

TUESDAY, 9 JULY 2019

PROCEEDINGS OF THE MINI PLENARIES SESSION – OLD ASSEMBLY CHAMBER

Members of the mini-plenary session met in the Old Assembly Chamber at 14:03.

The House Chairperson Ms M G Boroto took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

APPROPRIATION BILL

Debate on Vote No 13 – Women:

The MINISTER OF WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon House Chair, hon Chairperson of the Portfolio Committee on Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities, hon Ministers, Deputy Ministers, members of the Portfolio Committee on Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities, hon Members of Parliament, hon members of the Select Committee on Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities, various portfolio committees represented here, Commission on Gender Equality, commissioners, acting chairperson and CEOs, board of the National Youth Development Agency, chairpersons of NGOs, acting directors-general of our departments or ministries, civil society

organisations, Presidential Working Group on Disabilities, Council on Gender-Based Violence and Femicide, the leadership of the private sector, the United Nations representatives, ladies and gentlemen, fellow South Africans, dumelang [good afternoon.].

Hon Chairperson, it indeed gives me great pleasure to stand here as the Minister in the Presidency for the newly-configured Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities, and table the Budget Vote for a department that is central to the inclusive development of our country. This department is uniquely poised at the centre of government to co-ordinate and provide oversight in ensuring that government implements inclusive programmes, which are geared towards closing gaps in the representation of women, youth and persons with disabilities. When all departments commit to this ...

... ka nnete re tla ge re re ke dipitsi ra bona ka mebala.

(Translation of Sepedi sentence follows.)

[...that will be when the proof of the pudding is in the eating.]

Our focus is on intersectionality because women, youth and persons with disabilities are often disadvantaged by multiple sources of oppression - race, class, gender, sexual identity and other identity markers, and these markers intersect to create complicated layers of oppression.

When Mme Lillian Masediba Matabane-Ngoyi was banned, and effectively made an enemy in her land in 1957, she said:

I must say I had a tough time, but my spirit has not been dampened. You can tell my friends all over the world that this old girl is still her old self. I am looking forward to the day when my children will share in the wealth of our lovely South Africa.

How we wish that she was still around to witness the progress that has been achieved by the ANC-led government in the short 25 years since we attained our democracy. You strike a woman, you strike a rock. I say this as we are preparing for another commemoration of women's march in August. Our generation, people who are the beneficiaries of this democracy, are grateful to Mme Ngoyi, Mme Maxeke, Mme Madikizela-Mandela and all their peers for the democracy we are enjoying today. We have the most progressive Constitution in the world and have developed legislation and policy framework to advance human rights, equality and empowerment of women, youth and persons with disabilities.

We owe all this to the "mbhokodos" ...

Maswarathipa-ka-bogaleng ... *(Translation of Sepedi phrase follows.)*

[Those who take a bull by its horns...]

... who refused to be dampened by the brutal system of apartheid because as mothers ...

... ba phela ba swere thipa ka bogaleng - ka thoko ye go lego boima
... *(Translation of Sepedi sentence follows.)*

[...they are always courageous- not scared of facing the challenges...]

... for the future of their children and children's children. We pay tribute to Mma Ngoyi, Mme Sisulu, and Mama Winnie for their fighting spirit because today we are proudly standing in Parliament representing the most marginalised members of our society - women, youth and persons with disabilities, whose issues have been elevated to The Presidency. We also stand here today presenting a Budget Vote in the Parliament of the sixth administration which for the first time since 1994, has 50% of women in Cabinet - a milestone that has placed this country among only but the 11 in the world.

As we enter this new dawn of economic emancipation, our dream is of women, youth, persons with disabilities and the LGBTQI+ community to walk freely in the streets of this country at any time, participating in the development of the country and creating wealth without any fear of violence towards them ...

... e le bošego goba mosegare. (*Translation of Sepedi sentence follows.*)

[...day or night.]

In his state of the nation address, His Excellency the President outlined the seven priorities of the sixth administration and five fundamental goals for the next decade. The President spoke about social cohesion and safe communities, and that for the next decade, violent crime will be halved if not eliminated. However, I am presenting this Budget Vote in a very difficult time for women in this country. There is war against women and this cannot be tolerated, and has to be stopped now. For six women in a household to be murdered in one day - I am counting more than 13 human beings in total now, who had been killed in 2019 - is not okay. This does not make South Africa a country which is safe to live in. This happened on Saturday. I was shocked when I watched media reports. I think all of us should join the communities who sent condolences to all of those who lost their lives due to the stupid behaviour. May their souls rest in peace!

We are in total support of the community and call for action by our criminal justice system as this carnage must really stop now. We appeal for long sentences for perpetrators of gender-based violence with no option of parole. On 2 and 3 November last year, the President of the Republic of South Africa, His Excellency, Cyril

Ramaphosa called a Presidential Summit on Gender-Based Violence and Femicide where he declared gender-based violence and femicide a national crisis. We all agree with him that it is a crisis and what happened in Philippi confirms that. Therefore, as a country, we cannot deal with GBVF like any other crime, and we need urgent intervention strategies to address this carnage.

The Presidential Summit came out with a declaration that clearly outlined actions that needed to take place to finally eradicate gender-based violence and femicide in the country. This has to be finalised now to boldly start implementing and saving the lives of women and children in this country. An interim Gender-Based Violence and Femicide Steering Committee that consist of government departments, civil society organisations that represent networks or coalitions and intergovernmental organisations has been formed as recommended by the summit.

They are working under tight deadlines given by the summit to develop the national strategic plan, NSP, which must be integrated within the 2019-24 Medium-Term Strategic Framework and appoint the Gender-Based Violence Council by September 2019. The committee has formed task teams to address the different pillars of the NSP and has held national consultations with experts in the different areas to produce draft reports that are based on documents and consultations held nationally. The Gender-Based Violence Council that will be chaired by the President will implement the NSP on

gender-based violence and femicide in all spheres of government, including at community level and the private sector.

The rapid response teams will be replicated also at institutional levels including Parliament, legislatures and all workplaces. May I also include schools and institutions of higher learning, as well as technical vocational education and training, TVET, colleges! The council will work together with the criminal justice to track gender-based violence and femicide cases throughout the criminal justice system and monitor the sentencing of gender-based violence and femicide cases in our courts to ensure that they comply with minimum sentences and issue life sentences to all perpetrators.

Furthermore, we will work with Department of Correctional Services and parole boards to ensure that those sentenced for gender-based violence and femicide crimes serve their full term. In intensifying the programmes to eradicate gender-based violence and femicide, we will also be launching the national action plan on women, peace and security together with the three co-ordinating departments which are International Relations and Co-operation, the Department of Defence and Military Veterans and the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities.

However, gender-based violence will not stop if we do not invest our time as a nation in prevention programmes. This must start at home. How we raise our children, both boys and girls, will have an impact

on particularly boys, on what type of men they will become. We must socialise them and instil in them values of love that should lead them to mutual respect and treat all people as humans who deserve equal rights and opportunities. Therefore, for us to win this battle, we have to ensure that gender-based violence and femicide programmes are well-resourced and funded.

Through the Gender-Based Violence Council, we are going to ensure that all budgets that are sitting in different departments including the private sector, which are meant for addressing gender-based violence and femicide, are put in the council to attack the social ills that we have in our country. Otherwise, there will not be economic development to talk about if we do not take care of what needs to be taken care of. We welcome and applaud the decision by the President to allocate funding in this 2019-20 financial year to combat gender-based violence and support decisions taken at the summit. We are looking forward to the budget allocation from Treasury so that we can continue with the battle to eradicate gender-based violence and femicide.

It is only in the environment where women are safe and feel safe as espoused in the National Development Plan that they will participate freely in the programmes and economic opportunities made available through democracy without always looking over their shoulders. Let us eradicate gender-based violence and femicide in our lifetime.

Kopano ke maatla. (*Translation of Sepedi phrase follows.*)

[Unity is strength.]

As a country, we need radical change in how we address issues affecting women, youth and persons with disabilities and it cannot be business as usual. We cannot talk of economic transformation and job creation without enforcing policies in place to ensure that these sectors find meaningful benefits.

In this regard, we are going to enforce the Gender-Responsive Planning, Budgeting, Monitoring, Evaluation and Auditing Framework approved by Cabinet on 27 March 2019. We will make sure that members take time to acquaint themselves with this. We will share this because we want South Africa to come together to ensure that this works. I wish to encourage all Ministers and Deputy Ministers to familiarise themselves with the Gender-Responsive Planning, Budgeting, Monitoring, Evaluation and Auditing Framework, and to expand this framework to youth and persons with disabilities to ensure that programmes of government do not exclude our guests here. In fact, we are here because of them; and we are here to serve them.

To implement the Gender-Responsive Budget Framework, we are going to enforce the 30% of procurement to be dedicated to these sectors. In discussion with the Auditor-General, we will request that these are part of the audit outcomes, so that when the Auditor-General audits

all spheres of government, they are also audited on gender equality and economic empowerment of women, youth and persons with disabilities.

