many times to this Parliament and have outlined in our manifesto, South Africa would still be a poultry and textile industry.

While we believe that this Bill was a wasted opportunity, we recognise the need for it to be adopted in order to facilitate the administration and collection of carbon tax revenues. Watch this space. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

ILUNGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Malibongwe igama le-EFF!

Mnu M HLENGWA: Musani ukulokhu nibiza i-EFF uma ngiza lana kwi-podium. [Ubuwelewele.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 89

English:

Hon Deputy Speaker, one must say at the outset that one of the biggest challenges, of course, is the fact that the capacity of the ports of entry to ensure that the work gets is of serious concern. Our borders remain porous and the fact that there is not enough human capital and technological advances, there is a challenge which must be looked at and of course, it renders any collections that you want to do useless if we do not sort that out. So far as the carbon tax is concerned, we raised, last week, as the IFP, the fact that whilst we welcome, in principle, the Bill, we need to go back to the implementation tenets of that Bill because it is based on the 2010 frameworks and so they may be a mismatch in terms of what we seek to do and the basis upon which it is done. So that is something to look at. So, whilst we deal with all those technical issues of customs and excise ...

IsiZulu:

... mhlonishwa Ngqongqoshe, ngoba ngesikhathi uthula iSabelomali ngesonto eledlule noma futhi sesifika

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 90

kuleNdlu, siyobe sesisincane isikhathi sethu sokukhuluma ngoba sikhuluma ngento yanamhlanje. Angike ngisho nje ukuthi, kubalulekile ukuthi abantu bakithi sibacabangele ngempela ngoba uma kunyuka uphethiloli ne-VAT isaqhubekile ukuba sezingeni eliphezulu, izinga lokuphila kwabantu bakithi baseNingizimu Afrika ngempela, ngempela, alisekho esimweni sokuthi bangakwazi ukukhona ukubhekana naso lesi simo.

Ngakho-ke sikhona isidingo sokuthi ngempela intela, ngendlela eqoqwa ngayo, isibenze ngendlela kodwa nokuthi iqoqwa kobani nalokho kubalulekile. Asingazifici sesisesimweni la sicindezela khona abantu bakithi, sebebhekene nenselelo yokuthi abasakwazi ukuphila ngoba uHulumeni uthatha ngisho isenti lokugcina ezikhwameni zabantu bakithi. Ngakhoke, siyakucela nje Ngqongqosahe ukuthi, ake ukubukele eduze lokhu, ukulelekelela abantu bakithi ngoba noma wayinyusa imali yezibonelelo njengoba wenza ngesonto eledlule, kodwa uma ubuka ukunyuka kwayo, uyabona ukuthi kufushane kakhulu kunezinga lokuphila laseNingizimu Afrika. Siyazazi-ke izinkinga ezikhona nokuthi imali ezoba yisingeniso sokuqoqwa kwentela

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 91

ingaphansi ngemali engango-R234 billion kunaleyo ezobe isetshenziswa uHulumeni.

Kodwa-ke kudinga ukuthi-ke nenkohlakalo kulwiswane nayo, nokusebenza kukaHulumeni ikakhulukazi, kubhekisiswe ukuthi akucindezelwi abantu kodwa ikakhulu kakhulu, abantu okumele sibacabangele, abantu bakithi, okuyibona abagcina sebeyizisulu zokuthi ukuqoqeka kwentela nokusebenza kwemali esuke seyiqoqiwe akufinyeleli kubona ngendlela efanele bese bezibona sebegqilazekile. Ngakho, lokhu esikukhuluma nala, ukuqoqeka kwaleyomali uma kogcina ukuthi leyomali iqoqelwa ukuthi idliwe, intshontshwe, hhayi, kuyobe impela senza umjika-joe ongekho ezingeni elimukelekayo.

Ngakhoke, Ngqongqoshe, ake ukhulumisane nonembeza wakho nje, sike sisebenzele abantu bakithi, nemali eqoqwayo ... musa ukungisabisa sisi sistela. Ngakhoke, siyakucela Ngqongqoshe, asike sikubukele eduze konke lokho. Siyabonga.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 92

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, if you remember last week when this Carbon Tax Bill was being debated the National Freedom Party did not support this. Therefore, I'm hoping that today hon Tobias is here and she is going to give some clarity on these issues - so, it will give us a clearer picture whether we should be supporting it or not. Now, what was our argument? The purpose of the Carbon Tax Bill in our understanding as the NFP is to reduce emissions which will benefit our people on the basis that they can live and the air will be a better quality and that their health will improve. Now, on the one hand we are talking about putting a carbon tax, you are leaving a tax, and on the other hand you are saying that you are going to be giving an allowance.

Our understanding thus far is that if you are putting a tax and you are giving an allowance it is going to be of no consequence in whatsoever. There is no motivation for industry to reduce those emissions, and that is what we are concerned about. We would have had no problem if you didn't give an allowance at all because the intention is to penalise those who have a high level of emissions we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 93

want to reduce it. I'm going to give you a good example and I gave this before. If you look at the issue of the ... [Inaudible.] ... Jacobs Bluff, I have said and I have spoken about this time and time again. There is a high level of cancer, high level of tuberculosis and high level of lung infections. There was even a research done by the University of KwaZulu-Natal. That report has not been released.

Now, the fear is like, Minister, you are listening to me, we said that we are taking away a tax or value added tax, VAT, on flour. However, what we have never done is guaranteed that that is going to benefit the people on the ground. I will tell you what is happening. All these supermarkets everything remains the same. Everything remains the same even though that price of that flour or that bread should have been reduced. So, there is no mechanism there to see that the positive impact is going towards the people. This is what our fear is here, we must reduce that emission. What is the big industry going to do, we know they make megabucks - that is the term that it should be billions. All they are going to do is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 94

to push up the prices to cover those taxes, and they are also getting allowances. At the end of the day you are not going to reduce the emissions. It is not going to benefit our people and the poor Minister of Health who is trying to do his best will have even greater difficulty because his budget is not enough.

So, I hope hon Tobias is going to come and convince me before the NFP is going to vote here just now. Indeed, that there is going to be a benefit and there is going to be ... Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

Ms T V TOBIAS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I have got a lot of explanations to do with a very limited time. Firstly, let me say in advance that the DA is clutching at straws. There is an English saying that the horse is kicking at randomly at last. In a normal setting we never discuss an excise duty because it is an admin Bill, and it gives effect to another Money Bill that has been presented, but because they want a limelight, they stole the show to want to discuss Tax Bill, and I will come back to them. Let me first explain to the member Emam.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 95

The tax incentives are meant to: One, in trade it is to invite investors, but in greenhouse gas emissions is to discourage people to do emissions. That is why we are doing 120 per ton to those who are going to reduce their emissions by one ton, they get R120 incentives. The incentives are not for everybody, it is only for those who have reduced their emissions. There will be 100% taxation to those who are not. In actual fact, it is going to be incremental overtime if people don't reduce their emissions; they are going to be taxed more. Therefore, I hope you will support us and vote for the Carbon Tax Bill and the excise duty because it is just an admin Bill to give effect to the carbon tax.

Therefore, with the DA, they are using this platform to actually do what I like most, to demonstrate to the South African voters that they support business not the people. They are saying to the people of Sasolburg in Zamdela that they continue to die from gas emissions and don't tax business that brings bad air to them. I hope that the people of Zamdela in Sasolburg will not vote the DA but vote the African National Congress.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 96

Secondly, to the people of Mpumalanga, hon Deputy President, where you come from, automatically they are going to vote for the party you serve because it is clear that the DA says: Die of tuberculosis, die of any disease, it doesn't matter and it is business as usual. So, thank you for using this platform to campaign to expose yourselves that you don't even take care of the people of South Africa to make sure that we do our commitments to Conference of the Parties, Cop15, in Parys where we said that we will reduce gas emissions by 34% before 2020. I thank you South Africans; please vote for the African National Congress. I thank you. [Applause.]

Question put: That the Bill be read a second time.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

Ayes -: 195 [Take in from minutes.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 97

NOES - 4: Lees, R A; Shackleton, S; Stubbe, D J; Waters, M.

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a second time.

**CONSIDERATION OF TRADITIONAL AND KHOI-SAN LEADERSHIP BILL
AND THE REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON CO-OPERATIVE
GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS ON AMENDMENTS PROPOSED
BY NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mdakane ...

IsiZulu:

... isihlalo sakho nasi. Uma uwazi ukuthi uzokhuluma,
ungabohlala la uthanda khona. Qhubeka baba.

Mnu M R MDAKANE: Uxolo baba.

USEKELA SOMLOMO: Yebo. [Ubuwelewele.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 98

Mnu M R MDAKANE: Hhawu Nkosiyami! [Ubuwelewele.]

English:

Deputy Speaker, the ANC moves from the premise that the South African nation is a product of many streams of history and culture, representing the origins, dispersal and reintegration of humanity over hundreds of thousands of years.

As such, the establishment of the post democratic society under the ANC-led government in 1994 produced two guiding documents; the Reconstruction and Development Programme and a final Constitution of our country in 1996. They both gave expression to the vision of the ANC and its government aim at transforming and supporting the institution of traditional leadership, inline with a broader democratisation processes within the Republic and the supreme law of our country.

We will recall that historically, the Khoi and San people were also brutalised by colonial masters and apartheid regime who tried to make them extinct and undermine their

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 99

language and identity. However, through our new democratic dispensation, the ANC leadership has taken a conscious decision to rid our country of the painful past and build a new South African nation, united in diversity, where the value of all citizens is measured by their humanity without regard to race, gender and social status.

Therefore, the ANC view this Bill as part of the mechanism and instrument geared at correcting our painful past and recognising the Khoi and San people by restoring their dignity, identity, language, leadership and their culture.

So, this Bill, in a wider sense, has undergone a revival most notable since the end of apartheid in 1994. In March 2001 the ANC-led government held a Khoi-San consultative conference. The conference consisted of the 20 representatives from the different Khoi-San communities representing 10 different regions enacted as an umbrella body for the Khoi-San people across South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 100

The conference was significant in that it demonstrated the ANC's commitment to address the past dispensation and humiliation of the Khoi-San people by apartheid and colonial regimes. Moreover, the ANC-led government started a process of promoting and protecting the Khoi-San people rights in 2004 culminating in November 2018 with Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Bill being passed by the National Assembly.

On 10 January 2019, the Bill was passed during a special sitting of the NCOP and was backed by all provinces except the Western Cape. The NCOP made technical amendments.

President Nelson Mandela in inauguration of the National Council of Traditional Leaders in 1997 said, I quote:

... we gather in Cape Town to set up the National Council of Traditional Leaders, in the precincts of an institution that was used to perpetuate what that commander and his superior were delegated to do: to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 101

defeat, to subjugate and to dispossess the African people; to plunder their land and usurp its wealth.

It is in the same precinct in this institution where the DA rejected a Bill meant to restore and defend the rights of the Khoi-San people. Key clauses in the Bill as amended by the NCOP state that, I quote:

A council may only enter into a partnership or agreement if the relevant community has been consulted and the majority of community members present at such a meeting have taken a decision in support of the partnership or agreement to foster transparent democracy and community participation on matters that affect them.

That is the main amendment presented by the NCOP.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in conclusion, the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Bill makes it illegal for traditional leaders to act unitarily; to enter into deals with the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 102

private sector such as mining companies without the consent of the community.

The Bill places emphases on the Khoi and San community as a whole instead of only leaders. It demonstrates government's will to restore and defend the land rights of the Khoi-San people and makes it possible for them to claim and defend their land right, tradition and culture.

The ANC and the Portfolio Committee on Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs having considered the proposed technical amendment, which will transform the traditional and Khoi-San institution inline with the Constitution, the ANC and the committee agrees with amendments presented by the NCOP. Thank you very much, sir. [Applause.]

There was no debate.

Declarations of vote:

Mr K J MILEHAM: Deputy Speaker, at the outset, let me say that the DA acknowledges the role and institution of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 103

traditional leadership and would welcome the inclusion and recognition of the Khoi-San leadership into the structure.

However, as we have previously indicated in this House, this seriously problematic Bill does little more than make our brothers and sisters, who are the Khoi-San, second class citizens in comparisons to traditional communities as we currently know them.

The changes introduced by the NCOP do not address the fact that this Bill entrenches apartheid era spatial boundaries for traditional communities, boundaries that are arbitrary determined in the first place. It is quite rightly called a Bantustan Bill, perpetuated by the Bantustan apologists on my right.

The NCOP have not changed the fact that traditional leaders derive their mantle of leadership from these geographic boundaries nor have they changed the fact that the Khoi-San leadership have to demonstrate that they represent a distinct community with a defined heritage

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 104

and customs or that such a Khoi-San community has to audit and verify its membership annually, something that traditional communities don't have to do.

We were concern about the public participation process during the adoption of this Bill and how in many communities, drafts were only available in English. Furthermore, the Bill, which is very lengthy and technical, was not made readily available to the public in advance of the public hearings resulting in the affected communities trying to keep up while the document was presented. Notice of the public hearings was late, sometimes only being sent out the day prior to the actual hearing. Now all this make it rise to yet another constitutional challenge and only serves as an indictment on this Parliament and its systems and processes.

Turning now to the amendment proposed, there were three significant alterations made by the NCOP. The first was the deletion of the word, coherent, in clause 5 which determines recognition criteria for Khoi-San communities.

The clause used to read:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 105

"A community may apply to the Premier concerned to be recognised as a Khoi-San community if it has a proven history of coherent existence of the community from a particular point in time up to the present"

The deletion of the word coherent implies that continuous, uninterrupted and united existence as a community is no longer a requirement for recognition. The second major change proposed by the NCOP, amends clause 24(3)(c) by expanding the requirement for community consultation and a formal decision from that community prior to any agreement or partnership being entered into by their relevant traditional or Khoi-San council.

This is a welcome move as it has been evident by the various cases involving mining rights handed over by traditional leaders for personal gain without the input or approval of the community they purport to lead. But, the NCOP also inserted a new sub clause in clause 63(22). This clause was originally intended to provide as a transitional arrangement, a method of review for existing contracts, partnerships and agreements to ensure that the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 106

comply with the requirement of this Act, including that need for community consultation and being beneficial to the community concerned. The new sub clause (d) effectively negates this by stating that:

"The provisions of this sub section do not apply to any partnership or agreement which at the commencement of this Act, has been entered into in accordance with any enabling provision of any other law"

How is it possible that we create legislation that does all the right things and they say, but it doesn't apply anyway? We were just joking.

Lastly, we need to point out that the legislation we passed in this House last week, the Traditional Leadership Governance Framework Amendment Bill, was a colossal waste of time, money and resources because this Bill will repeal at as soon as it is passed into law.

As I said at the start, the DA acknowledges and recognises the role and institution of traditional

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 107

leadership and we welcome the long overdue recognition of Khoi-San leadership but this legislation is fundamentally flawed. It imposes arbitrary discrimination to differentiate between Khoi-San and traditional communities and arguably imposes harsher conditions on the Khoi-San for recognition. Its public participation issues may yet render it unconstitutional. It introduces good tracks and balances for partnerships and then undermines the very measures intended to make historic agreements reviewable.

Before I conclude I would like to acknowledge the late Brendan Boyle of Land and Accountability Research Centre who worked tirelessly on this legislation. He passed away two weeks ago and he will be missed. It is for all these reasons that the DA opposes this Bill. [Applause.]

Mr T E MULAUDZI: Hon Deputy Speaker, when the second reading debate for this Bill was tabled here, we rejected it because we were of the view that it was just another attempt to balkanize African people on the basis of apartheid Bantustan logic. The NCOP has done nothing to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 108

change our views on what we consider as a fundamental defect of this Bill.

We welcome the recognition of the Khoi-San communities in this Bill and we re-emphasise that the Khoi-San are fellow black people who must refuse all attempts to make them a group of people distinct from other Africans in this country. One of the most critical question we need to ask at this moment is, what must be done to standardise system of governance so that rural people are fully entitled to rights that all South Africans has and are not made subject to leadership institutions that are neither democratic in the true sense of the word or fully accountable to the people?

The Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Bill, is one of the many infiltrated attempts to reinforce apartheid, tribal, boundaries and lock rural people into unworkable forms of governance. Our rejection of this Bill, as was our rejections of the amendment to the Framework Act was based on the empirical research that these Bills, in essence, shows the fundamental failure in the very

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 109

conception of governance in the institution of the traditional leadership across the country.

During our engagement with rural communities, we have noted the following; rural communities need to have the right to decide the use of their own land; they need to see accountability for revenues end of their land and they need to have a say over the boundaries that defines their identities. Rural communities want to be consulted when decisions that have direct impact on their lives are taken. Those decisions should be based on their own involvement in customary law or the Constitution.

The Chiefs are not private owners of the land. They are custodian of the land for the benefit of the entire community but succession laws since 1994, has given extraordinary powers to the Chiefs to control, make deals and even sell the land for their own personal benefit.

The Bill has spectacularly failed to respond to some of the most pressing issues raised by rural communities. It only provides what can be best described as a cosmetic

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 110

attempt to reconfigure the institution of traditional leadership and leave rural communities locked in second class citizenship where there are condemned to be led by feudal lords who are used to buy politicians and unscrupulous mining companies. The EFF rejects this Bill. Thank you.

Mr X NGWEZI: Hon Deputy Speaker, the IFP supports this Bill because it seeks to redress the wrongs of the past. That is the first thing. Secondly, the IFP will always support government whenever it is having attempts to actually transform the institution of traditional leadership at all times. As the ANC tries to address this issue of the traditional leadership, it reminds me and itself that it knows very well that it has once been led by traditional leaders. I think two of the ANC leaders who led the ANC in the previous times were actually traditional leaders.

Further to that, it must remember that the struggles of this country did not only start in 1912, but it started very long before the ANC was formed in 1912. So, this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 111

struggle is very old. It didn't only begin in 1912. Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to welcome on behalf of the IFP, the initiatives that the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs is trying to put in addressing the issue of section 81 of the Municipal Structure Act, hoping that the Khoi and the San community would benefit from such. Minister, we can only commit as the IFP to say that, on that initiative we will commit our support and the communities of this country. We believe that traditional leaders and their communities will benefit as well. We support the Bill as I indicated earlier on. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Deputy Speaker, first of all let us welcome the initiative in addressing the recognition of the Khoi and San people. While this is the first step amongst many that must follow, as the National Freedom Party, we are concerned with the amount of power it gives the premiers of particular provinces in dealing with the issues of the Khoi and the San communities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 112

If we want to be realistic and honest, even this very building and the land that we are occupying belongs to the Khoi and San. All the water we are drinking here in the Western Cape belongs to the Khoi and the San. Now, I am concerned when my friends from the DA are afraid that the Khoi and the San will now rightfully get what is theirs. That is why they are objecting to the Bill by using certain clauses in the Bill in order to reject it. But, the truth is that there is a sense of fear that the time of illegal occupation of the Khoi and San land to come to an end and give them what is rightfully theirs.

The one thing that it does not talk about it is the kingship, which I think that it is an issue that we must deal with. However, it talks about consultation. Maybe it needs to be broader since the great percentage of the land in the Western Cape and parts of the Northern Cape and the Eastern Cape in terms of the restitution process, must go to the Khoi and the San community. They must, from the day in which this is enacted, be part and parcel of all the negotiations so that foreigners will not

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 113

continue coming to buy these lands at a pittance and put up their developments.

However, I want to say to the people of the Western Cape, since there is so much of the powers put on to the premiers for your negotiation, come in your numbers on 08 May 2019 and vote for the National Freedom Party in the Western Cape. If you do that, you will never be at the mercy of the Democratic Alliance who will never support you. We are saying that if you support the National Freedom Party, we will ensure that, that land process of yours will be accelerated with no further delay. That is your only hope because you will never get it as long as you vote for the DA in the Western Cape. Thank you very much.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Hon Speaker, the UDM supports the Bill with the amendments. The two-year extension of time for compliance for the tribal authorities to be reconstituted is most welcome. What may be a challenge at times it is for the Khoi-San community to prove that they existed from a particular point of time up to the present. How

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 114

will they go about proving a given date when we say a particular point of time? That could be a challenge going forward.

It is not clear on what would happen should there have been a break in their existence as a community. Let alone coherent or not coherent. That is one of the issues that could very well come up as the Bill gets implemented once signed into law. However, the significance of this Bill is the recognition of the way of governance that was practiced from time immemorial by the first nations of this country. This is what appeals to the UDM, that this way of governing themselves through traditional councils as they are called today, continues to be recognised.

This is a very significant step, particularly, considering the ongoing failures of the so-called the democratic way of running the country with leaders popping up, changing colours, changing character, with finance going astray and yet we are saying that the best system of running a community from the local government through to national is a democratic system. We have seen

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 115

the failures. Even when you try to correct those failures, you find that you are going deeper into problems. We do not have the size of problems in the cultural and traditional way of running the affairs of a community like we are having at the moment in South Africa. We are in a real quagmire.

Unfortunately, the ANC has not been a good example of what is called a democratic way of running a country. One would hope that at some point, there would be genuine correction. Come 08 May 2019, we have a plan as the UDM. Thank you.

Mr W M MADISHA: Deputy Speaker, the high level panel reports clearly points to a lack of political will on the part of the current governing party to ensure that formation and democratisation of our system and structures of traditional rule of a desire to foster and perpetuate Bantustan tactics first applied by the apartheid regime. During the liberation struggles South Africans stood up in opposition to the Bantu Authorities Act, to the unilateral imposition of tribal levies and to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 116

confront traditional leaders and their tribal police who went around collecting levies from poor women.

As Dr Klassen points out, when rural people voted, overwhelmingly for ANC in 1994, they voted for equality and democratic rights within a reunited South Africa. They would never have imagined that the ANC would abuse their support to entrench structural inequality in post-apartheid South Africa to advance the interest of an elite and to facilitate the exploitation of our mineral resources to the detriment of our rural and tribal folk and the gross and enrichment of a few.

