

WEDNESDAY, 11 JULY 2019

PROCEEDINGS OF THE MINI-PLenary SESSION - COMMITTEE ROOM E249

Members of the mini-plenary session met in Committee Room E249 at 14:01.

The House Chairperson Mr M L D Ntombela took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, ladies and gentlemen, may I take this opportunity make a short announcement to say that there is a problem with regard to the configuration of the interpretation gathered in this room. The information and technology team is still busy with this. They will get it right as soon as possible. There seems to be no isiNdebele interpretation. Something is just not right, but they will get it right very soon.

Hon members, also note that the time does not show in front of you, but there will be an indication. I now invite the hon Minister of Public Service and Administration to the podium. [Applause.] The Secretary will read the Order.

APPROPRIATION BILL

Debate on Budget Vote No 10 – Public Service and Administration:

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Thank you very much, "Sihlalo" or Chairperson of this session. I want to greet the hon Deputy Minister of the Department of Public Service and Administration, Ms Chikunga, hon members of the Portfolio Committee on Public Service and Administration, hon Members of Parliament who are here, members of the entities within the department, members of the Government Employees Medical Scheme, members of the Public Service Commission, members of the Government Employees Housing Scheme and senior officials in the Department of Public Service and Administration.

It is indeed an honour to be in this House to present the budget for the Department of Public Service and Administration. I want to start by just spelling out the mandates. We derive our mandate from chapter 10, sections 195 and 197 of the Constitution of the Republic. And, in addition to that, there are the two Acts of Parliament, the Public Service Act of 1994 and the Public Administration Management Act 11 of 2014. All of these, especially these acts, outline norms and standards and also outline values and principles respectively that govern our work in the Public Service.

The Public Service Act, for instance, lists a number of tasks, such as establishing norms and standards, dealing with organisational structures, setting up conditions of service and the like. Time is

not on our side, but we have provided you with what this Act does and how it guides us.

The Public Administration Management Act, on the other hand, provides the Minister of the Public Service and Administration with the authority to establish a uniform system of public administration across all three spheres of government. We think, at this point in time for the purposes of the Sixth Parliament, that it is very important to emphasise this point going forward.

Having said this, I want to proceed to say that the department has four components that are key, though there are others. They are the Department of Public Service and Administration, the Public Service Commission, the National School of Governance and the Centre for Public Service Innovation. It might be put wrong here, but it is a centre.

The President of the Republic, when he delivered the state of the nation address, identified seven priorities, and we want to report to this House that we are committed to doing our work flowing from those seven priorities. They are all written there. The first one, which is very important, is economic transformation and job-creation. We want to say that we agree fully with the President that this is a priority for all of us in the country, facing us in all corners of the Republic. Without it, we cannot move forward both as departments and as a country. It is very important that we be

informed of these as we go on with our work. The rest are there - the other six. However, out of these seven principles or priorities that the President counted, there are those that are the most relevant to us. I am not saying there is any one that is not relevant. I am referring to the most relevant and peculiar to our department. One is the consolidation of the social wage through reliable and quality basic services. That one talks to us directly as the Public Service. It is important to mention it.

The second priority is a capable and ethical developmental state. It talks to us and we have to craft the implementation thereof and make sure we make progress in this regard.

The third priority is the better Africa via the African Peer Review Mechanism, the APRM. Of course, the skills and the health of public servants is very important. These are the key priorities and very direct in terms of our interests and our mandates.

Over and above what the President outlined in terms of the priorities, there is the National Development Plan, the NDP, which is very instructive. We can say this or that about the NDP, but it remains very relevant and very instructive in terms of what we need to do in the Sixth Parliament. For instance, it clearly states that our country needs to follow a model of a developmental state. However, the NDP also recognises that not all capable states are developmental, and so it emphasises the importance of building a

capable state in terms of the skills and capacity of your public servants going forward.

The President had this to say when he was delivering his state of the nation address, and I quote:

This is the start of a wider process of arresting the decline in state capacity and restructuring our model of service delivery so it best serves our citizens. We will build on the work we have already begun to address problems of poor governance, inefficiency and financial sustainability. We are committed to building an ethical state in which there is no place for corruption, patronage, rent-seeking and plundering of public money. We want a corps of skilled and professional public servants of the highest moral standards - and dedicated to the public good.

