

TUESDAY, 12 NOVEMBER 2019

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:07.

The Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLES AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see column 000.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I wish to acknowledge the presence in the gallery, of the delegation of the officials of the United Kingdom who are visiting Parliament on a scoping visit. [Applause.] They are being led by the Consul-General, Mr Benjamin Boddy. You are welcome to our Parliament.

TRIBUTES TO THE SPRINGBOK RUGBY TEAM

UMBHEXESHI OYINTLOKO WEQELA LWESININZI: Somlomo ohloniphekileyo namalungu ale Ndlu, amazwi enkuthazo kwimpumelelo yeziTsiba-bhokhwe. Isizwe sonke siyadloba

sonwabile, luchulumanco kuthi. Sithi ngoko ke, huntshu!
Inde indlela esiyihambileyo sisonyuka amaqhina, sixwesa
kwimiwewe namaxethuka enzima yoMzantsi Afrika owahluka-
hlukeneyo.

Xa kunamamhlanje kusika inimba xa sibona singcwaba
iyantlukwano ngempumelelo yeziTsiba-bhokhwe emva
kokutywatyusha kanobom iinkunzi ebezigquba, zikhonya
zodwa kwisibaya sombhoxo. Sinembali ebuhlungu kwaye
encwinisayo kodwa kumele ukuba sidlule ekugcumeni sisele
umhlonyane sithi camagu, noko kudeda ubumnyama kuvela
ukukhanya ngoku eMzantsi Afrika.

Ezemidlalo ziye zasetyenziswa zalikheswa lokucinezela
ngakumbi isizwe esintsundu, kucalucalulwa ilungelo lethu
lokudlala ngokobuzwe. Ukunyamezelana ngundoqo xa
kusakhiwa isizwe. Ewe, kuyatshizwana ngodaka xa kusakhiwa
indlu kodwa yakugqitywa ukwakhiwa indlu kungenwe
ngaphakathi, akuphinde kutshizwane ngodaka kuye
kuchetywane iinduma.

Imbali elusizi esiphuma kuyo kufuneka singayiphindi.
Masikhuthaze wonke ummi woMzantsi Afrika ukuba
sisondelelane. Amathole anyongande kudlelana. Niliqhayiya
lesizwe, nilibhongo maBhoko-bhoko, ningamaqhawe.
Nisibuyisile isidima sethu ehlabathini kwaye nazisa

umanyano kwisizwe, kontsundu nomhlophe batsho babhiyoza kunye.

Masibulele nakuQamata ngokunithwala anise elizweni elikude eJapan niphinde nibuye ningenawo nomkrwelo. Lowo ngumzekelo wabantu abadlalayo nabaziphatha kakuhle. Namhla kunamhla, nizintandane ze-Afrika. Nibhala imbali entsha, niqala uqalo olutsha. Zaqandusela iinyosi kubomi obutsha. Ngubani na obesazi ukuba abantwana bomthonyama, isizukulwana sikaLuthuli, sikaTambo, sikaMandela uNkosi uDalibhunga ukuba namhlanje siza kumanya isizwe? Ewe kwakungeyiyo impazamo apho uNkosi uDalibhunga wathi kuni maligcinwe eli gama lithi Springboks, iziTsiba-bhokhwe ukuze sisebenzise lona ukwakha isizwe sisimanya ukuya phambili.

Amagorha eli lizwe ephelekwe nguMadiba ngokwakhe, Kitch Christie, uPienaar noDu Plessis ngonyaka we-1995 abuya nayo le ndebe yehlabathi. Saqonda ukuba mabaphinde kuba iduma lopho ngokuphindwa. EFrance, abuya eyixwayile le ndebe ngonyaka wama-2007 ekhokelwa nguMongameli uMbeki, izizi elimnyama ngokwalo. Laliphelekwe nguJake White, uJohn Smit noZola Yeye. Kubenjalo nangoku apha kulo nyaka wama-2019 magorha kaMongameli uCyril Ramaphosa.

Anisiphoxanga nize nayo okwesithathu le ndebe nikhokelwe nguRasie Erasmus nomdak'omnyama ongeva sepha, unqina

lendllovu uSiya Kolisi uGxiya ngokwakhe. Sithi kule
Palamente yomdibaniso yoMzantsi Afrika, kuni bantwana
bomgquba, enkosi ngokuqagambisa ilizwe lookhokho bethu.

Sinibonile nizijule ijacu kwilizwe elikude, sanqwala
isizwe satsho ngesankxwe. Sithi maz'enethole!
Zenenzenjalo nangomso ukuphakamisa ilizwe loMzantsi
Afrika. Somlomo ohloniphekileyo, iziTsiba-bhokhwe
zilimanyile ilizwe ubone ngamayeyeye, amanxeba ethu
masiwabophe ngezemidlalo sibheke phambili. Xa simanyene
singenza lukhulu, icekwa lilele kuni ke ukuze niphuhlise
abantwana abafuna ukudlala, abafane nani ezilokishini
nasemakhaya. Ndiyabulela [Kwaqhwatywa.] (*Translation of
isiXhosa paragraphs follows.*)

[The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Speaker and
hon members of this House, word of encouragement for the
victory of Springboks. The whole country is rejoicing;
it's happiness to us. We say, well done! We've travelled
a long way with up hills, and walking sideways, having
difficulties in a diverse South Africa.

Today we are proud when we bury our differences
successfully through the victory of Springboks after they
defeated the undefeated champions, who felt they cannot
be defeated in rugby. We have a sad history which makes

us not to stop complaining but we have to go through that route and drink a traditional flu herb and say well done, now there is light in South Africa.

Sport was used as a weapon to discriminate most of black people in South African; our right to play for national teams was violated. Tolerance is the key when a nation is built. Yes, there may be disagreements when we are building a house, but when it is done and ready to live in it, everyone enjoys being warm inside and help each other.

We must not repeat the sad truth that happened previously. Let's encourage unity to every South African. Let's not oppress each other. You are champions of the nation, you are our pride, Springboks, and you are heroes. You brought back our dignity in the world and brought unity in the nation, black and white so that they celebrate together.

Let's thank our Lord for travelling safe to and from Japan without any harm. This is an example of good behaviour of players. Today is today; you are the pride of South Africa. You are writing a new history, and starting a new beginning. Bees laid eggs in new life. Who knew that Africans, from Luthuli, Tambo, Mandela Nkosi

Dalibhunga generation today will unite the country? Yes, it was not a mistake when Nkosi Dalibhunga said to you the name Springboks must remain as is, Springboks so that we use it to build the nation going forward.

Heroes of this country accompanied by Madiba himself, Kitch Christie, Pienaar and Du Plessis in 1995, came with the world cup. We did it again in France, brought back the cup in 2007 with hon President Mbeki, Zizi, an African, accompanied by Jake White, John Smit and Zola Yeye. It happened again this year in 2019 with a hero, hon President Cyril Ramaphosa. You didn't disappoint us, you brought it for the third time led by Rasie Erasmus and a black African, ngina lendlovu Siya Kolisi, Gxiya. As Parliament of unity of South Africa we say, to you children of the soil, thank you, for brightening our forefathers' country.

We saw you playing tirelessly in a foreign country; the nation is thankful and made a noise of happiness. We say thank you! Please do so again and lift up our country, South Africa. Hon Speaker, Springboks united the country and you've heard ululations; let's console ourselves with sport and go forward. If we are united, we can do more, but it all depends on you to groom the young ones who

would like to play rugby, to be like you, those in townships and villages. Thank you [Applause.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam Speaker, my brothers and sisters in Parliament and all South Africans, *there is a dream, I feel so real, so real, all the world in union, the world as one*. Never could we have imagined that the lyrics to what is now known as the Rugby World Cup theme song would be so prophetic.

Our country has been in a bad way. Our people have been divided; hate was becoming the norm, leaving many people feeling more than a little helpless and vulnerable. The problem is that we as people were forgetting who we were. The times in which we found ourselves had made it hard for any of us to see the light, the flame that burns inside each and everyone of us. That flame reminds us that we are the nation of love, kindness, forgiveness, resilience, determination, and bravery. It's the flame that burns in the South African soul that many have tried to extinguish, but have failed at every attempt. It's that flame that tells us that when we are together we are, in fact, stronger together.

It is that flame that causes us to always revert to our default position as a nation, which is love. It is that

flame that causes us to have the best sense of humour in the world, the flame that allows us to do the voshos to Sho Majosi, a langarm to Kurt Darren and the bus stop to Vulindlela all while wearing our Springbok jerseys and flying our rainbow national flag.

You see, I know this love in our country is our default position because you cannot fake the utter joy that was felt by 99,999% of South Africans when Captain Fantastic, Siya Kolisi lifted the Webb Ellis trophy. You cannot fake that 99,999% of South Africans had a tear run down their cheek when Springbok coach Rassie Erasmus gave us a master class in nation-building. You cannot fake the laughter and happiness that we all felt when Faf de Klerk met Prince Harry in the Bok change room wearing a South African speedo. You cannot fake the outpouring of love that spontaneously erupted on the streets of South Africa, in our airports and everywhere that bus went with our champions on board. That is true love; it's not manufactured, it's real, and it's our default position as South Africans. [Applause.]

This is what it means to be South African. It means looking around and acknowledging the horrors that so many are faced with, but it is knowing that there is nothing wrong with South Africa that cannot be fixed with what is

right with South Africa. Gathering together, one mind, one heart, one creed, every colour, once joined, and never apart.

What a team! What a team! The level of determination, strength of character, sportsmanship and camaraderie; it was a wonder to behold. I had the extreme honour of meeting some of the team when they started their South African tour here at Parliament and I was immediately struck by two things. The first was their humbleness and patriotism, and the second was the fact that none of them had not quite yet realised that they, in actual fact, came to the rescue of a country when we were at a frighteningly low point.

This squad of gentle giants have led this country from a path of hate that some amongst us were attempting to lead us down, and brought us back together. This squad of heroes ensured that love conquered hate. It wasn't just their immense talent on the field, but it was their very nature.

The men who lead our Springbok team are, in fact, heroes in every sense of the word. To the hosts Japan, our sincerest thanks for your incredible hospitality,

goodwill and supreme sportsmanship. To you we say, Doumo Arigatou!

Other countries wanted to win the world cup, and South Africa needed to win the world cup. Thank you to our Springbok heroes! Go and take your place in the hall of legends and always remember, you are your ancestors' wildest dreams. Go Bokke! [Applause.]

Dr M Q NDLOZI: The EFF has long called for total decolonisation of our public symbols. This underlies our inability to join in the fake celebration of the Springboks because the Springbok is a sign that cannot be whitewashed. It stands in parallel continuity with Die Stem and trenching white supremacy in our society. That is why the rugby team in question is white dominated. It is a perfect reflection that white people have successfully resisted change in our country for the last 25 years. By definition, apartheid was always about creating a situation where black people live as though they are minority in this country when, in fact, we are the majority. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order ... order! Hon Ndlozi! Order!

Dr M Q NDLOZI: They tried to achieve this through the Tricameral Parliament and the Bantustans and that is why they ask us to be happy for being integrated, accommodated and included in their white-dominated associations.

People agree that rugby has not transformed and it is not about to transform. So, what exactly are we celebrating? Are we the only ones who remember that the Springboks purity had been kept by creating an inferior team known as the Leopards in order to distinguish them from the lily-white Springboks? [Interjections.]

Who has recognised our black rugby heroes like Majola, Mjo, Tsotsobe, Matyeshana, and Charles Mgweba who scored a brilliant try for the Leopards against the visiting British Lions in 1974? People out there are saying what is happening is racial unity on the streets but the truth is there is scores of black people out there exploited marginalised, scandalised and brutalised humanity to a white-dominated team. [Interjections.]

This is happening every day in South Africa. Black people running behind white-dominated institutions seeking inclusion, recognition and affirmation in their country of birth. Our people have done this in 1995 and 1997, and

in return the white-dominated society has not opened itself up.

Le hlotse Mandela! (*Translation of Sesotho sentence follows.*)

[Even Mandela could not change you.]

He could not even make you accept change, you white people. To the white community, to this day has recognised the humanity of black people. They refuse to this day to accept that 25 years only one Makazole Mapimpi has made it from rural rugby in the Eastern Cape where there are more black rugby players than the white people combined in South Africa.

That Siya Kolisi had to go to a white school. Otherwise, he would have not seen the light of day in the World Cup. Why must we rally behind people who, when they are together, call us baboons? One of the players in this recent team Eben Etzebeth is facing charges of racial assault in a case led by the human rights.

We therefore call on black people to refuse the emotional abuse that the ANC-led government is subjecting us to. It's a collective emotional abuse. This racial parade is

a complete emotional abuse of our people and it is emotional abuse to the people who have given too many cheeks to racism and they no longer have any other cheek to give anymore.

No racial unity until the land comes back. No racial unity until equality in black people paid the same salaries as white people for doing the same job. No racial unity until the wealth of this country is shared by all who live in it. No racial unity until a rugby team rises that has black majority in it like the country we live in.

When you are done celebrating here, go out and celebrate Louis Botha's statue. Go and celebrate the Strydom Square. Go sing Die Stem. Go fly the apartheid flag. Send your children to Jan Van Riebeek School down the road. Do not include us.

Asizi! (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[We are not coming!]

We are the generation of #RhodesMustFall. We are the generation of #DieStemMustFall. We are the generation that is refusing the emotional abuse that our parents

went through. We are the generation that will say without a shadow of doubt, without any apology that the Bokke must fall. It is a white supremacist sign that belongs in the dustbin of history. [Interjections.]

So, there is no stronger together. Our message is that black people you are on your own. There are no whites to unite with us in landlessness, and in informal settlements. Do not force black people to celebrate people who humiliate them. The Springbok must fall.

Asijiki! [Ubuwelewele.] [Ihlombe.] (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[There's no turning back! [Interjections.] [Applause.]]

Inkosi E M BUTHELEZI: Hon Speaker, all of us in this House can agree that the freedom we enjoy today came at a price. We managed to negotiate our transition with little bloodshed and we stunned the world with making what was believed by many to be impossible, possible. All our people came together, united behind the principles of reconciliation. We knew then that it was indeed going to be a process.

Building on reconciling with our past and championing social cohesion - building togetherness among our diverse people - is the process of reconciliation. It cannot be described in a single event or a single moment.

We have witnessed and experienced togetherness in our World Cup victories of 1995 and 2007, in hosting the world, showcasing our diverse and rich history in 2010 Fifa World Cup, and cherished moments of victory, despite our hardships, politically, socially and economically. Sadly, thereafter, for many years, we seemed to have lost our way.

We owe it to our national rugby team in 2019 that have singlehandedly marked the end of this year, on a victorious high.

We have seen in the past few days alone how many South Africans yearned for a moment to come together and unite in their support behind our national team ... [Applause.] ... that waved our flag patriotically and with enthusiasm. We all could once again say that we are proudly South African.

Let us be reminded and be grateful that such moments of victory will forever be recorded in our country's

history, and that we hold onto what we promised ourselves in ensuring that the process of reconciliation would be ongoing.

South Africa is indeed stronger when we come together. We are better off united than apart. We showed the world before, beyond their doubts, that we are a nation committed to building a home for all our people. We know full well that we can achieve any goal we set when we lift each other up through the down times and hold each other up through the good times.

Much like in rugby, we must commit ourselves to focus on the scrum, as we come together as a force against all odds we still face as a nation and as a continent.

South Africa is geographically located at the bottom of Africa as a continent. This victory, is actually teaching us, as members of this House, that we are carrying on our shoulders, the rest of our continent. Therefore, we dare not fail. We salute our team. We are behind them and this is what South Africa needs, going forward. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Me H JORDAAN: Voorsitter, ek was nege jaar oud toe die Bokke die 1995 Rugby Wêreldbeker gewen het en ek sal

nooit die uitdrukking op my pa se gesig vergeet nie. Ek onthou dat ek gedink het dat die Bokke die beste span is en dat Suid-Afrika die beste land in die wêreld is. Die trots op daardie oorwinning is 'n gevoel wat baie van ons duidelik steeds onthou en tot vandag toe deel.

Baie het egter in die tussentyd gebeur en die gevoel van trots op 'n Suid-Afrika wat die beste land in die wêreld was, het saam met die waarde van die rand en die inkrimping van ons ekonomie gedaal. Dit het plek gemaak, tesame met die stygende werkloosheidskoers, hemelhoë misdaadsyfer en stygende inflasie vir 'n groeiende gevoel van hopeloosheid, woede vir 'n regering wat nie ons land behoorlik regeer nie en 'n magteloosheid wat met armoede en swak dienslewering gepaard gaan.

Die krag van sport moet egter nooit onderskat word nie, want dit is deur sport wat ons oor verskeie grense heen agter een span of deelnemer kan verenig, onderhewig aan een stel reëls en met een doel voor oë - om te wen.

Die manne en vroue wat ons krygers is, diegene wat namens ons op die sportveld of -baan oorlog voer, is die werklike helde omdat hulle juis dit doen - hulle verenig ons op 'n gelyke speelveld. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.*)

[Ms H JORDAAN: Chairperson, I was nine years old when the Boks won the 1995 Rugby World Cup and I will never forget the look on my father's face. I remember thinking that the Boks were the best team and that South Africa was the best country in the world. The pride of that victory is a feeling that many of us still clearly remember and share to this day.

However, a lot has happened in the meantime and the feeling of pride in a South Africa that was the best country in the world declined along with the value of the rand and the contraction of our economy. This has given way, together with the rising unemployment rate, sky-high crime rate and rising inflation, to a growing sense of hopelessness, anger at a government that does not govern our country properly and powerlessness that comes with poverty and poor service delivery.

However, the power of sport should never be underestimated, because it is through sport that we can unite behind one team or competitor across multiple borders subject to one set of rules and with one goal in mind - to win.

The men and women who are our warriors, those who wage war on our behalf on the sports field or track, are the

real heroes because they do just that - they unite us on a level playing field.]

Therefore, the debt we owe to Captain Siya Kolisi and his team is not a small one. We thank and congratulate him and his men. The Springboks have yet again, as in 1995, succeeded in uniting a nation that was so deeply divided that we forgot our pride as South Africans; we forgot that there is hope and strength in who we are as a nation.

The single greatest achievement of the Rugby World Cup Springbok team, aside from bringing home the Webb Ellis Cup, was showing us that we can indeed unite in our diversity.

We, as a diverse nation of different races and many different cultures, languages and religions can indeed unite in our diversity. Siya, Faf, Bongsi, Eben, Likhanyo, RG, Peter-Steph, Mapimpi, Kitshoff, coach Rassie and the rest of the team have proven that, if we work together, listen to each other, respect each other's differences and build on our strengths rather than our weaknesses, we can win. We can be stronger together and we can make a success of this country.

Uniting a nation is however a very heavy burden to bear and though there is no doubt about the strength of the boys in green and gold, we cannot allow them to carry this burden alone.

It is our turn now to lift the responsibility of building toward a better South Africa together with Siya Kolisi and his team, just as he lifted the Webb Ellis Cup in Yokohama after the final.

The Springboks have done their part. They have executed their role brilliantly. It is our turn now, as ordinary South Africans, to take up the responsibility of nation-building towards a country that we can be proud of.

As Parliament, we can start by setting an example of mutual respect, embracing and respecting each other's differences, and working to improve on our strengths, rather than our weaknesses.

This means that statements such as: "Congratulations to Siya Kolisi; the rest go get your congratulations from Prince Harry," and whatever happened here now is not acceptable and get a red card.

Agb Ndlozi, as jy nie mooi speel nie, mag jy nie speel nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] (*Translation of Afrikaans sentence follows.*)

[Hon Ndlozi, if you don't play nicely, you don't get to play. [Interjections.]]

Unlike the Springboks, history will judge you harshly.

Ons moet nou hierdie verantwoordelikheid van nasiebou oorneem. Ons moet ophou om mekaar op die baadjie te takseer en ons moet mekaar respekteer vir wie ons is. Ons moet ophou om breë aannames te maak en te veralgemeen oor wie ons dink almal is. Ons moet ons skoene as 'n trotse nasie volstaan.

Ons moet ons regering aanspreeklik begin hou vir die manier waarop hulle ons belastinggeld bestee. Ons moet verantwoordbaarheid, behoorlike bestuur en goeie gesonde kernbeginsels op elke vlak van regering vereis. Ons moet nou aan 'n toekoms vir ons kinders bou. Ons moet nou regmaak wat gebreek is, voor dit te laat is. Hierdie is ons eindstryd, en ons moet wen. Ek dank u. [Applous.]

(*Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.*)

[We must take over this responsibility of nation-building now. We must stop judging the book by its cover and we need to respect each other for who we are. We must stop making broad assumptions and generalising who we think everyone is. We must fill our shoes as a proud nation.