When the former President Motlanthe and the high level panel pointed out the highness nature and called for the withdrawal of Warriors Bills impinging on the constitutional and democratic rights of our tribal communities including this one in particular... in particular I want to emphasize. He was rebuked by ANC for insulting traditional leaders. COPE has previously rejected this bill on account of defective public consultation on the grounds of constitutionalism that it

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 117

recreates former apartheid homelands and that rural communities would well be subjected to having a tribal identity and traditional leadership imposed on them. COPE stands against this apartheid spile Bantustanisation of our rural and tribal communities. We reject this bill and stand in solidarity with the people of our country, thank you.

Ms B J MALULEKE: Deputy Speaker, is it not surprising that the DA rejects this bill? They really don't care about our people. Their forefathers are the ones who stripped of Khoi-San's rights and land. It's just disappointing to hear the EFF also rejecting this bill because we really though that as Blacks, we know our history and not allow the Khoi-San to continue not enjoy the rights of their country.

Deputy Speaker, colonial disposition and apartheid laws such as the Bantu Authorities Act 1951, destroyed family based ownership rights that exist in terms of customary law and it was through this process that the Khoi-San were disposed of their land and their language and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 118

cultural practices were destroyed. The obliteration of Khoi-San practices culture was a conscious process of oppression by the apartheid system.

They were strict of their birth rights, land, livestock and positions rendering them to be slave labourers to the colonial Dutch farmers and later the British. Post 1994, a critical challenge for the ANC led government, was to transform old order authorities structures into new order authority structures in accordance with the Bill of Rights and the stipulation of Chapter 12 of the Constitution.

In 1926, South Africa adopted United Nation declaration on the rights of indigenous people. The declaration imposes a number of obligations on members' states. It also prohibits discrimination against indigenous people and promotes their full and effective participation in all matters that concern them. The declaration reaffirms what the Constitution of the Republic envisages.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 119

Deputy Speaker, President Nelson Mandela on the occasion of elaboration of traditional leaders in 1997 stated that "The nation needs to come to a proper understanding of those whose history has been grievously affected by refugees and distortion of apartheid and colonialism, the Khoi and the San". This was a demonstration that the ANC led government is committed to restore and defend the rights of the Khoi-San people. The traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Bill is aimed at giving recognition to Khoi-San communities, leaders and structures. It also made it possible for the marginalised citizens to claim and defend their land rights, language and traditions. It does not only relate to leadership issues but to the impact which national laws and policies have in changed and influence the way these people are living.

It also gives traditional leadership how they should relate with their communities. It also in this bill that Khoi-San people are also going to be recognised and given all the rights that other traditional leaderships have. As the ANC we will continue to support and protect the

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 120

rights of the all South Africans. The ANC supports the report of the committee.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chairperson, I move:

That the Bill, as amended, be passed

Motion agreed to.

Bill, as amended, accordingly passed.

**CONSIDERATION OF REQUEST FOR APPROVAL BY PARLIAMENT OF
THE KIGALI AMENDMENT TO THE MONTREAL PROTOCOL ON
SUBSTANCES THAT DEplete THE OZONE LAYER IN TERMS OF
SECTION 231 (2) OF CONSTITUTION, 1996**

Mr M P MAPULANE: Hon House Chair, hon Deputy President, hon members and fellow South Africans, on 16 September 1987, governments of the world convened under the United Nations and reached an environmental agreement to develop

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 121

a protocol that will govern the production and use of harmful substances that damages the ozone.

The agreement was called the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer. Its primary objective was to reduce production and consumption of ozone depleting substances in order to limit the abundance in the atmosphere, and thereby protect the fragile Montreal Protocol Layer. While the Montreal Protocol successfully phased out the ozone depleting substances ... [interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, hon members. Hon Mapulane please let me interrupt you. Hon members, there's a lot of movement. Can we please stay inside the House? Continue, hon member.

Mr M P MAPULANE: It led to shift towards hydrofluorocarbons, which are called the HFCs. Like the Ozone Depleting Substances which they replace, the HFCs are potent green houses that can be hundreds to thousands

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 122

of times more potent than carbon dioxide in contributing to climate change.

The HFCs are chemicals that are primarily used in air conditioning refrigeration and foam insulation. It was in this context that the following seven years of consultation, parties to the Montreal Protocol struck a landmark legally binding deal in the Rwandan capital of Kigali on 15 October 2016 to mandate countries to phase down the production and usage of hydrofluorocarbons, commonly known as the HFCs, to reduce the emissions of the greenhouse gasses in a move that could prevent up to 5 degree Celcius of global warming by the end of this century.

The environmental experts noted that the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol could be the single largest real contribution the world has made so far, in keeping the global temperature rise well below the 2 degree Celcius, a target agreed and codified by the Paris Agreement.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 123

Hon Chairperson, allow me to correct some misleading statements that were made by one member of the DA, hon Mileham, last week Thursday, on this podium. This member came here and repeated some frivolous allegations which were investigated and dismissed by credible institutions in the past. What are the facts?

The first fact is that ... [Interjections.] ...listen carefully. These frivolous and vexatious allegations were tested in 2011 by the Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration, CCMA. After a year-long arbitration, Senior Commissioner Tsabadi, dismissed and rubbished these allegations in his 60-page award, which reinstated and awarded compensation.

In fact, the CCMA was very scathing in the ruling that the charges were without merit and dismissed all of them. Of course, in the kangaroo court of Mr Mileham these things still exists. The second fact is that, these frivolous allegations were brought to the court ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 124

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Mapulane, please take your seat.

Mr M WATERS: I rise on the rule relevance. What is the relevance to the report that the speaker is talking about from the debate from last week? Where is the relevance? If there's supposed to be a ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Let's allow a member to continue.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, if there's supposed to be a point of order on an issue; it's going to be done immediately, and not taken later on. So, if the hon member felt aggrieved by what has been said in the House, he should have got up then on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 125

Mr M WATERS: This is irrelevant and I think you should rule.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I think you've made your point, but I'm going to allow the hon member to conclude his report.

Mr M P MAPULANE: I'm dealing with the misleading statements that were made on this podium, hon Chair, and I'm giving the facts.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, once again I'm standing on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes.

Mr M WATERS: What is misleading is a point of view. We normally have political debates and once again, if a member feels that someone has misled the House, he should stand up on a point of order immediately and say so. So, the Chair can then take corrective action, not a week later. This is some of the ANC's service delivery.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 126

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, I don't even know what this is, but I am going to allow it to be concluded. Conclude hon member.

Mr M P MAPULANE: Thank you very much hon House Chair, I'm just giving the House the facts of the matter that were raised here. I'm saying that these frivolous allegations that were brought here were brought before the court and were dismissed as the second fact.

So, I'm saying, Chairperson, that the DA must refrain from coming here to make this Parliament a kangaroo court and also coming here to bring their frivolous allegations. Therefore, I would like, hon Chair, to say that it gives me great pleasure to present to the hon House that it ratifies the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on substances that deplete the ozone layer. Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. Are there any objections to the approval of the Kigali

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 127

Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on substances that deplete the ozone layer as it appears on the Order Paper?

Mr R K PURDON: Chair, the DA would like to make a declaration, thanks.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): The declaration is requested, you are allowed, DA.

Declarations of vote:

Mr R K PURDON: Hon Chair, on October 15, 2016, in Kigali, Rwanda, out of 197 countries adopted an amendment to phase out hydrofluorocarbons, HFCs under the Montreal Protocol. Under this amendment countries committed to cut the production and consumption of HFCs by more than 80% over the next 30 years. For the layman hydrofluorocarbons are organic compounds that contain only hydrogen, fluorine and carbon atoms.

Hydrofluorocarbons, HFCs are frequently used in air conditioning solvents, foam insulation and as refrigerants. They are powerful greenhouse gases that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 128

harm the ozone layer and contribute to global warming and climate change. This is the main reason that negotiators from out of 197 nations at the United Nations Environment Program in Kigali reached a legally binding accord to phase out hydrofluorocarbons in an amendment to the Montreal Protocol.

So, let us remind ourselves that the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer was designed to reduce the production and consumption of ozone depleting substances. This is in order to reduce their abundance in the atmosphere, and thereby protect the earth's fragile ozone layer. This protocol entered into force in January 1989.

This is a further attempt to keep the global temperature rise well below 2 degrees Celsius, the target that was set in Paris in 2016. Hon Chair, Africa is a continent that is deeply vulnerable to climate change, and as I speak we are witnessing disastrous droughts here in SA and our farmers are under severe pressure. It must be

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 129

noted that African countries opted to phase down these chemicals faster than required.

This involves accurate reporting, transparency and how to deal with Legacy HFC stockpiles. Our concern is that while the intentions are good, have we got the capacity to monitor and enforce this agreement? This is against a background of Eskom's coal-fired plants persistently and significantly violating air pollution limits. This is not only illegal, but means that Eskom is continually endangering the health and violating the human rights of millions of South Africans.

Last month Eskom applied, for the 4th time, for more time to comply with South Africa's minimum emission standards. The sad fact is that while South Africans are asked to bail out Eskom financially, the environmental aspects of their non-performance go virtually unnoticed. No one even mentions their environmental transgressions. This is totally unacceptable. It is also evident that President Ramaphosa has scant respect for our environment.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 130

How else can we explain his appointment of a deeply flawed and incompetent Minister to head up the Environmental Portfolio? How do we explain it? Luckily, this will all change after May 8, because I am confident that incoming President Maimane will appoint a Minister that will serve our environment with the urgency it deserves. The DA supports this amendment

Mrs E N NTLANGWINI: Hon Chairperson, the EFF welcomes the approval by the Portfolio Committee on Environmental Affairs of the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substance that Deplete the Ozone Layer. The Kigali Amendment may possibly be the single largest real contribution the world has made so far towards keeping the global temperature rising below 2 degrees Celsius.

If implemented efficiently, the Kigali Amendment would mandate countries to phase down the production and usage of hydrofluorocarbons, which are man-made chemicals that deplete the ozone layer, exposing the planet to unmitigated temperature rises. Failure to implement this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 131

Kigali Amendment and to beef up our response to climate change, humanity's continued existence is in danger.

We are also told that the rate of temperature rise in Southern Africa is twice the global rate. Therefore, we need to rethink our way of viewing development and we also need to move away from burning fossil fuels for our energy needs. The EFF supports the approval of the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol. Come 8 May, the EFF will be government. Salute!

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, since we are dealing with the issues of environment, the IFP wishes to welcome a ruling by Magistrate Zungu in the Mtubatuba Regional Court that the alleged rhino poaching kingpin, Mr Dumisani Gwala, will eventually face his day in court on 29 April 2019 after protected delays in getting the matter to be heard. [Applause.]

I think that this is a positive step for all those of us who do not want to see what happens to these rhinos.

Secondly, hon Chairperson, we support this protocol and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 132

the positive step was the Carbon Tax Bill that was passed by this House because it shows that as the South Africans, we are serious about protecting the environment, and in particular, the ozone layer.

Hon Chairperson, we all know that in the last year or two, we have had some very erratic weather, where sometimes one wouldn't know whether it is summer or winter. There would be rains in the wrong time and cold in the wrong time, and this was as a result of degradation of earth by human beings.

This protocol which is an international protocol is something that we must adhere to and as the other colleagues said; implement, and hopefully, we will be making a contribution as Members of this Parliament to ensuring that we protect this environment and the species that lives in this particular environment.

Now, having said that, hon Chairperson, we welcome the fact that South Africa is going to be a party to the Montreal Protocol and today's approval reaffirms our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 133

commitment to mitigate against climate change. So, we wholeheartedly support the signing of the protocol. Thank you.

Mr W M MADISHA: Hon Chairperson, as Cope understands it, the Montreal Protocol was adopted with a view to reducing the production and consumption of ozone depleting substances, in order to protect the earth's fragile ozone layer. Chairperson, Africa and South Africa in particular, are particularly sensitive to climate change and to the effects of climate change on our drive to address poverty.

Cope supports Parliament's adoption of the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol in terms of which the United States of America, USA, and European Union, EU, countries will reduce the production and consumption of HFCs from 2019, and much of the rest of the world including all of Africa, will freeze the use of HFCs by 2024. Cope is of the view that the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol is an important step in the fight

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 134

against global warming and climate change. Thank you very much.

Ms S MCHUNU: The hon Chairperson and members, the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer has successfully worked to phase out the use of Ozone Depleting Substances primarily by substituting the use of chlorohydrofluorocarbons, CHFCs, by hydrofluorocarbons, HFCs, in various sectors such as refrigeration, air-conditioning, aerosols, fire extinguishers, and foam blowing.

The high global warming potential of hydrofluorocarbons, HFCs, is a key climate concern and hence it is the very reason behind the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol adopted during the 28th Meeting of Parties in October 2016 in Kigali, Rwanda, to phase down the use of HFCs globally by 2050.

It is important to note that hydrofluorocarbons emission have increased significantly in recent years, and can without a targeted hydrofluorocarbons phased down be

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 135

expected to rise further in response to increased demand for cooling services and the phased out of ozone depleting substances.

The increasing concern about hydrofluorocarbons is that they are the greenhouse gasses, falling under the scope of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, which South Africa ratified in August 1997. This is the Multilateral Climate Change Convention under which we regularly negotiate as a global community.

The convention was convened to find common global solutions to ongoing challenges of climate which are expected to affect us on the African continent more harshly, as our African climate is generally warm. I would like to remind the members of the House that, we negotiated the well-known Paris Climate Agreement which we also ratified under this framework convention.

Let us also reflect back on the 17th meeting of the Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change or Cop17 that we hosted in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 136

Durban in November to December 2011, which provided much needed foundation for the Paris Agreement. At international climate negotiations, our country is widely seen as playing a bridge building role between industrialised and developing countries.

This is driven partly by our collective desire to promote South Africa as a responsible actor at multilateral processes following the collapse of apartheid. Hon members, the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layers does not call upon us to do anything unusual. Rather, it calls upon us to draw our attention to the need to phase down hydrofluorocarbons in light of new information that implicates hydrofluorocarbons in warming or changing the climate.

This is of a major concern to us as the South Africans. Our government has shown decisive leadership on climate change matters as demonstrated by the number of key interventions that we have put together in this respect, especially the White Paper on Climate Change, the 5th

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 137

Chapter of our Development Blueprint and lastly, the National Development Plan, NDP, amongst others.

It suffices to state that, South Africa acceded to the original Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layers on January 15 1990. The Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol actually builds on this current protocol that we are already an esteemed party to. The phase down decision and its annex provides that the majority of Article 5 Parties, including South Africa, should take on a programmatic phase down schedule.

We might not lead to focus only on the phase down of hydrofluorocarbons, but we could also follow a leapfrog strategy that moves from current refrigerants directly into climate friendly alternatives, thereby bypassing the HFCs. This is possible with good research support from Montreal Protocol's own multilateral fund especially when it is blended with local finances.

We always see possibilities where others see hurdles.

Therefore, let us adopt this Kigali Amendment to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 138

Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layers because it is the right thing to do, in the last term of this Fifth Parliament.

IsiZulu:

Sengiphetha, malungu ahloniphekile, ngicela ukubonga wonke amaqembu aphikisayo ngokuxhasa uKhongolose kulesi sichibiyelo lokhu kukhombisa ukuvuthwa kwezinga lwentando yeningi nokukhula kweze laseNingizimu Afrika. Amaqembu aphikisayo afunda kuningi kuKhongolose futhi alandela ezinyathelweni zakhe. Lokhu kukhombisa umoya omuhle kaThuma Mina.

Simema wonke-ke amaqembu aphikisayo ukuba anxenxe bonke abalandeli bawo nabobonke abantu baseNingizimu Afrika ukuba ngomhlaka-8 May bavotele uKhongolose ngoba phela uKhongolose yinhlango yo-Madiba, yoLuthuli, o-Harry Gwala, o-Peter Mokaba, o-Solomon Mahlangu, o-Moses Kotane, o-Gert Sibande, o-Dullah Omar, o-Mama Mittah Seperepere, o-Mama Albertina Sisulu, o-Mama u-Winnie Mandela nawowonke amaqhawe ethu asalala. Ngiyabonga. Nivotele uKhongolose. [Ihlombe.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 139

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are there any objections to the approval of the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layers?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer accordingly approved.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE
- DETERMINATION OF REMUNERATION OF MEMBERS OF FINANCIAL
AND FISCAL COMMISSION**

Ms T V TOBIAS: Hon Chairperson and hon members, on 6 December 2018 the notice from the President on the determination of remuneration of members of the Financial and Fiscal Commission, FFC dated 26 October 2018 was referred to the Standing on Committee on Finance. This referral was a correction to the previous referral of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 140

this matter to the Standing Committee on Appropriations dated 13 November 2018.

On 22 August 2018 the Chairperson of the Independent Commission for the Remuneration of Public Office Bearers, Judge C J Musi made recommendations to the President as contemplated in section 9(1) of the Financial and Fiscal Commission Act, Act 99 of 1997, attached as an annexure to this report. Section 9(1) provides that members of the FFC are entitled to such remuneration, allowances and other benefits as determined by the President taking into consideration the recommendations from the Commission.

The determination by the President must be approved by the National Assembly. Furthermore, the Commission must consult with the Minister of Finance when investigating or considering the remuneration, allowances and other benefits of members of the FFC. The committee noted that the Commission complied with these provisions.

Remuneration of members of the FFC was last adjusted in 2012. Given the important advisory function of the FFC,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 141

the Commission made an initial proposal that National Treasury found unaffordable and unsustainable. Hence, the Commission base on its final recommendations for the full-time chairperson, the part-time deputy chairperson and other members of the FFC on the salary scales determined by the Department of Service and Administration for senior managers in the public service. The determination applies retrospectively from 01 April 2018.

Therefore, the Standing Committee on Finance, having considered the notice, reports that it supports the Determination of Remuneration of Members of the Financial and Fiscal Commission. Also, members should note that the DA reserved their position. We therefore request the House to consider the Report. I thank you.

Question put.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Mr R A LEES: A small but enthusiastic crowd. Madam Chair, the Financial and ... [Interjections.] ... That's much

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 142

better. The Financial and Fiscal Commission has been fraught with concerns for some years. The support given by the FFC to Parliament in the past has been less than useful, needs to be greatly improved and must be completely non-partisan.

A forensic investigation into the operations of the FFC and its previous acting chair was commissioned and the contents of the report from this investigation need to be properly and publicly scrutinised. There's currently a considerable internal conflict taking place at the FFC which undoubtedly has a negative impact on the work it should be undertaking. This may well be the result of the efforts by the current chair to instil an ethical professionalism and hard work. Time will tell.

Given the parlous economic situation facing all South Africans and the fact that President Ramaphosa has announced a freeze of public office bearers' salaries, we believe that such a freeze should also apply in the case of the FFC. Thank you, Madam Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 143

Ms Y N YAKO: Madam Chair, like many other institutions in this country, the Financial and Fiscal Commission has been ignored for far too long and lacks capacity. As Parliament, there is so much we can do to strengthen the Financial and Fiscal Commission. It begins with acknowledging the importance of the FFC as a constitutionally-mandated body.

The recommendation of the FFC must also find substantive expression in activities of Parliament. Currently, amongst its many duties, the Financial and Fiscal Commission provides government with recommendations on how revenue should be divided between three spheres of government. This is extremely important as the current manner in which revenue is divided is ill-conceived and has a negative impact on service delivery.

Since we first became Members of this Parliament, the EFF has consistently called for a larger percentage of national revenue to be allocated to the local sphere of government. Local government is at the forefront of service delivery and throughout much of the world the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 144

majority of resources are allocated to the local sphere of government.

An empowered and capacitated commission would have the necessary research skills, expertise and leadership to develop substantial policy papers, proposals and recommendations. By developing informed policy perspectives the commission would then be able to make practical and substantive policy proposals and recommendations that will have a positive impact on the lives of South Africans. So, we hope that this increase in remuneration will lead to the strengthening of the Financial and Fiscal Commission.

Therefore, Madam Chair, as the EFF we support the Determination of Remuneration of Members of the Financial and Fiscal Commission. But we want to state that, if this is not accompanied by increased capacitation of the Commission as a whole, we will have little or no impact on the ability of the Commission to fulfil its mandate. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 145

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon House Chairperson and hon colleagues, if one were to ask members of this House who know the FFC or have ever benefitted from the FFC in the execution of their duties and responsibilities in this Parliament, very few hands would go up. Those who have received assistance from the FFC would tell you that it has been nothing but short, to say the very least.

We want to put the cart before the horse and remunerate the Commissioners, the board, the chair and so on without first and foremost, giving capacity to the FFC to do its work and duties. If this was a bonus, one would want to ask the question: What are we benchmarking these increases against? We would find that, well, it is just a nicety. That's the one aspect.

Last week the Minister of Finance stood on this podium and spoke about belt-tightening; people not receiving increases and so on including Members of Parliament ...

IsiZulu:

... kodwa manje sishaya u-180, omunye nje umjika-joe ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 146

English:

... and we want to increase the FFC's salaries. No, it can't be. That amounts to Parliament speaking from both sides of its mouth. We have been told that there is no money. So, where will this money now come from? Let us not obfuscate the platform of duty and responsibility. What we should be speaking about is how we are going to give full capacity to the FFC; build up its technical expertise, financial muscle and so on, to actually be able to do its work. When we are satisfied that it is doing its work, we can then speak about increases.

Therefore, at this point in time it would be both reckless and irresponsible for us to blindly support this kind of recommendation. Thus, the IFP will not support this as a matter of principle and hope that the time will come when we'll do things correctly and properly. We will end up paying people to sit in their air-conditioned offices and not do anything. I still ask the question to members of this House: Who has received satisfactory help and assistance from the FFC? The number is next to zero.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 147

Well, only one hand. That tells you what the problem is. So, hon Chair, we do not support this. Thank you.

Mr Y I CARRIM: Comrade Chairperson, comrades and colleagues, this view that is emerging that the FFC is not performing to its fullest is not something that's peculiar or relevant to a single party. I think the committee as a whole has on several occasions said, we think the FFC should perform better and more effectively. It should be more productive. In fact, that's partly why in 2015 this very committee decided that at least the chairperson should be full-time and the deputy chairperson at least half-full time, if you like. That is not enough obviously.

However, this issue is not related to the salary scales, really. In the first instance, they haven't received an increase since 2012. Secondly, it is not the President who arbitrarily decided to increase their salaries. The President is merely acting on the recommendation - having thought it through - of the independent commission; the same commission that decides on our salary scales.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 148

Thirdly, the salaries offered are consistent with the salary scales of the Department of Public Service and Administration. So, there is nothing outlandish offered here.

