

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 1**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

---

***PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY***

---

The House met at 14:01.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

**REVIVING OF ITEMS ON ORDER PAPER**

(Draft Resolution)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, I rise on a point of order in terms of Rule 333 of the National Assembly Rules. Before the hon Chief Whip of the Majority Party moves the motion, I want to point out that it is our view that there is a procedural defect on the Order Paper, in that what item 1(1) is seeking to do is to revive the decision on a Bill which had, in fact, lapsed.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 2**

It is our view, after having taken advice on this matter, that this is the incorrect procedure to follow.

What should, in fact, happen is that the Second Reading of that Bill should be revived. We won't have a debate on it, but the question is then put. One cannot revive a question on a Bill that has, in fact, lapsed.

The example that the NA Table had given and the example, I presume, that the hon Mr Mahlangu is going to be handing up to you now relies on the interpretation of a committee report. A committee report is very different to a piece of legislation. There is a legislative process that we follow, and it is set out very, very clearly in the Rules.

Reviving the decision on the question of the Bill, I believe, is going to be a procedural irregularity, and could call into question the Bill's proper passing by the House. What we should rather be doing is reviving the Second Reading of the Bill, getting it back onto the Order Paper, and then putting it to the House for a question. I seek a ruling from you, Deputy Speaker.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 3

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am unable to rule when I don't know what you are talking about. [Interjections.] Firstly, there is a matter that is about to be put to me, and I would assume you would want me to hear what it is and the basis on which you are saying it would then be considered, and not before. [Interjections.] Do you see what ...? Yes, I know. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Deputy Speaker, I move:

(1) That the following items that were on the Order Paper and which, in terms of Rule 333 and 351, lapsed at the end of the last sitting day of the 2018 annual session, be revived:

(1) Decision of Question on Second Reading -  
Road Accident Benefit Scheme Bill;

(2) Consideration of Report of Portfolio  
Committee on Police on Firearms Control  
Amendment Bill;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 4**

- (3) Second Reading debate - Firearms Control Amendment Bill;
- (4) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Rural Development and Land Reform on Restitution of Land Rights Amendment Bill;
- (5) Second Reading debate - Restitution of Land Rights Amendment Bill;
- (6) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Water and Sanitation on Study tour to the Netherlands from 4 to 8 June 2018;
- (7) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry on Study visit to United Kingdom;
- (8) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Science and Technology on

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 5**

Study tour to Republic of Korea and Japan  
from 15 to 25 June 2018;

- (9) Consideration of Report of Portfolio  
Committee on Police on Study visit to  
People's Republic of China from 8 to 15  
October 2017;
- (10) Consideration of Report of Portfolio  
Committee on Tourism on Visit to Tourism  
Month activities in Eastern Cape Province;
- (11) Consideration of Report of Portfolio  
Committee on Public Works on Study tour to  
Federal Republic of Germany;
- (12) Consideration of Report of Portfolio  
Committee on Small Business Development on  
Study tour to Spain from 15 to 22  
September 2018;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 6**

- (13) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry on Study visit to Federal Republic of Germany;
- (14) Consideration of Report of Portfolio Committee on Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs on Study tour to China; and
- (15) Consideration of Report of Chief Whips' Forum on Study Tour to Ghana and United Kingdom from 16 to 26 January 2018.

Question put.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, I have requested a ruling from you, in terms of Rule 333 of the National Assembly Rules. Item 1(1) of the resolution before us should be the revival of the Second Reading of the Road Accident Fund Amendment Bill. It shouldn't be the question.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 7

One cannot revive the decision of a question on a Bill that has, in fact, lapsed, in terms of the Rules. What should be revived is the Second Reading of the Bill, which should then be put before the House for the question. It is not a committee report or some other instrument. It is a piece of legislation, and I would ask for a ruling from you, in this regard.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright. What I will do is look at what you are saying for consideration so that we can come back to the House on whether we can proceed with it. These matters were presented before you elsewhere and this matter that you are raising now did not arise, because you were alerted to it, and so, I would like to take advice on that. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: I did, in fact, raise this in the right forum at the Programming Committee, and there is acknowledgment of my raising this matter on 14 February, in written correspondence. I happen to think this correspondence is an incorrect interpretation, and that

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 8**

we are about to make an error, in terms of the legislative process.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Yes, alright.

Mr S N SWART: Deputy Speaker, I rise on a point of order: On the same Rule, Rule 333, I would ask you to consider the interpretation of Rule 333(1) when it refers to lapsing "at the end of that day", being the last day of the last year, "unless the Assembly decides otherwise".

I would ask you to consider whether the Assembly must decide then, or whether the Assembly can apply it retrospectively, now, because I would submit that there is no Rule that allows for reviving. I would also submit for your consideration that perhaps one needs to tighten up this Rule, going forwards, because my reading that the Assembly should have decided then to sit on that day because it was going to lapse, and decided to extend it and hold it over. That would be my respectful consideration and interpretation. However, it is up to you to make a ruling. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 9**

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Deputy Speaker, from my reading of what the hon Steenhuisen says, he has no objection to the final action that will be taken by this House, not even in relation to the matter that is before us. He is concerned about the capturing of how the matter is captured, but he agrees that, when the matter comes to this House, we will start where this matter was last interacted with in the last session. That last interaction was putting a question before the House.

So, we don't think that we are at variance, because he agrees that, when the matter comes here, we will, indeed, entertain a question on the matter so that we can vote on the matter. We will not debate the matter because we had concluded debating on the matter.

So, we don't have any difficulties, as long as the sentiment that is carried in this item is adhered to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, the issues raised here ... one of the observations made by the Table Staff is that as the reference made by hon Swart, that all Bills that have been introduced in the assembly and which are

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 10**

on the last sitting day of an annual session of the assembly appear on the Order Paper for the First or Second Reading lapse at the end of that day unless the assembly decides otherwise.

Now, work had already been done at that stage including Second Reading Debate and therefore, you don't have to go back to that. This is the observation that is made about that matter; so, you can't go back to a matter that was already decided. Meaning that, as it came here before the House [Interjection.] that's the observation that is made, yes. [Interjection.]

Hon members, the point that I have just raised now is that having made that assessment, the Second Reading had already been gone through. What we need to do is to indicate whether you want that amended because that's what would matter before us now, we can't go back to that, yes.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think we must not put the cart before the horse. And the hon Chief Whip of the Opposition has made a valid point, in that the House has

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 11**

to first bring the Bill to the House then the decision of the question we can take at a later stage. We can decide tomorrow when that item should be put on for the decision.

But what we should be bringing back to the House now is a lapsed Bill; because the Bill has lapsed in terms of the Rules, to be revived. And I would suggest that in terms of what hon Swart said - I mean, I don't want to respond to him - but it's common practice that in a new year we revive the Bills that lapsed in the preceding here, we do not do it at the end of 2018 for example. I think we are right in reviving Bills now in 2019, except for item one, which is trying to revive a decision on a question. But we should revive the Bill and then we should take a decision in the next few days. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Let's hear hon member first then we'll come to you.

Dr C P MULDER: Hon Deputy Speaker, the hon Chief Whip from the ANC refers to the general sentiment, but the problem that the Rules don't make provision for

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 12**

sentiments, makes provision for provisions. So, I'm afraid that the hon Chief Whip of the DA is absolutely correct. The Rules ... Rule 333 does not make provision for the revision or the bringing back of a decision that was not taken for whatever reason. We can revive the Bill. We first need to revive the Bill; we cannot revive the question that didn't take place on that day regardless of the sentiment that's what the Rules say. So, if the hon Chief Whip wants to proceed with the resolution, I would suggest that he amends his resolution and removes 1.1 for today, he can bring it tomorrow. But if he passes it, as it is now, it will be unprocedural in terms of Rule 333.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. That's correct. Hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Deputy Speaker, we would like to make an amendment to point 1.1; which we will submit to you now and 1.1 would then read: Second Reading - Road Accident Benefit Scheme Bill. Thank you Deputy Speaker.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 13**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, there is an amendment moved by the Chief Whip. Is that in order; are you fine with that amendment?

Agreed to.

**TRADITIONAL LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE FRAMEWORK AMENDMENT**

**BILL**

(Consideration of Bill and of Report thereon)

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Where is hon Mdakane? Hayi, hayi hon ... [Interjection.]

Mr M R MDAKANE: I'm here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, go ahead. Why are you speaking from there, in the first place?

Mr M R MDAKANE: No, I can speak anywhere.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no, just do what is normally done. Please, you can't change the rules in the middle of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 14**

the game. [Laughter.] At the end of the game. Please come. That you chair the subcommittee of the rules does not entitle you to do that. Just go ahead hon member.

Mr M R MDAKANE: Deputy Speaker, in November 2018 the NA passed the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Bill and was forwarded to the NCOP for concurrence, and was adopted on 10 January 2019 with exception of the abstention of the DA.

It makes provision for the recognition of the Khoi-San to effect consequential amendment to the other laws.

The Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework Amendment Bill was presented to the representatives of provinces during a meeting of the traditional affairs, technical and governance forum. The Bill was further presented at the Lekgotla, heard by the National House of Traditional Leaders and representatives from the provincial houses of traditional leaders on 23 August 2016.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 15**

The Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework Amendment Bill, 2017, seeks to provide for the establishment of kingship and queenship council in respect of the kingship and queenship that has been confirmed by the Commission of Traditional Leadership dispute and claims in accordance with the Act prior to its amendment in 2009.

One of the main purposes of the transitional provision is to deal with it immediately as such that the agreement has to have proven history of existence of the community from a particular point in time up to the present, recognition of Khoi-San community and a branch; before the new law came into operation and to provide legal space.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the portfolio committee debated this matter when we presented our Bill in 2018 and we agreed as the NA to pass the Bill; and was taken to the processes of Parliament then the NCOP made consequential and some minor technical amendment.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 16

As a result of that, the committee and the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, CoGTA, having considered the proposed amendment by the NCOP to the Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework Amendment Bill, 2015, adopted the portfolio committee Report on 13 February 2019, with the exception of the DA, that rejected the Report.

The committee recommends that the NA approve the Report with amendment. That is the issue, hon Deputy Speaker, that we are presenting for your consideration and approval. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

There was no debate.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Deputy Speaker, we move that the Report be adopted by this House.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr K J MILEHAM: Deputy Speaker, I don't know whether hon Mdakane has spent too much time in the magistrates' court recently because we are debating the Traditional Leadership Governance Framework Amendment Bill not the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 17**

Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Bill, TKLB.

[Laughter.] Deputy Speaker when I walked in here today, I took a photo of a banner outside the Old Assembly and it was a vision of the National House of Traditional Leaders and it said "the vision is to be House of Traditional Leaders that strives for good co-operative governance in traditional communities." I thought isn't that ironic because this is exactly what this Bill was intended right back in 2003 to introduce and it didn't. It failed dismally. This Amendment Bill is trying to correct a wrong. It is trying to correct a problem that has arisen because of sheer incompetence and lack of political will on the part of the department and the Minister.

The Democratic Alliance acknowledges and recognises the role and function of traditional leaders and more importantly, traditional councils. This legislation was intended to extend the timeframe that those traditional councils had to transform and to conform to the principle act and to legitimise those who had not complied. Now, as I said when we first debated the Traditional Leadership and Governance Amendment Bill in 2018 and what I said back then still holds the truth today:

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 18**

Firstly, the original act passed in 2003 gave traditional authorities one year to transform, hold elections and comply with the new legislation. One of those requirements was that one third of the members of the traditional council be women;

Secondly, when those traditional councils failed to do so within the one year timeframe, we bought an amendment in 2009 that was passed and that gave them seven years dating back to 2004, in other words up to 2011 to comply;

Thirdly, the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs at the national and provincial level has repeatedly failed to ensure compliance or to assist those traditional authorities to transform as required by this Act;

Fourthly, it perpetuates apartheid era, trouble authorities that were created by 1951 Black Authorities Act and it entrenches specific trouble identities by virtue of apartheid era spatial boundaries. Despite the fact that the Deputy Chief Justice Moseneke noted in the similar judgement *Ntshongwana and others versus the*

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 19**

Minister of Rural Development and others and I quote: "To use the Black Authorities Act of 1951 as a platform for reform after 1994 is simply incredible." In fact, I would go so far as to say it is reprehensible; [Applause.]

Fifthly, this Amendment Bill again extends the timeframe by a further two years; and lastly

Sixthly, it is little more than stop-gap legislation intended to show up a dysfunctional system until the Traditional and Khoisan Leadership Bill that hon Mdakane stood here and presented it so confidently about is passed into law. Deputy Speaker, we are being overtaken by events because of an incompetent department and an incompetent Ministry. They have given no indication of how they will ensure compliance within the extended timeframe.

Let us not forget that over the past 18 years no traditional council elections have been held in Limpopo. Those that were held in Eastern Cape, North West and KwaZulu-Natal were deeply flawed and rendered up illegitimate traditional councils that did not comply. In

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 20**

terms of the Principal Act, traditional councils have a limited term of office. For most, this expired in August last year. That would mean that any actions taken or contracts entered into by those councils once their term had expired would be illegal. All of which begs a question: What has this department been doing for the past five years? Could they not see the problem that the term of the traditional councils was about to run out? Were they unaware of the noncompliance with the existing Act?

Deputy Speaker, this Bill perpetuates a structure that is inherently, undemocratic, misogynist and frankly outdated. [Applause.] It puts no controls in place, nor does it ensure the rights of ordinary citizens and I use the word citizens advisedly because our people are citizens not subjects. It does not ensure that their rights are protected. [Interjections.]

We have repeatedly seen how traditional leaders and traditional authorities and again, I use the word "advisedly" because in many instances, they have not transformed into legislative required traditional

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 21**

councils, have plundered the financial resources of the very community they are supposed to represent, develop and protect. Thus far, they seem to get away with it with absolute impunity. This Bill was an opportunity to clarify the role of traditional leaders and traditional councils. It was an opportunity to create a more modern, democratic structure that reflects the will of communities. It's an opportunity that has been squandered and the DA opposes it. [Applause.]

Ms N K F HLONYANA: Hon Deputy Speaker, despite the amendments proposed by the NCOP on this Bill, our fundamental opposition to it still stands. This Amendment Bill is a classic example of state painting over cracks hoping the cracks will disappear. The portfolio committee and the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs will have us believe that the Bill proposed is just a minor technical amendment relating to the timeframe for proper constitution of traditional councils. But, what the Bill reveals is essential in a fundamental failure of the very conception of the governance of the institutions of the traditional leadership across the country.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 22**

The Framework Act, this is being amended here is based on the logic and the model of the Bantu Authorities Act, Act 68 of 1951. In that, it provides for a continuation of tribal authorities as tribal councils. This continuation was done on condition that the so-called traditional councils should transform to reflect the realities of the democratic society.

It is now common sense that all those transformative ideals envisaged by the Framework Act have failed to materialise and this failure is due to the very nature of these traditional councils. No attempts have been made by the department to understand what the underlying factors are, which have contributed to the failure of these Councils to establish themselves based on the provision of the Framework Act. No attempts have been made to fix those shortcomings; though the department knows for their own political agendas, the government is not eager to challenge the traditional leaders to conduct their businesses in a democratic and legal manner. They need to be a major rethink and reimagination of the kind of governance we need for South African rural people. This

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 23

amendment falls far short. Therefore, as the EFF, we reject the Amendment Bill. Thank you. [Applause.]

*IsiZulu:*

Mnu X NGWEZI: Lungu elihloniphekile Sekela Somlomo, amaKhosi aseNdlunkulu akhona angamalungu ale Ndlu, amalungu ahloniphekile ...

*English:*

... whilst supporting this Amendment Bill and the extensions that its various categories of extension seeks to enact into law, the IFP remains in the position that traditional leadership at the community level is the best suited to address the needs and challenges of their own communities and should be empowered in parallel with the local government to do so.

Traditional leadership is an extremely important aspect and component of our multicultural traditional value system in this country and traditional leadership must be afforded its rightful place in local community and provincial governments. When taking into account the objections of the Bill emphasise must be placed upon the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 24**

fact that there is still no clarification upon the roles of traditional leaders as mandated for in the Constitution. Additionally, I reiterate what was said by Prince Buthelezi last week in the state of the nation address I quote:

Section 81 of the Municipal Structures Act remains an insult to traditional leadership. It enables us to sit there and clap hands, but not to vote. There is a strong feeling amongst some of us that government may as well do the honest thing and abolish the institution.

Prince Buthelezi further rightfully stated that:

Our government has failed to do what even an oppressive colonial government did. Not a single traditional council or House of Traditional Leaders is allocated a budget. It's a serious challenge.

Yet, we must co-operate and fulfil our responsibilities in local government.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 25**

The IFP will continue to champion the voice of traditional leadership until its rightful place under our Constitution has been established. I thank you.

[Applause.]

Prof N M KHUBISA: Deputy Speaker, thank you very much, the NFP welcomes the report of the portfolio committee as it provides for the timeframes within which kingship or queenship council and traditional councils must be established. It also provides for a extended timeframes within the community authorities have to be established. However, the NFP wants to raise the following issues:

Firstly, we do not believe that the Constitution of the country covers the powers, functions and duties and roles of traditional leaders in a correct way. This scope, therefore is very narrow;

Secondly, traditional leaders do not merely attend to cultural and customarily matters. They are also responsible for their development of their tribes and communities;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 26**

Thirdly, it is therefore our submission as the NFP that Chapter 7, 9 and 12 of the Constitution has to be amended so as to widen correctly the scope of traditional leaders; and

Fourthly, traditional leaders have to be given powers to participate both in local municipalities and district municipalities and they must have the voting powers.

This recognition may not be enough as all legislations that have tried to address matters pertaining to traditional leaders have not adequately address this matter. When we deliberate on matters of this magnitude the land issue comes to the fore. Traditional leaders have always been leading the land issue with regard to the settlement of their tribes and food security. This Bill therefore besides trying to give timeframes to the offices of traditional authorities and councils, it also gives the form and shape of how traditional councils have to be constituted as seen in section 28(4) and section 3(2) of the Bill.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 27**

It is therefore the considered opinion of the NFP that this piece of legislation may not be final as some more consultation has to be made with traditional leaders. Before we consider issues of legal uncertainty with regard to the status of traditional authorities, it is important that we consider the powers, roles and functions of traditional leaders; whilst timeframes of establishing kingship and queenship and traditional authorities the key issue is about powers, roles and functions of traditional leaders.

In the areas led by traditional leaders, you will find that there are no schools, hospitals, clinics, Tvet colleges, universities and the SA Police Service, SAPS offices and the government must attend to these matters. However, we welcome the report yet it is not a finish task. Thank you.

Mr W M MADISHA: Thank you, we have as Cope consistently warned against attempts by the ANC to foster apartheid style bantustanisation of our tribal communities of white anting their constitutional democratic rise to curry favour, not carry, but curry favour with traditional

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 28**

leaders for narrow party political and corrupt ants. The purport of this Bill is to give traditional councils a further two year opportunity to give effect to important transformation requirements that they have failed to meet over the past 13 years. The requirement that traditional councils constitute includes 40% elected and one third women membership. Cope finds it reprehensible that many councils, have failed over the past 13 years to comply with the law and that the government has failed to ensure compliance.

It points to as a high-level panel report concludes a lack of political will on the part of a governing party to ensure transformation and democratisation of our traditional councils of a desire to foster Bantustan tactics, first applied by the apartheid regime. There is also a more sinister intend behind the Bill. That is to protect and legitimise agreements such as mining and other commercial agreements that have been concluded or are about to be concluded by untransformed and unelected traditional councils. The mining agreements concluded in Limpopo, for example platinum belt, where no official traditional council elections have ever taken place,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 29**

where a few connected elite have profited at the expense of entire communities are an example of nefarious intent.

The high-level panel report states that the current and proposed legislation on traditional leadership denies people living in areas under traditional leaders several constitutional rights, thereby distinguishing them from those living in the rest of the country, who enjoy the full benefits of postapartheid citizenship.

Cope denounces the ruling party and government and those traditional councils who have collectively failed over the past 13 years to effect reforms envisaged by the Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework Act. Thank you very much.

Mr J J DUBE: Deputy Speaker, after the establishment of the democratically elected ANC-led government in 1994, the Reconstruction and Development Programme, under the final Constitution of 1996, gave expression to the philosophical vision of the ANC and its government to the transformation and support of the institution of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 30**

traditional leaders in accordance with the constitutional principles of democracy and equality.

The proposed amendments provide a solution and clarity regarding the status of traditional councils and rural democracy. It has a bigger impact on the lives of people who live in rural areas than is generally perceived. It not only relates to the leadership issue but also to power relations and the impact the national laws and policies has on changing the balance of power within the rural areas. Men and women are equal. It further influences the way leadership connects with mineral rights and the land used. It demonstrates the ANC-led government's resolve to restore and defend the land rights of rural citizens on communal land. It makes it possible for the marginalised rural citizen to claim and defend their land rights and transition.

The ANC approved the committee report with amendments. I thank you.

Question put: That the Bill, as amended, be passed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 31

Division demanded.

The House divided.

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES.]

Question agreed to.

Bill, as amended, accordingly passed.

**CONSIDERATION OF LEGISLATIVE PROPOSAL TO AMEND THE  
NATIONAL MINIMUM WAGE ACT, 2018, SUBMITTED BY PORTFOLIO  
COMMITTEE ON LABOUR**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I know that we are approaching the end of the term, but do the necessary thing. Be on the seat here on time, every time, no exception. Go ahead ...

*Sesotho:*

... Ntate Mashile; ke bua le wena ntate. 14:45:50

*English:*

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 32**

Go ahead, hon member.

Mr B L MASHILE: Deputy Speaker, I think I have been ordered to be in my allocated seat just now to vote and it was not possible for me to move, but thanks in any way. Deputy Speaker, you will remember that last year the National Minimum Wage Act was passed, one of our most important that we have processed in 2018. After we have done that, then it came to our attention that there is a technical error that has happened which was a consequential one that slipped through our fingers.