We must start holding our government accountable for the way they spend our tax money. We must demand accountability, proper governance and good sound core principles at every level of government. We must now build a future for our children. We need to fix what's broken now, before it's too late. This is our final, and we must win. I thank you. [Applause.]

Rev K R J MESHOE: Hon Speaker, the ACDP would like to repeat our message of congratulations to the Springboks for beating England with a wide margin of 32 to 12, to win the Rugby World Cup in Japan. This was an incredible victory, and would not have been possible without the effort of the whole team who worked together as one.

This being said, I also want to pay special tribute to three outstanding team members. Firstly, a special word of thanks goes to our inspirational captain, Siya Kolisi. Besides the fact that he is the first black captain the

Springboks ever had, his outstanding leadership both on and off the field has been exemplary.

Worth noting is his advice to young aspirant rugby players, particularly those from poor backgrounds to have goals while believing that all things are possible.

Captain Siya Kolisi gave another inspiring message after winning the People's Choice Sports Star award at the SA Sport Awards in Durban on Sunday night. He is reported to have said, and I quote:

We are such a beautiful country. When we decide on a goal or dream, as a nation, we can achieve it. Our team is diverse. We've got different backgrounds and races, and we decided to fight for one common thing. We can also do it in life and business. We just have to put our egos aside and fight for what is right so that South Africa can be better.

This is why I was so disappointed by Dr Ndozi's divisive tweet where he congratulated Siya Kolisi for the victory, but said that the rest of the players should go to Prince Harry for their congratulations.

I want to appeal to Dr Ndlozi to join the nation for once and congratulate the entire Springbok team ...

[Applause.] - the only team to have won every Rugby World Cup final they have played in. This amazing victory, sir, was an important victory for all South Africans.

Therefore, all South Africans must rally in congratulating them.

The second person I want to mention by name is a great tactician, coach Rassie Erasmus, whose game plan ultimately outsmarted the tactics of England's coach, Eddie Jones. [Applause.] It was great to see how Rassie motivated and transformed our rugby team in just 18 months, to make them Rugby World Cup champions.

The third person is Makazole Mapimpi, who also comes from humble beginnings, who enjoyed a great tournament, and made history when he became the first South African to score a try in a Rugby World Cup final. His brilliance helped the team to victory. [Applause.]

South Africans are stronger and will be unbeatable if we continue to stand together. To the Bokke, we say that we salute you. You are our team and the Lord blesses you for all your efforts. [Applause.]

Mr B H HOLOMISA: Hon Speaker and hon members, as a nation we are experiencing a wave of unity and harmony as a result of the Springboks' win in the Rugby World Cup 2019. For this we are grateful, and may God help us sustain this atmosphere.

To Rassie, you have stayed your course and forged a team of men who had the heart and skill to bring home the Webb Ellis Trophy. Thank you. [Applause.]

To the Springboks management and support personnel, we say a job well done. Without you our boys would not have been able to perform as well as they did.

To Siya and the rest of the team, you have captured this nation's imagination. Thank you for raising our hopes and making us proud.

Hon members, before our players went onto the field, President Ramaphosa gave the squad a motivational talk. Later on when I met him just before the game started, we had a laugh when I said to him: "I hope that the buffalo did not intimidate the Springboks too much".

Sport, both in terms of participation and the support of our teams, can help to generate revenue, create jobs and

promote social cohesion. We must learn from countries like Australia.

Hon members, we would therefore be well-advised to create a sports agency to co-ordinate the various sport codes in terms of facilities, especially in rural areas and townships as well as identify the latent talent and developing the potential of our sportsmen and women. This task cannot be left in the hands of the bureaucrats.

We say thank you to Japan and her people for hosting a successful Rugby World Cup. Having being in Japan for the final, I was touched that the Japanese people learned Nkosi Sikelel' Afrika - a truly remarkable feat of a model nation. [Applause.]

Another phenomenon that struck me is the absence of dustbins but there is absolutely no litter. Each person takes responsibility for their own rubbish - they take ownership. This is a trait that South Africans can study and emulate.

Their motor industry is based on homemade goods. How I wish that we could create jobs by making parts of that industry as we have the raw materials.

Finally, just one thought; I would behove South Africa to enter into bilateral agreements with Japan to train entrepreneurs and owners of small, medium and macro enterprises, SMMEs. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ndidlala ibhola mna. [I play soccer.] [Laughter.]

Mr V ZUNGULA: Speaker, in the early 90s utata uDumile Qeqe built a stadium in Zwide, Port Elizabeth with hope that he would mentor and guard future stars and also keep children away from mischievous acts on the streets.

Little did he know that one of the children who used to train at his tracks would rise to be the standing captain of the Springboks.

Rugby has been accepted as part of the culture and identity in many townships across our country. In that light, I would like to direct our attention to the national women's rugby team that needs sponsorships and transformation in policies which still lean more towards men. They need to get support as far as media attention and broadcasting is concerned, and more than ever, they need support of this House.

The development of women's sports must be a matter of national priority where our teams are able to be capacitated enough to compete with other national teams.

Continued investment in women's sporting codes may as well assist in many gaps identified in South African communities. We have an opportunity again to celebrate in the 2021 women's Rugby World Cup which will be hosted in New Zealand.

The ATM therefore stands to say that Babalwa Latsha who is a captain of the Springboks rugby team, just like Siya Kolisi, can make the country proud again in 2021. For you who may not know, the women's rugby team is predominantly black as per demographics of our country. We congratulate the Springboks. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Speaker, I stand here before you a very proud South African. Indeed our Springboks have made us proud and I think we should all rally behind them.

Hon Speaker, we must admit that the odds were against the Springboks; many countries had written us off before the world cup.

I must also admit that I know nothing about rugby other than it's a game of bashing and wounding each other. But yes indeed this was the one time I watched, and for 80 minutes I was not willing to get off my seat - supporting the Springboks. I think 57 million people rallied behind our Springboks and we need to be proud of that.

Yes, I think hon Ndlozi is correct when he says: "Black people you are on your own" because, hon Ndlozi, the clothes you wear come from white companies; the car that he drives come from white companies, and the money that he steals come from the poorest from VBS Bank - the community's pension money. [Interjections.] So, yes indeed the blacks are on their own. There is no doubt about that. [Interjections.]

The one thing that we all forgot on this day was hatred. We forgot about race and gender, and we all came together as a united South Africa standing together behind our people. [Applause.]

Let me remind hon Ndlozi that behind the very successful captain that you are talking about, are the names of Hilton and Kendra Houghton. Yes, indeed they are whites who believed in him, identified him and worked with him to make him the leader he is today.

Let me also tell you that Paul van der Burg and Rassie Erasmus also played roles in the success of our captain and the Springboks team. Let us leave race out of this but celebrate a victory as one united nation.

[Interjections.] [Applause.]

We have seen this is the previous Rugby World Cup; in the Cricket World Cup and the African Cup of Nations how our success has united us all as South Africans. Let us take advantage of that and let us go forward with the difficulties and the differences we have.

There is an opportunity by these sportsmen and women of ours, not forgetting the South African netball team who can unite us and bring us into one nation with one purpose which is to create a better life for all of us.

Congratulations to the Springboks, the entire team, their families and their friends in the role they had played in the success of Springboks and making us South Africans proud. Thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon Madam Speaker, let me also congratulate our rugby team on making South Africa champions three times, in 1995, 2007 and this year, 2019. The boys' victory affirms our commitment to social

cohesion and nation-building. The spirit of sportsmanship and togetherness is purveying the whole of South Africa. Amabhokobhoko has just become the pride of our nation.

As we chanted and stood in unison, we marked an important era in our nation. This victory has left an indelible mark on our minds - an excellent and remarkable achievement. We shall always enjoy. It is true therefore that the thing of beauty is a joy forever.

It is a lifetime pride for South Africa. We are coming very far with the racial sport. We are here today, and that should be appreciated. We have unity of purpose, the determination to transcend race without losing our uniqueness and to savour the moment without being petty. We demonstrated to the world our unique stature and resilience as the Azanian people - a victory that has made even the criminals to be excited and forget about killing and raping people.

We cannot underplay the role of sport as an overarching unifier of the nation's blueprint. We celebrate South Africans who have not dignified the doomsayers' divisive rants - a sign that the majority of them are committed to a nonracial enterprise. It is fitting to say, Viva Siya,

Viva Rassie, Viva Mapimpi, Viva Amabhokobhoko, Viva South Africa! I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr W M MADISHA: It is in circumstances such as this that I remember the second President of our country - I here refer to the democratic South Africa's President Mbeki, who stood on this very platform, and Madiba was seated there and Mbeki said, "I am an African." The majority of the people throughout our country and beyond the seas rose and clapped hands because he further went on and uttered these words that he had a dream and that dream was to take us back to 1955 when the people of our country said that we are Africans; we are united; we may be white in skin colour; we may be black in skin colour, but we are Africans from South Africa.

In this Springboks match that we had, there are other African people in skin colour that were able to score. It was not only Siya but then if you look at De Allende, you look at Kolbe, you look at Mapimpi - those people were able to deliver tries, and we of course rose and said that we are Africans. There it was not only those of us who are pitch black, or those of us who are lighter in skin colour - all of us rose and said, "We are Africans."

I therefore want to say that we as leaders - as the representatives of the people of our country, need to be united just like all the people of South Africa were united and say that we are Africans; we are one; let's move forward and achieve that which we have fought for, that which we died for, and that which we went to jails for, so that indeed we can rise like we are seated here as one - we are Africans.

So, "Springbokke", we want to thank them for everything. They have helped us to arrive where we are at this stage. Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Mna A M SEABI: Sepikara, Mopresidente wa maloba, Mna Mandela, o ile a bolela a re ... (*Translation of Sepedi sentence follows.*)

[Mr A M SEABI: Hon Speaker, former President, Mr Nelson Mandela, once said ...]

Sport has the power to change the world. It has the power to inspire; it has the power to unite people in a way that little else does. It speaks to youth in a language they understand.

Ke tsopotse.

Kolisi Siya le yena o be a kitima le naga ya Afrika-Borwa a dutše a goeletša a re, ke a tsopola ... (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[Close quote.

While travelling all over South Africa, Siya Kolisi kept on saying, and I quote ...]

"Stronger Together."

Ke tsopotse. Se se ra go re, tau tša hloka seboka di šitwa ke nare e hlotša. Mokgatlo wa badimo le batho - e lego ANC, le wona o ile wa bolela go tloga kgale wa re ... (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[Close quote. All this means that there is power in unity. The people's party - the ANC - has been saying for a long time that ...]

"Together we can take South Africa forward."

Se ke seo mokgatlo wa ANC o be o tloga o se labalabela. Dibeke tše mmalwa tšeo di fetilego naga ye ya Afrika-Borwa e tlogile e bontšha gore tau tša hloka seboka di šitwa ke nare e hlotša. Go šoma ka seboka ke gona go ka

re išago pele. Mang le mang yoo a ka bago a phapharegilego borokong matšatši a mmalwa ao a fetilego, o tla ba a bone gore batho ba Afrika-Borwa ba ile ba ikgafa. Ba bangwe dikeledi di be di rotha, e le ge ba bona naga ya gabobona ye mpsha ka lebaka la seo Amabhokobhoko a se dirilego. (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[This is what the ANC believes in. In the past few weeks South Africa has proven that there is power in unity. We can only move forward if there is unity. This is what the ANC believes in. Anyone who has been paying attention over the past few days, would have noticed that South Africans have shown a lot of commitment. Some of the people even shed tears in awe of what the Springboks have achieved.]

United we stand, divided we fall. If we carry on with the spirit that was displayed in the last few weeks when the Springboks were displaying their quality scrum, we will take this country far. Together we can build this country.

A re lebogišeng Amabhokobhoko re re pele ke mo re yago. Re a leboga. [Legoswi.] [Tšwahlelo.] (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[We would like to congratulate the Springboks; forward we go. Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]]

MOTION OF CONDOLENCE

(The late Robert Gabriel Mugabe)

Mr J S MALEMA: Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House-

- (1) notes that on 6 September 2019, one of the most visionary and bravest of leaders produced by the African anti-colonial liberation movement, Mr Robert Gabriel Mugabe, the former president of Zimbabwe, passed on;
- (2) further notes that President Robert Mugabe was a devoted Pan-Africanist, a principled revolutionary, with unwavering commitment to the cause for the liberation of Africa and development of the African continent in a manner that puts African people first;
- (3) acknowledges that he stands head and shoulders above the rest in his commitment to resolve the

timeless question of the return of African land back to African people, of the use of African wealth for the development of Africa;

- (4) realises that the Fast Track Land Reform Programme in Zimbabwe remains a lodestar for all those still fighting for the return of the land;
- (5) further acknowledges that in his lifetime, he faced unimaginable attacks in the quest for the return of the land to African people, and that Zimbabwe was punished for daring to redefine itself as a sovereign nation; and
- (6) sends its condolences to the family of Robert Mugabe and to the people of Zimbabwe for whom Mugabe gave all his life.

Speaker, for this motion we want to argue that we are here as this generation of economic freedom fighters, the inheritors of the legacy of courage of resilience, of unwavering commitment to the principle of unconditional love for the African people, left for us by the special generation of African leaders who fought against colonialism and defeated it. They ushered a spirit of

hope, an affirmation of our humanity as African people and guarded with their lives our sovereignty as people.

Robert Gabriel Mugabe was one of the distinguished African leaders who sacrificed their youth for the emancipation of all Africans for the restoration of our right to humanity denied over generations by the colonialist forces.

We withstood untold humiliation at the hands of white people who stand here today and lecture us about human rights, who want to tell us how to feel about the pain they caused us, and have the guts to prescribe to us what racism is and what is not.

President Mugabe spent over a decade jailed by colonialists for fighting for African people.

The majority of white people, colonialists, have no moral authority to say anything about President Mugabe. They have no moral authority to impose their twisted conception of what an African state should be run like on any one.

When President Mugabe and the people of Zimbabwe finally defeated the evil regime of Ian Smith, they were not

thirsty for vengeance. They accepted that the white settlers community had made Zimbabwe a home. All they wanted was an equitable redistribution of Zimbabwe's wealth and the return of the land to the Zimbabwean people.

For over two decades, President Mugabe and the people of Zimbabwe patiently waited for the settler community and Britain to reciprocate their kindness and return back to the Zimbabweans the land stolen during colonialism. They thought they were dealing with people who were interested in the future well-being of Zimbabwe, people who knew that justice had to be done in Zimbabwe; they were wrong.

The British government and its British settler community in Zimbabwe were never interested in justice; they were only interested in maintaining the privileges Colonialism bestowed upon them. They never saw African people as equal human beings who can govern their own affairs. This is still the case in Zimbabwe as it is the case in South Africa.

If you dare touch the privilege of colonialism, which bestowed upon settler minority the right to dominate a native majority, you better be prepared for the full might of racist global institutions.

All the troubles of Zimbabwe, therefore, started when Zimbabweans began taking back their land and the white world stood up and vowed to punish President Mugabe and all Zimbabweans for daring to take back what rightfully belongs to them.

Despite this coordinated assault on the sovereignty of Zimbabwe, President Mugabe stood firm with extraordinary resolve to defend his nation. This unbending determination will inspire us for generations to come.

We now know that once we start shaking the foundation upon which our suffering is based, those who benefitted from our suffering will unleash their evil power on us. We will remain unshaken like President Mugabe.

This Parliament, as a product of the struggle of independence of people across the continent, must honour President Mugabe and on behalf of the people of the country send our deepest condolences to the people of Zimbabwe and the family of President Mugabe.

We must say to the wife of President Mugabe, she must remain strong and protect the legacy of her husband because we know that there are opportunists even amongst

the ranks of the ruling party in Zimbabwe who want to destroy the legacy of President Mugabe.

The younger generation must learn from President Mugabe that we must never worship whiteness, we must never seek to be like them and we must seek to be better than them. We must produce the type of a young cadre who'll be able to lead Africa and South Africa in particular, to progress and redistribute land to our people.

The expropriation of land without compensation must remain a priority to all of us. Anyone who apologises for demanding land back is a coward and is selling out.

The legacy of the giants who came before us, those who were tortured, those who were imprisoned, those who were harassed, even when they were facing death they were never scared to say they demand freedom in their lifetime. They delivered freedom. What we can do to our generation and in honour of the generation that gave us freedom is to fight for the return of the land and the wealth stolen from us by the beneficiaries of colonialism and children of criminals who landed in this country.

Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M J MASWANGWANYI: Hon Speaker, Ministers and hon Members of Parliament, we are gathered here today to join the people of Zimbabwe in paying tribute to a warrior, gallant fighter, tried and tested cadre, President Robert Gabriel Mugabe. Allow me to preface my tribute by quoting an African proverb, "Until lions tell their own stories, tales of the hunt shall always glorify the hunter". This means that if we as Africans who are the victims of slavery, torture, killing and land dispossession, do not tell our stories or write our own history, the former coloniser will always be the heroes. Unless we have our own storyteller, the oppressors will always have the best part of history.

To free ourselves from oppression, we must tell our history. African history has been told and written from the dominating oppressors' perspective, in such a way that the victims' voices are silenced. Our duty is to tell the African story of African civilisation, slavery, colonisation, apartheid, and exploitation of our natural resources. The effect of colonialism is to annihilate a people's belief in their heritage, struggles and heroes. We will never allow our former oppressors to tell the story about our heroes and President Mugabe in particular.

We are tasked by history not to let the lies spoken about our fallen heroes and President Mugabe in particular to be distorted. We owe it to them, the liberation movement and the people of Zimbabwe. President Mugabe was born on 21 February 1924, Kutama, Zimbabwe. He led Zimbabwe African National Union, Zanu - a trained teacher who studied at Fort Hare University. Mugabe battled against torture, prison and banishment designed to weaken him and the Zimbabwe African National Union - Patriotic Front, Zanu-PF, as a liberation movement of the people - a true people's organisation loyal to the great principles which inspire its creation and have guided it to the liberation of Zimbabwe.

He was imprisoned by the racist Ian Smith regime from 1964 to 1974. His wife was arrested and his child died whilst he was in prison. He was a tried and tested Pan-Africanist committed to the unity and liberation of Africa. He drew strength and courage from the deep well, which gave him strength to lead people's resistance and racial tyranny. He taught his people not to fear the oppressor, however powerful they might seem. We remember the revolutionary life of President Robert Mugabe and send our collective condolences to his family and the people of Zimbabwe.

The story of the revolutionary of Comrade Mugabe is a story of the struggle of the African people in their quest to be free. It is a story of the triumph of the human spirit against the injustices and subjugation. His relationship with the ANC started at the University College of Fort Hare in the 1950s. In his own words, he said, I quote: "Fort Hare transformed me, defining my African identity and African personality." He has participated in the activities of the ANC Youth League in Fort Hare alongside Mandela, Oliver Tambo, Duma Nokwe, Joe Mathews and others, and at one stage decided to boycott the visit by the Governor-General of Fort Hare. It was in Fort Hare that the ideas of African nationalism were inculcated in the minds of young activists, and President Mugabe was one of them.

During the years of struggle for liberation, the solidarity of the people of South Africa and Zimbabwe was solidified in the Wankie and Sipolilo campaigns. The Zimbabwean patriots, through their armed forces Zimbabwe People's Revolutionary Army, Zipra, fought side by side with uMkhonto weSizwe combatants against the tyrannical regime of Ian Smith and the apartheid regime in South Africa. He played a critical role in the merger of the Zimbabwe African People's Union, Zapu, and Zanu to form the Zanu-PF. The liberation of Zimbabwe and other

countries in the region, paved way for a possible liberation of South Africa.

President Mugabe played a critical role in the transformation of the then Frontline States which is called the Southern African Development Community, SADC, today - which was to focus on the economic development of our region. We are highlighting this point to demonstrate the Pan-Africanist commitment of President Mugabe.

President Mugabe knew it, as he was convinced of the certainty of our victory, that the historic and urgent issue of the day in Southern Africa was the question of the transfer of power to the people. Some years ago, the people of Zimbabwe under the leadership of President Mugabe decided to advance with their land reform programme. This has raised a number of responses from around the world, with some of the Western forces putting Zimbabwe under difficult circumstances through sanctions.

As South Africans, we will never be threatened by any force to expropriate land without compensation. We will learn from the mistakes and the good that the Zimbabweans have done.

His monumental legacy will inspire the current and the future generations. Despite a protracted economic crisis,

Zimbabwe's education has retained its ranking amongst the best in African Report by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation, Unesco, that put Zimbabwe's literacy at around 90%. Today, we join the people of Zimbabwe under President Mnangagwa to call for the lifting of sanctions on Zimbabwe ... [Applause.] ... which has done more harm to the people and the economy of Zimbabwe. Our approach ... [Interjections.] ... Hey, former colonisers keep quiet. [Laughter.] [Applause.] You were fighting against us with Ian Smith ... [Interjections.] ... yourselves.

