

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 1

WEDNESDAY, 04 SEPTEMBER 2024

PROCEEDINGS OF HYBRID NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 15:00.

The Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

ANNOUNCEMENT

The SPEAKER: Hon members, the only item on today's Order Paper is questions addressed to Ministers in Cluster 2 - Social Services. There are four supplementary questions on each question. Parties have indicated which questions their members wish to pose as supplementary questions. Adequate notice was given to parties for this purpose. This was done to facilitate the participation of members who are connecting to the sitting through the virtual platform.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 2

The members who will pose supplementary questions will be recognised by the Presiding Officer. In allocating opportunities for supplementary questions, the principle of fairness among others is applied. If a member who is to ask a supplementary question through the virtual platform is unable to do so due to technological difficulties, the party Whips on duty will be allowed to ask the question on behalf of their members.

When all the supplementary questions have been answered by the executive, we will proceed to the next question on the Order Paper.

IsiZulu:

Ngicela ukusho malungu ahloniphekile ukuthi namhlanje uhlu esinalo lenqubohlelo yale Ndlu ukuthi kuphendulwe imibuzo ebuzwe ngamalungu koNgqongqoshe kumbe noSekela Ngqongqoshe ngokujwayelekile. Uma kukhona ilungu ebelizobuza lowo mbuzo mhlawumbe ngobuchwepeshe besimanje njengoba sazi ukuthi sikule Ndlu ngezindlela ezimbili. Kukhona abasemakhaya noma emahhovisi abangekho la. Ngakhoke, yilowo nalowo Sotswebhu Omkhulu walelo qembu oyobe esesukuma abuze lowo mbuzo olandelo kuNgqongqoshe. Ngicela ukusho futhi malungu ahloniohekile

ukuthi bonke oNgqongqoshe bakhona la. Munye kuphela uNgqongqoshe ongekho namhlanje okunguNgqongqoshe Wezemfundo Ephakeme osohambeni lombuso kodwa ukhona uSekela Ngqongqoshe ozokwazi ukuphendula.

English:

I want to advise members that we did receive an apology from the Minister of Higher Education, who is on a state visit in China, the Deputy Minister is available to answer the question.

QUESTIONS - CLUSTER 2: SOCIAL SERVICES

Question 150:

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, members of the House, let me take this opportunity to accept and welcome the question. In response to the question, we all know that the Department of Social Development deals with all kinds of social ills that fall within its mandate, scope and capacity. The approach to dealing with social ills is informed by the prevalence in particular provinces. However, gambling as a social ill falls within the mandate of the Department of Trade and Competition.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 4

This is informed by the Department of Trade and Industry taking it upon itself to establish a line where people can phone and get assistance. As such, they do have that landline that is operating 24-7 to make sure that people who got themselves into this predicament can be assisted. Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

Xitsonga:

Tat S M GANA: Mutshamaxitulu, ndza khensa.

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Our interpreters, please make sure you do not interpret live. It's simultaneous. Members do have the gadgets to be able to listen to you. Hon Gana?

Mr S M GANA: Thank you very much.

Xitsonga:

Ndza khensa, Mutshamaxitulu.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 5

The SPEAKER: I'm sorry, can the service officers please go and talk to the technical team so that they do not broadcast their translation?

Xitsonga:

Tat S M GANA: Swi lava mi vutisa hi Xitsonga a ta kota ku swi twisisa kahle ... [A swi twali.] ... [Minkavanyeto.] ...

English:

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member, can we please sort this one out? Translation services, please do not translate and broadcast your translation. You are disturbing the House. Can we try again?

Xitsonga:

Tat S M GANA: Hi swona. Ndza khensa, Mutshamaxitulu. Hi swona, se swa tirha sweswi. Holobye, ndza swi amukela leswaku swinawana swa ku gembula swi wela eka Ndzawulo ya Mabindzu na Vumaki.

English:

My question is, we see many recipients of social grants, and on the day that they receive social grants, they are queuing

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 6

at sports betting sites. I am asking whether you, maybe let me not ask the department, as a Minister, on the day that social grants are being paid and you see the recipients queuing in the gambling sites, whether you see that as a social ill and what are you going to do about it? It's not enough for you to say that it belongs to the Department of Trade and Industry. Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon member, hon Speaker, indeed, our Department of Social Development comes across various forms of addiction, such as pornography, ... [Inaudible.] ... shopping addiction, sex addiction, and many more. We do refer them to the relevant institutions and organisations. However, the department only addresses addictions that are within its mandate. That's it, hon member. Thank you very much.

Ms K C TLHONG: Speaker, I'm satisfied with the question.

The SPEAKER: Are you not using your slot to make a follow-up question? You are fine with the answer. [Interjections.] Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 7

Ms B S MASANGO: Hon Speaker, hon Minister, does the department have data on the prevalence of gambling among grant recipients? What initiatives has the department embarked upon in partnership with the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition and other stakeholders to offer gambling prevention programmes? If not, what work is happening in this regard? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, thank you, hon member, our chair, yes, indeed we agree with the question that, indeed, our country has been caught up with a kind of scourge in this regard. As a department, we have started a process wherein we talk with our sister departments to make sure that we come up with a co-ordinated strategy to deal with this.

This is beyond our mandate. It will seek some strategy of Intergovernmental Relations, IGR, when we can talk with our sister departments as well as the second and third spheres of the government because this happens where our people get their grants as well as where our people stay. We are committed to dealing with this matter. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 8

Ms P MARAIS: Minister, these old people are not going there to the casinos because they have a gambling problem. On the contrary, they go there to see if they can make a few more rands. Minister, our old people must be exempted from paying water rates and electricity. Food prices are sky-high, and they can't cope with this anymore. Minister, you need to address these issues so that old people don't have to go to the casino to try to make more money.

Having laws in place is good, but it's not going to assist our poor people. Unemployment is making it worse because old people must maintain these whole families with their grant money. Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The hon member talks about many policies that belong to our sister departments where you are talking about the indigent grants or people who are supposed to get some discounts on the services that they are supposed to get. I guess this will need more than one department, which is the Department of Social Development because it talks to the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, it talks to the Department of Water and Sanitation, and all the departments.

I wish to say, we will initiate these discussions because of the gravity of the matter and the fact that the majority of people that are trapped in that are grant recipients. We agree. Thank you so much, hon Speaker.

Question 112:

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Hon Xaba-Ntshaba, your question is a complex one, but I want to endeavour to answer it as honestly as possible. Since taking office, I have prioritised strengthening efforts to address the critical issue of unsafe sanitation facilities in our public schools. In fact, I have made this a priority in the priorities of the seventh administration to make sure that we eradicate all pit toilets by the end of this financial year which ends in March because we know that the existence of pit toilets in our schools is not only a danger to our learners, but also is an issue of dignity. So the continued existence of these toilets poses a significant risk to learners health safety and therefore requires action.

I know that the member had asked specifically about bucket toilets, so I want to provide a historical context here. A

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 10

school needs register that was done in August 1997 indicated that there were 27 864 primary, secondary and combined schools, and of those, 278 had bucket toilets. Then we went fast forward to 2018, the Department of Basic Education initiated another audit of what we would call unsafe pit toilets and the number that we realised was that there were 4700 pit toilets that were not successfully eradicated. So that is the backlog that we are dealing with. So right now, as things stand, according to the audit that we have, there are 259 sanitation projects that need to be completed by March 2024. So, we want to make sure that we do these things and that's why in my provincial visits to the provinces, I am making it clear that no province and no Department of Education in the provinces should be sending money back to Treasury when not spending their infrastructure budgets when we still have massive infrastructure backlogs.

We also need to be creative about how we use this. We've got various partnerships the Department of Education does work with in terms of eradicating these pit toilets. But also, we are working with departments such as Public Works. We want to encourage the private sector to help us come on board so that we can accelerate the eradication of pit toilets as a matter

of urgency, not only for safety, but for dignity, both for learners and educators. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Nk P P XABA-NTSHABA: Angibonge Sihlalo ngaphambili, Ngqongqoshe inkinga yamanzi ngenye yezinselelo izikole ezibhekene nayo kanti lokhu kuphinde kube nomthelela ezinhlelweni zokukhucululwa kwendle. Ngabe uNgqongqoshe unawuphi umzamo wokuqeda izinselelo zamanzi ezikoleni? Ngiyabonga.

IsiXhosa:

UMPHATHISWA WEMFUNSO ESISISEKO: Mandibulele lungu elihloniphekileyo ngombuzo wakho. Unyanisile kakhulu kuba kaloku ingxaki esiye sibe nayo kukuba, nangona sifuna ukuzisusa ...

English:

... these pit toilets and pit latrines ...

IsiXhosa:

... kwiindawo ezininzi ingakumbi ezilalini apho kungekho manzi khona, uye ufumanise ukuba kuza kufuneka kubekho ...

English:

... some temporary structures ...

IsiXhosa:

... ezo ngamanye amaxesha ziye zingakhathalelwa. Loo nto iye ibangele ukuba abantu baphele bephinda besebenzisa eza zindlu zangasese zakudala. Yiyo loo nto ke ...

English:

... in our strategy as the department, what we are doing is asking even the implementing agents to make sure that we are utilising even structures that do not require water. We are a water scarce country. There are ways and means to make sure that we have dignified sanitation options that are not waterborne so that we can make sure that ...

IsiXhosa:

... nokuba ukuQumbu okanye eQwaqqa, ukuba siyile phaya ...

English:

... to eradicate pit toilets ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 13

IsiXhosa:

... siyazi ukuba abantu baza kukwazi ukufumana izindlu zangasese ezisemgathweni kwaye ezenza isidima.

English:

Mr S L NGCOBO: Hon Speaker, the department ... actually you know, it's a very sore issue this one. The department aimed and committed to eradicate all inappropriate sanitation by 2025. Now, can the Minister please tell this House the status of this commitment in both KwaZulu-Natal and the Eastern Cape provinces, in particular? I am particularly interested in the pit latrines because I heard the first part of the response of the hon Minister. These goes hand in hand. You can't separate them - the buckets and pit latrines. Kids are dying in schools. Thank you very much, Speaker.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon Speaker, maybe I wasn't quite clear in the first response to the first member. We don't - as far as we know - have bucket toilets in schools anymore. What we do have though is pit toilets in our schools. The audit that we have indicates that there are 259 pit toilets that are still left in the country. The biggest problems we face are in the Eastern Cape and in Limpopo. We

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 14

have a strategy to make sure that we are supporting those provinces - not only in spending their infrastructure budgets - but also making sure that they clear the backlog as quickly as possible.

The hon member is absolutely correct. We've given ourselves the date of March 2025 to eradicate all pit toilets. But in addition to that, I want to also assure the members of this House that this is a continuous project. You can't say your backlog was over 4000 pit toilets then, and then you simply say well then now we are done. Once we have cleared that backlog, we have to continuously do an audit to make sure that our schools remain safe so that we can see if there are new pit toilets that are erected and we can make sure that those pit toilets have been closed, they have been sealed and that proper sanitation is in our schools. This is something that we cannot lose track of because as I said, it's not just about safety, it is also about dignity for both learners and our educators.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hon Minister, over the past few years, tragic stories of hundreds of young children drowning in pit latrines have made headline news in South Africa. In 2019,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 15

President Cyril Ramaphosa launched a R6,8 billion sanitation programme appropriate for education. They called it Sanitation Appropriate For Education, Safe, programme to provide sufficient sanitation facilities to 4000 schools. However, almost six years later since the launch of the programme, little has been achieved. More than 3500 schools, which is not too far off from the initial 4000 schools, still have illegal pit latrines. The question is this, whether you have made any strides to investigate what those funds were used for given that they the problems still persist? Also, whether any financial compensation has been given to by the department or provided to the families of the deceased learners? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Yes, hon Kwankwa is right. The Safe programme was launched by the President back in 2018. This is the audits that I was talking about that when an audit was done back then, over 4000 pit toilets were identified. Where are we right now? We have identified from that backlog then, that we are sitting with over 250 toilets left. So progress has been made. But I will be the first to admit that it simply is not good enough and we cannot still have children who are drowning in pit toilets in 2024 - 30 years into our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 16

democracy. So this is why this matter is a priority for me and the department.

But to insinuate that, however, the department has not made any strides in six years, is a bridge too far hon member because that money has been spent, albeit it has been spent very slowly. We are now left with under 300 pit toilets that still need to be done. In terms of money that you asked what the funds were used for, a lot of them were used for this kind of project.

I also want to indicate that our big challenge is implementing agents who take way too long to do these projects. They are given the contract to go and clear backlogs and they are simply not doing enough. So one of the things that I would like to do is introduce competition into the space so that if you do work with the government and you do not fulfil what you are meant to do, then you will get blacklisted because it's not good enough for us to keep using the same implementing agents who are not doing the work that they're meant to do and then we must come and account. Yet, we've already paid for the work to be done and implementing agents are not doing so.

Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 17

Mr M A MAIMANE: Minister, I think we both can agree, and I want to celebrate your commitment to the eradication of pit toilets, given that they're an emblem of what the apartheid government has left behind. The question I want to put forward is to say, given that there's new infrastructure that's been built, there's a new trend where we are finding more portable toilets being built in schools in poor infrastructure, which is further inculcating this culture of separate development, particularly in township schools.

So my question is whether the Minister is willing and has a plan to eradicate portable toilets so that we don't end up in six years discussing those toilets? Secondly, if the Minister in my role in appropriations, would be willing to come with us to a rural school so that we can give more money to the eradication of this particular problem? Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Madam Speaker, I would absolutely be happy to go with the committee to any school. In fact, I want to make this plea to the members of the House that it would depend on you as Members of Parliament to go and do oversight on the ground so that we don't just rely on

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 18

PowerPoint presentations to be told that these things are that done. That when Members of Parliament don't do oversight, then you are able to give us feedback so that we can actually be a responsive government. So we can go where the problem is so that we can scratch where the itch is. So I would encourage as many Members of Parliament to do oversight and to show us where the problem is.

Hon Maimane talks about poor infrastructure and workmanship, and it's a big problem because you're spending billions of rands essentially building things that are going to break in a couple of years' time. As you say, it does entrench the notion of separate development because these are mostly in poorer schools and township schools. That's why I do want to emphasise that with the work that I'm doing with the Public Works and Infrastructure department, we do introduce competition in the space because I do believe that there's been certain implementing agents who have been slacking because they know that they can rely on government tenders for many years, regardless of the poor shoddiness of their work, they still rely on government tenders. But if we open up the system and have proper implementing agents who know that there will be consequences if you don't deliver proper work. There

will be consequences if you don't deliver work on time. There will be consequences if money goes missing when you've been entrusted to do public work.