Last year we then got in the process of actually addressing that specific matter which led to the committee meeting of 16 January to actually agree that we should correct that error because it is very important that we protect our workers. Therefore, I am here to ask the National Assembly to grant us permission to proceed with this legislative proposal in order to correct this technical error. Thank you very much.

There was no debate.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 33

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Deputy Speaker, we move that the House in terms of Rule 273(3) give permission that the legislative proposals be proceeded with. Thank you.

*Declarations of vote:*

Mr M BAGRAIM: The DA supports the amendments, but not the legislation. The amendments are due to gross negligence which was pointed out to the portfolio committee by the DA ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Order!

Mr M BAGRAIM: ... for December 2018. Before the President signed off the legislation, this amendment would not have been necessary, it was corrected timeously, and an enormous amount of expenditure would have been avoided. With the advent of the implementation of the national minimum wage in 2019, the trade union movements and in particular the Congress of SA Trade Unions, Cosatu, started to scream jobs bloodbath. The trade unions were hellbent on the screaming that the national minimum wage

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 34**

will not lead to any retrenchments, now they are saying jobs bloodbath.

Furthermore, they hysterically argued that the R20 per hour was far too low and has to be ratcheted up exponentially. Over and above this, a lot of noise emanated from the academics and the red hats, we didn't want to hear about the fact that it was almost impossible to create more jobs in many of the blue-collar sectors.

Two years ago, even our Treasury warned us that we will lose 750 000 jobs, but the warning was not heeded. In fact it appeared to be surreptitiously withdrawn after a lot of probable pressure being brought to bear on them. [Interjections.] We hear the very union bleating about the problems. Obviously no one is going to blame the national minimum wage, as there is always someone else to blame and someone else to talk about.

As a matter of fact, we have the largest percentage of unemployment in the world. Almost 10 million South Africans who want to work cannot find work. Businesses are still contemplating further retrenchments. New jobs

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 35**

are not being created in the blue-collar sectors. Businesses are being encouraged to mechanised and computerised. It is said that the business community is on an investment strike. It becomes far cheaper to import rather than to manufacture. Even with our own raw materials, businesses cannot compete with dozens of jurisdictions worldwide.

It is sheer folly and quite frankly reckless for the ruling party to have pushed for a national minimum wage in a shrinking economy and dying manufacturing. When other countries have 10% unemployment, their senior politicians resign, states of emergency are declared and the labour laws are deregulated so as to encourage more employment. We have a knack of doing exactly the opposite. It is almost like saying, for example, "If the price of petrol goes up, I am going to burn my motor vehicle." We are experts in South Africa in making decisions that have negative consequences.

Our ruling party likes to call it unintended consequences even if they have been warned for years about the probable negative results. No one in government seems to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 36**

understand that businesses have to make a profit in order to survive. Continual losses through unsustainable overheads mean the eventual demise of the employer. It appears that our hon Minister needs a course in economics 101. It is very well to say that people need to earn more if the business is making a loss. Every state-owned enterprise has not been able to internalise that fact and they need an income to be able to expend to the expenditure. If an employee does not produce enough to justify his or her salary, and the price of labour outpaces the value of goods, then something is bound to go wrong.

It would be simple if we could merely raise the price of goods in order to accommodate the rising labour costs, but then we need to ensure that the purchaser is not able to get the goods elsewhere at a much cheaper price. The world is becoming smaller and it is quite fair and reasonable for the buying public to purchase merchandise at the lowest price. The social and economic engineering is certainly not going to improve the standard of living of low-skilled workers. It will do just the opposite. We must understand that in South Africa today, the real

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 37**

minimum wage is R0 per hour. Low-skilled workers would probably be retrenched or be employed for less hours.

This has already started happening in South Africa; Cosatu has called it jobs bloodbath. This causes the minimum wage to be R0 per hour and I keep repeating that. The system of the national minimum wage cannot in any way change the real value of labour and unfortunately what it is really doing is, it is sending the message to the manufacturers that it would be cheaper for them to import.

We have already seen employers just ignoring the minimum wage, and some of the employees who are fully cognisant to the fact that they could lose their jobs just keeping quite. We have only 16 00 inspectors in the whole of South Africa and the chances of an inspector calling in your businesses ... [Time expired.]

Mr P G MOTOKA: The only reason why the Bill is before the House is because of the incompetency of the ANC and its ability for legislation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 38

*Sepedi:*

Re kgalemile batho kua komiting le ba mokgatlo wo o bušago gore ba dira lepotlapotla, ba kitimela go dumelelana le Molao woo Ramaphosa a dirago kuwauwetšo ka wona go uwauwetša bakgethi ka yona.

*English:*

Instead of going into detail and consider ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member ... [Interjections.] Hon member, just hold on please; just hold on. Hon Chauke please hold on. Hon member, refer to Members of Parliament, including the President, appropriately. You should not refer to them by name, they are to be referred to as honourable or mister.

*Sepedi:*

Mna P G MOTEKA: E re ke bušeletše gape. Le dirile lepotlapotla le kitimetše gore Mopresidente Ramaphosa ...

*English:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 39

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, I have made a ruling. You should respond to my ruling; you do not continue as if I didn't say anything.

Mr P G MOTEKA: I have corrected it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You must refer to the President appropriately. I am not saying you must restate what you have said.

Mr P G MOTEKA: I am doing that. [Interjections.] What do you want? I am doing just that. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening to you, hon member.

Mr P G MOTEKA: Yes, I am saying ...

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am waiting for the member to ...

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: But how did you not hear him because he said "lepotlapotla" [haste]...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 40

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member! Hon member, sit down!

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: He is correcting what he has done.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member!

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Haai, don't harass our members, man!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you are out of order.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: He said "lepotlapotla" [haste] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... and nobody gave you the right to speak in the first place. You are out of order, extremely so.

Mr P G MOTEKA: Deputy Speaker, I think you must listen.

*Sepedi:*

Ke re ke bušeletša gape; ba dira lepotlapotla gore

Mopresidente Ramaphosa a tle a dire ...

*English:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 41

... electioneering with this Act without going into details and considering ...

*Sepedi:*

... dillo tša bašomi. Empa rena taba ye ga e re makatše ka gore ANC kgale e dira ditiro tša mašilapuleng, go tloga ka 1994 go fihla lehono. [Tsenoganong.] Re le ba EFF re sa realo re re R20 ka iri ke papadi, ke ditokomane; ga go na lelapa le le tla phelago ka R20 ka iri. [Tsenoganong.] Ga le gona.

*English:*

Instead of using the opportunity of amendment to increase the minimum wage and further consult relevant stakeholders like the SA Federation of Trade Unions, Saftu, the ANC ...

*Sepedi:*

... ya dira tša yona feela, ya nagana gore e ka hlaola mekgatlo ye megolo bjalo ka Mokgatlo wa Kgwebišano wa Kgwerano wa Afrika-Borwa. Ke ka lebaka le ba wetšego ka leopeng lehono. [Tsenoganong.] La mathomo ge

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 42

Molaokakanywa wo o tlišwa mo Ngwakong wa  
Lekgotlatheramelao, re ba boditše gore ...

*English:*

... take it easy, step by step, make sure that the workers are getting justice out of it. Instead, they rushed it, thinking that our workers are stupid. Our workers are not fools. Thank you very much. We reject it.

Mr X NGWEZI: What is this "lepotlapotla"?

THE DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will tell you outside the House, hon member. [Laughter.]

Mr X NGWEZI: Hon Deputy Speaker, at the outset and whilst the IFP supports the legislative proposal, as it seeks to correct an error of a technical nature, which arose from a consequential amendment not being affected, we remain opposed to the idea of a national minimum wage for the very fact that it will harm far more employees than help them. Employers who cannot afford to meet the threshold payment will simply retrench the employee and will spiral unemployment already taking place in South Africa. This

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 43**

is not the right move at this time, as employers will simply substitute labour for capital or produce less. Both options will result in fewer employees being hired. Moreover, the national minimum wage does not even meet what is required in terms of the breadline requirement, so, we will not assist those it is meant to help. Such artificial market intervention can only fail in the long term causing more harm than good. The IFP has always advocated a sectoral approach to minimum wage determination and will continue along such lines. I thank you.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon Deputy Speaker, this Bill is coming to the House as a result of an error. The question has to be asked. Was it because we were in such a hurry that we could make an error in a Bill of this importance? The NFP supported the Minimum Wage Bill but we placed on record that the Bill with its good intentions may not be sufficient to deal with the whole host of challenges that beset our people in the workplace in farms and in mines. We also pointed out that R120 per day is not enough and R3500 per month is also not enough but at least there must be something that our people are getting.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 44**

We want to make a call as we deliberate on this proposal that there is going to be a need to make an amendment and we deliberate this matter even further. Security officers, domestic workers, farm workers, miners and all other employees need adequate salaries for them to support their families. Their conditions of service must be improved. They must be protected from abuse. The NFP also welcomes the correction as tabled here today in the form of a proposal but there is still a long way to go to solve the problems of our people. They need land for settlement and farming. They also need hospitals, schools and clinics that are of a high standard. Our people want to feel safe in the land of their birth and need jobs and they want to create their own businesses.

As we therefore welcome the correction of a technical error in Section 17(4) so that it correctly refers to Section 4(8) as opposed to Section 4(6). The NFP wants to put it on record that 2019 should be a year of dealing with all the challenges that affect the workers of our country, especially those who are at the bottom of the ladder or neglected when it comes to getting decent salaries. Thank you, we welcome the correction.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 45

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hon Deputy Speaker...

*IsiXhosa:*

... thatha UDM thatha! Masinixelele kwangoku ukuba siza kuphatha. Nifane nenza ingxolo siza kuba ngoosekela benu. Ndibavile abantu bethethelela oosomashishini, beteketa ngalo mba woMthetho oSaYilwayo woWona Mvuzo Mncinane kaZwelonke (Minimum Wage Bill). Aba somashishini baseMzantsi Afrika ngoongxowa abangabakhathalelanga abantu abahluphekileyo. Abantu abahluphekileyo bangalala bengatyanga bengenayo nepeni emdaka oosomashishini bona bajonge ingeniso kuphela kumashishini wabo.

Ukuba aba somashishini bebengamathandazwe, ngabula bona, ngebengakhange benza ugwayimbo lotyalo-mali ngemali eninzi abayifumana njengelifa kurhulumente wengcinezelo. Abakwazanga ukutyala imali kwilizwe labo njengamathandazwe ukukhulisa uqoqosho.

*English:*

They do not care whether you create conditions that are conducive for the nonsense that they keep talking about but they continue their so-called investment strike. In

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 46

fact, the same business people we are talking about are the same ones who are net investors into Brick countries...

*IsiXhosa:*

... bangafaki imali eMzantsi Afrika. Ngoku kufuneka sibane sibathethelela. Lo Mthetho osaYilwayo woWona Mvuzo Mncinane weSizwe...

*English:*

... is a step in the right direction...

*IsiXhosa:*

... qha le mali incinci kakhulu. Nani ngoku ningenwa yile nto yokuthi masininikeni *ibitjie lalatjie* nje okokuba ukwazi ukulala utyile. Awukwazi nokondla abantwana, yindlalo le. Le mali bekufanele ukuba noko ithe nyii. Ndiyekile mna ukuthetha ngokulungiswa kwalo Mthetho osaYilwayo qhubekani nina thina siya kuthetha ngazo ngenye emini.

Urhulumente we-ANC uyathanda ukubhideka ngamanye amaxesha ufumanise ukuba unenkungu. Uqala ngokugqiba ngokwenza

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 47

ummiselo woWona Mvuzo Mncinane ongama-R3500, alandelise ngokunyusa iVat ekubeni engakhange aqinisekise ukuba...

*English:*

... the minimum wage amount that is set takes that into consideration.

*IsiXhosa:*

Niye niphinde nibe le mali yabantu abahluphekileyo kuba...

*English:*

... a lot of that money still goes to the items which are affected by the Vat increase from 14% to 15%. That issue has not been considered holistically because it was supposed to be Vat sensitive. By the time we passed this Bill last year...

*IsiXhosa:*

... bekufanele ukuba lo mba uye wanikwa ingqwalasela. Asisayi ukuze sikwazi ukuthethelela oosomashishini baseMzantsi Afrika abanyolukileyo nabasoloko bejongene nokwenza imali.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 48

*English:*

The issue here is about fighting for the share of the workers in the mark up of the business because these are the people who generate the income but they are paid a pittance.

*IsiXhosa:*

Ingxaki ekhoyo yeyokuba oosomashishini balapha bafuna ukuba nemali eninzi...

*English:*

... and worsen the levels of inequality in the country. We are expected to sit here as leaders...

*IsiXhosa:*

... zabantu abantsundu eziyaziyo intlupheko yabantu bethu...

*English:*

... and not make the necessary interventions in the economy that can provide the necessary protection that our people need in the labour market.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 49

*IsiXhosa:*

Siyayixhasa le nto sisithi yinyuseni.

*English:*

The issue of technical amendments and corrections...

*IsiXhosa:*

... ihamba nokubhideka kwe-ANC kwaye yiyo kanye le nto eza kubangela ukuba siliphathe eli lizwe siyi-UDM. Phatha UDM, phatha! Amandla!

Ms S R VAN SCHALKWYK: Hon Deputy Speaker, off course the DA re-emphasised today that they are indeed strongly against the National Minimum Wage and is satisfied with workers earning low and slave wages. Hon Bagraim is misleading the House and our people out there to say that there is enormous amount involved in this technical amendment. Indeed it is only the cost of the advertising that is involved and nothing else.

Please note that this was a technical error which arose at the final stage and not incompetency, hon Moteka. You were part of the process. So, man up and also take the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 50

blame. There was no rush involved and the matter was discussed for more than three years at National Economic Development and Labour Council, Nedlac before being sent to Parliament. I do not see the rush hon members.

*Afrikaans:*

As ons haastig was om dit te implementeer, so what [wat daarvan], want ons het die nodigheid gesien om ons mense in die kwesbare sektore se lewens met haas te verander.

*English:*

One of the key agreements reached with business at Nedlac was that no worker should have their wages or benefits suppressed or reduced by employers in anticipation of the National Minimum Wage. This was to protect more than six million vulnerable workers from abuse of employers. The date set for this protection was 1 May 2017. Protection of workers was incorrectly cross referenced in the final Bill as amended by Parliament. It means that workers now no longer have the key protection backdated to 1 May 2017. That is why it is important for the ANC to push this amendment through as soon as possible.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 51

*Afrikaans:*

Ons weet dat daar in realiteit werkgewers is wat hul werkers in kwesbare sektore soos huiswerkers en tuinwerkers, asook plaaswerkers waardeer en hulle meer as die voorgestelde minimumloon betaal, en dat hulle nie die lone sal verlaag nie. Ons bedank hulle daarvoor, maar ons weet ook dat die teendeel ook waar is, dat daar baie werkgewers is wat geweet het dat die nasionale minimumloon R20 per uur sal wees en hulle alreeds voor die implementering daarvan die lone van die werkers verlaag het. Hulle het diegene wat hulle nuut aangestel het, ver onder die nasionale minimumloon aangestel.

So, dit is waarom dit belangrik is dat ons hierdie wysiging moet deurvoer, sodat ons seker kan maak dat mense beskerm word in die proses. Ons verwerp dit ten sterkste dat daar werkgewers was wat onwettig en oneties opgetree het deur hulle werkers te benadeel in die verband.

Met die Wysigingswetgewing wat ons dus vandag wil instel, wil ons seker maak dat werkers beskerming, terugwerkend

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 52

vanaf 1 Mei 2017 moet kry en dat skuldige werkgewers aan die pen gery moet word vir hulle verkeerde daede.

*English:*

To date thousands of cases have now been lodged at the Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration, CCMA, by workers whose employees are refusing to abide by the National Minimum Wage Act and that is a great point of concern. As the caring ANC-led government we do not want hundreds of thousands of vulnerable workers losing out on benefits that they were originally entitled to.

*Afrikaans:*

Agb Adjunkspeaker, as die ANC, wys ons dus weereens dat ons voortdurend ernstig is om die lewens van ons mense wat geaffekteer is deur armoede, lae inkomstes, ongelykhede en baie ander sosiale uitdagings te verbeter, omdat ons weet dat baie hiervan geërf is van die apartheidsregering.

Ons maan dus ons gemeenskappe, getroue ondersteuners en lede van die ANC aan om hulle nie te laat mislei deur *fong kong* [bedrieglike] politieke partye nie en dat hulle

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 53**

weereens hulle mandaat aan die ANC moet hernu deur wel ANC te stem op 8 Mei. Ons weet dat die ANC die enigste party is wat werklik omgee vir die mense op grondvlak. Ek dank u.

The DUPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, the motion is that permission be given to the Portfolio Committee on Labour to proceed with the legislative proposal.

Question Put.

Motion agreed to - Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting.

Permission accordingly given to the Portfolio Committee on Labour to proceed with the legislative proposal.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE  
ON CARBON TAX BILL**

Ms T V TOBIAS: Hon Deputy Speaker and hon members, good afternoon. The Carbon Tax Bill debate takes place a week after the President Ramaphosa stood at this podium to address us by giving us exactly what the ANC-led

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 54**

government was able to do, based on the promises he made at this podium last year. We thank the President for being able to report back to the nation about the achievables that the ANC government promised last year. Therefore the ANC government is a government hard at work. And this also happens a day before the Minister of Finance will present to us the Budget.

As you discuss this Bill in this fiscal year, this Bill will provide us with the opportunity to explain why we legislate for Green-House gas emissions both in an environmental and fiscal context. One can never have adequate time to elaborate on the impact of climate change on our world and the need to reduce Green-House gas emissions and taking queue from our President, who is action-orientated.

South Africa is implementing Cop 15 commitments we made to reduce our carbon footprint by 34%, siyenza manje [we are doing it now].

Hon members, just to give a background and context from a fiscal perspective, this Bill introduces the Polluter Pay

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 55**

Principle. I think this House agrees in principle that the time has arrived that people who pollute our environment must face consequences of their actions.

The process is not a punitive process but a process to teach people to take action through taxation to the benefit of the fiscus and the poor; and therefore, it is imperative for this House to understand that the Carbon tax Bill will be complimented by a package of tax incentives and revenue measures that will minimise impact in the first phase up to 2022.

The design of the Carbon tax also provides significant tax-free emission allowances emerging from 60% for the 1st phase. The Bill will also measure the calorific value for our coal, determine Carbon Tax Payable and determine allowances and threshold

This Bill will also ensure alignment to our Carbon Budget System; the practical and operational consideration will be made to ensure effective alignment.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 56**

The committee should also raise the upfront that the DA had reservations to the Bill, how interesting. Their reservations wanted to take into consideration economic development hon Chief Whip, at the expense of our climate, how hypocritical. They also wanted government to reinforce the tax collected whereas we have a central revenue financing system that allocates tax collected to all government programmes, but in this case they only wanted business to benefit through this reinforcing, how interesting.

The National Treasury will also work in conjunction with the Department of Environmental Affairs to implement and administrate the carbon tax and in terms of the Money Bills and Related Matters Act, it is required that an amendment should be effected to ensure a balance between revenue, expenditure and borrowing, therefore all revenue collected should be subjected to this law.

Hon members, least we forget our experience with the recent drought experienced right here in the Western Cape; climate change is really rising, rising water levels is real, therefore, it is important to nurture our

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 57**

environment and South Africa as a signatory to Cop 15 in Copenhagen is committed to establishing an environmentally friendly trade environment.

However, South Africa will not sacrifice job creation by introducing laws that are detrimental to the South African labour force; therefore, we have taken into consideration the issue of job preservation by ensuring that as we fulfil our international obligations, we do so within a South African friendly framework.

Therefore, by introducing tax incentives to companies that report 60% reduction is part of this principle, also by applying the tax system through a phase in approach is to minimise South African companies against trade exposure to unfair and uncompetitive behaviour against other companies worldwide. We therefore have threshold determined not international benchmarking system but on our very own determined standards.

Therefore hon members, hon Philly Mapulane will speak more in detail about the work done by the Department of Environmental Affairs through its research work to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 58**

determine the tax that we have put in place and he will further elaborate on the environmental issues.

The ANC-led government hon members is a caring government and will continue to do so by ensuring that health is protected and only South Africans can extend the mandate of the ANC to further pursue the strategic objective of building a non-racial, non-sexist and a prosperous society; and not a South Africa that represent a specific sector only.

The ANC on the 8th of May - as it has always got the support of the people - will express its gratitude as the people show their confidence in the ANC as they have always done. We don't take this expression for granted and promise to improve on our weaknesses.

As the President has demonstrated last week, we are not in the business of not implementing our promises, and we are therefore on target with our policies hence we are implementing this Carbon Tax Bill before 2022 hon Chief Whip, therefore I repeat, siyenza manje, vote ANC.

Amandla.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 59**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: hon Lees, I know it's your chance right now, please give me a short moment in the spirit of correcting our decisions as we go along. Earlier on the motion that permission be given to the Portfolio Committee on Labour to proceed with legislative proposals, we noted the objective of the EEF and I should have proceeded to say that it is therefore agreed too. Is that okay? The table staff correctly pointed it out. Thank you very much, this is now set. Mnu awukhulume nathi [Speak to us hon member].

Mr R A LEES: Ladies and gentlemen, and hon members, the South African economy is in crisis like we have not seen since the demise of Apartheid. There are 9,7 million South Africans who are unemployed in South Africa today, the majority of those 6,1 million South Africans are under the age of 34 years.

Unless there is a massive change in the way that the economy is managed, these 6,1 million young South Africans will never in their lifetimes find permanent employment and will remain a responsibility of the State instead of being a contributor to the economy and thus to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 60**

the creation of new jobs.