The SPEAKER: Hon Maswanganyi! Hon Maswanganyi, you will not point members with your fingers, please. Thank you.

Mr M J MASWANGANYI: Our approach ... [Laughter.] ... to this again will be guided by our principle that the problems of Zimbabwe will be solved by Zimbabweans themselves and through multilateral platforms like SADC and the African Union, AU. When Mugabe departed, he was at peace because he had returned land to the people. What we are also going to do here in South Africa as the ANC is to return land to our people. [Applause.] President Mugabe joins the list of martyrs of our revolution who continue to be the stars that continue to guide our revolutionary path; we dare not forget them. Today he

walks in the company of Joshua Nkomo, Josiah Tongogara, Sifiso Dabengwa, Solomon Mujuru, Herbert Chitepo and other fallen heroes. Rest in peace.

Phambili nge Hondo! Phambili nge Chimurenga! Asante sana!
[Kupiga makofi.] (Translation of Kiswahili sentences follows.)

[Keep on fighting! Forward with the revolution! Thank you! [Applause.]]

The SPEAKER: [Thank you.]

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Speaker, in 1988, when the hon Malema, whose hero is the late Robert Mugabe, was but six years old, I travelled to Harare to commemorate the anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, at a concert featuring many international luminaries. Little did I know, at that very time, that Mugabe's Fifth Brigade henchmen were busy indiscriminately massacring 20 000 of his Matabele compatriots.

The Fifth Brigade was different from all other Zimbabwean army units; it was directly subordinate to the prime minister's office, and not integrated into the army command structures or normal structures. They conducted

public executions in Matabeleland. Victims were often forced to dig their own graves in front of family and fellow villagers. I had no idea that this man who fought an illegitimate racist regime, and laid solid foundations in the nation's education was also laying the basis of a corrupt and venal state.

The fame reference by Tacitus to Rome's enemies is apposite here, he said:

These plunderers of the world, after exhausting the land by their devastations, are rifling the ocean stimulated by avarice to ravage, to slaughter, to usurp under false titles they call empire; and where they make a desert, they call it peace.

But, peace it is not. Under the jackboot of oppression; under the guise of anticolonialism; under the figleaf that covered theft, and fostered undeserving elites, all courtesy of Mugabe's whim and fiat spanning some 39 uninterrupted years, Zimbabweans now live in fear. This is the textbook definition of tyranny, and as Aeschylus said, whose words Mugabe would have recognised being a scholar of some significance: "a tyrant's trust dishonours those who earn it." And yes, the worst kind of tyrant is often the one who was once the victim.

Mugabe suffered, he fought, and he helped deliver freedom to the people of Rhodesia. But to his opponents he was a tyrant who imposed a National Socialist regime, governed by a central committee and a politburo that brooked no dissent. To his supporters, he was a revolutionary, an anti-imperialist hero. He was an embodiment of 20th century African nationalism, but the cold lens of history shows he ruled over Zimbabwe for nearly four decades and left a legacy dominated by murder, bloodshed, torture, persecution of political opponents, intimidation and vote-rigging on a grand scale.

He provides the textbook example of the perils many national liberation movements have visited on people hungry for dignity and a shared humanity, that binds instead of destroying, that builds instead of sowing the seeds of discord and deprivation. This is no time for mealy-mouthed condolences.

If Mugabe's death is to be remembered, let it be a beacon that warns against the path he trod, and that others appear destined to follow, the madness of rampant status control, the fostering of rent-seeking elites, the dispossession of private property, the perils of profligacy, tit-for-tat racism, and the impoverishment of

nation, a desert in the making that some have the temerity to call peace.

The only peace that exists in Mugabe's legacy is propped up by fear, and fed by hunger. The descent into the morass of failure was relentless for a country that used to be the jewel in Africa, to be carefully preserved as former Tanzanian President Julius Nyerere, architect of another parched landscape, advised Mugabe. With a prosperous agricultural sector and a manufacturing industry contributing 25% to GDP, Zimbabwe inherited a relatively modern economy which, despite being rooted in the supremacy of the white settlers, was among the most advanced in the region.

Almost 40 years later, the only jewels left are those made from the country's rich diamond fields, and traded in Antwerp via undisclosed deals at the expense of Zimbabweans. Ordinary Zimbabweans subsist on informal activities such as petty trade and artisanal mining, on shrinking incomes and acute cash crisis shaking the banking sector, with millions facing food and nutrition insecurity, a veritable desert. This is the shameful legacy of Robert Gabriel Mugabe. At his inauguration he said: "Tomorrow we shall cease to be men and women of the past and become men and women of the future". The events

that have prevailed in Zimbabwe since then have made a complete mockery of his speech.

Today, the messiahs have turned into persecutors, outdoing the colonial regimes they ousted. So, as we consider the life of Mugabe, let's heed the warnings his life has provided. It's time to say, thus far and no further. Why? Because some appear to be cut from the same cloth as their erstwhile hero, and it is incumbent therefore on us to ring out the warnings from the Latin phrase, *latet anguis in herba* - beware, there are snakes in the grass. I thank you. [Applause.]

Rev K R J MESHOE: Speaker, on behalf of the ACDP, I wish to offer my condolences to the family and the people of Zimbabwe on the passing away of former Zimbabwean president, the late Robert Gabriel Mugabe. It is widely agreed that Mr Mugabe started his presidency relatively well in a country that was prospering and was at peace, to the extent that it had come to be known as the breadbasket of Africa.

Things started to deteriorate when the late Morgan Tsvangirai and associates formed the Movement for Democratic Change that opposed some of his dictatorial tendencies, and divisive policies they believed would

destroy the economy and the relative peace Zimbabwe had. Speaker, I will not dwell much on the political intolerance or regime of brutality that ensued and changed the course of history in Zimbabwe until the late Mr Mugabe was deposed by the army in a well-co-ordinated bloodless coup last year.

What I would like to highlight, are two positive things for which many Zimbabweans credit Mr Mugabe. Firstly, he is applauded for the education he gave them, one of the best on the continent. In an opinion piece written by Prof Jonathan Jansen entitled, "South Africa can learn a thing or two from Zimbabwe's education system." He wrote, and I quote:

As the regime of Robert Mugabe crumbled unexpectedly before our very eyes, I could not help but recall why I left my university in California to do my doctoral fieldwork in rural Zimbabwe about a decade after the end of white rule.

He continues to say, and I quote:

To this day, top universities send their marketing personnel to Zimbabwe to recruit talented students. Zimbabwean teachers in South Africa make a significant

contribution to science and mathematics achievement in townships and rural schools. Their students not only graduate from our universities; they often excel with distinction.

The ACDP concurs with Professor Jansen and encourages government to review the abysmal state of education in this country, and learn from the strong Zimbabwean education model. The second positive that many Zimbabweans still speak about, is that they were taught the value of hard work, rather than becoming dependent on the state to provide for their basic needs.

It has been said that many of our hotels and restaurants prefer to hire Zimbabweans not because of their willingness to accept lower salaries, but mainly because they have a stronger work ethic. I recently read of primary school children in a rural area of Zimbabwe who were involved in projects to keep their community clean. They don't complain when they have to pick up litter because they are taught to take pride in keeping their community clean.

This, I believe, South Africa can learn from, and is part of the good things they say Mr Mugabe left for them.

Thank you.

Mr B H HOLOMISA: Somlomo namalungu abekekileyo ale Ndlu yoWiso-mthetho sithi egameni le-UDM tutwini kubantu baseZimbabwe nakusapho lukatata uMugabe. Ngexesha ndandisaphethe, phofu ndizibeke ngenkani kuloo minyaka, ndaba nethamsanqa lokuba ndimemnywe eSwaziland kumsitho wokubekwa kukaKumkani uMswati III. [Kwahlekwa.] UKumkani lo waye wandazisa kwiinkokheli zeeFrontline States apho ndaye ndadibana notata lo. Ukusukela ngoko samana sidibana kwimisitho okanye kwiinkomfa ezithile.

Njengoko kusitshiwo, ngumntu onobuntu kwaye ufundile. Xa sidibene ebedla ngokundibalisela ngeentsomi zabo zaseDikeni kwanokuba babesenza ntoni bejikeleza kweza lali bekhangela izinto abacinga ukuba zingabaphilisa. Lilonke sithi noko le ndoda isebenzile nangona ibinazo iingxakana ethe yabanazo njengamntu wonke. Ayikho inkokeli engenazingxaki. Sonke siyafana sizinkokeli, zineempazamo zethu. [Kwaqhwyatywa.] Kodwa ke yena into esiya kuthi simkhumbule ngayo yile ibithethwa apha ngutata uMeshoe yemfundo.

Ndikhe ndathetha nenkumanda yemikhosi iZipra, enye yeenjengele eziphume izandla, ndibuza ukuba kwakutheni ukuze kwenzekela laa nto eMatabeleland. Wayibeka kakuhle into yokuba iinjengele ezazingqonge utata uMugabe zaba neempembelelo ezingalunganga ezade zabangela ukuba

kubekho ukujongana ngezikhondo zamehlo phakathi koNkomo naye. Loo nto yabangela ukuba kusweleke abantu abaninzi. Ezo zinto ke azibhalwa kakuhle ngababhali bembali. Nangoku uya kufamanisa ukuba kwezi nkokeli zikhe zanikhokela umntu nimvotela elungile kodwa ufumanise ukuba le nto ebeyithunyiwe ixhwilwa ngaba bamngqongileyo.

Ngoko ke, lilonke sithi tata uMugabe lala ngoxolo uphumle. Wandinceda ke kodwa kuba wandivulela iminyango ndaya kuqhina koo-Angola ukuya kubona uDos Santos, ndangena eZambia ukuya kukhahlela ku-K K Kaunda nase-Uganda apho ndadibana noMuseveni sithetha ngokukhulula uMzantsi Afrika, makwedini, hayi le nto niyenzayo ngoku yokutya imali. Hayi maan. [Kwahlekwa.] *(Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.)*

[Mr B H HOLOMISA: Speaker and hon members of this House of Assembly, we say on behalf of the UDM let the pain be palliated people of Zimbabwe and to the family of Mr Mugabe. When I was still in power by force in those years, I was lucky enough to be invited to Swaziland for the coronation ceremony of King Mswati III. [Laughter.] The King introduced me to the leaders of the Frontline States where I met Mr Mugabe. Since then we used to meet at some events or conferences.]

As mentioned, he was a kind and educated person. When we met, he used to tell me about their legends in Dikeni and what they were doing, going around the villages looking for things that they thought would heal them. All in all, at least this man worked even though he had his problems like everyone else. There is no leader without problems. We are all the same leaders, with our faults. [Applause.] But what we will remember him for is what Father Meshoe said about education.

I have spoken to the commander of the Zipra forces, one of the best generals, asking why that happened in Matabeleland. He put it well that the generals who surrounded Mr Mugabe had negative influences which even caused a confrontation between Mr Nkomo and him. That caused many people to die. Those things are not well-written by historians. Even now, you will find that among these leaders who once led you, you vote for the right person, but you find out that what he was sent for is being hijacked by those around him.

So, all in all we say Mr Mugabe rest in peace. He helped me because he opened doors for me and I managed to go to Angola to see Dos Santos; I entered Zambia to greet KK Kaunda and Uganda where I met Museveni talking about freeing South Africa, and not involved in the corruption

you are doing now, boys. I don't like that comrades.

[Laughter.]

Mnu V ZUNGULA: Somlomo ohloniphekileyo, namhlanje sibona ama-Afrika siphinde sifumanise ukuba ngoobani abantu abangengawo ama-Afrika. Umntu ongum-Afrika uyayazi ukuba xa umntu eswelekile awuthethi kakubi ngaye, uthetha kakuhle kuba uzama ukubonisa abantu ukuba mabazame ukukopa izinto ezilungileyo nezintle azenzileyo.

(Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)

[Mr V ZUNGULA: Hon Speaker, today we see Africans and we also know who non-Africans are. An African person knows that when a person dies, you don't speak ill of him, but you speak well because you are trying to show people that they should try to copy the good side and good things he did.]

As the ATM, we pay our respects to a fearless servant of Zimbabwe, a servant of Africa who is respected and admired all over the continent. Gushungo led his people and freed them from the colonial and oppressive British government.

He made sure that Zimbabwe broke free from the colonial Rhodesia. In our country, we are still stuck on our

colonial name as well as the apartheid, economic, social and cultural structure. It is as if the leaders of our country are fearful of our colonisers and oppressors. The best condolence we can give for President Mugabe is to assist the people of Zimbabwe to overcome the challenges they face.

Today, Zimbabwe can build its economy. It needs its own political will and an end to political meddling. South Africa must assist Zimbabwe so that it is profitable for Zimbabweans to stay in Zimbabwe as we all that no one aspires to be displaced from their home country. South Africa, the Southern African Development Community, SADC, and the African Union, AU, must reinforce the structures for development of all regions in Africa.

The sanctions have destroyed the lives of the people of Zimbabwe, and therefore must be lifted. However, the sanctions imposed on the administration personnel because of the crimes that they have committed against the people of Zimbabwe must be upheld. South Africa must aid the people of Zimbabwe not certain political parties. The corrupt Zimbabwe politicians must be refused to invest in our country. Similarly, South African politicians must declare their business interest in Zimbabwe. They must

not use their political positions to advance the business interests at the expense of Zimbabweans.

South Africa must be there for its neighbour and assist the country in these difficult times. We need a stable Zimbabwe for a stronger Africa. Rest in peace Gushungo!

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Speaker, on behalf of the NFP allow me to express our condolences to the wife and children of the former President Robert Mugabe. Hon Speaker, allow me to start off with a quote from the late hon Mugabe on 26 September 2007, and I quote:

Let Mr Bush read history correctly. Let him realise that both personally and in his representative capacity as the current president of the United States, he stands for this civilisation, which occupied, which colonised, which incarcerated, which killed. He has much to atone for and very little to lecture us on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. His hands drip with innocent blood of many nationalities.

The late Robert Mugabe was demonised by the colonialists. They rejected him as a political leader. He was branded a terrorist. He was even jailed for over 10 years. He was not even allowed to bury his son.

Whilst negotiations were taking place in the Lancaster Conference, they went out there together with the help of colonialist South Africa and they targeted and bombed many of the areas in the neighbouring states where they were planning and preparing onslaught on Rhodesia.

I think, we must admit that under President Mugabe - and I think even South Africa suffers today and has not achieved what Robert Mugabe achieved in Zimbabwe particularly in terms of - and I think hon Malema is correct. If you look at the issue of education and where he took them, from 45% right to 80% literacy. If you go back to some of the quotations of President Mugabe, he always put emphasis on education because he said that, if you do not have education, you will not be able to succeed in anything in the world.

We must be mindful of the fact that, President Robert Mugabe played a pivotal role in the liberation of the people of Zimbabwe from the apartheid Rhodesia in those years. He has paid a price for it as he spent many years in jail - as we all are aware. He once said that, your key to success is education. It is better to have education than to be surrounded by poor graduates and rich criminals.

You can see the emphasis that he actually put. One of the reasons why Zimbabwe is in the state that it is today is because of the sanctions, particularly with the role that the United States and the British have played in ensuring that there is no success in Zimbabwe. Let us not entirely put the blame on Zimbabwe and President Mugabe for the state of Zimbabwe. Let us acknowledge the role that he played in liberating the people in Zimbabwe. Our condolences go to his family, friends and particularly to all those who currently supported him and still believed in his leadership. Thank you very much.

Mr M P GALO: Hon Speaker, paying homage to a controversial leader like President Robert Mugabe is daunting to any person who has cared to interrogate his legacy. The living dead, in terms of the African traditions are never to be spoken ill of. However, we can talk about president Mugabe's legacy.

Let us start with Gukurahundi Massacre of the Ndebele civilians which was carried out by the Zimbabwean National Army from early 1983 to late 1987. Over 30 000 people were brutally killed under the blatant command of President Mugabe. In this regard, we are calling upon President Emmerson Mnangagwa to establish the truth and

reconciliation commission to bring the perpetrators to book.

He led the dual role of transforming the economy of Zimbabwe and providing quality education. He regrettably also led a dual role of destroying the same economy as well as trampling on human rights of the Zimbabwean people by aligning himself to the Pan-Africanist Agenda. President Mugabe assisted many Azanian People's Liberation Army, Apla, comrades and combatants. This is the leaf that we take out of his political life, and his commitment to Pan-Africanism.

In the latter years of his life, he had started embracing accountable leadership on the continent, lashing out at the despots in the diaspora. President Mugabe's indigenisation land programme was pugnacious, ill-informed and misinformed. From his life, we learn of the African leader who rose to prominence on the back of a struggle for his people but had his political life cut short because of his penchant for absolute power. We wish his family well. May his soul rest in eternal peace! I thank you.

Mr J S MALEMA: Hon speaker, we want to take this opportunity to agree with what comrade Maswangwanyani said,

particularly on the sanctions, that we should unite as a country and demand imperialist forces to drop the sanctions against Zimbabwe. We also want to make a clarion call to President Mnangagwa to allow the Zimbabwean Zanu-PF comrades who are in exile to return back home. There should be a high level of political tolerance because the disagreement should not lead to targeting and victimising those who hold a different view. If Zimbabwe is going to succeed, all the progressive forces will have to come together in defence of what president Mugabe stood for.

We also want to avail ourselves to engage in facilitating that type of an agreement between the comrades in exile and those who remain in Zimbabwe. There are small-minded people who always get tempted to blame comrade Grace Mugabe for whatever reasons. We see that as a direct attack on the legacy of President Mugabe. You must have courage to confront President Mugabe and leave his wife out of your hatred of his politics, because it is only fools who target wives when they are defeated by husbands [Applause.] You must accept that the husband defeated you when he was still alive and leave his wife and children alone. Allow them to live in Zimbabwe in peace. We do not want to wake up one morning and be told that Grace is no

longer staying there, because she is victimised for the political stands that were taken by the husband.

I heard someone saying here in 1988 Malema was this or that age, and that is the problem of an ageist. You are an ageist of note, because whether I was eight or six years at the time, politically, if we were to compare what I have achieved and what you have achieved, you do not come anywhere close [Applause.] You always hide behind the dress of your mother's credentials. You use your family wrongly for personal accumulation and you always irritate us with your parents' credentials as if they are yours. They are not yours; you have no credentials at all. [Interjections.]

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Point of order!

The SPEAKER: Hon Malema, please take your seat, there is a point of order. What is your point of order, Sir?

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: The hon Malema accused me of using my family's name for personal accumulation. He must withdraw. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order member, order! Hon Malema, I did not hear a name. Were you referring to this hon member?

Mr J S MALEMA: Hon Speaker, I never mentioned anyone, but if the shoe fits, wear it [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Please proceed.

Mr J S MALEMA: Stop! You are too old chief; you are too old to be saying, my mother, and my father, this and that [Laughter.] Write your own history which is going to be the ugliest history because of the side you chose.

The SPEAKER: Hon Malema, hon Malema!

Mr J S MALEMA: You will never have credentials close to your parents. You are nothing compared to your parents. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Malema, your time has expired. Order members! Order!

Debate concluded.

Question put.

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting; Inkatha Freedom Party and African Christian Democratic Party abstaining).

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION
REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON EMPLOYMENT AND LABOUR**

There was no debate.

The Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of vote:

Dr M J CARDO: Hon Speaker, the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of the Portfolio Committee on Employment and Labour does not adequately grasp - let alone address - the monstrous magnitude of South Africa's unemployment crisis.

In 1994, there were 3,6 million unemployed South Africans. In 2019, the number is over 10 million. Two adults in every five cannot find work. In 1994, the official unemployment rate was 20%. Today, the rate is 29,1%, the highest in 11 years.

Every single day, for the past 10 years, almost 900 South Africans joined the ranks of the unemployed. Our youth bear the brunt of it. Yet, nearly six months after rebranding, the Departments of Employment and Labour has

still not reconfigured to tackle its expanded mandate of job creation.

The department should be focusing its efforts on supporting labour-intensive sectors like light manufacturing and tourism to create new jobs and take on new workers. This is where the opportunity for growth and access to a global market of seven billion consumers lies.

Through deregulation, the department should be making it easier for business to absorb large numbers of relatively unskilled workers into productive employments in technologically advanced sectors. It should be championing the cause of small business owners who are being choked by the extension of collective bargaining agreements and other onerous labour regulations.

Hon Speaker, in the face of the challenges that confront us, the observations and the recommendations contained in this report are feeble and the DA cannot support them. I thank you. [Applause.]