Mr Hlengwa is generally a very sober, helpful, useful and productive member of this committee. I can only take it that he is saying what he is saying because he didn't attend the meetings. In the first instance, we didn't blindly agree, Mr Hlengwa. In fact, in the very first meeting both the DA and ANC said, let's get more information before we vote on this. It is not blindly. You were not there but it doesn't mean we were blind.

Secondly, you are saying there's no money. So, the subtext is, let us not pay them. Well, then the same applies to us my friend. If there is no money, why must we pay Members of Parliament? Let us start with that. We can't say, let us not pay the FFC because there is no money. At least we got increases, if I am correct, annually for many years now and the FFC counsellors have not had that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 149

The next point is that we were clear that - I don't understand this - we were not genuine that the FFC is not performing. Who ultimately is responsible to ensure that the FFC performs if not our committee and Parliament? So, the very members of the committee who are meant to hold the FFC to account are now complaining that they are not performing as if somehow that's unrelated to our role. It is not just us who must ensure that the FFC performs, but it is also the role of the Ministry and National Treasury. We should hold the FFC, the Ministry and Treasury to account in respect of the performance of the FFC.

Yes, the DA says there is a report that is looking into allegations of mismanagement within the FFC. There is nothing to stop our committee from requesting a copy of that report. There are circumstances in which the executive is legally bound not to release a report. If that is the case, the executive must give us the reason why it will not release the report. However, if there is no legal obstacle to releasing the report, let's do exactly that. Let's decide tomorrow in our committee

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 150

meeting to request a copy of the report. But certainly, it will be the Sixth Parliament and not us who will be able to process that.

Regarding the issue of performance-linked salaries, yes, presumably in some form or another, the commission does look at the role a commission or Members of Parliament play in evaluating our salaries and the salaries of the FFC against the market and so on. Presumably, that commission, independent as it is, would have done some sort of evaluation. But, let us not be inconsistent and hypocritical. If we are demanding performance-related salaries for the FFC, then what about us as Members of Parliament? Shouldn't we also be paid according to some form of performance evaluation? Of course, most of us will say, no!

My own view, which I do not want to mention but those who know me will know what I think. But because I have no mandate, therefore I shall keep quiet. However, I have once or twice said it publicly and I was chided by comrades. So, hey, you know what, I think I have had my

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 151

say. Therefore, let me not say anything. Let me put this to you. If we are going to say the FFC should be evaluated fully for its performance and determine whether the salaries allocated to it are actually appropriate or not, that will have to apply to all commissions including the Gender Commission. Does that fall within the purview of the Portfolio Committee on Finance? No! Presumably, that falls under the purview of the Portfolio Committee on Public Service and Administration.

If it is the view of the majority of us in the Portfolio Committee on Finance since we are responsible for the budget and we are on extremely severe constraints financially, economically and otherwise, and what's looming at most is 1,7% on goal grid in the 2019-20 financial year, then let's discuss that, take the majority decision, write to the Chairperson of the Portfolio Committee on Public Service and Administration as well as the Speaker's Office, and ask that this matter be attended to. So, in principle, we are not saying that but we can't just take the FFC alone and treat it differently. If that's what you want to do as the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 152

majority in our committee, let's put it to the committee tomorrow or next week and we'll process it via the appropriate committee.

Having said all of that, I would like to say that the current chairperson is doing what he can in the circumstances that he faces. The reasons they have not been performing is not because they choose not to perform as Mr Hlengwa said that they haven't even given them enough support. But that's my view and that of the majority and certainly the ANC and my comrade there, Thandi Tobias whom I see more often than my own partner these days. You know what, no, there's no nefarious thing; we work together; and she's the Whip and I'm the Chair. Do you think if I was having a relationship with Thandi Tobias-Pokolo I would say so publicly here? Secondly, anybody who observes in the committee knows that we fight a lot in the committee. [Interjections.] Yes, that's transparency.

What I am saying in short is that I have no doubt that Thandi Tobias-Pokolo at least and the majority in the ANC

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 153

agree with what I am saying in that regard. Having said that, can we please move on; do our job; stop whinging and wining; and leave the FFC to account? Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chair, we move that this Report be adopted by this House. Thank you.

Motion agreed to (Inkatha Freedom Party, Democratic Alliance and Congress of the People dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON WATER
AND SANITATION ON STUDY TOUR TO NETHERLANDS FROM 4 TO 8**

JUNE 2018

Mr M JOHNSON: House Chairperson, comrades, friends, fellow South Africans, allow me from the outset to introduce this report on the study tour to the Netherlands that took place on 4 to 8 June 2018 for adoption by this august House.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 154

This report forms part of an ongoing ANC programme of bettering the lives of our ordinary people. It follows the best practice on water governance and wastewater treatment technologies worldwide. It also follows a relationship governed by a MOU between South Africa and the Netherlands - the world leader in governance and technological advancements.

Part of our observation revealed a need for an extension of a memorandum of understanding between South Africa and the Netherlands on the co-operation in the field of water resource. This report also seeks to build capacity and activities that include among others, training of wastewater operators, and maintenance technicians.

Out of this study tour, a need for the creation of opportunities and/or involvement of public-private partnerships is clearly articulated in the MOU, especially given the budget constraints that our country is confronted with, especially in the water and sanitation sphere.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 155

Our committee further observed that co-operation and maintenance of wastewater treatment in South Africa should consider new technologies, which are cost and energy efficient, such as the Nereda wastewater treatment technologies in the Netherlands.

Lastly, there should be a clear maintenance plan for water resource such as dams and rivers, for instance, dredging was identified in this regard as part of a creation of more storage capacity in our dams.

In order to sustain our infrastructure, the department should develop a maintenance and monitoring plan for the management of the country's water resource. On behalf of the ANC, the people's movement, leading this committee, I submit this report for adoption by this august House. I thank you.

IsiZulu:

USOTSWEBHU OMKHULU WEQEMBU ELIBUSAYO: Sihlalo, sicela ukuthi le Ndlu yesiShayamthetho iyamukele lo Mbiko wekomidi. Ngiyabonga.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 156

Declarations of vote:

Mr L J BASSON: Chairperson, the portfolio committee resolved to conduct a study tour on water governance. The Netherlands was identified as a country with best practices that could assist with South Africa's needs. In 2013, South Africa and the Netherlands entered into a memorandum of understanding. The objective of the Kingfisher Programme is to capacitate catchment management agencies, CMAs, on water governance and ensure the exchange of skills and expertise.

The Netherlands became a world leader in integrated water governance as well as water and wastewater treatment.

Water authorities in the Netherland exist for more than 700 years. On this study tour, we learned a lot about how to govern water and maintain infrastructure.

We could change water management in South Africa for the better and therefore we support this report. The DA urges Minister Nkwinti to implement the best practices, as mentioned in this report.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 157

The committee waited almost three years for the water master plan - this plan that spells out the future of water in South Africa. The committee heard all the excuses in the world why this report was not made available to the portfolio committee. Guess what? The Dutch presented South Africa's water plan in the Netherlands to us. What an embarrassing moment it was for us!

Leonardo Da Vinci said and I quote: "Water is the driving force of all nature." All over South Africa, our people experience water-shedding. The ANC government's inability to expand, maintain, manage and finance this country's water infrastructure is dragging our people down into a filthy pit latrine. The question is: Why? The answer is simple: We see political interference, lack of leadership, corruption and little to no planning.

The problem started with the previous Minister Nomvula Mokonyane's denial. On eNCA, the Minister said and I quote: "We will never ever have a situation of water-shedding. It will never happen." The fact is that water-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 158

shedding is real. It is a crisis in South Africa and we are experiencing that now.

Three officials of the department were quoted in the newspaper saying that long-term plans on how to mitigate the national drought did not get the attention it needed. They further said and I quote: "We did not ignore it or plan to fail, we just screwed up."

Whether we have drought or not, our water infrastructure is, by large, in danger to collapse. Underperforming municipalities governed by the ANC is the main contributor to water crises and the polluting of our rivers.

South Africa, if you vote ANC in this election, you will see more of the same corruption, maladministration and water-shedding. [Interjections.]

Afrikaans:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 159

Suid-Afrika sal op 8 Mei verandering bring. Stem vir 'n DA-regering wat die mense van Suid-Afrika eerste sal plaas.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Would you mind to take a question?

Mr L J BASSON: I don't take questions here. Come to the portfolio committee.

Afrikaans:

Stem vir 'n DA-regering wat 'n beter toekoms vir ons kinders bou, 'n DA-regering wat ware verandering sal bring - verandering wat een Suid-Afrika vir almal sal bou.

Suid-Afrika, daar is net een keuse om korrupsie te stop, een keuse om werk te skep, een keuse om die ligte aan te hou en een keuse om water in jou krane te hê en daardie keuse is om DA te stem op 8 Mei. Dankie. [Applous.]

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 160

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sihlalo ngithi angibonge ithuba lokuthi ngime lapha. Yebo, ngangiyingxenye yokuya eNetherlands siyobheka ukuthi bona benzenjani ukucwenga amanzi abo ezweni labo ukuze abantu bangahlupheki. Ngesikhathi sihamba siya laphaya lapha eKapa kwakunenkinga enkulu yokushoda kwamanzi. Lapho i-DA yayishabasheka ihlangana nezinkontileka zangaphandle ekungabangani bayo. UNgqongqoshe uNomvula Mokonyane kanjalo la eNingizimu Afrika edle waziqeda zonke izimali nalobo Ben 10 bakhe. [Ubuwelewele.] Into eyenzekile la eNingizimu Afrika ziphelelwe ngamanzi ... [Ubuwelewele.]

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon House Chair, on a point of order: I insist that the hon member may not refer to a member of this House in this derogatory manner. [Interjections.] If she wants to cast aspersions, she can then do so through a substantive motion. We request that you order her to actually withdraw. Thank you.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Chairperson, on a point of order: ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 161

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): No, I am dealing with the order, as raised.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Are you going to come after ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): I have to rule on the order first, hon member. Hon Khawula, what you have said when you talked about the Minister is unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

... ukuthi uqede yonke imali. [Ubuwelewele.] Wazi kahle ukuthi kufanele ulethe ...

English:

... you have to bring a substantive motion, if you have to accuse a member of this House about that.

[Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

Ngicela uhoxhise kulokho Mama.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 162

Nk M S KHAWULA: Eh

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Ngicela uhoxhise kuqala Mama.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Engani nyiyaqala ukukhuluma manje usungingena emlonyeni. [Uhleko.]

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Kulungile Mama.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Yikuphi engizokuhoxhisa kuqala.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Cha, uhoxhisa ukuthi uqede imali. [Ubuwelewele.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: Cha, angeke mfowethu. [Ubuwelewele.] Manini manini. Angithi niyazi lapha uAgrizzi kanti ukthini? [Ubuwelewele.]

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Cha, lungu elihloniphekile Mam'uKhawula, sikhuluma ngohlelo olunye

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 163

alukho udaba luka-Agrizzi lapha eNdlini. [Ubuwelewele.]
Ngicela uhoxhise Mama.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Lalela ke ngiyaxolisa.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Siyabonga Mama, qhubeka
nenkulumo yakho.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyayifuna leyo mizuzu.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Cha, imile vele Mama.
Angeke bayiphange.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Kulungile, ngiyabonga. Uyabona lapha
eNingizimu Afrika ayikho into ebuhlungu kulokhu kuthiwa
akufihlwe izinto zibe zenzekile. Kumanje la eNingizimu
Afrika abantu bakithi amanzi abanawo. Kade ngise wadini
yama-26 eZakheni, eNyokeni abantu kusukela ngowezi-1994
bakhala ngamanzi. Izindlu zangasese zakhona kuse
yilezizomgodi. [Ubuwelewele.] Into ebeyiyelwe laphaya
eNetherlands kwakufana nokuthi sasivakasha ngoba
uNgqongqoshe yena qobo lwakhe into esayifika bebeya

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 164

laphaya eNetherlands bebethola imiklomelo yokuthi babika izinto ezilungile ukuthi bayazenza lapha eNingizimu Afrika. [Ubuwelewele.]

Uyabona njengoba ngikhuluma nani nje kunalento eyatholakala yokuthi la eNingizimu Afrika kuvumelekile ukuthi kuthathwe intsha ihambe iyoqeqeshwa ngaphesheya ukuthi kufuneka aphathwe kanjani amanzi nendle. Kunokuthi uNgqongqoshe athathe izingane zalapha eNingizimu Afrika ayoziqeqesha ubethatha izingane zakhe nezabangane bakhe. [Ubuwelewele.] Le nto ibuhlungu ngoba nina ninenkinga yokuvikelana, nikhohlwe ukuthi njengoba nilapha nifike ngamavoti abantu. [Ubuwelewele.] Okubuhlungu kunakho konke asikwazi ukukhuluma ... [Ubuwelewele.]

Mr P J MNGUNI: Chairperson, on a point of order: I rise in terms of Rule 92. Once again, the hon member is repeating the same reference to the Minister and she may only do so through a substantive motion, which she is allowed to do. [Interjections.] She cannot do it in the course of the debate, as she is doing. We request that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 165

she withdraws once again. If she continues in this fashion, it will be something else.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Chairperson, on a point of order: ...
I am not scared of you, Chief. On a point of order: ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon members, I am sorry that I missed that part. Can the hon Whip please tell me which part it is? Or, I will ask the Table staff to look into it and then we will talk about it.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Chairperson, on a point of order: ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): I am not done. I am not done. I will ask the Table staff to consult Hansard because I missed that one.

Mr P J MNGUNI: House Chair, thank you. Yes. It had to do with the Minister taking the child and ...

[Interjections.] Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 166

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): I will ask the Table staff to consult Hansard and I will rule on it.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Chairperson, we are busy with a very important subject here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): What is your point of order?

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: I am coming to it. Don't be impatient. I am rising on a very important ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon member, what is your point of order?

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: No, you were patient with that hairdresser. You were patient with him. So, give me a chance. Why are you talking into my mouth? Why ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon member, I am going to switch off your microphone. What is your point of order?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 167

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: My point of order is: Can you address that guy that stands up all the time? He must stop doing this thing. He must go and cut hair or something.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): I have ruled on the matter, hon member. So, that is not a point of order. I am going to switch off your microphone. I have ruled on the matter. I am not going back.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, bengizocela ...

[Ubuwelewele.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon House Chairperson, on a point of order: That hon member of the EFF called hon Mnguni a hairdresser and that guy. We don't use those names in this House. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Thank you for that. I will also allow the Table staff to assist me with the ruling on this one, because I could not hear it.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 168

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Hon Chair, what is wrong with a hairdresser?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Thank you very much. I did not ...

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: What is wrong? It is an occupation. It is a profession. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon member, take your seat.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, uyabona kukhona into engiphatha kabi la eNingizimu Afrika ukuthi lapha siyahola, sihola imali yabakhokhi bentela ukuthi siqinisekise ukuthi umsebenzi wabo uyenzeka. Ewadini lama-44 amanzi awekho. Uma uthi uyabheka izimali zakhona ziyaphuma funeka sonke sizogamba amanga lapha ePhalamende sivikele abantu abangangayo. [Ubuwelewele.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 169

Lungu elihloniphekile Mnguni kufuneka ucabange into eyodwa. Uyabona asifani, mina ngaba emzabalazweni ngiyayazi into engangiyilwela. Mhlawumbe wena ungomunye walaba abadingiswa awulwazi usizi esalulwelayo.

[Ubuwelewele.] Ngakho ke ayikho into ebuhlungu ukubona abantu bakithi behlupheka ekubeni sasilwa sithi silwela bona. Musani ukwenza into enaniyenza kuMongameli wenu uZuma, nanishabasheka nenza yona lento. [Ubuwelewele.] Etheni enza amaphutha nimvune. [Ubuwelewele.] Enze amaphutha nimvune. Yini inkinga yenu? Anikwazi ukucabangela abantu nicabangela kuphela ukuthi akuvotwe ukuze nithole amavoti abantu.

Bayahlupheka abantu. Thina sihamba phansi ebantwini. Izimoto zethu ziphela amathayela, siyehla siyeyuka ukubheka izinkinga zabantu. Abantu bakithi bayahlupheka, amanzi abanawo. Izindlu zangasese ezingasile kade kuthiwa zizoqedwa kodwa namanje lezo zindlu zangasese zisekhona. Siphuma la sihambe siye siyokwenza umsebenzi wokuyogapha [oversight] izinkinga ebebesibikela zona bakhuluma ngezinto ezinhle, uma sifika ebantwini sifika konakele.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 170

Lungu elihloniphekile Nkwinti ngifuna ukukutshela into eyodwa, ngiyakuthemba. Ake uqinisekise ukuthi usebenzele abantu, uyeke labantu bakho abangazi ukuthi bafunani la eNingizimu Afrika. [Ubuwelewele.] Uma ungumNingizimu Afrika votela i-EFF, nikhohlwe yilezi zigebengu lezi! [Ihlombe.]

Inkosi R S CEBEKHULU: Chairperson, firstly I must state, unfortunately I was not part of the Portfolio Committee on visit Netherland but, I wish to state some of the things, I felt I should. The IFP notes and supports this report following over study to the Netherlands by the Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation. I cannot stress enough the importance of this engagement. Our country has experienced a severe drought, constant water shortages and is on the brink of disaster if do not take swift action, however swift action requires decisive and strong leadership. I am doubtful that the current crop of leaders within the ANC is able to take this action without lining their pocket first.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 171

We need leaders who can get the job done. It is of no use for us to speak of developing world class technologies in the water sector when we have world class thieves that are looting the state at the cost of all South Africans having to suffer the consequences. The Department of Water and Sanitation need to get its house in order before it can manage with scope of delivering good quality and clean drinking water to our people while providing dignified sanitations to millions of South Africans.

The President's Infrastructural Committee need to focus on our bulk water supply system with urgency. This too, is an opportunity to drive the economy by creating thousands of jobs; it's not just about fixing water leaks, without addressing core water infrastructure needs and going to the root of the problems. Waste treatment facilities are dilapidated, some desolate and some are crumbling. This is a major risk and may pose a dire threat, should we allow for the contamination of our drinking water, as pipelines running into our dams and seas are fragile at this point.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 172

The IFP hopes that with the trainings, skills development and capacitating of the Kingfisher Programme, we are able to take a clear program of action forward in improving our water governance. The IFP supports this report however it must be said once again that if the ANC can keep their hands off the public purse. This Department can deliver better services to all our people. Thank you.

Ms D CARTER: Chairperson, as COPE we taken great interest in the report on the study tour, by all accounts Netherlands has world governed water and sanitation sector but is hard not to draw a negative and damning contrast with the deteriorating water and sanitation situation we face here at home. Currently our national focus is on the collapse of Eskom and the damning consequences thereof.

As COPE we are equally concern that we are facing similar crisis we the impending collapse of our water and our sanitation sector. The sign of this crisis already clearly is manifesting themselves despite repeated warnings over the past 20 years. As far back as 2002, the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 173

National Water Strategy concluded that we have become a water constrain economy, that future growth of our economy was constrain, not just by just electricity constrains but by lack of waters, wow, but no absolutely action was taken, rather those that sounded alarm, like the plant scientist like Dr Anthony Turton, was shouted down, victimised and hounded out of government.

Add to this that water we have in our rivers and dams, the resources on which our entire national economy is based is now polluted by sewage, acid mine drainage, uranium and a cocktail of drugs, including antibiotics, steroids, hormones amongst others, but hon M Johnson, calls it, the ANC's back sceptors. Today I am treated raw sewage from dysfunctional inoperative sewage plants, flows directly into our rivers without any fear of regulatory intervention, hon M Johnson is that really back sceptors?

The Department of Water and Sanitation has been mismanaged, corrupted and looted with absolute impunity, to the point of collapse, skilled and experienced

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 174

engineers have been purge. The same can be said with many of our board water, utilities and municipalities, especially those under the tyranny of the ruling party and I call the ruling party for a reason. We face an unfolding water and sanitation disaster and it is not only the healthy and social wellbeing of our society but our current and future economic prospect and our very stability as a nation.

At the heart of this crisis is current governing party. COPE notes this report and its recommendation, the real and lasting solution to our growing water and sanitation crisis, lies in the removal from power of a corrupted Ruling Party. South Africa needs a new centre and we are part of that solution. To the electorate I want to say, your vote can ... [inaudible] it will save both the country from corruption. Thank you.

Mr D MNGUNI: Chairperson, The Deputy President, The Chief Whip of the Ruling Party, hon members, hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers. Let me start by saying that EFF, it is of great importance that you must always tell the truth.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 175

You must know and have evidence of what you are talking about. If there is any evidence of corruption as you have just alluded to. 1. You must bring evidence; you must report that to the police. That is what you are supposed to do as a member of this House.

As the ANC, forming part of the portfolio committee, we resolved at the strategic planning workshop held in 2014, to conduct a study tour on water governance and waste water treatment technologies. The Netherlands was identified as a country with best practice in respect of water governance and waste water treatment technologies, as identified by the organisation for economic cooperation and development report on Dutch water governance.

There were focus areas which some of them, the hon Chair of the portfolio committee has alluded them. The tour was enabled by the memorandum of understanding between our country and the Netherlands, which was signed in 2013. It provided the framework for cooperation in the field water resources on a basis of mutual benefit. It also paved the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 176

way for strong working relationships between South African institutions and the Dutch Water Boards, including the non governmental organisations, water companies, municipalities, knowledge institutions and businesses.

In this regards the Committee was then exposed to the Kingfisher Programme, which is a bilateral cooperation programme on water governance between South Africa's water institutions and Dutch Regional Water Authorities. The Kingfisher phase one, ran from 2013-2016 and the second phase from 2017-2018. The Committee learnt that the programme focused on among others the establishment catchment management agencies, organisational development, and process to development internal and organisational structures, stakeholder engagement, and trust boundary water management and cooperation governance with municipalities.

Apart from this programme, the Committee learn a lot about water governance through presentation from various governmental and non governmental organisations, such as

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 177

the Regional Water Boards, research institutions and the Parliamentary Committee on Infrastructure and water management. EFF, were there to learn ...