South Africa has been brought to its knees by many ANC failures such as rampant corruption, ANC cadre deployment of incapable people in key positions, despicable trade union influence in government and plain stupid ANC policies.

One of the biggest and most evil failures of the ANC government has been the calculated destruction of Eskom's ability to provide electricity for South Africa's economy. Eskom has systematically replaced highly skilled staff with ANC cadres who by and large are not capable of doing the job and many of whom have simply been looters on a grand scale.

Now taxpayers, through extortion, have to pay for this unprecedented scale of mismanagement and thievery. There can be no question that one of the key factors that has resulted in the low investment levels and thus low economic growth is the high tax regime in South Africa.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 61**

Over the past two years there have been some significant tax increases that have not resulted in any additional revenue, in fact revenue has decreased. These tax buoyancy levels have got worse and taxpayers are getting to the point, if not already there, where they simply don't see value in producing the additional earnings when so much of these hard earned earnings will be lost in the myriad number of direct and hidden taxes.

If we are to avoid further stagnation in economic growth in the South African economy, we simply cannot afford any further taxes. What South Africa needs is not extra taxes, instead we need a decrease in taxes in order to stimulate the economy and create the jobs. Thank you Chairperson.

Ms Y N YAKO: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. There are many things that we are getting wrong as a government. There are many things that we are getting wrong as this country, and one of those things is to negate or to degenerate the seriousness of climate change. It is our responsibility to secure the future, not only for our citizens but also for the future of this country.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 62**

The EFF welcomes the introduction of the Carbon Tax Bill. The greatest challenge facing humanity today is the injudicious use of finite fossil fuels for development, leaving behind immeasurable damage to our environment and causing irreparable harm to the ozone layer, exposing all of us to an inevitable, slow and painful demise. This foolish mass suicide, sold as development, must be arrested if we are to survive as humanity.

At the moment, science tells us that if we fail to arrest and reverse global warming in the next 12 years, our planet will face a climate apocalypse never faced before, affecting at least 15% of sub-Saharan Africa, leading to a near collapse of the agricultural system, to new diseases and the inevitable death of millions of people.

We are also told that the rate of temperature rise in Southern Africa is twice the global rate. Therefore, we need a supernatural commitment to cut our carbon emission ... finite fuels if we are to have a chance of survival as a species. We need to rethink our way of viewing development. We need to move away from burning fossil fuels for our energy needs. For this reason we do need a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 63**

legislative mechanism to impose stiffer taxes on those who continue to emit large quantities of carbon dioxide into the atmosphere.

To have a reasonable prospect of escaping the impact of climate change, we need to restrict global warming to 1,5°C. We need to cut carbon dioxide emissions by at least 45% by 2030. This must be coupled with the introduction of a legislative measure to force companies to embark on ecologically sustainable developmental initiatives.

The dependence on coal for our energy needs, despite known dangers, is the most tragic of our current development growth and path. There is no reason why we do not have a properly developed renewable energy sector in South Africa. It is possible to make the transition from a fossil fuel-based economy to a renewable energy-based economy within a decade if we have the political will to do so.

We would have liked this Bill to have placed legislative obligations on companies to proactively partake in the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 64**

creation of an ecologically sustainable society. This they can do by leading a massive programme of tree planting around areas where they operate.

As much as we support the Bill, we do not have as much confidence in the ability of the ANC to monitor its implementation. We do not have confidence that the ANC will not take bribes from the biggest emitters of greenhouse gases, thereby rendering this whole exercise futile.

However, in principle and for the sake of a common future, we do support this Bill. [Applause.]

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon Deputy Speaker, it is widely accepted that the Paris climate Agreement, signed in 2015, sets the stage for worldwide climate change adaptation and mitigation strategies to be implemented by participating state parties in post-2020 climate change governance through their preconference intended nationally determined contributions, NDCs.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 65**

The Carbon Tax Bill before us today, which gives effect to the polluter pays principle, is draft legislation aimed not only at mitigating greenhouse gas emissions but, more importantly, in ensuring that South Africa as a party to the Paris Agreement meets its NDCs.

Carbon tax, a Treasury initiative, which once implemented, will be an addition to corporate tax and will apply to entities that exceed the threshold of carbon emissions for a particular activity. As such, one of the drawbacks of this tax is not only financial in an already struggling economy, but also an additional administrative burden on both companies and an already ineffective SA Revenue Service, Sars.

Now, if we take a closer look at South Africa's Paris NDCs, we find it to be prima facie contradictory in that it is nothing more than a summary for policy makers of national policy, and that it is internally contradictory in that, amongst others, it claims that South Africa's government is nearing completion of two emission efficient power stations in Medupi and Kusile. Now, correct me if I'm wrong, but experts are saying that if

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 66**

these two power stations are online by 2025 we will be lucky.

Secondly, the idea that these power emissions are emission efficient is only in comparison to the currently very inefficient – if they are actually working at all – coal-powered Eskom power stations, which emit about 30 million tons of carbon emissions each year.

Yet, in the NDCs South Africa talks about decarbonising the electricity centres in South Africa by 2050. The question then to government becomes, how do you intend to decarbonise one of the biggest greenhouse gas emission electricity supply emitters in South Africa by 2050 when each of the mentioned power plants have a life span of over 75 years, which effectively means that these power supply stations will arguably be emitting gases up until the year 2100 before they are decommissioned?

The Carbon Tax Bill that is before us is a bouquet of national mitigation policies which were last updated in 2020, which essentially means that they are out of date.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 67**

There are many well-founded criticisms about the basing of current legislation on out of date policy.

So how will this Bill effectively mitigate carbon emissions when the biggest polluters such as Eskom, a government entity ... Questionably, will it be effective?

So, whilst the IFP supports this Bill, we are extremely concerned that the information, which informs that South Africa's greenhouse gas emissions targets are met, is incorrect. There must be an immediate audit and policy update; otherwise this legislation may prove itself to be ineffective. I thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The NFP notes the Carbon Tax Bill tabled here today. In Parliament on 20 November 2018, the Minister of Finance made a statement that climate change poses the greatest threat to mankind.

However, let me start off by saying that while the Minister said that, for many years the NFP in this very House – and I'm glad that the Minister of Health is here

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 68**

and he's going to listen to this – has been complaining about emissions in the Merewent, Wentworth, Jacobs, Bluff and Lamontville areas, with very high levels of cancer, tuberculosis and lung infections. Yet, nothing has happened.

Now, for me that is contradictory. On the one hand we say it's going to have an effect on humankind or mankind; on the other it is continuously being done in South Africa in front of our eyes, and we do very little or nothing.

Added to that is the fact that the University of KwaZulu-Natal did some research about a decade ago and to date nothing has been released. However, the communities surrounding these refineries – Engen, Mondi and Sapref – are affected and very little of nothing ...

Now, what we find here is that the emphasis seems to be on tax, on money, on revenue, rather than on the reduction of carbon emissions. As the NFP, we believe that more emphasis should be put on reducing these emissions rather than ... And there is clearly no indication or guarantee that by increasing or putting in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 69**

these taxes you are going to reduce those emissions. Remember, all that is going to happen is that these big industries are going to pass on that cost to those who are economically disadvantaged. In our view as the NFP, the entire process did not give enough opportunity for the economically disadvantaged to participate in this process.

In 2015 we were ranked 18 on the list of the worst greenhouse gas emitters in the world. Do we know why this process was delayed for over eight years? Is ... because big industry, like these refineries, was actually funding. They funded a process to actually deny that in fact this has an effect on climate change.

So, what we are saying is that even with the tax that you are putting, together with the incentives and allowances that you are going to give, it clearly means that there's going to be very little or no tax. So, it's not really going to serve the purpose.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 70**

As the NFP, we cannot support this. We believe ... put the interest and the lives of the people ... more than the money that you're talking ... [Inaudible.]

Mr W M MADISHA: Hon Deputy Speaker, Cope agrees that climate change currently poses the greatest threat facing humankind. Worryingly, by all accounts South Africa will warm at twice the global average. Already the effects of climate change are to be felt here at home.

We agree that South Africa must play its role in global efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. In this regard, we note that we have, in terms of the Paris Agreement on climate change, undertaken to reduce our greenhouse gas emissions by close to half within the next six years. This is an onerous commitment and as Cope we question whether the commitment made will be realised given the provisions of this Bill in its final form.

Greenhouse gas emissions and the resultant global warming harm the world and South Africa socially and environmentally. The impact and consequences of global

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 71**

warming are more pronounced on the poor and vulnerable than on the rich and resourced.

Carbon taxation is essentially a fiscal tool that puts a price on greenhouse emissions made through the production of goods and services. The tax, its rates, rebates and exemptions aim to change behaviour and reduce emissions. The conundrum we face as a nation is the need to meet our reduction in emissions commitment in times when we need to create conditions conducive to meaningful economic growth and job creation; and this, following a decade of econocide, unfortunately induced by the governing party.

This is not an ideal situation and requires a fine balance; a trade-off between the need for growth and environmental sustainability. Time will tell whether the proposed phased-in-kids-glove approach is the right posture to adopt.

Apart from this, Cope would have liked to have seen the ring-fencing of carbon tax revenue for use or investment in greener energy production technologies and industries

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 72**

that will reduce greenhouse emissions and improve energy supply. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

Mr M P MAPULANE: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon members of the House, fellow South Africans. As I ascend this podium, I am tempted to ask a question as to what is the exact position of the DA on this matter. The DA in the Portfolio Committee of Environmental Affairs, fully support the introduction of the Carbon Tax Bill, as one of the instruments that will help us to mitigate the effects of climate change. The DA on Standing Committee on Finance does not support this Bill. Can real the DA please stand up?... [Interjection].

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, the hon member asked a question, I am more than happy to provide the answer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, that is rhetorical, thank you, sit hon member.

Mr M P MAPULANE: ... Hon Deputy Speaker, on the 08th of October last year, the United Nation's Intergovernmental

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 73**

Panel on Climate Change, which is a pre-eminent scientific world body tasked with assessing the impacts, risks and possible response options to climate change, produced a special report on Global Warming of 1.5°C. The special report, which was written by 91 scientists and review editors from over 40 countries, makes a compelling argument for world leaders and governments to rapidly introduce far reaching measures to mitigate and limit the impacts of climate change.

The special report makes a critical finding that global emissions of carbon dioxide, CO<sub>2</sub> would need to fall by 45 percent from 2010 levels by 2030, reaching 'net zero' around 2050 in order to attain the targets set by the Paris Agreement.

These and many other reports of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, IPCC provides irrefutable scientific data that confirms that emissions of carbon dioxide and other greenhouse gases are changing the earth's climate, potentially imposing a significant global cost that will fall disproportionately on the poorest of the poor.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 74**

Rising temperatures, erratic rainfall and extreme weather events are likely to take a heavy toll on South Africa, with growing losses on human and financial resources, particularly from droughts and flooding. It is against this background that industries and households will have to reduce their negative impact on the environment, by implementing far reaching changes to the way people live and work, with carbon tax playing a decisive role in creating the necessary behavioural change as well as changes in industrial processes towards a low carbon, and ultimately a zero carbon economy.

Hon members, climate change is not a hoax, a figment in someone's imagination, neither is it a scare crow invented by scientists. Climate change is a reality that requires all countries of the world, especially the biggest polluting ones like us, to make sacrifices and take concrete practical climate actions to transform to a low carbon economy.

The National Climate Change Response Policy White Paper of 2011 expresses our country's policy and political commitment to dealing with climate change. It proposes a

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 75**

variety of plans and initiatives to mitigate South Africa's vulnerability to the growing threats of climate change and measures to regulate the impact thereof.

The White Paper on climate change commits South Africa at the international level to reduce emissions relative to a business as usual scenario by 34 per cent by 2020 and 42 per cent by 2025, as our country's contribution to an international effort to limit global warming relative to pre industrial times to less than 2°C. Although this commitment is conditional on the provision of external financing, it has become increasingly clear that South Africa needs to implement certain domestic emissions reduction measures to safeguard its economy and enhance the wellbeing of its people from the ensuing threats of climate change.

The White Paper identifies the use of carbon tax as one of the key instruments in the context of the carbon budget approach, which entails specifying the desired emission reduction outcomes, DEROS for specific sectors consistent with the benchmark national greenhouse gas emissions range trajectory.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 76**

The release of the Carbon Tax Policy Paper in May 2013, was the culmination of a process that started in the mid 2000s, signalling the country's commitment to introduce instruments to mitigate the effects of climate change. In fact, carbon tax is highly favoured in designing climate change mitigation policies, as it is an easy to implement instrument with limited demands on administrative capacity.

Let me deal with the distinction between the concept of carbon tax and the carbon budget, because they often been confused to mean the same thing, although the two instruments have the same objective of reducing greenhouse gas emissions, they are however completely different.

A Carbon Tax Policy, as designed by the National Treasury, is intended to provide a price signal to producers and consumers of carbon intensive products and to create an incentive to invest in cleaner technology. The carbon tax is expected to come into operation in this year, 2019 at a headline rate of R120 per ton of CO<sub>2</sub> emission, R120/tCO<sub>2</sub>e.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 77**

Carbon tax is designed to reduce the output of greenhouse gases, particularly carbon dioxide, into the atmosphere with the goal of protecting the health or wellbeing of our people. By increasing the cost of greenhouse gas emissions, the Bill hopes to curb consumption, reduce the demand for fossil fuels and push more companies towards creating environmentally friendly alternative and/or renewable sources.

We believe that the proposed carbon tax is not too high to pose threat to growth, but that it is enough to provide motivation for major emitters to look for ways to reduce their greenhouse gas, GHG emissions. We have spent too much time talking; it is now time to act.

On the other hand a series of carbon budgets were designed by the Department of Environmental Affairs, envisaged providing a green house gas emissions allowance or what is called a cap, against which physical emissions arising from the operations of a company during a defined period will be tracked.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 78**

In the period to 2020, the carbon budgets will not be a compliance instrument, but rather will be used to increase understanding of the emissions profile of participating companies, and to establish monitoring, reporting and verification, MRV processes.

Accordingly, the first phase of carbon budgets in South Africa 2016-2020 is being implemented as a voluntary pilot in preparation for a second mandatory phase to commence in 2021. Phase one, as just started, does not include compliance measures. The decision to start with a voluntary phase was influenced by a lack of an appropriate legal instrument. Carbon budgets are allocated to a selection of individual entities in the form of a cumulative target level of GHG emissions that they are permitted to emit over a five year carbon budget period. Beyond 2020, they are expected to become compulsory, more so, when the Climate Change Bill currently underway in the Executive becomes a law or an Act of Parliament.

We must expeditiously transform to low carbon sources of energy to power our economy in order to remain

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 79**

internationally competitive, and therefore policy levers such as carbon tax, are crucial in facilitating greenhouse gas emissions reduction technology and innovation.

This is of uttermost importance, as our national economy is highly dependent on energy intensive production and use, considering that we are amongst the 30 largest emitters of greenhouse gases globally, which makes our economy extremely vulnerable due to large carbon footprints of our production commodities or goods, and also the long haul or distance to some of our main trading partners, especially those up north.

It is important to recognise that efforts made in climate mitigation and adaptation as opportunities for just a transition in South Africa. While a just transition can be applied to any number of sectors, the fundamental component revolves around change; a movement from the status quo to something better.

There are several settings for this transformation, but most are along the broad lines of shifting from

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 80**

environmentally and socially damaging practices to those of a cleaner, restorative economy, something that is entrenched as a fundamental bill of rights in our Constitution.

The discourse on just transition cannot mainly be confined to trade unions and non profit organisations and academic institutions, as inappropriately assumed by some among us. In fact, our Government is at the centre of the debate on the question of just transition as it deals with the overall health, wellbeing and welfare of our people, which everywhere is the prerogative of government regulation, we are doing so in this case by the presentation of the Carbon Tax Bill to this House which the ANC support and looks like all other parties will support it, excluding DA. Thank you.

Mr M P GALO: Deputy Speaker, the century-long Carbon Tax Bill aims at managing the inevitable climate change impact through interventions that build and sustain South Africa's social, economic and environmental resilience and emergency response capacity.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 81**

The Bill is being touted by the Kyoto Protocol signatory, in the mould of South Africa. South Africa has committed to reduce greenhouse emissions by about 5%, from 2008 to 2012. According to the Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Centre, South Africa is the 13th largest emitting country.

This Bill, regrettably, is unmindful of these realities, including our commitment to the Sustainable Development Agenda and the attainment of the Sustainable Development Goals. How far has the Bill gone in addressing the Paris Agreement to combat Climate Change? Have we allowed our unsound economic outlook to displace environmental justice?

Deputy Speaker, the Bill offers allowances to emitters up to 95%. According to the Bill, the carbon tax levied in respect of the sum of the greenhouse gas emissions will be R120, a ton of carbon dioxide equivalent. However, because of tax free allowances, it will result in an effective tax of R48 a ton. This is an affront to the global goal of limiting temperature increase to below 2

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 82**

degrees Celsius. It is an affront to the future generation who will inherit a degraded environment.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the silence by the Ministry of Environmental Affairs is also deafening. It has a critical role to champion climate conservation and sustainable development. The late Ms Molewa would have fought tooth and nail against this less punitive Bill.

In line with our commitment to global sustainable development, environmental justice and food security, we are reluctant to support this Bill. Thank you very much.

Ms G S A NGWENYA: Chair, the Carbon Tax Bill has been almost a decade in the making. It must be appreciated that a great deal of consultation has taken place, and the chair of the finance committee allowed comment from stakeholders right up to the day of voting on the Bill, which is unusual. The minority view is recorded in the report.

We cannot, however, support the Carbon Tax Bill. The hon member from the ANC suggested that he will like for the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 83

real DA to please stand up, unfortunately I am obliged to stand; otherwise I would have quite liked to demonstrate the real DA does not need to stand up, we can take you on, lying down. [Applause.]

Let's be clear about what it is we are in fact supporting today because the DA has long been a champion for the environment. Where we govern our climate change policies and environmental strategies provide models for the rest of the country to emulate. We care about a sustainable future. So what is it that we oppose? We stand in opposition to bad policy, which this Bill is, and which stands to undermine the good intentions upon which it is built.

An American 19th century judge opined that a government ill executed, whatever may be its theory, must, in practice, be a bad government. On one hand there remain serious doubts that introducing carbon tax is the appropriate approach, and on the other, for those who advocate for a carbon tax there are concerns that the tax is too low to be effectual.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 84**

It is a truism that when you attempt to appeal to both sides, you end up convincing neither. This Bill is exactly that - a policy nebbish. Many of us in these benches will know that the trouble with broach churches is that all are welcome; the search for consensus eventually obliterates truth. That's exactly what has happened with this Bill. Ten years of hand wringing discussion, well intentioned to appeal to all, has unfortunately borne a limp wristed policy.

What this amounts to is that this tax which is intended to reduce Greenhouse gas emissions may actually just be a load of policy hot air. Considering that the government will subsidise the initial implementation of the carbon tax, what the full effects of the Bill will be remain to be seen. Perhaps it is not the right time, or perhaps it is cowardice, but as usual, the tough questions and answers are too tough to deal with right now and are being kicked down the line.

While South Africa must move towards enhanced energy efficiency, it needs to do so in a manner that takes

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 85**

cognisance of the country's stage of economic development and our global contribution to Greenhouse gas emissions.

The first period, as expressed in the Bill, is a trial with a view in 2022 to adjusting rates and tax free thresholds; but the door to re-evaluate the carbon tax as a viable mechanism in South Africa's carbon reduction strategy should also remain open. With the Bill as it stands, if the trial fails, it is not clear that South Africa will be able to pivot quickly.

A carbon tax is not the only carbon pricing instrument available to achieve lower emissions. We cannot be so unimaginative as to assume that there is only one way to crack an egg. Ironically, we cannot be lectured to from the ANC about consequences. The DA in fact, is the party of consequences. Hon Tobias tells us about the polluter pays principle, I suggest her party learns first to master the corrector pays principle. [Applause.]

To suggest that those who oppose the carbon tax Bill are opposed to environmental progress and reform, is to flog a straw man. Not enough has been done to provide for an

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 86**

emissions-trading system in South Africa. The difference is that carbon taxes are explicit in creating a fixed price for carbon whereas emissions trading systems ensure that economy-wide emissions are kept below a certain emissions cap, and allow the market to set the appropriate price for carbon.

Furthermore, the economic impact of the carbon tax hinges heavily on the design of the tax and the manner in which Treasury utilises the revenues collected. There is concern that there is no guarantee that tax collected will be channelled back into the economy in a manner that mitigates deindustrialisation and invests in renewable technologies. It was suggested via numerous public submissions that revenue collected be ring fenced.

Carbon prices generate government revenue, which can be used to increase green spending, compensate adversely affected industries and communities or be redistributed to the public. Numerous studies reveal that the way in which carbon pricing revenues are spent plays an important role in determining whether a carbon pricing initiative will be successful. Studies show that

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 87**

ambitious carbon pricing is often correlated with high political trust and low levels of corruption. The recommendation is that if trust is low, revenue should thus be recycled using a transparent, trust-boosting strategy to enhance its acceptability. There is no doubt that in South Africa, political trust is low and that corruption levels are high.

This Bill does nothing to guarantee how carbon revenues will be spent, a key factor in the success of carbon pricing model globally. Not only that, but the Carbon Tax Bill does not include a flexible legislative framework as it does not allow for companies to achieve 100% tax free status.

In Switzerland, where carbon tax policies have been affected, revenues have been used to invest in green technologies and to direct transfers back to households and firms. I repeat; there are no such mechanisms or such provisions for this to be guaranteed in the current articulation of the Bill.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 88

So it is not clear whose interests in fact this Bill is intended to serve, except the appearance of doing something while doing nothing at all. It will not distinguish us, but it will place us amongst those who have tried this policy and failed, it places no safeguards to ensure increased investments in renewable technologies, nor does the framework incentivise companies to the fullest extent.