This is our mission - both as a department and as government in the Sixth Parliament. We are inviting all Members of Parliament and the public to join us in this direction, so that our country forges ahead and succeeds.

We want to recognise the work that has been done in the last 25 years and we give an outline of those key achievements that we regard as important. The first one is the integration of the former so-called self-governing states and Bantustans into a united Public

Service. That is the work that has been accomplished in the last 25 years - very important.

The second task that has been achieved is a framework governing the Public Service in the Republic of South Africa, which was not there before 1994.

The third achievement is the 1997 White Paper on the Transformation of the Public Service, commonly known as the Batho Pele White Paper, which focuses on making sure that at the heart of service delivery, the Public Service puts people first, and we need to move along those lines. [Applause.]

A number of regulations accompanying these have also been developed over time. To date, you know when you are doing the wrong thing and you know when you are doing the right thing in the Public Service. This is as a result of the regulations that have been developed, adopted and implemented over time.

In 2005, for instance, government registered the Government Employees Medical Scheme, Gems, which caters for quite a substantial number of people. Actually, it is one of the biggest schemes, particularly in the Public Service. It is very important, and has about 700 000 principal members. That is quite a large number catering for public servants. This means that they are deriving service from this, otherwise they would have not been members if it

was a bad scheme. We applaud it, we will work on it and improve it going forward. That is the work that has been done in the past, but also a lot of work has been done in addressing homeownership across the country for public servants, and that is important.

There is also a Peer Review Mechanism in Africa that is making sure that all of us on the continent work together following particular systems, values and principles. This is just a short summary of work that has been done in the past 25 years, which we feel we need to recognise.

But then we have our own priorities, which I now want to outline. We have identified five of Public Service and Administration's own priorities, which we are sure will cater for all the things that I have said above. The first priority is dealing with resistant fault lines. When we talk about fault lines we are referring in particular to those things that we decided long ago at various platforms that we would do, but we find that implementation has not gone up to the level that is ideal. Nevertheless, progress has been made and though they are resistant, we still have to move on them.

These in particular refer to the Batho Pele principles. There are eight of them, as you would recall. They are consultation, service standards, access, courtesy, openness, transparency, redress and value for money. These principles are still relevant and we still

need to do lots and lots of work to make sure that we are at the desired level in terms of implementing them.

Secondly, part of the resistant fault lines is the perception that is held by the public that the Public Service in the country still harbours elements of laziness on our side in the Public Service, both elected and unelected - that is, appointed public servants. Laziness.

Thirdly, people hold the perception that we are arrogant in the Public Service, those in the offices, those who are employed and those who are elected. [Applause.] We go to them; they have been telling us all that during elections. Arrogance! Something we can get rid of easily and, by the way, by all of us.

Fourthly, they say we lack innovation: things that we could do easily today we still find difficult to do because of lack of innovation. And that we are nonresponsive. There is a phrase that is operational of seeking to characterise Public Service as being sent from pillar to post. People like saying this: I went to Home Affairs or to that office and I was sent from pillar to post. Now we are in the Public Service, we are in charge and we are going to be looking for this pillar and that post together with the public and remove them altogether in the Public Service. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Excuse me, Minister.

Excuse me, Minister.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: That is the first priority that we have set ourselves for the next five years. We are inviting you to work with us on this. Remove the "pillar to post".

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Excuse me, Minister. I am sorry. Minister, excuse me. You are left with seven minutes. I just wanted to make you aware.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: The second one is the Public Administration Management Act, or Pama. It is our intention to ensure that we implement it in full.

The third priority is achieving high levels of stability, and we count here what is called the cost of living adjustment, Cola, which we have already done. This is ensuring that senior management services, SMS, are paid in accordance with the Consumer Price Index, CPI, which has not been happening. However, we have signed that and I am sure public servants/SMS members are very happy with our achievement. [Applause.] This is very responsive and makes sure that people find the Public Service attractive.

However, we want to quickly move on and say that we want to assure unions that we intend consolidating relations and working together

with them. They are our partners. They are not our opponents. We will make sure we work with them. Whether it is difficult or easy, we must just work with a smile and move on even when we oppose one another somewhere and somehow.

We then want to move on to applaud, for instance, the longish cycle of negotiated settlements. For instance, the next cycle is only coming in 2021. That shows that if we work together with unions we can achieve and make sure that there is stability within the Public Service. We want to achieve more, not just the cycles, because there are some things that show us that there are unintended consequences.