My strong recommendation is simply this, if you do business with the state and you don't do a good job, you must be blacklisted. It cannot be that the same people who do shoddy work in the Eastern Cape will turn up in Gauteng and do shoddy work there again. There has to be consequence management with our implementing agents. We have got to open up the space because the monopoly is what is costing us because people know that there is no consequence management. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Question 78:

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, I'm going to try and take the House into my confidence on this matter. Hon Jordan, thank you for the opportunity for me to be able to address Parliament on the issue. So, the Department of Basic Education ... firstly, I want to assure members of this House that there has been no disruption in the National School Nutrition Programme. I have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 20

heard people saying, to halt this process is somehow going to affect the school nutrition programme. It is not true.

Currently, how the system works, is that some provinces have a centralised system of procurement of their nutrition and some provinces have a decentralised system. The Department of Basic Education about two or three years ago, undertook a process of looking to see how they can modernise the National School Nutrition Programme. When I came into office, I asked questions about the modernisation strategy. When I asked questions, my question was simply this. This is a multiyear tender with the price tag of R10 billion and it is important for me as a new Minister to do my due diligence for two reasons really. Firstly, I need to make sure that the 9,7 million learners who rely on these meals, some of whom have only that meal to depend on that day. I need to make sure that as DBE, we do not contribute to learners not getting their school nutrition. Therefore, I needed to satisfy myself that, in fact, this strategy is one that will make sure that no child goes hungry in school.

The second thing is, I needed to make sure that I do my due diligence in terms of making sure have we met Treasury

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 21

regulations, which speak to how direct grants to provinces are handled, and that process is ongoing - and so that is the process I have said. I have instructed the department to stop all and every step that has been taken thus far on this matter, until I have satisfied myself that it is, firstly, the correct strategy to follow; secondly, no public money will be lost, and thirdly no child in any school will go hungry. Up until I'm satisfied that those things can be true and can be met, I have asked the department to halt this process until due diligence is done and I'll brief Cabinet accordingly once that is done.

Ms C JORDAN: Thank you, hon Speaker, thank you to the Minister also for that response. My follow-up question is whether the Minister had engaged with the provinces of Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal for their current failure to ensure that regular delivery of nutritious food to schools in the National School Nutrition Programme and what these provinces responses have been?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you very much hon Speaker and thank you to hon Jordan. Yes, I have done a lot of engagement with provinces. In fact, I convened the Council of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 22

Education Ministers about two weeks ago, and we deliberated on several issues, including the School Nutrition Programme. Members once again want to be as honest as possible. There is no poor and perfect system. Whether you're looking at a centralised model or a decentralised model, there's never going to be a system that will not be corrupted. There will never be a system that will not have inefficiencies in it. What we need to do, as government, is make sure that we close the loop of corruption, and we close the inefficiencies as much as possible. So, yes, I've had engagements with provinces. Some provinces have said, look, we are struggling with delivering nutritious meals every single day. For instance, the Northern Cape, they struggle because of a unique set of circumstances where they've got long distances to travel. So, ours, as DBE is to look at the provincial challenges and assist provinces to get to the 9,7 million learners every single day, and that is why my due diligence in terms of this strategy becomes very important because I become the custodian of the R10 billion tender that is to feed 9,7 million children in South Africa. So, yes, hon Jordan, there have been challenges in the provinces, but my undertaking is that this is why I'm doing the kind of due

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 23

diligence that I'm doing to make sure that we close inefficiencies and we save money where possible.

Ms K J MAIMELA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and to the hon Minister, given the fact that public procurement is an important lever of the state which has an impact on the economy and the people, and that the Public Procurement Act places localisation and set aside as a key component to advance the redistribution objectives to tackle poverty, inequality and unemployment. How will the Minister ensure that the National School Nutrition Programme contributes to local economic development, particularly with regard to the producers of the food items offered through the programme? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and the Chairperson is absolutely correct that one of the things that we ought to also be mindful of is how as a government when we do business make sure that we are also empowering communities. So, yes, this is one of the considerations we are going to be looking at when we are really looking at the modernisation strategy to see, whether are we empowering local businesses? Are we empowering local

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 24

farmers in those provinces in those communities who can be able to provide fresh, nutritious food? I'm not entirely convinced that simply saying one supplier can provide meals to every single learner, every single day. I think that there is value in staggering and localising it as much as possible. In saying that local communities must feed their local schools, and I think, there is something empowering about that. So, I agree with you that is one of the things that we need to consider as we go forward when we look at modernisation strategies.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Speaker, I'll take the question.

The SPEAKER: I nearly, asked when did you change to be Mashabela?

IsiZulu:

Nk H O MKHALIPHI: Minister, ngibuke ma...

The SPEAKER: Oh! You speak through the Chair, hon member.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Minister, we hear your response about the whole thing ...

IsiZulu:

... kodwa manje awucacisi kahle ukuthi njengoba usafuna ukuzinelisa wena luthini uhlelo lwakho?

English:

After your satisfaction and you are not telling us about your timeframe about this matter? The second question is that how many children are you feeding as a department?

IsiZulu:

...noma mhlawumbe uthuswa yilo 9,8 bhiliyoni kanti mhlawumbe abantwana ...

English:

... they are more than 9,8 billion who are needing this feeding scheme and how much per child that is needed from your department?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Next time members ask one question as a supplementary. Yes, I am just advising all members.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 26

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you very much. Speaker, because I have great appreciation for where the Members sitting. I too sat there not so long ago. So, I will answer all your questions, hon members. They will ...

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: Speaker must fall.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members, as the rules apply for now, but if the Minister is willing, that is the Minister's choice. However, it's not obligatory. Rule says one supplementary question. Speaker will, indeed, enforce the rules. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Speaker, on the question, and the member asked an important question. So, what happens now as you are doing your due diligence. So, I just want to reiterate again that there has been no interruption in the School Nutrition Programme. It continues as is. Of course, we have to look at whether is it efficient in the way that it is done? How do we make it more efficient? How do we use R10 billion to make sure that your money stretches? You asked an important question again. Are you sure that you only have 9,7 million learners who need the nutrition

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 27

programme? I can almost guarantee you that there's probably a greater need and as South Africa goes through deep financial issues and at a fiscal crisis. I can guarantee you more and more learners are going to need our assistance in terms of nutrition, particularly as we start to incorporate Grade R and ECD. We are going to have more students that we need to look at and more learners. So, yes, we must look at the basket of money that we have, how do we make it stretch but at the same time how do we make sure that the meals are nutritious, that they are fresh, and they reach as many learners as possible. I am not sure of the figure I will provide it to you on how much we spend per learner in the R10 billion tender. Thank you.

Ms L M NGOBENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker, and thank you to the Minister. Minister, the National School Nutrition Programme is of critical importance in supporting vulnerable learners. There are numerous reports of unscrupulous tenderpreneurs exploiting the programme by delivering substandard meals or failing to deliver altogether. Additionally, persistence non-payment to service providers such as those in KZN, exacerbates this problem. We as Action SA have formally raised this concern with the MEC in KZN in July and to date, radio silence on feedback. Given the dysfunction that characterises the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 28

School Nutrition Programme, in many instances, which directly impacts the most vulnerable among us. I know that you have said you are busy with your due diligence, but what are your thoughts on the long-term plan to stabilise the programme so that we can ensure consistent delivery of safe and nutritious meals to all schools? If you do not have it for now, what is the plan? Thank you, Speakers.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Speaker. The member is absolutely correct. We are dealing with unscrupulous people who are tendertrepreneurs, who are really milking the public purse in various provinces and in various layers of the system. That is why the department obviously undertook to say three years ago, how do we look at modernising, how do we look at making sure that we have got efficiency in the system. That is how the modernisation strategy started to say, how do we close the taps where people are looting money out of the system. But I must say, regardless of where the process is now, with regards to the modernization strategy. Where it is intolerable is where provinces are allowing service providers, who are serving our learners rotten food, substandard food. The department has a set menu of what nutritious meals must look like, and each and

every service provider that does this kind of work has to stick to those standards that have been set by the School Nutrition Programme. And, where these things are not happening again, I would appreciate Members of Parliament who are saying here is a school that does not get its School Nutrition Programme, so that I can ask the relevant department heads to say, go there and find out. Yes, KZN had a big issue with the non-payment of service providers. And one of the things that we are doing is having a specific intervention with KwaZulu-Natal around their fiscal challenges as a department to see where we can assist this DBE in trying to unlock some of these challenges. Thank you.

Question 136:

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, I want to, because there are some figures which I will now explain in context. But I want to read here that the department is continuing with its programme of consolidating the school system, particularly in the Eastern Cape. Many of you will know that it is a very rural province, and many years ago, they started the process of building schools in rural areas in certain villages. But due to economic migration, more and more people are moving to the cities. They are moving

closer to economic opportunities. As a result, the schools that have been built, even the most modern schools, are becoming white elephants because we don't have enough learners to attend them.

So, there is a whole set of guidelines that the department gives to the provinces in terms of how and when do you close down a school. So, I want to assure Parliament that the decision to close schools is not arbitrary. You have to look at various things, including the number of learners at the school, whether or not we can still provide quality learning outcomes in those numbers.

I just wanted to read some numbers here. The Eastern Cape has really driven this process. Over the next five years, a total of 978 schools are slated for rationalisation and realignment. And that's nothing to be alarmed about because it's important that we as a department respond to migration trends. We can't just build schools for the sake of it when learners are learning mainly in the urban areas, and we have a problem of overcrowding in the urban areas. So, we have to respond as a government to see where people are going and where we find the need and make sure that we accommodate them where they are.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 31

The total number of schools in this category is 116. In the category of schools that need to be rationalised, there are 54. It is important to note that rationalisation is not just about closing schools but consolidating the school system. As the process unfolds, the department will work with stakeholders on this. This involves the consolidation of 435 schools, the closure of 281 schools, the realignment of 35 schools over the next five years, the retention of 116 schools over the five-year period and the expansion of 54 schools. So, the point I am getting at is that rationalising schools is not easy school closures, it's about making sure that those schools that are not viable, you make them viable by either moving more learners there or redirecting learners. But then, it becomes the responsibility of the department in the province to make sure that if you do rationalise and close down a school, how then do you ferry learners who no longer can go to that school? How do you accommodate them in a different area. So, it is an important process to undertake because we can't have schools that are sitting empty when there are kids that are sitting in overcrowded classrooms. So, this is a necessary process, but it certainly is not an arbitrary one.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 32

Mr V G REDDY: Thank you, Speaker. I will ask the follow-up question on behalf of hon Mbatha.

The SPEAKER: I was thinking whether we are now on Question 176?

Mr V G REDDY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. The Government of National Unit, GNU, must not lie to this House and the people of South Africa. The fact of the matter is that we need to face the facts ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, can you take a seat? Hon Dlakude, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Speaker, the word "lying" is unparliamentary, and we don't use that word in this House. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Just to indicate that the word is not used to a reference to a member. So, the point of order is not sustained.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 33

Mr V G REDDY: ... Thank you, Madam Speaker. It's time that we face the facts, the education of the black child has not improved under President Ramaphosa and this GNU. Former President Jacob Zuma said, "Education is the most powerful weapon to change the world."

The truth is told and ... [Inaudible.] ... people can't accept the truth.

Yet, under this administration, that weapon has been blunted. And what you see in provinces like the Eastern Cape and the Western Cape, mind you, where the DA governs, and 2000 teachers are currently facing the chop. We are getting rid of teachers when we should be hiring teachers. In the Eastern Cape there is a school... [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Please do not drown the member.

Mr V G REDDY: ... Minister, there is a school in Nqgeleni where in 2017, two blocks were burnt. Up to today, that schools has not been rebuilt. There are 140 children sitting in the class, there is no teachers to teach those kids, and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 34

they are all black children. So, where we come from, there's no future. The question is what concrete steps ...

[Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members, you are not helping the Minister. She is trying her best to listen to the question. Order! Minister Majodina, can you please be in order! Hon member, please ask your question before your time is up.

Mr V G REDDY: ... What concrete steps have you taken to address this crisis particularly of the future of a black child? What real progress has been made to make sure that black children receive the education that they are entitled to.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Speaker. Hon Reddy is right about one thing and that is simply that in the 30 years that we have had a democratic government, we are not anywhere near where we should be when it comes to the level of education, particularly for poor black children. We have to admit that, because if we admit that, then we start to improve. So, you ask? No, no, no, no, no. Please allow me...

[Interjections.] ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 35

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members, your member asked the question the Minister is responding. You can't be the one disrupting the Minister.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: ... the point I am trying to make is that once we acknowledge that we are nowhere near where we should be, then we can start to fix the problem. And I agree with you, it is predominantly poor black children who have had not good quality education.

So, in the two months that I have been a Minister in the GNU is as follows. Firstly, I have set priorities of making sure that literacy and numeracy rates are increased. I want to assure members of the House that we are working day and night to make sure that we turn around the lot of poor black children in this country so that they can be active participants in the economy. That is an obsession of mine, and I can assure you that is happening.

I also want to address this issue, it was part of the question but not really, but I want to address it quickly when I have time. It is about the dismissing of teachers. Hon member, we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 36

are not going to fire teachers and as a leader, I would ask you to be careful with your words because it is important that we do not mislead the public. There is a big fiscal problem and the crisis in South Africa where we have to look at how we can help the provinces to retain the current basket of posts that they have. We have not sacked any teachers, hon member.

All I am saying is that it is important that you as a public leader do not mislead the public, because people expect you to inform them properly. And if we have people in this House who mislead the public, then we have a tough lot. No 2000 teachers have been fired; we have to get that right. The point is that we are engaging Treasury. We are engaging Treasury collections to support provinces... [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time is up. Hon Reddy, at the time you raised a point of order, the Minister's time had already been concluded. So, what is the point of order?

Mr V G REDDY: The point of order is that speakers should address you as the Speaker. The Minister there is directly addressing me directly me unless she wants to make me the Speaker?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 37

The SPEAKER: Hon Reddy, I am very glad that you raised this question, because you were the first to ask it. So, I think that the next time we raise a point of order, when the shoe pinches, we have to remember that we started it. So, when all of us respond, we must address the Chair. But obviously, when Ministers reply to questions, they reply to questions put by hon members. Let's not talk to the camera, because unfortunately sometimes the camera doesn't do it well for us.

Dr W J BOSHOFF: Hon Speaker, thank you and through you to the Minister. I realise and recognise that these closing down of schools you used another word is not arbitrary, and that it is according to certain standards. But I believe for the previous 120 years there has always been this tension between communities and the state. It's easier for the department manage less, bigger schools and communities want their children near their family home as long as possible. I want to know if you are prepared to reconsider these standards completely and coherently, considering not only school management considerations, but also the psychological and educational well-being of the child as a whole? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 38

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I almost addressed hon Boshoff, but I'm worried about hon Reddy. Hon Boshoff is absolutely correct that there is often tension in communities between the state and communities, because communities are attached to their schools. In fact, the very village where I come from KwamDingi, had a school when I was there growing up and that school has since been closed down. And people seem to think that now that I am the Minister, I can get it rebuilt. But the problem is that if there are five children who are now going to that school, you can't keep it going. I am not even concerned about the financial or fiscal reality of keeping a school like that going.