After 10 years, what is front of us today, is a policy that remains mediocre and one borne of experience. South Africans deserve better and this policy must be opposed with the contempt it deserves. [Applause.]

Ms N ABRAHAMS-NTANTISO: Deputy Speaker, I just want to start off with inputs by the opposition. I want to lower the excitement of hon Galo. The voters of the ANC now know better. In the past, they had mistaken the AIC for the ANC, so on 8 May, there will be no luck.

Hon member, you must know that the studies that culminated in this Bill were not only conducted by National Treasury, but the Department of Environmental

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 89

Affairs was also included. I will come back to the lady, hon Ngwenya. We cannot expect the hon member to see policy in the African National Congress when she said that the DA that she belongs to is not serious about policy. So, ...

*IsiXhosa:*

... xa kunje komanzi kuya bekela phi kowomileyo.

[Kwaqhwyatywa.]

*English:*

The ANC supports the Carbon Tax Bill and we do submit and admit that it took a lot of balancing between what business wants and what environment activists want, because most importantly, for the African National Congress, it is what the people - the majority of the downtrodden, the poor - really needs.

The World Climate Change summit, hosted in our country in 2011, noted that South Africa leads nonpetroleum countries in carbon emissions, 20 times higher than even the US.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 90

As hon Ngwenya said as well, the committee consulted widely on the Bill. The result was the change in implementation dates. As a committee, we were misunderstood and made it to the *Daily Maverick* for all the wrong reason. We have since set the record straight with the lady, Ms Garcin, and she understands that we do care about the environment.

Climate change is intricately linked to almost all facets of our society, particularly socioeconomic progression, as resources such as water, feedstock in the form of food, fibre, biodiversity, amongst others determine the production potential of many sectors of the economy, which in turn affects the human development aspirations of the country.

There is evidence that extreme weather events in South Africa are increasing, with heat wave conditions found to be more likely, dry spell durations lengthening slightly and rainfall intensity increasing. The associated impacts primarily have a bearing on economic and social aspects of our development.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 91

The South African economy is dependent on primary sectors such as agriculture, particularly mineral extractives which are naturally resource-dependent and energy-intensive, with the energy generation being very important, as it is also subject to climate variability and change.

The NDP's vision for the future, which includes access to affordable food; safe, affordable and reliable water and energy services, cannot be based on an economic model or assumptions of infinite availability of these and other resources.

*Afrikaans:*

Ons is teleurgesteld in die DA. Ons het geweet hulle gaan verskil. In die komitee het hulle soveel gehad om by te voeg. Ons het gehoop dat, soos die ANC, hulle by die arme mense sal staan, maar nee, soos altyd, stem en staan die DA met die ryk mense.

*English:*

The Carbon Tax Bill gives effect to the "polluter pays" principle, as hon Tobias and others indicated. The carbon

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 92

tax will assist, in a least-cost manner, in reducing GHG emissions and ensuring that South Africa will meet its NDC commitments as part of its ratification of the 2015 Paris Agreement. Thus, the carbon tax is an essential element of South Africa's commitment to the Paris Agreement, as part of a package of measures to mitigate climate change. It is not the only one, but part of what is being done. The carbon tax is intended as an instrument to help drive down emissions in a cost-effective and dynamic way over the medium to long term.

South Africa's triple challenge of unemployment, poverty and inequity must be considered.

*IsiXhosa:*

Besilindele ukuba ithi iDA xa ichasa lo Mthetho isondele ebantwini kula manqanaba. Kodwa ke bayazibonisa...

*English:*

... on the eve of general elections, that they have nothing to do with ordinary people but everything to do with big businesses. [Interjections.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 93**

In his response to the debate on the state of the nation address, President Ramaphosa emphasised the importance of dealing with climate change, to protect the poor and vulnerable in our society. The President confirmed the ANC's commitment to ensuring that South Africa leads in the fight against climate change.

There was support for the policy certainty provided on the carbon tax, both in the Second Draft Carbon Tax Bill, circulated for comments in December 2017 and in the Budget Speech of February 2018.

Some stakeholders noted that the carbon tax is a critical tool in South Africa's climate change toolbox, which is necessary to meet both international obligations and address local constitutional and developmental requirements. The draft Carbon Tax Bill was commended as a landmark piece of legislation to guide future efforts, as the carbon tax was viewed as a critical tool for pricing GHG emissions as a key element of the national mitigation strategy.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 94**

In addition, stakeholders argued that a lower level of economic growth does not obviate the need for a carbon tax to incentivise further reductions in overall greenhouse gas emissions.

Several stakeholders, including NGOs and academia, were concerned that the Bill does not adequately implement the polluter-pays principle or reflect the urgency of the risk posed. They stated the Bill will not sufficiently promote a meaningful reduction of GHG emissions and that this failure contradicts the constitutional right to an environment not harmful to one's health or well-being, and the duty to take reasonable measures to prevent environmental pollution.

The main aim of the carbon tax is to put a price on the environmental and economic damages caused by excessive emissions of greenhouse gases. A secondary aim is to change the behaviour of firms and consumers, by encouraging uptake of cost-effective, low-carbon alternatives. The fact that the current levels of emissions might be within the target range does not mean the carbon tax should be zero or negate the need for a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 95

carbon tax. Analysis has shown that GHG emissions are closely related to GDP growth and if we do not take precautionary action we will likely exceed the target range by as early as 2025.

*Afrikaans:*

Deurlopende, koppige weiering deur die rykes om terug te keer ten opsigte van gasvrystelling is een van die redes waarom die wetsontwerp vandag hier is.

*English:*

There was support for additional revenue recycling measures, such as the expansion of free basic electricity, funding for alternative energy sources, and the expansion of public transport. It was suggested that these measures should be included in the Bill. Several suggestions were made by stakeholders including: targeted revenue recycling for the benefit of rural agricultural areas where there are biomass-based renewable energy options which can assist both in GHG emission reduction and job creation, hon member of the DA, in poorer regions of the economy; revenue could be used to facilitate investments in co-processing of waste to give effect to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 96**

integrated waste management, circular economy as well as mitigating coal-based GHG emissions from cement; channelling revenues to support small and emerging businesses and climate change mitigation start-ups; and revenues should be earmarked to provide finance or loans for community-based renewable energy installation in low-income areas.

National Treasury notes the recommendation to remove the vehicle emissions tax with the introduction of the carbon tax. National Treasury will consider harmonising the taxes and reviewing the combined impact of carbon-related taxes, including the motor vehicle emissions tax and possibly phasing down or phasing out the tax.

However, this will only be considered during the second phase of the carbon tax, once the effective carbon tax rate is sufficiently high, so as to fully account for external costs of carbon emissions. It is misleading to talk about double taxation, given the low-effective carbon tax rate during the first phase.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 97**

The reduction of cost is not the only reason that offsets will be used. The availability of suitable projects and the positive impacts that can be achieved through alternative investments are also reasons that are not referred to. Any mechanism to reduce any GHG emissions, in the least-cost manner, should be allowable. Increased flexibility on a variety of fronts must be considered.

South Africa remains a dual economy with one of the highest Gini coefficients in the world, perpetuating both inequality and exclusion. Poverty and inequality, both exacerbated by unemployment, are South Africa's most significant challenges. Lack of access to natural resources, a two-tiered educational system, a dual health system, discriminatory spatial planning, and other socioeconomic dimensions are some of the aspects that demonstrate inequality in our society. Undoing both inequality and poverty remains the major preoccupation of the ANC in the democratic South Africa.

In conclusion, ...

*IsiXhosa:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 98

USEKELA SOMLOMO: Hayi likuphelele ixesha ngoku.  
Ndiyaxolisa kakhulu.

*English:*

Ms N ABRAHAMS-NTANTISO: Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Deputy Speaker, hon Ngwenya is asking what if we lose. Now, the question we are posing as the ANC, how can we win if we do not play? Our poster is that you can only win if you play. We just want to say to hon Ngwenya, victories are not direct results of mere paralyses of ideation. It's post ideation action during action adjustment and then victories.

So, our posture as the ANC, we know in order to win, we must play. Hon members, as mentioned by our President, I quote: "Unless we tackle climate change, we will not be able to meet our developmental objectives". Climate change poses the greatest threat facing humankind and South Africa intends to play its role as part of the global effort to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and enable us to meet our commitments as agreed in Paris Agreement.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 99**

Under the late Minister Edna Molewa, we submitted our Nationally Determined Contributions commitments under the Paris Agreement which requires our emissions to peak from 2020 to 2025, plateau from 2025 to 2035 and decline from 2036 onwards because we know that only if we play, we can win. The Nationally Determined Contribution, NDC, notes the carbon tax as an integral part of the package of policy measures to help us reduce emissions and meet our commitments.

Deputy Speaker, the carbon tax aims to ensure that costs of damages caused by the emissions of greenhouse gases, like carbon dioxide and methane are included in the price of high carbon emitting goods and services.

The Carbon Tax Bill gives effect to the polluter pays principle and helps to ensure that both firms and consumers take these costs into account in their future production, consumption and investment decisions.

The tax will help to promote the uptake of alternative low carbon fuels, renewable and energy efficiency measures by both producers and consumers.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 100**

The introduction of carbon tax is an important first step to help encourage our transition to a low carbon climate resilient economy and create opportunities for new innovative industries and business models. Investment in renewable, green technologies and the growth of some sectors will benefit from this intervention and make us more competitive in the meeting of our future climate change challenges.

If we do not take action now to start to reduce emissions, the overall costs to our economy of reducing emissions are likely to increase significantly in future. As we speak, climate change is damaging humanity. We can only tackle it if we do something about it, not if we ask what happens if we lose.

The Carbon Tax Bill is the culmination of an extensive stakeholder consultation process over the past nine years.

Following the consultation, substantial changes were made to the policy to take into account stakeholder comments and additional technical changes were made to the Bill

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 101**

during the consultation of the Standing Committee on Finance.

To conclude, I just want to restate, as the ANC, the question we are posing - how can we win if we do not play? We have opted to play because the only victory comes from action. The only adjustment comes from experience in activity. The only way we can win is when we play. That's why we are supporting the Bill for implementation so that we can deal with climate change.

I would like to emphasise that climate change is a reality and we will have to prepare to operate in carbon constrained economy over the medium to long term.

Operating on business as usual basis is no longer an option. We must therefore take urgent and appropriate action to curb our emissions to help transition our economy into a low carbon growth path.

The carbon tax is a part of broader package of mitigation policy measures under National Climate Change Response

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 102

Policy to help achieve our Nationally Determined Contribution to target in a cost effective manner.

We dare again emphasise, the reason other parties even lie about their statistics of employment creation growth is because they are always caught in ideation, what happens if we lose. They forget that they have never acted, they have always been asking. That's misleading the country about the statistics of Western Cape because they are caught in the gallery of what happens if we lose. Now, we are answering questions. We know we will win if we act. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I will request the Table here to read and give this debate we have just had its proper order. Please do so, read the Fourth Order.

Hon members, I am going back ... [Interjections.]

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, please let me correct what happened procedurally. I would like us to do exactly

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 103

that that I have noticed, we are self-correcting now.

Okay.

Hon members, we have just had the debate being concluded and I want to know whether there are any objections to the Bill being read the first time?

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, you didn't put the question for the report.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will do so.

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, but that comes before the Bill, generally.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes generally, you are right ...

[Interjections.]

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, so then you got to put the report and then the Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am pointing out to you that we have notice that and we are correcting that, hon member. You

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 104

can't let me ask you to start afresh when it is very easy to do it quickly now. Are there any objections to the Bill being read the first time?

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Bill be read a first time.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That's fine, your Whips are looking at you and they will indicate otherwise. We are closed.

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a first time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Chief Whip, hon members, as I said earlier on, we are re-ordering. This is where we should

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 105**

have completed. We went straight to the debate instead of completing the first part, which I will ask the secretary to read the Third Order.

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

**CARBON TAX BILL**

(Second Reading debate)

There was no debate.

Bill read a second time (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

**TRANSFORMING THE ECONOMY TO SERVE THE PEOPLE**

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 106**

(Subject for Discussion)

Mr M D MAHLOBO: Hon Deputy Speaker, Ministers, and Deputy Ministers, hon members, comrades and friends, fellow South Africans, last week on 11 February 2019 we, as a nation, took a pause and reflected on how far we have come since our icon and the father of our democracy, Nelson Mandela was released from prison after 27 years. In his address on 3 February 2005 in London during a campaign on making poverty history, Madiba said:

Massive poverty and obscene inequality are such terrible scourges of our times - times in which the world boasts breathtaking advances in science, technology, industry and wealth accumulation - that they have to rank alongside slavery and apartheid as social evils.

We remain on course in our journey of building a truly united, nonracial, nonsexist, democratic and prosperous society. A lot has been achieved over the last 25 years and South Africa today is much better than it was before 1994. However, as the ANC, we are the first to admit that

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 107**

more still needs to be done. In 1994, the democratic government inherited an economy in a deep structural crisis, trapped in a low-growth equilibrium, economic exclusion, and underdevelopment. The structured exclusion of black people from economic power began in the late 1800s with the first dispossession of land.

Apartheid systematically and purposefully restricted the majority of South Africans from meaningful participation in the economy. The assets of millions of our people were directly and indirectly destroyed and access to skills and to self-employment was racially restricted. The result is an economic structure that today, in essence, still excludes the vast majority of South Africans. South Africans were systematically deprived of viable business opportunities in the following ways:

Firstly, by confining the majority of African people to homelands;

Secondly, by racially segregating and enforcing the Group Areas Act;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 108**

Thirdly, by the curtailment of property ownership rights of black people and making it impossible for them to acquire assets that could serve as collateral for loan financing and it also excluded black persons from the long-run process of capital accrual and growth;

Fourthly, the job reservation policy was reinforced through a vastly inferior education system and this had devastating effects on skills and the positions that the majority of workers obtained in the labour market.

Only a small minority gained access to higher education. Technological and professional careers were made less attainable by chronic inadequacies in the teaching of Mathematics and Sciences in black schools. Millions of adult South Africans had been particularly poorly equipped for a modernised industrial and commercial economy.

It is crucial to understand the magnitude of what took place in our past in order to understand why we need to act together as a nation to bring about an economic transformation in the interest of all.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 109

*IsiZulu:*

Kunabanye kuleNdlu Yesishayamthetho abangafuni ukuthi-ke kwaziwe ukuthi kwenzekani, bayaphikisana nemithetho yokuthi-ke umnotho waleli lizwe leli uguquke ukuze bakwazi ukuthi idlanzana liqhubeke liqhoqhobele umnotho wethu.

Mnu M HLENGWA: Obani lapho?

*English:*

Mr M D MAHLOBO: South Africa's new Constitution enshrined the right of all South Africans to equality and it was to put specific measures in place. The ANC had to introduce laws like the Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act, the Employment Equity Act, the Preferential Procurement Policy Framework Act, the Broad-Based Economic Empowerment Act others. Our country needs an economy that will meet the needs of all our people in a sustainable manner. This will only be possible if our economy is built on the full potential of all persons.

In the period since 1994, we have seen the economy undergoing profound restructuring. In the first decade of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 110**

our democracy, our economy was growing well. There was a macroeconomic stabilisation that we achieved. The economy has also been integrated into the global economy. Despite the economic successes and a plethora of state policy, strategy, programmes, interventions and overcoming economic disparities, entrenched inequalities continue.

Vast racial and gender inequalities in the distribution of and access to wealth, income, skills and employment persist. As a consequence, our economy continues to perform below its potential. The doomsayers are saying that the ANC has done less but if you look at the independent report of the SA Institute for Race Relations; it says that over the last two decades; the ANC has done well and the standards of our people have improved. [Applause.] It says:

There is a lot to be proud of and in no way is it true to say that South Africa is no better than it was in 1994, or that South Africans have refused to work together to bring about change. This is a substantively better society to live in than it was in 1994. We think that, as a result of that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 111

progress, social and other relations remain predominantly sound.

That is what the report is saying. The report further says:

More credit must go to the entrepreneurs, investors, employers, and employees, whose hard work and risk-taking generated the tax revenue that funded the free and subsidised houses and services, and social welfare. Too often, these entrepreneurs and the middle classes are hounded as uncaring and selfish elite who have done nothing to bring about a better future. They have done a great deal and deserve great credit.

That is how the report closes. It is therefore important to acknowledge that President Ramaphosa, by engaging with a number of South Africans through the presidential summits and other fora, is proving that any ANC leader and cadre must breathe the same breath as our people, share the same future and stay truly connected to them. In part, this is our effort to draw wisdom and potential

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 112**

from all citizens whilst striving with endless energy towards our goal of building a nation. His approach has left many of our detractors dazzled and hopeless, thus resorting to lies and vitriol as witnessed during the state of the nation address.

We have made strides in respect of the economy since 1994. Inflation dropped from 9% in 1994 to 5,3% in 2017. The number of people that are employed by this economy has increased from 4,9 million to over 16 million. If you look at the latest Labour Force Survey report, you will know that, in the fourth quarter, our results have demonstrated an increase where more than 16,5 million people are in employment. But if you look at the performance of our provinces, Gauteng is leading followed by the Free State and the Western Cape. We also note that the Commission on Employment Equity indicates that the ANC has done well but there are those other people who do not believe in employment equity and affirmative action. The public procurement as purchasing power in our hands is being used to be able to push the participation of our people in the economy. We are also dealing with the question of monopolies. The Competition Act has just been

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 113**

amended by the President so that we can be in a position to able to deal with monopolies but at the very same time give the power to the commission to have teeth and curb those violations.

South Africa's economy has been performing at an average rate of about less than a percent currently but it remains the second largest in the continent. If you look at the other sectors of the economy, manufacturing production has increased by 1,2% in 2018 as compared with 2017 and manufacturing has assisted us to be able to get out of technical recession, and we need to do more especially around the issues of manufacturing because it contributes 25% of the manufacturing activity. The investment in mining and the indaba that was held here, mining is on the rise again and we are looking forward to 2019 with all the commitments that have been made. When you look at international tourism, tourism expenditure has grown and was recorded at the end of 2017 to be above R277 billion of which constitute 56% domestic and 44% international visitors. The revision of tourism visa regime and the plans to roll-out the e-Visa system will enhance the potential of attending to issues of tourism

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 114**

and increase the growth potential. And government spending continues in this fashion. For every R100 you have, there is R18 that government is spending. In 2016-17, we have about R1,58 trillion that the government has contributed. [Time expired.] When we come back later on, we will indicate the plans of the ANC to take the economy forward. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr D W MACPHERSON: House Chairperson, the topic chosen by the ANC today is done so in the hope that it will portray a party that has spent the last 25 years in government trying to break down the barriers to inclusion and broadening opportunities for the unemployed. However, we all know that this is not the case. The 9,4 million unemployed South Africans know that this is not the case. There has, however, been one government that over the last 10 years has worked tirelessly to build a capable state that creates an environment for job creation, investment facilitation and improves access to opportunity, no matter what the colour of your membership card is.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 115**

The Western Cape, by every measure, both independent and by government, shows how this province has focused on getting the basics right. And what do these statistics tell us about the Western Cape. It has the lowest unemployment rate of under 20%, a full 14 points below the national average on the expanded definition. It has created 508 000 new jobs since the start of this administration's first term. If every other province had followed the lead of the Western Cape, we would be close to the five million job opportunities the ANC promised the country by 2020. Employment in the Western Cape grew by 24% between 2009 and 2018, well ahead of Gauteng at 18,6% and KwaZulu-Natal at over 8%.

It now has the lowest rural unemployment rate at 15,7%, a decrease of 3,4% quarter on quarter despite the devastating drought. Think about that for a moment, colleagues, more than eight out of 10 people living in rural areas in the Western Cape have a job - that is truly incredible. [Applause.] These economic gains would not have been possible without a strategic unit called the Red Tape Reduction Unit. A R1 billion saving has been

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 116**

achieved across 27 red tape interventions where bureaucracy would have otherwise killed growth.

The DA is literally shredding red tape to allow more people to start businesses and create jobs, this is real transformation. You see hon members, where the DA is in government, we don't just talk about transforming the economy to serve our people, we actually do it. However, let's compare this with the ANC's record over the last 10 years. Since 2009, unemployment has increased every single year, currently at 37%. Manufacturing as a contribution to gross domestic product, GDP, has declined to 11,8% from 13,6%. Our national debt has ballooned to 55,8% of GDP from 31,3%. We have spent R162 billion bailing out zombie state-owned entities, SOE's, since 2008. Eskom produces 6383Mw less than it did 10 years ago, meaning that we can't keep the lights on which costs our economy R2 billion a day.

Hon members, this dismal performance at the expense of the unemployed is because the ANC solely focuses on transforming the economy to serve their masters in exchange for braai packs and bottles of whiskey. To quote

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 117**

former ANC Member of Parliament, Dr Zukile Luyenge in his resignation last week, I quote:

The ANC has shown signs of decline, where the interests of the elite are protected and no longer speak to the needs of the people.

On every measure, it is clear to see that only the DA is truly serving the people of South Africa by creating jobs, improving living standards and broadening opportunity. I thank you. [Applause.]

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: Hon House Chair, in South Africa today we are facing an economic crisis. Our people do not have access to land or the means of production, but at the same time there are no jobs. What this essentially means is that for millions of South Africans there is no way to survive besides dependence on the government social grant. For the last 25 years, the ANC government has done nothing to achieve the economic liberation of black South Africans from centuries of white oppression and exploitation. The latest Quarterly Labour Force Survey shows that South Africa's expanded unemployment

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 118**

rate is 37%, with over 9,7 million South Africans who are unemployed. Amongst women and youth the unemployment rates are even higher with more women being unemployed than employed, at 41,2% unemployed and 37,6% employed.