We will annually report on the performance of government and the private sector on economic transformation and gender equality which is a constitutional mandate. We are going to reintroduce the Women Empowerment and Gender Equality Bill that was lauded as the trailblazer in dealing with patriarchy and redressing the imbalances of the past by the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women, Cedaw, committee. The Women Empowerment and Gender Equality Bill lapsed in the fifth administration. For us as a nation to restore human dignity and have social cohesion, we must create jobs and provide women, youth and persons with disabilities with the environment conducive to starting businesses and creating employment for all.

A re se ke ra iša bana sekolong feela gore ba rutege ba kgone go nyaka mešomo, ba swanetše ba tsebe le go itirela ka bobona ...

(Translation of Sepedi sentences follows.)

[Let us not take children to school just to be educated and get employment; they also need to be innovative.]

... as they have already said, earlier. One of the low-hanging fruits is that they must actively participate in and benefit from

the manufacturing component of the Sanitary Dignity Framework. The production of sanitary products is a multimillion rand industry but does not benefit women who are the users of these products. This is not justifiable. In fact, we advocate that women co-operatives should be the owners and manufacturers of the sanitary products.

The National Treasury allocated R157 million extra for the 2019-20 financial year to augment provincial allocations for the national roll-out of the sanitary dignity project under the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities. The department will engage the provinces to ensure that this allocation kick-starts the manufacturing processes led by women. While in the process of establishing these, we urge them to support women-owned businesses and not continue buying sanitary pads from existing channels. It is okay to buy where you were used to buy in the past, but can manufacturers who have the know-how, also open up their hands by making partnerships work in reality for businesses in order to make South Africa work?

In his state of the nation address, the President announced that no person in South Africa will go hungry. According to Statistics SA, poverty has a face, and that face is female. In addition to this, in South Africa, the face of poverty is of a black woman as reported by the SA Institute of Race Relations in 2017.

This indicates that women suffer the triple and persistent challenges of poverty, inequality and unemployment more than men as reported by Statistics SA. To ensure that we eradicate hunger in the country, we are going to start a process of developing a national strategy on poverty eradication in partnership with all government departments and civil society organisations that are working at the household level to ensure that no South African will go hungry. It is a shame that we are still talking about hungry people in such a rich nation.

We cannot talk about women's economic empowerment and not talk about women's access to land. This must be addressed urgently as women want to continue with food production in a large scale and to become property developers. This will eradicate hunger as they will feed their families and their neighbourhood, because it is women who knows how to do things better.

We have a crisis. On 16 June this year, President Ramaphosa stressed that as a country we are facing a national crisis regarding youth unemployment as 57% of the unemployed in the country are youth. The President has categorically pointed out that our topmost priority as a country must be to address the issue of high youth unemployment, unemployability, lack of appropriate job-related skills and the provision of job opportunities to grow the economy. We have set our sights on ensuring the expansion of the National Youth Service working together with other responsible departments to take on

50 000 young people a year to get into the National Youth Service. Go to any other country outside this continent and you will find that what makes countries successful is patriotism. If we are talking about moving this country forward, we should first be patriots. We should believe in South Africa first and make other friends afterwards.

On Saturday 28 June 2019, we had a consultation on Beijing+25 Report process and women and young people cried about not being employed. These are graduates in the science, technology, engineering and mathematics areas and this challenges the myth that those that are unemployed do not possess the requisite skills. There are young people with requisite skills who are sitting at home and are jobless. They have pleaded for government's intervention ... [Interjections.] ... on ensuring compliance to recruitment of foreign nationals on only scares skills as prescribed.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto) Let's hear the speaker at the podium, please.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: To mitigate all these, we will develop a database of unemployed graduates as requested by the hon President during the state of the nation address on youth, and in partnership with the Department of Labour, the National Youth Development Agency, NYDA, the private sector and the Sector Education and Training Authority, Seta, to

ensure that we place those professionals in real jobs. [Time expired.] Thank you. Malibongwe! [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, before we continue, we have clocks here. All the speakers who come here will see the clock. So, once the clock becomes blank you must know that your time is up. In so far as our guests are concerned, we want to welcome you. We really appreciate your presence here, but unfortunately the Rules of this Chamber do not allow our guests to participate - participation in terms of clapping hands or using cameras in the House. So, when you appreciate something, I think you can just smile - please don't clap. But we really appreciate your presence here.

Abomama ba khona bonke, siyabonga. (*Translation of IsiZulu sentence follows.*)

[All the women present, thank you.]

The other issue is that only water can be consumed in this Chamber. No tea or fizzy drinks are allowed in this Chamber. So please, let's try and respect this House as a Chamber. We know it is not the National Assembly, but this becomes a Chamber when we meet here and have these programmes. Thank you very much.

Ms C N NDABA: Hon House Chair, hon Minister, Deputy Minister, hon Deputy Chief Whip of Gauteng Legislature, hon guests, dumelang [good afternoon.] The ANC remains committed to the vision of a united, nonracial, nonsexist, democratic and prosperous South Africa as enshrined in the Freedom Charter. The advancement of gender equality is an ideal that transcends our policies and should, thus assist us towards the realisation of a national democratic society.

Working off the backdrop of Apartheid as well as the gap that was unintentionally created after the democratic breakthrough, the first two decades of democracy can be characterised by major advancements made by this government, some of which include the establishment of a democratic, nonracial and nonsexist political order. The introduction of democratic rights for all citizens and the establishment of vibrant institutions; a constitution that forms the underlying foundation for women's development, gender equality and a nonsexist society, and given effect through policies, legislation and institutions to give effect to this vision. Our Strategy and Tactics Document of 2017 correctly outlines the following precisely because patriarchal oppression was embedded in the economic, social, religious, cultural, family and other relations in all communities. Its eradication cannot be an assumed consequence of democracy. All manifestations and consequences of patriarchy – from the feminisation of poverty, physical and psychological abuse, undermining of self-confidence, to open and hidden forms of

exclusion from positions of authority and power – need to be eliminated consciously.

Critical in this regard is the creation of the material and cultural conditions that would allow the abilities of women to flourish and enrich the life of the nation. In alignment of budget in addressing the issues of youth and persons with disabilities, gender equality in any society is a basic human right and the implementations of these rights are a priority to the ANC-led government.

Whilst a pronounced effort has been demonstrated and noteworthy advances towards gender equality have been made post-1994 in South Africa, women still face barriers with regard to employment and income, and challenges remain in all areas where women reside, but are more pronounced in rural areas. It is neither sufficient to be gender conscious with regard to policy nor is the inclusion of women in formal institutions satisfactory, especially since this has not led to the desired distribution of resources of the economy and land in fundamental ways. That is why the budget plays a pivotal role in ensuring that policy positions are able to find expression through the efficient allocation of resources.

The committee acknowledges the transitional arrangements currently underway by the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities.

While we acknowledge the expanded mandate of the department, the committee has urged the department to present its new Annual Performance and Strategic Plans within the next 30 days. The functioning of the department is very important for this country as it focuses on fulfilling the rights of the most vulnerable groups which the committee will oversee diligently.

According to the Estimates of National Expenditure for 2019, the Department of Women received a budgetary allocation of R244,4 million for 2019-20, of which R85,177 million is transferred to the Commission for Gender Equality. This allocation will reflect, among other things, detailed conversations and recommendations that arose from the strategic planning sessions undertaken by the commissioners, and the findings of the Human Rights Commission, HSRC, 20-Year Review, which will lead to the following significant differences in the approach to implementation.

The Strategic Plan of Commission for Gender Equality, CGE, is based on a catalyst model, rather than an implementer model, and it presupposes a fair degree of centralisation; there is reliance on the establishment of strategic partnerships to ensure delivery of programmes; and stronger co-operation and co-ordination across departments within the CGE itself.

The National Treasury released its Final Response Document on Rates and Monetary Amounts and Amendment of Revenue Laws Bill, 2018 based

on hearings by the Standing Committee on Finance in Parliament. The VAT Panel recommended that among other items, sanitary products, school uniforms and nappies for babies and adults should be added to the list of zero-rated items.

Whilst we have not yet achieved supplying free sanitary products to girls and women who cannot afford, the announcement by Treasury is a milestone in so far as having a gender-responsive budget is concerned. Furthermore, the 28 February 2019 marked the national Sanitary Dignity Programme launch. The launch was an advocacy, an awareness initiative which was as a result of resource mobilization leading to the programme becoming a funded mandate.

The R157 million allocated by the National Treasury for the 2019-20 financial year is intended to augment provincial allocations for the national roll-out. Another achievement in ensuring sanitary dignity for all was an announcement of the personal health care allowance of R275 for students, supported by the National Student Financial Aid Scheme.

As the former Minister of Women in the Presidency outlined in the same month on the occasion of the national Sanitary Dignity Programme launch. There's a very important matter of the economic value chain of the Sanitary Dignity Programme, Minister, which is the local economic development aspect wherein women who own and run manufacturing enterprises can be encouraged as well as women who own

co-operatives to occupy the space. This is already taking place in Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Free State and the Western Cape.