Adv T E MULAUDZI: Hon Speaker, the EFF rejects this Budgetary Review and Recommendation, BRR, Report of the Portfolio Committee on Employment and Labour. As if this

department does not exist, more than 10 million people, mainly youth willing and looking for work, cannot find work. Companies are retrenching workers everyday.

ArcerlorMittal is retrenching as many as 2 000 workers presently. Sibanye-Stillwater Gold Mine is retrenching more than 10 000 workers. Even banks which are making profit are retrenching workers. More than 15 000 people are at risk of losing their jobs in the banking sectors. Even state-owned entities like Eskom, SA Airways, SAA, Transnet and Denel are also retrenching workers.

The ruling party has no believable plan to stop these retrenchments or a plan to create new jobs. We, as the EFF, have asked the Minister of Employment and Labour, Mr Thulas Nxesi a question for a written reply: Whether government will ever introduce the Job Protection Bill? He said no, because the current legislation is enough.

This is how detached, irrational and reckless our so-called leaders are.

Hon Speaker, we have an economy that put the interest of the so-called investors above everything, including human life.

Labour inspector function has completely collapsed. Workers are abused, raped and dismissed without due processes. While in many cases, they work under bad working conditions without anyone intervening.

Transformation, especially in the private sector, has failed. White men continue to dominate senior management positions. Now, the purging of black professionals in the state-owned enterprises by the Minister of Public Enterprises means that fewer and fewer opportunities for blacks to get employed are reduced drastically. Here we are, adopting the BRR divorced from the reality.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired.

Adv T E MULAUDZI: The EFF proudly rejects this BRR Report. [Applause.]

Mr X NGWEZI: Hon Speaker and hon members, this department's mandate is to regulate South Africa's labour market for a sustainable economy. Regulating the labour market must be achieved through amongst others, the development of appropriate legislation and regulations, inspections, compliance monitoring and enforcement, social and income protection and social dialogue.

In its efforts to ensure the above, the department must also fully utilise its abilities from its internal audit and not merely await corrections or the identification of challenges by the Auditor-General.

This contributes to a slower response by the department to resolve its issues which contradicts the idea to centralise its responsibilities.

The department has also been recorded to underspend about R196 million, yet the department had not taken the appropriate steps to prevent the fruitless, wasteful and irregular expenditure. The underspending in this department indicates obvious service delivery shortfalls.

In fact, this department has listed in its reports that the Productivity SA and Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration, CCMA, suffer from inadequate resources for the former and a need for additional funding for later.

Hon Speaker, the department must work with the Department of Home Affairs, to resolve the employment issues that saw violent attacks against some foreign nationals in the trucking, agriculture and the hospitality sector.

The departments must perform more oversight to employers and verify the legality in terms of the documentation regarding their employees in these sectors.

The Deputy Director-General: Immigration Services of Home Affairs, Mr Jackie Mackay stated that there is little control and regulation for immigration as to where they are allocated and there is no policy to integrate people when they move from rural to urban settlements.

The Department of Employment and Labour together with the Department of Home Affairs must design policies where immigrants are located in South Africa, for the first few years according to the skills requirements of the regions in South Africa.

We see other nations doing this across the world, whereby they approve skilled immigrants into their countries and conditionally locate them in regions and sectors for which they have been granted entry. With these concerns hon Speaker, the IFP supports the BRR Report. Thank you.
[Applause.]

Ms H JORDAAN: Hon Speaker, the unemployment rate in South Africa is sitting at an alarming 29,1% - the highest in 11 years. We have a higher-than-projected inflation rate

and less than the ideal economic growth rate. These are not the ideal circumstances in which the department has to fulfil its expanded mandate of both implementing and monitoring the implementation of labour legislation and enabling job creation.

Die departement en die regering doen hulself ook nie 'n guns deur arbeids- en ander wetgewing te implementeer wat juis hierdie ideale kortwiek nie.

Deur die privaatsektor keer op keer as die swartskaap vir julle mislukkings uit te kryt werk lankal nie meer nie.

Daar is bepaalde tekortkominge in die Departement van Arbeid en Werkskepping en sy entiteite wat allereers aangespreek sal moet word. So nie, sal die departement nooit in sy doel slaag nie.

Dit is 'n absolute skreiende skande dat die Ongevalle Kommissaris as entiteit van die Departement van Arbeid vir die afgelope nege jaar 'n weerhoude ouditmening van die Ouditeur-Generaal ontvang het.

Dieselfde geld vir die oudituitkomste van die werkloosheid-versekerheidsfonds en sy swak prestasie, deur slegs 63% van sy jaarteikens te behaal.

Swak bestuur aan die een kant en kortsigtige drakoniese wetgeving aan die ander kant veroorsaak dat werkloosheid bloot aanhou styg, wat weer 'n bepaalde uitwerking op die fiskus en die land se ekonomie het. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.*)

[The department and the government are also not doing themselves a favour by implementing labour and other legislation that clips the wings of these ideals.

Blaming the private sector time and again for your failures has long ceased to work.

There are certain shortcomings in the Department of Employment and Labour and its entities that should be addressed, first of all. If not, the department will never succeed in its goal.

It is an absolute shame that the Compensation Commissioner as an entity of the Department of Labour has received a withheld audit opinion from the Auditor-General for the past nine years.

The same applies to the audit outcomes of the Unemployment Insurance Fund, UIF, and its poor performance by achieving only 63% of its annual targets.

Poor governance on the one hand and short-sighted draconian legislation on the other cause unemployment to simply continue to rise, which in turn has a definite effect on the fiscus and the country's economy.]

Hon Speaker, the chief executive officer, CEO, of Capitec, this week, said despite the best of intentions, South Africa's Black Economic Empowerment, BEE, scheme has largely been a failure and I quote:

If you look at BEE in totality in South Africa, it hasn't worked because it should be there to help all South Africans and, unfortunately, it has only helped a couple of people.

In contrast with this statement from the CEO of one of South Africa's best performing banks, the Minister of Employment and Labour, a department whose entities cannot manage to get proper audit outcomes, stated in August that harsh measures will be resorted to, to ensure a quicker transformation in the workplace.

Government must wake up. Your policies are failing, leading to higher unemployment and insufficient economic growth. The FF Plus cannot support this Budgetary Review and Recommendation, BRR, Report. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon Madam Speaker, the committee, having assessed the report of this department, made the observations so as to make the department to turn things around. We have also noted the decline in industrial actions and an increase in noncompliance to legislative instruments by the employers.

An upsurge of health and safety breaches in the productive sectors that is agriculture, mining and manufacturing and also the lack of inspectors to enforce labour regulations.

The Employment Equity Commission Report delineates some of these challenges in great clarity. The committee also stressed the urgency of funding the Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Conciliation, CCMA, for the purpose of discharging its duties properly.

With the minimum wage coming into effect, we are likely to see employers seeking exemptions from the department. This process may end up requiring the CCMA to intervene or mediate.

We have also noted some of the employers failing to comply with the Compensation for Occupational Injuries

and Diseases Act. This must be acted upon immediately by the inspectors.

The National Economic Development and Labour Council Nedlac, has to improve its capacity. It has failed to protect massive job retrenchments that resulted in the economy contracting.

In addition Madam Speaker, Nedlac has not intervened with great efficiency to mobilise the social partners to retain jobs.

There is a great need for co-operation between the Ministries of Employment and Labour and Mineral Resources and Energy as section 54 directs that work stoppages are warranted because some of the mining companies do not enforce safety regulations. There are major implications for companies and the workers alike as work stoppages turn to affect their profit margins and jobs respectively. We support this report. Thank you.

Mr W M MADISHA: Hon Speaker, please permit me to start by indicating that South Africa is the sixth richest country in the world. However, it is one of the poorest in the world. South Africa's riches emerge from mineral

resources where more than 400 000 people work, but are losing jobs daily and are poorly paid.

Recommendations put before Parliament today are not new, but are recommendations tabled before the democratic Parliament over the past very many years. I here refer to 1998, to date of course. The major problem I must indicate is that those recommendations are never implemented. That is why today unemployment rate is beyond 50%.

I remember I raised this last year and it was said that unemployment rate is around 21% which is wrong, and it is still wrong because like it has been empirically proven.

The young people who do not even have matric, are part of 72% of those people who do not work. Now, these are the problems that we have, besides the very many millions who are there and are not working.

Now, the ruling party has pushed and succeeded in ensuring that people believe that unemployment rate is around 29%. That is not correct. There is only one thing that can help us at the moment, and that is for the South Africans to demand that money that is wasted daily gets properly directed to where it is supposed to.

The person who must do that is the ... [Time expired.]

Mr C H M SIBISI: Hon Speaker, indeed, poverty, unemployment and inequality are three major challenges facing the country. In terms of the official count, 6,7 million people are unemployed in South Africa, which is 29% of everybody who could be working. In terms of the expanded definition, more than 10 million people are unemployed, or 38,5% of people who could be working.

The number of people who are employed increased by 21 000 from 16 291 000 in the first quarter of 2019, to 16 339 000 in the second quarter of 2019. Compared to the second quarter of 2018, the number of employed people increased by 25 000. These poverty lines, if accurate, indicate that extreme poverty in South Africa has, over the years, been rising and falling.

In 2006 the percentage of the population living below the food poverty line was 28,4%. In 2009, the number climbed to 33,5% in part perhaps because of the global financial crisis. By 2011 it had fallen to 21,4%. In 2015 it climbed again to 25,4% or 13,8 million people.

The NFP, unfortunately, notes the Auditor-General's report stating that the department underspent by

R196,2 million and failed to take effective steps to prevent wasteful, irregular and fruitless expenditure. The NFP also notes and is encouraged that the UIF has developed a plan to address internal controls and deficiencies and a mechanism to monitor the implementation of the plan in order to combat failure in monitoring, management and financial statements.

The NFP also notes and encourages gender parity in accordance with the department's gender equity plan to combat gender inequality. The NFP supports the BRR Report tabled here today. Thank you.

Mr W M THRING: Hon Speaker, poverty, unemployment and inequality remain the three most significant challenges facing the country. These were identified by the National Development Plan, NDP, in its 2011 diagnostic report. Raising employment through faster economic growth has become a key priority to remedy this situation.

Regrettably, the rate of unemployment continues to rise. The quarterly unemployment survey by Statistics SA shows that unemployment, in terms of its narrow definition, has surpassed 29%. In terms of the expanded definition of unemployment, we are looking at unemployment sitting at

close to 40%. This is the highest jobless rate that we have had since 2008.

In response to the unemployment challenges, President Cyril Ramaphosa convened the Presidential Jobs Summit in October 2018 with government, business, labour and other social partners. This also allowed for findings by Former President's Motlanthe high-level panel, one of which was to amend the Labour Relations Act to remove the extension to the non-parties clause or to prescribe to non-parties, recommending that this should be applicable to small and medium-sized enterprises.

The ACDP also notes that there has been a commensurate increase in unemployment together with the challenges that we have seen in Eskom. So, in order to solve the unemployment problems that we have, it is important that we look at the energy crisis because there is a correlation between the challenges that we have in energy with the unemployment that we face in South Africa. I thank you.

Mr S W MDABE: Hon Speaker, the Portfolio Committee on Employment and Labour has considered the performance of the department and its entities. After considering the presentation made by the department on the annual report

and the input from the Auditor-General and the advisory boards, the committee has made various observations and recommendations.

With the expanded mandate of employment, the Department of Employment and Labour will be required to change its approach from mere compliance enforcement to the co-ordination of all government efforts to create jobs and reduce unemployment.

The Department of Employment and Labour will now be expected, among other things, to contribute to bringing about a qualitative structural shift in employment. The above broad functions of the department will surely require an increase in the budget allocation to set the proper structures, repositioning reinforcement and capacity enhancement for the execution of this fresh and progressive mandate.

The department has five entities that are playing a pivotal role and a transformational developmental role in our country, and therefore they ought to be guarded jealously. The portfolio committee will constantly monitor the implementation of the Compensation Fund Action Plan, which is an instrument of improving the performance of this entity on many fronts, responding to

the findings of at least three investigations that were conducted in the entity as well as improving its audit outcomes which have seen disclaimers for several years. There shall be no hesitation in taking further action in the event of satisfactory results not occurring.

The manner in which the Unemployment Insurance Fund ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired.

Mr S W MDABE: The ANC supports this BRR Report.

[Applause.]

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION
REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HOME AFFAIRS**

There was no debate.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Speaker, I hereby move:

That the Report be adopted.

Thank you.

Declarations of vote:

Ms T A KHANYILE: Hon Speaker, this department has a backlog on asylumseekers' appeals of 150 000. It is of great concern that R200 billion has become a contingent liability. The e-visa was supposed to have been piloted in April. Today, seven months later and still in this House, speeches by the ANC members even last week have lauded our e-visa system that has not been implemented.

The Department of Home Affairs is spending 5% above wage budgets. This is unsustainable. The DA has provided a solution but no one listens. Supply chain issues, irregular expenditure, poor internal controls downtimes ... [Inaudible.] ... the elephant in the room let alone the Government Printing Work who did not even bother to produce their audit report. This department consists of only 770 immigration officials who were missing in action to assist refugees with their recent plight in Cape Town. The DA will not support this Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report. I thank you.

Ms L F TITO: Speaker, the EFF rejects the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report. The Department of Home Affairs has been problematic for a while because of the inability of government to properly locate the strategic and objective roles of the department in advancing the developmental ideals of the country and the continent.

This means that our government is unable to successfully execute its mandate because it is caught wanting on what is to be done. If properly located, this department could be the most strategic department for our renewed focus to foster Pan-African unity and development. It can be an enabler in promoting, maintaining and sustaining the rich African culture, a culture of unity and oneness and give legitimacy to colonial establishment.

Instead of playing this revolutionary role in our conception of nationhood within the context of Pan-African unity, the department has relied on colonial prescripts in order to undermine the oneness of African people, a culture of trade relations and economic stability. This department undermines a primary tradition inherent in African people; a tradition of common courtesy, compassion, effectiveness and efficiency. This is demonstrated by undermining our African people to long queues which do not allow our people to access permits on

time so that they can participate meaningfully in the heritage and economy of our land.

We are not shocked that other people of the world are granted unlimited access to our land as if they are indigenous people. This is the state of Africans in Africa, a state of refugee and discomfort at the hands of their own African siblings. It must be no surprise, therefore, that this attitude get extended to other sectors of society and we get engulfed in xenophobic sentiment as the country. We want the Department of Home Affairs that is welcoming to African people, and does not treat African people as if they are unwelcome in a land that is in reality theirs. This department must make sure that it checks and balances our capacities ...

[Inaudible.] [Time expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms B G Boroto): ... hon member!
hon member! Your time has expired. Thank you, thank you.

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Thank you very much, hon House Chairperson. Ask any South African what they think of the Department of Home Affairs and the first two things that would come to mind are the painstakingly long queues and the systems that are perpetually offline. Ask the people of KwaZulu-Natal and they will speak about the poor

service delivery that we see that some offices like the Umngeni office. Speak to our grandmothers in our deep rural areas and they will tell us how they have to spend R200 of their Sassa grant monies to travel to Home Affairs offices far away from their own homes, only to find that Home Affairs offices to where they have travelled are offline for days on end.

Perhaps, the biggest failure of this department is its failure to manage immigration. It is a fact that this department has no idea who is in South Africa, from which countries and whether those foreign nationals have entered our country legally or not. They have no clue whether any of the spaza shops or any of the Chinese malls are run by migrants with legal documentation or not.

The Department spends millions on deporting undocumented migrants back to their own countries, only for those economic migrants to cross back over the border because, in fact, there is no border. The Department of Home Affairs recently admitted that it has no legal capacity or resources to enforce its own immigration laws. Thus, now faces just close to R700 million in civil claims brought against it for these failures.

Amnesty International says that South Africa's broken asylum system leaves thousands of applicants undocumented, causing tensions with locals. In the same vein the SA Chamber of Commerce has warned that it is this department's failure to document migrants that leads to xenophobia. The question remains: Can this department fix itself and fix what is broken? Only time will tell.

In the spirit of wanting to fix what is broken, the IFP will support this Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report.

Mnr F J MULDER: Agb Huisvoorsitter, die rol wat die Departement van Binnelandse Sake moet vervul om die identiteit van Suid-Afrikaanse burgers te beskerm, die migrasie van mense te reguleer en ook die land se internasionale verpligtinge na te kom wat bewegingsregulering betref, moet nie onderskat word nie.

Hierdie mandaat staan sentraal in binnelandse veiligheid asook die beskerming van Suid-Afrikaanse burgers wat in die buiteland reis. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.*)

[Mr F J MULDER: Hon House Chairperson, the role that the Department of Home Affairs must fulfil in order to

protect the identity of South African citizens, regulate the migration of people and also fulfil the country's international obligations regarding movement regulation must not be underestimated.

This mandate is central to interior security as well as the protection of South African citizens travelling abroad.]

The three overarching budget programmes through which the department's mandate is at most rated namely; administration, citizen affairs and immigration affairs can only succeed if they coexist in synergy.

Te oordeel aan talle klagtes van die publiek, neem aansoeke van reisdokumente in heelwat gevalle soms maande of geen terugvoering word ontvang deur die amptelike kanale op die departement se webwerf nie. Ons ontvang weekliks talle klagtes van die publiek wat doodgewoon geen reaksie op hul navrae ontvang nie. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.*)

[Judging by numerous complaints from the public, applications for travel documents in many cases sometimes take months to finalise or no feedback is received through the official channels on the department's

website. We receive numerous complaints every week from the public who simply do not receive any response to their inquiries.]

The administration should be able to support the citizens' programme to provide accessible services and documents for citizens and lawful residents, and immigration affairs should be able to regulate foreign visitors and enforce immigration legislation and deportations.

Die departement bedryf sy sake só dat hy tans regseise van meer as R2 miljard, vanweë swak dienslewering, in die gesig staar. Die departement erken self dat hy nie oor die kapasiteit beskik om immigrasiewetgewing te polisieer nie, met spesifieke verwysing na die heersende oproer onder onwettige immigrante by die Verenigde Nasieskantore, VN-kantore, in Pretoria en in Kaapstad nie. Die VF Plus ondersteun nie die verslag nie. Dankie, Voorsitter. *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.)*

[The department runs its affairs in such a way that it is currently facing legal claims of more than R2 billion due to poor service delivery. The department itself admits that it does not have the capacity to police immigration legislation, with specific reference to the prevailing

unrest among illegal immigrants at the United Nations, UN, offices in Pretoria and in Cape Town. The FF Plus does not support the report. Thank you, House Chairperson.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chair, the NFP welcomes the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of the Department of Home Affairs tabled here today. Allow me first of all to welcome the decision by the Department of Home Affairs together with the Department of Tourism in relaxing the requirements for the unabridged birth certificate particularly for foreign children that want to visit South Africa, making it a lot easier enhancing the tourism industry.

Hon chairperson, what is quite evident here is the fact that the department is facing serious challenges. I think it is time that maybe this department needs a full forensic audit into the challenges that they face to be able to see exactly what is going on so that we can start addressing them. You know, it appears to be a norm at the moment that the information technology, IT, system seems to be failing the Department of Home Affairs always. People are going to the Home Affairs offices and they are turned away because the systems are down. They have to go

back and told to come back and the next day it is exactly the same thing. So, it appears to be a serious problem.

Work permits appear to be a problem. The going rate in South Africa at the moment is about R30 000 if you want a work permit. The going rate to come and go across the border today is R50 at a time, and that is all you need to pay at SA borders to be able to cross over. Over and above the challenges that we are facing in terms of supply chain and the irregular expenditure, we need to pay more attention particularly to the porous borders that we have because this is exactly where greater percentage of the corruption and illegal foreigners who are entering South Africa appears to be taking place. We call for greater border control in terms of that.

The other problem that many people seem to be experiencing is, where applications have to be submitted to an organisation, an independent organisation called Visa Facilitation Services, VFS. They have to submit it and pay lots of money for it. What happens is that - I tell you - if there is one document outstanding, they have to resubmit with everything and pay again. We think that the department needs to take control of this rather than outsourcing and have internal capacity to be able to do that. The NFP very reluctantly will support this on

the understanding that the department will do a forensic investigation to deal with this challenges. Thank you.

[Time expired.]

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, the ACDP is aware of the many challenges facing this department as we - like many other parliamentarians - receive many constituency queries and complaints. We welcome the additional R1,8 billion allocated for the modernisation programme as well as the R7,1 billion set aside of the medium term as employee compensation to improve and expand client interface. We really are looking forward to an improvement in the services that are delivered.