Siswati:

Mnu D MNGUNI... bantfu bafuna kuva kwekutsi imali yabo uyisebentise kahle ...

English:

Mr D MNGUNI...it was not a wasteful expenditure, when you went there, what is it that you learnt not that what you are doing, telling us excuses which you are supposed to resolve. It is worth point out that Netherlands and South Africa water management issues are completely different ...

Siswati:

Mnu D MNGUNI: ... INetherlands inemanti lamaningi kodvwa Iningizimu Afrika ayinawo emanti lamaningi, emanti ayaphela eNingizimu Afrika, kodvwa ke...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 178

Mr D MNGUNI...the governing systems are applicable to South Africa's governing challenges. This is evident in the Inkomati-Usuthu Catchment, which has implemented some aspects of the Dutch water governance. I must be saying that the Regional Water Authority in Netherlands was established in the 1255, which is 764 years as we are saying now.

The Democratic South Africa has got only 25 years into existence. When the DA, your forefathers ...

Siswati:

Mnu D MNGUNI: ... bonkhulu benu bafika la ...

English:

Mr D MNGUNI: ... 300 years ago in 1652 through Jan Van Riebeeck ...

Siswati:

Mnu D MNGUNI: ... uma bafika lana bawabona emanti aseNingizimu Afrika kodvwa abakhoni kwenta ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 179

English:

Mr D MNGUNI: ... governing issues to ensure that all people in South Africa get water ...

Siswati:

Mnu D MNGUNI: ... bona bebabuke bantfu babo, labamhlophe labambalwa kutsi ngibo lokumele batfole emanti kuphela. Kungako emadamu, nemifula aphetfwe bantfu labamhlophe ...

English:

Mr D MNGUNI: ... we have got 5000 dams in South Africa, only 300+ of those dams are owned by the Department. More than 4000 dams are owned by your forefathers, your cousins, your nephews. When you go to the farms, you will find that some of the black farm owners, African Famers' Association of South Africa, AFASA and so fort they don't have water, but were given land. How do you expect those people to produce?

Siswati:

Mnu D MNGUNI: ... Ngoba nine natsatsa lamanti nawenta enu.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 180

English:

Mr D MNGUNI: ... Apart from the governing lessons, the Committee also learnt a lot about waste water treatment technologies and innovations, for instance a sight visit to Ipswich Treatment Plant, which uses the innovative Narendra sewage treatment technology, which was very informative. The technology allows for the treatment of waste water, with unique feature of aerobic granular biomass, invented by the Deaf University of Technology in partnership with Royal Haskoning Dwars, Heederik en Verhy, DHV, which is the Dutch Foundation for Applied Water Research and Dutch Water Authorities.

The treatment plant operated by the water authority, Water Skavele en Veluwe treats waste water produced by East London Town, EP, and the surrounding areas, including the industrial and the domestic waste. The system uses aerobic biological treatment methods that require no chemicals or if needed a minimal compared to the conventional technologies.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 181

It also worth noting that the Narendra system takes 20% less phase, 30% less power and smaller quantities of chemical additive, resulting in the reduction of environmental pollution by about 50%, in comparison with the conventional plants. The final influence from the plant can be safely discharged into the river ecosystem or used for agricultural purposes.

The memorandum of understanding which was supposed to be finished by 2018 has also been signed now, on 25 June 2018, this will enable the Department to make further studies and researches towards ...[inaudible]. Thank you.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON TRADE
AND INDUSTRY - ON STUDY VISIT TO UNITED KINGDOM**

Ms J L FUBBS: Chairperson, I did realise that there was a pledge form here. Forgive me. This was one of the most constructive reports coming from the Committee of Trade and Industry about a study visit, nor was it no joy ride. We actually went on the study visit in May, because we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 182

were in the middle of the Bill on the National Credit Amendment Bill and it was a committee Bill.

As all of us know, it is very helpful and constructive to look at other countries have done. At that particular time, Parliament's Budget was very tight but nevertheless, in May last year, we were allowed to go on this three day visit to the United Kingdom, UK.

Why did we go there? As a matter of fact, there were many international case studies on Debt Relief, in particular, there had been the one in Croatia which seemed to be just the trick but did only happen in February 2015. So, we wanted to know what will be the impact that was a bit too soon. We looked at India but that was to address the farmers while we went just addressing the farmers we were addressing a abroad agreement.

Then there was a United State of America that addressed purely the students. Then there was no income, no assets, Nina, for New Zealand, England and Wales. Both Japan and America had a bankruptcy one.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 183

We weren't looking at bankruptcy per se, we were looking at individuals earning seven thousand five hundred or less and what will be the most appropriate jurisdiction to conduct the study visit to but also we could afford as a Parliament of South Africa. That turned out to be the UK which was England, Scotland, Ireland and Wales.

So, I do know. I am not giving a Geography lesson but thanks for that. The purpose of our study trip was to get a better understanding of how other jurisdiction had dealt with this issue and what the impact was on the fiscus, because in the eighteen months prior to that we were informed that we will bring down the country. The banks will collapse.

Well, we learnt with interest. This was not the case in the UK in terms of England, Scotland and Wales. There were many role players and varieties of how you would address this, including something very interesting that in the end the industry itself thought it would be a very good idea to contribute and levy them.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 184

This is taken from the government. It came from the business community. So, I guess the different jurisdiction had different business communities and that was quite clear. Nevertheless, this was a multiparty committee, the ANC, the DA and the EFF.

We learnt there of the importance they attached to financial awareness education starting from the schools assisting people on how to budget insisting that the financial institutions would be part of this process and financial institutions meaning all the banks, etc.

Finally, the importance they played on everyone having access to debt counselling including the poorest of the poor. That actually proved to be a very important Bill for us and when we looked at what we brought out later and the recommendations was basic education. It was to ask the Minister of Finance to introduce a levy on credit providers and I realised I am into downtime. I want to respect you hon Chairperson and to say that this study visit of the committee was incredibly constructive as all parties will agree. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 185

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House
Chairperson, I move that the report be adopted.

Declarations of Vote:

Mr D W MACPHERSON: Chairperson, sometimes it is important to question the purpose of study tours and whether in fact anything is indeed learnt from them, because the reason why the Portfolio Committee for Trade and Industry went on the study tour to the UK was to look at credit regulation and more specifically with Debt Relief.

If one looks at the Bill that the committee produced, clearly they didn't learn a thing. Now, the one thing that we did learn from the UK is that they have a good credit regulation framework that protects citizens. That is responsive to citizen. That is effective in financial literacy, everything that the National Credit Regulator is not.

Their financial sector it seemed to be a partner in credit regulation and enforcement. In South Africa, the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 186

financial sector is seen as the enemy and it continuously browbeaten.

We seemed to have learned very little from the UK debt relief model and instead ploughed headlong into our credit Bill ignoring much of the issues around moral hazard but never let the facts get on the way of a committee Bill.

Then, I want to touch on the German leg that followed and it is important why we went there, because we went there to learn about the Fourth Industrial Revolution. In Germany, the Fourth Industrial Revolution is not an election catch phrase like it is for the ANC.

Ms J L FUBBS: Hon Chairperson, a point of order and it is the first time I have called a point of order in twenty years.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member, you can take your seat. What is the point of order, hon member?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 187

Ms J L FUBBS: The report on the table is not about the German leg of the study tour. That is still coming. This is about the report on study tour with respect to Debt Relief and the practices in the UK. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member on the podium, you can proceed and reflect on what the report is about.

Mr D W MACPHERSON: Well, I am not aware that as badge of honour that in twenty years I got the hon Fubbs to take a point of order. I may carry on talking about the Fourth Industrial Revolution, because for the ANC it is nothing but a catch phrase. It is something that they talk about but has little ever been seen in South Africa.

What do we learn about the Germans when it comes to the Fourth Industrial Revolution? That they work together, government, unions and civil society, which are not exactly like how the ANC works in their tripartite alliance.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 188

Let's use Eskom as a great example. The President says he is going to unbundle Eskom, Ace Magashule says you are not going to unbundle Eskom. The President says in the sona reply, I am going to unbundle Eskom, the Minister for Transport says if you dare do that, the SACP wont vote for you in the elections on 8th May. That doesn't sound like a very cohesive government when it comes to policy.

Let's not forget hon Fubbs what BMW conveyed to us. When they said with regards to the South African automotive master plan that what concerns them the most about the plan is the unrealistic requirements with respect to Black Economic Empowerment, BEE and localisation.

Why is that, Minister? It is because BMW see BEE for what it is, a narrow enrichment scheme for cadres, comrades and cronies and BMW will not have anything to do with it.

So, maybe and just maybe the portfolio committee and the hon member, Fubbs would have learnt something from this trip. That is the best to learn from the best and when

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 189

the UK credit regulators say that what we should be doing is having financial literacy, we can't just write it as a requirement in a Bill that we will discuss it sometime later. That is something that should actually be implemented from the beginning and hopefully if you have learned something in the last twenty years in this Parliament that maybe we should actually start listening to some people that know what they are doing and not your own study group. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Order, hon members. Let's try and focus on the report at hand. I am sure hon member you heard in the response, hon Fubbs said the German leg report is still coming.

Ms E N NTLANGWINI: Hon Chairperson, ...

IsiXhosa:

Hayi lo mntwana, hayi! Mhlawumbi ...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 190

... after 8 May 2019, we will see a different picture,
... [Interjections.] But we will see. The true value of
the Trade and Industry study tour to the United Kingdom,
the UK, can only be truly determined if lessons learnt
are reflected in the recommendations of the committee and
the policy of government.

During our time in the UK, one of the many interesting
policies which were learnt was the banking levy. A bank
levy is an annual tax on the value of all the debts of
the bank, and the purpose of the levy is to prevent banks
from engaging in reckless spending and practices.

Currently, in South Africa, we have seen a situation
where the exact opposite is happening and that is what
the DA is protecting. Commercial banks like Capitec Bank
engage in reckless spending. They target the poor and
working class, trapping them into high-interest loans and
they are unable to repay them.

By doing this, the bank profits not only from the monthly
debt repayments, instead they generate most of their

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 191

profits through default charges and repossessions of property. This behaviour is exploitative and must be stopped.

The study tour was an opportunity for us as lawmakers of South Africa to learn the failures and the successes of their systems abroad. We have learnt. We have come back and we have approved our Bill that we as the committee have set.

Deputy Secretary-General, we are very proud of the work that we have done into that Debt Amendment Bill because that Bill will help the poor, especially the ones that are trapped into high-interest loans, which these banks are recklessly offering, while repossessing their properties. So, that will help them.

We are not shying away from it. We are very proud of the work that we have done. This was not only an exercise of flying on an Emirates flights and being treated nicely. We have come back, we have approved a Bill and it will be fully effective. We support this report. Thank you

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 192

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, I chose to declare from my podium here, not there. I want to declare that the IFP hard-working member on this committee, hon Esterhuizen, was not included on this trip to the United Kingdom.

[Interjections.] Hon Fubbs, the chairperson of this committee, has said here many times - three or four times - that this is the most constructive of the committee. She says the study visit of the committee was very constructive.

Well, we can't agree or disagree whether it was constructive or not, and we hope that when Parliament - in the sixth Parliament - considers people who need to go on study trips, they will make sure that all members of a committee go on a study trip so that when they come back here, they can speak of the lessons that they learnt and share the wisdom with all of us. [Applause.] That is all I have to say, hon Chairperson. That is my declaration. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Thank you very much, hon Singh. I thought in your declaration you would

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 193

have added that on the study tour of the Chief Whips, you missed one hon member who attends that Chief Whips Forum without apologising at any point, but you didn't mention it. So, regarding your feelings about the member you have mentioned, I am sure you understand exactly how that other hon member feels about it. [Laughter.] Hon Mantashe!

Ms P T MANTASHE: Hon Chairperson and my colleagues, fellow South Africans, ...

IsiXhosa:

... mandinibulise emva kwale mini. Esona sizathu esabangela ukuba siye e-UK yayikufuna ukwazi kubantu abasele besebenzisa lo Mthetho oYilwayo weTyala weSizwe - National Credit Bill- ukuba bawenza njani na kwaye usebenza njani? Kaloku eli qela liphikisayo, elilapha ekunene kwam, lalisithi ukuba sikhe nje sawusebenzisa lo Mthetho oYilwayo umnotho weli lizwe uza kuwa kwaye iibhanki ziya kuvala.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 194

Safika phaya sabona umahluko omkhulu kwatsho kwasa kuthi ukuba ayikho le nto ibithethwa leli qela liphikisayo. Kaloku le genge, ngabantu abasoloko besenzela ixhala lokuba isibhakabhaka siza kusiwela imihla nezolo. Thina sibone ukuba abantu baseMzantsi Afrika bayaxhatshazwa ngoongxowa ngokuba banikwe amatyala abangakwaziyo ukuwahlawula. Lo mkhuba sowude wanwenwela nakwaba barhola ipeyi.

Sibone ukuba masingenelele njengorhulumente okhathalela abantu baseMzantsi Afrika ngokuthi senze lo Mthetho oYilwayo. Sifike sadibana nawo onke amahlakani eebhanki zase-UK. Kudliwano-ndlebe nawo ayidandalalizisile into yokuba ukusetyenziswa kwalo Mthetho oYilwayo akuzange kube nazimpembelelo zigwenxa kuqoqosho lwase-UK. Bubuxoki bodwa obu buthethwa ngaba bantu. [Kwaqhwytywa.] Ngelo nyathelo siye asakwazi ukuba singawupasisi lo Mthetho oYilwayo kwaye sesona sizathu esabangela ukuba siwukhawulezise. Abantu bethu bayaphela apha phandle kwaye bayaxhatshazwa ngaba ngxowa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 195

I-DA yahamba, yasilandela phi phi phi abantu bangaphesheya abaza kuphikisana nalo Mthetho oYilwayo kodwa saye sabahlula kuba sasime enyanisweni. Thina besibethwa lusizi lwabantu abantsundu abasokolayo kuba abanye babexuthelwa izindlu zabo bethathelwa iimoto zabo kodwa ngethuba beboleleka bebesaziwa ukuba badendwa emisebenzini yabo. Aba ngxowa ngabantu abangakhathaliyo kuba ingxowa zabo ziyagcwala ngenxa yemali yaba bantu.

English:

The National Credit Amendment Bill seeks to strengthen provisions to curb reckless lending by creditors. To introduce offences and penalties for prohibited conduct such as providing credit related services without being registered or conducting reckless lending and provide compulsory life assurance for loans that are below R50 000 and are granted for a period of six months and longer.

IsiXhosa:

Umnika njani umntu orhola i-R1000 ngenyanga ityala lama-R3000 ekufuneka eyibuyise nenzala? Uyamazi loo mntu ukuba

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 196

akasebenzi into ebhadlileyo. Siyibona loo nto njengokuxhatshazwa kwabantu ngaba bantu basekunene kwam. Emva kodliwano-ndlebe phantse nawo onke amahlakani eebhanki e-UK, sifumanise ukuba abantu baseMzantsi Afrika banga fumana ukuphumla ingakumbi phantsi koxinzelelo olumandla kuqoqosho lwaseMzantsi Afrika. Silindele ukuba utyikitywe emva kwayo yonke inkqubo oza kuwuthatha kwaye siqinisekile ukuba lo Mthetho oYilwayo uza kuwenza umahluko omkhulu.

Xa ndisaleka, abanyanisekanga aba bantu benza ngathi bayabathanda abantu baseMzantsi Afrika kwaye babakhathalele besithi mabokhe uMzantsi Afrika omnye. Baza kuwakha njani uMzantsi Afrika omnye xa besithi abawufuni uMthetho woPhuhliso oluBanzi lwabantu abaNtsundu kwezoQoqosho. Uza kuya njani phaya phambili nilangana nibe ningazange nalingana ngenxa yemithetho ababekade beyisebenzisa yokungalingani?

Sifuna abantu baseMzantsi Afrika bababone ukuba bangabanyhwalazi into abayiyo. Abantu bakuthi mabahambe baye kuvotela i-ANC kuba lelona qela elikhathalayo

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 197

entliziyweni yalo ngabantu abahluphekileyo. Kuhambo lwethu lwase-UK sifunde ukuba urhulumente waphaya uyabafundisa abantu bakhe ngokuphatha imali. Oongxowa beebhanki bakhupha imali kubo ukuze kufundiswe abantu ngendlela eyiyo yokuphatha imali. Loo nto idala ukuba abantu basinde ekubolekeni imali kwaba krebe babolekisa ngemali.

Sibuya phaya neziphakamiso ...

English:

... to the Minister of Trade and Industry. We engaged the Minister and said to him go and engage the Minister of Finance to consider introducing a levy on credit providers to the National Credit Regulator to facilitate financial literacy training and free debt advice for consumers.

IsiXhosa:

Okwesibini, ...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 198

... that the Minister of Trade and Industry must go and engage the Minister of Basic Education to consider including financial literacy and management as a compulsory part of the curriculum of our schools, that we must improve the distribution of consumer education information. We will use the National Credit Regulator to do that in all languages of South Africa.

IsiXhosa:

Sibuyile phaya, sawugqibezela lo Mthetho oYilwayo, uphaya kwiBhunga leSizwe lamaPhondo kwaye uhamba amaphondo njengokuba ndithetha nani. Sinethemba elikhulu lokuba abantu baseMzantsi Afrika baza kusingqinela kwinto yokuba bathe ntywee ematyaleni. Sifuna ukubahlangula babe ngabantu noko abasondeleyo kwaba bantu kudala bengoosiswana-sibomvana.

Siyi-ANC siyayixhasa le ngxelo kwaye sicela le Ndlu iyixhase ngokunjalo. Abantu mabahambe baye kuvotela i-ANC kuba kuphela korhulumente onothando lwabo ezintliziyweni. Ndiyabulela. [Kwaqhwatywa.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 199

THE HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Order, hon members! In the beginning I did ask, in terms of the motion, whether the report be adopted and the answer was yes. There were no objections, but parties needed to make their declarations.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**SOLUTIONS TO ADDRESS JOB LOSSES IN SOUTH AFRICA AND THE
GROSS DOMESTIC PRODUCT (GDP) GROWTH FORECAST DECLINE FOR
2019**

(Subject for Discussion)

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: House Chairperson, in this election, 10 million unemployed South Africans faces a life-changing decision: which of the parties represented in this House is going to give them the best chance of finding work over the next five years?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 200

Frankly, everything in this election is just noise. The whole election boils down to that central question. Which party is the jobs party? So, let's look at the evidence and at the manifestos. One party in this House, the DA, has left every other party in this House in the dust in delivering job-creating economic growth. [Applause.] On every measure, pick any measure you want - unemployment, new jobs created, numbers of discouraged job seekers, new investment attracted, ease of doing business - on every score there is only one party that knows how to get the job done. That's the DA. [Applause.]

There is only one party that has actually delivered 640 000 new jobs in 10 years. That is not the national government. It's not the government of eight provinces. Only the DA has done that. [Applause.]

There is only one party in this House that has delivered an unemployment rate 14% points lower than the national average and the only province in the country with an unemployment rate below 20% for the first ever. That is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 201

not the national government. It's not the government of eight other provinces. It's the DA.

In 2009, the ANC's President Jacob Zuma, lest we forget, promised five million jobs by 2020. Yet, only the DA has actually contributed to delivering on this promise. [Applause.] If every ANC governed province had done as well as the DA governed province, we would have achieved the goal or put differently if every province had been governed by the DA, we would have achieved the goal long ago. [Applause.] That is the choice. That is our offer in this election. Everything else is just noise.

We will do for South Africa what we have already done where we govern. We will deliver job creating economic growth. We will deliver a one year paid internship for school leavers, to get them in the door of their first job. We will attract investment and cut red tape. We will stop corruption and throw corrupt politicians in jail. We will make sure that jobs are available fairly, not only to the well connected or the corrupt. Voters can trust that we will do these things; we will do as we say

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 202

because we have already done them. That's what we do. That's what the DA does. We get things done. That is our offer. That is our record.

Now, our opponents here say that voters should trust the state to fix our economy and create more jobs. They want more power and more money for them and less power and less money in the hands of people. That's their offer. But look where it has got us. We have a state electricity company that cannot produce electricity. We have a state railway that doesn't have enough trains. We have a state airline that cannot fly. We have state run ports system that cannot unload ships. We have a state mining company that doesn't mine. We have a state gas company that can't find any gas. The party that brought us all of this is now asking for voters to give it control of the health system.

To pay for it all, this feckless, shameless party has reached deep way back into the vault of failed economic ideas and is now proposing prescribed assets,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 203

nationalisation of the Reserve Bank and expropriation of private property.

So, total is its bankruptcy of ideas that the ANC has actually resorted to borrowing economic policy from apartheid. That's where prescribed assets come from. We have been having it as they say. This is the wicked irony - the ANC has destroyed economic growth, it has destroyed jobs, it has stolen billions, bankrupted the state, and now it wants to take the pensions, pinches the pensions of ordinary hard working people to pay for it all.

Every teacher, every nurse, doctor, every professional in South Africa must know this and hear this message. That is the policy of the ANC - to take your lifesavings to pay for their crimes.

So, let us be clearheaded about the choice in this election. One party promises continuing decline, growing poverty and accelerating misery. That is the ANC. One party promises to continue what it has already delivered. We are the jobs party. We are the growth party. We are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 204

the party of improving lives, improving opportunities and beating poverty. [Applause.] Voters can lend us their vote in this election knowing that we will do the same for them as we have done where we govern. Our track record leaves everyone else here in our dust. We are just getting started. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Ms L S MAKHUBELA-MASHELE: Hon House Chair, hon members, the ANC-led government has worked tirelessly in the past 25 years to change the lives of all South Africans for the better. The government has created a conducive environment for inclusive economic growth and job creation in South Africa.

It is important to reflect on the employment as it is the key economic indicator of inclusive growth. Stats SA has reported that in 2008, employment picked to approximately 13, million, when the economy was doing better. However, during the recession in 2009 and 2010 there were job losses. Throughout the ANC putting efforts to ensure that those two successive years of decline had issues where

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 205

jobs were created by the economy which grew from 204 to 258 in 2011 and 2012 respectively.