There are opportunities in manufacturing, storage, distribution and waste management. We call upon the newly-configured Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities to ensure that it begins the process of engaging relevant departments and stakeholders in ensuring that women, youth and people with disabilities find expression in the economic value chain of the projects of this nature.

In youth development, while the current Budget Vote 13 does not include a budget for youth, it is expected that the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities will soon receive the youth budget initially allocated to the Department for Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation which is R470,1 million. This reconfiguration will be reflected in the October Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS process, and ultimately find expression in the 2020 Budget. Among other things, will be the inclusion of budgets for National Youth Development programme which facilitates the development and implementation of national youth strategies and policies, as well as the National Youth Development Agency.

We implore the National Youth Development Agency, working with the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities, to speed up the amendment of the National Youth Development Agency Act of

2008. Furthermore, the NYDA should ensure provincial youth desks and other youth organisations are consulted in the process of amending this Act.

Lastly, we urge that all board vacancies at the NYDA should be filled as a matter of urgency. The board's term comes to an end in 2020; hence there will be seven vacancies to be filled.

The majority of young people in South Africa, like their 1976 counterparts, are finding it difficult to enter the labour market or start their own businesses because of skills deficit, marketing, access to finance and education challenges emanating from the legacy of apartheid.

The current government has developed policies, introduced programmes and has partnered with various private companies to help ensure that young people are not economically discriminated against but are able to enjoy the economic fruits of democracy. While certain departments are increasingly putting youth concerns at the heart of their development agenda, a lot more remains to be done.

During the state of the nation address post-2019 national elections, the President's speech noted various initiatives and challenges in relation to youth. He also highlighted the following seven priorities; economic transformation, job creation, education, skills, health, and consolidating the social wage through reliable

and quality basic services is another important priority. Spatial integration, human settlement, local government, social cohesion, safe communities, building a capable ethical and developmental state, better Africa and world are other key priorities.

He noted that all programmes and policies across all departments and agencies will be directed in pursuance of all these overarching priorities with the aim to improve the lives of all South Africans. These priorities have a direct impact on youth and their development. The new Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities must ensure that all programmes are informed by these priorities.

Isikhathi sesiphelile? Ngiyabonga. *(Translation of IsiZulu sentences follow.)*

[Has the time expired? Thank you.]

Mr L MPHITHI: Hon House Chairperson, hon Minister, hon Deputy Minister, the chair of the committee as well as the Western Cape Speaker of the legislature, good afternoon. In South Africa in every eight hours a woman is killed and half of these murders happen at the hands of the intimate partners. This makes South Africa's femicide rate five times higher than the global trends.

Youth unemployment is currently at an all-time high of 55,2% meaning the majority of young people in this country are unemployed. Youth unemployment is literally killing young people in this country. The national disability rate in South Africa stands at 7,5%. This is around 4,5 million people who continue to face the lack of opportunities and the lack of mainstreaming into South African society.

We are here today to say we are angry; we are tired of the lies we have been told and we are tired because we feel that things need to change. We are no longer accepting the lies we have been told. We are here because sidikiwe [we are fed up!] [Applause.] These are the sad realities that keep us up at night. So, hon Minister you can imagine my surprise, when I walked into the Committee of Women, Youth and People with Disabilities meeting where your departments makes a presentation and makes no mention of people living with disabilities in the country, and makes no mention of young people who do not have jobs in this country. You can only imagine my surprise but then how can I be surprised when the last committee's comments in the Fifth Parliament stated that:

The overall lack of understanding of the department's mandate is the key driver for poor performance we have.

So, I looked at the department's past five years' performance. I averaged the total targets met for each year for the past five years

and guess what it gave me, 44,9%. So, for the past five years this department has continued to fail to meet its targets. The biggest cost driver in this department stands at 57%, an amount of just over R91 million that has been set aside for the compensation of employees. What is devastating about this is that the department is spending more money on salaries and less on the programmes which are supposed to be on the ground with the most marginalised people in this society.

A further question that I have is why we are spending money on human capital if we cannot even meet the targets. Hon Chairperson, the programmes of this department are focused on the production of reports. Shockingly, most of them have cost centres attached to them. Yet, we are spending over R91 million on the compensation of employees. Do we not have skills in this department? At this stage, the committee, as it stands, does not even have the organogram or structure of the department as we requested last week. The targets of this department demonstrate the broad challenges that it continues to face. It cannot be that targets are measured by outputs and not outcomes. It cannot be that officials set targets on variables that they have full control over.

It cannot be that our officials do not set targets based on the impact that they have in our community. For example, how do you have a target that is producing a report for an entire year? For an entire, the department is producing a report. Can we be taken

seriously please? What we need to say is that this department has already spent R17 million on renting out three floors when it could be out in the communities working for the most marginalised people.

When will this department start taking its role in society? When will it realise that the struggle in our communities is a ruthless struggle where people face murder.

UMphathiswa uthi isebe malikhawuleze. Sikhawuleze njani Mphathiswa, nixakeke kukwenza iingxelo? (*Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.*)

[The hon Minister says the department must speed up. How can we do that, hon Minister, when you are struggling to do a report?]

It does not take an investigator to see that this department is on its knees, lost in a desert, and wondering without direction. But all is not lost. We urge the Minister to not only go back to a departmental strategic session, but to also go back to the realities of the most vulnerable people in our society.

Minister, women are dying in this country. They are dying because we as men are killing them. Young people are without jobs, and without dignity. Our people living with disabilities continue to be excluded each and every day. We have to do more. Our conscience cannot allow

us to allow the production of reports and focus on salaries in this department.

I would like to give you a few advises: Firstly, stop focusing on salaries and prioritize the programmes that the communities need in this country. Secondly, we know that this department has not been functioning well for the past two years because of transitional period. We urge you and your officials to please find those mitigating factors so that this department continues to function. Thirdly, the department has received the smallest appropriation of all departments in this country and this will impact on the work of the Commission on Gender Equality. So, we need to go back to Treasury and request an increase in the budget of this department. Fourthly, the department must quickly understand its mandate and the tangible deliverables it has. This means you need to go back and review your targets, strategic objectives and align the department to the issues that face people on the ground. Lastly, officials must come prepared to our committee meetings because we cannot correct reports in a committee meeting. If this continues...

... kuzoba lit! *(Translation of IsiXhosa phrase follows.)*

[There will be flames!] [Applause.]

In service to your country no one is above the people. We are not above the people of South Africa. Let us adopt humility and in doing

so, let us remember that this committee is going to change. Things are going to be shaken up. We are young and we are not going to allow ourselves to be undermined. We will hold these committees, the officials and all departmental officials accountable. We will do our job to ensure that the constituencies are respected. Amandla!

[Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Table staff if you can manage to keep space for the members from this side on one desk here. There is a chair there. Members from this side, can you occupy that chair if you are going to speak. Thank you very much. The EFF has split their minutes so do not be surprised. Continue, madam.

Nksk N P SONTI: Sihlalo weNdlu, ndiyanibulisa nonke kule Ndlu.

(Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.)

[Mrs N P SONTI: Hon Chairperson of the House, I greet you all in this House.]

Minister, if we are to be honest, this budget allocation is a disgrace and we will not support it. The only thing it does is reflect what little concern your government has for women, youth and persons with disabilities. Even when the budget of this department was only meant to address issues facing women, it was not enough. But lack of budget is only half the problem. This department does not have a plan, and on top of that is led by incompetent individuals

who lack the will and energy to transform society. Gender-based violence is one of the greatest ills affecting our society. Every day you hear stories of women getting raped and murdered. At home, at the workplace, on public transport and at school, the women of South Africa live in constant fear of men.

While we acknowledge that the Department cannot by itself fight the epidemic of gender-based violence in this country, the reality is that even with its limited resources and responsibilities there is a lot more this department could be doing. I will now present to you a number of programmes and policies your department should be advocating for as found in the EFF election manifesto. So I hope you are listening Minister and that your pen is ready.

Minister, South Africa's judicial system from the police to the courts is not equipped to deal with the scale of gender-based violence taking place. Therefore, it is important for your department to engage, work with, and make proposals to the Minister of Police. The starting point of your engagements should be that all police stations must have a DNA testing kit so that DNA samples can be taken from rape victims the moment the crime is reported. One of the main reasons why we have such a low conviction rate is because police do not have evidence to make convictions. Secondly, it was recently revealed to us by the Minister of Police that in the entire country, for the over 1 100 police stations, there are only 114 counsellors and 202 social workers. Everyday women young and old

come to the police to report rape and abuse. These women need to receive counselling. How do you expect a child to provide a statement to the police if they have not even been counselled?

Sendiza kugqiba Sihlalo weNdlu. Liphi ela iphepha? (*Translation of IsiXhosa sentences follows.*)

[I am about to conclude, House Chairperson. Where is that paper?]

In addition to counsellors we need to train police on how to properly deal with victims of sexual and gender-based violence. Often the police are insensitive and do not handle evidence and statements correctly. That is why all police must receive compulsory gender education training, and a specialised law enforcement unit must be established to specifically deal with women-related crimes. Minister, if you want to see an improvement in the lives of women, you will take the advice I have given you and begin to engage the Minister of Police on these interventions that the EFF has come up with. I thank you.