However, one of the key challenges remains with the border management with the number of illegal immigrants increasing over the years. As you know this places a lot of pressure on our resources when it comes to health, education and ... [Inaudible.] ... services. Regrettably, our borders remain porous. It is therefore a shame that the Border Management Agency Bill lapsed in the Fifth Parliament due to a dispute with the Treasury on the Border Management Agency, BMA, taking over customs payments at border posts. This issue needs to be resolved.

The ACDP also welcomes yesterday's announcement by the Minister that he has signed a waiver which allows foreign children to enter the country without carrying the additional supporting documents, the unabridged birth certificate. This ill-considered requirement - a number of years ago - had a devastating impact on tourism numbers and eventually, since it prevailed and that requirement has been done away with, regrettably again, at the cost of tourists coming to South Africa.

The Electoral Commission's budget is also referred to in the Report and it falls within this budget. Many questions have been asked in this regard relating to a number of issues of double voting, indelible ink and zip-zip machines. These issues need to be addressed as we prepare for the local government elections going into that season. The report makes mention of a lot of other recommendations about the entities reporting to it and clearly, as Parliament exercises its oversight functions that portfolio committee must ensure that those recommendations are complied with and are implemented to their full. I thank you.

Ms T MGWEBA: House Chair, the ANC supports the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report of the Portfolio Committee on Home Affairs. The Constitution of our

country provides for the right of dignity in the Bill of Rights which entails the right to identification and citizenship amongst other things. The Department of Home Affairs plays a critical role in entrenching the rights of our people to citizenship. Through the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, the department continues to strengthen and deepen our democracy by creating a platform for our people to exercise their rights in determining the government of their choice. On this score, we applaud the work by the IEC in the recent elections in May.

The Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR, further ensures that the Department of Home Affairs will focus on repositioning itself as a modern and secure organisation improving and expanding client interface and delivery of imperatives, establishing and operationalising a border management agency, streamlining and securing international migration as well as establishing public-private partnership in support of key infrastructure projects.

As part of contributing to the target set by the President, of doubling international tourists arrival to 21 million by 2030, the department has introduced an e-visa which will ensure the ease of travel for our

international visitors and the creation of jobs especially in the tourism sector and the entire value chain.

We have noted the clean audit achieved by the Government Printing Works, GPW, and we urge them to ensure return on investment, sound financial management and sustainability. We also note the unqualified audit opinion received by the department and urge that it enforces consequence management for procurements which are not compliant with the supply chain management regulations, irregular expenditure and corruption. We also urge the department to fill existing vacancies to ensure stability and efficient services to our people. The ANC, therefore, supports the BRRR of the Portfolio Committee on Home Affairs. [Applause.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 167: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Creecy, B D; Dhlomo, S M; Dikgale, M C; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini, D D; Dlulane, B N;

Dyantyi, P P; Frolick, C T; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gomba, M
M; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hadebe, B M; Hermans, J;
Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M; Hlengwa, M D; Hlongo, A S;
Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H;
Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Koornhof, G W;
Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M;
Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B
P; Mabiletsa, M D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe,
G; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N
P; Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P;
Majozi, Z; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P;
Maluleke, B; Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M;
Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ;
Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Mashego, M R; Mashego-
Dlamini, K C; Masiko, F A; Masondo, T S; Mathafa, O M;
Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F; Mbatha, S G N; Mbinqo-
Gigaba, B P; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, T V B;
Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N;
Mkhatshwa, N T; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M;
Modise, M; Modise, P M P; Mofokeng, J M; Molala, L E;
Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Motaung, A;
Motaung, N E; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T;
Mthembu, A H; Munyai, T B; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba,
C N; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X;
Nkabane, N P; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele,
M ; Nqola, X; Ntobongwana, N; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M;

Nxumalo, M N; Nzuza, N B; Papo, A H M; Patrein, S; Peter,
Z J; Peters, E D; Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C;
Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M;
Semenya, M R; Seoposengwe, C; Shabalala, N F; Shabalala,
L F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibisi, C H M; Sibiya, D P;
Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K;
Siwela, V S; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Soty, M M;
Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M
A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshwete, B; Van Der Merwe, L
L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P;
Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zuma, A S;
Zungu, T R M.

NOES - 91: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Basson, L J;
Bergman, D; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia,
G K Y; Ceza, K; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N;
Cuthbert, M J; De Freitas, M S F; Dlamini, M M; Faber, W
F; George, D T; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I
M; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hicklin, M B; Hinana, N E;
Hlonyana, N K F; Hoosen, M H; Hunsinger, C H H; Ismail, H
; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Keetse, P P;
Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; King, C V; Kohler, D;
Komane, R N; Kruger, H C C; Langa, T M; Lorimer, J R B;
Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B
S; Mafanya, W T I; Malatsi, M S; Maotwe, O M C; Masango,
B S ; Masipa, N P; Mazzone, N W A; Mbabama, T M; Mc

Gluwa, J J; Mente, N V; Mey, P ; Mileham, K J; Mkhaliphi, H O; Mohlala, M R; Mokgotho, S M; Mokoena, L G; Moteka, P G; Motsepe, C C S; Msane, T P; Mthenjane, D F; Mulaudzi, T E; Mulder, F J; Ngcobo, S; Nolutshungu, N J; Opperman, G ; Phillips, C; Seithloho, I S; Sharif, N K; Shelembe, M L; Shembeni, H A; Sindane, P; Siwisa, A M; Spies, E R J; Steyn, A; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Dyk, V; Van Staden, P A; Walters, T C R; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S; Yako, Y N.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION
REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON COMMUNICATIONS -
TELECOMMUNICATIONS, POSTAL SERVICES AND ENTITIES

There was no debate.

SEPHADI SE SEHOLO SA MOKGA WA BONGATA: Modulasetulo, ke sisinya hore tlaleho ena e amohelwe. (*Translation of Sesotho sentence follows.*)

[The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Chairperson, I move that the report be adopted.]

Declarations of vote:

Mr C MACKENZIE: House Chair, in my first BRRR speech in this House six years ago, I asked the then Minister Cwele whether the South African government would meet the international deadline of July 2015 to switch off the analogue signal and finally release the digital dividend - of which spectrum is one part of it. Cwele assured me with confidence that we would meet it with no problem.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): There is too much movement, please.

Mr C MACKENZIE: Fast forward to today, and if confidence translated into results, we would be downloading a full feature high-definition movie in seven seconds flat.

Instead, and unlike our neighbours in Lesotho, Mozambique, Namibia and Botswana, our government is still broadcasting analogue and hasn't released the spectrum, and to add insult to injury, Independent Communications Authority of South Africa, Icasa, latest information memorandum on spectrum release offers these bands as lots for auction when it actually has no idea beyond a

guesstimate when this spectrum will actually become available. It's selling something that it doesn't have.

So, when we review the work of the department and its entities over the last financial year, what stands out is the lack of progress. The usual competent high flyers like Sentech continue to receive clean audits while serial nonperformers like the SA post Office, Sapo, and the Universal Service and Access Agency of South Africa, Usaasa, continue to reflect matters of concern.

Among these are hundreds of millions of rand in unauthorised, fruitless and wasteful expenditure.

Given government failed to switch off the analogue signal by the 2015 deadline due to your incompetence, you effectively cost South Africa hundreds of millions in dual illumination costs, massive legal bills, and billions in revenue that could have been earned by leasing the spectrum in those bands.

While the Auditor-General doesn't record it as wasteful, the fact is you have wasted billions in opportunity costs as you sat on your collective hands and did nothing, Minister after Minister. That's real fruitless and wasteful expenditure; it's money down the drain.

This department is stagnating, treading water and going nowhere besides to conferences spouting off about the Fourth Industrial Revolution without first bothering to educate the Deputy President as to what the first, second and third ones were. The DA supports this report. [Time expired.]

Mr L G MOKOENA: House Chair, let's point out that the process of amalgamating the two departments and the streamlining of its system is slower and turns to hold back process in the department. This resulted in the inability of the department and its ability to play its shareholder role in the state-owned enterprises, SOEs.

This is evident in the following points that we have made in the committee itself. Firstly, the department is indecisive on the SABC and it seems to be a communication desk of Treasury because it has failed to protect the broadcaster from Treasury's delay to capitalise it, resulting in poor workers not being paid at the SOE.

The department is failing to recognise the industry consensus that the digital migration is the SABC's lifeline and the only way the SOE can regain market dominance against the corrupt MultiChoice which survives through bribes.

Instead of implementing migration, the department is hiding behind plans and more plans while R182 million is wasted in storing unused set-top boxes.

On the Independent Communications Authority of South Africa, Icasa, since the #DataMustFall public enquiry three years ago, the cost of data has remained unaffordable for ordinary South Africans. The Icasa is failing to whip mobile operators into line. Instead of the department and Icasa pressurising operators to lower cost and make SMSs free, they have allowed them to hide behind the lucrative spectrum which stands to benefit individuals.

We endorse the rollout of spectrum, but it cannot be used as a scapegoat by greedy mobile operators who are simply refusing to reduce the cost of data.

The Icasa has a mandate to enforce the license requirement on operators to provide free internet to 1 500 schools. Instead of enforcing this requirement, Icasa connived with the operators to reduce the number from 5 000 to 1 500 schools per service provider.

The department has allowed Treasury to influence the separation and selling of assets which they call

unaffordable. The selling of these assets of the SABC is unsustainable and will further disadvantage the organisation. For that reason, we cannot support the report. Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

Ms Z MAJOZI: Hon Chairperson, I wish to thank the Minister for indeed walking her talk and finally delivering on spectrum. At this stage, we apply a wait-and-see approach with the hope that all our people will reap the rewards of fair play and competition as data costs drops.

Chairperson, it is with much less enthusiasm and not with pace that the IFP raises its concern with the ongoing transition and reconfiguration of the department, the state of the Post Office and the confusion surrounding its measure or split from the Postbank. The ever-growing concern that the SABC intends requesting additional TV license fees from consumers, cannot be supported.

The department is also well-known for either missing a deadline or simply just shifting the goalpost. The deadline of March 2020 is fast approaching for the merger of Telecoms and we are not certain whether this deadline will be reached.

Furthermore, when the committee considered the report of Sentech, Sita, BBI, Usaasa, Usaf, Sapo, Zadna and Nemisa, ... that most of the entities are in desperate need of leadership and can be collectively referred to as a bunch of material uncertainties.

The Auditor-General did not mince his words in outlining the liabilities that make up this group of entities and the number of actual material uncertainties which made up the financial report.

Given the fact that we must cut somewhere in this time of austerity, we must ask the question whether or not we must cut them when we don't see positive results and any impact.

While we are aware of the many challenges the Minister must navigate through, the IFP will support this department as long as it focuses on ensuring that we are not left behind while others are steadily implementing changes to accommodate the Fourth Industrial Revolution. We support the BRRR.

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, one of the main aims of the department is to deliver broadband connectivity to provide secure and affordable access for all citizens to

education, health and other government services, and to ensure that this in itself stimulates economic development.

So, in this regard, cybersecurity remains a challenge. The ACDP appreciates the operations of the cybersecurity hub and the virtue of cybersecurity hubs that are falling under this department. Cybersecurity breaches pose a significant threat to South Africans. We urge the department to take more steps to protect cybersecurity.

We also regret the resignation of Mr Andrew Barnes, former Chief Operating Officer of the Post Office; he cited differences in relation to the location of the proposed Postbank as the reason for his resignation. That wasn't an amicable separation. It's regrettable that highly experienced chief operation officers are leaving state-owned companies. This includes, SAA's Mr Vuyani Jarana. It's clear that political meddling in these state-owned companies continues with chief operating officers unable to do what is required to turn around these SOEs.

Having said that, the Post Office must be commended, however, for taking over the social grant payments during the current financial year. This follows the SA Social

Security Agency, Sassa, debacle and the taking over of almost 7,7 million grantees. This is to be commended, notwithstanding the fact that there are only two members of the board who remain on the SA Post Office.

To conclude, the report sets out deep concerns relating to many entities reporting to the Minister. Once the two departments are merged, oversight will be even more difficult but more necessary. There will be additional work and the committee needs to ensure that its recommendations, as set out in this report, are complied with; and it may be necessary to set up subcommittees dealing with Telecommunications and Communications to ensure that this oversight function is properly done in terms of the Constitution. I thank you.

Mr C H M SIBISI: The department, in consultation with State Information Technology Agency, Sita, facilitated the implementation of National e-Government Strategy and Roadmap. The National e-Services Portal was developed, and e-services from selected government departments were uploaded on the National e-Services Portal, which is live and interactive. However, hon Chairperson, Sita has been placed under fire this past week due to constant downtime. This very House complains about how it is negatively affecting various departments.

The NFP commends the department for achieving 92% of their planned targets as outlined in its 2018-19 Annual Performance Plan.

With budget spending at 99% of its total budget allocation, the NFP notes that underspending is due to posts that are not filled. The NFP also notes that SA Post Office expenditure exceeded the budget by R600 million mainly on car costs and security costs for the Sassa project. The department must re-evaluate its planning strategy to avoid this in the next financial term. The NFP commends Sentec for reliable network availability by exceeding its target. Sentec has ensured employees' development by exceeding the training interventions target of 85% training interventions by implementing 163% after-training plan.

Sentec has also exceeded 6,5% of the actual net profit after tax, spend target on supplier enterprise and socioeconomic development by spending 11,4% as a strategy to contribute to socioeconomic transformation and black economic empowerment. This is indeed a commendable job.

However, we agree with the recommendations listed in the report that the department and its entities must develop an effective system for improving financial capacity,

compliance with legislation and performance reporting.
The NFP supports the BRRR report tabled here today. [Time expired.]

Ms N J KUBHEKA: Chairperson, the month of November 2019 has been remarkable for raising the national pride and unity in South Africa. The Rugby World Cup victory by our team led by Captain Siya Kolisi and the colourful images we have seen beamed through various digital platforms during Springbok tour have inspired young and old. Thanks to the intervention by the Department of Communications. The poor urban and rural masses have been included in these activities through the platforms of the SABC.

One of the threats of the Fourth Industrial Revolution is the possibility of the emergence of a digital apartheid where some will be connected and others left out. For this reason, the ANC is resolute that government and the public sector must ensure the access of fibre networks, which are the most critical components of Telecommunications. Infrastructure supports the agenda of socioeconomic transformation. The movement of funds within the vote must enhance the objectives of inclusive economic growth managed by clean and accountable government structures.

In order to achieve the objectives of the ANC, the department and its entities must resolve the matters of the irregular expenditure by investigating the reported cases and taking the necessary disciplinary steps against implicated officials.

We are encouraged by the work done to revitalise and reposition the SA Post Office and other entities. We also understand the Auditor-General's whole report, and we need to follow all the details that the Auditor-General has presented. The ANC supports the BRRR budget. Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION

REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORT

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of vote:

Mr C H H HUNSINGER: Chairperson, half of the 12 main entities under the Department of Transport pose direct financial risk to our fiscal reliability. As such, it is a trend that requires urgent intervention and decisive reform.

The effect of having four different Transport Ministers in just three years, and over 15 current board vacancies between the 12 state-owned entities, SOEs, all contribute toward financial management inconsistency and constrained advancement.

A cross-cut analysis of entities on unauthorised, irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure amounts reveals that 89% have not been dealt with in the past five years. Consequence management seems to be totally ignored, evident from the same five-year analysis which shows that only 1% was recovered from billions of rand being affected.

Crucial modification necessities are needed in budget, administration and service delivery management of our land, water and airspace regulation, planning and provision.

During the briefings with entities, the DA highlighted the gaps between performance outcomes and disappointing levels of transport provision, pointing out numerous and constant misalignments between key performance areas, indicators and outcomes versus what our pedestrians, cyclists, commuters, passengers and travellers experience on a daily basis.

As such, a meaningful number of recommendations have been absorbed in this committee report, all of which are supported by the DA. Team Transport of the DA will apply shoulder to these and other much-needed improvements as they constructively engage with solutions and ideas promoting an open-opportunity society and working towards building one South Africa for all. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M M CHABANGU: House Chair, the EFF rejects the Portfolio Committee of Transport's Budget Review and Recommendation Report.

We reject the e-toll in Gauteng. We call all the people in Gauteng to continue with their legitimate civil disobedience and reject e-tolls.

Pravin Gordhan's private law firm, Werksmans Attorneys, looted more than R300 million now from the Passenger Rail Agency of SA, Prasa. [Interjections.]

Mr B A RADEBE: I rise on a point of order, Chair. We have Minister Gordhan. We cannot call Ministers by their first names. Rule 82!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, just be reminded that we refer to each other in a dignified manner. Thank you. Continue, hon member.

Mr M M CHABANGU: Mr Pravin Gordhan's private law firm, Werksmans Attorneys, looted more than R300 million from Prasa. The same company appointed by the same Popo Molefe who was appointed by Mr Gordhan ... [Interjections.]

Mr B A RADEBE: I rise on a point of order in terms of Rule 85. The reputation of hon Gordhan is being tarnished here. That he has appointed his private law firm ... If there is such a thing, a substantive motion must be brought before the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, I heard about the law firm, but if that is the case, I will listen to the Hansard correctly. Thank you.

Mr M M CHABANGU: The report fails to appreciate that part of the reason transport, in particular public transport, is dysfunctional in this country is because we have failed to expropriate land without compensation and re-imagine a new South Africa – a Sth Africa in which the distance between work and home is shortened. A distance between home and school is walking distance. A distance between home, church, shops and even a shortened distance between our homes and health facilities. What is to be done?

Firstly, we must establish a state construction company to build roads and stop relying on tenders.

Secondly, government must buy locally manufactured trains and buses to stimulate local industrialisation.

Thirdly, we must subsidise taxis to lower the price for customers and remove all unroadworthy taxis.

Lastly, as an intermediate intervention, we cannot separate transport from land. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Mr K P SITHOLE: House Chair, this department is one of the key entities of our state which can unlock our economy and boost productivity. We all know that

transport is a fundamental component to the way business runs.

The report shows that this department incurs irregular expenditure in the amount of R107 million. The Auditor-General indicates that the department has not taken adequate steps to prevent this. If this department had performed without irregular expenditure and with proper management, the state could do so much with this money. The department could have used it to build more trains or improve road safety.

By implementing a mandatory check of all road vehicles after three years ... and pay it into the e-tolls debt ... back to the contractors ... which South Africa never asked for ...

Khona ngempela ubani lomuntu esimkhokhela lama-e-tolls?

(Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.)

[Who exactly are we paying for the e-tolls?]

The subject of e-tolls must find a resolution swiftly.

The Minister of Transport, the Minister of Finance and the Premier of Gauteng must come together and find a way forward.

The e-tolls have been the cause of much public outcry and do not have a space in our country.

In closing, we challenge this department to reduce road fatalities over the upcoming Christmas and festive season. We do not need drastic efforts such as reducing the speed limit but ... [Inaudible.] ... than ongoing effort. The reduction of speed limit will not achieve ... Anything is okay ... [Inaudible.] ... speed limits are often disregarded ... [Inaudible.] ... the department together with the police need to ensure all cars adhere to the speed limit, no drinking and reckless driving and unroadworthy cars have no space in our country.

The IFP supports the report.

Mnr P MEY: Huis Voorsitter, Vervoer is seker een van die belangrikste departemente in Suid-Afrika. 'n Kenmerk van 'n goeie ekonomie - en ons kan kyk na die wêreld - waar enige sterk of ryk ekonomie is, beskik hulle oor van die modernste vervoerstelsels in die wêreld. Ongelukkig is ons die teendeel daarvan.

Elke entiteit in die vervoerstelsel is belangrik. Dit is juis hulle wat die ekonomie aan die rol hou. Ons moet een ding onthou: as hulle nie funksioneer nie, kan hierdie ekonomie nooit groei nie. Om te kan groei, sal ons 'n baie beter vervoerstelsel in Suid-Afrika moet kry.

Wat die treinstelsel betref, die armstes gebruik die treinstelsel omdat dit die goedkoopste manier van vervoer is. Die treine is oud en afgeleef. Die sekuriteit op die treine is baie, baie swak. Een van die redes is ...

(Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.)

[Mr P MEY: House Chairperson, the Department of Transport is probably one of the most important departments in South Africa. A feature of a good economy - and we can look at the world - where there is a strong or wealthy economy, they have some of the most modern transport systems in the world. Unfortunately, we are the opposite.

Every entity in the transportation system is important. It is precisely they who keep the economy going. We must remember one thing: if they do not function, this economy will never grow. In order to grow, we will have to get a much better transport system in South Africa.

With regard to the train system, the poorest use it because it is the cheapest mode of transport. The trains are old and decrepit. The security on the trains is very, very poor. One of the reasons is ...]

... for the past 25 years, this government forgot to maintain and upgrade the Department of Transport.