When it comes to the youth 67,7%, the young people between the ages of 15 and 24, who are part of the labour force are unemployed, and between the ages of 25 and 34, 42,8% are unemployed. The reasons why we have such high levels of unemployment are because for a quarter of a century the ANC government has fully embraced neo-liberal economics. This has resulted in deregulation, the opening up of South Africa's markets, the growth of the financial sector, and the collapse of South Africa's industrial capacity.

Since 1994, the manufacturing sector in South Africa has continued to decline, while the nonproductive sectors of the economy such as the financial sector, the service sector and consumption continue to expand. It is why we have economic growth without job creation, and why we continue to remain subject to neo-colonial trade relations. For a quarter of a century, the ANC has

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 119**

maintained the status quo and has mismanaged the economy. The ruling party has failed to build new cities, develop industries, and use special economic zones effectively. Instead, its members have focused on self-enrichment and greed.

It is because of this South Africa remains an exporter of raw and semiprocessed materials, and an importer and consumer of finished products. South Africa's top export to China is mineral resources, and our top import from China is machinery. Our top export to the United States is precious minerals, and our top import is machinery. The very minerals which the people of South Africa extract and sell are being sold back to them as finished products 10 times their original cost. If we continue along this path our country will stay in a perpetual state of underdevelopment, and our people will continue to live in misery. For government to begin the process of transforming the economy, it must start by taking control of the means of production, and developing the forces of production.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 120**

The EFF manifesto is a concrete, implementable program of action as to how this can be achieved, and how new jobs can be created. Following the nationalisation of land, mines, and other strategic sectors of the economy ...

Thank you. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon House Chairperson, in 1994 South Africans stepped into a new dispensation filled with hopes, dreams and aspirations for economic justice. We all hoped for better days to come, where we all rise into a daybreak that's wondrously clear, leaving behind the nights of terror and fear but what we thought was a light at the end of the tunnel - with each year that passed - we realised it was an oncoming train as the ANC continue to fail.

The true measure of the economic development of a country is the standard of living of the majority of its people. Tomorrow the Budget speech will come at a time of heightened anxiety about South Africa's economy. The numbers simply do not look good. Low economic growth projections, high unemployment, particularly amongst the youth, escalating inequality and steady climb of debt to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 121**

GDP with National Treasury worryingly forecasting this could reach 60% by 2023-24 surely to trigger International Monetary Fund, IMF, and World Bank interventions.

The resultant consequence has been the regressive increase in debt servicing costs which now stand at R180 billion annually. From President Ramaphosa's state of the nation address it was very clear that government, buoyed by election fever, was over promising with high level plans whilst anchored in low level efficiency. The reality in this country is that the economy simple does not serve the majority of the people. And the upcoming budget tomorrow will be a moment of sobriety in comparison to the utopic honeymoon promises of state of the nation address 2019 - and of course it's what this debate called by the hon Mahlobo seeks to do. And this is precisely why we need to move away from the misguided rhetoric of the governing party and present a pragmatic economic agenda of plans and solutions. We need to move deliberately in the direction of growth, development and sustainability. This government needs to put the people ahead of politics in order to serve all the people. The

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 122**

key to unlocking major economic setbacks lies with the powers that be - i.e. the failing ANC at this point in time.

To now to get an economy that serves all South Africans the forefront the following are important: Education to produce the technical and innovative skills, knowledge and expertise required by the new inclusive economy and jobs market we desire; local economic development wherein new local economic niches are prioritised and beneficiated to maximise potential yield - this requires a new focus of building up local government capabilities on key areas of water, road, energy and human settlement infrastructure planning. We must bite the bullet and decisively deal with Eskom and all the other failing SOEs.

Therefore, hon Mahlobo, we are obliged by our conscious to point out in order to achieve our collective goal to transform our economy to build the South Africa where all South Africans enjoy dignity, opportunity and prosperity we need to be driven by the burning desire to eliminate historical inequalities and to do so in a bold,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 123**

unapologetic and responsible fashion. I thank you. [Time expired.]

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, hon members, thank you very much. The NFP believes that this is a critical topic, particularly this time when there are so many challenges facing the economy of the country and these impact negatively on the lives of our people. A debate of this nature therefore warrants that move from rhetoric sheer politicking and political gimmickry. There are so many issues that are facing the people of South Africa. The country has been leaping from one challenge to another.

Last year, we saw the increase of value-added tax, VAT, and petrol. The country plunged into a technical recession. Many people were retrenched. Others still remained out of employment. A whopping 9,4 million people could not find any job. More than 37% of our youth lived in abject poverty and could not find employment. It is the duty of the country to create an environment that is conducive to job creation and investment.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 124**

The NFP, therefore, condemns labour brokerage and fronting. We need to correct our education system. We need education that will take our learners and students to the 4th Industrial Revolution, hence we cannot overemphasise the importance of skilling and upskilling our people right from early childhood development. Our children must be given some technologically-based education up to university.

This country needs to invest in enhancing entrepreneurship development and small to medium enterprises. We need to unlock the mega infrastructure and township and rural economy. This is where the administration of the ANC has been taking a knee-jerk approach or a snail's pace attitude.

We need to create and produce industrialists. They must be in all sectors of the economy, e.g. manufacturing, mining, textile, agriculture, ocean economy, etc. We must create an economy that opens some space for emerging enterprises.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 125**

Our public transport system must be upgraded. We need to improve telecommunications and ensure that our country is well connected to Africa and the rest of the world. Let us deal with the cost of data. Our people must be taught to create their own jobs in order to save.

Our country needs robust mechanisms of reducing the state debt, hence it is important to have well-run, well-managed and well-governed SOEs by people with technical requisite skills. We know the saga with Eskom and other SOEs. We need a safe country and we must deal with gender-based violence in our country as a priority. All criminals must face the full might of the law. I thank you.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Chairperson, an economy in any developing country has a duty to serve the needs of areas that have been underdeveloped. Pre-1994 South Africa, the majority of people in this country were left underdeveloped, underskilled and excluded from the economy. 1994 raised hopes and dreams for a fair and equitable development path for all South Africans into the economy of this country.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 126**

With the formation of the UDM in 1997, we realised that these hopes and dreams were never to materialise. Thus, we provided an unbiased, nonracial, corrupt-free and trustworthy alternative for South Africans to turn to. Here it is! South Africa can only be best served by an economy that is multipronged, since the country has two vastly different classes of citizens: The haves; and the have-nots.

Moreover, since we are a developing state, our education system needs to be restructured so that it prepares our youth to be research oriented, rather than to just regurgitating old theories.

Today's industrial world needs a labour force that is driven by creative minds. That should be the first level of transformation. All legislation dealing with our economy should state explicitly that one of the objectives is to transform it.

Rules and regulations should specify the amount of local content that should be part of all goods manufactured in South Africa. There should be serious criminal

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 127**

consequences for failure to adhere thereto. Support for small businesses should be maximised.

Recently, a young lady went to the East London office of Small Enterprise Development Agency, Seda, an entity of the Department of Small Business Development. All she needed was nonfinancial support, like the drafting of a business plan etc. That office's response was that they have no money. Money for what, when all they should have done was to draft a business plan for her?

Then she proceeded to the Easter Cape Development Corporation's business division, also in East London. Again, she came back empty handed, reason being that they could only support her financially if she wanted to secure tangible goods like bread and milk. This lady offers services in the sphere of health and safety in the construction industry, which is her chosen line of business.

Another area that needs urgent attention is the extremely complex process of filling in of application forms and piles of paperwork when an entrepreneur wants to enter

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 128**

into medium-size business space. You would rather go attempt your second-year B.Com degree than handle those finance forms. Cut down the ribbon - the red tape!

A steady labour force ensures a healthy flow of goods from shops. This further creates higher demands for such goods from the manufacturing sector; thus increasing the demand for raw materials. What government needs then is to prudently and judiciously manage the tax revenue that comes with each sale transaction. This is all that is needed from the part of government.

Infrastructure maintenance can create large volumes of permanent employment for the less educated. Large contracts should be broken down and spread amongst all suppliers. [Time expired.] In that way, the economy will grow: Not for a few; but so many. I thank you.

Mr W M MADISHA: Hon Chair, one wonders: Where and how does the ANC cook up these Joseph Goebbels - like cynical, dishonest and propagandist - subjects for discussion? The truth is that it the ANC that sabotaged and destroyed our economic prospects - and continues to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 129**

do so. Worse, it is the ANC that has abused the moral and legitimate need for economic transformation, to enrich its own elite - over and over again - at the expense of the people, particularly the working class and the poor people.

This topic, introduced by the ANC, is simply disingenuous, insincere and downright deceitful. The entire State Capture project was premised on the supposed political desire to advance economic transformation. It turned out to represent our greatest betrayal. It has sabotaged and irrevocably damaged our transformational and developmental project.

More and more South Africans are coming to the stark realisation that the current ruling party has neither the capacity nor the will to create conditions for development, transformation and inclusive economic growth. Decisive leadership and brave choices must be made, but the governing party is so compromised, factionalised and split. It is caught in its own web of sleaze, perversion and corrupt interests - it is paralysed!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 130

The President says one thing and the next day Luthuli House contradicts it. The President calls for reform and the ANC's alliance partners howl blue murder. The ANC can't even keep the lights on. Apart from various significant structural reforms required to boost our economic prospects, we stand zero chance of attracting foreign direct investment, FDI; of encouraging development, inclusive growth and large-scale job creation; or meeting the challenges and opportunities of Fourth Industrial Revolution.

If government can't even keep the lights on, the ANC betrayed the trust placed in it. It sabotaged our prospects for a transformed and prosperous society. South Africa needs a new centre – a fresh start. Cope calls on all patriotic South Africans to work together to save South Africa. [Time expired.]

*Sepedi:*

ANC e paletšwe.

Ms C DUDLEY: Chairperson, for the ACDP transformation of the economy means greater inclusivity and not exclusivity

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 131**

as we have seen in the past and sadly in the present. Those with skills and experience must be valued and encouraged to continue ... [Interjections.] sorry.

Mr M L W FILTANE: I just wanted to know if Reverend Meshoe did pray over that speech before it is delivered.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Filtane, please, don't come with your frivolous points of order. It is a waste of our time. Continue, hon member.

Ms C DUDLEY: Those with skills and experience must be valued and encouraged to continue to use their skills in the service of South Africa. It is these skills and experience that must help to expand the economy to draw more people into jobs and to help skill more people. In this way people would be able to move away from having to rely on government grants and to become self-reliant. We all want a South Africa with a vibrant and healthier economy where jobs and opportunities are in abundance and the government that serves the people. The path to this begins with the skilling of people ranging from a greater

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 132**

focus on diverse basic and tertiary education to driving adult programmes that are linked to industry needs.

Yes, transforming the economy does begin with our children even before schooling begins. The ACDP will focus on making Grade R available at all schools and make early childhood development accessible in all areas. These children must then progress through a world-class education system and not be casualties of experimental schooling. An example of this is the education that Zimbabweans accessed over many years. Their education happened to be the Cambridge system which has given generations of the Zimbabweans an unenviable ability not only to know facts, but to apply them together with the desire to work hard and to support their families.

Education must be career-focussed encouraging individual talents and giving youth the tools to be enthusiastic skilled employees or innovative entrepreneurs. By revitalising their apprenticeship model and expanding their employment tax incentives, the ACDP will encourage businesses to provide paid internships for school leavers. A confident youth who are contributing to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 133**

society and earning a living are far more likely to be positive about a bright future and willing to build rather than destroy what they have.

Women, of course, play an integral role in transforming the economy. Unions have an important role in monitoring fair labour practices, the health safety and the wellbeing of workers. However, unions themselves must be accountable as unfair influence in appointments and opting for crippling protests over negotiation undermines progress. The promotion of the much needed local and foreign direct investment is hugely dependent on the protection of the property rights. The ACDP believes that local and international confidence will also increase as the safety of farmers and farmworkers is taken seriously.

In closing, the Bible teachings against dishonesty, stealing, killing and serving one another are solely missing in our schools today. The consequences are all too evident. The ACDP believes prayer and scripture in schools will bring the fundamental changes that are needed to reform our society. Thank you. [Time expired.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 134**

Dr M J CARDO: Hon Chairperson, today we will hear a lot of vapid ANC jargon about economic transformation and serving the people. It is all very hackneyed, hollow and hopeless. The truth is that the ANC couldn't care less about serving the people. It is only interested in serving those inside its own tent, the ANC insiders.

If you are inside the very important person, VIP, section of the ANC tent – like many Ministers in this House – you are part of a corrupt empire on which the sun never sets. It is an empire where booze, braai packs and bribes are sponsored by Bosasa. If you are on the outside, well, as any number of ANC flunkeys have cautioned over the years, it is cold outside the ANC. That is why, under the ANC, black economic empowerment has enriched a few ANC fat cats at the expense of the majority who remain excluded and poor. That is why, under the ANC, you have to flash your black, green and gold membership card if you want a job in the public service. And that is why, under the ANC, the only thing the so-called developmental state has developed are the bank balances of ANC cronies who captured and plundered state-owned enterprises like

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 135**

Eskom. The rest of us are quite literally in the dark and in the cold.

The ANC likes to talk about economic inclusion, but in reality, it has widened the gap between the insiders and outsiders. Through criminal practices like jobs for pals and jobs for sex in the public sector, the ANC has increased the divide between the haves and the have-nots. Through rigid labour laws that make it hard to hire workers, the ANC has denied people a foothold on the ladder of economic opportunity. The ANC deludes itself into thinking that you can make the economy more inclusive through competition legislation.

To make the economy more inclusive, we need to broaden the skills base. We need to radically transform our labour laws to create jobs. We need to improve access to capital and credit for unbanked entrepreneurs. We need to cut red tape for owners of small and medium sized businesses. The ANC won't do this, because the party exists only to benefit a small group of insiders. It's the reason 10 million South Africans can't find work. It's the reason that more than half of all South Africans

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 136**

live below the poverty line and it's the reason that 14 million South Africans go to bed hungry every day.

The ANC government only cares about enriching its cronies and rewarding those close to it with employment. This is not what we were promised in 1994. But, the DA has a plan to create fair access to real long-term jobs. Our plan focuses on: growing small business opportunities through increased funding assistance; removing blockages and red tape; introducing a voluntary national service; one year of income and skills development for school leavers and prosecuting and eliminating the practice of sex for jobs and cash for jobs in the public sector.

On 8 May, South Africans will get the chance to put South Africa back on track. It's a choice between letting South Africa become more corrupt, more unequal and more economically exclusive or building an inclusive modern successful economy that creates jobs. In the end, it's a choice between the DA's one South Africa for all or the ANC's divided South Africa for some. I thank you.

[Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 137**

Adv A D ALBERTS: Chairperson, the fact that we have this debate 25 years into our new political dispensation is an admission of guilt by the ANC that its policies have failed - otherwise, why have this debate at all?

We have the highest unemployment rate in the world. The ANC has not only failed but has spectacularly contributed to the destruction of our economy. The ANC has indeed profoundly transformed South Africa's economic world. To be sure, one must remember that transformation, as a word in itself, is not necessarily a good thing. However, within the context of ANC logic, the term has been reduced to an obsession with race representation at all cost, leading to the loss of experience and skills.

*Afrikaans:*

So het dit dan gebeur dat die ANC ons land in die grond in getransformeer het. Ek kon sterker woorde gebruik, maar my ma kyk ook na hierdie debat. Die string transformasie-sukcesse, in ANC terme, is duielingwekkend.

*English:*

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 138

Let's look at one of the ANC's transformation successes. Eskom has been transformed into an empty vessel ripping the economic foundation of the country from under our feet. Even as we speak, Eskom is devising a plan to get rid of more engineers simply because they have a white skin. Is this possible? Yes, under the ANC's rule, this is the reality. Transformation trumps delivery - always.

*Afrikaans:*

Die oorsaak van ons ekonomiese agteruitgang het dus te doen met die maatstaf van sukses. Wat is die maatstaf wat die VF Plus gebruik? Ons sien sukses as 'n proses gebaseer op meriete en eindproduk of diens wat kan kompeteer met die beste in die wêreld. Die ANC sien sukses as 'n transformasieproses en eindproduk of diens waaraan die korrekte aantal swart persone moes deelneem, ongeag of dit werk of nie werk nie.

*English:*

Transformation trumps delivery! So, if an economy is reduced to a racial census of card-carrying ANC-members with little to no regard for merit, then experienced white and black people will not want to work in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 139

public sector and will eventually move on to another country when the private sector starts to mirror the transformation objectives of the ANC, as it does today.

This is the essence of what is wrong with our economy which is not growing and not creating jobs to absorb the unemployed, the highest number in the world, once again - because transformation trumps delivery.

*Afrikaans:*

Indien ons die ekonomie wil verbeter ...

*English:*

... improve ...

*Afrikaans:*

... in plaas van transformeer, moet ons ras vervang met meriete en moet ons eiendomsreg beskerm.

*English:*

One thing is certain: We will not stand by idly and watch the ANC destroy everything.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 140

*Afrikaans:*

Op 8 Mei sal die kiesers wel terugslaan. Dankie.

*English:*

Ms N R BHENGU: House Chairperson and hon members, we expected to hear solutions. Instead, we heard the usual outcry.

*Afrikaans:*

'n AGB LID: Ja!

*English:*

The Freedom Charter says:

THE PEOPLE SHALL SHARE IN THE COUNTRY'S WEALTH!

The national wealth of our country, the heritage of all South Africans, shall be restored to the people;

The mineral wealth beneath the soil, the Banks and monopoly industry shall be transferred to the ownership of the people as a whole;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 141

All other industry and trade shall be controlled to assist the well-being of the people.

The Freedom Charter further proclaims:

All people shall have equal rights to trade where they choose, to manufacture and to enter all trades, crafts and professions.

In 1969, at a conference held in Morogoro, the ANC resolved to transform South Africa into a mixed economic system driven by three pillars: state-owned enterprises, private-owned enterprises, and worker and community-owned enterprises based on the concept of co-operatives.

[Interjections.]

*IsiZulu:*

Lo mnotho ofunwa yi-ANC yibhodwe elinemilenze emithathu elinganayo. Ngesikhathi ithatha umbuso i-ANC, yathola ibhodwe elakheke kabi kwasekuqaleni elalinemilenze engalingani. [Ubuwelewele.] Umlenze omele ongxiwankulu, i-private sector, mude, uyisidudla, ufuna ukulungiswa, ucwecwe ukuze ulingane neminye imilenze. Umlenze omele

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 142**

izinkampani zikaHulumeni umncanyana futhi mufushane, uhlale usekwa njalo njengoba kwenzeka kwi-SA Airways, ne-SA Broadcasting Corporation, SABC, no-Eskom.

Umlenze omele izinkampani zabasebenzi nomphakathi ezilawula ngentando ngamalungu abasebenzi futhi aphinde abe ngabanikazi bomnotho, awubonakali. Kunesibazi lapho okumele ngabe kunalomlenze khona. [Ihlombe.] Lesi simo somnotho senza kwaba nesidingo sokuthi uHulumeni we-ANC ashaye imithetho ezokwenza ukuthi abantu abamnyama, okuyibona abaningi okungabendabuko kuleli lizwe, bakwazi ukungena kwezomnotho. Bangathathwa njengezisebenzi ezisebenzela obasi abadlala igalofu nabathengi bezimpahla ezilandwa kwamanye amazwe.

Eminye yale mithetho eyashaywa uHulumeni ka-ANC i- black economic empowerment, i-affirmative action, i-broad-based economic empowerment, i-black industrialist, nokusungulwa koMnyango Wokuthuthukiswa Kwamabhizinisi Amancane nama-co-operatives, onikezwe amandla wokusebenzisana neminye iminyango kaHulumeni nezinkampani zikaHulumeni ukuze kube khona ukubambisana uma kuthuthukiswa osomabhizinisi abancane nama-co-operatives. Kukuhle kunjalo, akusho

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 143

ukuthi osomabhizinisi abancane nama-co-operatives  
sebefikile e-Khanana, ezweni lesithembiso.

Kusenzima, basahamba ehlane laseJudiya, abadayisi,  
abadayisi emgaqweni basanethwa, abanazo izindawo zokubeka  
izimpahla zabo, bashiswa yilanga. Abasemalokishini  
nasemakhaya babanga nezikhondlakhondla ezivula  
izinxanxathela yezitolo emalokishini nasemakhaya. Abezi-  
spaza shops nabagundayo nabacwala izinwele babanga  
nabokufika kuleli lizwe, okukhomba ukuthi kukhona  
okudinga ukuthi sikulungise. Sishaya imithetho ezovikela  
osomabhizinisi abancane baseNingizimu Afrika ukuze sifike  
kulemisebenzi engu-9 million ngo-2030 esilinde ukuthi  
yenziwe osomabhizinisi abancane nama-co-operatives.  
Abantu baseNingizimu Afrika laba esikhuluma ngabo.

*English:*

In the state of the nation address, President Cyril  
Ramaphosa said the following:

We will also be expanding the People's Housing  
Programme, where households are allocated serviced

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 144**

stands to build their own houses, either individually or through community-led housing co-operatives.

The approach provides a huge opportunity for communities to organise themselves and form housing co-operatives to build their own houses instead of remaining passive recipients of keys to houses built for them by other people. This approach will also enable communities to form themselves into workers' co-operatives that would manufacture and produce building materials and also use new technologies to build houses faster and cheaper without being dictated to by contractors who are profit driven. Money will rotate in the community.

The South African National Civic Organisation, Sanco, an organisation that subscribes to the Freedom Charter and the ideals of the ANC, advocates for a people-centred and people-driven development approach. President Ramaphosa has unpacked this by declaring that the People's Housing Programme will be expanded to include this approach. The above points to a need to re-evaluate how the Sector Education and Training Authorities, Setas, enable

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 145**

communities to acquire the skills required to develop their local economy.