Ms M D HLENGWA: Hon Minister, hon Chairperson and comrades, women have always formed a part of the most marginalised group of people in South Africa and sadly not a lot has changed today. In South Africa women have had a battle to receive equality and safety which still leaves much to be desired despite our Constitution that

enriches woman empowerment and gender equality. Yet our budget has always seemed to let women down.

Impela impela lesi sabiwomali asisiphethe kahle thina njengabantu besifazane futhi asisenzeli lutho. (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[Surely this budget does not sit well with us as women and it does nothing for us.]

We have a Women's Day and as well as the entire month dedicated to the protection of women's rights, prevention to violence against women and children and yet, little or nothing has been effectively done to reduce the assault and rape cases reported each year. Each year women report cases but nothing has been done, even today there are cases.

While the actual size of the gap differs based on individual study characteristics, research consistently shows a notable difference in what women and men take home. Women have very little opportunities to change their own situations as we found that women are still marginalised in many sectors. Women living in rural areas are the backbone of the family, communities and rural economy. They continue to demonstrate tremendous resilience in the face of multidimensional poverty and inequality.

The health system in South Africa is in a terrible state. We see ambulances being hijacked and first respondents being murdered senselessly. Government is failing in their primary task of providing security to the people of this country. It has become so bad that we are starting to feel it in our health systems. For example, earlier year a video went viral where an elderly sick woman was tied up in the Mamelodi Hospital and left on the floor to suffer. As a woman I am disgusted by the treatment of another woman. This type of behaviour and standard of treatment has become all too common in South Africa and we as the IFP will not accept this.

Women need to be able to access professionally-run clinics 24 hours and seven days a week. If a woman is assaulted, she must be able to have access to safe and reliable public transport at all times. Furthermore, the IFP calls for actual involvement by government in the task of educating young girls and women to curb the scourge of teenage and youth pregnancies. Women commonly face obstacles in various business sectors and sometimes even experience financial and emotional abuse. Construction, for example, is extremely male dominated and it is rare to find a woman as a principal contractor.

Government, through the education departments, must assist and promote education of these sectors where women are lacking in representation. It is our duty as South Africans to ensure that women's rights are protected, their privacy is respected and we live

up to women who sacrificed their lives for the freedom we can all enjoy today, men and women like.

The IFP pledges its support for this budget. However, the reality is that the budget we are debating today is simply not enough. If we do not start addressing the lack of adequate funding for the empowerment of our women, debates like these will remain empty rhetoric. [Time expired.]

Me T BREEDT: Agb Voorsitter, alle oorspronklikheid en verskeidenheid is verdring in 'n doodse alledaagse groef. Wie weet watter talentvolle vroue Afrika al kon gehad het, was dit nie vir die verlamme, dodende idee wat hier heers omtrent wat 'n meisie en vrou moet wees nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.*)

[Ms T BREEDT: Hon Chairperson, all originality and variety has been suppressed in a general deadly groove. Who knows what talented women Africa could have produced, were it not for the crippling, deadly prevailing idea about the status of a girl and a woman.]

[Interjections.]]

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms L S Makhubela-Mashele): Hon members, please do not drown the speaker. [Interjections.]

Daar is woorde wat reeds in 1921 deur die eerste Afrikaner feminis geskryf is. *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.)*

[There are words that were already written in 1921 by the first Afrikaner feminist.]

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms L S Makhubela-Mashele): Hon members, you can use your earphones to hear the translation. You can then choose the language that you are comfortable with.

Marie du Toit, of te wel, Totius, die digter, se suster, het hierdie wyse woorde 100 jaar gelede genoem. *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.)*

[Marie du Toit, or rather, the sister of the poet Totius, spoke these wise words 100 years ago.]

They still ring true today. Women have been marginalised through the centuries. Women have been discriminated against and today, it is not different.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Uxolo Sihlalo! Uxolo! uXolo, ngokukhulu ukuzihlonipha, nawe ngiyakuhlonipha esihlalweni, lana asikho isiZulu. *(Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.)*

[Pardon me, Chairperson! Pardon! Pardon, with due respect as well as that of your position, there is no isiZulu interpreting here.]

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms L S Makhubela-Mashele): Hon members, as you continue with the channels ...

USIHLALO OYIBAMBA (Nk L S Makhubela-Mashele): ... Uzosithola isiZulu mama. Qhubeka nokubheka, uzosithola. Sikhona isiZulu. Hambisa amachanells uzoze usithole isiZulu ma. (*Translation of isiZulu sentences follows.*)

[The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms L S Makhubela-Mashele):... there will be an isiZulu interpreting madam. Continue searching, you will find it. There is isiZulu interpreting. Search the channels until you find the isiZulu interpreting, madam.]

Hon members, let us allow the speaker to continue and let us not make unnecessary points of order. [Interjections.]

Dr C P MULDER: Hon Chairperson, on a point of order: Every member is entitled to use the language of his or her choice and that is why we have the translation services. So, I would appeal to the House to allow ... [Inaudible.]

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms L S Makhubela-Mashele): You are protected, hon member. Allow the hon member to finish his point before you interject.

Dr C P MULDER: Thank you. I would like to ask the House Chairperson to allow the hon member to deliver her speech. It is her maiden speech and she is entitled to do it in the language that she prefers. Other languages were also used today. If there is a problem with the translation services, then the Table staff should take note of that and rectify it.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Chairperson, no we must sort it out - the interpreting. Ms Khawula is a Member of Parliament and she deserves to know what is happening in the debate. She is a member of this committee. So, we cannot take the decision that she must just wait without knowing what is happening in the debate. So, the Table staff must sort it out.

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms L S Makhubela-Mashele): Okay, the Table staff is assisting us to check with the translation services, but English is available. We are checking the other languages.

Ms T BREEDT: This department is an extremely important department and it cannot strive for cosmetic equality, but should rather focus on true equality and addressing societal barriers that women currently face.

Die VF Plus ondersteun vroueregte, maar weet dat dit in die praktyk slegs verwesenlik kan word deur die bemagtiging van vroue deur opleiding en die skep van gelyke geleenthede. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.*)

[The FF Plus supports women's rights, but knows that this can only be achieved in practice by empowering women through training and creating equal opportunities.]

There are a number of concerns when examining the department's budget and annual performance plan, APP. Taking into consideration that this is the smallest budget of all the departments, and the payments to entities, you cannot spend 57% of its allocated budget on salaries and not on the necessary projects for women, youth and people with disabilities. This department needs to be more frugal with its finances.

Taking this into account, I am especially worried about the Sanitary Dignity project. It has apparently been launched in KwaZulu-Natal and has two more pilot projects elsewhere. I come from the Free State and the Free State is somewhat confused, I have to admit. It has a number of departments handling this project, but it is without clear definition as to what it is set out to accomplish. The necessary departmental indicators are not yet at the implementation stage. According to the APP, consultation sessions will only take

place in the fourth quarter. The framework is still in the process of being finalised.

With every month, quarter and financial year that this project does not see the light of day, at least 30% of South African learners are missing school for at least five days of every single month. I do have to admit, good work has been done in terms of sanitary products becoming VAT free, but that is not enough. More needs to be done.

Agb Voorsitter, daar moet daadwerklike aktivisme in terme van geweld teen vroue en kinders wees. Meeste slagoffers van verkragting, molestering en huishoudelike geweld is weens intimidasie, te bang om hierdie voorvalle aan te meld. In baie gevalle skiet die polisie se hantering ... [Onhoorbaar.] ... te kort en word slagoffers nie beskerm nie.

Die strafregstelsel laat ook baie slagoffers in die steek, veral met betrekking tot die wyse waarop daar van slagoffers verwag word om in 'n oophof te getuig of selfs hul verkragters in persoon uit te ken. As gevolg van swak hantering van sake, leemtes in die oordrag van dossiere, die onvolledigheid van ondersoeke, die integriteit van bewysstukke en getuienisse wat nie behoorlik en met die nodige sorg hanteer word nie, is vervolging in hierdie sake dikwels onsuksesvol.

Hierdie tekorte in die stelsel lei tot die lae aanmeldingsyfer van hierdie misdrywe en daarom is baie seksuele oortreders steeds op vrye voet.

Die VF Plus ondersteun maatreëls wat daarop gemik is om vroue en kinders, meeskwesbare landsburgers te beskerm teen mishandeling en misbruik. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.*)

[Hon Chairperson, there must be real activism in terms of violence against women and children. Most of the victims of rape, molestation and domestic violence are too scared to report these incidents due to intimidation. In many instances the handling of these cases by the police is inadequate... [Inaudible.] ... and the victims are not being protected.

The criminal justice system also fails many victims, especially with regard to the way in which victims are expected to testify in open court or even to identify their rapists in person. Due to the poor handling of cases, gaps in the transfer of files, the incompleteness of investigations, the integrity of evidence and testimonies that are not handled properly and with due care, prosecution in these cases is often unsuccessful.