The point is the quality of the education can never be quite the same. Yes, we have a responsibility as a department to consult the public when we are doing rationalisations or closing or merging of schools. We have to consult the communities. We cannot deal arbitrarily with the administration, because these are public goods. They belong to the municipalities. But we also have a responsibility to let the communities know why we need to rationalise and how it is, if your child lives in this village, he will be taken to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 39

next one. If we take children to the next village, do we have scholar transportation to take them there? Are there roads in these villages where transportation is possible? So, it's complex, but it's doable. And I understand the point of having to consult the communities.

Mr W M THRING: Thank you, hon Speaker. Minister, in the last administration, the ACDP vociferously opposed the closing down of rural schools. One of those being the Siyaxhuka Primary School in the Western Cape. Our former member hon Suckers argued that the closing of farm schools was in direct contradiction to rural development strategies and highlights the lack of research conducted possibly by the department. Minister, state capture corruption, incompetence, maladministration has resulted in austerity measures which are crowding out education needs. Economic, social, mental, psychological well-being of the child or learner must be prioritised over departmental policy.

Has the department conducted social economic assessments and or psychosocial impact studies on the effect of the closure of rural schools on the learner on families, communities in our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 40

rural areas, in particular? If yes, what are the results if not? Why not? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon Speaker, the member is absolutely right that there has been as I have been saying, a process of closing down some schools and rural schools because again, remember my responsibility does not only just lie in having bricks and mortar, but it also lies in making sure that the quality of the education at the school is the right one. So, you have got to balance those two things. If there is a farm school that is not meeting targets and that is not providing quality education, we have to redirect the kids to a place where they can get good education.

What is needed then, however, is consultation with the parents of the school, with the school governing body, SGBs, so that we can tell the people this is the reason. My criticism of government processes is that sometimes they can be disconnected from the communities they serve. And I agree with you that one of the things we should do in this process is to really consult the communities. But I also appeal to communities to understand that where schools are no longer viable, we have to consider the interests of the learners. And

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 41

even if there are five or ten, I am still responsible for them. And I have to get them to the closest place where they can get the best education we can offer. Thank you.

Mr M A MAIMANE: Thank you, Speaker. Minister, in understanding this problem, and I hear your point about rationalisations and the closing down of certain schools. My fundamental question speaks to this; Firstly, the correlating problem is that - As Stats SA has already indicated that net in immigration into metros is increasing, which begs the question, given the fiscal constraint that we are facing, what urgent interventions are you putting in place to ensure that we don't increase classroom populations and teacher ratios in urban centres as a correction to that issue?

And on the second, when we are leaving public infrastructure and rural communities, how are we ensuring that those schools and buildings are repurposed for interventions like early childhood development, ECDs, given the lack of and the shortage that we find, particularly in the Eastern Cape?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you very much, hon member. As I indicated early, you are absolutely right. The metros are where they are feeling the pressure the most. The

Gauteng MEC will tell you that his problems are many when it comes to January during admission time because people are moving where economic opportunities are. So, the point I am making is that government cannot keep doing things the same way that it has always done. We have got to be responsive in our budgeting. If we are saying look, we have got to take money here so that we can respond to a need in the metro government or in a metro area, then that is what we have to do.

I am also quite pleased with what Gauteng has also started to do where they are building mobile classrooms, additional classrooms so that we can make sure that we don't have overcrowding. But I agree with you on this, we cannot compromise on the quality of teaching by having overcrowded classrooms. That is why, as the Department of Basic Education, we need to figure out how can we support provinces like the Western Cape, KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng, where we have an influx into these areas and into these metropolitan areas. To ensure that we support you to provide the infrastructure quickly so that if you tell me that you have 50 extra pupils in school and there is no way of accommodating them without overcrowding a classroom?

How then do we ensure that we build quickly to accommodate these students, because the teacher to student ratio is an important factor when it comes to delivering quality education. With a comprehensive approach, we will not increase our literacy rate. When classrooms are overcrowded, you can't expect teachers to teach 50 children and expect good marks. So, we need to respond, just as we have done with migration and immigration happens, we also need to make sure that the budget process responds to it.

Question 114:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Thank you, Speaker. The NSFAS has to date pay it over R1,9 billion towards student accommodation, for both universities and TVET students. The administrator has also paid all legitimate invoices from the landlords, and on time, as of August 2024, to prevent any evictions. So, as far as we know, there will be no evictions of any student, especially in those accommodations where they met the requirements, and they had legitimate invoices.

However, what I must also emphasise is that the NSFAS team, as we speak, are engaged in roadshows. They are actually in

Gauteng now, meeting with all the accommodation providers to try and resolve whatever issues that they may have. This was a pilot project, which had a lifespan. We will obviously review the rollout of that pilot project and the lessons that have been learned in this regard.

However, some of the proposals that are coming up from the administrator, include, ensuring that we put in place a system to manage the identification of accommodation providers, the placement of students, but also the payment of those accommodation providers, so that we avoid some of the glitches that we had experienced. Thank you, hon member.

On the second part of the question, the Special investigation Unit will continue with any investigations relating to the NSFAS, as per the proclamation, and these investigations will not in any way impact on students' welfare and safety in any manner. Thank you.

Mr W T LETSIE: Thank you very much, Speaker.

Sesotho:

Ho na le maloko a matjha a mangata ka mona!

English:

Deputy Minister, thank you for your response. Last year, the NSFAS paid just over R14 billion in student accommodation. In your answer, in September, you are saying that the NSFAS has just paid about R1,9 billion, which is very little compared to last year, and the academic student accommodation calendar ends next month. For us, this is a clear indication that these student accommodation providers, in general, and small business in particular, are correct that they have been frustrated by lack of payments in some instances, and wrong amounts of payments on other instances.

Noting that small businesses are economic drivers for any economy, and the anxiety that these students are going through because of the NSFAS's nonpayments, it means that they can be threatened every week and every month with evictions. What can you say to these students and landlords going through what I have just mentioned above? Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Thank you, Speaker.

The R1,9 billion you refer to is not the overall amount paid by the NSFAS in terms of student accommodation. It relates to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 46

the amounts paid to accommodation private providers, because this question was relating specifically to private providers. The other accommodation is paid directly to universities and TVET colleges and so on and so forth. So that is the first point.

The second point is that any of the accommodation providers who have got issues of payment, they should deal with the NSFAS relating to that. As I said, the NSFAS is busy with roadshows, and I think the accommodation providers are aware where they can meet the NSFAS for them to raise these issues.

I fully also agree with you that there is a lot of local economic activity that happens, where in people have opened up their homes and are renting those out to students. So, it is an injection into the local economy and that is why we want to make sure that this works, but we also have to comply with certain rules.

So, if an accommodation provider is going to provide accommodation, they have to comply with the requirements of the NSFAS, the specifications of the room, and so on and so forth. But I think more importantly, they have to have proper

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 47

documentation for them to be paid. Otherwise, the Auditor-General will be on our case in in this regard.

So those type of things are the ones that have essentially caused delays. On the delays that were caused by communication between universities, TVET colleges and the NSFAS, we seem to think that we have been able to handle them. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Thank you again, Minister, for your response. I just want to find out - because the reality is that many students have dropped out due to lack of payment to landlords and provisions of food: What measures have you taken to try to quantify the numbers of these students; in the interim, what consequences are there for those involved, leading up to this disaster; and what action has been taken against service providers responsible for the payment system to these students? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Thank you. We don't know how many students have dropped out. That is for this academic year. I mean, the academic year is still in progress, and even if they have dropped out, we don't know if it is

related to student accommodation. I think once we consolidate the numbers for the academic year 2024, we will know how many students registered, and how many of those completed. So, I think it would be futile for us to speculate those numbers as yet.

Secondly, as I said, this was a pilot project: We have learned our lessons in terms of how this was run; and there are interesting recommendations that are coming from the NSFAS, as an administrator, in terms of how we should handle the question of student accommodation moving forward, including considering building internal capacity in the NSFAS to be able to handle this. However, I think it is part of the discussions, not only with universities but also with the accommodation providers themselves, in terms of the lessons that we have learned and how we can improve this. Thank you.

Mr M SHIKWAMBANA: Thank you, Deputy Minister. In light of the fact that the NSFAS has appointed 39 service providers to assist with the accreditation of the students' accommodation, and they have admitted that the value being derived from those services is at best questionable: Why not let the TVET colleges and universities perform their own student's

accommodation accreditation processes, because they are already doing these things, to save the taxpayers' money? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Just as with any pilot project, we learn lessons and I think let's get the lessons from this pilot. However, what I can assure the House is that we have not taken away completely the right of universities and TVET colleges to also participate in the process. They have got their own accommodations, and they have also had their own systems that have been there for years. I think the bigger problem now is only that we have centralised the problem with the NSFAS.

So, some of these problems have already always been there, even though the administration was at university level. There have been complaints around corruption. There have been complaints about the kind of student accommodation that students are placed in, which meant that we had to take action as to prevent that from taking place. That is why we instituted this pilot project. Let us learn lessons from them. I think we will obviously listen to any views as it relates to

what we have learned and what needs to be done to move forward. Thank you.

Ms B E MACHI: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Minister, given the fact that the NSFAS will be responsible for accrediting private accommodation: What specific clauses or provisions, as the NSFAS, did you include in the lease agreements to protect students from evictions in the event of delays or consequences by the NSFAS? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Thank you. I am not certain about specific clauses in the in the contracts that protect students from eviction. However, what NSFAS does is to guarantee the landlord that upon granting this student accommodation, we will pay on behalf of the student, or that we will pay the student so that the student pays you.

In instances where landlords have threatened to evict students, for instance, in Sol Plaatjie, where I was about two weeks ago, we engaged with the landlords. We realised or we found out that some of the problems were administrative problems, which they were on their side required to comply, to furnish information to the university and to the NSFAS, so

that payments are made. So, I am not certain if there is a specific clause there. It is something that we can check and then get back to you on that. Thank you.

Question 105:

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the hon Mashabela, she's not here ... [Interjections.] ...

IsiXhosa:

... ungavuya ...

English:

... unfortunately, hon Mashabela raises an important point, and I must make a quick reflection, that as South Africans are financially stretched more and more, being able to afford something as basic as a uniform can be very tough for families. But at the same time, we have to look at it from a departmental point of view, where the R330 billion we have is for the core business of the department. The core business of the department is to ensure that we deliver quality learning and teaching, but we find ourselves having to do a lot more because we constantly say this is not our core business,

therefore, we are not going to be responsive. So, the issue around school uniforms is a problematic one, but there have been interventions. While we are unable to provide school uniforms in schools, there have been interventions that we've done, because we're not blind to these challenges. So, in 2020, both the department and the Competition Commission recognised the concerning practice by many schools that were signing exclusive supplier agreements with pre-selected suppliers of school uniforms. That was driving up the price, and these agreements entered without transparent or competitive bidding processes remained in force for between 10 to 15 years.

So, the department has released a circular, which requires school governing bodies, SGBs, to adhere to the following guidelines. Number one is to ensure that school uniforms are as generic as possible, so they can be obtained from as many suppliers as possible. Exclusivity should be limited to school items the school regards as necessary, but we keep it as generic as possible. Schools must follow a competitive bidding process when appointing suppliers, and schools should appoint more than one supplier to give parents more options because more options mean better competition, and you can then manage

the prices. Agreements should be concluded with suppliers and should run for a limited duration.

So, the point I'm making is that while we are unable to provide schools and children with school uniforms because we wouldn't be able to have the money to do that we have intervened. After all, we understand that we can't allow uncompetitive processes that exclude more and more learners. So, what we've done is to say, well, the Competition Commission has assisted us in drawing up these guidelines so that we can make sure that schools are not running rackets where school uniforms are completely unaffordable for people. So, we keep it generic, we keep it competitive, so we can keep the prices as low as possible. Thank you, Speaker.

IsiZulu:

Nk H O MKHALIPHI: Ngqongqoshe, manje le mihlahlandlela uzoyisebenzisa nini ngoba la sikhuluma ngabantu abahluphekayo? Ungahle ukwazi lokho ukuthi ...

English:

... the SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, is providing such help that you are asking from your department as an

intervention, but the problem is that Sassa does not even have a joint programme with your department, because at the end of the day, ...

IsiZulu:

... abantwana abahluphekile abathembele kusibonelelelo sikaHulumeni kufuneka baye bayoziveza kwa-Sassa bakhombise futhi baveze ubumpofu babo ...

English:

... instead of Sassa and your department having a joint programme to say, because you are here on the database of Sassa ...

IsiZulu:

... siyazi ukuthi udinga umfaniswano wesikole bese niyangenelela ngesizotha.

English:

Thank you.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Deputy Speaker, ...

IsiXhosa:

... ndiyaliva ilungu elihloniphekileyo kwaye linyanisile xa lisithi asifuni ukuba abantu babhentsise intlupheko yabantwana ezikolweni. Ngenene iyabachaphazela abantwana xa besiya esikolweni bezazi ukuba abanayo iyunifomu kuba babonakala behlelelekile. Ngoko ke ndiyaluva uluvo lwakho ...

English:

... maybe it's a point we can explore ...

IsiXhosa:

... ukuba singancedisana njani na, kodwa njengoko benditshilo ukuba le migaqo kudala ikhona, yayiqale ngama2020 ...

English:

... between the Department of Basic Education and the Competition Commission.

IsiXhosa:

Kudala, iyunifomu zezikolo zazifumaneka kwiindawo ezikhethekileyo kuphela ...

English:

... so exclusive that you can only buy that school uniform from a particular supplier, and that supplier knows that and, therefore, would hike the price. So, we are saying ...

IsiXhosa:

... le migaqo ibalulekile kuba yenza iiyunifomu zezikolo zifane, ukwazi ukuthenga noba kuphi na. Kodwa ke, ndiyasiva isiphakamiso sakho esithi mhlawumbi eli sebe lethu lingasebenzisana neArhente yoKhuseleko lwezeNtlalo yaseMzantsi Afrika kuquka neSebe loPhuhliso loLuntu, sibone ukuba singenza kanjani. UMphathhiswa uTolashe ukhona naye ulapha, umamele singakwazi ukuthethathethana, sibone ukuba singenza kanjani.

Setswana:

Rre S T D LOUW: Ke tseye tšhono go leboga Motlatsammusakgotla wa Kokoanotheomolao ya Bosetšhaba.