Economic transformation is more about enabling those who were excluded from participating in the mainstream economy to participate. It is about addressing the exploitation of communities that are treated as providers of labour and consumers of goods. It is about training communities to use community assets for their own development. The development of technologies provides communities with an opportunity to process raw materials that are, in fact, the assets of those communities in order to create wealth at community level.

We stand here today to debate ways to transform the economy to serve the people. This debate calls on us to look honestly at the three legs of the mixed-economy pot and appreciate the ANC's election manifesto that reads as follows.

The ANC-led government will increase public support to the co-operatives banking sector. Registered financial institutions will be recognised as co-operative banks.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 146**

Access to affordable industrial and enterprise finance for small, medium and micro enterprises, SMMEs, and co-operatives will be broadened. We will broaden the ownership and control of banking by workers and communities, ensure adequate protection for deposit-holders in the co-operative banking sector, and facilitate access to markets for small businesses and co-operatives in the township and rural economy. We will scale up business support measures, including access to funding and improved competition legislation, address illegal trading and selling of fake and expired goods, and expand campaigns to stop illegal trading in townships and villages, much of which is conducted by foreign nationals. We will support the formation of networks of community-owned retail and wholesale facilities and the effective use of townships and rural-based local suppliers, including bulk buying and packaging schemes by township and rural retailers.

In his state of the nation address, President Ramaphosa said that we must accelerate inclusive economic growth and create jobs. We should improve our education system and develop skills that we need now and in the future. We

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 147**

are duty bound to improve the conditions of life for all South Africans. We have no choice but to step up the fight against corruption. We need to strengthen the capacity of the state.

The ANC is equal to the task. I thank you.

[Interjections.] [Applause.]

Mr M P GALO: Madam Chair, much of the discussions during the CODESA pre eminently exaggerated the political gains that needed to be made. It's not a secret that we over negotiated during the struggle. The results of these discussions regrettably left us with an economy that is deeply concentrated structural and unresponsive to the demands of all South Africans.

Chair over the past 25 years, we have not dismantled monopolies, we have not destroyed the distractive, competitive practices such as price fixing collusion and the abuse of market dominance and we have allowed carbon emitters to degrade our environment without punitive sanctions to turn the tight. Our economy has to be inclusive and competitive. It has to move from producing

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 148**

jobless growth to harnessing the potential of small and medium sized enterprises.

The dismal role of the employment equity commission in enforcing compliance with the Employment Equity Act is a great/grave concern to us. Unfair discriminatory practices in the workplace have to seize to continue.

Chair, the financing of small cooperatives and agro-processing producers has not moved at the pace and speed commensurate with the rhetoric around their significance.

We have heard of the millions of Rands belonging to the poor farmers vanishing without account. This is our state of affairs. Our economy growth must also be under pinned by effective oversight and corruption negating weapons.

SCOPA only started "barking" after the 2016 local government elections. The least is said about the National Prosecuting Authority (NPA), the better.

Chair, we also need clean efficient and reliable energy security. Eskom monopoly cannot be left unattended to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 149

attract foreign investment and to create jobs. We cannot afford to have a single unreliable electricity supplier. Certainty is another area that we cannot afford to ignore. South Africa has enviable opportunities to change the economy transgression to the nation, it is possible.

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: House Chair, the ANC's manifesto for the elections is slight of hand and mirrors trick that aims to transform the economy, and create jobs. It's a glorified wish list. By comparison, my colleagues have highlighted what the DA has achieved in the Western Cape.

But let's see if the ANC's claim, based on past delivery is justified.

GDP growth was 7.9% in 1964, at the height of apartheid's repugnancy. By 1994 it had shrunk to 3.2%. In 2006 it was 5,5%, in apartheid-free South Africa, but in 2017, it was 1.3% and now, the World Bank has cut its estimate to below 1%. Whose fault is that?

Five years ago Goldman Sachs identified key areas of growth focus. Let's examine you progress to date.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 150**

Unemployment and inequality, as economist Mike Schussler says, "There are war zones, including Iraq and Yemen that have a lower unemployment rate."

The ANC has responded with many initiatives to deal with jobs, all to no avail. Ours is now the highest in the world. Whose fault is that?

Current account deficit – This has widened to R 177 billion in the third quarter of 2018. Deficits financed by financial flows are vulnerable to capital flight if foreign investors sell their assets and repatriate the money. This is points to high risk, and an uncompetitive economy. Whose fault is that?

Savings rate – We have been dissaving since 2005. Our savings rate is now last amongst the G20. One of the key contributors is that government is trying squeeze water from a tiny tax stone. Whose fault is that?

Research and development – We trail other nations in expenditure on research and development (R&D) as a percentage of gross domestic product (GDP). It's now less

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 151**

than 1%, despite the universally accepted measure that every R&D job creates a multiple of 3.2 indirect jobs. Whose fault is that?

The Mining sector – Seven years ago this sector created one million jobs and accounted for 18% of GDP, but is now bedevilled by a charter that is rooted in failed Black Economic Empowerment (BEE) policies, is ultra varies the Mineral and Petroleum Resources Development Act (MPRDA) and unlawful in many of its provisions. A fundamental rethink is required, and the answer lies in shifting away from the ANC's BEE policies, so we can leverage our vast mineral wealth and empower the poor and disadvantaged in a way that the draft mining charter never

According to the Minerals Council, net investment in mining declined by 57% since 2008, partly because of lower global commodity prices and higher input costs but the decrease has also been fuelled by the country's damaging mining policies. Whose fault is that?

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 152**

Sovereign credit ratings - We are now junk status. This is a reflection on the government's ability to honour its debt

You've had 25 years to address this. For almost ten years Zuma's ANC, with President Ramaphosa at his side for five years, has driven the bus towards the cliff. Now President Ramaphosa is accelerating to the edge. The question remains, whose fault is that?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS: Hon House Chair, before I get to the business of the day, I would request the speaker that was here busy asking whose fault is it, to listen carefully to what I am about to say. Hon members, Thomas Piketty says:

When inequality gets to extreme, it becomes useless for growth and can even become bad because it tends to lead to high perpetuation of inequality, overtime and low mobility.

This translates to stagnation or slow growth in the economy especially in an economy that lacks inclusivity as

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 153**

it is the case in South Africa today. Whose fault is that? Our economy was historically defined in and around the mineral's energy complex which has led to South Africa having an economic growth path characterised by a monopolistic market structure and highly racialized patterns of ownership. Whose fault is that?

It is this legacy of apartheid colonialism that has resulted in the concentration of wealth in the hands of a few as well as high levels of inequality, unemployment and poverty for the majority and today we have brave members from the DA who talk of inclusivity under their rule. Is that the life that is lived by the people from Khayelitsha?

Inequality is the burden borne by black people in the main and this inequality has made it difficult and nearly impossible for the citizens and young black entrepreneurs who have no collateral to access to funding and it is only the ANC-led government that is working to change that condition and it has been proven.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 154**

It is important for the hon members to understand that the network industry such as electricity, water and telecommunications infrastructure in this country were designed to serve a minority that believe it is better than everyone. In 1994, only 19 million plus citizens had access to electricity out of a population of 38 million and all blacks did not have access to it. What we have today, to serve all South Africans has been extended to accommodate and service those that were not serviced in the past. That is why you are crying foul, trying to address the injustices of the past.

Having inherited a bankrupt state, it would always have been difficult to balance all priorities on an equal basis over a 25 years period. I mean, it took you 100's of years. These are the fundamental problems that the ANC government has sought to confront and resolves since its ascendance to power. We have since 1994, initiated a number of interventions aimed at a fundamental change in the structure, institutions, patterns of ownership, management and control of the economy in favour of all South Africans, unlike your fathers.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 155**

We have driven a comprehensive programme to broaden access to key infrastructure including electricity, water and the communications infrastructure. We have further introduced various industry transformation charters, and that is why you are crying BEE today. The empowerment funding institutions such as the National Empowerment Fund (NEF), and Small, Medium and Micro-sized Enterprises, SMMEs, funding and support initiatives and the black industrialist programmes that is there to enhance manufacturing from the black people that were deprived.

We have made some progress but the fundamental challenge of the monopolistic market structure and racialized ownership patterns remains persistent. It is this understanding that underpins our approach to the Fourth Industrial Revolution, 4IR and the digital economy that we seek to build. Our approach seeks to place people at the heart of the 4IR conversation, in line with our historical call to transform the economy to serve the people. This will only be realised when we all strive to build a capable 4IR army. In order for this army to be effective, there is a need to change legislation and regulatory frameworks which were previously voice

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 156**

oriented. We will therefore put legislative and policy frameworks that respond to the data centric environment.

With the reconfiguration of the Ministry, it has become imperative for us to reposition the departments to play a significant role in the increasing the sector's contribution to the GDP. We therefore need to invest in technology, skills, manufacturing capacity and create an environment for innovation to drive.

Hon Speaker, a people-centred response to 4IR speaks to jobs, skills and broad economic participation. It speaks to de-concentrating, improved competitiveness and transformed ownership patterns. In short, it has to be an inclusive digital economy. This is fundamental to our 4IR response; hence our 2019 ANC Election Manifesto commits us to:

Ensuring that, more women, rural people and the youth will be drawn into the economy through expanding access to digital skills training; developing technology; digital start-ups; more

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 157**

concerted effort on SMMEs, Co-ops and village enterprises.

Hon members, most people talk about the Fourth Industrial Revolution in a sceptical manner, as it has been projected as "this animal" that will swallow their jobs. Ours is to demonstrate that the benefits far exceed the magnified negative impact as Noam Chomsky says of some technological advancement over the past few decades:

The internet could be a very positive step towards education, organisation and participation of a meaningful society.

Going through a study by Accenture in 2018, one discovered that South Africa can unlock more than five trillion in value over the next decade through the use of digital technologies in key industry sectors such as agriculture, mining financial and manufacturing. The study further argues that digital transformation of government services is lightly to create the highest value for society through its impact on economic activity, productivity and service delivery. The

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 158**

digitisation of public infrastructure maintenance, public administration and healthcare alone can add over R1.2 trillion over the next decade.

The biggest task facing us as the nation is how to build a 4IR army that is required by the new industries and technologies. At the centre of our response therefore, is the massive skills development programme. Our education system from primary school must begin to include these critical technology skills. Our universities and Technical and Vocational Education and Training TVET colleges must prioritise the development of these skills through our roll-over programmes such as the broadband infrastructure programme. We are enabling skills and technology transfers to SMMEs.

Hon members, since announcing our noble ambition of training one million young people in various technology skills by 2030, as the sector we have trained 20 000 young people. These training interventions are focused on programmes such as coding, robotics, and internet amongst many others. Achieving this vision is no small task. It requires coordination of efforts by government, public

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 159**

sector, private companies and civil society. President Ramaphosa further affirmed this view in the state of the nation address that:

In line with our framework for skills for a changing world, we are expanding the training of both educators and learners to respond to emerging technologies.

The collaboration with the Department of Basic Education as started in 2013, has resulted in lots of public schools in rural and under serviced areas receiving full equipped ICT labs through an amendment of licence obligations from mobile operators. This was taken further by Minister Angie Motshekga who announced the phasing in of a comprehensive information and technology programme. In this regard, National Electronic Media Institute of South Africa, Nemisa, our training institute will be transformed into a key digital skills academy for both public servants and our communities.

Hon members, South Africa suffers from the big four syndrome, where almost every industry or market is

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 160**

dominated by a four big players. As we seek to grow the economy and unlock opportunities presented by the digital economy, it is imperative for the market to be opened up and small businesses to be given an opportunity.

As President Ramaphosa in his state of the nation address mentioned, we will soon issue a policy directive to enable ICASA to licence high demand spectrum. This directive provides a legal framework for the allocation of spectrum to the private and other industry players. Plans to fast track digital migration are at an advanced stage.

Noting the impact of high data cost the ANC-led government through Independent Communications Authority of South Africa, Icasa, is in a process of finalising the end-user and subscriber charter amendment regulations. These regulations will amongst others compel operators to provide consumers with an option to opt in or out of bundle data billing. Data subscribers are now also receiving usage definition notifications.

*IsiXhosa:*

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 161**

Oko kuthetha ukuba umaMfene uzakwazi ukuthumela idatha yakhe kwintombi yakhe esesikolweni.

*English:*

Hon members, South Africa currently has different 4IR elements spread across government departments, state entities and the private sector. However, there is there is no co-ordination for effective execution. To address the above challenge, President Ramaphosa established the presidential commission on 4IR. This commission will therefore serve as a national over-arching advisory mechanism on digital transformation.

In collaboration with the private sector and academia, we will also host a Digital Economy Summit in March 2019. The summit seeks to develop a co-ordinated country strategy and execution plan for the Fourth Industrial Revolution. Hon members, there is always fear of the unknown and unchartered grounds, it is a human response. What we are blessed with as the human race is the power to think and plan, the human power to come together and achieve unimaginable goals. The government lives and serves the people but the most functional government

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 162**

serves and works hand in hand with the people in building a better world.

In building we have tools provided. No man works alone, no government works alone. We collaborate as a people, support each other and share skills; we even learn and discover what we can do together. We use all our platforms, our resources to co-ordinate and build our country starting with the youth. When that is done there execution will go smoothly and that is what the ANC government stands for. Thank hon Chair.

Mr M D MAHLOBO: Chair, let's talk the facts, and not lies. Unemployment has decreased by 0,4% to 27,1% in terms of the labour force survey. Employment has increased by 149 000 to more than 16,5 million of South African South Africans that are employed. Unemployment has decreased by 70 000 to 6,1, as compared to the other things. Therefore, the opposition has nothing to offer.

Over the last 12 months, President Ramaphosa and the ANC government have been hard at work. To add, the ANC president and the President of the country, has approved

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 163**

the post-2020 automotive production and the development programme framework for the automotive master plan. The industry has committed an investment of over R40 billion in South Africa over the next five years.

Government has intervened in the steel industry where ArcelorMittal South Africa has recorded profit in sales of 10% and 8% profit. We have leveraged over R6 billion of private sector investment. We have worked closely with World Bank during the foreign direct investment, FDI, strategy consultations and achieved investment pipeline of R193,504 billion.

President Ramaphosa has been able to get a commitment of over R300 billion investment that had been announced. Watch our plans as the ANC because the opposition has nothing to offer us. The ANC has a plan. Our workers will have a stake in the companies they work in and they will share in the profits. We shall end monopolies to create space for new emerging companies by ending behaviour of stifling competition. We shall allocate 30% of government procurement spent to small business and co-operatives. We shall reduce the cost of data and extend free Wi-Fi to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 164**

many more sites in our country. We will work with private sector to ensure that small business, black industrialists and co-operatives are funded. We shall accelerate land reform including expropriation without compensation within the law and provide support to emerging farmers. We are going to increase research and development output in line with the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

The ANC will work with labour, business and communities to create many new jobs and ensure that all workers have decent jobs. An extra 275 000 jobs will be created in each year. We will increase internship and training opportunities for young people...[Interjections.]

Ms M O MKHALIPHI: Chair, I rise on a point of order. Is the member on the podium prepared to take a question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are you prepared to take a question, hon Mahlobo?

Mr M D MAHLOBO: No!

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 165**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you! Take your seat.

Mr M D MAHLOBO: We will implement the national minimum wage to improve the lives of more than six million workers. We will mobilise R1,2 trillion in the new investment over four years. Already, R300 billion is in the bag. We will also establish an infrastructure fund for us as a nation to transform our economy to serve the people. We will create an enabling environment to attract both domestic and foreign investment by taking decisive action to end state capture, restore the integrity of public institutions and tackle corruption whilst ensuring the state has the capacity, resources and the people to serve citizens effectively.

The ANC is a home for all South Africans. Our movement carries hopes, dreams and aspirations of the majority of the people. We are under no illusions that the road ahead is arduous and we have more mountains still to climb as we march on in our quest to create a better life for all.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 166**

His Excellency, Comrade Cyril Ramaphosa, our President and the ANC, have presented a credible manifesto and the plan. Even our detractors in this House cannot dispute our plan and our record.

I want to close by quoting Nelson Mandela, our first President, when he said, and I quote:

Like slavery and apartheid, poverty is not natural. It is man-made and it can be overcome and eradicated by actions of human beings. And overcoming poverty is not a gesture of charity. It is an act of justice. It is the protection of human right, the right to dignity and decent life. While poverty persists, there is no true freedom.

We can't continue with people who have benefitted from the history of dispossessing us - making us to be less than human like as our people are experiencing in the Western Cape. We are obligated by human solidarity and love for peace, justice and equality to be tolerant, reject prejudice base on race, creed, gender, religion, sectarianism and cast. Freedom and equality is the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 167**

cornerstone of a truly united, nonracial, nonsexist, democratic and prosperous society we all yearn for.

On 8 May, fellow citizens, once again we have an opportunity that your movement - the movement of our people, the ANC - will seek another mandate so that we can continue with the strides we have made over the past 25 years. And we have recorded a lot of strides. Today, our country is better than yesterday. The ANC is also admitting that more work still needs to be done. We are the only organisation working side by side with our people that have the capacity, the zeal and the worthwhile to be able to march ahead. Let's grow South Africa together! Let's vote the ANC so that we can together build our country from the ruins of apartheid. I thank you.

Debate Concluded.

**ANNOUNCEMENT OF PRESIDENT RAMAPHOSA AS AFRICAN UNION**

**CHAIR FOR 2020**

(Draft Resolution)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 168

Mr M S A MAILA: Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) congratulates President Matamela Cyril Ramaphosa for being announced the Chairperson of the African Union, AU, for 2020, where he will take over from the current Chair, Egyptian President Abdel Fattah al-Sisi;
- (2) understands that the announcement was made on Sunday 11 February 2019 at the 32nd Ordinary Session of the Assembly of the Heads of State and Government in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia;
- (3) acknowledges that the session was held over two days under the theme, "The year of refugees, returnees, and international displaced persons: towards durable solutions to forced displacement in Africa";

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 169

- (4) believes that the position of the AU Chair rotates between the African regions and this time it was meant to go to eSwatini, formerly Swaziland, but capacity constraints meant the country could not fulfil this duty and pleaded with South Africa to take over;
- (5) remembers that South Africa last chaired the AU in 2002 when former President Thabo Mvuyelwa Mbeki held the position;
- (6) further remembers that the last time a country from the Southern African Development community, SADC, region chaired the AU was in 2015 under former Zimbabwean President Robert Gabriel Mugabe;
- (7) congratulates President Ramaphosa on the appointment;
- (8) and wishes him well when he resumes his appointment in 2020.

I so move.

**BEST WORLD MUSIC ALBUM GRAMMY FOR SOWETO GOSPEL CHOIR**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr M W RABOTAPI: Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House—

- (1) congratulates the multiple award-winning South African gospel group, Soweto Gospel Choir for winning the Best World Music Album Grammy for their album, *Freedom*, at the 61st Annual Grammy Awards ceremony, at Staples Center in Los Angeles, United States of America;
- (2) notes that the Best World Music Album is awarded to albums that contain at least 51% playing time of new vocal or instrumental world music recordings;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 171

- (3) further notes that the album was recorded in June 2018 as the group's tribute to the 100 years of Mandela celebrations;
- (4) further congratulates album producers Diniloxolo Ndlakuse, Shimmy Jiyane, Mary Mulovhedzi and Mulalo Mulovhedzi for their hard work, passion and determination;
- (5) also notes that the group received this prestigious award subsequent to a successful three month long tour of the United States of America;
- (6) further notes that the group previously won an Emmy for their collaboration with global pop icons U2 as part of ESPN's 2010 Fifa World Cup coverage;
- (7) and wishes them well in their future endeavours.

I so move.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 172

CLOSURE OF VOTER REGISTRATION

(Draft Resolution)

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that voter registration will close in the coming days;
- (2) also notes that this will be the final opportunity South Africans will have to register as eligible voters for elections on 8 May 2019;
- (3) further notes that all young people, employed, unemployed, those struggling with fees for higher education, youth struggling with substance abuse, youth from lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, questioning and intersex, LGBTQI, community, youth heading

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 173**

homes, youth in sports, arts and culture, youth in church, community organisations and orphanage centres, we encourage all of you to register to vote;

- (4) also encourages that if you are at an institution of higher learning make use of the Independent Electoral Commission, IEC, registration points;
- (5) further encourages that for those at home, go to your local IEC office and register there. We must register to vote for our land and jobs now!

I so move.

**DEATH OF 13 PEOPLE AT GLORIA MINE IN MPUMALANGA**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr S LUZIPHO: Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 174

That the House –

- (1) notes with great shock the death of 13 people following an explosion at the Gloria Mine in Mpumalanga;
- (2) further notes that the number has risen to 13, after seven bodies were retrieved on Thursday 14 February;
- (3) understand that the group of 42 people, all of whom were involved in a copper cable theft entered the shaft to strip the equipment when a methane explosion resulted in 22 members of the group being trapped and suffocated;
- (4) further understand that the area has since being declared a crime scene and cordoned off due to volatility of the situation and the possibility that illegal miners are still being trapped inside the shaft;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 175

- (5) sends a vote of thanks to the mine rescue services, the police and the inspectors for a critical role they played in the rescue mission;
- (6) supports the Mpumalanga police for opening an inquest docket on this matter;
- (7) call upon all involved in illegal mining to desist from this dangerous practice on closed mines;
- (8) conveys our sincere condolences to the families of the deceased.

I so move.