These deficiencies regarding the system result in the low reporting rate of these offenses and therefore many sexual offenders are still at large.

The FF Plus supports measures aimed at protecting women and children, the most vulnerable citizens, from mistreatment and abuse.]

The President announced that the police and courts will be capacitated to support victims of gender-based violence and this cannot remain ... [Inaudible.] Minister, you mentioned that this department must play a pivotal role in the interdepartmental co-operation and I would like to see this done.

Verder is die begroting ontoereikend, wanneer in ag geneem word dat jeug en persone met gestremdhede ook nou bygevoeg is, en daardie addisionele bevoegdhede word nie in aanmerking gebring nie.

Mense met gestremdhede moet bemagtig word met toepaslike opleiding en hul regte moet beskerm word. Blinde en dowe persone se toegang tot onderwys en kommunikasie by staatsinstellings in braille en gebaretaal moet prioriteit geniet. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.*)

[Furthermore, the budget is insufficient, considering that the youth and people with disabilities have also been added, and those additional skills needed are not taken into account.

People with disabilities must be empowered with appropriate training and their rights must be protected. Priority should be given to

blind and deaf persons' access to education and communication at state institutions with regard to Braille and sign language.]

Hon Chairperson, and hon female colleagues -there are many of you here today - we need to stop allowing ourselves to be reduced to merely a quota in a party because we will never have true power. This will never allow us to become truly equal. It is condoning marginalisation and it is accepting the myth that women are inferior or even equal to men, because, hon female colleagues, we are far greater.

South African women, throughout the ages, have proved to be extremely resilient. We, as South African women, need to stand together and fight for equal opportunities and equal rights for all. Thank you. I just want to apologise to hon Khawula and the rest of the ladies who did not understand my Afrikaans. I hope it will be sorted out.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES IN THE PRESIDENCY: Good afternoon hon Minister. I would also like to acknowledge the Chairperson and all hon members, especially members of the portfolio committee. To the people that are in the gallery, I would like to say, malibongwe! I would also like to acknowledge Mme Mandu Ramakaba, one of our veterans who are here. If you look at the mandate of this department, we owe a lot to the people who went through the struggle before us, like Mme Ramakaba.

A lot has been said about the 25 years of our democracy and the achievements thereof. Nevertheless, we still have institutionalised patriarchy and its related social ills, youth unemployment and lack of economic inclusion for persons with disabilities. There are tangible interventions that the department has come up with, like the Gender-Responsive Planning and Budgeting. We will continue to monitor, enable and support the realisation of the impact of such policies.

The President, hon Ramaphosa, during his state of the nation address, Sona, spoke about seven prioritises. I think it is important to touch on a few of those, since others have been mentioned. I will limit myself to economic transformation and job creation. Chairperson, in order for us to make significant gains in creating an inclusive economy, we need to have a paradigm shift. Persons with disabilities, women and youth are not looking for hand-outs - they cannot continue increasing the social wage - but recognition for their skills, talents and most importantly an opportunity to contribute to the growth of the economy and to attain economic independence.

That will be one of our priorities, in partnership with our sister departments like the Department of Trade and Industry. This is to ensure that the incentives programmes - the tax - that the department gives to multinationals benefits these groups. They have been beneficiaries for too long. I'm going to mention some of the

programs that the Department of Trade and Industry believes have made a significant contribution since their inception, like Insimbi and Global Business Services Incentive, GBS.

With regard to the question of young people in particular, we will continue to look at some of the programmes, like to track the youth employment services which aims to place 50 000 people in the work place to gain paid work experience. We are looking at sustainability and there are quite a number of programmes that had been initiated. I know many of us have not followed the work of the Harambee Group. Mention has been made of the NYDA, but I think what is unique about that programme is the training which is closely linked to work experience.

Those are some of the things that we will pursue, support and ensure that we form partnership with them as the need arises. There are a few young people who have made it. I would like to make mention of Kgothatso Montjane who is a 33-year old professional wheelchair tennis player. She became the first black South African woman to compete at Wimbledon. For me, this is an example that, if we pursue the right policies and their implementation, our people with disabilities are capable and can compete fairly.

Chairperson, we are proud to announce that South Africa became the third signatory to the Protocol of the African Charter on Human and People's Rights and the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in

Africa, in April 2019. We did that, mainly because, we are not happy with the target that we have set for ourselves. Two percent of work is not enough.

I want to quickly move to the priority of education, skills and health. Again we have heard the speakers. We have our universities but we need to reflect on what more do we have to do to make sure that we do not put in so much money but still talk of unemployment. One other thing we need to do is to really look at sustainability of offers and opportunities that our young people get, because if they are not sustainable, then they are not helping.

I would also like to mention another intervention that was mentioned by the President, which is the launch of the Fourth Industrial Revolution Commission. It will go a long way. The World Economic Forum has studies which clearly show that young once people are exposed to artificial intelligence, have access to Wi-Fi and there are policies to cut the cost of data, they are able to flourish. They innovate, come up with special applications and become entrepreneurs; they get involved in all kinds services on their own, without focusing so much on what government can offer them.

On Social Cohesion and Safe Communities, a lot has been said about the crises of gender-based violence in our country. In this country we have to tackle what activists have been struggling with. In 2011, the LGBTQ+ activist and member of the Ekurhuleni Pride Organising

Committee, Noxolo Nogwaza lost her life due to her sexual orientation. It cannot be that in a democratic era, we keep quiet when people's rights are undermined to that extent. We remember her and we will speak on her behalf and many others who continue to be harassed.

With regard to violence against women, yesterday, I witnessed the signing of a partnership between Sefako Makgatho Health Science University and the University of Nottingham. The idea is to ensure that we use scientific evidence to see what the bottlenecks are in the system, which continue to puzzle us when so much has been put in and there are policies in place. It's more than just saying that there is no goodwill. I think we need to learn what it is that needs to be done in order to advance on this matter.

The challenge before us is immense. I will not endeavour to commit that our department, working alone, will respond to all of the pressing needs facing women, youth and persons with disabilities. The reconfiguration of the department gives us an opportunity to revisit our family status, parenting structures, resocializing a boy child, so that our department's approach will look at tackling all these social ills, from a firm foundation of family values. We can however get to work; we can begin to change the manner in which we do things which start with recognizing that as government we do not have all the answers. Through social compact and partnership, I think it is doable

In closing, I would like to acknowledge the courage of Mme Charlotte Maxeke who obtained her graduate studies in the USA, becoming the first African woman to complete a science degree. She also led campaigns against the Native Land Act, and she defended family life and values by leading campaigns that chased men out of beer halls so that they could go and spend time with their families. I think this department has what is required to take this struggle of gender equality forward. Thank you. [Applause.]

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms L S Makhubela-Mashele): We call upon hon M E Sukers. [Interjections.] Hon members, can I also inform you that this is the maiden speech of hon M Sukers.

Ms M E SUKERS: Chairperson and hon members of the House, the ACDP congratulate the Minister on her appointment and we wish her well. As part of the many first-time female members of this House, we stand on the shoulders of many women who have paved the way for us, in particular for the ACDP; we recognise the significant contributions made by our very own Cheryllyn Dudley who retired this year after an exemplary career in Parliament. She was the first member of an opposition party to have a Private Member's Bill passed in this House.

Hon Minister, in South Africa we applaud ourselves on the progress made to improve gender inequality as it relates to women. We see ourselves as a society that celebrates women, and yes we have done

so. But today, 25 years after the birth of our democracy, South Africa is one of the most dangerous places in the world to raise a girl child. The levels of inequality and poverty have contributed to the increased vulnerability of women and children. Violence perpetrated against them has reached unacceptable levels. I am concerned that there is a disparity between the laws that protect women and the removal of perpetrators who commit violence against women. Women are forced to face their perpetrators daily or worse, live in the same houses as them.

While the department is said to have performed much better compared to the first quarter, it only managed to achieve 60% of its targets; this despite the additional R18,3 million allocation. It is concerning that the administration programme receives the greatest proportion of the budget and has the highest proportion of staff. However, the core mandated activities, social transformation and economic empowerment has the smallest budget and the fewest number of staff. It is rightly asked whether this department could achieve goals set under this programme. The progress on the development and implementation of frameworks has taken too long and impedes the ability of the department to execute its mandate.

For example, the ACDP has been urging government for years to respond adequately to the plight of women with special housing needs and people with disabilities. The policy has been waiting for over 20 years for approval. Safe housing will improve the lives of the

most vulnerable women in our nation and provide safety to those women who need it most to regain their dignity. Economic disparity limits the choices that women have regarding their safety, education and that of their children.

The ACDP supports the strategic objectives of the department and we have noticed the improvement but we question the ability of the department to deliver on its expanded mandate. We do not have another 25 years to get things right; the need is now, and it is immediate. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms L S Makhubela-Mashele): Hon N K Sharif. Hon members, can it also be noted that this is the maiden speech of the hon Sharif.