English:

Minister, poor learners can have challenges in having adequate school uniforms, hence, campaigns for school shoes and uniforms are still prevalent in our communities due to the need of the poor. What programmes does the department

implement to ensure all school learners have adequate school shoes and uniforms from the department? Thanks.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Deputy Speaker, thank you, and as I said to hon Mkhalihi via hon Mashabela is that, yes, I understand that we are in a difficult financial position, anyone in South Africa right now will tell you that they are backed up against the wall financially. And so, you are right, many corporate partners that are coming on board and saying they will raise funds for school shoes and the like. And so, hon member, I think ...

IsiXhosa:

... into ebalulekileyo xa sijonga ezi ngxaki sinazo kufuneka siyazi ukuba ezi-R330 billion soze zenze zonke izinto esizingwenelayo, ezifana nokwakha iibhlorho, ukwakha izindlu zangasese nokukuthenga iincwadi zokufundisa (textbooks). Kufuneka sikhangele ukuba singaqala ngezphi na.

English:

In our prioritisation, we also need to say how do we involve other partners, the private sector, and how we include social partners, ...

IsiXhosa:

... aza kusincedisa kwaba bantwana bahlelelekileyo ...

English:

... with school shoes, with school uniforms because ...

IsiXhosa:

... kubalulekile, njengoko ohloniphekileyo uMkhaliphi eyichaphazele into yokuba, akulunganga ukusoloko ubhentsisa ubuhlwempu babantwana kwabanye esikolweni kuba iyabachaphazela loo nto ekuzithembeni. Kodwa ke ...

English:

... it doesn't mean private partners don't have a role to play. And private partners having a role to play in these campaigns is not nice to have. We all have a responsibility to build this country. And in doing so, we have a responsibility to invest in our education system. So, we will do what we can, but I also implore partners to come on board and assist us where we cannot afford to do so.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 59

Ms D C CHRISTIANS: Deputy Speaker, Minister, given that the full subsidisation of school uniforms in no-fee schools is primarily overseen by the Department of Social Development, through Sassa, as we have already heard. How is the Department of Basic Education collaborating then with the Department of Social Development to ensure that the needs of all learners are fully met? And specifically, what steps are being taken to expand current subsidies? And what have been your talks with the Department of Social Development with regard to including critical items such as shoes and winter clothing, which are essential for learners' comfort and dignity?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Christians, yes, you raise an important point also in that we have to work, and I've been saying this, it's important that we work across the government departments. We can't afford to work in silos anymore, and one of the key takeaways, I think, for me, from this sitting and question and answer, has been the suggestion that I've received from members around working with Minister Tolashe much more closely, so that we can make sure that the information in the database that she has is linked to what we have and is linked to where we know we have no-fee schools, so we can better support our learners.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 60

One of the things we have tried to do is to make sure that we keep the uniforms as generic as possible so that more and more people can afford to do so. But I take the point, and I think the Minister and I, and I'm glad that she's here, I think now we've got some homework for her and me to do to see how we can collaborate better as these two departments.

Thank you.

Ms D E JAMES: Deputy Speaker, leave no one behind, they say when in our communities there's hundreds of learners being left behind. Minister, I want to ask how inclusive the no-fee paying offering all basic educational needs, such as stationery? You highlighted earlier that sometimes the meal that they receive at school is the only meal that they are getting. So how do we expect parents to pay for stationery? I want to bring to your attention that a child that is not in the classroom is learning how to cock a gun and how to use drugs in the community. What are we doing as a government to ensure our learners and children remain connected to education? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 61

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Before I hand over to the hon Minister, hon members, in terms of the Rules, the follow-up question must be related to the first question asked. Now, this is not about a school uniform. This was about stationary, but it is up to the Minister if she wishes to respond. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Deputy Speaker, yes, I will respond because the member raises an important point about how we keep learners in school. And I do also want to, once again, throw this back to members as leaders in our society that you need to help us. We know that the throughput rate is not going as well as it should be. We know that there are learners who start Grade 1 and Grade R and don't necessarily finish Grade 12. And so, one of the things that I've said in my term in office is to say, well, let's not just only focus and put an overemphasis on matric results. Let us also see where we are losing learners, and where we are losing learners, we have to have targeted approaches to make sure that we are supporting them to stay in school. But we have to work with communities, parents, and political leaders like yourselves, to show us where some of these things are going wrong.

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 62

In terms of stationery that you raised; the good news is that the department has learned over the years some very harsh lessons. You remember the crisis of textbooks many years ago, and the systems have been done well in that we've got a delivery of textbooks and workbooks that are sitting at over 90%. I would love to see that sitting at 100%, knowing that every single kid in school has textbooks and workbooks. But we're working hard.

And I think coming from where the department came from, if you remember the textbook scandal where kids were sitting without textbooks long into the school year, I think we're moving in the right direction in ensuring that basic stationery is provided, basic workbooks are provided, so that, again, regardless of where you are, whether you are in Pofadder or you're in Sandton, you still have access to good quality education. Thank you.

Question 69:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Deputy Speaker, there is currently no cap on student accommodation for the Technical and Vocational Education and Training, TVET, students funded by the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS. All

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 63

students, university or TVET are receiving the same allowance. Thank you.

Ms B E MACHI: Hon Deputy Minister, beyond accommodation what other factors have been identified as contribution to the challenges to TVET students face in assessing quality education? How does the department plan to address these with accommodation cap issue? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Like I said, Deputy Speaker, there is no cap on TVET college students. All students are paid an equal amount for accommodation allowance, whether university or TVET college. So, the question does not stand. Thank you.

Ms F HASSAN: Deputy Minister, just as a follow up, what is the plan of the department to increase public investment in the development of student accommodation, as the accommodation provided by institutions of higher learning is often more affordable, safer and includes better utilities relative to other private providers? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 64

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Firstly, there is the Student Housing Infrastructure Programme, SHIP, in which our department together with the Development Bank and Treasury investing billions of rands into student accommodation that is based on campuses. Secondly, is that there has been collaboration between public institutions and private providers to jointly construct student accommodation. So, those are the two major interventions.

We have seen over the last 10 to 15 years a huge growth in public investment as it relates to student accommodation. However, what we have also seen is that the centralisation of the accommodation process have led to private sector investing in and showing interest in working together with the TVET colleges and universities towards building student accommodation. Our idea is that which investments studies at a TVET college or at a higher education institution university, should be able to have accommodation that is decent - and I think there are guidelines to that effect - or should be staying within reasonable walking distance towards their school or public transport distance towards their school. That is our ultimate goal. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 65

Mrs D VAN DER WALT: Deputy Minister, you say you want to promote vocational education at TVET colleges, but we treat these colleges as stepchildren. Considering that NSFAS accommodation allowances are capped at R50,000 per year for living in tertiary residences in metro areas and only R41,000 for all other areas.

The NSFAS head office occupies prime space on five floors in a building on the Cape Town foreshore at the rental of R2,4 million a month. The management sits on the 20th floor with a panoramic view of Table Bay. I am sure the Deputy Minister would agree that excessive expenditure for the NSFAS management should be capped and the money put towards increasing grants to students. If so, how will you cap it and from when? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Deputy Minister, it was still part of the much broader question. You may proceed.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Thank you, but there is obviously some new element of that. Nevertheless, we will try and see how far we respond to that. Firstly, that is the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 66

cap that exists. The cap that is imposed on all accommodation providers in the urban and in the rural.

There had to be special dispensation for the accommodation providers in the urban area. The reason being that the cost in metros such as Cape Town; Johannesburg; Pretoria; Port Elizabeth, PE; and so forth, the cost of accommodation in those areas are expensive or higher. However, even then we had to find a way of regulating the expense because we have a strong suspicion that the accommodation providers were colluding in order to hike prices so that we, as the state, should pay more for accommodation.

So, the fact that it is the state that pays does not necessarily give anybody the right to overcharge. We suspected that that is the case. It was not only the private provider it was some of the institutions who were charging. So, we had to cap because we are the buyer as the state hence we had to determine the cost. It doesn't only apply to TVET college students it also applies to university students. Therefore, there is no treatment of TVET college students as a second cousin or twice removed. Everybody is in the same basket. Uh, yea. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 67

Xitsonga:

Tat M SHIKWAMBANA: Ndza khensa, Xandla xa Xipikara.

English:

Deputy Minister, students do not have accommodation and they are also not funded by NSFAS. We have over 90 000 appeals stuck at the NSFAS offices. Can you, please, tell the House what the main cause of this delays is to process the appeals of the student? When will these appeals be processed because the students are struggling to rent accommodation as we speak now, and they are not funded by NSFAS? Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: I think for the question we can provide details, definitely the 90 is a wrong number. We were with the members at the NSFAS. Yes, appeals were a problem in terms of being cleared but it was not 90 000. Nevertheless, we will give the hon member updated numbers because when we were all there at the NSFAS the administrator made a commitment that at a certain period all those appeals would have been cleared. So, we will give the hon member the updated figures.

Our hope is that all appeals would have been finalised. The system that we are putting in place now - and I know it is related to a later question but I think I should address it now - is in such a way that we want to finalise all funding decisions by December 2024 so that by 2025 when the academic year start every student knows whether they are funded or not so that they go and report at the university or the TVET college. Thank you.

Question 121:

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Chairlady, there are two incidents that happened in Themba Hospital. The first incident happened in April 2024, whereby certain people invaded the hospital, demanding contracts in the form of tenders. They even met the hospital board. Following that incidence, the Minister of Health, Mpumalanga Premier, Member of Executive Council, MEC, for Health, Mpumalanga Province Commissioner of SA Police Service, SAPS. All visited Themba Hospital for intervention and a security assessment was done.

The recommendations of those assessments were implemented as follows: One, the hospital put up improved security infrastructure and security systems, which include close

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 69

circuit television, CCTV, cameras, spikes, boom gates and even security turns around the doctor's quarters, and secondly; the alleged perpetrators were interdicted from entering the hospital.

The second incident was not necessarily a direct attack, at the hospital. But it was gang of criminals fighting and shooting each other somewhere in the community. When one of them got injured, they all took him to hospital. But because they were heavily armed. The hospital staff was clearly intimidated. After this second incident, Mpumalanga Department of Health complained to the Department of Community Safety, Security and Liaison, which is the department that issues security tenders in Mpumalanga.

And after that complaint, this tender was terminated, and a new company was chosen which also includes a tactical response team inside it. And SAPS, South African Police Service started conducting patrols around Themba Hospital, but SAPS is also establishing investigation team to investigate all reported cases in Themba.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 70

But all in all, for the whole country in strengthening intergovernmental relations, the National Department of Health has entered into a memorandum of agreement with South African Police Service to strengthen security in all health facilities.

Additionally, safety and security are one of the non-negotiables programs of the National Health Council. In this regard the Minister has appointed a ministerial task team for safety and security in all public facilities. The purpose of this task team is to assess effectiveness of security measures and make recommendation. And this task team consists of South African Police Service, state security, Private Security Industry Regulatory Authority, Department of Home Affairs and the Department of Employment of Labour.

This task team meets regularly to monitor the implementation of the recommendations to assist provinces with any requirements of security intervention. Thank you.

Siswati:

Mk F L SHABANGU: Asibonge Lisekela Lasomlomo, Mhlonishwa, Mphatsiswa weTemphilo, kunaletingcinamba tona leti lotibikako.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 71

Kunetibhedlela nemitfolamphilo lekwenta kahle emisebentini yayo, ibonakele isibonelo lesihle ekulweni nobe ekuvaleni ligebe kutekuphepha. Manje Ngcongchoshe, sicela kubuta kutsi letikhungo tetemphilo tikwenta njani kutsi titfole nobe tibe sezingeni lelikahle, tingehli kulelizinga lato? Ngiyabonga.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yeah, the modus operandi of the task team, that I've alluded to, as I said, is to assess security in various hospitals. But in the process also to learn good practices from elsewhere. Now, those hospitals that are doing very well because they have passed standard compliance from the Office of Health Standard Compliance, because they put very good security features. The team will obviously learn there and advise the other hospitals that have got security problems, to learn from them and implement similar standards. Thank you very much.

Dr K W D LE ROUX: Thank Deputy Speaker and thank you Minister. Minister, in the light of the debate held yesterday about the threats that acts of extortion hold to all South Africans, including healthcare workers. And in the light of the several incidents of violence, extortion that we have had on the

grounds of Themba Hospital in Mpumalanga, over the past six months.

Could you please answer the following: Have any charges been laid against the businessman who was interdicted from entering the grounds of Themba Hospital after the incident in April and who on Sunday the 11th of April in violation of the court order and the court interdict, entered into the grounds with the firearm and force doctors and nurses to attend to a family member at gunpoint? And if not, why not? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon member, you will appreciate that that's the work which must be done by SAPS, As part of this team. In my first response, I said SAPS has also established an investigation team, to investigate all reported cases at Themba Hospital. that will include the cases you have mentioned, and we are waiting for them to give a report. Thank you.

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: Deputy speaker, and I'll take the question on behalf of Thembekwayo. Minister...

IsiXhosa:

...esi sibhedlele siye savalwa...

English:

... for three weeks.

IsiXhosa:

Abantu bakwaBhokweni...

English:

...are very far from Rob Ferreira. They are very far from Lekazi, Kanyamazane clinic, which operates for 24 hours.

But...

IsiXhosa:

...iinqwelo zezigulane khange nizikhuphe...

English:

...as a temporal measure so that...

IsiXhosa:

...abantu bakwaBhokweni...

English:

... can go somewhere for medical care and...

IsiXhosa:

...izigulane ebezilinde ukunyangwa kwesa sibhedlele
azikwazanga ukuba ziqhubeleke zifumane olo nyango.

English:

What have you done for the people...

IsiXhosa:

...abangakwazanga ukufumana amayeza...

English:

... that they receive monthly from ...

IsiXhosa:

...kwesa sibhedlele? Kuza kwenziwa ntoni ngaba bantu nezi
zigulana zonke zilindele unyango?

English:

What are the measures that are in place and are you going to
provide additional ambulances so that...

IsiXhosa:

...abantu bakaBhokweni...

English:

... that feel unsafe, still go to Rob Ferrera and Kanyamazane?

Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon member, I am not aware of any

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I have not yet recognised you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yeah, that is called ... no, that's called the exercise power, because some people exercise power. Hon member, I'm not really aware of a hospital that was closed for three weeks. But obviously any hospital in the country that can provide a particular service, we can't just turn people away, they've got to be referred somewhere.

Now, I am not aware of the facts that you were mentioning.

I'll have to go and ascertain them. Because I had a very long discussion with the MEC for Health in Mpumalanga, this very

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 76

afternoon and those issues were not brought to my attention. But I'll go and look for them. Thank you.

Mr S N SWART: Deputy Speaker, arising from your response, hon Minister, the ACDP strongly condemns these acts of violence at our hospitals, and we are pleased that your response or the interventions that has been taken place to try to prevent such occurrences at Themba Hospital and in fact at hospitals against the country. Minister, you indicated that SAPS has established a task team and are busy investigating these matters.