Ek wil vir u sê, ek was op 'n voorstedelike trein vanaf Johannesburg na Pretoria. Twee rowe - een voor Kaserne en een net voor Tembisa. Daar is geen sekuriteit op die treine nie. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.*)

[I was on a suburban train from Johannesburg to Pretoria and two robberies occurred - one just before Kaserne and one just before Tembisa. There is no security on the trains.]

Hon Minister of Police, it is time to bring the Railway Police back.

Die ander probleem by die Departement van Vervoer is dat daar soveel mense wat waarnemend is wat nie permanent aangestel word nie. Dit moet onmiddelik reggestel word. Een van die maniere is om weg te doen met regstellende aksie sodat mense op grond van meriete aangestel kan

word. Baie dankie. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.*)

[The other problem at the Department of Transport is that many people in acting positions are not appointed permanently. This must be corrected immediately. One of the ways is to do away with affirmative action so that people can be appointed based on merit. Thank you very much.]

Mr W M THRING: House Chair, the ACDP notes that this department is mandated to maximise the contribution of transport to the economic and social development goals of our society through the provision of safe, reliable, effective, efficient and fully integrated transport systems that best meet the needs of passenger and freight users.

Of great concern to the ACDP is the failure of the committee to meet with the following entities due to the nontabling of their annual reports within the prescribed period. These entities are the SA Maritime Safety Authority, Samsa, Driving Licence Card Account, DLCA, the SA Research and Rescue Organisation, Sasar, including the National Sea Rescue Institute, NSRI. In addition, Prasa and Autopax received disclaimers, regressing from having

previously received qualified reports. The SA Search and Rescue Organisation and the NSRI failed to submit their financial reports. Findings are still outstanding.

This is not the only committee to which a department and entities failed to report. Either they do not show up or they fail to submit their reports on time. For government to function efficiently, transparently, timeously, effectively and with accountability, it requires all entities to report when called upon to do so. Entities that fail in this regard are antagonistic towards progress and the poor. Consequence management – starting with their leadership – must be effected.

The ACDP is encouraged by the manufacturing of some 600 X'Trapolis Mega trains for Prasa.

This department and Sanral – that needed an amount of some R5,8 billion – need to note the message from the public: scrap e-tolls. The next time you wish to introduce a user-pay system, involve the user in the process. Thank you.

Vho M M RAMADWA: Mulangadzulo wa Nn̄du, Komiti ya Phothifol̄io ya Muhasho wa Vhuendi yo țangana na muhasho, vha gođana, vha eletshedzana khathihi na u fhululedzana.

Ro dovha hafhu ra țangana na Ofisi ya Muțola Muvhalelano. Ndi zwone zwine riņe vha ANC ra țanganedza na u tikedza muvhigo wa Muhasho wa Vhuendi.

Muhasho une ra khou amba ngawo, ndi muhasho u re na zwiimiswa zwa fumiraru. Muhasho na zwiimiswa zwawo wo vha na khaedu fhedzi ha vhambiwa maano a u dzi tandulula nga u lulamisa zwo khakheaho.

Kha řwaha wa muvhalelano wa 2018-19, muvhigo wa Muțola Muvhalelano wo sumbedza uri a ho ngo vha na odithi dzi soliseaho fhedzi a vho ngo swikelela muvhigo wo kunaho.

Zwiņwe zwiimiswa zwa muhasho zwi fanaho na Prasa na Autopax a zwo ngo kona u swikelela muvhigo wavhuđi fhedzi zwo pfana uri hu vhe na maano a u shandukisa zwithu. Na Minista vho ita uri hu vhe na War Room [Nņdu ya u tandulula dzikhaedu] u itela u tandulula hezwi zwithu zwi sa khou tshimbilaho zwavhuđi. A ro ngo zwi litsha zwo sokou ralo fhedzi.

Komiti yo dovha hafhu ya țuțuwedza zwiimiswa zwo shumaho zwavhuđi uri zwi ise phanđa na maitele ane a đo ita uri zwithu zwi tshimbile. Nga mafhungo aya, riņe ri khou tikedza muvhigo wa BRRR. Aa! [U vhandā zwanđa].

(Translation of Tshivenđa speech follows.)

[Ms M M RAMADWA: Chairperson, the Portfolio Committee on Transport met with the department - they criticised, advised and commended each other. We also met with the Office of the Auditor-General. That's why we, as the ANC, support this report of the Department of Transport.

The Department we are talking about has 13 entities. The Department and its entities had challenges, but they discussed the strategies to resolve them.

In the 2018-19 financial year, the report by the Auditor-General showed that the Department received an unqualified audit report with findings.

Other entities like Prasa and Autopax within the Department didn't receive a clean audit, but they agreed on strategies to remedy the situation. The Minister also established a war room which will be used to rectify all irregularities. We didn't just leave the situation as it is.

The committee also encouraged the entities which performed well to continue doing the good work. With this, we support the BRRR report. Thank you! [Applause.]

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

CONSIDERATION OF BUDGETARY REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION

REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

LISEKELA SIKHULU SABOSISWEBHU WELICEMBU LELINYENTI:

Sihlalo lohloniphekile, besicela kutsi lombiko walelikomiti wemukelwe nguleNdlu. Siyabonga. (*Translation of Siswati paragraph follows.*)

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Chairperson, we request the House to approve this committee report. Thank you.]

Declarations of vote:

Nks S GWARUBE: Sihlalo weNdlu, uhlahlo lwabiwo-mali lweSebe lezeMpilo alusetyenziselwa abantu baseMzantsi Afrika. Simane sixelelwa ukuba imali ayikho kodwa ingxaki yeyokuba imali ekhoyo ayisetyenziswa kwiinkonzo eziya eluntwini. Eyona nto ecace mhlophe kule nkqubo yoHlaziyo loHlahlo lwabiwo-mali yeyokuba urhulumente akazimisela ukulungisa inkqubo yezempilo yethu.

Uluntu lwaseMzantsi Afrika luthenjise nge-Inshorensi yezeMpilo yeSizwe okungathi lo Mthetho oYilwayo wenzelwe ukulungisa ezempilo. Akukhonto ebuhlungu njengokubukela

urhulumente okhekelwa yi-ANC elahlekisa abantu kwaye bethembisa ngezinto ezingasokuze ziphunyezwe.

[Kwaqhwyatywa.] Lo Mthetho awusayi kufaka abongikazi noogqirha ezibhedlele naseziklinikhi; awusayi kuzisa amayeza aza kunceda abantu; awusayi kuqinisekisa ukuba abantu abalindi imini yonke besiya kufuna uncedo; kwaye awusayi kuphelisa urhwaphilizo kweli sebe.

Lo Mthetho uza kuzisa ukubiwa kwemali ngabo baseLuthuli House kwaye uza kunyusela ngerhafu abantu abahleli benemivuzo engaphucukanga. Ukuphuculwa kwezempilo yinto i-DA ezimisele kuyo kodwa lona uMthetho uza kusibuyisela umva. Abantu bethu baza kuhlala bengamaxhoba karhulumente ongakhathaliyo. UNondyabo uyibeke yacaca mhlophe ukuba imali efunwa ngaba bantu bafuna lo Mthetho ayikho.

UMphathiswa uMkhize weli sebe uqine enyaleni yena kuquka namalungu e-ANC akwiKomiti yeMicimbi yeSebe lezeMpilo azimisele ukuba ziimbongi njee zalo Mphathiswa. La malungu awazimiselanga ukukhonza abantu abasinyulileyo.

Singumbutho weDA, sifuna ukuba iinkonzo ezisemgangathweni zisiwe ebantwini kwaye siqinisekise ukuba imali yoluntu ayibiwa ngabantu abanyolukileyo. Asiyixhasi leNgxelo yoHlaziyo loHlahlo lwabiwo-mali. [Liphelile ixesha.]

[Kwaqhwyatywa.] (*Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.*).

[Ms S GWARUBE: Chairperson of the House, the Budget Vote of the Department of Health is not used for the people of South Africa. We are always told that there is no money but the problem is that the money available is not used for services to the public. What is clear from this Budget Reform process is that the government is not committed to fixing our health care system.

The people of South Africa have been promised National Health Insurance as if this Bill was designed to fix health. There is nothing more painful than watching a government led by the ANC misleading the people and promising things that will never be fulfilled.

[Applause.] This Bill will not appoint nurses and doctors in hospitals and clinics; it will not bring medicine to help people; it will not ensure that people do not wait all day long for help; and it will not end corruption in this department.

This Bill will bring about the theft of money by those in Luthuli House and will increase taxes on people who are still on poor incomes. Improving health is something the DA is committed to but this Act will set us back. Our people will always be victims of the uncaring government. The Treasury has made it very clear that the money that these people want for this Bill does not exist. Minister

Mkhize of this department is adamant that he, along with the ANC members in the Portfolio Committee of the Department of Health are determined to be the poets of this Minister. These members are not willing to serve the people who elected us.

As the DA, we want quality services to be delivered to the people and ensure that public money is not stolen by greedy people. We are not supporting this Report of the Budget Vote. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Ms N N CHIRWA: House Chairperson, the EFF rejects the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report, BRRR, of the Portfolio Committee on Health. This is fundamentally the reason why the government has failed and refused to admit to our people that it has ushered a complete collapse of the public health care system of our country.

Children as young as three-years-old with hearing disabilities are expected to buy their own hearing aids. The department has also failed to regulate the compensation of miners as there are no repercussions whatsoever for mining companies which do not compensate miners for sicknesses and death due to mining.

Nine out of 10 people living and receiving antiretroviral drugs, ARV, treatments are female and yet there is still no effective programme by the department to address the stigma in many communities. Young women are still being used as HIV testing kits by men and this is a form of gender-based violence which should be treated as such by the department.

For a government that fakes concern about preventing new HIV infections, it is disingenuous that post-exposure prophylaxis, PEP, is only accessible to those who have access to private doctors and prescriptions. According to this government, easy access to PEP is only attainable by the poor if they are raped.

The National Health Insurance, NHI, referral system is also very unrealistic for those living in remote areas. Currently, our people have to set appointments to see doctors in clinics and sometimes have to wait for up to two weeks in dejected areas like Upington. The poor will literally die waiting to get referral letters.

We repeat that the focus of the department must move to prevention, primary health care, and education on health care. If you are truly committed to lessening the burden of disease, ensure that each clinic and hospital has

adequate staff, infrastructure is prioritised and ward-based with 24-hour health facilities in each ward. Otherwise, it is futile to take our youth to Cuba to study medicine through a system that focuses on prevention and primary health care only to come back to South Africa and be underutilised because our government is full of lazy thinkers and filled with thugs. We reject this report. [Applause.]

Ms M D HLENGWA: House Chairperson, the state of public health care in South Africa is a cause of great concern. For over a decade, we have witnessed this government struggle with the provision of better health care services.

We have heard on numerous occasions that government is overwhelmed by the health care system. We heard about the revitalisation of ageing infrastructure and the strengthening of medical innovation research and development. We have heard about government's plans to improve human resource management, planning and development. We have heard about the provision of adequate and community-based care especially in rural areas. We have heard these promises from government for well over a decade now and yet, 10 years later, we are still faced with the same challenges.

In 2009, the Deputy Minister of Health, Dr Molefi Sefularo, said and I quote: "These are the priorities that you should hold us, as the Department of Health, accountable for in the coming five years of governance." Now, who will account for this? The truth is that the situation has not improved, but it has only worsened.

We need government reforms and accountability in the health care sector immediately. We must root out all forms of insitutionalised corruption before we even start with the NHI. The IFP supports the BRRR. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mnr P A VAN STADEN: Agb Voorsitter, dit was nogal ontstellend om te verneem dat die Departement van Gesondheid met 'n bedrag van R1 miljard onderspandeer het. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.*)

[Mr P A VAN STADEN: Hon Chairperson, it was quite upsetting to learn that the Department of Health had underspent by an amount of R1 billion.]

It is not surprising that our state hospitals and clinics are in such terrible condition. The Auditor-General reported to the committee that hospitals in Mpumalanga, Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal and Free State don't make use of

their medical equipments which were bought for an amount of R13,2 million since 2015.

Words like infrastructure or deficiencies, lack of secured and controlled access to all filing and storage areas, lack of sufficient infrastructure, lack of implementation, lack of ongoing maintenance, lack of approved maintenance plan and sufficient training, lack of medicine, and lack of overall service delivery.

Die gevalle wat die afgelope tyd deur die publiek aangemeld is oor wat by staatshospitale aan die gang is, is skrikwekkend en skokkend. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.*)

[The cases that have been reported lately by the public about what is going on at government hospitals are alarming and shocking.]

A two-year-old girl passed away because she had to wait up to nine hours to be admitted at the Tshwane District Hospital. Old people are tied with chains to chairs at the Mamelodi Hospital. A patient with a blood clot through his heart had to wait up to 17 hours to be admitted at the Tshwane District Hospital.

Around 3 800 people died in Gauteng hospitals in the 2018-19 financial year due to medical negligence as reported by the MEC for Health in Gauteng. My question is: Are there any of the ANC members here who are willing to be admitted to a state hospital? If not so, why do you want the South African public to go and be admitted to a state hospital if you aren't willing to be treated there yourselves? What is happening at state hospitals in South Africa is an absolute disgrace.

If this government is under the impression that the NHI is going to fix all of these problems, then it needs to think very hard again. Playtime is over. The FF Plus doesn't support the report. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms M E SUKERS: Hon House Chairperson, in considering this report, the ACDP firstly wish to acknowledge the important role of nurses in reaching the objectives of a healthy nation. It is our nurses who are at the forefront of educating communities on Diabetes, Tuberculosis, TB, and HIV at a primary level. These dedicated professionals are critical to ensuring that we reach our goal of a nation living a healthy life and living up to 70 years of age.

Our biggest concern in this budget report lies under Programme 5. The continuous development of nurses falls under this programme. This programme is responsible for hospitals, tertiary services and workforce development.

The programme underspent by R177 million. The number of targets for Programme 5 decreased from 29 to 19, with only eight of those 19 targets achieved. None of the three targets related to ensuring quality health care by improving compliance with national core standards at all hospitals were met.

Die werklikheid van hierdie verslag kan gesien word deur die siek mense by ons hospitale. Die aanklagte van mediese wanpraktyk teen die departement is 'n bywys van die werklikheid van die verslag. Dit is veral ons oumense en mense in landelike gebiede wat onder personeeltekorte ly, wat bydra tot swak diens.

Hierdie probleem gaan nie deur die Nasionale Gesondheidsversekering opgelos word nie. Ons land gaan nou deur 'n transformasie met die Nasionale Gesondheidsversekering, maar die basiese infrastruktuur moet tog herstel word voor ons hierdie groot projek begin.

Menslike ontwikkeling en retensie van spesialiste is die basiese boustene van die stelsel. Baie dankie. [Tyd verstreke.] (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.*)

[The reality of this report can be seen by the sick people at our hospitals. The charges of medical malpractice against the department are proof of the reality of the report. It is especially our elderly people and people in rural areas who suffer from staff shortages, which contribute to poor service.

This problem will not be solved by the National Health Insurance. Our country is now going through a transformation with the National Health Insurance, but the basic infrastructure must be repaired before we start this big project.

Human development and retention of specialists are the basic building blocks of the system. Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, the NFP notes and welcomes the report tabled here on the Department of Health. What is common knowledge here and seeming to be the norm is that we always tend to spend our money but

when it is time to get value for it, that's when we fall flat. Again, this department is guilty of having spent most of the budget allocated to it but it has underperformed.

Irregular, wasteful and fruitless expenditure continues. I want to remind my friend from the FF Plus that whilst I will acknowledge that, yes, we have serious challenges in the public health sector, so does the private sector at the moment with regard to health care despite the fact that people on the ground pay a lot of money for private health care in South Africa.

Health care practitioners in rural areas are badly affected particularly because there seems to be a shortage of medical specialists and nursing staff. Medical negligence appears to be on the rise. The Health Professions Council of SA, HPCSA, has been poorly performing with regard to its accreditation, and time and again, we find that there are those who are practising as medical practitioners but aren't accredited and have no necessary qualification. There are serious weaknesses with regard to that.

The audit report clearly shows that provinces have a shortage of medicine or stock-outs that we referred to,

and the problem of not paying the creditors within 30 days continues. That, appears to be a serious problem.

The concern that arises is that, if these weaknesses and challenges are not addressed, how are we going to implement the NHI? That's why we believe that more attention must be given to the challenges, but very importantly, 80% of the diseases are caused by what we eat and there are no control measures with regard to the food that is provided on the streets and in different businesses. The NFP supports the report tabled here.

[Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr T B MUNYAI: House Chairperson, unlike those who are rented by big business, who came up with a barrage of propaganda trying to undermine the NHI, the people's glorious movement - the ANC - rises in support of the BRRR on the Portfolio Committee on Health.

Health remains a priority for the ANC-led government. It is within this context that we came up with a progressive policy shift since the 1994 breakthrough in the form of a single unified system called the National Health Insurance of which the Bill is going through public hearings as we speak.

As the White Paper notes:

National Health Insurance represents a substantial policy shift that will necessitate a massive reorganisation of the current health care system, both public and private.

It reflects the kind of society we wish to live in; one based on the values of justice, fairness and social solidarity.

Implementation of the NHI is consistent with the global vision that health care should be a social investment and not a private commodified basic service. Implementation of the NHI is underpinned by the Vision 2030 of the NDP which envisages that by 2030, everyone must have access to equal standard of care regardless of their income and that common funds should enable that equitable access to health care regardless of what people can afford and how frequently they need to use the service.

Therefore, we welcome the recommendation that entities of the department such as the National Health Laboratory Service, NHLS, the Council for Medical Schemes, CMS, as well as the SA Health Products Regulatory Authority,

Sahpra, should provide ... We support, okay. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 162: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Creecy, B D; Dhlomo, S M; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini, D D; Dlulane, B N; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Frolick, C T; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gomba, M M; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hadebe, B M; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M; Hlengwa, M D; Hlongo, A S; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Koornhof, G W; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Magwanishe, G; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majozi, Z; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C;

Masiko, F A; Masondo, T S; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O
M; Mbatha, S G N; Mbinqo-Gigaba, B P; Mbuyane, S H; Mc
Donald, L E; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ;
Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhathshwa, N T; Mlenzana, Z;
Modise, M; Modise, P M P; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H;
Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R;
Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S;
Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, A H; Munyai, T B;
Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Newhoudt Druchen, W
S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi,
B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Nqola, X; Ntobongwana, N;
Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxumalo, M N; Papo, A H M;
Patrein, S; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Pilane-Majake, M C
C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M;
Semenya, M R; Seoposengwe, C; Shabalala, N F; Shabalala,
L F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibisi, C H M; Sibiya, D P;
Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K;
Siwela, V S; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Soty, M M;
Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M
A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshwete, B; Van Der Merwe, L
L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P;
Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zuma, A S;
Zungu, T R M.

NOES - 98: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagrain, M;
Basson, L J; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia,

G K Y; Ceza, K; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N;
Cuthbert, M J; George, D T; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J;
Groenewald, I M; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hicklin, M B;
Hill-Lewis, G G; Hinana, N E; Hlonyana, N K F; Hoosen, M
H; Hunsinger, C H H; Ismail, H ; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D;
Julius, J W W; Keetse, P P; Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S;
King, C V; Kohler, D; Komane, R N; Kruger, H C C; Langa,
T M; Lees, R A; Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J R B; Mabhena, T
B; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madisha, W
M; Madlingozi, B S; Mafanya, W T I; Malatsi, M S; Maotwe,
O M C; Masango, B S ; Mazzone, N W A; Mbabama, T M;
Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Mente, N V; Meshoe, K R J;
Mey, P ; Mileham, K J; Mkhaliphi, H O; Mohlala, M R;
Mokgotho, S M; Mokoena, L G; Moteka, P G; Motsepe, C C S;
Msane, T P; Mthenjane, D F; Mulaudzi, T E; Mulder, F J;
Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Opperman, G ;
Phillips, C; Seithloho, I S; Sharif, N K; Shelembe, M L;
Shembeni, H A; Sindane, P; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P;
Spies, E R J; Steyn, A; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Tafeni,
N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Van Dyk, V;
Van Minnen, B M; Van Staden, P A; Walters, T C R; Waters,
M; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E
R; Winkler, H S; Yako, Y N.

ABSTAIN - 1: Kwankwa, N L S.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**DECISION OF QUESTION ON APPROVAL BY PARLIAMENT OF
CONVENTION ESTABLISHING THE SQUARE KILOMETRE ARRAY (SKA)
OBSERVATORY IN TERMS OF SECTION 231(2) OF CONSTITUTION,
1996**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, I wish to remind you that this matter was debated in a mini-plenary but that decision thereon can only be taken in the full plenary. This is the same for the other decisions of Questions the House will decide on today.