Fast-forward to 2018, the intervention by the government to improve on job creation has already started to bear positive results. The quarter labour force survey released by Stats SA on the 12th of February 2019, indicates that for the 4th quarter of 2018, unemployment decreased by 0,4 percentage point and that is a fact.

The South African working age population has also increased by 0,4 percentage point in the last quarter of 2018. That is much better than the year before. The absorption rate increased by 43,3% in the same period. This is a positive growth trajectory, and it shows that the ANC-led government is indeed a government of the people and thus can be trusted and given the mandate to lead even more years to a prosperous South Africa.

Hon members, by raising this motion, the DA displays that they are oblivious of the economic upturn in the country. They put blinkers to avoid seeing the good work done by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 206

the ANC. They are always bickering and constantly looking for something wrong with the ANC policies. They do this without offering any credible and practical solutions. Their obsession with the ANC continues to show that they have poverty on policy and politics. But it is expected from a party without any sound policy strategy units.

The recent resignation of the hon Ngwenya who was the DA's token of the head of policy revealed your poor on policy matters. In her words she said "The bottom is that I do not believe that the DA takes policy seriously and as a result, there has not been any operational and political resource to ensure that policy is taken care of in the DA".

Your own policy head did not believe you. Take policy seriously! Yet you expect South Africans to take you seriously, come on!

With regard to solutions to addressing job losses in the country and the GDP growth focus for 2019, the ANC have sound and practical policy plans for the future. Hon

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 207

members, it troubles the DA and it gives them sleepless nights to realise that the ANC is doing something right in the economy. I am reminded of a song by our young prolific singer Mlindo the vocalist that is entitled "Imoto". The song says ...

IsiZulu:

... Imoto uma imile aziyikhonkothi, izinja zikhonkotha imoto ehambayo.

English:

This car - which is the ANC delivery vehicle is moving. Let me tell you why the DA in Mlindo's analysis is barking at the ANC. Firstly, the ANC has put in place good economic policies. The new growth path and its interventions has promoted a development growth path to create decent jobs and subsequent sector focus programmes. The new growth path prioritises efforts to support employment creation in the following six key indicators. Listen! Infrastructure, the agricultural value-chain, the mining value-chain, the green economy,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 208

manufacturing sectors which are included in the industrial action policy plan, tourism and certain high level services. In these sectors it is where the economy was recorded with the latest unemployment trajectory recorded by Stats SA.

Secondly, the ANC addressed the gap between skills and the labour market ensuring that more enter the job market through implementation of the mass apprenticeship, opportunities for youth and women and other forms of skills and training which are linked to the employment opportunities.

Thirdly, the successful presidential summit wearing social partners agreed that it is imperative to secure substantially faster growth in the agriculture, mining and manufacturing sectors as these sectors are key drivers of exports and investments. The social partners recognise that many of the economic enablers which have committed to supporting growth in firms, corporative and small businesses across the sectors are those that are from the ANC policies.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 209

Fourthly, the presidential summit also indicated that it has secured investment of over R1,46 trillion. This investment will flow towards the rural areas and will ensure that inclusive economic growth is equally distributed within ... [Interjections]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Order! Order, hon members, if some of you continue interjecting in a manner that drowns a person on the podium, the person would also increase their voice. Equally so, you should lessen the level at which you converse and the level at which you interject. Proceed, hon member.

Ms L S MAKHUBELA-MASHELE: Thank you House Chair. I am sure they are barking because the ANC vehicle is moving and as I have said, it barks only at the vehicle that is moving. The presidency has also facilitated the youth employment service, which is an initiative intended to create over a million work opportunities for young people in South Africa. Since its inception, the year's initiative has already found a placement for over 4600 young people across the country in 2018 alone.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 210

Hon members, the ANC-led government has also implemented the Youth Employment Accord which has amongst others improved the education and training opportunities for the gap between school leaving young people and the first time employed. It has also connected young people and the employment opportunities through which they are supported by the placement schemes and the work readiness promotion programmes for young school leavers and provide young people with work experience. This is a good story to tell. We are moving on the right trajectory.

The ANC-led government has also partnered with private sector to ensure that they implement a programme that protects the existing jobs across sectors whilst taking active steps to ensure that retrenchments are the last consideration and the review of the retrenchment procedures. This is evident in the new Mining Charter that was well accepted by the mining sector and across business, and the employment tax incentives targeting millions of young people across South Africa who have been excluded from participating in the economy actively and as a result suffer from disproportionality from

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 211

unemployment, discouragement and economic marginalisation.

To their frustration, South Africans, the DA cannot ignore the innovative and futuristic posture of the ANC in modernising our economy and creating jobs for the future. The presidential's Digital Industrial Revolution Commission has been conceptualised to shape a common digital future that places people at the centre of digital transformation. This scientific approach using technical advances, to address the needs of our people addressing inequality and inclusiveness. Reducing the cost of data and extending free Wi-Fi to many more sites across the country. The ANC is impacting on the lives of the people in a way that is very relevant.

In January this year, the ANC-led government started implementing the National Minimum Wage. This is positive for both the low income earners and the Gross Domestic Product of the country as more money will be circulating in the economy. We have outlined our plans and interventions of the economy that will consolidate

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 212

inclusive growth, create jobs, provide for decent works while protecting existing jobs in the near future.

In another song by Mlindo the vocalist that is entitled "Vala umlomo uvule amadlebe".

IsiZulu:

Indaba ingawe DA.

English:

I am borrowing from this analogy again that the DA must just shut up and listen to what we have placed for the next five years. In our manifesto that is accepted by a resounding affirmation by the private sector and citizens alike ... [Interjections.]

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, sorry my ears are ringing a bit. Is shut up parliamentary? I don't believe it is. Can the hon member please withdraw that?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Let me get the advice from the table and I will come back on that one.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 213

Can we allow the member to proceed? Hon members, I think I have advised about the shouting and I am not going to say anything more on that one. Proceed hon member.

Ms L S MAKHUBELA-MASHELE: ... I would advise you to close your mouth and listen. In our manifesto that has been accepted by a resounding affirmation by the private sector and citizens alike, the ANC will in the next five years work with our social partners – that is business labour to implement work programmes that will ensure that more than 275 people annually are absorbed in the labour market. Ensure that we do not only create new jobs but ensure that we protect the existing ones.

Hon members, we must advise that the DA has nothing to put on the table. Their manifestos are not workable. They do not have practical solutions for the motion that they have brought about on the table. I must say that it is only the ANC that is serious about creating employment and protecting the existing opportunities that are there. We have guaranteed the placement of over 3000 graduates in the private sector and ensured that all those that are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 214

graduating even from the TVET colleges are absorbed by the labour market. It is you who must provide us with practical solutions. You must tell your people in the private sector to ensure that they play ball in creating jobs. It is not only the government that has the responsibility to ensure that people across South Africa are employed.

We have made sure that the implementation of the national minimum wage will cover even domestic workers, farming and forestry and other vulnerable workers to ensure that there is compliance in this sector as well. We are protecting even the most vulnerable workers as the ANC. This is a free lecture on what are the interventions that the ANC is doing in the economy to ensure that there are no job losses.

The DA must realise that these are but bold and practical steps to ensure that the ANC stimulates this economy.

Time does not allow us to say much but, we are a government working for the people, a government by the people and a government that would ensure that we win the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 215

2019 elections with a resounding majority and we will come back and implement our policies that are workable, that are practical and that will ensure that jobs are created in South Africa. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Order. Hon Mashele, can you go back to the podium. I just want to check whether indeed, the point of order as raised by hon Walters relating to the statement you made in your speech where you said "shut up", did you say that?

Ms L S MAKHUBELA-MASHELE: Hon House Chair, I withdraw "shut up" but, I say keep quiet and open your ears.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Thank you very much.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, the withdrawal has to be unconditional. She cannot put a proviso on it. Either the member withdraws unconditionally or she doesn't. One of the two.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 216

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Order hon members!

Mr M WATERS: That's how you treat all of us and you must treat the hon member the same. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Hon member, withdraw unconditionally!

Ms L S MAKHUBELA-MASHELE: I with draw "shut up"

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms AT DIDIZA): Thank you. Hon Thembekwayo!

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: Chairperson, the simple reality is that, only the EFF has presented a concrete and cogent plan to create sustainable jobs to grow South Africa's economy. One of the greatest failures of the post 1994 government has been the inability to create decent and sustainable jobs, especially for able, willing and young people.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 217

South Africa have more than 22,6 million people who can work, of which 16,4 million are working and 6,2 million are unemployed. Here, we are talking about people who looked for work but could not find it and eventually gave up. These are people the post 1994 government has failed and continue to fail. Our people, especially the young people, should not despair any longer. As the EFF, we carry the hope, the political and ideological will to create jobs, implement a national minimum wage, achieve quality work and a living wage.

Firstly, to create sustainable jobs, the EFF industrial policy will focus on inward industrialisation with export capacity. We will not repeat the mistake of the post 1994 government that failed to create jobs because it did not pursue inward industrialisation, as a result, we import everything we use on a daily basis. We import spoons, pots, toothpicks, bulbs, blankets, waskoms [basins], electrical appliances, digital video disc, DVDs, clothes and the majority of other things we use on a daily basis.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 218

These above are products which we can produce. Our people who are unemployed can be employed in factories to produce these finished products. To achieve this, the EFF government will declare multiple special economic zones where companies that employ 2000 people in sustainable jobs, we will pay them a minimum wage and employees will have access to the benefits. Historically and now, this is the most efficient way to create jobs: to build industries to produce things that people consume on a daily basis and to involve people in all stages of production.

Secondly, the EFF government would use state procurement decisively in all spheres of government including the state-owned entities which is estimated at around R1 trillion every year to enable industrialisation and localisation. The EFF government will amend the Public Finance Management Act, PFMA, and Municipal Finance Management Act, MFMA, to produce 80% of all goods and products from local producers of which half should be owned and controlled by women and youth. The EFF government will leverage the economies of scale to buy

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 219

commonly used products such as motors, linen and garments for hospitals using the government budget to maximise the effect on industrialisation and job creation.

Any policy that grows the economy but fails to give us jobs and to prioritise quality of work will be a repeat of the last 25 years. This is the only way that our people who are hopeless could now gain economic power. This is the only way that we will grow the economy at 6% in 2020 and 2021. This will increase to 10% in 2022. Dear South Africans, for our land and jobs now, please, vote for the EFF. Thank you, Chairperson. [Applause.]

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon House Chairperson, in the sea of the ANC, DA and EFF noise, the IFP is the only island of hope and the only voice of reason. It is quite interesting that the ANC can come here and tell us about a good story to tell when some of them are speaking about nine wasted years. It is interesting about a good story to tell when you have a revenue shortfall of R143 billion; R180 billion debt repayment cost every year; a VAT

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 220

increase; fuel levy increases; corruption and of course, the Zondo Commission.

It is interesting you speak about the reduction of the unemployment rate in the fourth quarter, when it is common knowledge that in the fourth quarter there were jobs because everybody is doing a small job for the festive season. So, in actual fact, unemployment remains a crisis in South Africa. Thanks, to the failed policies of the ANC since they took over in 1994.

Where is the Freedom Charter which says, we the people shall share the country's wealth? Well, it is clear now that it was only for "some" that will share the wealth. Our country is the most unequal in the world and the highest unemployment rate. The majority of our people live in conditions of unemployment, poverty and indignity. You have compounded this problem with the fact that corruption is the hallmark of all that you do. So, is that a good story to tell or nine wasted years or in your books, the good story is the nine wasted years?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 221

Hon House Chairperson, well, on 10 March 2019, the IFP will be presenting to the South Africans a credible manifesto, a credible alternative which will focus on job creation, poverty alleviation and the keen focus on education to make sure that the knowledge, skills and expertise that we produce at this country responds to the needs of the job market. It should be a manifesto which says no to corruption and yes to good governance. It is time for a party that will bring about social and economic justice. That is the IFP. We have strong leadership and a clear plan in the IFP. We need solutions now and you have had 25 years to fix our problems. Miraculously, you think you can sort them out in the next election. The question becomes; what were you doing for the past 25 years, sleeping on the wheel?

Let's move away from too many whys and get to the hows. We are going to that manifesto launch to give South Africans hope. With the new commitment that, we, in the IFP will work with the people for the people. It is about time that government recognises that South Africans are the bosses of the government and that government is not

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 222

the bosses of the people. So, there is very little that we can take from the ANC. However, we will create a conducive environment for jobs, create infrastructure, water infrastructure and make sure that Eskom is readily working for South Africans with a keen focus on local economic development, small businesses and make sure that informal economy is allowed to flourish without the bureaucracy of the people who have brought them into conditions of poverty. On the 08 May 2019, vote the ANC out. Viva the IFP, viva. [Time expired.]

Mr R W T CHANCE: House Chairperson, the quickest way to uncover a political party's attitude to the role of small business as the solution to our economic problems, is to do a word search of their manifesto.

In the DA's manifesto launched on Saturday, you will find 39 references to small businesses, not just in the section on small business but throughout the document. In the ANC's manifesto, small business gets 13 mentions and in the EFF's, only 3. Does that tell us something about their priority for growing our economy and creating jobs?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 223

What about red tape? Red tape strangles small business and inhibits growth and job creation. The DA's manifesto mentions red tape 10 times. Neither the ANC's nor the EFF's manifestos do mention it at all, no, not once.

So, the Minister of Small Business Development, Lindiwe Zulu's promise of a red tape reduction strategy doesn't get a mention in the ANC's manifesto. Are you listening, Minister? Instead, there are lots of empty promises and no concrete proposals. We know that entrepreneurs are the bedrock of a successful economy. Entrepreneurs take risks, invest their own capital, innovate and employ people. It is a sad fact that South Africa has too few entrepreneurs and a dearth of small and medium enterprises. So, you'd expect the main political parties to be doing all they can to promote and develop entrepreneurs in our society.

Surprise, surprise, the DA's manifesto mentions entrepreneurs 20 times, the ANC's three times and the EFF's just once. Let this sink in for a minute. Two of the three main parties contesting for power on 08 May,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 224

hardly give a mention to the key ingredients of an enterprise economy. Nevertheless, we should not be surprised. The ANC and EFF are both steeped in the outdated socialist, Marxist and Leninist state-led ideologies. These have brought nothing but misery wherever they were practiced. Venezuela and Zimbabwe are their idea of economic nirvana.

By contrast, the DA's record in government in the Western Cape and in DA-run towns and cities points to another scenario for our country. An open economy led by the private sector and supported by government. The results, as you have heard from my colleague, the hon Hill-Lewis, the Western Cape has created 75% of new jobs in South Africa in the last 12 months. [Applause.]

The DA's manifesto speaks of unleashing small business. South Africans have enormous potential to innovate and create jobs. They just need to be given a chance. So, we will introduce an overtly pro-business policy approach with a start-up visa high on our agenda to encourage immigration of entrepreneurs. We will ease the cost of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 225

doing business and promote flexibility by exempting businesses employing up to 250 people from certain Black Economic Empowerment, BEE, and labour regulations. We will follow the lead of the Western Cape which has achieved savings of R1 billion by targeting red tape in government. We will improve cash flow for small businesses by introducing an amnesty on penalties for nonpayment of taxes due to nonpayment of invoices and mandate a maximum of 21 days payment time of invoices to government. We will combine institutions providing financial and nonfinancial support into single entities and streamline our development finance institutions, DFIs. I could go on.

Perhaps one of the most important things is that we will take steps to instil an entrepreneurial mindset in youth owned businesses and maximise incentives to start and run the business. Only the DA has the policies and track record to grow the economy and to bring hope to the 10 million unemployed South Africans looking for an answer. I thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 226

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, this is what we have got in our country; 25 years into democracy and public transport is appalling, school infrastructure is appalling and this is what we have got in our country as well, economic country has been revised down to 0,7% from 1,5% in the February 2018 budget; and unemployment has risen to 37,2% on the expanded figure. This is what we have got in our country.

House Chairperson, it is abundantly clear that our country is braced for deficits and some erosion of fiscal strength in a number of ways. For instance, the budget deficit would jump to 4,2% of the Gross Domestic Product, GDP, in the current year and reach 4,5% in 2020; that is appalling.

Eskom would receive a bailout of R69 billion in three years to come and R150 billion in 10 years to come; that is appalling.

As of now it is estimated that we borrow at least R1,2 billion a day. The government needs to borrow

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 227

R243 billion in 2019-20 then R250 billion in 2020-21; that is appalling.

What has been lacking in this country? We need to nip fraud and corruption in the bud to save billions of rands that are stolen from the government's fiscus. We need to invest in education and in mega projects, and that has not been happening in our country. We need to invest in Small, Medium and Micro-sized Enterprises, SMMEs, as they contribute 60% to 70% in the GDP; that has not been happening. We need to boost the governance of state-owned enterprises, SOEs, so that they contribute to job creation. We have to bring in technical skills like electricians, we need to upgrade the infrastructure, we need to invoke consequence management; SOEs do not perform and they continue to get bailouts instead of disciplining those who do not perform in our country, because of corruption.

There are many issues that have been spoken about in our country, like investing in the production and employment of black industrialists, not enough has been done to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 228

unlock township and rural economy. Most entrepreneurs do start their businesses but due to lack of incubation, mentorship, coaching and funding, these businesses die along the way. Our emerging entrepreneurs need funding and mentors who will be with them all the way.

Government should deal with outstanding land claims; help emerging farmers with technical and scientific skills.

Tourism, mining, manufacturing and textile have been neglected. We need to do things in a local way.

Some groups of people e.g. women, youth and people living with disabilities should be assisted with funding to start their own businesses; that has not been happening.

We need to take care of security guards, domestic workers, health workers, tellers etc. which has not been working in our country. And the NFP will do these things because they have not been done in 25 years. Thank you, Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 229

Mr N L S KWANKWA: House Chair, much of South Africa's problems, economic problems, over the past decade can be attributed to the ruling party's gross mismanagement of the economy and state-owned enterprises as well as policy uncertainty. As a consequence, the South African economy has experienced tepid but negligible economic growth rates over this period.

Under the ANC government countless bailouts to SOEs have turned them into a major drain on the fiscus, diverting billions of rands that should be channelled to the poor and service delivery.

Further, the ANC government has failed to reduce the unemployment rate, the youth unemployment rate in particular, and poverty and inequality despite it having borrowed more than a trillion rands over the past decade.

Rampant corruption and mismanagement of the South African economy has resulted in an increase in the cost of living for the poor and the working class.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 230

The UDM believes that a responsible government cannot leave the fate of South Africans to market forces alone nor can it sit back while the economy is underperforming, causing the quality of life for the poor and working class to deteriorate.

As a social democratic party that works for social reform and social renewal in order to ensure inclusive growth and development, a UDM government will adopt pro-poor economic growth policies that seek to redistribute income, eradicate poverty, reduce inequality and ensure prosperity for all South Africans. For instance, one of the issues that we would do if we were to be in power, we would make sure that we cut Value Added Tax, VAT, back to 14% and increase corporate income tax as well as introduce wealth tax in order to redistribute all of that income to the poor.

We would also restructure the SOE portfolio of government to ensure that only ones that are central to government's growth and development strategy are kept. SA Airways,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 231

SAA, is one of them; it's a vanity project that we don't need.

South Africa needs an inspiring and shared economic vision of where we are going in the next 10 to 20 years where all South Africans will feel that they have a meaningful role to play in making the country an economic, social and political success.

Looking back, the Convention for a Democratic South Africa, CODESA, negotiations only focused on political freedom and consequently, economic policy formulation has been left to individual Ministers, to the detriment of the development of a comprehensive and coherent plan for South Africa. This approach to policy formulation is not sustainable because as soon as changes occur in government, new administration tends to disown previously adopted policies.

One of the things we'll do is to ensure that we introduce a manageable public debt and budget deficit. But not only that; dealing decisively with financial governance and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 232

challenges facing SOEs in order to restore confidence in the economy, ensure that these utilities fulfil their socioeconomic agendas.

We would also ensure that we introduce ...

[Interjection.]

IsiXhosa:

Kwekhu Bawo! Hayi eli xesha lisuke liphale ingathi nilenza ngabomi kodwa ke votelani i-UDM nazi nezithembiso zevoti. Siyaqhuba.

Mr W M MADISHA: House Chair, to deal with the problems that we face as a country we must follow the truths. The ANC government continues, on a daily basis, to say that unemployment rate has gone down; but then that is not true. It is a fact that unemployment is beyond 40%; they don't want to agree that that is the case. It is true that 65% of that 40% is the young people in our country; those are facts. But then they tell you that it is 27%, which is not true.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 233

It is a fact that those who are working are not getting a living wage and the millions who are working are only paid in tips; go to the restaurants and you will find there people who don't even come from South Africa, who don't get any payments at all, but are getting only tips. I think we all know that, and that is a major, major problem.

It is a fact that instead of employing people in our country, the government of ANC employs many people and them Ministers and Deputy Ministers. We have said this on many occasions. And I have said and I want to repeat that, more than R4 billion which is supposed to create jobs goes into the pockets of those particular people. Unless we deal with that, we are not getting anywhere at all.

I must say that even the Ministers who sit here and say that unemployment must be dealt with, it must be addressed, the people must be paid properly; they don't do that, including - we want to repeat - the Chairperson of the NCOP, who pays a worker R800, that was reported;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 234

these are facts. But it is not that person only; there are many others, other Ministers here who are doing the same thing. We are not getting anywhere at all. That is why Cope says: to deal with this thing we will put much effort into expanding our skills base and encouraging the establishment of labour intensive industries. That we would change the ... [Time Expired.]

IsiXhosa:

Mnu M R BARA: Sihlalo weNdlu, nguBharha hayi Bhara. Masibulele ke kodwa noba kutheni na.

English:

I think it is important to start my speech by saying that what is it that the ANC can change in five years which they could not do in 25 years? Secondly, I am not sure where hon Makhubele-Mashele stays or come from. Where is it this economic upturn that you are talking about? Do you stay in this country? I am not sure! I think, probably, somewhere in Dubai.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 235

The DA advocates for a city-led growth or economic growth as it was. A DA national government will ensure that all three spheres of government work together, that means, local economic development correlates with both provincial and national growth strategies. In order to achieve this the DA stands by the following core principles, amongst others: zero tolerance for corruption; fair access to opportunities for all South Africans; reducing red tape; promotion of public-private partnerships; training and education through apprenticeship and skills development; and addressing apartheid spatial planning.