Can you advise the House that the many of the witnesses which would be medical personnel, are receiving sufficient protection from any act of intimidation against them, because many witnesses and whistleblowers for that fact, feel intimidated and do not want to give statements to the police, thus inhibiting the police investigations? Thank you so much.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon member, we also feel very angry about incidents like this, and we want every South African to feel angry. Because when you go to hospital, you don't expect, to experience things like these. Nobody wants to experience

that. So, we want the police to work very hard around the clock. That's why the task team includes even state security. We're including even private security industry, so that we work together as a nation to make sure that we nip this in the bud.

I do hear a lot about people being scared to whistle blow because they believe that whistleblowers are not protected. I I'm not sure, to what extent this question can be generalized. I was in Home Affairs for many years. We depended on whistleblowers every single day, and people were coming forward to whistle blow even when 10 days before the elections. We called Special Investigating Unit, SIU, to go and raid all the refugee reception centres. It was after a whistleblower who gave us a detailed account of what's happening? And so, whistleblowers will always be there. I know some get intimidated, but South Africans don't want corruption, so they'll always whistle blow. And I've got confidence in them. Thank you very much.

Question 139:

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 78

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHEKATHI: Ngokuzithoba okukhulu mangibonge kuwe Sekela Somlomo, ngibonge kakhulu ngombuzo.

English:

It must be noted that the Government of National Unity in the 7th administration is constituted into three distinct and autonomous spheres like it was the case in 1994. The matter that the hon member has raised falls within the sphere of the provincial government and in this case, under Gauteng government. The Constitution is clear on this matter.

Rule 1345(b) states that "questions asked must relate to matters for which Cabinet members are officially responsible for." However, currently there are 12 public treatment centres in the country. The department has ensured that at least each province has one public treatment centre, something that did not exist before the democratic dispensation. To date, the department has registered 232 NPOs owned treatment centres subsidised by provinces and more than 60 privately-owned treatment centres in the country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 79

Furthermore, the Prevention of and Treatment for Substance Abuse Act of 70 of 2008 makes provision for the establishment of community-based treatment services. The purpose of the community-based centres is to increase access to treatment services at the local level in order to meet the demand for treatment services. The department continues to capacitate communities to establish community-based treatment services in order to expand such services. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Mr A SAULS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I have no supplementary question. Thank you.

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: Yes, Deputy Speaker, I need your guidance. Since the follow-up questions are under your guidance as the determination, when a person says they don't have follow up. Can't you give it to a party that is interested in following up? Because you decided they must follow up, they are forfeiting their slot. Can't that slot be taken by any of the parties that are not on your determination? Please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, I do refer you to the changes in the Rules where in the past when an opportunity wasn't

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 80

taken, other members could take it, but the Rules were changed. So, we only have those questions allocated which have been signed off by the Speaker. You can take that to the programming hon member. We now go to the next follow-up question, hon Makgato. Order, members!

Ms M P MAKGATO: Thank you, Madam Speaker, how does the department respond to the feedback from staff, patients and their families integrated to inform the rehabilitation centre's programmes, and also the financial allocation and other requirements interventions? I thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, the Department of Social Development has adopted and implemented the universal treatment curriculum in all public treatment centres to ensure that services provided are of good quality and in line with this international demand. That will be my response, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you very much. What's your problem?

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Thank you ever so much, House Chair, hon Minister, in light of the fact that five non-profit drug rehabilitation centres were recently notified that they are

not going to receive funding for the year 2024-25 because they are under investigation. These rehabs accounted for about 246 of the provinces, 571 state funded beds. The question is whether your department has placed 127 patients who ultimately have no space on the new rehab facility. Also, what are the details of the allegations of the investigations of those five non-profit drug rehabs? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, as I've said earlier on, majority of these issues that in hon members are asking are more of provincial competence, as they have received their own budgets for them to run this. Where there are problems, we wish hon members can send these questions to the relevant departments in provinces, because even with the IGR, I have no responsibility to respond on behalf of provincial legislation, because they've got their own systems, their own priorities as well they implement the way they think fit to do so. As such, I can't respond to the question hon Speaker. I thank you.

Mr P A VAN STADEN: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, hon Minister, many NPOs in Gauteng are experiencing the problem of provincial department but their funds should have been

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 82

dispersed to them seven days after the department received the signed agreement back. Some NPOs did receive their funds, but others may have to close their doors because funds were not disbursed. Some may have to go to court to intervene in these matters. Can the Minister indicate to this House what were the reasons why the provincial department have defunded these NPOs? How many NPOs have taken the provincial department to court to get their funds and what measurements have her department put in place to see to it that these sorts of practices across Africa do not happen again. Thank you, Deputy speaker.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, because the question is very consistent. I would have to go and find more information about what exactly is transpiring in holding on the matter of funding and nonfunding of the NPOs. From where I'm standing now, I don't have such a detail. Thank you so much.

Question 92:

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Deputy Speaker let me start by correcting something that is grossly wrong in the question. The National Health Insurance, NHI, never made any proposal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 83

whereby each South African will be provided with the same quality health care only under private health care as your question suggests.

What the NHI proposes is that all health facilities, public and private, must be accessible to all South Africans if and when their health demands it. This must obviously be done in an affordable manner.

Now, let me deal with this claim of R1,3 trillion. You are aware, hon members, that R1,3 trillion is the total budget of the government. The publication of this number is disingenuous and deliberately circulated to anger the public because it will sound crazy for the state to introduce a health financing system that will cost the same or even more than the total budget of the country.

I have described this calculation in certain terms, and I want to repeat it here. I said the person who did it was practicing mathematical hooliganism because of the way it was calculated. It is mathematical trickery; you are tricking people. For those who don't understand, it is similar to if a Minister of housing stands up and say all South Africans need to have

shelter. No body can challenge that. Then somebody goes to Sandton or Bantry Bay here and take the most expensive house in which a billionaire lives and multiply it by 61 million people and say this is what the Minister is proposing on the housing of South Africans. That is exactly what has happened here, and that is why I call it mathematical hooliganism. The person who made this calculation is obviously an interested party because they are making a lot of money from health care by being a medical aid. This is wrong.

This calculation also makes a very wrong assumption that we are going to abandon all public clinics, all health centres, all ordinary hospitals, all academic hospitals and general practitioners and go only to private hospitals. How possible is that?

Your last question is on the impact this calculation will have on tax payers. I cannot, in my right senses, investigate an impact about something that does not exist and will not exist. Thank you.

Mrs M O CLARKE: Deputy Speaker, to the Minister, surely you have to get the same health care no matter if it is under

public or private hospital in terms of the Constitution, and I am sure if you look at that, that is what everybody would want because that is what NHI sparks. We will get the same quality health care in a public hospital, and it should be universal to everybody, and you are saying today that is not the case. So, maybe you can answer the following for me, Minister.

Can the Minister please advise what the cost of the massive NHI roadshow was, both in total and per region, the specifics of its funding within the department's budget - this would be detailed as a specific project funding related to the NHI initiative. Can the Minister also please advise us under which section the budget was used, why were many civil society groupings and private medical stakeholders not included in the current roadshow? One would think the decision would be guided by the government's strategic objectives to achieve a broader consultation announced in the state of the nation address by the President. This exclusion however has raised concerns around transparency. Minister, your dismissal of valid concerns around the NHI is very concerning. I thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon member, I want you to listen to what I am saying and not to what you want to hear. I never

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 86

said people are not going to receive quality health care. Quality health care does not necessarily amount to expensive health care. It doesn't amount to that. Some of the charges that are there in the private health care sector, and I repeat, we never said we are going to abolish them as people are saying, however, some of the charges are ridiculous and it was even said so by the market inquiry headed by the former Chief Justice.

If you go to a general practitioner, GP, in a township and do a circumcision you will pay R1 800, but if you go to a private hospital you will pay between R15 000 and R18 000. Now, is that fair? Are you going to say that GPs are not doing correct circumcisions? Is that fair? Why do you think quality health care has to be necessarily expensive? It does not follow.

On the second question I am absolutely puzzled. Every single Minister here or everywhere in the world for that matter is allowed to go out and speak about anything from their department with members of society any time they are called to, or they want. I was surprised why I am being questioned while I am doing the roadshow, how much it costs and all that. I have the right to go out and speak to anybody about any

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 87

programme of the department and that includes the NHI. I have never excluded anybody - I have a list of people who have invited me to go and address them. I have been to churches and tomorrow I have been called by the media, there is a debate about NHI, and I am going there and I don't owe you any explanation why I am going there. I will go.

I have been called by the Congress of Traditional Leaders of South Africa, Contralesa, and I am preparing to go to them. I was called by churches in Limpopo, and I will go to them. If you call me, I will even come, even to your house and talk to you about NHI and I am not going to explain the cost to you. So, I am not going to entertain what you are saying. I will go out because every Minister is allowed to do so. Why don't you ask all the other Ministers when they go and talk about housing, water, social development, education ... why ...

[Inaudible.] [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mkhalihi, is that a point of order? Please state which point. Hon members, order! We cannot hear which point of order you are rising on.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 88

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Deputy Speaker, what are you going to do when the Government of national Unity, GNU, falls with your position?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mkhaliphi, that is not a point of order. The second supplementary question will be asked by the hon Dhlomo. Hon members ... Minister of Water and Sanitation ... Good afternoon, Minister, but could we please keep it down because no one can hear what is going on at the moment. The second supplementary question will be asked by the hon Dhlomo.

Mr S M DHLOMO: The data that is available from the World Bank, World Health Organisation, WHO, and many other such institutions will tell you that when you compare the total expenditure on health percentage of gross domestic product, GDP, looking into various countries, but let us just focus on BRICS, South Africa is spending 8,5% of its GDP on health. Except for Brazil that is spending 9,8%, all other countries are spending far less of their GDP on health. India, for example, is 3,8% and China is 6,85%.

However, paradoxically, the health outcomes of these countries are far better than what we have in South Africa. Let's look

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 89

at the life expectancy. In all these countries their citizens live beyond 70 years. Secondly, the maternal mortality rate of these countries is less than 100 per 100 000 of women who deliver babies. We are sitting above 100. The infant mortality rate of babies who are born ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, please round up your question, your time has run out.

Mr S M DHLOMO: Okay, let me round up. The infant mortality rate and the under-five mortality rate, Minister, are all ... when are we going to have this 8,5% really benefiting us because our outcomes do not show that we have such a budget dedicated to health? Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon member, the recommendation from the WHO is that if countries spend 5% of their GDP on health, they ought to have good health systems for all their citizens. That is the recommendation from WHO. In South Africa we have far exceeded that recommendation, and we are at 8,5%. So, your question is, what's wrong.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 90

What is wrong is that 51% of it goes to only 14% of the population. Unfortunately, that 14% includes all of us in here. We benefit from that 51%. If you want to see how this affects countries, the same document you are talking about - if you are talking about the same graph I have seen from the World Bank - it has something that is heart wrenching, that of all the countries who spend most on health in the world, the US is number one, Lesotho is number five and we are at 16. It sounds like a joke while Lesotho is number five.

One of our private hospitals here went to Lesotho - I am not going to name it. Their biggest hospital was called Queen Elizabeth. They said this Queen Elizabeth is dilapidated with no equipment and therefore let us build you a world class hospital with equipment. Then they did so. They even tricked them by saying Queen Elizabeth is a colonial name, name the hospital after your queen, and they named it Queen Mamohato. That hospital is unaffordable; the Basotho cannot afford it, and they are paying about half of the total budget of Lesotho only to that hospital - money that comes into a South African private hospital group. These are some of the things that we want to change.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 91

Go to Ladybrand Hospital where we have a brand-new hospital. The biggest ward in that hospital has four beds like private hospitals here. However, if you get into that hospital you will find Basotho women. They are coming to South Africa because their hospital has been taken over and they are number five in the world in health expenditure. We are number 16 in that graph of the World Bank. We have exceeded many countries in Europe because of these expenses that you are talking about which many people like us to believe they are from God. They are not from God, they are ... [Inaudible.] ... and we can reverse them ... [Time expired.] Thank you.

Mr P A VAN STADEN: House Chairperson, since the tabling of the NHI Bill in 2019 I have raised a question on how the NHI will be funded and every time the ANC and the then Minister argued that the NHI will be tax funded. Well, we all know that the tax base in South Africa is getting smaller every year. The official opposition at that time earlier this year around March, warned that another R859 billion was needed to fund the NHI and Momentum's recent estimation of R1,3 trillion a year is a matter of great concern. My question is, while the Minister of Finance could not provide the Portfolio Committee on Health with a finance model, can the Minister inform South

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 92

Africans today for once and for all where the funding of the NHI is going to come from? If not, why not, and if the Minister really believes that the already overburdened tax payers will simply accept another form of tax to fund the NHI? Thank you, hon House Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, those were two questions, but, Minister, if you want to answer both ...

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I will. Why not. Hon House Chairperson, we had a scourge of a disease called HIV and Aids which was the biggest in the world. In 2010 we put up a programme whereby we were going to run the biggest HIV counselling, testing and treatment campaign in the world which today is ... [Interjections.] ... yes, it was exactly under him, but he was taught by me to do that ... [Interjections.] ... No, no, no, you can go and ask Msholozzi I sat with him. You can go and ask him because I sat with him and showed him what we must do, and we did it.

When we published that I was asked a question about where the money will come from. If I will pay you back, I refuse to answer that question. When people are dying, and you have to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 93

treat them you can't start asking questions like that. The first policy of medical aid was enacted in 1967, and nobody stood up and asked where the money is going to come from. They established private hospitals and private health care medical aids, and nobody asked where the money is coming from. So, when we want to keep South Africans, even those who are poor, you are asking where the money will come from. I am not going to answer that question. Money in this country for housing, for water, for police, for the army, to run Parliament and pay your salaries where is it coming from?

The second question that the tax base is becoming limited is because there is this sick thinking that only all of you who are rich are paying tax. Show me a single South African who is not paying tax in this country. Show me. Tax which feeds the government comes from three sources ... [Time expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, order! Thank you. The last supplementary question will come from hon Letlape. Order! Hon Letlape, just take your seat for a moment. Hon Sauls?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 94

Mr A SAULS: Chair, I am just wondering if I can give my supplementary question time to the Minister, please?

[Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): No, Christmas is also coming. Hon Letlape, please proceed.

Dr T K S LETLAPE: I guess, Minister, not all parts of the GNU are not working. My question to the Minister is, I am currently battling from your answer to the first question where you said the mathematics mixed with hooliganism was based on the fact that medical aids are making money. In terms of the law, they are supposed to be nonprofit and the person to ensure that they are nonprofit is the Minister of Health.