Question put: That the Convention establishing the Square Kilometre Array (SKA) Observatory be agreed to.

Agreed to.

Convention establishing the Square Kilometre Array (SKA) Observatory accordingly approved.

**DECISION OF QUESTION ON REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON
TOURISM - CONSULTATIVE WORKSHOP ON TOURIST SAFETY AND
SECURITY IN SOUTH AFRICA**

There was no debate.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

Agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**DECISION OF QUESTION ON REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON
PUBLIC WORKS AND INFRASTRUCTURE - OVERSIGHT VISIT TO
GAUTENG**

There was no debate.

Question put: That the Report be adopted.

Agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

MOTION OF CONDOLENCE

(The late Sandile Dikeni)

Ms N J KUBEKA: Hon House Chairperson, I move without
notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes with sadness the passing of the renowned South African writer, activist and poet Sandile Dikeni at the age of 53 on Saturday 9 November 2019, after a long illness;
- (2) recalls graduated with a National Diploma in Journalism from Pentech, known today as Cape Peninsula University of Technology, CPUT;
- (3) remembers that among the many notable positions he held in his career, he was an arts editor for the *Cape Times*, editor of *Die Suid Afrikaan* and political editor of *This Day SA*;
- (4) believes that Dikeni, whose poem *Shake that Guava Juice* was hailed countrywide was the finest poet and journalist this country has ever produced; and
- (5) conveys condolences to his family and friends in the media industry.

Agreed to.

**GENDER-BASED VIOLENT INCIDENT IN BARDALE VILLAGE, MFULENI
IN WESTERN CAPE**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N P MASIPA: Hon House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that another incident of gender-based violence raised its ugly head in Bardale Village, Mfulweni, on 26 September 2019;
- (2) further notes that Mrs Pumla Ntombela, née Mvinjelwa, together with her two children, 10 year-old Nhlanhla and 6-year-old Bajabulile, were brutally murdered in their sleep allegedly by the deceased's husband and father of the two children;
- (3) acknowledges that the Western Cape High Court confirmed that Mrs Ntombela's parents had the right to bury the deceased after a long dispute between the two families about whose right it is to bury the deceased;

- (4) recognises that it is unacceptable for women and children to be murdered in this manner;
- (5) condemns the cowardly murder of Mrs Ntombela and her children; and
- (6) conveys its heartfelt condolences to the family and friends of Mrs Ntombela.

Agreed to.

**PRESIDENT OF BENIN DEMANDS FOREIGN CURRENCY RESERVES FROM
FRENCH CENTRAL BANK**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms O M C MAOTWE: Hon House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the President of Benin, Patrice Talon, has ordered that his country's foreign currency reserves, deposited during the colonial era in the French Central Bank, be immediately withdrawn;

- (2) recognises that the French colonial control of African countries that it used occupy has been hanging unto this important aspect of currency control for many decades;
- (3) warns that if African countries are to be in charge of their own destiny and choose their development path, they must break ties with former colonisers, and instead trade and relate on an equal footing;
- (4) advises that the success of the move by the President of Benin also depends on the rest of the other former French African colonies to follow through; and
- (5) calls on all African countries to follow the example of Benin, and withdraw all foreign currency reserves, mineral deposits and all other assets from the control of former colonisers.

Agreed to.

**ANC SADDENED BY DEATH OF FIVE PUPILS IN CAR ACCIDENT
ALONG R574 ROAD BETWEEN GROBLERSDAL AND MPUDULLE**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms N GANTSHO: Hon House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes with sadness the death of five Limpopo high school pupils when the car they hitchhiked was involved in an accident along the R574 road between Groblersdal and Mpudulle on Tuesday, 5 November 2019;
- (2) understands that the five pupils - four in Grade 10 and one in Grade 9, and aged between 15 and 18, all attended the A M Mashego Secondary School near Groblersdal;
- (3) observes that the driver of the vehicle apparently lost control when approaching Matrompi bridge and it rolled several times, instantly killing the five learners and critically injuring the driver and his crew;

- (4) acknowledges that counselling has been organised for the learners, teachers, support staff and the bereaved families; and
- (5) conveys its deepest condolences to the families of the affected children, relatives and the learners of the school.

Agreed to.

IFP MARKS 159 YEARS OF INDIAN IMMIGRATION TO SOUTH AFRICA

(Draft Resolution)

MR N SINGH: Hon House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that Saturday, 16 November will mark the 159th year since one of the first groups of Indian people were recorded to have settled in South Africa, arriving in Durban in the year 1860 from Madras to work in the sugar cane plantation in Port Natal;

- (2) further notes that the group was made up of 197 men, 89 women and 59 children who were all indentured labourers;
- (3) acknowledges that some returned to India after their term was up and those who remained established themselves as industrial and railway workers;
- (4) further acknowledges that today the province of KwaZulu-Natal has the highest population of Indian people outside of India;
- (5) recognises that many migrant communities from across the world, not only India have contributed greatly to building a thriving South Africa, united in its diversity; and
- (6) encourages all South Africans to embrace one another in our differences in the spirit of social cohesion in the same way that the Springbok victory has galvanised unity in the public discourse.

Agreed to.

**TATJANA SCHOENMAKER AWARDED SPORT STAR OF THE YEAR AWARD
AT SOUTH AFRICAN SPORT AWARDS**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H JORDAAN: Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) congratulates Tatjana Schoenmaker for being awarded the Sport Star of the Year award at the SA Sport Awards on Sunday;
- (2) also congratulates the 22-year old swimmer for also being awarded the Sportswoman of the Year award;
- (3) acknowledges that Ms Schoenmaker became the first South African female swimmer to win a medal at a Fina World Championship, when she won a silver medal in the 200m breaststroke in Gwangju, South Korea; and
- (4) thanks her for being an inspiration to young swimmers, especially female swimmers, and wishes her luck for her future endeavours.

Agreed to.

**CHAD LE CLOS WINS NEW GOLD MEDAL IN 100 METRE BUTTERFLY
RACE AT FINA SWIMMING WORLD CUP IN DOHA**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T M A TONGWANE: House Chairperson, I move without
notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that South Africa's Olympic-winning swimmer, Chad le Clos, won a new gold medal in the 100 metre butterfly race at the Fina Swimming World Cup in Doha, Qatar on Thursday, 7 November 2019;
- (2) acknowledges that Le Clos earned this gold medal with a stellar time of just 51,70 seconds, ahead of Poland's Jakub Majerski and the USA's Michael Andrew;
- (3) also acknowledges that this was Chad's 144th World Cup gold medal; and

- (4) congratulates Le Clos for always representing his country with pride and wishes him well in his future races.

Agreed to.

MOTION OF CONDOLENCE

(The late Sergeant Bongani Xakata)

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes with sadness the tragic death of Sergeant Bongani Xakata, who was gunned down at his home in Lingelethu West, Khayelitsha, on the evening of 30 October 2019;
- (2) further notes that since 2009, Sergeant Xakata was a much-loved, respected and disciplined member of the uniformed protection and security services at Parliament, having previously served in the SA National Defence Force;

- (3) condemns this callous attack in the strongest possible terms and trusts that the perpetrators will be speedily apprehended and brought to justice; and
- (4) expresses its deepest condolences to his wife, Ms Lumka and six children, his broader family, friends and colleagues at Parliament and wishes them comfort at this sad time.

Agreed to.

MOTION OF CONDOLENCE

(The late Loredana Civico Loyson)

(Draft Resolution)

Mr N L S KWANKWA: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes with sadness that the honorary vice-consul for Italy in Port Elizabeth, Loredana Loyson died at the weekend;

- (2) further notes that she passed away after a courageous battle with cancer;
- (3) also notes that although Loredana was responsible for the interests and wellbeing of Italians living in SA, particularly in the region between Cradock and Knysna, she decided to extend her life making sure that she works for the poor and the downtrodden in the area in the position she held since 1993; and
- (4) sends its condolences to the family and friends of Loredana Civico Loyson.

Agreed to.

**CHARLIZE THERON WINS HOLLYWOOD CAREER ACHIEVEMENT AWARD
AT 23RD ANNUAL HOLLYWOOD FILM AWARDS**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H ISMAIL: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that Ms Charlize Theron won the Hollywood Career Achievement Award at the 23rd Annual Hollywood Film Awards held in Los Angeles on 3 November 2019;
- (2) also notes that Ms Theron was born on 7 August 1975 in Benoni, Gauteng;
- (3) acknowledges that Ms Theron is well-regarded for her versatility as an actor, and that she earned an Academy Award for Best Actress for her portrayal of serial killer, Aileen Wuornos, in the 2003 movie *Monster*;
- (4) recognises that Ms Theron has also been involved in a number of charities, foundations and outreach projects globally, and specifically advocates for the elimination of violence against women and children, and for HIV prevention;
- (5) calls upon all South Africans to aspire to emulate Ms Theron's exemplary humanitarian efforts; and
- (6) congratulates Ms Theron on her winning of the Hollywood Career Achievement Award and wishes her well in her future endeavours.

Agreed to.

FORMER PRESIDENT OF BRAZIL RELEASED FROM PRISON

(Draft Resolution)

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes and welcomes the release of former president of Brazil, Lula Da Silva, from prison;
- (2) recognises and acknowledges that under president Lula, millions of people were lifted out of poverty because of clear and practical socialist policy reforms;
- (3) further recognises that under his visionary leadership tens of millions of poor people of Brazil benefitted from housing, education and family policies under the Bolsa Familia Program;
- (4) acknowledges that under his socialist policy reforms, the economy of Brazil grew, people

worked and earned income, children went to school and had vaccinations, and the people of Brazil had access to food;

(5) recalls that metalworkers, trade unionists, and the poor people of Brazil stood by and supported president Lula because of the lasting impression his decisive interventions has and will continue to have in their lives;

(6) believes that political prosecutions of leaders championing socialist policy reforms, coup d'états against socialist governments, and inhumane trade embargoes are a clear demonstration of intolerance of different ideas by right wing imperialists, and deny people the right to choose their own development path; and

(7) wishes president Lula good health and rest.

Amandla!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are there any objections?

Ms N MAZZONE: The DA objects.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): In light of the objection, the motion without notice may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become a notice of a motion on the Order Paper.

TENDAI MTAWARIRA RETIRES FROM TEST RUGBY AFTER WORLD CUP

(Draft Resolution)

Mr F D XASA: Hon House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that Springboks and Sharks veteran player, Tendai Mtawarira, retired from international rugby on Wednesday, 6 November 2019, after helping South Africa to Rugby World Cup glory in Japan;
- (2) further notes that, just a day after announcing his retirement, he also confirmed his departure from the Durban Sharks franchise;
- (3) acknowledges that the 34-year-old, nicknamed “Beast”, is South Africa’s third most capped player in history, having played 117 Tests;

- (4) recalls that he made his senior provincial debut for the Cell C Sharks in 2006, and won his first Springbok cap in 2008, setting records on the way;
- (5) believes that South Africa has been privileged to have a humble player like Tendai who never put his own interests above that of the team; and
- (6) thanks "Beast" for what he has done for both the Sharks and South Africa, and wishes him and his family the best for the next chapter of their lives.

Agreed to.

**DESECRATION OF MORE THAN 70 HEADSTONES AT MOWBRAY MUSLIM
CEMETERY**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes the desecration of more than 70 headstones of Muslim graves in the Mowbray cemetery with the

formation of a cross and other symbols on these headstones;

- (2) also notes that this is clearly not an act of hooliganism or criminality, but a well-planned attack on the sanctity of the graves of Muslims;
- (3) further notes that this is an act of religious intolerance and Islamophobia;
- (4) acknowledges that some of the headstones were placed in freshly dug holes;
- (5) recognises that yet another gravesite which is a burial site for saints in Islam situated at Deer Park, Table Mountain has been vandalised;
- (6) also acknowledges the condemnation by the interfaith organisation;
- (7) condemns this barbaric act; and
- (8) calls on the SA Police Service to ensure that the perpetrators are arrested and face the full might of the law.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): It is unfortunate that I cannot put the question, and you know the reason - the motion was not circulated. Thank you.

**SIBUSISO MPUNGOSE SENTENCED TO FOUR LIFE SENTENCES BY
PIETERMARITZBURG HIGH COURT**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T V B MCHUNU: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) welcomes the Pietermaritzburg High Court sentencing of Sibusiso Mpungose on Wednesday 6 November 2019 to four life terms for killing his three biological children and a stepdaughter;
- (2) understands that he will return to court later this month to face an additional charge of rape in an unrelated incident;
- (3) hopes that this harsh sentence will serve as a deterrent to those who abuse and kill defenceless children; and

- (4) thanks the criminal justice system for the sterling work done in their pursuit of Mpungose and in ensuring justice for the slain children.

Agreed to.

COMMERCIAL CASES HANDED OVER TO SPECIAL INVESTIGATIONS

UNIT

(Draft Resolution)

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the first batch of civil and commercial cases were handed over to the Special Investigations Unit, SIU, Special Tribunal to commence with litigation;
- (2) supports Judge Gidfonia Mlindelwa Makhanya, who has been appointed as President of the tribunal;
- (3) impresses on the tribunal the need to recover the reported R14,7 billion lost to, *inter alia*,

corruption and failure to adhere to public
procurement and contractual prescripts;

(4) condemns the Stalingrad tactics used by the state
capture peddlers in the main by intimidating
witnesses through sponsored assassination
attempts and frivolous litigation; and

(5) wishes Judge Gidfonia Mlindelwa Makhanya great
strength in fulfilling one of the most important
functions in the fight against state capture and
its remnants.

Agreed to.

Mna W M MADISHA: Ka ye o ka no re feta, le go tše pedi
tše di tlogo. Ke a leboga.

MODULASETULO WA NGWAKO (Moh M G Boroto): Ke tlile go no
le bitša mehla ye.

Mna W M MADISHA: Aowa, o se ke wa dira bjalo.

(Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.)

[Mr W M MADISHA: You can exclude us on this one, and in
the next two. Thank you.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I will always call you.

Mr W M MADISHA: No, please don't do that.]

**37 PEOPLE KILLED AND 60 WOUNDED IN ATTACK ON MINING
COMPANY CONVOY IN BURKINA FASO**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms T V B MCHUNU: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes with sadness the deaths of 37 people and 60 wounded in an attack on a mining company convoy in Burkina Faso on Wednesday 6 November 2019;
- (2) understands that the bloodshed occurred when five buses carrying staff of a Canadian firm Semafo, were ambushed and a military escort vehicle was struck by an explosive device before gunmen opened fire on the convoy;

- (3) further understands that Burkina Faso has been a target of a terrorist insurgency that has killed hundreds of people in recent years;
- (4) acknowledges that the military in Burkina Faso has been struggling to contain the violence that spilled over the border from neighbouring Mali;
and
- (5) conveys our condolences to the government of Burkina Faso and families of the dead mine workers and wishes those wounded, a speedy recovery.

Agreed to.

**NDEBELE STUDENTS ASSOCIATION HOSTED FIRST EVER NDEBELE
SPELLING BEE**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr T B MABHENA: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes that the Ndebele Students Association, NSA, hosted its first ever Ndebele Spelling Bee and debate competition at the University of the Witwatersrand in Johannesburg a few weeks ago;
- (2) further notes that both events saw over 12 severely under-resourced high schools from Mpumalanga and Gauteng participating in the competitions;
- (3) recognises that the events were attended by some members of this House across the political divide;
- (4) acknowledges that both events were aligned to Parliament's theme of celebrating South Africa's literary classics in the International Year of Indigenous Languages;
- (5) further recognises that the events were also attended by the recipient of the Order of Ikhamanga in Silver, Dr Nothembi Mkhwebane who was also bestowed the special honour award; and

- (6) commends the contribution of the Wits NSA for their role in the preservation of indigenous languages.

Agreed to.

MOTION OF CONDOLENCE

(The late Luther Cohen)

(Draft Resolution)

Mr P M P MODISE: House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House -

- (1) notes with sadness the death of former YoTV presenter and member of the music group Jozi, Luther "Crazy Lu" Cohen from asthma attack in Cambodia on Friday 8 November 2019;
- (2) remembers that Crazy Lu became a child star when he hosted a popular kids programme *X-Attitude*, on the YoTV Kids platform on SABC;

- (3) further remembers that he later became a member of Jozi, with Bongani Fassie, Ishmael and Da L.E.S;
- (4) believes that he will be greatly missed for his ability to make everybody entertained and keep everybody happy; and
- (5) conveys its condolences to his family and friends in the music industry.

Agreed to.

HIGH COURT ESTABLISHED IN MPUMALANGA

(Member's Statement)

Ms N H MASEKO-JELE (ANC): As the ANC, we acknowledge the establishment of the High Court in Mpumalanga which officially opened on Friday, 8 November 2019. This embodies the fulfilment of the ANC-led government's democratic commitment to ensure access to justice for all.

This is a milestone towards enhancing access to justice and will provide relief for Mpumalanga residents who will

no longer be required to take long trips to Pretoria High Court for all serious criminal offences and civil claims.

The official opening of this High Court follows the commencement of its functioning in May this year. It is a four-storey building with 12 courtrooms: Five to be used for civil cases; and the other two will accommodate criminal cases.

Before the project was launched, Mpumalanga was the only province in South Africa without a High Court ...

[Applause.]... 25 years into our democracy. As the ANC, we trust that the opening of this High Court will serve as a catalyst in our efforts to attract legal expertise back to the province. I thank you. [Applause.]

CRISIS IN NELSON MANDELA METRO

(Member's Statement)

Mr A G WHITFIELD (DA): Nelson Mandela Bay's coalition of corruption headed by the UDM's mad Mayor Mongameli Bobani is in truth led by the ANC who are now more determined than ever before to steal the city and drive it back into the ground.

Last week, the ANC promised to put the people first and rid them of the worst mayor in the city's history. Instead, they ran away with their tails between their legs because in their coalition, it is the tail that wags the dog.

From 2016 to 2018, the DA-led coalition in Nelson Mandela Bay initiated a rapid turnaround in the finances and service delivery, which resulted in additional funding from Treasury after spending 100% of our grant funding.

One year later: The finances have all but collapsed; service delivery is nonexistent; National Treasury is recalling their grants; and 18 people have been murdered in what appear to be politically motivated killings.

The ANC have once again stolen the city and, in so doing, have sacrificed the people of Nelson Mandela Bay on the altar of corruption. [Applause.]

SEWERAGE CRISIS IN GREATER TAUNG MUNICIPALITY

(Member's Statement)

Ms N J NOLUTSHUNGU (EFF): House Chair, for the past two years, the community of Magogong in Greater Taung

Municipality has been drinking polluted water, which has turned brown in colour. They lodged a complaint about this water to the local municipality, and the municipality promised to provide them with clean water. However, up to date, their issue has not been solved.

The Department of Human Settlements, Water and Sanitation have built the people of Magogong RDP houses with an incomplete sewerage system which has septic tanks. The sewerage system has not been functioning since 1996. These septic tanks have been installed on the grounds in the yards of the RDP houses. When it is hot, the waste comes out of these septic tanks, flows on the ground and sometimes flows inside the RDP houses.

In 2004, one of the children fell and drowned in one of these septic tanks. The municipality refused to take responsibility for the tragic death. The name of the child who died due to these tanks is Tumelo Loikanyeng.

The conditions that the people of Magogong live in are despicable and there seems to be no one prepared to listen to their cries in government. Thank you.

[Applause.] [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Are you listening? Are you listening?

GOVERNMENT LAUNCHES INVESTMENT DRIVE

(Member's Statement)

Ms P N ABRAHAM (ANC): South Africa's investment drive is on track. The ANC welcomes all the efforts by our government to attract new investment. We are pleased to hear that approximately R363 billion - translating to 412 000 direct jobs - has been pledged at the second SA Investment Conference on Wednesday, 6 November 2019, at Sandton Convention Centre in Johannesburg, by about a dozen companies and business partnership forums.

This is a 17% higher than the R300 billion pledged at the conference debut in 2018. The gathering is part of President Ramaphosa's investment drive to raise R1,2 trillion in 5 years to improve the country's low economic growth and deal with the high unemployment rate.

The new commitments follow the assurances given by the President that the proceeds of the pledges made at the inaugural investment conference last year were already being realised. Of the R300 billion in investment pledged in 2018, about R238 billion has been secured during the past 12 months.

Since 2018, eight projects have been completed and about 17 are in the implementation stage. The remaining projects are still in the planning phase. The ANC would like those who gave us their mandate and trust to be assured that South Africa will rise and prosper in the years ahead and overcome all the current challenges and difficulties. Thank you. [Applause.]