IsiXhosa:

Siyayazi ukuba i-ANC yoyisakele ukuzenza ezi zinto kule minyaka ingama-25 idlulileyo. Oomasipala abaninzi kweli lizwe abakwazi ukunikezela iinkonzo ebantwini ngenxa yobusela norhwaphilizo.

English:

In Johannesburg, the ANC administration established small, medium and micro-sized enterprises, SMMEs,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 236

initiative which was only capturing numbers while it could not specify what capacity was provided to the SMMEs. Herman Mashaba and his administration created opportunity centres in Braamfontein, Roodepoort, Diepsloot, Orange Farm, etc. The intention is to support and capacitate SMMEs and entrepreneurs with support from ABSA, Small Enterprise Development Agency, Seda, Innovation Hub, SA Revenue Service, Sars, and others.

The ANC under Parks Tau contracted Business Hub, which is a company that was under liquidation, lived and survived on city fundings from the City of Joburg, hence that project fell flat. It is not surprising therefore that Herman Mashaba has recently received the African Leadership Commendation award in recognition of his outstanding contribution to Africa's economic growth and development by the *African Leadership Magazine*. The City of Johannesburg, like Cape Town, has opened up the tender process to the public. This is transparency and accountability at work.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 237

The City of Cape Town has created 45 000 Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP, jobs for all people of the City without producing any party affiliation membership card. More than 13 000 skills development jobs have been created. While the ANC promotes a divided society, the DA is building a one South Africa for all.

In Johannesburg the ANC administration has messed up the funds. People have stolen and corruption has been rife, but I can tell you now there have been many arrests and convictions because of the commitment of the DA in ensuring that we run a clean governance.

Invest Cape Town Initiative places the City of Cape Town as an African hub through energy and ambition of its people. The City's investment and job creation partnerships secured investment of over R1,8 billion in the process creating just over 2 200 jobs. Collectively, Business Process Enabling South Africa, Western Cape; Western Cape Investment and Trade Promotion Agency, Wesgro; and Green Cape facilitated R1,2 billion

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 238

investments thereby creating 2 286 employment opportunities. Vote the DA on 8 May. Out, all of you!

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon Chairperson, vote the AIC on 8 May. As the AIC we believe in action, and not in speeches. The AIC is just like a dark horse. A dark horse is someone who can do things unexpected as we did. In order to avoid job losses we need relevant skills. Investment will always assist in keeping jobs and in the creation of the new ones. We should avoid retrenchments because our people should be employed. Crime and corruption must be fought at all costs because these are cancer and a running sore to our economy and to the poor people.

Government has to find solutions to the loss of jobs. It is the duty of the government to reduce the rate of unemployment and contributes towards the growth of our economy. The economical level of savings in South Africa is very, very low. It is at just 3% to the growth domestic product - this is very, very low. In order to fight the loss of jobs in our country the savings of money must happen so as to have a pool of wealth and this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 239

will lead to the creation of new jobs. To create more jobs more especially for the black Africans who do not have jobs, the money that is supposed to be saved must be saved thoroughly. The policies in our trust and insurance companies must be reinvested in the black Africans in particular. We should avoid the tendency of letting the bulk of national savings to be used for the richer citizens. We have to contribute a lot to the black Africans because these are the people that have been suffering a lot.

We must always force the banks to do away with the notorious rule, I quote, "No fund to start a funding." What is that? If the poor blacks cannot be funded to start a business, where must they get money to start their businesses? No where!

I think an Act of Parliament is needed to break this white monopoly which sometimes corruptly leads to black monopoly because there are rich black persons who may follow and do the same. [Time expired.] Vote the AIC; vote the AIC!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 240

Ms A T KHANYILE: Chairperson, in 2014, the ANC promised to address the needs of the youth for empowerment, education and job creation through a multipronged approach that creates job placements and internship schemes. This approach sets aside 60% of employment and empowerment in infrastructure, projects for youth and training incentive schemes. The failing ANC promised that this approach would empower and promote the education and employment for young South Africans. However, this promise was not kept in terms of job creation as the number of unemployed youths increased in the age group 15 to 34 year. Five hundred and sixty-six thousand more people are unemployed in 2018 than in 2014, based on the official unemployment definition.

Our education system doesn't prepare our young people to become entrepreneurs and we still have a long way to go in bringing entrepreneurship skills to students when they are at their most creative and inspired age. We need young people who are job creators, and not young people who are turned pensioners before they reach pensionable age. Millions of our young South Africans are grant

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 241

recipients and have no alternative options as the ANC failed to provide them with a proper education.

Unlike the failing ANC, the DA has a plan. A DA government will incentivise new and growing businesses to create jobs. High youth unemployment rates have a negative impact on economic growth and productivity which can no longer be ignored. There is a risk of loss of talent and skills since a great number of university graduates are unable to find jobs and put their knowledge and capabilities into growing, innovating and diversifying our economy.

Hon Speaker, one of the reasons why youth unemployment is so high in our country is because some ANC leaders are more concerned about satisfying their sexual needs, preying on young women rather than satisfying the needs of the citizens. [Applause.] Take for an example, hon Jeff Radebe who asked a young lady to send him nude pictures of herself. This is a shocking state of affairs in our country and the ANC should be ashamed of itself.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 242

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon Chair, on a point of order. I do know that the hon member might be coming for the first or second time on the podium, but the Rule of the House states that if you want to refer to anything to a member you do so through a substantive motion. Hon Jeff Radebe is a member of this House and it cannot be accepted. She must withdraw it. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order! Order! What's your point of order, hon Waters?

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, the issue that was raised by the hon member on the podium is a matter of public record. The Minister himself apologised publicly for that. So, it's a matter of a public record. It's in the public domain.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon members!

Mr M WATERS: It is in the public domain! No need to apologise.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 243

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member! Can you take a seat, hon member. Order, hon members! Hon members, allow me to actually rule on that point. Hon member, proceed while I consult.

Ms A T KHANYILE: The ANC should be ashamed of itself instead of defending those who have been found guilty of these heinous crimes. But this is not an isolated incident in the ANC. We know that there are many ANC leaders who either force young women to send them nude videos or pictures or even rape them when they don't get their way.

I want to send a message to young woman in South Africa today. If you are desperate for a job and approach any ANC leader, and they ask you for sexual favours, bring this information to me and the DA we shall see to it that they are dealt with properly and those predators are sent to jail. We will ensure fair access for jobs by making sex for jobs a form of corruption. Job opportunities should be allocated fairly. A DA government will ensure that all perpetrators of these immoral acts are arrested

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 244

by an honest and professional police force that protects our people.

Where the DA governs in the Western Cape the official youth unemployment rate is approximately 32% versus the national average of 38,9%. The expanded youth unemployment rate is approximately 34,7% versus the national average of 50,1%. The DA-run City of Cape Town offers free bus rides to job seekers. This is the DA difference. Where we govern, job seekers have fair access to opportunities and empowerment.

Young people within my province, Mpumalanga, especially in the Highveld, aspire to be farmers and aspire to be trained in farming techniques, but they struggle to get finance. There is an office in Ermelo that is supposed to assist these young people, but they often go there unassisted. There is only one person and that person is never in the office. [Time expired.] Vote for the DA on 08 May. Power!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 245

THE MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: House Chairperson, when I saw that I was going to be asked to speak in the name of the Leader of the Opposition - the man who wants us to believe that he is going to be the president of the country, but I think he knows in his heart of hearts that it will never happen.

On an issue that the first word is solutions, I thought maybe we might have a debate about serious proposals. When I then saw later on that no, he wasn't going to participate but rather delegated it, I knew it was going to be what it is and what it was. It's a mere repetition of slogans and empty chanting, that's all it has been.

I am surprised at the hon Hill-Lewis, because all he did was to come here and repeat a number of assertions that were actually dealt with head-on by my colleague, Minister Patel in winding up the state of the nation debate.

So, I think this idea about where the DA governs there are jobs; three quarters of the jobs come from the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 246

Western Cape, the facts don't support that. Actually, as Minister Patel said, the Western Cape grew faster when the ANC was governing the province between 2004-09, at 5,5% per annum as opposed to as opposed to 1,9%, that unemployment was lower in the Western Cape at that time. It was 16,4% and today it is 19,3%.

Also, the DA governs, supposedly, in Tshwane and unemployment there has gone up by 46 000 people since they took over. [Interjections.] Now, the point made by hon Hill-Lewis and repeated by the hon Chance by saying three quarters of the jobs in the last year were created in the Western Cape; I do not know where he has been looking - fact check that - but according to Statistics SA, year on year change - fourth quarter 2018 compared to 2017; Gauteng had 172 000, KwaZulu-Natal had 135 000, Limpopo had 59 000, Western Cape had 29 000; doesn't look like three quarters of the jobs came from here, it doesn't look like it.

What we would have expected is what we got - a bunch of empty sloganeering. The real issue ... I also don't know

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 247

about a decline in GDP growth forecast for 2019, I didn't hear any of them talking about that. In the Budget, we were told that the GDP estimate for this year is 0,7%; 1,5% for 2019 and 1,7% for 2020. That doesn't sound like GDP declined. Now, I know that there is a lot of downside risks in the world economy and all that but they put it in their motion and they didn't speak to it at all.

The reality is, of course, we have a high level of structural unemployment in South Africa which didn't come in the last 25 years; it came in the period when we saw the decline of the gold mining industry in South Africa in the 1960s onwards. In fact, when I was doing a little bit of research, I found out that black unemployment was not even measured in South Africa before 1960.

In 1960, when the gold mining industry was still employing more people from outside South Africa than inside it, black unemployment was estimated at 16,7%. In 1970, it was 17,50% and in 1982, it was 22,50%.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 248

Between 1960 and 1985, employment in the gold mining industry is more than half from three quarters and yet the figures show only 6% increase in unemployment. Why is that? It is because the labour force did not include most black people that were forced to go and live in the homelands. They didn't even count as been in the labour force.

The labour force did not include women. Women were supposed to sit home and be housewives. The labour force did not include many young people who were supposed to be in self-employment in the homelands. That is what it was.

Again, the job creation figures have been quite substantial. Just to go back because a point needs to be remade, according to the International Labour Organisation, ILO, since 1994, South Africa's job growth has been 3,2% per annum, which is more than Mexico, Brazil, Indonesia, Turkey and the United States. In absolute numbers, the 7,3 million jobs were created between 1994 and 2017 was in Malaysia, South Korea,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 249

Italy, France, Germany and the UK. Those are the ILO figures. That's what happened.

The problem has been that as we have created jobs, the labour force has grown because people are allowed to move into towns, people are considered to be work seekers, women are coming into the job market and we now have a young population. So, the issue about employment and unemployment is how we address the structural unemployment that we have.

This is not going to be just by raising the growth rate. Yes, we need to raise the growth rate by 1,50%, even 2,1% in 2021 is not enough. We also have to address the content and the character of that growth and make it more inclusive, as well as address the sectoral character of that growth.

I think that much of what we have been talking about is contained in the Job Summit and in the over all direction of the economy. Yes, we need to address the question of state capture and corruption because the two have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 250

weakened the very policy tools that we need to talk about.

So, the target for the ANC manifesto is 275 000 new jobs every year by boosting local demand as well as by exported ... I haven't heard anybody come up with any proposals. In fact, I think what we have is that any proposal that we had and any proposal that comes from a manifesto is either a repetition of something that is already been done or it is actually not workable and doable.

So, I thought this was going to be the direction of the debate. I thought, let me go back and read this manifesto that was launched over the weekend with great fanfare - let me go and read the DA manifesto. What do they actually say about jobs? What they say is that they want to have a job in every home. It is not a bad idea, that's one way we can advance. But how are they going to get there? They say they are going to pass a Jobs Act. Now, what is the Jobs Act going to do? We are going to spend time sitting in Parliament debating a Jobs Act. One of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 251

the things it is going to do is to provide special incentive for jobs over a particular threshold by giving incentives to investors. We are already doing that, we don't need an Act to do it. They are all of our incentives - the 12I Tax Incentive. There are additional benefits for job creation, all of these sectoral programmes. There are job benefits.

Then, if you take what was announced in the Budget that the Jobs Fund has already dispersed R4,6 billion and has supported 200 000 jobs. There is another R1,1 billion that's been made available to it in the budget. We are already doing it, what's the point?

The second thing is that they are going to introduce a labour market flexibility exemption clause. What is it going to do? It is going to make it easier to fire workers because apparently if you make it easier to fire workers, then there is an incentive to hire them. You might get the firings without the hirings, by the way.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 252

The other one is to allow potential employees to opt out of the minimum wage. Now, the minimum wage has six million people, who at the moment are earning less than R20 an hour. Those are jobs in a home for low income people. With regard to the minimum wage, there is a process of exemption, but employers have to apply and show evidence. Now, you going to say, let's leave it to employees. What are you opening this up to? You are not going to be in government, so what the hell. For workers to be blackmailed into signing a form against not getting a job and to say they are ... [Inaudible.] ... wage, they not going to want it but they will be blackmailed into doing it. What a ridiculous and silly proposal is that? [Laughter.]

They say they are going to introduce compulsory balloting for strikes. Hey [19:54:26] agteros kom ook in die kraal [better late than never] but it's in the amendments to the Labour Relations Act. What is that?

Then I thought, well, let me look also on inclusivity. What are they proposing on black economic empowerment,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 253

BEE? Let me just say that I think that the hon Maimane needs to be congratulated because he has won a big political battle in his organisation against many backwoodsmen, who many of them are sitting right here. He has actually inserted in it the idea that there ought to be race-based redress. That's where my congratulation stops.

So, what are they proposing? They are proposing and I quote: "That they will codify specific metrics which will signify successful redress." What does that mean? That is just a lot of words. They then go on to say that they could include broadening ownership, improving trading and skills and improving entrepreneurial support. All of that is provided for in the current BEE codes. In fact, what they are going to do is to sit and have a discussion about statistical measurement instead of getting on and implement it. That's what the DA manifesto is about.

You know, this comes to really understanding this animal because in 2013 ... and the battle that the hon Maimane had to take. In 2013, Lindiwe Mazibuko, then the leader,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 254

stood up and said that for the first time the DA would vote for BEE legislation and so they did, I had a great fanfare.

I went to the National Council of Provinces and I heard ... no, they are not going to vote for it now because they didn't like the new codes. I said, I know that's nonsense, I know that it isn't the reason. You stuck your toe into the water; you found it very uncomfortable and gone back to your comfort zone. That's what happened.

Then, I got to read a book by somebody pompously titled, *The Autobiography*, I think you know who it is. I read the story. What happened? Lindiwe Mazibuko got carpeted by the leader who came whirling into the caucus and said what are you doing? Pull back on this one. And guess what, they did. So, they didn't have a policy.

Then the hon Wilmot James came here and said, maybe what we should have is not black economic empowerment but development economic empowerment. I remember standing out here once and saying is it to be or not to be, that is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 255

the question. I think we know where they have gone on this one.

So, they are not going to do anything serious. They can put down verbiage because they know they are never going to be in government.

And that get's to the real issue. The real issue ... We already heard the story. We repeated it a number of occasions, why repeat it again. What did the hon Gwen Ngwenya have to say when she was the head of policy? She resigned because she said there were three junior researchers who were in charge of the DA policy. She said national government in waiting could not possibly rest on the shoulders of three inexperienced researchers. Well, let me tell you, I think the three inexperienced researchers were the ones who wrote this manifesto. It shows from start to finish. [Applause.]

The party spends more on temporary billboards and other marketing, whah, whah, whah, more than that than on

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 256

serious policy. Serious policy on job creation will only come from the government grappling with the issues.

We look forward to any reasonable contributions. We haven't had any today. I am not surprised, but anyway, there we are. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Hon Makhubela-Mashele and hon Davies have given us a history lesson ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Lie again.

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: ... and have said that we are poor on policy. Let me just remind you what's the ANC's bigger ideas are in this election. You have literally gone to the economics history book; you have looked up a section entitled apartheid economic policy and you have pulled out prescribed assets, nationalised Reserve Bank and presented that to the public as your big ideas in this election. You call us poor on policy; you should be ashamed of yourselves! [Applause.] That's your big idea.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 257

Then you have gone even further back into history – thank you for the history lesson, sir, and you found expropriation of land without compensation and that’s your big idea with your friends from the 1800s. That’s your other big idea in this election.

This is what the ANC has to offer the country and you call us poor on policy, come on! You talk about modernising our economy. I think there must be some new modern paradigm that doesn’t require electricity. Until such time as we figure that out, there will be no modernising. [Applause.] And while you are at it, hon Davies won’t you please fire the person that came up with the slogan ‘the power is in your hands.’ [Applause.] If that’s your slogan, really! Maybe that was a junior researcher that came up with that one as well. [Laughter.]

Now, let me tell you. Hon Patel is not the arbiter of facts in South Africa. A slightly more credible arbiter of facts is Africa Check. They found the DA’s claims on job creation where we govern to be 100% true. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 258

On GDP growth, whatever the Minister says in the Budget is frankly irrelevant. He can tell us the economy is going to grow at 10% but it has actually declined every year for the last eight years without exception. That is a fact.

Here is another fact. Despite all the history and the statistics you can spout, Mr Davies, there are 10 million unemployed South Africans and that's on your head. [Time expired.]

Debate concluded.

DEATH OF LEGENDARY JAZZ MUSICIAN DOROTHY MASUKA

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T C MEMELA: I move without notice on behalf of the

ANC:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 259

- (1) notes with sadness the death of the legendary jazz musician and activist Dorothy Masuka at the age of 85 on Saturday, 23 February 2019;
- (2) recalls that Masuka who sang hits such as *Hamba Nontsokolo* and *Lendaba* was born and raised in Bulawayo in Zimbabwe and travelled to Johannesburg by train as a teenager to launch her music career;
- (3) further recalls that she sang about township life and has travelled to many countries such as Malawi, Tanzania, the United States and Zambia;
- (4) remembers that Masuka was a revolutionary who used her music to spread the message of liberation from the apartheid regime;
- (5) recognises that with more than 40 years of performing under her belt, she enjoyed celebrity status across Africa ... [Time expired.]

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 260

Agreed to.

**FAILURE BY THABA CHWEU MUNICIPALITY TO DELIVER WATER IN
MASHISHING**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H S BOSHOFF: I move without notice on behalf of the
DA:

That the House -

- (1) notes with concern the failure by the Thaba Chweu Local Municipality to deliver water to Extension 6A in Ward 3 Mashishing;
- (2) also notes that this past week the municipality has neither assisted the residents of this extension with alternate water supply nor forwarded any communication to this community about the lack of water supply;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 261

- (3) further notes that the water cannon that needs to deliver water in the event of any water supply being interrupted is broken and that the municipality awaits a quotation on the costs to have it repaired;
- (4) acknowledges that section 27 on constitutional right to water mandates the municipality to make water available and accessible to the public;
- (5) condemns the lack of interest of the officials of Thaba Chweu Local Municipality to address the water crisis;
- (6) further condemns all actions of neglect and ignorance relating to the nonsupply of water;
- (7) call upon the MEC of Co-operative Governance, Human Settlements and Traditional Affairs and the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs to urgently intervene as this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 262

municipality is one of worst performing municipalities in Mpumalanga and the country;

(8) further notes that the DA in Thaba Chweu will be laying a complaint with the Human Rights Commission in Nelspruit in this regard;

(9) recognises that under a DA government, every citizen will be provided with basic services and therefore urges all ... [Time expired.]

Not agreed to.

**40TH ANNIVERSARY OF ROBERT SMANGALISO SOBUKWE DEATH
COMMEMORATED**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: House Chair, I move without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 263

- (1) notes that tomorrow will mark 41 years since the death of Comrade Robert Smangaliso Sobukwe, one of the greatest Pan-Africanist thinker, a revolutionary of the 20th century;
- (2) also notes that Sobukwe dedicated his life to the total liberation of the African people;
- (3) further notes that it was him, along with other revolutionaries, conceptualise our struggle and our vision of a South Africa and a united Africa where the land and everything beneath belongs to the people serving their needs and desires, Africa my beginning, Africa my ending;
- (4) acknowledges that it was these ideas and his dedication that made him such a threat to the apartheid state leading to the isolation on Robben Island and from society while he was under house arrest;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 264

(5) further acknowledges that while they tried to silence him, even in death, his words, vision and deeds continue to inspire us, the current generation, in our pursuit of land and the attainment of economic freedom in our lifetime;

(6) believes that political minions masquerading as intellectuals will never understand the significance of Robert Sobukwe hence they go around misguided saying shameful things about him;

(7) wishes the revolutionary to rest in peace, amandla!

Agreed to.

DEATH OF UMSHWATHI MUNICIPALITY MAYOR SIPHINDILE

SIBONGILE ZONDI-MBHELE

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 265

Ms N F SHABALALA: Madam House Chair, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

- (1) notes with sadness the death of Umshwathi Municipality Mayor, Councillor Siphindile Sibongile Zondi-Mbhele, on Sunday, 17 February 2019, after a short illness;
- (2) also notes that Councillor Zondi-Mbhele was the first woman mayor in the Natal Midlands municipality serving from 2016 until her untimely passing;
- (3) recalls that she had served as deputy mayor for a period of 10 years before she became the mayor;
- (4) further recalls that she was a pioneer who swiftly showed dedication in serving the people in her area;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 266

(5) remembers that her passion to be an activist and a member of the community that is very active started when she became a teacher in one of Nadi's primary school, and also served as a PR Councillor at the same time;

(6) believes that she leaves a rich legacy, especially in driving ... [Time expired.] ... infrastructure projects in her area.

Agreed to.