I pay R7 000 to Parmed which is too expensive, and I expect you to stop it because it is from a piece of apartheid legislation. How are you going to help me, Minister, not to be fleeced by a piece of apartheid legislation in the new dispensation where I want to be with the people and not with those that take away from the people? How do you ensure that the medical aid Parmed doesn't fleece me and make ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 95

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon member, your time has run out. Hon Minister there is a very tenuous linkage to the original question, but you are welcome to answer.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, I am prepared to answer. Dr Letlape, I don't know why you are paying little for GEMS because GEMS is so expensive ... I mean for Parmed, sorry. My apology, Parmed is very expensive, and I am on record saying that that medical scheme should not exist even if we were to continue with medical schemes outside NHI. To this extent I met with the trust which includes speakers of provinces to make this proposal that even if we keep medical aids, we all go to GEMS, and it was rejected.

My reason that it should not exist is because insurance is based on numbers. You can't have a medical aid of so few people. How many are we there in Parmed? There are 490 of us in Parliament. Then you go to provinces, 80 in Gauteng, 80 in KwaZulu-Natal, 74 in Limpopo etc. and then 265 judges only. If you add that it is about a thousand.

If you want to understand why you can't have an insurance of a few people, just get a life insurance where there are only 10

of you, then die and see how much will be paid. It doesn't work. I don't know why it is allowed. So, that proposal was rejected and that is why we are fighting tooth and nail that we come up with a new health financing system which is NHI because of exactly some of the factors that you have mentioned. What we are doing here doesn't work because it is too expensive and that is why we want to change it. Thank you.

Question 123:

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chair, I appreciate the question. If I may inform the House that, there is a number of departments who are champions in this initiative of distribution of sanitary dignity with the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities, Department of Education, Department of Health and other departments.

As the Department of Social Development, we do provide sanitary pads to young girls when donated by the donors. For now, only three provinces provide sanitary pads. These are Gauteng province, North West and Western Cape.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 97

Hon House Chair, the department through its sustainable livelihoods programme, over and above lifting individuals and communities out of poverty, has also a programme to link them to income generation programmes, so that they are able to provide for their basic needs and are less dependent on government support. This is what we do as part of government departments that do provide for this, but it is not specifically our responsibility. Thank you very much, hon House Chair.

Mr T B MUNYAI: House Chair, the matter has been clarified with the table that I will do a follow up. What monitoring and evaluation strategies are in place to assess the long-term impact of the department's intervention in challenging cultural and social stigma on menstrual health? Does the Minister believe that sanitary towels will be made available at zero tax, free of charge in public facilities like the male condoms? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chair, this is a very sensitive matter. As such, we would make your request that as the department we are committed in providing and distribution. However, talking about culture, we wish to make

a special request that we develop a written response to this august House, so that we can take the House into confidence, because issues of culture are a contribution on the bigger scale of gender-based violence and femicide. For that, reason we're making that humble request hon House Chair. Thank you.

Ms A L A ABRAHAMS: Period poverty highlights the blatant gender disparities in our society, until such a time where the budget, together with stakeholder partnerships can match the need, we will continue to have this conversation. It requires a whole of society approach, which includes us all 400 Members of Parliament.

Minister, will you commit to spearheading a campaign where this Seventh Administration collectively donates sanitary products to our qualifying schools before the year is complete? Let's do something constructive and show the public that Parliament is more than just a talk shop. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Indeed, this is a profound call by the hon members which makes everybody to contribute. Let's allow that to be part of the consolidated response that we will bring to the House. Yes, as the department we are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 99

committed to be part of that and to be able to give clear answers that would have a turnaround strategy in so far as the call is concerned. Thank you very much, hon member.

IsiXhosa:

Niyandiva? Ndiyaqhuba apha.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: House Chair, we can't accept this. Please, I'm not talking to you. I'm talking through your Chair of the Government of National Unity, GNU. The. This is the third time this Minister can't provide answers. So, you are not working, chief? You don't know that you're supposed to come and answer questions in this House? Chair, you cannot allow her.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Yeah, thank you hon member.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chair, on a serious note.

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order Chair.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible ... fighter, sit down.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 100

Ms H O MKHALIPHI She is a Minister Chairperson ...

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible] ... sit down wena [you.] Sit down.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chair ... [Inaudible] ... sit down.

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order Chair.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chair if the Minister is not reading the follow-up questions, she can't provide - No, it's ah, ah, no Minister. We have spoken about this issue before that we can't have ministers who failed to answer question in the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon member.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: [Inaudible] ... and you must not allow it to happen.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon member.

Firstly, we can't prescribe to the Ministers what they must say. Secondly, we must bear in mind that the Rules also do provide specifically where an answer is to include statistics

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 101

and budgetary projections, for a Minister to undertake to furnish a written answer. So, the Rules to allow for that.

In the circumstances, what I've heard from the Minister is that, apart from a project plan the detailed figures which the hon Abrahams specifically requested are to follow. Hon member, is that a new point of order?

An HON MEMBER: It is that point of order that I was rising on, because the hon member, can't refer to the Minister as chief. That is unparliamentary.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you. Let's ... Let's ... [Interjectios.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: You will be promoted next time. For now, sit down.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Let's proceed. The third supplementary question will be asked by the hon Marais.

Ms N TAFENI: Minister, as part of the intergovernmental or department's efforts to make sure that those in need have

access to sanitary towels when they need them. Is there a reason why the department is not making sure that there are sanitary towels collection points in all public schools and public spaces such as clinics and hospitals, for example, as it is the case mostly with male condoms? And also ...

IsiXhosa:

... eMpuma Koloni sinomama owakhetha ukuzibulala wabulala nabantwana bakhe ngenxa yendlala. Ingaba kuphando enilwenzileyo nilisebe, bangaphi oomama abathe bagaxeleka kule meko ...

English:

... in the Eastern Cape or Limpopo province ...

IsiXhosa:

... ukuze singaphindi sigaxeleke kwiingxaki ezikumila kunje ngenxa yokuswela kwamanina iindlela zokubheka phambili. Okunye Mphathiswa, kumaphondo oMzantsi Afrika olithoba kumele ukuba sibenabo abantu abanika amasebe amalaphu okuzikhusela xa usexesheni (sanitary towels) kuba baninzi abantu ananeeprojekthi zokuwenza ukuze isebe lethu lenze kakuhle.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 103

Kwakhona, uthi wena lo mcimbi wamalaphu okuzikhusela xa usexesheni awalulo uxanduva lwesebe lakho. Ulukhomba kweliphi isebe olu xanduva ...

English:

... because you as the Minister of Social Development together with the Minister of Basic Education jointly ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, I think the Minister got your question and your time has run out. The Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chair, as I've already indicated that different departments through their own budgets, are giving out sanitary towels. That's one response. The Department of Social Development, DSD is also doing that through its work relationship and partnership with people who really understand the plight of women.

So, as the Department of Social Development, the breadwinner of the nation, this responsibility does not necessarily fall into our mandate for now. However, I'll take your advice of co-ordination between myself and other departments like the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 104

Department of Basic Education, DBE that also does provide sanitary towels to schools and the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities which also does that.

But for now, if you can listen, this is the response I am giving, there is no necessary budget for this important task and responsibility. Hence, I accept your call of further co-ordination with other departments. I thank you, hon Chair.

Ms B E MACHI: Hon Minister, given the fact that many people have contributed to solving this issue, what mechanism has the department put in place to ensure that those who are in dire need of the sanitary products are receiving them accordingly, especially those who are in rural areas and the low-income households? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chair, I hear the House very clearly to say, this task needs more co-ordination than it is the case now. Whoever does have a budget or a partnership with anybody who can assist in this regard must be co-ordinated by Department of Social Development. We are taking that responsibility to make sure that people who are in dire need of this kind of a service can be able to get

that. That is the challenge we are taking. Thank you very much, hon Chair.

Question 106:

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: Some of the recipients complained that they felt that their privacy had been infringed upon and they were being unnecessarily exposed for having applied for government assistance at a time when they were struggling and vulnerable. I can have some sympathy for this reaction but it is not a perspective that I believe is valid. Anyone who receives funding from government is in fact a recipient of public funds. By the very definition of the word it is therefore not receiving private money, and it is certainly not a private matter and should not be seen that way.

We have seen examples of people complaining about government only to discover that they were helped by government. This is obviously embarrassing but could have been avoided if we all had just been honest with each other throughout. It is not the reason that we should avoid transparency and openness because this is the best way to fight corruption.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 106

Some people whose names appear on those lists came forward and said that they had not actually received any money, raising questions about whether monies may in fact have been redirected improperly. This is a matter that we are investigating and we will get to the bottom of it. It may well be that these denials are only for the cameras so to speak, but something more sinister may have happened and we would never have known if we had not made the matter public.

I believe that this must, should and will be the approach under the government of national unity's, GNU's, leadership of President Cyril Ramaphosa – to be open, honest and serving the people at all times.

The majority of beneficiaries did not complain that their names and the amounts they had received were published because they realised that there was no shame in having and needing help. The government took a very drastic decision to put the country under lockdown and they were unable to earn a living anymore. That was not their fault and they deserve to be helped by their government. In fact, we should probably have done much more for them. What matters now is that we push on and try to grow and sustain a thriving creative sector in

order to truly put the trauma of COVID behind us.

[Interjections.]

Pardon? You have bigger things to worry about than how I think. The GNU is a very caring government. The GNU is thriving. The ones who said that the GNU will not last have entered divorce. What you see here is a divorce ...

[Inaudible.]

Mr V G REDDY: House Chairperson, point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Minister, just take your seat for a moment. Just take your seat for a moment please. I have a point of order. Minister, please take your seat for a moment. Hon Reddy, why are you rising?

Mr V G REDDY: House Chairperson, I wasn't sure whether that was a TikTok performance but the rules say that you cannot mislead the House. There is no GNU in this House. The member is using the word GNU incorrectly and is misleading this House ... [Inaudible.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 108

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Reddy, if you had stood and said the Minister must stay relevant to the question I could've listened to you. However, that's a point of argument. Hon Minister, are you done answering the question?

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: No, no, no, I want to ask ... You can't have problems in your marriage and then you speak about other people's marriage. Our marriage is intact. We differ like couples. There's no progressive caucus ...
[Inaudible.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Order! Sit down! You should have rotted in jail!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Minister, just take your seat again, please. Hon Minister, please take your seat for a moment. Hon member?

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: House Chair, I think you have to be fair to all of us. Just as the deputy secretary-general hon Mkhalihi said, Ministers must answer questions. When it's irrelevant and frivolous, it must be stopped. Don't subject us to that mediocre ... called an answer. We are not part of it.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 109

Divorce and marriages have nothing to do with the initial question. What we want is government at work and consistency, not some mediocre answer that we have received here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you. Hon Minister, there is still 37 seconds left. However, I sustain that point of order.

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Minister, let me just finish. In answering questions, Ministers must deal with the topic of the question. Politics is not to be part of the answers to the question. If you want to add to the substance of the answer to the original question you may do so but from now please refrain from entering into the fray of politics.

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: House Chairperson ... [Inaudible.] ... I was ready ...

Ms O M C MAOTWE: What's the problem ...

Setswana:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 110

... ka mapantiti. Mapantiti! [bandit]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Maotwe? Hon Maotwe on the virtual platform?

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: No, I was busy answering. If they then have these frivolous points of order ...

An HON MEMBER: We are still waiting ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: Chair, allow me while I'm on the floor. There's an issue that I just need to deal with for 10 seconds. [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] ... say, this bandiet [bandit.] Every time they say this ... [Interjections.] ... Let me speak ... [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Order, House Chair. Order, order.

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: ... [Inaudible.] ... This is why Floyd left.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 111

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Okay, Minister, now ... Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: House Chair, allow me to say one thing. Every time ...

An HON MEMBER: Chair, he's contesting your ruling.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Minister, unfortunately your time has now expired.

An HON MEMBER: The hon Minister is contesting your ruling.

An HON MEMBER: Hlala *phansi*, hlala *phansi* [*sit down*] chief. Hlala *phansi*.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon Minister. You may take your seat.

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: ... [Inaudible.] ... say this ... [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Hlala *phansi*, chief. Sit down.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 112

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Can you sit down now? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Minister, please take your seat now. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: I listen to you not to the divorced couple. I listen to you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you. Order, hon members. Hon Maotwe on the virtual platform? Hon Maotwe on the virtual platform, all of us heard you unmute and refer to the Minister as a bandiet [bandit] which is not a respectful way in which to refer to the Minister. Please unmute and withdraw that remark.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: House Chair, did you hear me mention the Minister's name?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member?

Ms O M C MAOTWE: I'm asking if you heard me mention the Minister's name.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 113

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): We all heard you call the Minister a bandiet [bandit]. Please withdraw.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: Yes, I said mapantiti [bandit]. House Chair, I said mapantiti [bandit]. Did I refer to the Minister?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Maotwe, withdraw that remark.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: I will never. I will never. Mapantiti! [Bandit!] I will never withdraw mapantiti [bandit]. I never said anyone is a mapantiti [bandit]. I said mapantiti [bandit].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Maotwe, I'm going to give you a last opportunity to withdraw the remark otherwise I'm going to order that you be removed from the virtual platform.

Ms O M C MAOTWE: House Chair, if the shoe fits he must wear it. I said mapantiti [bandit]. That's the problem with bringing a mapantiti [bandit] here.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 114

Mr J S MALEMA: On a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Maotwe, are you withdrawing?

Mr J S MALEMA: Chair, on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): I'm dealing with this first.

Mr J S MALEMA: You are out of order. On a point of order. You are out of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Malema, I will come to you just now. Technical staff, it would seem that hon Maotwe refuses to withdraw. Please remove her from the virtual platform. Hon Malema, did you want to raise a point of order?

Mr J S MALEMA: What you did is wrong because there is nothing wrong in what hon Maotwe did.

Sepedi:

Motho youwe ke lephantiti ...

English:

... and he knows that.

Sepedi:

Ke lephantiti.

English:

To refer to him as a lephantiti [bandit] is not untruthful.

It's not vulgar. That's what he is.

Sepedi:

Ebile le yena o a bolela gore ke yena lephantiti.

English:

He is proud ...

Sepedi:

... go ba lephantiti.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 116

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Malema, you have now also referred to the Minister in a disrespectful manner. Our rules clearly say that we are to refer to one another in a respectful manner. Please withdraw that.

Sepedi:

Mna J S MALEMA: Tona ya lephantiti. Lepantiti la Tona!

[Tsenoganong.] O tlo mpotša gore lephantiti ke lebitšo goba ke Tona - lephantiti. [Tsenoganong.] Ke lephantiti.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Malema, I'm going to give you another opportunity to withdraw. Hon Malema, are you not withdrawing?

Mr J S MALEMA: That's what he is.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Okay, please remove the hon Malema from the virtual platform.

Mr M M DLAMINI: Chairperson?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 117

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Dlamini, are you rising on a new point?

Mr M M DLAMINI: No, I'm rising on the same point. I see the way you are treating our members. First, hon Maotwe.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Order!