TOURISM DECLINE IN SOUTH AFRICA, A CAUSE FOR CONCERN

(Member's Statement)

Mr K P SITHOLE (IFP): Hon House Chairperson, the decline in tourism experienced by South Africa in the recent years is a source for much concern to the IFP. According to recent Statistics SA, numbers have shown that international visitors to South Africa have declined for the first seven months of 2019.

We are currently on month eleven and no promising projections are in sight. This comes on the back of President Ramaphosa's pronouncements during his state of the nation address earlier in the year, making specific mention to international tourism and government's aim to double international visitors to 21 million by 2030.

The tourism sector, which is seen as a means to unlock jobs and economic growth in South Africa, has been battling to stay competitive. Uncertainty over visa arrangements for visitors from certain countries and concerns over crime have been the major setbacks.

We also need to look into better education for officials within the sector to empower them to deal with challenges faced by the sector and save us from this crisis. The IFP thanks you very much.

**TRIPARTITE ALLIANCE PARTNER, COSATU CONTRIBUTES TO
FINANCIAL CRISIS**

(Member's Statement)

Mr F J MULDER (FF PLUS): House Chair, unlike the Springbok team, the ANC's Tripartite Alliance is a divided house. Last Wednesday, during the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement speech of the Minister of Finance, it became clear that South Africa is in the midst of a serious financial crisis.

Suid-Afrika se staatskuld was 10 jaar gelede nog onder 30%; tans is dit 60%. Indien ons so voortgaan, sal dit oor nege jaar, teen 2028, 80% wees. Ons het vanweë die

vermorsing van geld, korrupsie en ANC-regeringsbeleid, wat ekonomiese groei byna ontmoontlik maak, in hierdie situasie beland. Wat was Cosatu se reaksie? (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.*)

[South Africa's public debt was still under 30% 10 years ago; currently it stands at 60%. Should we continue like this, then, in nine-years' time, by 2028, it will be at 80%. We have ended up in this situation, because of wasting money, corruption and ANC-led government's policies that cause economic growth to be almost impossible. What was Cosatu's response?]

We are content though that the bulk of the blatantly anti-worker attacks proposed by Treasury in its economic strategy paper has been removed. The federation appreciates the intervention by the President and the ANC to reject these treacherous proposals that were targeted at the National Minimum Wage, collective bargaining agreements and other progressive constitutional rights.

Die antwoord lê in 'n werkskeppende ekonomie, waar 'n vryer arbeidsmag die reël sal wees. Om dit reg te kry, sal die ANC-regering die mag van 'n onverantwoordelike Cosatu-vakbondvennoot moet breek. Dit is in belang van

Suid-Afrika. Kan die ANC dit doen? Dankie. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.*)

[The answer resides in a job-creating economy, where a workforce that is more free, should be the rule. To get that right, the ANC-led government will have to break the power of an irresponsible Cosatu trade union partnership. That is in the interest of South Africa. Will the ANC be able to do so? Thank you.]

**ANC RELATIONS WITH INDIAN COMMUNITY FORGED DURING
STRUGGLE FOR FREEDOM**

(Member's Statement)

Mr S N GUMEDE (ANC): The relationship between the ANC and the Indian community was forged in the trenches of the struggle, not as an act of convenience, but as an act of a single people working together. Throughout the history of a struggle for freedom, the role of South Africans of the Indian origin has been central.

It was thus with heavy hearts that members of the Indian community, along with the Mayor of Ethekewini, Mxolisi Kaunda, admitted their disappointment that R4,4 million

earmarked for the 1860 Indentured Monument project had not been ... the money was returned to the province.

The year 2020 would mark 160 years since the arrival of Indian people in Durban. The Ethekekwini was unable to use the funds for the erection of the statue celebrating this milestone but could have used the funds to build a soup kitchen or second-hand clothing distribution in the name of indenture labourers.

Given the funds in March 2015, the Ethekekwini City returned the money to the city due to difficulties to implement the project. The feeling among the Indian community now is that the role of the province's history has not been recognised but undermined. [Time expired.]

E-TOLLS MONEY ENRICHING FOREIGN-OWNED COMPANY, KAPSCH

(Member's Statement)

Mr C H H HUNSINGER (DA): More than two months have passed since 31 August cut-off date when Minister Mbalula had to come up with the solution to the e-toll problem in Gauteng. At the end of this month, the contract with electronic toll collection, ETC, company, Kapsch - a 100% foreign-owned company, will expire with no indication

whether the SA National Roads Agency Limited, Sanral, has or will extend the contract yet again.

This project contributes much to Sanral's R2,6 billion interest payments per year. So, where does the money come from? This year, R5,8 billion was removed from the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa, Prasa, and general road maintenance budget to pay the Austrian-based company. Motorists' reluctance to pay means that this contract cost us R3,5 billion each year. The deal was dodgy from the beginning. The SA National Roads Agency Limited should have paid Kapsch R6,2 billion, but they agreed to pay R9,9 billion. They also overpaid on construction. What should have cost R9 billion, Sanral paid almost twice that amount. Government is playing tough by threatening local road users while millions of rand are poured into foreign-owned coffers each month. [Interjections.]

**CALL TO CREATE PLACEMENT OPPORTUNITIES FOR TVET COLLEGE
STUDENTS**

(Member's Statement)

Mr N L S KWANKWA (UDM): House Chair and hon members ...

... ikhona ingxaki apha kwaye sibuhlungu xa siqaphela ukuba asimboni umntu weSebe leMfundo ePhakamileyo, Nzululwazi nobuChwephesha kwaba baPhathiswa balapha. Ingxaki apho ikhoyo uye ufumanise ukuba kwezi TVET Colleges abantwana bethu bayawenza lamanqanaba ngempumelelo bade baye kuphuma koo-N6. Xa begqibile ukufunda... (*Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.*).

[... there is a problem here and we are sad when we notice that we do not see a person from the Department of Higher Education, Science and Technology among the Ministers here. The problem is where you find out that in these TVET Colleges our children do levels successfully until they get out of N6. When they finish studying ...]

... these institutions place the responsibility and burden of looking for placement opportunities on 18-year-olds to 20-year-olds, who do not know anyone in the private sector. This is unlike your universities of technologies where they are responsible for looking at placement opportunities for students. Now, we have a lot of children who are discouraged and demoralised because they have qualifications that they cannot take to the next level though the same qualifications are again not good enough for some sectors of the private sector.

Okokuqala, eyona nto esithi urhulumente kufuneka ayenze yeyokuqinisekisa ukuba urhulumente uyabanika ...

(Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.)

[Firstly, what we say the government should do is to ensure that it gives them ...]

... placement opportunities so that they can be able to acquire their national diplomas during that 18-months period at the end of the process.

Okwesibini, kufuneka urhulumente ayenze ibe luxanduva lwezi kholeji ukuba zifumanele abafundi ... *(Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.)*

[Secondly, the government should make it the responsibility of these colleges to find for students ...]

... placement opportunities so that they can be taken to the next level ...

... singathi abantwana bebancinci sibe sibathwalisa uxanduva abangazukwazi ukumelana nalo. Enkosi.

(Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.)

[... we do not, while children are young, burden them with responsibilities that they will not be able to cope with. Thank you.]

**EMERGENCY ACTION PLAN TOWARDS COMBATING GENDER-BASED
VIOLENCE LAUNCHED**

(Member's Statement)

Ms M M E TLHAPE (ANC): The Emergency Action Plan unveiled by President Ramaphosa on 18 September 2019 has already made progress towards combating violence against women and children through a co-ordinated government and civil society effort. The delivery of evidence collection kits such as pediatric rape kits, adult rape kits and buccal sample kits to Gauteng and Limpopo by the SA Police Service, SAPS, have been completed. They are also in the process of finalising delivery to all police stations in the country.

The SAPS is in the process of enhancing the Forensic Science Laboratory that tracks the processing of gender-based violence and femicide-related cases. The system will be completed by January 2020. A total of 312 police entrants are currently under training and will be allocated to the family violence, child abuse and sexual

offence by 31 December 2019. Further, inspections of police stations to ensure availability of rape kits has been done and the SAPS has committed to finalising 80% of gender-based violence-related services complaints within 14 working days. The ANC-led government remains committed to dealing with gender-based violence in all its forms.

Thank you.

**SA POLICE SERVICE FAILS TO ARREST SUSPECT EMPLOYED WITH
BOGUS CERTIFICATES AT KWAZULU-NATAL DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH**

(Member's Statement)

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM (NFP): House Chair, the NFP notes with concern - the Minister is here - the failure of the SA Police Service to arrest the suspect, Rishal Dianen, who was employed by the Department of Health for over seven months with bogus certificates from the University of KwaZulu-Natal. This put many lives at risk and defrauded the Department of Health despite all the evidence and the report of the Health Professional Council of South Africa confirming the bogus certificates and his deregistration, including reports from the University of KwaZulu-Natal confirming that his certificates were indeed fake. He continues to evade the law despite many complaints lodged with the SA Police Service in KwaZulu-Natal, and

nationally, the Hawks have failed to secure his arrest with serious allegations of interference and collusion by members of the SA Police Service.

**ANC WELCOMES NATIONAL CONSULTATIVE WORKSHOP ON MORAL
REGENERATION MOVEMENT**

(Member's Statement)

Mr K E MAGAXA (ANC): Comrade Madiba introduced the concept of a Moral Regeneration Movement, which he termed the RDP of the soul. This was an effort to resuscitate morality among the fellow citizens of South Africa. The ANC therefore welcomes the National Consultative Workshop on the Moral Regeneration Movement of South Africa. The workshop was attended by more than 150 delegates and representatives from government, civil society and a host of stakeholders from across the length and breadth of South Africa, who gathered in Benoni - Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality in Gauteng from 7 to 8 November 2019.

As the patron of the Moral Regeneration Movement, Deputy President Comrade David Mabuza has directed that all sectors of society be mobilised under the Moral Regeneration Movement banner, to work together in

reinstilling in every citizen, the RDP of the Soul. The ANC therefore looks forward to the consolidated draft National Programme of Action emanating from the workshop as well as the final adoption at the planned Moral Regeneration Summit to be held before the end of 2019. I thank you.

**ESCALATING CRIME IN NORTHERN CAPE AND SAPS FAILURE TO
PROTECT VULNERABLE RURAL COMMUNITIES**

(Member's Statement)

Ms G OPPERMAN (DA): House Chairperson, may I arrest your attention to the fact that crime is getting worse in the Northern Cape and the SAPS is failing our vulnerable rural communities. Violent crime in the Brandvlei area has significantly escalated. A local resident was recently hacked to death in her home, and just three weeks ago, a teenage girl stepped her mother to death.

Last Saturday evening, a young woman took her life in a cell in Williston, the fourth suicide at that station. Last year, the provincial police commissioner promised that the towns of Brandvlei, Middelpoos and Sutherland would all receive additional vehicles. It is now 18 months later, and there has been no improvement.

Crime prevention is hampered due to inoperative vehicles, continuous mechanical repairs and maintenance. Brandvlei has only a single police van which they borrow from a nearby town. The van from Middelpoort was in for repairs from January until April, and only after a week on the province's rural roads, it was back in for repairs. So, there is no police van in Middelpoort. It is the same in Sutherland, where a single van spends more time in for repairs and not being utilised than on the road.

The DA has held precedence with the petition which calls for visible policing. We need more vehicles, and better ones than the current GWM ones that are being procured by the SAPS. According to the current year annual performance plan, APP, proper vehicles and restoring communities' trust in the police are ministerial priorities. But these 6 000 voters cannot even scream ...

"Hugo, bel die polisie!" (*Translation of Afrikaans sentence follows.*)

["Hugo, call the police!"]

... for the police cannot simply come. [Time expired.]

[Laughter.]

SAPS AND NATIONAL PROSECUTING AUTHORITY FAILING SENZO**MEYIWA'S FAMILY**

(Member's Statement)

Mr B S MADLINGOZI (EFF): Chairperson, it is over five years now since Senzo Meyiwa, a national football captain was murdered in cold blood. His family has been crying for justice ever since he died. His father later succumbed to stress-related illness as a result of his heartache over losing his beloved son. In that period, we have had one Minister of Police after another playing with the feelings of the Meyiwa family, promising that arrests will be made soon.

No one has been arrested and no one has taken responsibility for the murder of a very young and strong leader of our national team. We are disgusted that the Minister of Police and the NPA have not taken the investigation of this case seriously. We are even more perturbed that this has now been taken over by opportunistic right-wingers in the form of AfriForum. This happen because the state has failed Senzo Meyiwa and his family. We dare say that if Meyiwa was a white sportsman, his killers would have been found by now. No

one has been arrested because black lives do not matter in this country, regardless of who you may be. Thank you.

SOUTH AFRICA TAKES LEAD IN UN SECURITY COUNCIL

(Member's Statement)

Ms N C NDABA (ANC): House Chairperson, the South African government's commitment in its support, especially to women, was displayed at the United Nations Security Council. South Africa capitalised on the opportunity as the lead nation in the Council, that the month of October, be one of a call for the meaningful participation of women at all levels. These levels include the following. Peace processes, investing in women as peace builders, protecting the human rights of women and ensuring that there is swift accountability to those who perpetrate heinous crimes such as sexual violence. The resolution has been adopted unanimously, in a rare display of unity of purpose, in a Council starkly divided on issues of peace and security.

South Africa, in its deliberations was clear that there is a need to strengthen reporting requirements and support for women and children in conflict situations. This opportunity gave women from the Democratic Republic

of Congo, Central African Republic, Burundi and Sudan, to speak of their pain, hopes and expectations. The Center for Reproductive Rights has praised South Africa's leadership, commending the South African government for its commitment to the rights of women and girls during its presidency in the Council. Malibongwe! [Praise!] I thank you.

**UNDOCUMENTED FOREIGN NATIONALS ARRESTED DURING SAFER
FESTIVE SEASON CAMPAIGN IN GAUTENG**

(Member's Statement)

Mr M S CHABANE (ANC): House Chair, the ANC believes that while migration is a global phenomenon, there is a need for a swift action in dealing with undocumented foreigners and those who commit crimes in our country. Kicking off the safer festive season campaign, the SA Police Service in Gauteng led by Minister Ndosini, arrested 380 undocumented foreign nationals in Hillbrow, on Friday 8th November. The issue of undocumented foreign nationals especially those involved in criminal activities is a serious cause for concern.

As the ANC, we understand that foreign nationals have chosen South Africa for various reasons. We therefore

call upon our government to crack down on those who are undocumented. The ANC election manifesto directs us to take tough measure against undocumented migrants involved in criminal activities.

We remain committed to achieving Outcome 3 of the National Development Plan, NDP, to protect all living in South African, and tourists who visit including those who study and work legally. I thank you.

SAPS AND NATIONAL PROSECUTING AUTHORITY FAILING SENZO

MEYIWA'S FAMILY

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF POLICE: Chairperson, there are quite a number of them, but I would like to deal with the emotional one, of the former goalkeeper of Orlando Pirates. I don't know if the member did listen to the press briefing by the family about the police. I want to leave it there and if you are interested, you can go back and listen to what the family said in the press briefing. [Interjections.] That, is the first point I would like to make.

Secondly, as I stand here as the Minister of Police, we are satisfied that we are on the track when it comes to this case. This case is five years old and we have one year on the case ... [Interjections.] We know where the docket is. [Interjections.] If you don't know where it is, you better follow the news and you will know where it is. [Interjections.] That, has been clarified. We are very clear. To attach emotions on this one is not going to help and we are not going to fall for the emotions that people attached on this case.

We are satisfied, we are on course and we are briefed on the case. We are working together with the Minister of Justice and Correctional Services and the case of Senzo Meyiwa will be resolved. The noise will not resolve it, and so, sit down and relax. Thank you very much.

SAPS AND NATIONAL PROSECUTING AUTHORITY FAILING SENZO

MEYIWA'S FAMILY

HIGH COURT ESTABLISHED IN MPUMALANGA

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: Hon Chairperson, I just want to confirm that the National

Prosecuting Authority, NPA, and the SA Police Service, are working very well on the matter and it is being attended to. The issue will be resolved.

On the statement by hon Maseko-Jele of the ANC with regard to the opening of the Mpumalanga High Court, we want to say that it was a historic event. It is an event that will enable people of that province to access courts wherever they are because, it has got various circuit courts in the various parts of the province such as Kwa-Mhlanga, Mkhobola, Barberton and Graskop. So, it will be able to service most parts of the province - with also the state-of-the-art technology, including victim-friendly facilities that will enable victims of crime to testify without any fear or favour. But it will also be used as a platform for a new generation of practitioners in the province in the mould of various esteemed practitioners of our country.

The High Court opening was preceded by the opening of the Bityi Magistrate Court in the Eastern Cape and also the official opening of the renovated Mthatha High Court, which we have also given the state-of-the-art technology to enable communication between inmates in correctional facilities, who can postpone cases through technology.

This is a new generation of our courts which will enable us to access justice throughout the country and this kind of new generations of our courts is going to break the apartheid spatial planning. It will enable access for our people; it will also enable new practitioners to be able to come to the fore and to the entire transformation of the justice sector. Thank you. [Applause.]

TOURISM DECLINE IN SOUTH AFRICA, A CAUSE FOR CONCERN

(Minister's Response)

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF TOURISM: Chair, we have managed to acknowledge the fact that we have witnessed the decline of tourist arrival in 2018. However, if you now analyse on a month-to-month basis, you will realise that we are gradually turning the corner. If you analyse the figures in August, you will realise that we have increased the numbers to about 140 000 arrivals from 125 000 per arrivals in July. So, when you make a monthly analysis you will realise that we are gradually turning the corner.

We agree that there are challenges. One of them is the issue of tourists' safety. We are working very hard with the SA Police Service to create a safer environment for

our tourists. But we want to make a call that it is a collective responsibility to create safer communities. We must all work together as individuals, as a nation and as the people to make sure that we create a safer environment for our communities so that even our tourists feel safe when they come to our country.

We have deployed various tourism monitors as a department in various hot spots to make sure that we create safer environments for our tourists. So, we are working very hard and we are gradually turning the corner. We will make sure that we reach the target that the President has set of making sure that by 2030, we have 21 million tourists arrivals. Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

NOTICES OF MOTION

Mrs V VAN DYK: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates the victimisation of whistleblowers in the fight against corruption in the public service.

Mrs D B NGWENYA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House debates the plight of fidelity vehicle guards who are exposed to dangerous working conditions and are underpaid.

Ms M MODISE: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates African countries' need to work together to promote peace and stability while addressing trade obstacles, climate change, corruption, cybersecurity and the opportunities and challenges of the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

Mr K P SITHOLE: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the IFP:

That the House debates the issues of decline in the tourism sector.

Mr W W WESSELS: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the FF PLUS:

That the House debates the failure of national and provincial governments to give effect to the Constitution by implementing the Official Languages Act and enacting Provincial Official Languages Act.

Mr O M MATHAFA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates social cohesion and that nation-building can be encouraged through the progressive realisation of socioeconomic rights for all, the elimination of all forms of discrimination, building democracy through active citizenship and governance, and elimination of all threats to nation-building.

Mr W M THRING: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ACDP:

That the House debates the interventions and credible debt stabilisation strategies needed to prevent the

South African economy from being downgraded to speculative grade.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the UDM:

That the House debates measures to address the root causes of taxi violence in South Africa, which regularly affect a number of communities.

Mr B B NODADA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates the complete overhaul of the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, which has failed to adequately account for the R30 billion allocated for poor students who are still hungry without allowances and are being evicted from their off-campus residences due to the non-payment by NSFAS to date.

Ms N N CHIRWA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House debates the recognition of homophobia, homophobic sleaze, corrective rape, misogyny and slut-shaming sleaze as hate speech and hate crime.

Ms M C DIKGALE: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates reviewing competition legislation that enriches the powers of economic regulators to promote competition, based on fact-based inquiries and investigations, and also to discourage government policy and action that stifle competition.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the NFP:

That the House debates the need to reduce the number of provinces in South Africa and /or create a two-tier system.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon member, there is a gathering taking place there behind hon Swart. Will those members please take up their seats. Thank you. Continue, hon member.

Mr X QAYISO: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates progress on the implementation of the Truth and Reconciliation Committee, TRC, recommendations, as well as discussions on prosecutions, the special dispensation process, and reparations.

Mr Z MLENZANA: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates expanding access to social security with a comprehensive basket of defined benefits and services.

Mr H C C KRÜGER: House Chairperson, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates measures necessary to pave the way to ease of doing business of small and medium enterprises.

The House adjourned at 18:18.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

Please click on the following link to access the relevant Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports for this day.

[https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-papers?sorts\[date\]=-1](https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-papers?sorts[date]=-1)