**NC'WALA TRADITIONAL CEREMONY OF NGONI PEOPLE OF ZAMBIA
EASTERN PROVINCE PRAISED**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N SINGH: House Chairperson, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 267

- (1) notes that the IFP Leader, Prince Mangosuthu Buthelezi, was invited by His Royal Highness, Inkosi Yama Khosi Paramount Chief Mpezeni IV to participate in the Nc'wala Traditional Ceremony of the Ngoni people of Eastern Province in Zambia;
- (2) acknowledges that this symbolic ceremony is central to the Ngoni's cultural heritage and is attended from far and wide by thousands upon thousands of people under the 10 traditional leaders who serve under His Royal Highness Mpezeni IV;
- (3) further acknowledges that in previous years, President Peter Mutharika of Malawi and former President Joachim Chissano of Mozambique have addressed the Nc'wala ceremony, for the Ngoni people have historical ties to these neighbours;

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 268

(4) recognises that the theme of this year's ceremony was "Preserving Our Cultural Heritage Through Gender Equality"; and

(5) further recognises that this was a pertinent theme for gender equality and must be placed high on the agenda in every forum, whether it is political or cultural.

Agreed to.

**GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE, SEXUAL HARASSMENT AND RAPE OF
WOMEN AND CHILDREN PREVALENT IN SOUTH AFRICA**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S C MNCWABE: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 269

- (1) notes that gender-based violence, sexual harassment and rape of women and children is prevalent in our society;
- (2) recognises that domestic crimes are also prevalent in our country; and
- (3) welcomes the 22 years sentence handed down on Sizwe Sithole in Greytown who raped a woman aged 21 after he pretended to be a former schoolmate of the lady in question.

Agreed to.

OR TAMBO AIRPORT AWARDED AFRICAN AIRPORT OF THE YEAR

(Draft Resolution)

Mr R M TSELI: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 270

(1) notes that OR Tambo International Airport, South Africa's biggest and busiest point of entry, was named African Airport of the Year at an Air Cargo Africa conference and exhibition in Ekurhuleni on Thursday, 21 February 2019;

(2) further notes that this was the fourth time the airport has won the award;

(3) recalls that the three-day event hosted 80 international exhibitors;

(4) further recalls that more than 3 000 trade visitors attended the event this year representing 60 countries;

(5) understands that the award recognises leaders in cargo logistics service provision;

(6) further understands that South African Airlines is recognised globally for excellence and the many awards attest to this;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 271

(7) acknowledges that OR Tambo International oversees more than 82% of South African air cargo volume passing through it each year, and 92% of that cargo is international;

(8) believes that winning this award demonstrates the airport's commitment to deliver the best infrastructure for stakeholders; and

(9) congratulates OR Tambo International Airport personnel for their dedication and for flying the South African flag high.

Agreed to.

DR LINDIWE SIDALI FROM THE EASTERN CAPE BECOMES SOUTH AFRICA'S FIRST AFRICAN FEMALE CARDIOTHORACIC SURGEON

(Draft Resolution)

Ms C N MAJEKE: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 272

That the House –

- (1) notes that on 25 November 2018, Dr Lindiwe Sidali, a 35 year old doctor from Dutywa in the Eastern Cape, became South Africa's first African female cardiothoracic surgeon;
- (2) further notes that Dr Lindiwe Sidali has been a doctor for 10 years then completed her fellowship of cardiothoracic surgery at Inkosi Albert Luthuli Central Hospital in Durban;
- (3) acknowledges that Dr Lindiwe won a scholarship from the North West Department of Health to study medicine in Cuba. Her interest in medicine was sparked when she volunteered at Wonderkop clinic where she realised the opportunity of serving people kept her motivated;
- (4) further acknowledges that Dr Sidali urges the youth, especially young girls, to pursue education; and

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 273

- (5) congratulates Dr Lindiwe Sidali an African female in a speciality that is famously known for being male dominated.

Agreed to.

**WELFARE ORGANISATIONS UNABLE TO AFFORD NATIONAL MINIMUM
WAGE**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M BAGRAIM: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that the national minimum wage was introduced on 01 January much to the dismay of many welfare organisations;

- (2) also notes that the organisations have made representations to the Department of Labour and of Social Development advising that their staff

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 274

in protected workshops are in fact defined as workers as contained in the definition of the national minimum wage;

- (3) also notes that workers within these workshops are now entitled to receive a salary of at least R20 per hour for four hours per day;
- (4) further notes that currently these workers do not receive this payment and are therefore considering engaging in illegal work;
- (5) recognises that many of these workshops are government sponsored at a much lesser amount than the R20 per hour;
- (6) acknowledges that the unintended consequence of the national minimum wage legislation is now threatening to force NGOs to stop providing occupational therapy to many of their disabled workers with two of these protected workshops already closed;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 275

(7) admits that the stipend provided through the Department of Health as a subsidy is not adequate to cover the national minimum wage and that many employers are unable to provide additional finances over and above the national minimum wage; and

(8) finally notes that the government is directly responsible for the closure of many of these workshops, leaving the most vulnerable in our community ... [Time expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are there any objections to the motion?

AN HON MEMBER: The ANC objects.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): In light of the objection, the motion without notice may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become a notice of motion on the Order Paper.

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 276

VODACOM CHARGING CLIENTS TO ROLL OVER DATA

(Draft Resolution)

Ms Y N YAKO: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that Vodacom will be charging clients to rollover data;
- (2) further notes that this is a serious move in reaction to the Independent Communication Authority of South Africa's, ICASA, regulations preventing data companies from allowing data to expire;
- (3) realises that Vodacom has been consistent with the logic of capital, and has found and manipulated legal loopholes to continue robbing clients and customers of data they pay for;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 277

- (4) further realises that Vodacom is charging R5 to rollover anything less than 100MB, and R49 for anything over 1GB;
- (5) understands that while some companies have taken steps in the right direction, Vodacom continues to show a lack of good faith. If anything, Vodacom just showed government and South Africans the middle finger; and
- (6) also understands that under EFF-run government, data will not only be rolled over free of charge but its cost will be halved.

Agreed to.

CELEBRATING ARMED FORCES DAY

(Draft Resolution)

Ms N B DAMBUZA: Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 278

That the House -

- (1) notes that 21 February is regarded annually as Armed Forces Day in South Africa;
- (2) further notes that this day coincides with the sinking of the *SS Mendi* in the English Channel where a total of 616 black South African troops died, making the incident one of South Africa's worst tragedies of the First World War, of 1914-1918;
- (3) acknowledges that this day has evolved into a week-long event to honour men and women in uniform, to bring the SA National Defence Force, SANDF, to the people and allowing the SANDF Commander-in-Chief, President Cyril Ramaphosa, to take the salute from a mass parade of all four service arms and the reserve force;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 279

- (4) realises that Armed Forces Day is also a platform to test the SANDF's logistics capabilities and state of readiness;
- (5) recognises the role the SANDF plays in defending and protecting our sovereignty and territorial integrity;
- (6) further recognises the contribution it plays towards the wellbeing, prosperity and upliftment of the people of South Africa;
- (7) believes in and appreciates the commitment of our soldiers to defend and protect the state;
and
- (8) calls upon all South Africans to support our men and women in uniforms in celebrating this annual event.

Agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 280

**TWO PEOPLE DIE WHILE 69 MORE SUSTAIN INJURY ON MPUMALANGA
BUS CRASH**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr A M SEABI: Chair, I hereby move a motion without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

- (1) notes with sadness the death of two people and the injury of 96 more, following a collision between a bus and a vehicle on the R538 Numbi Road, just past White River in Mpumalanga, on Saturday, 16 February 2019;
- (2) further notes that upon arrival paramedics found a bus off the roadway and multiple people on the scene, as well as a vehicle that had burst into flames up the road;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 281

- (3) understands that upon further assessment, paramedics found that two people inside the vehicle sustained fatal injuries and were declared dead at the scene;
- (4) further understands that the exact circumstances surrounding the accident are not yet known, but that local authorities were on the scene for further investigations;
- (5) thanks the medical services on the scene for their swift action in transporting the injured patients to a hospital with injuries ranging from minor to moderate; and
- (6) conveys its condolences to the families of the deceased and wishes the injured patients a speedy recovery.

Agreed to.

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 282

COURT OF ARBITRATION FOR SPORT RULES IN FAVOUR OF DUTEE
CHAND HIGH ON TESTOSTERONE OF FEMALE ATHLETES

(Draft Resolution)

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: I hereby move a motion without notice
on behalf of the AIC:

That the House -

- (1) notes that in 2015, the International Association of Athletics Federations, IAAF, was dealt a heavy blow when the Court of Arbitration for Sport, Cas, ruled in favour of Dutee Chand from India;
- (2) further notes that the court found that there was no evidence supporting the claim that high testosterone enhanced female athletes' performance;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 283

- (3) understands that the IAAF had a 2017 deadline to furnish the court with evidence that testosterone gave female athletes competitive advantage;
- (4) further understands that Caster Semenya, in the light of existing jurisprudence on testosterone will emerge unscathed;
- (5) realises that South African will again reclaim its pulse and creative spirit on the world map;
- (6) further realises that the IAAF case against Caster is frivolous, and that she has already won the first phase of her battle;
- (7) acknowledges that the countries of the East and West failed to look into the doping of Russian athletes; and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 284

- (8) calls upon the IAAF to lay their hands off Caster Semenya and to let her enjoy her time in sport, #HandsOffCasterSemenya.

Agreed to.

**DR YACOOB ABBA OMAR IS APPOINTED AS CHAIRPERSON OF SANAC
BOARD**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms R C ADAMS: Chair, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

- (1) congratulates Dr Yacoob Abba Omar on his appointment as the chairperson of the Board of the SA National AIDS Council Trust, Sanac Trust, on Friday, 15 February 2019;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 285

- (2) notes that Dr Omar is currently a Trustee of the SANAC Trust and Head of Strategy and Communications at the Banking Association of South Africa;
- (3) recalls that prior to this, he worked for the Mapungubwe Institute, Mistra, a Johannesburg-based research institute;
- (4) further recalls that he also served as South Africa's Ambassador to Oman from 2003 to 2008, and later the United Arab Emirates from 2008 to 2012;
- (5) remembers that he has also worked for various private and public entities, including Meropa Communications and Government Communication and Information System, GCIS;
- (6) believes that Dr Yacoob Abba Omar, in his latest post, will share his wealth of experience and we are confident that he will

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 286

make a valuable contribution to the
institution; and

(7) wishes him much success in his new position of
responsibility.

Agreed to.

WESTERN CAPE SERVICE DELIVERY

(Draft Resolution)

Ms L V JAMES: I hereby move a motion without notice on
behalf of the DA:

That the House -

(1) notes that the Western Cape unemployment rate
dropped to 19,3%, the lowest in South Africa,
with its expanded unemployment rate 14
percentage points lower than the national
average;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 287

- (2) further notes that the Western Cape rural unemployment rate is even lower at 15,7%, again the lowest in South Africa;
- (3) understands that between 2009 and 2018, the Western Cape government grew employment by 24,8%, creating 508 000 new jobs since 2009;
- (4) recognises that R1 billion in economic savings have been generated through their Red Tape reduction and Ease of Doing Business strategies;
- (5) acknowledges that since 2009, the Western Cape have completed over 200 000 housing opportunities and are on track to meet 100% of their targets by the end of their current term;
- (7) commends the fact that since 2009 more than 100 000 people have received title deeds across the province, having exceeded their targets by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 288

at least 2 000 every year and making great strides in helping people becoming home owners;

- (7) further recognises that 91,5% of Western Cape households now live within 30 minutes of a healthcare facility;
- (8) further acknowledges that the Western Cape achieved 72,7% in advanced reading, compared to 36,1% nationally, and has built 132 new schools and over 2 000 new classrooms;
- (9) further commends them for supporting 357 land reform projects with over R500 million in support funding and achieving a 72% success rate on agricultural land reform projects, compared to an estimated 10% success rate nationally; and
- (10) congratulates the Western Cape provincial government in achieving these massive feats and wishes them well in their future endeavours.

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 289

Agreed to.

**LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES FOILS ROBBERY AT EDENVALE HIGH
SCHOOL**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms S R VAN SCHALKWYK: Chairperson, I hereby move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

- (1) congratulates the police for swiftly handling the robbery at Edenvale High School, in Johannesburg where a shootout took place on Thursday, February 21, 2019, during a suspected robbery;
- (2) notes that two of the suspects were killed on the scene when confronted by police and security companies;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 290

- (3) also notes that a third suspect was injured in the shootout and was transported to hospital under police guard;
- (4) understands that a fourth suspect was arrested after he was found in possession of a rifle and pistol;
- (5) commends the law enforcement agencies for the job well done in foiling the robbery at Edenvale High School; and
- (6) commends the principal, the teachers, and the staff for their brave act in handling the situation, in keeping calm and assuring the learners' safety under stressful and difficult times.

Agreed to.

NEWLY BUILT SCHOOL OPENED IN SOWETO

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 291

(Member's Statement)

Mr A BOTES (ANC): The ANC welcomes the opening of a new state-of-the-art school in Soweto, the Protea Glen Secondary School which is worth more than R57 million. The school boasts 28 classrooms, an administration block, two science labs, one smart multi-purpose room, a computer lab, a library, amongst other unique features.

Thus far, the ANC in Gauteng government has opened more than 13 new brick and mortar schools since 2015, and its effort is geared at ensuring state-of-the-art infrastructure is provided to previously under-serviced communities thereby radically altering the face of township schools.

The ANC is of the view that the provision of schools with modern facilities in township communities will improve and transform the quality of education in the townships.

This particular school is a modern information technology-based facility with a design based on a prototype that incorporates the Department of Education

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 292

National Schools Infrastructure Norms and Standards.

Thank you.

POOR INFRASTRUCTURE OF RDP HOUSES IN MPUMALANGA

(Member's Statement)

Ms A T KHANYILE (DA): Chairperson, the states of RDP houses in extension 8 Lekwa in Mpumalanga is a disgrace. Our people deserves better than shoddy workmanship and poor infrastructure. Many houses are damaged with leaking roofs and incorrectly connected sewerage pipes. Doors are of poor quality and badly installed. There is also no drain infrastructure to catch storm water. Even so, residents often go without water themselves because the taps have run dry. As a result, they end up consuming water from the fire hydrant. Most units have poor electricity connections and when the power goes off desperate people tend to desperate measures.

On the 3 January 2019, a young woman was killed trying to dig a cable after her lights went off. In phase two and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 293

three of the project, people suffer the same problems. Some community members claim houses are occupied by people not on the beneficiary list. The Minister of Human Settlement must intervene to ensure the project is finalised and shoddy workmanship is addressed by the developer. As the uncaring ANC government in Lekwa municipality seems more concerned with corrupt activities and factional battles instead of delivering services to our people. [Interjections.]

On the 9 May, the DA government will ensure that quality housing projects are completed on time and within budget for the people of Lekwa and that contractors and developers are held fully accountable for theirs and the ANC's failure to deliver. Thank you. [Applause.]

CHAIRPERSON OF ESKOM'S CONFLICT OF INTEREST

(Member's Statement)

Ms N V MENTE (EFF): House Chair, the new dawn is simply the sun on a different day and; Jabu Mabuza and Patrice

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 294

Motsepe are the perfect examples of this. As the Chairperson of Eskom, Jabu Mabuza is a working conflict of interest. When he was appointed, he was the executive chair of a company which owns companies that are responsible for the maintenance of the third of Eskom's boilers.

Jabu Mabuza's investment company, Sphere Holdings owns shares in companies such as Babcock and Honeywell that has evergreen contracts to service Eskom. Jabu Mabuza told the Zondo commission that Eskom is riddled with corruption and that the tenders for coal and maintenance are in fact corrupt tenders but he is a beneficiary of these tenders. How else was he able to get contracts with Eskom that are corrupt, unless he is also corrupt? But because Minister Pravin is only concerned with the removal of black, useless, ingenious, he will not dare look at the direction of these particular contracts because they are owned by white people who are untouchable. It is clear that conflict of interest is not an issue. [Time expired.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 295

SIGNING OF NEW INVESTMENT AGREEMENTS

(Member's Statement)

Mr S A TLEANE (ANC): House Chair, the ANC is delighted by the signing of new investment agreements, which brings the total number of signed investors to eight, and investment value to over R3 billion, at the Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone. The Saldanha Bay Industrial Development Zone is part of the Department of Trade and Industry Special Economic Zones Programme, and is developing into a world-class offshore and maritime hub.

These investors include international stakeholders from the United Kingdom, Europe, the Middle East and Africa, with the rest being local companies. These investments will assist a great deal in establishing new industrial value chains in and around the port of Saldanha.

These investments indicate the confidence that the international investors have in our country as an investor friendly destination, as well as a show of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 296

confidence in the administration, programmes, plans and investments drives of the President of the ANC and the Republic of South Africa.

The ANC calls upon all South Africans to support President Ramaphosa's commitments to grow the economy and make South Africa a better place for all. I thank you.

[Applause.]

STOCK THEFT IN KWAZULU-NATAL

(Member's Statement)

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU (IFP): Chairperson, crime remains strife in the country and rural and farming communities bare the bulk of the brunt because they remain vulnerable as targets due to many challenges that are unique only to them. One of these challenges is the issue of livestock theft in areas such as Dondothena in KwaMthethwa, area under Kwambonambi which is Umfolozi local municipality, rural areas of uMlalazi municipality. This is a huge

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 297

problem that has caused life in these areas to be unpleasant.

It has become so bad that people have joined Isikebhe in order to cope with the issue of livestock theft. In the area of uMlalazi local municipality, it was reported that seven people lost their lives amidst scuffles related to stock theft. The crime levels and fear thereof also impacts on school children as they cannot move around in fear of being of being caught between these disputes.

Rural communities regard livestock as living will and they are their only source of income and sustenance. Thus, when their livestock are stolen many households and subsistence farmers loose their livelihoods. But these farmers are not the only ones who suffer on account of stock theft; it also has as serious impact ... Thank you.
[Time expired.]

**MAKHANDA MUNICIPALITY RESIDENTS DENIED FUNDAMENTAL RIGHT
OF ACCESS TO SUFFICIENT WATER**

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 298

(Member's Statement)

Mr M L W FILTANE (UDM): House Chair, section 27 1(b) of the Constitution of the Republic reads "Everyone has the right to have access to sufficient water." This fundamental right is still to be enjoyed by the people of Makhanda Municipality in the Eastern Cape, 25 years into democracy.

The legacy of the former Ministers of Water and Sanitation will be permanently inscribed in the history books of this area as the most inhuman, draconian, unconstitutional and monumental failure to promote, defend and uphold the rights of the people of Makhanda as enshrined in the highest law of the country.

It has left the people of Grahamstown and the surrounding area even more thirsty, unhygienic, hungry, poor and helpless. School going children are the hardest hit as they struggle to go to school without clean uniforms and bodies.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 299

Given the astronomically high levels of unemployment and poverty in Makhanda, the option to buy water from the private sector is the exclusive preserved of the fortunate.

The UDM welcomes the interventions by the Gift of the Givers as well as their associate, Dr Gideon Groenewald, hydrologist and geologist who drilled 455 metres into a rock to produce no less than 20 000 litres of pure drinking water per day.

We commend the current Minister, himself the son of Makhanda, to do everything possible in law to reverse the legacy of his predecessors.

IsiXhosa:

Siyangxengxeza Mngakrwana, Yintsabe, Ziduli, Hlab'ilawu, osel'amanzi angaselwayo, masincedisane nabantu baseRhini neziphaluka nabo basele amanzi acocekileyo. Enkosi.

[Kwaphela ixesha.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 300

**GOVERNMENT SIGNS A 30-YEAR LEASE WITH 900 FARMERS FOR
AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT**

(Member's Statement)

Mr A F MADELLA (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC welcomes the commitment by our government in signing 30-year leases with 900 farmers to enable them to mobilise funding for agricultural development. These measures are part of the broader effort to unleash an agricultural revolution in South Africa.

The epicentre of this revolution will be in the rural areas of our country. This announcement was made by the President of South Africa, his Excellency Cyril Matamela Ramaphosa, during the annual address of the National House of Traditional Leaders in Parliament last week.

The ANC acknowledges that the first task by the government is to accelerate inclusive economic growth and create jobs. The most direct way out of poverty for our people is through employment and other productive

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 301

economic activities such as small business ownership and farming.

It was the clear intention of increasing levels of investment that saw our government embarking upon an ambitious investment drive last year to raise R1,2 trillion in new investment over five years.

Vote ANC on 8 May for growth. [Applause.]

**PROGRESSIVE YOUTH ALLIANCE OF SASCO WINS SRC ELECTIONS IN
ALL TSHWANE TVET COLLEGES**

(Member's Statement)

Ms M L DUNJWA (ANC): Chair, the ANC welcomes the recent results of the Students Representative Council, SRC, elections in all Tshwane Technical and Vocational Education and Training, TVET, colleges where the Progressive Youth Alliance of South African Students Congress, SASCO, and the ANC Youth League won by a landslide victory.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 302

These are great results for SASCO and ANC Youth League as they received 89% of votes followed by the EFF at 11%.

The ANC congratulates the Progressive Youth Alliance for the unity and the hard work they displayed prior the results that tilted good results. Once again, the voters reaffirmed their confidence in the alliance of the progressive forces.

We thank the students who supported the alliance and call upon SASCO-led SRC to commit to redouble its efforts in solving the problems faced by students. We also thank the ANC regional election team leadership and its members for their support.

These results are once again a confirmation that SASCO and the ANC Youth League alliance remain the students' choice at tertiary institutions. I thank you. [Applause.]

**AIRPORTS COMPANY SA WASTES MONEY ON GALA DINNER INSTEAD
OF FOCUSING ON VITAL ISSUES**

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 303

(Member's Statement)

Mr M S F DE FREITAS (DA): House Chair, Airports Company SA, ACSA, a transport state-owned enterprise, SOE, recently celebrated its 25th anniversary with a gala dinner that could run into the million of rands.

This extravagant event, which took place at the luxurious Sandton Convention Centre with guests enjoying the very best that money can buy.

This is particularly concerning as ACSA has been one of the state-owned enterprises, SOEs, mentioned by name during the Zondo Commission of Inquiry into state capture.

In an environment where the South African economy is in dire straits, with record high unemployment and low growth, this kind of self-indulgent exercise is nothing more than a waste of money.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 304

Nothing illustrates this better than the motor vehicle that caught fire at OR Tambo International Airport this week; it burnt to a shell as there was no attempt at our major international airport to put it out.

Hon Jackson Mthembu, in fact, twitted that he was shocked at this; albeit he wasn't half as shocked as countless tourists who witnessed this criminal negligence.