Ms N K SHARIF: Hon House Chairperson, hon Minister, Deputy Minister, committee chairperson, and all hon members, all protocol observed. The budget allocation to the Commission for Gender Equality of R85,2 million is too low. In fact, the R4,8 million decrease in Budget Vote 13 for the Department of Women's core work in programme two is unacceptable. The Commission for Gender Equality is performing relatively well, mostly because it's an independent Chapter 9 institution. However, the fact that it is the least funded entity says a lot about where government's focus lies.

It goes without saying that the funding to the Commission for Gender Equality must be increased, as they seem to be doing more work than the department and would be able to put the money to better use as they actually work with people on the ground. The Commission for Gender Equality is inundated with cases from the public on various matters and struggles to close off these cases due to the lack of budget, staff and the inability to appoint commissioners. The Commission for Gender Equality also struggles with the overarching gender machinery for national key performance indicators, KPIs, as well as the lack of funding for gender-based violence. How can we expect the Commission for Gender Equality to do its job when you fail to provide the necessary funding and resources? It is almost impossible for provincial commissioners to reach rural areas from urban centres when there are not enough resources. This means that the Commission for Gender Equality is unable to fulfil and deliver on its mandate. The funding model must be revisited because we are directly impeding on the work of the Commission for Gender Equality. When your department's core function is to ensure a just and equal society for women, youth and persons with disabilities, how is it possible that the most important part of the department's work is underfunded and undercapacitated? This while the majority of the total budget goes towards the compensation of employees and the provision of goods and services?

I mean really hon Minister, how is it possible that the department is prioritising money for travel and subsistence when there are

women, nonbinary persons, children and persons living with disabilities struggling every single day? I would like to reiterate my concerns regarding the lack of programmes, initiatives and frameworks aimed at the lesbian, gay, bisexual, trans, intersex, queer, asexual, other diverse sexual orientations and gender identities, LGBTIQ+ community, and that is how you say it. As an ally, I will continue to raise my concerns regarding the lack of priority by national government to assist and ensure a safe and equal society for all.

The Sanitary Drive Project is also of concern. The project seems to be somewhat of a tick box exercise and has taken much too long to roll out. The department must start looking at reusable sanitary products for sustainability, the environment and most importantly to reach more people, and if you know, that is not only women in that Ministry ... [Inaudible.] The department's continued excuse that reusable sanitary products need to be SA Bureau of Standards, SABS, approved, will no longer suffice. I call on the Minister to speed up the process to get the project going. The Presidency and the department argue that they take gender-based violence and femicide seriously but, hon Minister, you are being disingenuous because the programmes aimed at fighting this are, again, underfunded and undercapacitated. The National Council on Gender-Based Violence, as set out in the Annual Performance Plan will take a whole year to establish, another year to develop a strategy, and will only be implemented in 2021.

This country does not have two more years for the government to be shuffling its feet. We need intervention now and these needs to be a priority. I am not convinced that the work of the department is focused on its vision and the mission that is worded with pretty terms and wrapped together with our hopes and dreams. It is all just rhetoric. Actions speak louder than words and right now, the department's actions are almost nonexistent. The DA will, "dala what it must" [do what it has to] and we will hold you accountable. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sanibonani, Ngqongqoshe, njengezwe asivumelane ukuthi akekho umuntu ophila nokukhubazeka okumele abe hlwempu, engabi nekhaya, okanye ahlale emkhukhwini noma emgaqweni. Asivumelane ngokuthi umnyango kumele uqoqe imininingwane yabo bonke abantu abaphila nokukhubazeka zingakapheli izinyanga eziyisithupha ukuze bathole ukusizakala ngekwezidingo zabo, umuntu nomuntu, ngokwezidingo zakhe ezifanele yena. Masibakhele izindlu singakapheli isikhathi esingangonyaka Bangingi abantu abaphila nokukhubazeka abafunde ngokwenele, futhi abasesimeni sokuthi bengasebenza emikhakheni abayifundele kodwa abangasebenzi.

Uhulumeni makavule amathuba basebenze. Uma izinkampani ezizimele zingafuni ukubaqasha, uHulumeni makaqinisekise ukuthi uyena kanye obaqashayo ngaphansi kwakhe ngqo Hhulumeni zingakapheli izinyanga eziyisithupha. Uhulumeni makaqinisekise ukuthi uma sebeqashiwe baholelwa ngendlela egculisayo futhi nezikhungo abasebenzela kuzo

zihambisana nezidingo zabo eziyisipesheli. Uhulumeni makaqinisekise ukuthi ingakapheli iminyaka emibili, zonke izikhungo zinabantu abaqeqeshiwe, abakwazi ukuxhumana nokuthi bakwazi ukuthola izidingo zabo kanjalo izindlu namahhovisi kube amahhovisi abavumelayo. Ukuthi bakhubazekile.

Bonke abadinga izihlalo ezihambayo mabazithole ngokushesha ukuze bakwazi ukusizakala noma yinini uma bedinga usizo. Izindawo zezithuthi zomphakathi - njengeziteshi zezitimela, amabhasi, amarenki amatekisi njalo njalo – mazibe nezindawo zokuhamba izihlalo zabaphila nokukhubazeka ukuze nabo bekwazi ukusebenzisa izithuthi zomphakathi. Lokhu kuyaphuthuma kakhulu. Kuyimanje kunezibhedlela kanye nezikole ezingenazo izindlu zangasese ezakhelwe abanezidingo eziyisipesheli. Lapho kudicilelwa phansi izithunzi zabo ngoba izindlu zangasese zakhelwe abaphila kahle. [Kwaphela isikhathi.] Kulungile ngiyabonga. Ngqongqoshe, okokugcina, ngicela uhambe uye eMlaza, izitimela zigcwele nabantu besifazane bayahlukumezeka. NaKwamashu nezisuka eMlaza, phuthuma, musa ukuhlala Ngqongqoshe. [Ubuwelewele.] *(Translation of isiZulu speech follows.)*

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Greetings to you all. Minister, let us agree as the country that no person living with disability is supposed to be poor, homeless, stay in a shack or on the streets. Let us agree that the department should collect details of all people living with disabilities before the end of six months so that they can receive assistance according to their needs individually - assistance that

suits them individually. Let us build them houses within a period of a year. There are many people living with disabilities who are learned enough to be also in the position of being employed in the sectors in which they are trained but are not employed.

The government must make job opportunities for them to work. And if the private sector does not want to employ them, the government must ensure that it employs them itself within the period of six months. The government must ensure that once they are employed they are remunerated in a satisfactory manner and that their work places are suitable for their conditions. The government must ensure that before the period of two years come to an end, all the institutions have trained people who can communicate and are able to acquire their needs; and that their houses and offices are suitable for their conditions as they are living with disabilities.

All those who need wheelchairs must get them as a matter of urgency so that they can receive assistance at any time they need it. Public transport facilities - like train stations, buses, taxi ranks etcetera - must have wheelchair ramps so that they too can be able to use public transport. This is a great emergency. As we speak now, there are hospitals and schools that do not have ablution facilities that are suitable for people with special needs. That taints their dignity because the ablution facilities suit people with no disabilities. [Time expired.] It is fine, thank you. One last thing Minister, I request you to go to uMlazi, where trains are full and

women are being harassed; even in KwaMashu and in those that are coming from uMlazi. Hurry, and do not even sit down, Minister.

[Interjections.] [Time expired.] [Applause.]]

Ms B MALULEKE: Hon Chairperson, Hon Minister, Deputy Minister, hon members, ladies and gentlemen, good afternoon. Hon Chairperson, it has been the strong political commitment of the ANC-led government to craft gender-sensitive legislation and policies that will promote empowerment and equality. It is against this backdrop, that the main goal of the ANC is to radically transform the socioeconomic status of women, youth and persons with disabilities.

Implementation of radical socioeconomic programmes can be achieved through, the transformation agenda of state institutions and monitoring of policies. Chairperson, South Africa has signed and ratified many regional and international treaties, such as the Beijing Platform for Action, the African Youth Charter in order to realise its mandate and the United Nations convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities. In the President 2019 state of the nation address, the President highlighted the importance of the NDP.

The National Development Plan stresses utilisation of public resources for the socioeconomic empowerment of women, youth, persons with disabilities and promotion of gender equality. In order to realize this, the Vision 2030, we have to ensure women including rural women, youth and persons with disabilities are active

participants in our economy and must be prioritised by decision-makers.

Hon Chairperson, there is a need to strengthen women, youth and persons with disabilities' skills capacity and networks to benefit from policies and programmes within the economic sectors, and increase the access for finance to them.

Women continue to suffer tremendous challenges in accessing land.

Mmagorena, Mme Maite Nkoana-Mashabane ba re mphiri o tee ga o lle.

(Translation of Sepedi sentence follows.)

[Madam Maite Nkoana-Mashabane, it is said that one bracelet alone cannot make a sound.]

So, it means the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities will need to collaborate with the Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural development. This collaboration should consider how women can gain assistance with organising their economic activities, such as farming cooperatives, or microfinance groups. We also have to find ways of ensuring that widows and women in the rural areas have access to communal land which is under custodianship of traditional leaders.