The next thing we want to show - in that diagram there - is what happening. While we believe that the Public Service is not necessarily bloated, we do believe that the Wage Bill overall is rather high. And that's not just the Wage Bill, because the cost of running public administration in the country is a little bit high. I want us to look at that and approach this going forward.

We show in that diagram what is happening in other parts of the world. For instance, in Ethiopia the public service is at 8%. In other words, the people who are serving the population, the whole society there or all the people there, is at 8% and at 1:25. You can compare this to other countries. People could make the assumption that we have a bloated Public Service and are out of line with the

rest of the world. This is not the case. However, we agree we have to manage the costs.

With regard to fighting corruption, the great revolutionary from Argentina Ernesto "Che" Guevara once said, and I quote, "If you tremble with indignation at every injustice, then you are a comrade of mine." [Applause.]

Now to borrow from him: I believe that if you tremble at every act of corruption, dishonesty and lies, then you are a public servant. Then you are a comrade of mine in the Public Service. [Applause.]

There are a number of things that have been achieved: the hotline, the anticorruption line, the disclosure frameworks and all of those. Some of the things that we see at the Zondo Commission are very undesirable. All of us believe that. The whole of South Africa is waiting for the final outcome so that the relevant action can be taken. We are all looking forward to that.

We also have some figures in terms of what is happening in the space of disciplinary cases. The last of these five priorities is the implementation of policy. Here, we are emphasising that we are going to focus on this matter with jealousy, making sure that we fight for and implement whatever we want to implement.

We move on. The Deputy Minister will deal with issues about Gems and the housing scheme. I just want to say that we are in year one of phasing out bonuses. We will. Secondly, if people ask us what we are doing, what we are going to do, then these are all the things we are going to do. We are not just focusing on the Wage Bill, but on quite a range of issues to contain costs of public administration.

The next thing is the Ministerial Handbook. The President has released that handbook. However, there is agreement in the executive that there are certain areas of concern. To this effect, the President has appointed the Minister of Finance, the Minister of Public Service and Administration and the Minister of Public Works and Infrastructure to work on three areas to deal with these and to report back to Cabinet in two months. In particular, there is the upper limit of vehicle purchases, the tariffs of those who will be using their cars, and upgrades in security in residential areas. We are going to be working on these. We want to say the current ministerial handbook is an old "new" book. I will explain what we mean by that.

As I conclude, let me say that in our department we are working very hard on our macro structure. Tomorrow in Pretoria we will be dealing with this, making progress on this matter so that we become a model and ensure that we lead by example in the reconfiguration of the state and that we adapt it to the prescripts of the new administration, the Sixth Parliament.

With regard to the youth, yes, we are forging ahead with opportunities for young people, ensuring that the entry levels for young people when they enter the Public Service are made easier than they have been in the past. [Applause.]

With regard to information and communications technology, ICT, we are in the era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution and we are working with all relevant partners in making sure that we move ahead in this sphere.

With regard to good relations, we have said that those on the Public Service Commission are our friends. They are independent, but we are friends and neighbours financially. They do their work and we do our work. We give an undertaking that we will work very well with them. We are quite impressed with their work in terms of making sure that we comply, and, where there have been deviations, they emphasise them and call people to order. We will be working with them to ensure that they are stronger and have teeth where they need to have teeth. We give statistics on the hotline on some of the issues.

We want to conclude overall by saying ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Minister, hon Minister, thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Thank you very much to you, Chair, and members of the committee. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Minister, I would like to apologise again for all the inconvenience. The ICT people are working on it. Hon members, we will break for a few seconds just to allow them to get this thing in order. It is very inconvenient for members.

Business suspended at 14:25 and resumed at 14:28.

Mr T H JAMES: Hon House Chair, hon members of the portfolio committee, hon Minister and Deputy Minister, hon commissioner and all guests gathered here this afternoon, we greet you all. In the interests of time, I am not going to deliver what I have prepared, so that I don't run the risk of being told that my time is up.

I want to zoom directly to what the portfolio committee I chair has recommended, because it would be wrong for some of us to think that when I stand here as the chair of the portfolio committee I stand here and advance my own ideas that have not been canvassed with the committee. One thing that the committee has recommended to the Minister is the issue he raised of the ministerial handbook.