The DA will be writing to the Transport Minister, Blade Nzimande, to ask why such unnecessary expenses take place when monies could be far better used to improve the airports in access portfolio.

The DA would not allow the waste of taxpayers' money to go unchallenged as we build a capable state that delivers one South Africa for all. Thank you. [Applause.]

PRESIDENT MALEMA IN COURT OVER TAKING THE LAND BACK CALL

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 305

Ms H O MKHALIPHI (EFF): House Chair, it was Frantz Fanon who said:

For colonised people the most essential value, because the most concrete, is first and foremost the land: the land which will bring them bread and, above all, dignity.

Yesterday the president and the commander in chief of the economic emancipation movement was called before the Newcastle Magistrate Court simply because he called on all South Africans to take back what is theirs, the land.

For 25 years, we have lived with the hope that ANC will reverse centuries of dispossession which saw the African majority reduced to live in only 13% of all land.

But, for 25 years, our people have been failed; yet, when the commander in chief, president Malema, made the call for people to take back what is theirs, he was simply echoing a call made by generations of freedom fighters who gave their lives to see Africa return to Africans, he was taken to court and treated like a criminal by the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 306

ANC. The irony of the entire situation is that the ANC is trying to prosecute the commander in chief, president Malema, with ... [Interjection.]

IsiZulu:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Thokoza, mhlonishwa, isikhathi sakho siphelile.

English:

Ms H O MKHALIPHI (EFF): Ah, but you are very, very, very, very bad wena [you]. Boroto must fall, seriously!

**NSFAS QUALIFYING STUDENTS SHOULD NOT BE PREVENTED FROM
REGISTERING FOR 2019 ACADEMIC YEAR DUE TO OUTSTANDING
FEES**

(Member's Statement)

Ms C C SEPTEMBER (ANC): House Chair, the ANC believes that no National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, qual ... [Interjection.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 307

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon House Chair, on a point of order! In terms of Rule 92, the presiding officer has precedence, but there's also another principle again in the Rules that members ought to refer to each other in a respectful manner. We cannot accept and we request that, ho Chair, - because it's done on record - the hon member, although it have been in her mind in a light note, but must withdraw it on record that the so-called "Boroto must fall". So, that one can never be accepted, not under our watch. Thank you, hon House Chair.

IsiZulu:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Inzima ngoba ikhuluma ngami.

English:

Hon member, can you please withdraw?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: No, Chair. What must I withdraw? Chair, this is very late. And this member has a tendency of just talking for the sake of talking, please man.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 308

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, no, no, no. Hon member, just withdraw.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Withdraw what? I'm not withdrawing, Chair. Ukuthi [Saying] Boroto must fall?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay, I will ask my advisers on what is to be done.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Thank you. Wena, stop being tjatjarag [sticking in your nose where it doesn't belong] wena. Hair cut, German cut!

Ms L M MASEKO: Chairperson, on a point of order. Hon Mnguni is an hon member of this House, he's not wena. Can the hon member withdraw? And what does tjatjarag mean? [Interjections.] Please withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members [Interjection.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: She can Google tjatjarag.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 309

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, I'll be assisted and I will make a comprehensive ruling on both. [Interjection.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chairperson, tjatjarag means clever. Mnguni is clever. [Interjection.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I never gave a permission to speak. Please take your seat.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: You are very clever.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I'll come back with a very comprehensive ruling.

Ms C C SEPTEMBER (ANC): House Chair, the ANC believes that no National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, qualifying student who was registered in 2018 and who has been admitted to a university and meets the academic criteria for continuation should be prevented from registering in 2019 due to outstanding fees.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 310

Students were encouraged that if they are in good academic standards and who have debt and are NSFAS qualifying must sign an acknowledgement of debt form and be allowed to register for 2019. This is the same process that was followed last year.

It is important to address the matter of the historic debt of NSFAS qualifying students in accordance with a process. The ANC looks forward to the department's announcement in this regard at the end of March.

Those final year students who may be on track to completion this year but may have been blocked from registering due to outstanding debt must be identified. We need to ensure that any student who is academically successful and unable to complete their studies for financial reasons is enabled to complete. There must be a way that needs to found for collaboration at all institutions to resolve all of these matters urgently. Vote ANC.

MATATIELE'S INCORPORATION INTO KWAZULU-NATAL

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 311

(Member's Statement)

Mr L M NTSHAYISA (AIC): Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. Of course, we were not informed but this is a very good opportunity. The AIC and the people of Matatiele ... [Interjections.] ... are still waiting for the promise to be fulfilled by the ANC. You know after the 2016 local government elections the ANC approached the AIC in order for us to assist them to rule or to run the municipalities of Ekurhuleni and Rustenburg; however, nothing has come forth.

The agreement entered into was that the former college of Maluti would be turned into an agricultural college; that the road between the town of Matatiele and Lesotho would be tarred; and again, that Matatiele would be incorporated into KwaZulu-Natal. That never happened, and we are still looking forward to or expecting the Bill that is going to take Matatiele into KwaZulu-Natal; however, nothing has happened.

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 312

It's a pity that the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs is not here. Perhaps he would have given a very good answer to this promise. [Time expired.]

GOVERNMENT PRIORITISES STUDENTS' ACCOMODATION NEEDS

(Member's Statement)

Mrs J D KILIAN (ANC): Hon Chairperson, the ANC welcomes steps taken to address student accommodation needs as a priority of government. It is done through support from the Infrastructure and Efficiency Grant for student accommodation and other infrastructure projects. From 2015-16 until 2020-21 a whopping R4,1 billion will be allocated for student housing.

The Student Housing Infrastructure Programme is working on a range of partnerships to provide 200 000 beds for university students and 100 000 beds for technical and vocational education and training college students over a period of 10 years. A total of 18 221 new beds will be

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 313

provided over the next three years as follows. Nelson Mandela University will receive 2 000 beds; the University of the Western Cape will receive 2 680 beds; North West University Mafikeng will receive 1 760 beds; Sefako Makgatho University will receive 2 000 beds; the University of Fort Hare will receive 1 437 beds; the University of Limpopo will receive 3 008 beds; the University of Zululand will receive 3 500 beds; and Vaal University of Technology will receive 1 836 beds.

The ANC supports the collaboration between the departments of Higher Education and Training, Human Settlements and Public Works to explore ... [Inaudible.]
[Time expired.]

UNDERSTAFFED AND UNDER-RESOURCED POLICE STATIONS

(Member's Statement)

Mr M WATERS (DA): Thank you, Chairperson. Violent attacks at two schools in my constituency last Thursday have left the communities of Kempton Park and Edenvale severely

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 314

traumatised. Six men with AK-47s invaded Edenvale High while learners were in the classrooms. The ensuing gun battle saw two gunmen killed and another two injured. At Norkem Park High, armed criminals robbed the school. This comes barely a week after a learner was shot at Dowerglen High when a suspect fleeing from police shot randomly into a classroom.

Shockingly, police are fighting crime with one hand tied behind their backs. In a parliamentary reply, the Minister of Police said to effectively fight crime, the UN Office on Drugs and Crime prescribe a minimum police strength of one officer to 220 people.

Both Edenvale and Norkem Park police stations are chronically understaffed. Edenvale has one officer for every 559 residents while Norkem Park has one officer for every 766 residents. Both police stations also lack 50% of the vehicles needed for visible policing.

The ANC's failure to adequately resource our police stations gives criminals the confidence to walk into

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 315

schools in broad daylight and terrorise our children. Only voters can stop this on 8 May by voting for a DA government that will prioritise the fight against crime and allocate sufficient resources ... [Inaudible.] [Time expired.]

**FRAUDSTERS SCAM SOUTH AFRICANS DESPITE BANKS CLAIMING
EFFICIENCY**

(Member's Statement)

Mr X MABASA (ANC): The ANC is concerned about fraudsters that are harassing the public, and making claims to bank clients and having debit orders paid to them unknowingly. This is a common practice within the country and has been ongoing for years. The practice widely targets many South Africans, especially the working class. Cyber criminals are using sophisticated methods to access customers' internet banking information and emails are part of this scam.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 316

Amounts debited from millions of community banking ... ranks from R99,00; R97,00; and anything up to R200,00 at a time. Sometimes it is unauthorised debit orders that affect customers and that cannot be detected. In most cases the fraudulent companies put through debit orders, for which they had no mandate, for amounts that will not trigger an SMS notification from the banks to clients.

Some banks have confirmed detecting abnormally high volumes and the ANC calls on banks to do more in their attempts to stop this fraud. We also urge bank customers to be more vigilant in order to combat cyber crime ... and protect bank customers. Banks must do their job.

STOCK THEFT IN KWAZULU-NATAL

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF POLICE: I thought that the member of the DA will stand up and congratulate the gallant police of Edenvale for a quick response by shooting and killing those criminals rather than come here and talk nonsense.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 317

Just say to the police bravo and give them kudos once and for all. They responded; they saved lives; they killed criminals. I think that ...

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, the Minister is misleading the House. [Interjections.] The private security company was the first on the scene and ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Nobody asked for a point of order, you just stood up and talked, that is why I switched your microphone off. Minister, please continue.

The MINISTER OF POLICE: House Chairperson, the police belonging to the SA Police Service in Edenvale responded to that matter. You must not just try ... I should have said you are lying, but I am not allowed to say so. It is South African police members, and not private security officers that responded. It is police members from the police station. You should go and check your facts.

[Interjections.] So, kudos to them! Congratulations to the women and men in blue. No matter what you say about

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 318

them, they did a good job. We welcome that. Secondly, to inkosi up there - I would like to get those facts but I would also like to warn inkosi not to work with "iskebhe". "Iskebhe" is a group of stock theft gangsters who are committing crime themselves, stealing cattle themselves in the name of protecting the people. Let us talk about not ever promote the criminality of the group called "Iskebhe". Thank you very much.

SIGNING OF NEW INVESTMENT AGREEMENTS

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: House Chair, can I thank hon Tleane for the statement on the R3 billion investment agreement concluded in Saldanha. It shows the success of the ANC-led government programme on special economic zones. It was a programme launched by national government and it was followed by the second special economic zone launched by President Ramaphosa in Atlantis recently. As positive action it contrast with the hon Hill-Lewis' desperate attempts earlier to deflect and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 319

spin the employment numbers in the Western Cape, earlier in the debate. It challenges the employment data we put out in the public domain during the state of the nation address debate.

Mr M WATERS: House Chairperson, a point of order.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, hon member.

Can you take your seat, hon Patel. Yes, hon member.

Mr M WATERS: House Chairperson, the Minister is supposed to reply to Members' Statements, not to a previous debate. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member ...

Mr M WATERS: ... and that is exactly what the member is doing.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Allow the Minister to respond. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 320

Mr M WATERS: But he should respond to Members' Statements.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Allow the Minister to respond.

Mr M WATERS: ... not to a previous debate.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Waters, please allow the Minister to respond. Hon Patel, continue.

The MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: House Chair, the truth hurts. So, when hon Tleane talked about Saldanha's success, it contrasted with the hon Hill-Lewis' comment. By the way the hon Hill-Lewis did not say that our data was wrong; he simply said that the Minister of Economic Development is not the arbiter of facts. That is very revealing; that is very telling.

He then committed a standard logical fallacy - the false appeal to authority, by quoting Africa Check as apparently confirming the DA claims about job creation in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 321

the Western Cape. There are still problems with this. The Africa Check he quoted was published on 25 June 2018, eight-months old, while the data we quoted was released two weeks ago, shame! [Interjections.]

Statistics SA report quoted by Africa Check was the Quarter 1 report for 2018. The problem is Quarter 2 report was published, Quarter 3 was published, Quarter 4 report was also published. [Time expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Nkwinti?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, I was rising on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, please.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I thank you. The Rules are quite clear in that Ministers have two minutes to respond to members' statement. [Interjections.] Do you agree with me? They are to respond to previous debates. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 322

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: This is the abuse of power.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I think the hon Minister has done that ...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: If you ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): If there is something that he responded to that you are not satisfied with, you know what should be done.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: But the people want to respond and they should respond in the debate.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I agree with you. Thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: That is what he should do.

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 323

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): We are no longer there. We are done with the hon Patel. Hon Nkwinti?

[Interjections.] Hon Nkwinti, please respond. I am not going to listen to you, hon Mileham, you are insulting and that is terrible for an adult like you.

[Interjections.] Continue, hon member. [Interjections.]

**MAKHANDA MUNICIPALITY RESIDENTS DENIED FUNDAMENTAL RIGHT
OF ACCESS TO SUFFICIENT WATER**

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Hon House Chair, both of those gentlemen are my homeboys. I am surprised that they can behave like that. I am proud of them because they are my homeboys but both of them ...

[Interjections.] Please don't do that ...

IsiXhosa:

... musa ukuyenza maan loo nto leyo. Hayi maan musa ukwenza loo nto leyo Ross. [Uwelewele.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 324

English:

Thank you, House Chair. I am sorry for wasting your time. The corollary to the privilege of members of Parliament is that they may not themselves insult people who cannot answer for themselves. This House is failing to enforce that principle, as a result we keep hearing here people attacking and assaulting the personalities of people who cannot answer for themselves. Could we please look at that because neither Jabu Mabuza nor Motsepe can answer for themselves here in this House. Of course Minister Pravin Gordhan can. Thank you on that point, hon Chair. Lastly ... [Interjections.] ... the people of Makhanda ... hon Chair, it is true, I agree with the hon members, they are struggling.

Last week we assisted by allocated R300 million to that municipality. At least they have some money. Now, we will assist them more with the technical capabilities. I am going home; that is my home indeed, the hon members are right. We carry water at home amadingding, because we do not have water. I will go home. The universities and other institutions are struggling. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 325

**NSFAS QUALIFYING STUDENTS WITH OUTSTANDING FEES
REGISTERING FOR 2019 ACADEMIC YEAR NOT TO BE PREVENTED**

GOVERNMENT PRIORITISES STUDENTS' ACCOMODATION NEEDS

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Hon House Chairperson, it is correct that the Rules deal with Members' Statements and responses by the executive but there is no part of the Rules that says how the executive must respond. I wish to thank the ANC for having raised the matter of calling on young people who are National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, qualifying and who have not been allowed to register on financial grounds due to debt. We have our institutions to allow such students to register and I see that institutions have begun doing so because I have been getting letters from young people.

I have also asked that students who are in their year of completion of their degree and who are being excluded

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 326

because they are poor or indeed have financial needs that such students should be allowed to register and we would on a case by case basis assess whether the department is able to assist them. And again, many institutions already have a policy in this regard and have begun to respond. We congratulate our government and the people of South Africa for making funding available to assist poor and working class families and to have their children access higher education and technical and vocational education and training, TVet, college study.

We are absolutely thrilled that R30,8 billion would be made available from public resources in this regard and congratulate the ANC government and the people of South Africa for their efforts in support of young people.

Finally we know that there is scarcity of accommodation in our institutions, our plan for 300 000 beds in the next 10 years certainly is an important intervention again by the ANC-led government and the people of South Africa. Thank you very much, House Chairperson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 327

**GAUTENG EDUCATION DEPARTMENT CONGRATULATED FOR TOP
ACHIEVEMENT AS BEST PERFORMING PROVINCE**

(Minister's Response)

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon House Chairperson, we would like to congratulate the ANC-led province of Gauteng for the incredible achievement of the 20 best performing districts. Fifteen out of the top 18 came from Gauteng and they have only 15 districts. Free State, North West, Western Cape and others had none. The top performing province was Gauteng, followed very closely by less than half per cent by the Free State and some 5% below that was the Western Cape. I think they should learn from Gauteng how to govern and how to develop capacity. [Interjections.]

This ANC-led government has delivered some 600 schools in this administration alone, which converts or translates to an average of more than two schools per week. The Western Cape has been the beneficiary of 25 sets of the art schools in Dunoos, Atlantis, Belhar, areas which were

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 328

hitherto neglected by the DA and they had to wait for the national government to make the intervention.

[Interjections.]

Notwithstanding the boastfulness, it is Gauteng that has provided special schools for aeronautics, and maritime studies, even though they do not have the sea there, and they have shown the advancement in terms of data-driven districts. I think if at all the Western Cape has to look at Gauteng, it will not have the problem of 2 500 learners who are still not registered and who do not have a place in school. I think they must look tentatively to better performing districts. The most overcrowded province in terms of schools is the Western Cape - in terms of teacher-pupil ratio whilst Gauteng is building and opening schools, the Western Cape is closing schools. I think they should listen attentively and look at what is happening around the world and say if you want better education, look at the ANC, and not at the DA.

Thank you. [Interjections.]

IsiXhosa:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 329

UMPHATHISWA WEZOKUHLALISWA KOLUNTU: Sihlalo weNdlu, ukususela kunyaka we-1994, lo rhulumente we-ANC wakhe amathuba ezindlu ezingaphaya kwezigidi ezi-4,7. [Kwaqhwatywa.] Ndiyalibulela ilungu elihloniphekileyo ngokuzisa izindlu zaseLigwa apho izindlu zakhona zineentanda. Ndiyaqiniseka ukuba ohloniphekileyo uyayazi ukuba kukho ingxaki enkulu eLigwa yohlobo lomhlaba. Nokuba oonokhontrakhi banezakhono ezingakanani na, ukuba kuye kwabakho impazamo enye, nokuba incinci kangakanani na, kuvele kubekho iintanda eziya athetha ngazo sezikhona.

English:

It is good though that you brought it here.

IsiXhosa:

Khawuvale umlomo wena. [Kwahlekwa.] UMphathiswa wesebe ephondweni sele eyizisile ngakum. Xa sidibana rhoqo phaya kwiBhunga likaMphathiswa nabaPhathiswa beSebe emaPhondweni, Minmec, sithetha ngeendlela zokuhlangula iLigwa nokuphucula izindlu ezikula ndawo zibe kumgangatho ongcono kunalaa nto zikuyo ngoku. Enkosi kakhulu.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 330

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I must emphasise that I can't prescribe how the Ministers answer questions, even though some people might say I am useless. Thank you for that. I am not.

Ms N V MENTE: On a point of order, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, hon member.

Ms N V MENTE: House Chairperson, I just want to seek clarity from you when you are saying you can't prescribe because their oath is saying that they must be loyal and honest to the people. So, when they lie, they can't be honest. That is the description of their answers.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, I don't have that in my roles. Thank you very much. I don't have that in my rules. Thank you. I am passing. I am not going back to the ministerial issues.

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 331

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, hon Waters.

Mr M WATERS: I agree with you, Chairperson, you can't prescribe to any Minister in which fashion they respond to member's statements, but they have to respond to member's statements. There is no restriction.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): That is why I said to you, you know what to do if you are not satisfied, Mr Waters. Thank you.

NOTICES OF MOTION

Mr S A TLEANE: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

(1) note that -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 332

- (a) consideration of the establishment of a Special Economic Zone for clothing, textile and footwear as a labour intensive job creation projects.

Afrikaans:

Me V VAN DYK: Voorsitter, by die volgende sitting van die Huis sal ek namens die DA voorstel:

Dat die Huis die stand van ambulansdienste in Namakwaland sal debateer, met 'n fokus op lisensies en veiligheidssertifikate wat verval het en wat 'n veiligheidsrisiko vir beide die ambulanspersoneel en die publiek inhou.

Ms N P SONTI: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House -

(1) notes that -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 333

- (a) the establishment of multiple special economic zones in various regions of South Africa.

Mr A F MADELLA: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

(1) notes that -

- (a) the building of institutional capacity to support localisation, including SARS with the focus on combating illegal imports, smuggling, invoice fraud and dumping.

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the IFP:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 334

(1) notes that -

- (a) the persistent issue of theft of livestock in rural areas and how in many area law enforcement officers seem to be unable to prevent this from happening.

Mr S C MNCWABE: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the NFP:

That the House -

(1) notes that -

- (a) the behaviour and conduct of some certain foreign religious leaders in this country.

Mrs J D KILIAN: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 335

That the House -

(1) notes that -

(a) the rapid expansion of the post school
sector and challenges associated with it.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that
on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on
behalf of the UDM:

That the House -

(1) note that -

(a) the measures to regulate the religious
industry.

Ms N I TARABELLA MARCHESI: Chairperson, I hereby give
notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall
move on behalf of the DA:

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 336

That the House -

(1) notes that -

- (a) inappropriate and inadequate school infrastructure, lack of maintenance thereof and safety challenges the infrastructure poses to our learners in schools in South Africa.

Ms N P SONTI: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House -

(1) notes that -

- (a) about the people of Marikana who are killed everyday by the illegal electrically connections because of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 337

lack of service delivery which is done by the ANC's delays.

Ms C C SEPTEMBER: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

(1) notes that -

- (a) strengthening of security at South African schools to prevent the escalating violent crimes and robberies unleashed in our schools, especially the Western Cape.

Sepedi:

Mna W M MADISHA: Ka lebaka la gore go tswaletšwe Modulasetulo, ke go senya nako ge re re re tle re bolele ka tšona. Re tla lefa tšona ka morago ga dikgetho.
Thobela!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 338

MODULASETULO WA NGWAKO (Moh M G Boroto): Aowa, kua gae ba a tseba gore re sa le mošomong, Mokone.

Mr A BOTES: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

(1) notes that -

- (a) strengthening and supporting the government interventions and initiatives aimed at addressing the increasing levels of poverty experienced by South Africans.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the AIC:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 339

(1) notes that -

- (a) how the abuse of tender system along with corruption has plunged our country into poverty and what are the solutions therefore.

Ms M L DUNJWA: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House -

(1) notes that -

- (a) the development of an economic strategy that appropriately balances between meeting our developmental objectives as well as promoting inclusive growth.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 340

Ms B S MASANGO: Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

(1) notes that -

- (a) the prevalence of Africa Global Operations/Bosasa operations contracts in government departments and corruption associated there with.

Xitsonga:

Nkul X MABASA: Mutshamaxitulu, ndzi tivisa leswaku eka ntshamo lowu landzelaka wa Yindlu ndzi ta susumeta hi ku yimela ANC:

Leswaku Yindlu yi va na njhekanjhekisano hi ...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 26 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 341

...accelerating and strengthening government interventions to mitigate the impact of the draught on economic development and job creation.

The House adjourned at 21:16.

UNREVISED HANSARD