Measuring informal activity is useful, but its importance is limited, if it is excluded from the international definition of "work." Informal trading has been the backbone of our economy. Therefore, collaboration with the Department of Labour, Department of Small Business Development and local municipalities can empower trading owned by women, youth and persons with disabilities. Start

We commend the work done by the Commission for Gender Equality. However, this Chapter 9 institution must continue to provide services that are visible to people living in the most rural areas. This is where the CGE services are mostly needed. We call on the department to ensure that there is a balanced allocation of budget. That the APP follows the principle of smart targets which means that they must be specific, measurable, achievable, realistic and time bound. During the briefing by the department, the committee noted with concern that the key performance indicators in the APP for 2019-20 were not smart and lacked the requisite details to effectively hold the department accountable. In addition, it was noted that the indicators only measured outputs and not outcomes. This is a new department, Madam Minister and we have an opportunity to ensure that all targets set are indeed smart, and benefit all women, youth and persons with disabilities.

In closing Chairperson, we commend the ANC-led government in introducing a national minimum wage, which will improve livelihoods of women, youth and persons with disabilities. However, having

mentioned all challenges, women, youth and persons with disabilities must also be applauded for their resilience. It is in this regard that they should play key roles in determining how national budgets are prioritised, so that their core rights that affect them the most are effectively realised.

Chairperson, the ANC supports Budget Vote 13 with recommendations made. I thank you. [Applause.]

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms L S Makhubela-Mashele): Order, hon members!

Ms M S KHAWULA: Point of order, Chairperson, ...

Ngabe yisesontweni yini manje sase sibona abafundisi manje?
Sesididekile. (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[Is this a church, why do we see ministers of religion in here now?
We are confused.]

The ACTING CHAIRPERSON (Ms L S Makhubela-Mashele): That is not a point of order, hon member. I would like to inform the House that it is also the maiden speech of the hon Ngcobo, hon members.

Mr S K NGCOBO: House Chairperson, hon Minister, hon Deputy Minister and hon members, good afternoon.

The late Irish poet, W B Yeats, once wrote:

Turning and turning in the widening gyre. The falcon cannot hear
the falconer; things fall apart; the centre cannot hold.

I can think of no better way to describe the dire situation in the
Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities than these
poetic words.

Everything in this department seems to be falling apart and there
seems to be no realistic and detailed plan to ensure that the
department has what it takes to deliver on its mandate. If one looks
at its annual performance plan and key performance indicators, it
becomes crystal clear that the department is not fit enough to
deliver on its mandate.

Mr T V MASHELE: Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, hon member,
wait. Order, hon members! I will tell her what she must do, please!
Hon member, can I help you?

Mr T V MASHELE: Is the member willing to take a question?

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (M S M S Boroto): Hon members!

[Interjections.] Hon members! [Laughter.] Hon members, I am here to respond to the member not you. Please stop it. Hon member, in the maiden speech we become mild and we don't do that.

Mr T V MASHELE: Are you a woman chief?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (MS M S Boroto): Continue hon member, your clock was stopped. Hon members allow us to do our work.

Mr S K NGCOBO: In particular, under Programme 3, the department says that it has concluded a 25-year review to assess the country's progress in advancing the quality of life for women, yet the Presidential Review Committee on Women Empowerment and Gender Equality has just begun another 25-year review. Therefore, the status of the department's 25-year review and its role in the Presidential Review Committee remain unclear.

This department has also indicated that there will be social campaigns and community dialogues to advance the socioeconomic empowerment of women, but it has not been clear with regard to what the desired impact of these campaigns and dialogues will be.

House Chairperson, now that this department includes one of the most vulnerable groups in society, namely, persons with disabilities, it must be noted that they still face a number of challenges in this

country that hamper their ability to climb the ladder of socioeconomic empowerment.

According to a research done by the SA Human Rights Commission on disability and equality in South Africa during the period 2013 to 2017, persons with disabilities are still marginalised and have not been capacitated enough to fully participate in society. They still face different forms of discrimination in various spheres, including access to health care services, education, economic opportunities and employment.

Allow me to share with you a very painful story of Mama Nomzamo from the Eastern Cape, who lives with a disability after she was hit by a car and crippled. Mama Nomzamo depends solely on her social grant to take care of her five grandchildren. In her own words she said,

It really pains me that I do not have a wheelchair. My knees are sore it feels like they have been broken from the inside. I used to be fresh and vibrant, but now I feel like a loner and I am ashamed of myself.

Painful stories such as this one indicate that the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities still has a mountain to climb in addressing the challenges faced by people with disabilities in South Africa.

Now is the time for Minister Maite Nkoana-Mashabane and her department to commit themselves to their jobs to ensure that life is made easier for our women, youth and persons with disabilities. I thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, the time I am wasting now is because we have a conversion in this House. The hon Shaik Emam cannot just speak after the DA and the ANC, unless he gets permission from the Whips. So, unfortunately they do not agree because usually they tell us. Let me just say it now. If you have fewer members that run around, you just inform the Table so that we put you towards the end and arrangements are made for you when you come back. So, when you just come in and they have already spoken it becomes a problem for us.

We want everybody to speak, but necessary arrangements have to be made. I am just saying it even for tomorrow. Thank you very much. No, wait. Hon members, I was just passing the message. We now call on the Whip for the Committee on Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities to take the stage. [Applause.]

Order hon members! Order! Most of our members here are doing their maiden speech. So, let us respect them!

Ms F A MASIKO: Hon Chairperson, hon members, hon Minister and Deputy Minister, guest in the gallery, *molweni, sanibonani* and good afternoon.

Hon Chairperson, in dealing with the budget today, we must firstly commend the work that has been done by the Committee on Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities under the chairpersonship of the hon Nonhlanhla Ncube-Ndaba. This hon Chairperson is attested by my hon members on the left who have time and again quoted most of the resolutions of the committee. It does show that the committee has done good work. [Applause.]

Hon members and fellow South Africans the issue of gender-based violence must never be used for sloganeering and finger pointing. All of us must rise above our political ideological differences so that we can find common solutions. As we know violence knows no colour or party line. Singing and howling can never solve our problems that we are currently facing. [Applause.]

Ngisho lokho mam' uKhawula. (*Translation of IsiZulu sentence follows.*)

[That is what I am saying madam Khawula.]

Hon members and Chairperson, equality is the foundation for equitable and inclusive sustainable development, which will never

take place if half the population is left behind. Providing women, youth and persons with disabilities equal opportunities and access to education, health care, decent work, representation in political and economic decision-making processes will fuel sustainable economies and benefit us all

As this budget debate unfolds, we should bear in our minds that at this very moment, in every part of the world from the sleepy towns and villages to gigantic cities, children are being born. As these children grow into young men and women, they will be looking up to us as elders and leaders for guidance on what their hopes, dreams and responsibilities will be in this world.

They will also look up to us for direction because, before they even reach the age of 10, they could have possibly faced some intersecting disadvantages because of their age, gender, ethnic background, sexual identity, religious affiliation, income, disability and other compounding factors. They would have also seen blatant disparities between men and women, young and old in terms of wealth, job opportunities and respect.

Hon Chairperson, in trying to guide the young, we must be brutally honest. We must give them a full picture of their struggle globally, but most importantly their struggles within the borders of South Africa. We must be able to tabulate what we as the country have done or been able to achieve and also be frank about what we still have

to accomplish in addressing gender oppression, patriarchy, sexism, racism, structural oppression, youth unemployment and creating a conducive environment which enables the most vulnerable to take control of their lives.

Chairperson and hon members, it is often forgotten that women, youth and persons with disabilities are sources of power. They have the power to survive, power to prevent, power to reduce risk and power for resilience and transformation. This is the power that the recently-formed Ministry for the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities must evoke and tap into. In all these areas women have risen to greatness and power by utilising available resources and increasing their influence in the decision-making.

The Freedom Charter supports this when it states:

Our country will never be prosperous or free until all our people live in brotherhood, enjoying equal rights and opportunities that only a democratic state, based on the will of the people, can secure to all their birthright without distinction of colour, race sex or belief.

It is an undeniable fact that under this government's leadership, South Africa has in the past 25 years rolled its sleeves, and enacted a raft of legislations and programmes to empower women, youth and persons with disabilities.

Hon members, firstly, we can all recall that, we have registered tremendous improvements in national, provincial and local governments and many other sectors such as traditional leadership councils. Women are now represented in many traditional councils, something that was unheard of before the year 1994. [Applause.]

The ANC-led government has done tremendous work to ensure the redress as far as women empowerment and emancipation is concerned.

Secondly, the ANC-led government has worked hard in ensuring that land ownership by women remains on its agenda. The gender profile provides evidence that considerable progress has been made concerning women's access to land across the country.

Thirdly, South Africa is a signatory to the African Youth Charter, adopted in May 2006 and endorsed by the African Union heads of state in the same year. It has identified the following priorities: Education, skills and competence development, employment and sustainable livelihoods, youth leadership and participation, health and welfare, peace and stability, environmental protection, and cultural and moral values.

In his state of the nation address the President noted that in terms of creating employment and other economic opportunities, we must strengthen the social wage and reduce the cost of living.