**DROWNING OF NTANDO NZUZA IN A RIVER NEAR VERULAM**

(Draft Resolution)

*IsiZulu:*

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 176

Inkosi E M BUTHELEZI: Sihlalo, egameni le-IFP,  
ngiphakamisa:

Ukuthi –

- (1) leNdlu yedlulise ukukhathazeka kanye nokudabuka emndenini womfana omncane uNtando Nzuza odlule emhlabeni ngenxa yokuminza emfuleni wase-Verulam;
- (2) umzimba wakhe utholakale ngase ndaweni ehlanza amanzi;
- (3) siqaphela nokuthi umngane wakhe obone lesehlakalo ushilo ukuthi umufi ubezama ukubhukuda ewelela ngaphesheya endaweni lapho bekunenkundla yokudlala;
- (4) siphinde futhi siqaphele ukuthi izehlakalo ezinjengalezi zikhombisa ibanga elide okufanele silihambe njengohulumeni ekuqinisekiseni ukuphepha kwezingane zethu nokuthi izindawo

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 177**

zokudlala zisendaweni ezifinyelelekayo  
neziphephileyo;

- (5) sidlulisa futhi ukubonga kakhulu kulabo bophiko lokuntshuza kanye nabahlengi baseThekwini nethimba le-Reaction Unit SA ngokwenza umsebenzi omuhle wokufumana umzimba walomfanyana;

- (6) sicela ukuthi uhulumeni aqinisekise ukuthi izindawo zonke ezisemakhaya zibanezindawo zokudlala futhi kube ngeziphephileyo ukuze singabhekani nezimo ezifana nalezi.

Ngiyaphakamisa.

**GOVERNMENT URGED TO ADVANCE DEVELOPMENT IN THE AREA UNDER  
MZIMELA TRADITIONAL AUTHORITY**

(Draft Resolution)

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chairperson, I move without  
notice:

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 178**

That the House –

- (1) notes that the people of Mzimela traditional authority have been without SA Police Service offices, hospitals, clinics and clean water for many years;
- (2) further notes that the government has been advocating for urban rural integrated development as from 1994;
- (3) calls upon government to work with Inkosi Thanda Mzimela and his traditional authority to advance development in the area concerned as people desperately need development and service delivery; and
- (4) congratulates Inkosi Mzimela for doing the best by bringing development in his tribe. Thank you.

Agreed to.

**ANNIVERSARY OF NELSON MANDELA'S RELEASE FROM PRISON**

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 179

(Draft Resolution)

Ms Y N PHOSA: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that 11 February 2019 marks 29 years of Nelson Mandela's release from Victor Verster Prison in Cape Town after spending 27 years imprisoned;
- (2) further notes that Mandela spent 18 years on Robben Island and a short period at Pollsmoor Prison before spending the last 14 months of his imprisonment at the Victor Verster Prison;
- (3) recalls that in June 1964, Madiba and other political activists were sentenced to life in prison at Robben Island;
- (4) further recalls that his release paved the way for South Africa's years of peace-making, negotiations and a process of transformation;

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 180

- (5) remembers that South Africa's transition from apartheid ended formally on 27 April 1994 with the first democratic general elections and a government of national unity under the stewardship of President Rolihlahla Mandela;
- (6) believes that Madiba's presidency was about entrenching democracy and putting in place the instruments required to transform society fundamentally; and
- (7) calls upon South Africans to celebrate the country's break from colonial and apartheid shackles, and to go out in their numbers to vote in the 2019 general elections set for 8 May 2019 in remembrance of Madiba. [Time expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Botoro): Just a reminder: It has been a long time that we haven't done motions - it is one and a half minute.

Agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 181

FIVE PUPILS STABBED DURING A BRAWL IN CAPE TOWN

(Draft Resolution)

Ms C N MAJEKE: House Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes with sadness that five people from Cape Town were stabbed during a brawl that involved a large number of pupils;
- (2) understands that two pangas and loads of alcohol had been confiscated from the pupils;
- (3) further notes the increase of violence in South African schools;
- (4) wishes those injured a speedy recovery;
- (5) calls for the Minister of Education, government and society to urgently develop a plan on how to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 182**

prevent and control violent incidences that occur inside and outside of school premises;

- (6) further calls on government to tighten up security around school premises and avail law enforcement agencies for routine checks on students;
- (7) recommends that there should be a setting of clearly defined rules and limits for children and consequences for not complying and be consistent in enforcing them. I so move.

Agreed to.

**RESIGNATION OF THE MR STEVENS MOKGALAPA AS MEMBER OF  
PARLIAMENT**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr K J MILEHAM: House Chairperson, I hereby move without notice:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 183

That this House –

- (1) notes the resignation of the Mr Stevens Mokgalapa as a Member of Parliament;
- (2) recognises that Mr Mokgalapa served as DA Shadow Minister of International Relations and Co-operation and prior to that as Shadow Minister of Human Settlements;
- (3) acknowledges that he was honoured by his colleagues in the African Liberal Network for his commitment to liberal values and dedication to international co-operation, through his election as president of that international organisation;
- (4) recalls that he previously served as a Councillor in Tshwane from 2000 to 2009;
- (5) congratulates him on his appointment as Mayor of Tshwane, where he was elected unopposed on 12 February 2019; and

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 184

(6) wishes him well in his endeavours.

Agreed to.

**LIQUIDATION OF AFRICAN GLOBAL OPERATION**

(Draft Resolution)

Mrs H O MKHALIPI: House Chairperson, I hereby move  
without notice:

That the House –

(1) notes the voluntary liquidation by African Global Operations, known as BOSASA, after revelations at the Zondo State Capture Commission of tender corruption which involved some Ministers in Cabinet today;

(2) further notes that more than 4 500 workers who did not participate or benefit in the corruption of BOSASA are going to lose their jobs;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 185**

- (3) recognise that insourcing of all these workers in government departments and state-owned companies is the only rational and sensible way forward as many will not find work anytime soon in the economy that is not growing;
- (4) acknowledge that it is not sustainable or appropriate to remove BOSASA as a corrupt service provider only to appoint Bidvest in their place. All government departments and state-owned enterprises must build internal capacity; and
- (5) finally notes that Steinhoff bank account must be closed for the same reasons the Guptas and BOSASA bank accounts were closed;

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are there any objections to the motion?

An HON MEMBER: The ANC objects to the motion.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): In light of the objection, the motion without notice may not be proceeded

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 186**

with. The motion without notice will now become a notice of motion on the Order Paper.

**WORLD DAY OF JUSTICE 2019**

(Draft Resolution)

Mr G J SKOSANA: Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes that since 2009, the 20th of February has annually been the United Nations observance known as “World Day of Social Justice”;
- (2) further notes that the purpose of the day is to focus on the plight of social injustice throughout the world and to press for improvements and solutions;
- (3) acknowledges that World Day of Social Justice recognises the need to promote efforts to tackle issues such as poverty, exclusions, employment,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 187

gender equity and access to social well-being and justice for all;

- (4) recognises the 2019 theme: "If You Want Peace & Development, Work for Social Justice";
- (5) believes that social justice is an underlying principle for peaceful and prosperous coexistence within and among nations;
- (6) further believes that a society for all must be based on social justice and respect for all human rights and fundamental freedoms; and
- (7) calls upon countries and governments to commit to the creation of a framework for action to promote social justice at national, regional and international levels.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Are there any objections to the motion?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: The EFF objects to the motion.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 188**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): In light of the objection, the motion without notice may not be proceeded with. The motion without notice will now become a notice of motion on the Order Paper.

**TOP FRENCH AWARD FOR SA PLAYWRIGHT BRETT BAILEY**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms M P CHUEU: Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes the South African playwright Brett Bailey was awarded France's "Knight in the Order of Arts and Letters" award at a ceremony at the Granger Bay Hotel School in Mouille Point on Tuesday 12 February 2019;
- (2) further notes that France ambassador to South African, Christophe Farnaud, bestowed the award on behalf of President Emmanuel Macron;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 189**

- (3) acknowledges that the Order of Arts and Letters is a French order established in 1957 and awarded by the French Ministry of Culture in recognition of significant contributions to the enrichment of the arts and literature in France and abroad;
- (4) recalls that Brett is a playwright who has a strong commitment to political actions, social messages and economic questions;
- (5) further recalls that his work takes on rampant capitalism, ruthless exploitation, careless power and greed;
- (6) congratulates Brett Bailey on receiving this top award.

Agreed to.

**APPLAUDING THE IEC FOR MANAGING TO REGISTER 2, 4MILLION  
POTENTIAL VOTERS**

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 190

(Draft Resolution)

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes the good effort made by IEC particularly on the last weekend of registration of 26 and 27 January 2019, that the target was to register 2,5 million people with their physical addresses;
- (2) further notes that the IEC managed to register 2, 4 million people this was great because it was achieved though it was not easy to get into other voting stations due to service delivery protests;
- (3) appreciates these efforts because it is another way of deepening democracy in our country;
- (4) also notes that IEC applied to Constitutional Court for the extension of the registration of

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 191**

people with physical addresses for 18 months and it was agreed to;

- (5) acknowledge that this will help us so that the elections of 2019 may not be challenged on the basis of the physical addresses;
- (6) further acknowledge that the number to be registered was too big within such a short space of time and IEC is always making a point that our elections are free and fair and without any prejudice and it is always the wish of IEC that all political parties do contest the elections;
- (7) encourages IEC to keep doing well and attend to the issue of irregularities with immediate effect. The idea of having the electoral Court to solve party issues is a very good idea.

Agreed to.

**CONDOLENCES ON THE UNFORTUNATE AND UNTIMED KILLING OF THE  
STUDENT AT DURBAN UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY**

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 192

(Draft Resolution)

Ms S MCHUNU: Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes with great sadness the unfortunate and untimed killing of a student, Mlungisi Madonsela by security guards at Steve Biko campus in Durban on Tuesday, 05 February 2019, during an altercation with security guards;
- (2) further notes his death occurred during students protest over funding and accommodation at that institution;
- (3) recalls that this is the second killing of a student being shot at the institution of higher learning within a short space of time and under the same circumstances;

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 193**

- (4) calls upon students' leadership and populace to desist from using violence to air their grievances;
- (5) also calls upon the universities to act responsibly when deploying armed security;
- (6) further calls upon the Department of Higher Education to regulate the use of excessive force at the institutions of higher learning; and
- (7) conveys its condolences to Mr Madonsela's family, friends, fellow students.

Agreed to.

**EXPRESSING SHOCK ON THE ACT OF TERRORISM ATTACK IN  
KASHMIR**

(Draft Resolution)

Ms S V KALYAN: Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 194

That the House –

- (1) notes with shock and dismay of a terrorist attack in Kashmir on Thursday, 14 February 2019, in which 40 soldiers of the Central Reserve Police Force were killed;
- (2) condemns this cowardly act of terrorism, the likes of which has not been seen in over three decades in Kashmir, which was carried out by a 19 year old suicide bomber;
- (3) further notes that acts of terrorism has no place in this society and constitutes a threat to peace and security in the world order;
- (4) calls on the government of Pakistan to find and take action on the perpetrators of this dastardly attack;
- (5) salute the fallen Jawans who have the ultimate and supreme sacrifice for their country; and

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 195**

(6) extends its condolences to the respective families and the nation of India for this tragic loss.

Agreed to.

**CONDAMINATION OF THE IAAF BY SOUTH AFRICANS FOR UNFAIR AND DISCRIMINATORY REGULATIONS TOWARDS CASTOR SEMENYA**

(Member's Statement)

Mr S M RALEGOMA (ANC): The ANC joins millions of sports-loving South Africans and people of the world in condemning the International Association of Athletics Federation, IAAF's, unfair and discriminatory regulations that seems to be targeted at our heroic and award-winning international star, Castor Semenya.

We are of the view that all people of the world who are there to uphold women's rights should rally behind Castor Semenya as she appeals at the International Court of Arbitration for Sports, ICAS, in Lausanne, Switzerland, against the IAAF's ruling, forcing the female runners to

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 196**

take medication to reduce their testosterone levels for six months before racing internationally.

The ANC and the sports-loving South Africans are also mindful of the other hand tactics used by the IAAF in yet another attempt for embarrassing and humiliating Castor in public space to win support for their views in the court of public opinion. We call upon Parliament to unreservedly support and add its voice in an application launched by the Athletics South Africa, ASA, at the Court of Arbitration for Sport, CAS, to challenge these regulations.

We also call upon the ANC government to assist on this matter by raising public awareness and mobilising public support on the discriminatory nature of these regulations. Thank you. [Applause.]

**SUSPENSION OF THE ANC CONCILLOR IN BERG RIVER, BILLY  
CLAASSEN, FOR ALLEGATIONS OF MISCONDUCT**

(Member's Statement)

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 197**

Mr L J BASSON (DA): Chair, the suspension of ANC's Councillor, Billy Claassen, due to findings of misconduct as a public representative in the Berg River Council, led to a by-elections in Ward 5 on 16 January 2019. It was contested in six rural Village Development Societies, VDS, by the ACDP, the AIC, the EFF and the ANC.

We are delighted that the DA emerged victorious by taking Ward 5 from the ANC. [Applause.] This represents an overwhelming thumbs-up by the people of Berg River for quality services and good governance, as all seven wards are now represented by the DA [Applause.]

We also welcome the resignation of two further ANC public representatives in the Berg River Council. Clearly, it is not just voters leaving the ANC in droves. The DA is grateful for the support of the residents of Ward 5 and their move away from the ANC to the DA, is a clear cut acknowledgement of DA-led action-driven governance.

The public representatives who serve only themselves should be roundly rejected and replaced, not just in person, but as in this case, by losing a seat to the DA.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 198

[Applause.] These are early signs of what will be seen on a large scale on 8 May as many more joins the DA on our mission to build one South Africa for all. I thank you.

[Applause.]

**TRADITIONAL LEADERS STILL OWED BACKPAY IN KWAZULU-NATAL**

(Member's Statement)

*IsiZulu:*

Nk M S KHAWULA (EFF): Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, ngisukuma egameni le-EFF ukuphakamisa lokhu, udaba lobuholi bendabuko ikakhulukazi izinduna namakhosi KwaZulu-Natali. Imali yabo ayifani neyakwezinye izifundazwe. Kunezikhhalo eziningi ezithinta ubuhloli bendabuko mayelana nemali njalo. Ningilalele. Izinduna ziyahlukumezeka kakhulu kulobuholi be-ANC wentando yeningi. [Ubuwelewele.] Zathenjiswa ukuhola ngowe-2011 ukuya ngowezi-2017 kodwa azangahola. Ziqale ukuhola ngowezi-2017 zathenjiswa ukuthi bazokhokhelwa imali yabo yezinyanga ezendlule[backpay.] kodwa azikaze ziyithole leyo mali kuze kube yimanje.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 199**

U-MEC uNomusa Dube-Ncube ubatshela ukuthi imali iyashoda. Umbuzo uthi: Bekuyimalini ebikhona obekufanele ikhokhele izinduna namakhosi? [Ubuwelewele.] Ishonephi le mali? [Ubuwelewele.] Le ekhona ke eyibhiliyoni 1,2 kungani zinganikezwa izinduna zikwazi ukuthi ziqhubeke zidle. UNomusa Dube usenza lokhu ebekwenza ngemali yesomiso le athe ilahlekile. [Ubuwelewele.]

Okunye okwenzekayo uma kukhothame iNkosi izinduna azihole.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Siyathokoza Mhlonishwa.

Nk M S KHAWULA (EFF): Hhayi, sengiyaqeda.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Cha, siyathothokoza mhlonishwa kunesikhathi [Ubuwelewele.] Ngiyacela mama.

Nk M S KHAWULA (EFF): Aziholi izinduna imali yazo kodwa ziyasebenza. Kungani ungivala kodwa? [Uhleko.]

**REMOVAL OF THE STATUE OF FORMER PRESIDENT, NELSON  
MANDELA, BY THE CITY OF CAPE TOWN FOR A PHOTO SHOOT**

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 200**

(Member's Statement)

Ms L N MJOBO (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC is disappointed by the City of Cape Town's decision to give permission to a film production company to remove the statue of former President Nelson Mandela temporarily for an international movie shoot. Mandela delivered his speech after he was released from jail at the Grand Parade in Cape Town on 11 February 1990.

On that day people from all walks of life came together to listen to Mandela's speak after years in prison. The statue plays a significant part in our history, and to remove it, displays the city's arrogance of Madiba's stature and his place in our history. The statue was removed on the anniversary of a famous address he made to more than 250 000 people on the day of his release from Victor Verster Prison, now known as the Drakenstein Correctional Centre.

The statue's removal was apparently at the request of a member of film crew. Removing the statue to clear the way for a film shoot is to wipe away the memory of the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 201**

momentous occasion from history. This statue is part of Cape Town's identity, and to remove it to accommodate a film shoot even temporarily, shows the DA-led city's disdain for the memory of the historic event. Shame on you, DA!

**COMMEMORATION OF ARMED FORCES DAY IN FALSE BAY,  
MUIZENBERG, CAPE TOWN**

(Member's Statement)

Mr N SINGH (IFP): Chairperson, I deliver this statement horrified that our SA National Defence Force, SANDF, is about to unleash hell for a second successive day at False Bay, Muizenberg, in Cape Town. If one was in Cape Town last night, you might have thought that we are under attack, as live fire ammunition was recklessly and with full abandon fired into the waters of Muizenberg by the SANDF in a display of South Africa's military might.

This event is not withstanding the fact that False Bay is known not only for its thousands of resident dolphins, seals and birdlife, but is also a home and one of the

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 202**

large vestiges of the protected great white shark species which come to cast in the Bay.

I have been made to understand that the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape Province also authorise such an event to take place. One would have expected them to be in a High court trying desperately to interdict the event, or the very least, having the event moved to a more suitable and less ecologically sensitive sight.

I recall a motion in this House calling for a ban on fireworks. The impact of this Armed Forces Day is far worse than fireworks on the environment. The IFP has written to the hon Minister of Military Defence and Military Veterans about this matter, to which no reply has been received.

It also calls upon the hon Minister of Environmental Affairs to conduct a full investigation into the matter and ascertain whether the environmental impact assessment was completed and approved, we don't think that the National Defence Environmental Impact Assessment, NDEIA, was complete. [Time expired.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 203**

**ESKOM AS THE CAUSE OF LOADSHEDDING IN SOUTH AFRICA**

(Member's Statement)

Prof N M KHUBISA (NFP): Chairperson, the NFP is disturbed by what has happened in Eskom. The recent load shedding has affected our country severely. It seems there is a lot that is going on in the state-owned entities, SOEs. We were hoping that with the introduction of new board and management, things would turn for the better.

It has moved from bad to worse, and Eskom is technically insolvent. We are not sure whether this bunking exercise will add value to the company. Eskom has a debt of R440 billion and it is projecting net loss of R20 billion. Almost R200 billion has been poured into two power stations, those are Medupe and Kusile, but we have not got the results.

We are told that some of the infrastructure that is used in Eskom is old and that it needs to be upgraded. We also hear that the company lacks a mix of technical skills. The end result is poor performance. This coupled with

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 204**

mismanagement and lack of skills has resulted in the downfall of this state-owned entity. We need to view the issue of state-owned entities in a serious light. But consequence management is very critical.

State-owned entities have been plagued by fraud and corruption, and that includes this one, Eskom. There have been no consequences for such acts of crime. We need to have the right people at the right place. People without skills must not be brought to SOEs as they deal with mega projects. Therefore, their collapse is very sad.

The matter concerning Eskom needs that we bring in people with relevant skills to run the entity, so that it creates jobs and lead our people towards elimination of poverty, inequality and unemployment. Thank you. [Time expired.]

**SOUTH AFRICA-CUBA MEDICAL TRAINING PROGRAMME**

(Member's Statement)

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 205**

Mr S D BEKWA (ANC): House Chair, the ANC is once again delighted by the success stories of the Republic of South Africa and Cuba Medical Training programme. As one of its recipients, Dr Nhlanhla Mngadi, a medical intern with the family medicine unit, is already treating a number of patients at R K Khan Hospital in Durban, KwaZulu-Natal for the very first time.

Dr Mngadi who is a child from an impoverished home and many like him, are doctors today because of the ANC's government's initiative and support. Had it not been for the Republic of South Africa-Cuba Medical Training programme, their dreams of becoming doctors would have been a pipe dream.

Since the programme has been pioneered, it has since produced 127 doctors while 438 are still studying in Cuba, and 291 are now completing their studies in South Africa. Dr Mngadi's journey started in 2011 when he and hundreds of other poor South African students left their homes to study medicine in Cuba.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 206**

Cuba is a country with a strong focus on health education and disease prevention rather than cure, which is more in line with the National Health Insurance, NHI. The ANC is grateful that Dr Mngadi and many like him, accepts the responsibility to serve their communities with deeper enthusiasm. I thank you, Chair.

**CONTINUING CORRUPTION BY THE ANC-LED GOVERNMENT**

(Member's Statement)

Mr M W MADISHA (COPE): Chairperson, it is more than a year, since society and opposition parties, including COPE forced the ANC to eventually recall Zuma from presidency.

What becomes more evident with each passing day is that, his removal from office provides no panacea to the multiple crises we face, rather as shocking admissions at various commissions of inquiry that are taking place recently.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 207**

It is the ANC that sits at the core of a criminal network that ensued and corrupted and continues to loot organs of state in all spheres of government under its control. What is clear is that it is greed and corruption that is the glue that binds what is left of the ANC together; that the ANC is corrupted beyond redemption; that it can't self-correct; that the ANC is so conflicted, corrupted, factionalised, caught and paralysed in its web of the seed and greed that it can't provide real and viable solutions to save us from a growing national calamity and escalates this each passing day. They must go. Thank you very much. [Time Expired.]

**HANDING OVER OF TOOLS AND EQUIPMENTS TO INFORMAL BUSINESS OWNERS FROM MAMELODI**

(Member's Statement)

Ms L S MAKHUBELA-MASHELE (ANC): Chairperson, in the recently conveyed job summit, President Cyril Ramaphosa committed government to creating more jobs and establishing a township and rural entrepreneurship fund

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 208**

to support South Africans with businesses in townships and rural areas.