Mr M M DLAMINI: May I address you?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Dlamini, just hold on for one moment. Can we just be silent so that I can hear the hon Dlamini. Please continue.

Mr M M DLAMINI: Chair, I'm saying that I'm rising on the issue of you ill-treating the members here when they speak on issues that are facts. So, how should they address ... or maybe you don't understand ... lephantiti [bandit]. It's a prisoner. Someone who serves a sentence. That is a fact. So why is that an issue now?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon Dlamini. I have made my rulings and you are welcome to take it to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 118

Rules Committee and to write to the Speaker. Hon members, we will now continue with the first ...

Mr M M DLAMINI: Yes, but don't do something wrong. These members who you removed from this platform ... What's going to happen? They must exercise their right as Members of Parliament. What should happen now? Can you speak to your team there to bring them back so that they can continue to ...
[Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Dlamini, we are not going to ... [Inaudible.] ... the whole matter. Thank you. As the Chief Whip of the EFF you will know that if you are aggrieved with my ruling you can take it to the Rules Committee and you can write to the Speaker.

Mr M M DLAMINI: Yes, but can you bring the members back to the ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): The first supplementary question ... Please mute the hon Dlamini now. The first supplementary question will be asked by the hon Mthethwa.

[Interjections.] I've concluded with that matter. I've already

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 119

ruled on that matter, hon members. I'm not going to entertain any further points of order on that issue.

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: Wait, wait, wait.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): If it is on another matter you are welcome to proceed. If it's on the matter I have made my ruling on, we are not going to continue with that.

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: No, you ... [Inaudible.] ... going to intimidate us.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, I'm just following the rules.

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: ... [Inaudible.] ... in terms of Rule 69. Chair, we are going to take your rulings to the appropriate platform because all your rulings are wrong, unfair and uninformed.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you. Hon Mthethwa, do you have a follow-up question?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 120

Mr E MTHETHWA: Chair, I don't know ... Maybe ... No, let me not go there. The Minister did not answer my question. Unfortunately, he wasted our time here with all these other issues that are not related to the question. My question was as follows. What criteria did they follow to determine the amounts that were given to different individuals? He did not respond. Be that as it may, I am not disappointed. What kind of transgressions were committed in the process of distributing the funds and were there any consequences for those who committed such? If not, why is the management or executive management at the department still the same since that is the very management that must now take responsibility to hold those whom they didn't even want to hold accountable, accountable now. What are you going to do? How are you going to run that accountability process? Thanks, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Minister, before you take the floor, there's now a reminder to you that one part of the original question was not answered. It's a very specific, substantive follow-up question. Let me just ask you as well that in your response to also stick to addressing those issues, please. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 121

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: Alright. I think we must be fair. We were not caught out. We investigated and exposed the names to the public. After you show the public, you wait for people to come back and say they didn't get money. We are now at that part. After we willingly published the names we then got information. We are now at the stage of investigating. We realised that there was no panel at the department to investigate. We then went public and called on people to apply to be part of the legal panel so that we can investigate. The panel is closing in the few days. They will then adjudicate and appoint law firms. We will then have our own legal panel. That legal panel will investigate that which the hon member wants us to investigate and that which we see as corruption and which needs further investigation.

However, we can't just come and cast aspersions on people and remove people without proper evidence against them. We live in a country with laws and you can't just come in and say because you were there when something wrong happened you were part of that wrong. It can't be, it shouldn't be and it will never be.

Ms M L MMOLOTSANE: Chair, I want to ask the Minister what was the department's action feedback from artists and creatives to

inform future strategies or policies in order to provide support during a crisis such as the COVID-19 pandemic?

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: Last week we called all the creatives and artists and had what we call a bosberaad [*bush summit*]. In that bosberaad [*bush summit*] we listened to them because in South Africa artists are not organised, while in sport the sporting federations are extremely organised. We have now reached consensus amongst us all. They will organise themselves as a sector and that sector will then tell us how we should deal with them as a sector.

You usually had musicians speaking for choral musicians, speaking for everyone, speaking for publishers. We now have 52 different sectors. You have poetry, you have choral music, you have publishers, you have writers, you have scriptwriters, you have filmmakers. For the first time these people are now organised.

The bosberaad [*bush summit*] was very positive. Everybody was happy. They even said that they feel very positive about the GNU. Thank you very much.

Mr L C JACOBS: Hon Chairperson, you will agree that there's all sorts of different name-calling that just took place in the House but the only type of theft that I saw in this House today is how time was being taken away from discussing serious matters that matter to the Republic of South Africa.

Hon Minister, I want to ask you the following. You are aware and you will agree with me that when it came to distributing the funds to artists during COVID the process was ...

Afrikaans:

... sementvas en bankvas ...

English:

... with corruption. So, I want to ask you to what extent are you satisfied with how these funds were distributed and to whom they were distributed?

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: As I've said now, I came there and we published the names. Some people made allegations. I can't agree with the hon member and say ... this person ... there was theft of corruption. No, I don't even think there was theft of corruption. We are still busy

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 124

with the process now. As I said previously, we have a panel and the panel will investigate. I am not the investigator. I'm not going to call people corrupt without people having evidence. Many artists are very happy with the work that the previous Minister did in helping them during their darkest hour. So, you can't cast aspersions. You see, tomorrow when I answer you, you are going to say I don't answer you. Now you are busy with me.

However, while I'm on the floor please allow me to say one thing. I'm within my time. I want to make it clear here that I don't mind you calling me ... I have two parts. Firstly, I don't mind you calling me a bandiet [bandit]. However, I want to make you aware of one thing. Here in the Western Cape my name Gayton McKenzie was there. Your name, the EFF, was there in the Western Cape. People looked at your name but people decided ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Yes, hon Minister. Hon Minister?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 125

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: ... we not ...
[Inaudible.] ... to this party. We'll vote for this ...
[Inaudible.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: I got double to what
you got here. They went ... [Inaudible.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): No, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: ... to vote for the
bandiet [bandit].

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Minister, please take
your seat. Hon Minister, there will be ... Order, hon members!
There will be another opportunity for voters everywhere to
look at the ballot, so let's campaign then. Hon members, the
last supplementary question will be asked by ... Okay, hon
member?

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: House Chair, are you not going to address
Rule 69 with this member who does not know and respect the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 126

rules of the House because he's ... of gross misconduct. It's not going to be tolerable anymore and we are going to act on it.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Yes, thank you, hon member.

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: His conduct is far out of line and you are not calling him to order. He has repeatedly done the same thing and you have not chased him out of the House. He has not done it once, he has not done it twice ... [Inaudible.] ... Why don't you chase him out of the House?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon member. I've asked the Minister to take his seat. I've asked the Minister to take his seat and he complied. Thank you. The last supplementary question will be asked by the hon Sauls.

Mr M M DLAMINI: Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Dlamini on the virtual platform?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 127

Mr M M DLAMINI: Chair, you know we are being very nice with you. We are asking you to conduct this House in an orderly manner because we are not going to accept this abuse that we are getting from Mr Gayton. You are sitting there and not doing anything. We are asking you ... [Inaudible.] ... on Mr Gayton. He must focus on the work that he's supposed to do and respond to questions that have been asked by hon members. Even now he stands there and says to you that he doesn't mind being called a lephantiti [bandit]. Instead of ... acknowledging and saying that you actually removed the EFF leadership ... on the facts because he's confirming it. However, you removed the EFF leadership that's supposed to be doing its work here and you are not correcting it because that statement of ... [Inaudible.] ... lephantiti [bandit] is going to remain. He is a lephantiti [bandit]. He has confirmed it. It's going to remain throughout this term and ... [Inaudible.] ... so you must also put it ... [Inaudible.] ... so you don't make those mistakes anymore on the way forward ... [Inaudible.] ... of this House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon Dlamini. My ruling stands. The member from MK?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 128

Mr E M NTSHINGILA: In terms of consistency and fairness I would then propose that you bring the treasurer-general of the EFF ... based on the fact that you are not taking action against the other member ... [Inaudible.] ... his utterances.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon member. We have dealt with that matter. Those members were removed because they refused to obey an order. The Minister ...

Mr E M NTSHINGILA: Chairperson? Chairperson?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): ... obeyed the direction of the Chair. Thank you.

Mr E M NTSHINGILA: The Minister confirmed the word lepantiti [bandit] and you removed the member from the platform. We find your ruling unfair and inconsistent. So, take action that will assist the House ... [Inaudible.] ... the order of the House ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, I've made my ruling. Those members were removed because they refused to obey the ruling.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 129

Mr E M NTSHINGILA: ... [Inaudible.] ... as a lephantiti
[bandit]. What kind of action are you going to take?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, the rules also
say that while the Chair is addressing the House nobody else
is to speak.

An HON MEMBER: But you must be consistent with your rulings.
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon members.
Let's continue with the Question Session. The last
supplementary question is that of the hon Sauls.

Mr M M DLAMINI: Chair, how can you say we should continue when
we are raising issues in this House? ... [Inaudible.]
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon Dlamini.
I've already reacted by indicating that I intervened when the
Minister again abused his ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 130

Ms P R MAILOLA: House Chair, you are biased in your rulings. House Chair, you are biased in your rulings. You should be removed from that seat. Can you please ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, thank you. You are eating into other members' opportunity to ask questions.

Ms P R MAILOLA: Huh-uh, you are biased in your rulings.
[Interjections.]

Mr C G NIEHAUS: House Chair, you are incompetent. House Chair, you don't know the rules. You should leave the Chair. You are incompetent. [Interjections.] House Chair, you should leave the Chair. You are incompetent. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, I will state one last time that when I told the Minister to take his seat and refrain from continuing he followed the direction of the Chair. We will now continue with the Question Session.

Ms P R MAILOLA: House Chair, can you please recognise us?
What's wrong with you?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 131

Mr M M DLAMINI: Chair, just learn to listen to what we are raising. We are saying to you the Minister has confirmed that he is a lephantiti [bandit]. You made a wrong ruling. Just correct it by bringing the president of the EFF ...

[Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Dlamini, you can't just ... [Inaudible.]

Mr M M DLAMINI: It's a simple request. Why can't you just listen? It's a simple request. You made a mistake. We are helping you. Let's bring them back so that they can continue with their work ... [Inaudible.] ... right in front of you.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon Dlamini. There's still 10 minutes left for the Minister to answer further questions.

Mr M M DLAMINI: No, leave that. I'm talking about the mistake that you made in removing the leadership of the EFF. Let's correct it now, Chair. Just leave the arrogance and that ...

[Inaudible.] ... Just listen to people.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 132

Ms P R MAILOLA: Exactly! Exactly! ... [Interjections.]

Mr M M DLAMINI: Just accept that you made a mistake. You made a mistake ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, let's continue.

Mr M M DLAMINI: Continue with what, Chair, when ... [Inaudible.] ... you made a mistake?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Sauls, do you have a follow-up question? Please continue.

Mr M M DLAMINI: Don't you want to acknowledge that you made a mistake?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Dlamini, please mute now.

Ms M R MOHLALA: Point of order, Chairperson. Chair, point of order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 133

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, we have dealt with this matter. We are proceeding. We are proceeding.

Ms M R MOHLALA: Point of order, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, is it a new point of order or is it on the same question?

Ms M R MOHLALA: We want to speak. We want to raise a point of order against you, Chair. Please allow us to raise points of order in this House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, you can write to the Speaker. You can take the matter to the Rules Committee.

Ms M R MOHLALA: Can you please allow us to raise a point of order on you, Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, is it a new point of order on another matter? Otherwise I have made my

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 134

ruling and in terms of the rules you are ... [Inaudible.] ...
take the matter ...

Ms M R MOHLALA: Yes, allow me.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): If it is not a new point of
order I will accept that as disregarding the authority of the
Chair. So make double sure that it is a new point of order.

Ms M R MOHLALA: Chair, I think you are very inconsistent in
your ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, that is not a
new point of order. That argument has been raised.

Ms M R MOHLALA: Listen! Listen! I'm not there yet.

Chairperson, you removed our members, stating that they used
the name lepantiti [bandit]. The Minister himself stood up and
said he's a lepantiti [bandit]. Can you please remove the
Minister from the House. You removed ... [Interjections.] ...
Chairperson. ... [Interjections.] ... is removed. The
president is removed ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 135

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, take your seat now.

Ms M R MOHLALA: Can the Minister be removed from the House as well?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Please take your seat.

Ms M R MOHLALA: [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, if you don't take your seat now I'm going to ask you to leave the Chamber. Hon members? Hon members? Firstly, that's not a new point of order.

Mr M M DLAMINI: Chairperson, let's listen to each other. Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Dlamini, I'm on the floor. Please mute the hon Dlamini. That's not a new point of order. It's a revisitation of the old points of order. I've dealt with that. Rule 92(8) very clearly says that no member may raise a point of order again or a similar point of order

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 136

if the presiding officer ruled that that point of order has been dealt with. I've indicated to you that you can take your unhappiness to the Rules Committee and to the Speaker. We are now proceeding with the Question Session. I will not deal with any further points of order on this issue.

Mr M B BLOSE: Chair, it's a different order. It's a different point, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, please assist us by allowing us to continue. You can take the matter to the Rules Committee.

Mr M B BLOSE: No, it's a different point, Chair.

Dr L MANAGA: My hand is up.

Mr M M DLAMINI: No, no, no, Chairperson.

Dr L MANAGA: I raised my hand, hon Chair.

Mr M M DLAMINI: Chair, you are extremely wrong now. What do you mean that a point of order that has been raised ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 137

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Is it a new matter, hon Dlamini?

Mr M M DLAMINI: ... must be taken somewhere. What do you mean? The members are saying that they are raising a different point of order. So have you suspended all the rules of this House? Now they must be taken to the Rules Committee? What nonsense is that now? Where are the rules right now? Where did you learn that?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Yes, hon Dlamini, that's indeed what the rules say. Can you please mute all members on the virtual platform?

Dr L MANAGA: My hand is up. I raised my hand.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Sauls, you have the last opportunity for a follow-up question.

Dr L MANAGA: I raised my hand, House Chair.

Mr M B BLOSE: Chairperson, I'm rising on a different issue.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 138

Ms M S LETLAPE: Your arrogance is going to deal with you, Chair. [Interjections.]

Mr M B BLOSE: Chair, it's hon Blose. I'm rising on a different issue.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, if it's not a different issue then I'm going to order your removal from the virtual platform.

Mr M B BLOSE: Chair, I have two things. We beg for your patience. Firstly, I want to hear what your ruling is in terms of removing members from the platform using the word lephantiti [bandit] yet the Minister has confirmed it is lephantiti [bandit]. You must tell us what your ruling is with regard to that. Secondly, we are calling for your consistency, Chair. We are saying if you remove our members for using the word lephantiti [bandit] it's either you bring them back because you've made a wrong ruling or you remove the Minister. So, tell us what your ruling in terms of that is so that we know in this House because we don't know what your ruling is.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 139

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, that is indeed not a new point of order.