Furthermore, the National Development Plan's vision is to reduce

unemployment rate to 6% by 2030. It is against this backdrop that the ANC-led government has prioritised youth employment initiatives.

In terms of persons with disabilities, we should celebrate the release of the White Paper on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, which advocates for measures that will hold duty-bearers accountable.

Finally hon members, South Africa's postapartheid Constitution was the first in the world to outlaw discrimination based on sexual orientation, and was the fifth country in the world and the first, and to date the only in Africa, to legalise same sex marriages. The lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, intersex, queer/questioning, asexual, and other gender and sexual diversities, LGBTIQ+ community enjoys constitutional and statutory protections from discrimination in employment and many other areas. Hon members, we have scored these achievements because we believe in following the prescripts of the Constitution which is transformative in nature. The Constitution's founding provisions among other things elevate human dignity and the achievement of equality.

Hon Chairperson, we must commend the ANC-led government on working on a holistic and comprehensive approach that is multisectoral in its drive to achieve women empowerment and gender equality to eradicate gender-based violence.

While we are proud of what as a country have achieved so far, we must never rest on our laurels. We know that eradicating 300 years of women disempowerment requires us to intensify our women empowerment programmes as social transformation alone is just not enough for empowerment of these vulnerable groups. The mindset of society also has to keep pace. Part of the mandate of the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities should be to ensure these groups are granted all the opportunities they deserve.

Gender equality and empowering all women, youth and persons with disabilities is something that we seek to advance and if we fail to address their various needs and aspirations, a generation will be lost with it. Our hopes for sustainable development and prosperity, peace and security will also be lost.

Hon members, all stakeholders have a duty in resilience-building. It must however be noted that the private sector is not doing well in dealing with the imbalances of the past. It is using every trick in the book to ignore calls for women and youth empowerment. With so many young people sitting at home with degrees we must ask ourselves why Mango Airline ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, Order! You cannot drown the speaker on the podium, please! Continue, hon member.

Ms F A MASIKO: With so many young people sitting at home, we must ask ourselves why Mango Airline would choose to bring back a man whose only qualification is a matric. On the one hand we are telling young people that education is the key to success, but on the other we are looking away when this airline undermines us. We cannot be ambiguous about this.

I also want to reflect on the case of a 34-year-old Sibusiso Zondi from Durban who has cerebral palsy. Zondi has been a prisoner in his eighth-floor flat for the past nine years because the building owner refuses to fix the lift. In protest, his mother stopped paying levies. Instead of addressing her legitimate concern, the body corporate took her to court. Instead of the court listening to the plight of the Zondi family and the reasons for her refusal to pay the levies, the body corporate was granted the eviction order, leaving Zondi and his mother stranded. The private sector needs to change. [Applause.]

According to the report released by an accounting firm, Grant Thornton, South Africa is falling behind in gender representation in top management, as the number of roles held by women is dropping. Our young girls have to know about this gloomy picture, so that when they grow and enter the private sector, they are ready to rock the boat. They must be inspired by the spirit of mam' Lilian Ngoyi, Helen Joseph, Bertha Mashaba and mam' Winnie Madikizela-Mandela who,

during the apartheid regime, stood up and spoke against oppression.
[Applause.]

Hon Chairperson, the private sector unfortunately is not the only culprit. The South African political parties do not take the issue of women empowerment seriously as the ANC does. That is why we have the DA cabinet and many of its councils filled with men. This speaks to how little they value empowerment of women.

Just after the 2016 Local Government Elections, the axis of evil led by the DA and the EFF in several municipalities ganged up, removed the ANC and wasted no time in reversing the gains we have made in the past 25 years. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Ms F A MASIKO: Their councils have male mayors ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order! Order!

Ms F A MASIKO: ... and if that is not enough, their committees are dominated by men. It is therefore depressing to see women being poorly represented in elected offices such as councils and legislatures that are not led by the ANC. [Applause.]

Hon Chairperson, I would like to remind the hon members who are women on my left, that our struggle transcends political ideologies because we cannot sit on the sides, wait and fight alone. You also

have to wage the war and the battle, and you will also find that South African women will support you.

As a caring society, we have a historic mission to ultimately create a nonracial and nonsexist society, and to destroy the cultures and practices that are not aligned with the new and future society. We will be abandoning our revolution if we do not continue to fight for the noble cause.

Hon member, there are a number of areas that we must focus on in order to continue driving the agenda of the empowerment of women, youth and persons with disabilities.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): On that note, hon member, thank you. Your time has now expired. [Applause.]

Ms F A MASIKO: Chairperson, the ANC therefore supports Budget Vote 13, with recommendations made. Thank you. [Applause.]
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you! Order! Order, hon members! Order! Hon member, please take your seat!

Mrs E N NTLANGWINI: Chairperson, on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Alright hon Ntlangwini, what is your point of order?

Mrs E N NTLANGWINI: Chairperson, I just like to know, was that a sweeping or ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, take your seat. That is not the point of order. Hon members ...

Re ka bitša Mme Maite Nkoana-Mashabane a tle go tswalela ...

(Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.)

[We will call Mme Maite Nkoana-Mashabane to come and close...]

Dr C P MULDER: Hon Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, hon Mulder.

Dr C P MULDER: Hon House Chairperson, I am rising on a point of order. I want to move that in term of Rule 4(1) we suspend Rule 52(2) which means that we take a vote on this budget immediately after the debate because it is quite clear that the ruling party is not interested; only 26 of their members attended this debate the whole day and I think we should take a vote immediately after this.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that is not a point to be raised here; can I stop you just there. You can't raise that here; you know very well that it is not correct. Continue, hon member. That is not a point of order.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon House Chairperson, hon chairperson of the committee, Deputy Minister, hon members of the House, our guests in the gallery and everyone present in the room, we have listened. We came here as a department whose main responsibility, if not mandate, is advocacy. We have come out clean and we lack time to outline what it is that we will be doing in collaboration and partnership with government departments and private partnerships.

We will never give up hope on our people. This challenge that we are faced with ...

Bothata bjo bo lebanego le basadi, le baswa, le bagolofadi mo nageng ya Afrika-Borwa, ga bo tsebe mmala. Le tlala ga e tsebe mmala, feela bo mo mmaleng wa motho yo moso. Mphiri o tee ga o lle. (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[The challenge faced by women, the youth and persons with disabilities in South Africa is experienced by different races. Hunger doesn't know the skin colour, but it affects a black person. We need to work together.]

We are going to have to work together. Nature dictates that.

Batho ba ka letsogong la kganetšo ba na le go lebala ...

(Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.)

[People on the left side sometimes forget ...]

... this configured department was only proclaimed as a department by the President on 26 June. So, all this work that we have done together in this House, championing the rights of women and reminding ourselves of all international protocols that we have adhered to, starting with [Inaudible.] ...

... mphiri o tee ka nnete ga o lle. A re šomišaneng mmogo; re kgone go fenyha mehlolo ye re e bonago, bana ba bannyane ba bašemane, ba kata bomakgolo ba bona ... *(Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.)*

[... we really need to help each other. Let us work cooperatively; to overcome the strange things that we see, young boys raping their grandmothers ...]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon MkhaliPhi, order!

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: It has to start right here in this House. This is not

just another debate because our people who have yearned for freedom are being killed, particularly women. We need to give them protection ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Minister ... We have visitors up there. They can't even hear what the speaker on the podium is saying. Please reduce your voices. Continue.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: There is absolutely no need to disagree on matters that we should be working together on, particularly in fighting patriarchy. The way patriarchy co-opts you and you start speaking the way you do; you think you are being an activist when you are actually co-opted. Leave people who are members of the ANC to the ANC. The ANC knows how to take care of its own.

We will continue to support our youth in challenges they are faced with. We will continue to support Vakhegula-Vakhegula; elderly women who win trophies internationally in football - the only ones from South Africa.

Ngwana Montjane ... [Montjane's daughter ...]

... we are very proud of you. You are doing a very good job, as the hon Minister said.

Sho Madjozi, shine and well done to you! Continue to fly and fly high. The African child, continue doing what you do and know that you have good parents from where you come. We are with you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order!

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: We will listen to progressive matters that are taking us out of this rut of being number one as far as femicide and all the ills are concerned. Moving forward, we will work together with all sensible contributions made by hon members of this House. I thank you.

Ms M S KHAWULA: House Chair, on a point of order ...

... Sihlalo, uNgqongqoshe akasitsheli luthongezinto ebesikade sikhuluma ngazo, uxolo. (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Chairperson, sorry, the Minister have not told us anything about issues that we were talking about.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Khawula, no! Please switch off that microphone.

Hon members, that brings us to the end of our debate. Members are reminded that the debate on Transport Budget Vote will take place at

16:30 in the National Assembly Chamber. The debate on Science and Technology Budget Vote will take place at 16:30 in this venue and the Budget Vote on Statistics SA will take place in E249. They all start at half-past four. Thank you very much. The mini-plenary will now rise.

Debate concluded.

The mini-plenary session rose at 16:18.