The ANC welcomes the handing over of tools and equipments to informal business owners from Mamelodi, Gauteng by the Department of Small Business Development on 15th Friday 2019. This is part of the department and its agency Small Enterprise Development Agency, Seda, Informal Micro Enterprises Development Programme which aims to uplift business owners in the informal sector with tools and equipments to sustain their businesses as well as to provide mentorship and training.

The Ministry of Small Business Development is on a nationwide campaign to uplift township and rural economies and has already visited several towns in KwaZulu-Natal, Gauteng, Northern Cape and Limpopo. The informal section has been identified by government as critical to addressing the triple challenges of poverty, unemployment and inequality.

In this regard, the Department of Small Business Development has developed a set incentives programmes

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 209**

targeting Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises. I thank you.

**THE FUTURE OF STUDENTS AT TVET COLLEGES IN SOUTH AFRICA**

(Member's Statement)

Mr M SHACKLETON (DA): Chairperson, the future of students at TVET colleges in South Africa is hanging in the balance, whilst institutions across the country have been confronted by labour strikes over the last six months, unions having issues with the Department of Higher Education and Training and also recently called for a national shut down. The failure by the Minister of Higher Education Naledi Pandor and her department to resolve employment issues, it's putting the future of students at risk.

Today, Yusuf Cassim, the DA Member of Parliament, MP, did an oversight inspection at Lovedale Colleges, Zwelitsha Campus, where a strike has brought education to a scratching halt. The staff affiliated to National Education, Health and Allied Workers' Union, Nehawu,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 210**

South African Democratic Teachers Union, Sadtu and National Professional Teacher's Organisation of South Africa, Naptosa have been on strike since October 2018 and no teaching learning registration of supplementary examination are taking place, as students are not registered. They can't access National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, funding and have no allowances to sustain them.

During today's massive public meeting, students made it clear that they want to return to class but they are being held ransom by the department's failure. We believe unions should hold the ANC to ransom and not poor students. You shouldn't suffer because Minister Pandor turns a blind eye and fails to act, caring nothing for the future of our youth. The DA will continue fighting to ensure that no student is left behind in building one South Africa for all.

**STUDENTS ARE FORCED TO LEARN IN AFRIKAANS IN SPRINGBOK IN**

**THE NORTHERN CAPE PROVINCE**

(Member's Statement)

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 211

*Tshivenda:*

Mr T E MULAUDZI (EFF): Mudzulatshidula, ...

*English:*

... it will be 43 years this year, since the Soweto student uprising and 25 years since this country first democratic election. Despite a quarter of century of the ANC rule, the legacies of apartheid continue to exist.

In Springbok in the Northern Cape, today, students are forced to learn in Afrikaans and are forced to study elsewhere because of no alternative. Children who have grown up their whole lives speaking Tswana, IsiXhosa, Sesotho and English are having their education compromised, because of the inability of this government to transform our education system.

For months community members of Springbok have written to various schools and the Department of Basic Education to resolve this issue, but nothing has been done and their cries has been ignored.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 212**

Schools must offer classes to the learners in languages which they understand and are able to like it. The EFF therefore calls upon the Department of Basic Education to investigate the lack of English medium schools in Springbok and further calls upon the department to resolve this matter urgently.

*Tshivenda:*

Ndo livhuwa.

**THREE HUNDRED NEW NURSES APPOINTED IN KWAZULU-NATAL  
PROVINCE**

(Member's Statement)

Mr P MAESELA (ANC): Chairperson, three hundred new nurses celebrate the good news of their employment. Mrs Nompumelelo Majola from KwaZulu-Natal, KZN, who spent the past thirteen years struggling to find permanent employment, is one of the first beneficiaries of the stimulus package recently announced by President Ramaphosa.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 213**

Mrs Majola who originated from Mbumbulu is now working in the Prince Mshiyeni Memorial Hospital in Umlazi, in Durban and gives thanks to President Ramaphosa and Member of the Executive Council, Dr Sibongiseni Dlomo for making her dream come true.

Three hundred new nurses including Mrs Majola celebrated the good news of their employment. Thanks to the stimulus package. It aims to boost the public health sector through the creation of more than five thousand three hundred jobs throughout the country.

The KZN Provincial Department of Health is also finalising the appointment of porters, general orderlies, and pharmacist assistants and artisans.

The ANC believes that the beneficiaries of the stimulus package will be the vast majority of the population who rely on the state for their health needs, particularly those in the far flung areas. Thank you.

**SOUTH AFRICANS LIVING IN SQUALOR**

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 214**

(Member's Statement)

Mr L M NTSHAYISA (AIC): Hon Chairperson, the vast majority of South Africans lives in squalor and under constraints social infrastructure. The road infrastructure in the rural villages has regressed over the past twenty five years. Short workmanship leads to road fatalities and spiralling road accidents.

The share decision of intergovernmental relations between departments across different spheres of government is non-existent. The unity of purpose drives towards building a coherent state apparatus is misleading action.

The extent of this neglect has seen unmitigated number of rural villagers preferring the cities for unsustainable human settlement. As a consequence, the equitable share for the affected municipalities takes a hard knock. The community protests have spiralled out of control. Trust and disillusionment are the things of the day. There is an urgent need to improve the social infrastructure of these rural communities.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 215**

Government can't continue abdicating its obligation to improve welfare of the nation. It serves no purpose to claim over the people when in fact their livelihood have not significantly transferred over the years, for instance the road between Maluti Township and ... [Time Expired.]

**THE ANC STRENGTHENING SUPPORT TO SMALL FARMS AND  
COOPERATIVES**

(Member's Statement)

Ms N B DAMBUZA (ANC): Chairperson, the ANC is committed to strengthening and supporting small farms and cooperatives to enter the formal value chains and take advantage of economic scale. This is to create job and food security. We therefore, welcome that success story of Busisiwe Molefe, the first black female farmer from KwaZulu-Natal who supplies macadamia nut to the export market.

Her success story is due to the successful training and support from the KwaZulu-Natal Department of Agriculture

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 216**

and Rural Development and Agricultural Development Agency. She was trained through the Perishable Product Export Board Council in Financial Management, Agri-Business and Marketing which enabled her to move into the commercial sector.

D B S Farm employed twenty seven permanent and ten seasonal workers, many of whom are women and youth to the export market and local giant retailers. The ANC believes that her success story and many stories like hers will inspire other women to follow their dreams and make a success of their lives. This will also hopefully encourage more women to start their own business and break through the class feeling in previous male dominated industry. I thank you.

**NATIONAL MINIMUM WAGE CAUSES MASS RETRENCHMENTS AND  
STIFLES JOB CREATION**

(Member's Statement)

Mr M BAGRAIM (DA): It was promised that the National Minimum Wage would be implemented on 1 January.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 217**

Shockingly, it was announced when the commission was wholly unprepared. Despite requests for sufficient funding from the Ministry, this has not materialised even though referrals have already increased by more than 15%.

This deluge is hampering the entire system. It is projected that in whatever year, the logjam will affect the proper functioning of the entire Department of Labour. Many of the department's systems are totally inadequate. The only one working was the CCMA. It is clear that the ANC-led government has a knack of destroying anything that is actually functioning as it should.

The National Minimum Wage has not only created an environment leading to mass retrenchments, but it has pulled the handbrake on job creation. While the DA-led governments in the Western Cape, Cape Town, Johannesburg and Tshwane continue to create hundreds of thousands of jobs, unemployment remains at an almost 15-year high. Once again, the tail, Cosatu is wagging the dog, the ANC. The ANC's election promise rings as hollow as this one,

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 218**

and only a vote for the DA will reverse this trend as we build one South Africa for all. Thank you.

**ANC WELCOMES NATIONAL HEALTH INSURANCE WAR ROOM**

(Member's Statement)

Ms M P CHUEU (ANC): The ANC welcomes the setting up of the National Health Insurance, NHI war room which brings together various key departments to address the crisis in the public health system while at the same time preparing for the implementation of the NHI. We have realised the magnitude of the challenges in the health care as well as the need to reduce inequality in access to health care in order to ensure that South Africans have access to comprehensive quality health services irrespective of their socio-economic status. This is why the urgency to establish the NHI and quality war room in the Presidency is significant as it will ensure that there are no hurdles in our movement towards universal health coverage.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 219**

The NHI will enable South Africans to receive free services at the point of care in public and private quality-accredited facilities. After extensive consultations the NHI Bill will soon be ready for submission to Parliament. The ANC is encouraged by President Ramaphosa's indication in the state of the nation address that in 2019 government will take a significant step towards universal health coverage that will bring quality health care to all South Africans. I thank you.

**ANC LOSES WARD 5 TO DA**

**TRADITIONAL LEADERS NOT PAID THEIR SALARIES**

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY: House Chair, I want to start with the hon member from the DA, who spoke about the Ward 5 that the ANC has lost. Yes indeed, as the ANC, when our members are out of line especially that councillor, we are prepared to lose the ward just to make sure that we correct what was done wrong. But he forgot

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 220**

to mention Ward 5 in Knysna which was lost by the DA to the ANC and many others because one ward is not a sign that you are winning. There are many wards which have been won by the ANC to show that we are winning.

Secondly, if you are serious about dealing with councillors who are doing wrong, start with Solly Msimanga. Instead of disciplining Solly Msimanga and dealing with the challenges, you moved him to be a candidate in Gauteng. He has collapsed the Tshwane Municipality. [Interjections.] There are audit findings from the Auditor-General but you are not dealing with that. Show leadership, deal with Solly Msimanga, and remove him from being a candidate to show that you are disciplined as you say.

The other issue I want to respond to is the matter that has been raised by the EFF member, the hon Khawula.

*IsiZulu:*

ithi siqale la, izinduna bezingaholi ngaphambi kokuphatha kukahulumeni kaKhongolose. Izinduna ziqale ukuhola sekuphethe uhulumeni kaKhongolose, yingakho izinduna

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 221

zimbonga lohulumeni kaKhongolose ngoba ziyazi ukuthi ekuqaleni bezingaholelwa futhi zazingatholi lutho. Ziyaqala ukuhola izinduna, yingakho sithi nalapho kunamaphutha khona nokunye okungahambi kahle siyazama ukukulungisa. Kungakho nale KaZulu-Natal, uNgqongqoshe uNomusa Dube-Ncube ezama ukulungisa uma kunezinkinga, futhi ayikho nemali elahlekile.

Nanamhlanje uNgqongqoshe ubekhona mhlanganweni wamakhosini ekhuluma nawo, ngoba kwawona amakhosini nezinduna ziyazi ukuthi uhulumeni kaKhongolose uyazikhathalela, ngoba nguye owenze ukuthi zithole imiholo.

**IAAF REGULATIONS CONDEMNED FOR DISCRIMINATING AGAINST  
YOUNG GIRLS**

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF SPORT AND RECREATION: Hon Chair, I want to thank the hon Ralegoma for raising the issue around the International Association of Athletics Federations, IAAF Regulations. Indeed, it is a shame at this point in

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 222**

time when the world is beginning to respect human rights that the IAAF comes up with the regulations without any compelling evidence and therefore, discriminating against young girls like Caster Semenya in participating in world events. The regulations have drawn much criticism from organisations of the world because at this point in time, they are exposing where the body is violating the right to privacy, health, livelihood, own identity and also the acceptable standards of human rights in terms of the human rights law.

Therefore, our campaign, which has been running online, has been widely accepted and supported. We are indeed calling upon even the Parliament of the Republic of SA to join us as we rally behind the court case which started on Monday and will end on Friday this week. We say, away with this and hands off because it also affects our athlete Caster Semenya directly. In future it is going to affect athletes of the African origin. Therefore, we have our #Naturally Superior, #Hands Off Caster Semenya and we wish that we could have maybe a day where Parliament will find a way to discuss the matter. [Applause.]

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 223**

*IsiZulu:*

Nks M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo uyazi kukhona into engiphatha kabi, uyabona uma ngabe sikhuluma la sisuke sikhuluma ngezinto ezithinta abantu kodwa manje ungqongqoshe ungitshela ngezindaba zangalena, mina ngikhuluma ngo 2011 kuya ku 2017.

USihlalo weNdlu: Ngicela ukuthi uyoxoxisana noNgqongqoshe ngalolu daba okhala ngalo, lolu daba lungabuyi lana futhi ngoba phela manje bayaphendula emibuzweni ebuziwe. Siyaxolisa kuleyo ndawo.

**CONTINUING CORRUPTION BY THE ANC-LED GOVERNMENT**

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Chair, may I respond to hon Madisha of Cope and his insult to the ANC. The ANC is an organisation of more than 107 years for struggle, for the emancipation of all the people of South Africa. It is the listening organisation. The ANC is in a period of renewal and unity in action to confront all challenges affecting our people.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 224**

As we conduct the struggle, of course, we will do the mistakes, but as a learning organisation, we all have learned for our mistakes and that's why we have delivered so many good services to our people in the last 25 years. [Applause.]

As we prepare for our renewal of mandate on 8 May this year, we are the only political formation with a credible practical plan done in consultation with the people in order to take South Africa forward. Let us grow South Africa together. Let us embrace Thuma Mina spirit. Let us call upon the dying organisation like Cope to stop resorting to baseless insult to the ANC and its leaders and its President in particular. I thank you. [Applause.]

**THE FUTURE OF STUDENTS AT TVET COLLEGES IN SOUTH AFRICA**

(Minister's Response)

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING:

Chairperson, as far as I am aware only one union has submitted a notice of strike and that is National Education, Health and Allied Workers' Union, Nehawu, with

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 225**

respect to the collage sector. The SA Democratic Teachers Union, Sadtu, is not participating in the strike.

Now, I think only an organisation searching for cheap political capital would seem to celebrate unions stopping students from studying. Any union interfering with learning and teaching in our institutions is to be definitely told that that should not happen

Furthermore, over 400 000 students have been confirmed as National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, beneficiaries. There are 21 colleges where we have our students to do what we have told students to do throughout the country to open bank accounts so that funds can directly be administered to them rather than the past practice where monies have disappeared through corrupt means. We have stopped that practice and then introduced a new approach. [Applause.]

Those students who are not yet receiving their funding may be subject of the 46 000 appeals that are being processed by NSFAS at present. But I am very pleased that for the first time by the beginning of February over

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 226**

400 000 young people have their status confirmed.

[Applause.] Therefore, this is a great advance.

We will work and are working with all institutions to ensure that education does continue, but I think anyone interfering with the right of our young people to learn must be condemned for that conduct, particularly when the issues are being discussed in the bargaining chamber.

Thank you very much. [Applause.]

**NATIONAL MINIMUM WAGE CAUSES MASS RETRENCHMENTS AND  
STIFLES JOB CREATION**

(Minister's Response)

*IsiZulu:*

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZABASEBENZI: Sihlalo weNdlu, ngiyafisa ukuthi umhlonishwa u-Bagraim angakhohlisi iNingizimu Afrika ngoba izikhalazo eziphambi kwe-CCMA ngezithi i-CCMA bacele ukuthi alandelele izinkampani ezithile ezingakabakhokheli abasebenzi. Kube nezinye ezinye izinkampani ezifake izicelo zokuthi zibe ngaphansi kohlelo lokukhululwa. U-CCMA no-IES ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 227

*English:*

... they are on top of the issues. We are going to make sure that those who don't follow or comply with the legislation ...

*IsiZulu:*

... sizobafaka kwinkantolo yamacala yezindaba zabasebenzi.

*English:*

We don't have a problem. But now, the CCMA has those powers. They are going to do inspection on all those companies. Therefore, ...

*IsiZulu:*

... makangakhohlisi, makangafuni ukuthi ukhulumela abasebenzi ekususela kumsebenza awenza ngaphandle kwasePhalamende. Ngakhoke, makenze umsebenzi wala ewususela kulokho okumele ngabe uyakwenza kuleNdlu. Bese ngicela ukuthi ngongezelele kulokhu okushiwo wumhlonishwa u-Kubayi-Ngubane, uNgqongqoshe, MaKhawula, umthetho wokuholela izinduna washicilelwa ngo-2013 hhayi ngo-2011 futhi izinduna bacaciselwa ukuthi kungani zingakhokhelwa

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 228**

ngaleso sikhathi ngoba iPhalamende noma isiShayamthetho sikaZwelonke saphasisa umthetho ngaphandle kokubhekelela ukuthi lowo mthetho, ngokwesabelozimali, uzosebenzeka yini.

Ngoba sikhuluma nje, izifundazwe zonke sezihlele kahle asebhajethile ukuthi siholelwe izinduna. Ngikhuluma nje izinduna zakaNongoma noMhlabuyalingana zicele ukuthi sizincedise ... [Kwaphela isikhathi.] ngoba indima yazo manje ngoba sebolelwa uHulumeni iyini. Ngiyabonga Sihlalo.

**STUDENTS ARE FORCED TO LEARN IN AFRIKAANS IN SPRINGBOK IN  
THE NORTHERN CAPE PROVINCE**

(Member's Statement)

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon Chair, the hon member from the EFF raises a very important issue. We have no knowledge of it, but I recently invite the hon member to bring it to our attention.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 229**

We are committed to parity of language and parity of esteem of all our languages. We have heard several years ago an incident in Ermelo, where the governing body in the school had excluded learners on the basis of language. The matter was taken to court. The court found in favour of the school and the governing body.

We took the matter on appeal. The Supreme Court of Appeal found in favour of the governing body. We took the matter to the Constitutional Court. The Constitutional Court found that language could not be used as an instrument to exclude learners and that we have to look at the broader interest of the community.

To that end, we have indeed reviewed and amended our admission policies of that gate keeping does not take place where language is used as the basis of exclusion rather than inclusion. Indeed, what were gone done beyond that is to ensure that all our schools where only English and Afrikaans is taught is obliged to teach an indigenous African language. This is our commitment to the promotion of our indigenous languages and the parity of esteem of all our languages.

**UNREVISED HANSARD**

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

**TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019**

**Page: 230**

We assure the hon member that if indeed the matter is brought to our attention, we will act on it immediately. Thank you very much, hon Chair. [Applause.]

**NOTICES OF MOTION**

Mr T M NKONZO: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates the development of an economic strategy that appropriately balances our developmental objectives as well as promoting inclusive growth.

Thank you.

Mr M S F DE FREITAS: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House debates -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 231

- (1) the continuing and current shambolic state of the Passenger Rail Agency of SA;
- (2) the inaction by the Minister to resolve its problems and bring guilty parties to book; and
- (3) what needs to be done to get Prasa back on track.

Thank you.

*Sesotho:*

Mong N S MATIASE: Modulasetulo wa Ntlo, ke fana ka tsebiso ya hore letsatsing le latelang la ho dula ha Ntlo ke tla etsa tshisinyo lebitsong la mokgatlo wa EFF:

Hore Ntlo -

- (1) e ngangisane le ho sekaseka taba ya hore dikgwedi tse 12 di fetile haesale Mopresidente Ramaphosa a etsa tshepiso ya hore o tla ilo thoba le ho hlakola dikeledi tsa bahlolohadi le bana ba basebetsi ba dimaeneng ba Marikana mme hona ha ho eso etsahala; mme

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 232

(2) e hopotse Mopresidente Ramaphosa ka tshepiso eo  
a e entseng.

Ke a leboha.

Ms L M MJOBO: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on  
the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf  
of the ANC:

That the House debates, addresses and resolves  
genuine students' grievances and challenges through  
rational dialogue and peaceful means.

Thank you.

*IsiZulu:*

Inkosi E M BUTHELEZI: Sihlalo, ngicela ukufaka isaziso  
egameni le-IFP:

Ukuthi ngokuhlala kweNdlu okulandelayo sicela kube  
wudaba lwemigwaqo ebhidlikayo emakhaya nokuyisizathu  
sezingozi eziningi. Ngiyaphakamisa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 233

Prof N M KHUBISA: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the NFP:

That the House debates -

- (1) and resolves on a gun-free South Africa noting the serious challenges we face in South Africa as a result of Illegal and unlicensed firearms;
- (2) high murder rate as a result of firearms; and
- (3) high level of serious and violent crimes committed with the use of firearms.

Thank you.

Ms C N NDABA: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 234

That the House debates promoting local economic development, particularly in centres where there is great potential for localisation and empowerment.

Thank you.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the UDM:

That the House debates the need to use renewable energy in order to ensure the stability and sustainability of power supply.

Thank you.

Ms B S MASANGO: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 235

- (1) debates the dire situation at Kagiso Child Welfare SA where services have ground to a halt since April 2018 as salaries have not been paid to social workers; and
- (2) how clients, including children, the elderly and the disabled are deprived of essential services.

Thank you.

Mr N S MATIASE: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House -

- (1) debates the right to land of people living in communal areas, such as the people of Xolobeni, is an absolute right; and
- (2) that no one has authority to dispossess indigenous people of the right to land for the benefit of a few capitalists.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 236

Thank you.

Ms C MATSIMBI: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the ANC:

That the House debates accelerating and strengthening government interventions to mitigate the impact of the drought on economic development and job creation.

Thank you

Dr P MAESELA: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of ANC:

That the House debates using South Africa's non-permanent position in the United Nations Security Council to advance peace on the continent and across the globe to ensure a stable and just world.

Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 237

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Madam Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of AIC:

That the House debates how African identity can be protected in terms of the economy, education, culture, defence, law and justice.

Thank you.

Mr D W MACPHERSON: House Chair, I hereby give notice that on the next sitting day of the House I shall move on behalf of the DA:

That the House -

(1) debates The impending job crisis currently unfolding in the sugar cane and related industries sector with 350 000 jobs on the line; and

(2) the ANC as well as the Chairperson of the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry's

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2019

Page: 238

unwillingness to do anything about it to meet  
this crisis head-on.

Thank you.

The House adjourned at 19:00.

UNREVISED HANSARD