Ms M S LETLAPE: It is a new point of order, Chair. It's a new point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Please stand down. I've given my ... point of order. Please remove that member.

Ms M S LETLAPE: It's a simple thing. Either you bring them back or you remove your Minister.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Please also remove that hon member who is disrupting proceedings now.

An HON MEMBER: Now you are abusing your power.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Please mute the virtual platform.

Dr L MANAGA: I've raised my hand, hon Chair. My hand is up.

An HON MEMBER: The member's hand is up.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 140

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Sauls, do you have a follow-up question?

Dr L MANAGA: I have a follow-up question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): No, the follow-up question is that of hon Sauls. Hon Sauls?

Mr A SAULS: I'm going to ask for your indulgence in order to be fair in the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Sauls, I've given you an opportunity for a follow-up question.

Mr A SAULS: Hon Chair, you have not been fair in terms of the situation that is happening here and in terms of your ruling. We have submitted ourselves to your ruling. Whenever you told the Minister to sit down he did. Then you allowed others to do what they are doing now. For the sake of clarity and ...

[Inaudible.] ... I have to ...

An HON MEMBER: Order, Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 141

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Sauls, I'm asking you to take the Question Session forward. Do you have a follow-up question? I did not recognise you on a point of order.

Mr A SAULS: Yet, you recognised the EFF.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Yes, hon Sauls.

Mr A SAULS: So I'm standing up and I'm asking you ... It's my prerogative. Chairperson, I'm saying that I have a point of order ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Okay.

Mr A SAULS: ... so you have to allow me.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Okay, what is your point of order?

Mr A SAULS: Thank you. The point of order is that the rule says when a member has the floor and speaks, members of the

House should not interrupt. Listen, Chairperson. There they are doing it again.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, give the hon Sauls an opportunity to unpack his point of order.

Mr A SAULS: Hon Chair, you can rule whether it's not in the Rule Book because you know it's in the Rule Book. So what they have done ... Can I finish? So what they have done ... You have allowed ... In terms of clarity, the Minister never said that he accepts the label bandiet [bandit]. He said he doesn't mind ... and they carried on. So, Chairperson, the days of the EFF ruling this House are over. They have found their match.

Afrikaans:

Ons baiza nie!

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Sauls, do you have a follow-up question?

An HON MEMBER: Order, Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 143

Mr A SAULS: Hon Chair, when I started I said I was standing up because I feel they are disturbing me and I'm on the floor. Chairperson, as to your question, may I address you?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Sauls, are you going to ask a follow-up question?

Mr A SAULS: They are not allowing me to address you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Yes, please ask the follow-up question.

Mr A SAULS: Get order in the House, Chairperson.

An HON MEMBER: Order, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, give the hon Sauls an opportunity. Hon Sauls, take your seat. Hon Dlakude and hon Manyi.

An HON MEMBER: Chairperson, point of order.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 144

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE LARGEST MINORITY PARTY: Hon House Chairperson, I'm standing on Rule 69 which speaks to gross disorderly conduct. Some members have violated this rule. Rule 66 also states that a member must not be interrupted while on the floor. I'm also standing on Rule 82 which speaks of reference to a member in respectful terms. So all these rules have been violated by EFF members. The order on the Question Paper today is questions to the ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: The cockroach violated it.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE LARGEST MINORITY PARTY: Hon House Chairperson, I want to plead with you ...

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: How do you expect us to respect the House when we are being insulted here?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE LARGEST MINORITY PARTY: ... that when the time ... [Inaudible.] ... comes to an end you adjourn the House. Don't extend the Question Session. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 145

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon members.

Mr C G NIEHAUS: Chairperson, on a point of order. I raised my hand.

Mr L M KOMANE: Chairperson, point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members?

Mr L M KOMANE: Chairperson, point of order. Please allow me to raise my point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Order!

Mr L M KOMANE: Can you allow me to raise my point of order?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, the time for this Question Session has expired.

Mr L M KOMANE: It ran out before you did this. Can you allow me to raise a point of order?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 146

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: House Chair, Gayton called people here cockroaches. Are you going to allow him to say that?

Mr L M KOMANE: Can you allow me to raise a point of order?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): This has not been a dignified ... [Inaudible.] The time has expired.

[Interjections.] We request ... [Interjections.]

Mr C G NIEHAUS: We've raised our hands on points of order.

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: We are not going to allow that.

[Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: ... [Inaudible.] ... as if you didn't hear.

[Interjections.]

Mr L M KOMANE: Chairperson, as I'm looking at you there is one thing that you don't understand. We only have two Houses to raise points of order. You run this one differently. This is not your house. It's our House. You have to run this House ... [Inaudible.] ... the rules.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 147

An HON MEMBER: Chairperson, remove the cockroach.

Mr L M KOMANE: Can you allow us to raise our orders?

[Interjections.] [Inaudible.] Can you allow us to practise our rights in this House ... [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Chairperson, on a point of order.

Ms P MARAIS: Chairperson?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, unless it's a new point of order I'm not going to entertain it.

Mr L M KOMANE: You don't know what is new. [Inaudible.]

Mr C G NIEHAUS: Chairperson, until you hear us you don't know what the point of order is. [Interjections.] I've raised my hand on a point of order, Chairperson.

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: You must rule against Gayton calling people cockroaches. Yes, Gayton just called people cockroaches and you didn't say anything.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 148

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): I didn't hear that.

[Interjections.]

Mr M M DLAMINI: You must ask Gayton. Stop being weak. Stop being a coward. [Interjections.]

Mr C G NIEHAUS: Chairperson, are you going to follow the rules and allow us to raise points of order? [Interjections.] I've raised my hand on a point of order. I expect to be recognised, Chairperson. [Interjections.]

Ms P MARAIS: Chairperson, have you recognised me?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Yes, hon Marais, I have recognised you.

Ms P MARAIS: I just want to bring to your attention that this Minister is calling us cockroaches with Malema. So, this most useless one is calling us cockroaches ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon Marais. Hon Minister, did you refer to members of the EFF as cockroaches?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 149

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Uzothini ngoba vele akazi lutho?

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Order!

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: I did not call the hon member or any member here a cockroach. I called Malema a cockroach.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Minister, the rules do not allow for that. Hon Minister, please stand up!

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: I withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Do you withdraw that?

The MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: I withdraw.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): We have a withdrawal. Hon member?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 150

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: Chair, I think we must teach Gayton the rules of the House. We are going to take this matter to the Ethics Committee.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, hon member. Please ... [Inaudible.]

Mr A SAULS: Hon Chair, we know the rules ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): We have that, hon Sauls.

Mr A SAULS: ... I rose earlier on Rule 66. I want them to know that we will also take them to the Ethics Committee for calling our president a bandiet [bandit]. Earlier I rose on Rule 66 ...

An HON MEMBER: Chair, you must not allow people who are turning this House into a prison. We are not in a prison here.

Afrikaans:

Mnr A SAULS: Ons baiza nie!

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 151

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Sauls, please take your seat.

An HON MEMBER: Gayton is converting this House into a cell. This is not a cell here.

Mr A SAULS: ... [Inaudible.] ... We are not afraid of you. We are not afraid of you ... [Inaudible.] ... We are not afraid of you.

Afrikaans:

Ons baiza nie! Ons baiza nie!

Me P MARAIS: Ons baiza nie!

English:

An HON MEMBER: This Minister thinks we are in a prison here. We are in Parliament here. We are not in a prison. He must stop doing what he's doing. We are not in a prison here. We are in Parliament.

Afrikaans:

Me P MARAIS: Ons baiza ook nie hier nie.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 152

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, may I address you?

An HON MEMBER: We are not lephantitis [bandits] here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Rule 69(c) says that members may not engage in gross disorderly conduct by repeatedly undermining the authority of the presiding officer or repeatedly refusing to obey rulings or repeatedly disrespecting the presiding officer.

Rule 70 says if the presiding officer is of the opinion that a member is deliberately contravening a provision of these rules or that a member is disregarding their authority ... the member's gross disorderly conduct, such a member may be ordered to leave.

We are now done with the issue. We have now wasted 20 minutes of your time ... to ask questions to the executive. Order! Hon members, if you now persist I'm going to make use of Rule 70

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 153

against you. Okay, hon members, please leave the House. Please leave the House.

Ms N V MENTE-NKUNA: You can clap hands for Gayton, your buddy.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Please leave the House.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: You can clap hands for this frog called Gayton.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon Ntlangwini ... Hon Mkhaliphi, please leave the House.

Setswana:

Mme H O MKHALIPHI: O bias (kgethololo)! O nale bias (kgethololo) wena!

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon members, the three hours for questions to the cluster have expired. One question has been moved to the Order Paper for oral reply in addition to the questions to the cluster. We will now take the question

that was transferred for written oral reply in terms of Rule 146(1). Question 156 has been asked by the hon Ntshingila to the Minister of Higher Education. The question is about the responsibility for ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.] ... higher education institutions.

An HON MEMBER: What are you going to do? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Please remove that hon member from the virtual platform for continually disregarding the authority of the Chair. The hon Deputy Minister?

IsiZulu:

Nk M R MOHLALA: Sinishiya nale nto yenu yamabhantinti.

English:

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Gayton must go back to jail. That's where he belongs.

Afrikaans:

Me P MARAIS: Ons baiza nie!

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 155

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Hon member, why are you rising?

Mr M G MAHLAULE: Chairperson, I want to appeal to you. You said that the time allocated for questions is over, so the Deputy Minister packed up and left. However, I appeal that we get hold of him because he is still in the precinct so that he can come back and answer the question. He was abiding by your ruling that you gave.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thanks. Hon members, we can suspend the business of the day for five minutes to see if the Deputy Minister is still available. Business is suspended for five minutes.

Business suspended at 18:10 and resumed at 18:16.

Question 156:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Order, hon members. We are ready to proceed with the business of the day. The Deputy Minister has joined on the virtual platform. Deputy Minister, we are at Question 156 which has been transferred to oral reply due to the failure to be answered in terms of the rules.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 156

The question is about the responsibility for nation-building by higher education institutions. Over to you, Deputy Minister.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: House Chairperson, the question relates to the set stream fund deal of universities and Technical Vocational Education and Training, Tvet, colleges, and we do encourage as the department that set stream funding where universities and Tvet colleges are allowed to raise additional funding for their own sustainability.

We have seen overtime mainly within the private sector, supporting universities and supporting Tvet colleges. Our major worry, of course, is that money still flows mostly to universities that have the most resources. So, we need to change this. We need to see more monies flowing to universities that have historically been disadvantaged because we need these private resources. However, we must emphasise, hon House Chair, that we also have to be careful that public funding should not exceed, in any way, or should not be exceeded in any way by private funding, as this may

essentially lead to the privatisation of our universities and Tvet colleges.

So, that balance between sources of funding from the private sector and public investment into these institutions is going to be critical. We are doing everything in our powers to make sure that Tvet colleges and universities are in better state for them to be supported financially for them to attract private sector investment. Thank you, House Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, Deputy Minister. The first supplementary question is to be asked by the hon Nchingila.

Mr E M NTSHINGILA: Chairperson, it's hon Ntshingila.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): My apologies.

Mr E M NTSHINGILA: Yes, sir. Thanks, Chairperson. Hon Deputy Minister, I think we ought to put more effort in mobilising the public private partnerships, P3, given the previously disadvantaged institutions that continues to struggle. To mobilise this state income stream that continues to overburden

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 158

government grants, but also families that can't afford on student fees. Why is it so difficult, Deputy Minister, to consider the public private partnerships, P3, difficult to ensure that these economic zones where such disadvantaged institutions are located, the private sector, there's a regulated role in funding education that you ought to facilitate such a process, so that that regulation would not necessarily raise the fears that you have just allayed in your response?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Chairperson, look, the numbers are showing us that government funding towards public universities has been on the decline and that most universities are relying on private sector funding. So, there are resources from the private sector, but have been flowing towards our universities and our Tvet colleges. If you look at some of the universities like Wits, they're mining school, for instance, for which the private sector played a very crucial role. At the Tshwane University of Technology in Pretoria, we have the Centre for Artificial Intelligence, which has been a great collaboration between state institutions, public finance and private sector.

So, there's a bigger role that the private sector is playing. However, it is important that we raise caution that universities should remain public institutions. Therefore, it means that we'll have to mobilise more resources from the public sector to fund these situations. In fact, it's quite worrying when some of the university councils and university managers would say that they can survive for such a number of years without public finance, which means that private sector funding may have the potential to erode the authority of the state over these institutions. So, I agree with you that we will have to look at the regulations and so on. Thank you.

Ms B E MACHI: Hon Deputy Minister, in the spirit of nation-building. What has the department done through higher education institutions to empower local communities, especially in towns where students are the primary contributors towards the local economy?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: Well, I mean universities and Tvet colleges are based in communities, and they play a role. University councils comprise people from those communities, and therefore, the mandates of those institutions are defined based on those communities, the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 160

needs, interest, aspirations and targets are defined in terms of those communities. They have a mandate to pursue national goals, to pursue the National Development Plan, NDP, so forth and so on. So, there's no university that can go out of the way, or if they do, obviously, we'll have to come in, but the point is that there is a mandate for all our public higher education institutions to pursue the national mandate, including the National Development Plan, NDP, and its set goals.

Ms Y GOVANA: Hon Deputy Minister, public private partnerships are essentially making sure that institutions develop self-reliance capacity. Universities and colleges generate revenue through government subsidies, pushing fees and third-stream income derived from corporate and commercial activities, investments and donations. Successfully, post-school education institutions that lead in training and innovation, have cutting-edge training and research facilities. Our previous previously disadvantaged universities struggle to have a balance of significant third income stream revenue.

What will your department do, Deputy Minister, to support and ensure previously disadvantaged universities have increased

third stream, which only benefits former white universities and colleges?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: I fully agree with you, but we'll have to look at the skewed private sector flow of sponsorships and scholarships and so on and so forth, in order to make sure that they benefit all the universities, rightly so. This week, in fact, on Saturday, we were laying to rest Prof Brian O'Connell, who has shown that through innovative and creative leadership of a university by the university Vice Chancellor, can actually put a university through a combination of public and private sector funding in a state where it is as we can see at the investor of the Western Cape.

So, it's a combination of innovative and visionary leadership at a local level, regulation policy but also incentives for the private sector to invest. However, I must say that we are quite excited with some of the resources that the private sector has availed, and we are going to continue to encourage them, work together with them and engage them, so that they bring in private sector resources to help develop our public institutions.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 4 SEPTEMBER 2024

Page: 162

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr W Horn): Thank you, Deputy Minister. Hon members, no request was received for the last supplementary question. I request members to stand and wait for the Chair and the mace to leave the Chamber. That concludes the business for the day and the House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:26.