The committee has said that before everything else is done in terms of implementing it, it must be served before the committee, so that the committee is able to see and engage with the ministerial handbook. Now, if you say that I'm wrong to say that, then I don't know what I stand for as the chairperson of the portfolio committee. The other thing that the portfolio committee addressed was that there are long lists of disciplinary cases that have been dragging on for too long.

Therefore, the portfolio committee has said that the department must try to address that. No cases must drag on for a long time without being attended to. The other thing that the portfolio committee has observed is that the department has no plan to attract young people and to reskill them. The committee is urging the department to look into the issue of attracting young people, particularly women, to reskill them and place them in your department.

Another thing the committee has observed is that when you put people in managerial positions, you don't appoint them. You leave them in acting capacities for too long, and that leads to confusion in roles. If you are in an acting position, you don't have all the capacity and power needed because you are in an acting capacity. The committee agreed that this issue should be addressed by the committee. Thank you very much, Chairperson. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Order, hon members! The hon Schreiber will be delivering his speech and it is his maiden speech.

Dr L A SCHREIBER: Hon Chair, it is indeed true that South Africa is in desperate need of a new vision. We need a vision for a future where all South Africans can achieve prosperity. However, what our country does not need is the ideologically infused hallucination that we got from the ANC during the state of the nation address and debate. No, what we need is a practical vision grounded in the year 2019, rather than in the year 1919.

The DA is the only party that offers such a modernising vision, including when it comes to drastically reforming the Public Service. We are the party for prosperity ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, please lower your voices.

Dr L A SCHREIBER: ... and, in order to create shared prosperity, our vision is to build a 21st-century opportunity state that serves, empowers and creates the freedom for citizens to reach for the stars. The opportunity state is one that judges every decision on the basis of whether it expands possibilities for citizens to prosper; it is where bureaucrats becomes public servants; where a dedicated core of professionals shun corruption in all its forms;

where Home Affairs is never offline; and where all teachers are well trained and dedicated.

Unfortunately, with the exception of DA-led municipalities in the Western Cape, South Africa is a depressingly long way away from achieving this vision. Today, more citizens are trapped in poverty than ever in the history of our country. As always, the ANC's response to this, as we have heard here today, is to double down on more of the same. The budget before us today makes it clear that the government has no serious plan to fundamentally reform the Public Service.

Fellow South Africans, our government is trapped in denial. Instead of weaning themselves off of their outdated ideological drug, the ANC is upping the dose and hoping to escape into a comforting hallucination populated by bullet trains and imaginary cities. Undeterred by engineering the collapse of the public health sector, they now want to nationalise private care. After plunging the country into recession, they now want to tell you where to invest your pension.

Following the destruction of Eskom, they now want to sink another R230 billion of your money down that bottomless pit. Despite the Minister's earlier words, the ANC has in fact created a patronage state that does not empower citizens, but controls and steals from them.

So, how do we get from our current patronage state to the DA's opportunity state? The first step, which can be taken immediately, is to dramatically cut frivolous expenditure on maintaining the luxury lifestyles of Cabinet members.

I was introduced to a new concept today of an old "new" ministerial handbook, but I would like to suggest that instead of coming up with new concepts, we cut that down to the bone. In the midst of an economic crisis that saw the economy decline by 3,2% in the last quarter, the so-called old "new" ministerial handbook continues to spend millions of rand on luxuries.

Dear taxpayer: Did you know that under the old "new" handbook you will be paying for the likes of former Ministers like Des van Rooyen to fly business class around the country for the rest of their lives? [Interjections.] Nearly 150 000 people lost their jobs as a consequence of Van Rooyen's four days as Finance Minister. While he is rewarded and jets around the country on taxpayer money, the thousands of families who have had their lives ruined are struggling to put food on the table.

This madness must come to an end. Now. The Western Cape, which introduced its own streamlined - ... not old "new", but streamlined - handbook in 2011, has consistently been rated as the best run government in South Africa. [Applause.] The Western Cape proves that none of these luxuries are required for Ministers to do their jobs.

This is why I have already called for the Department of Public Service and Administration - and, we have heard here today - to appear before the parliamentary committee to accept recommendations on how to dramatically cut the ministerial handbook.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, please do not drown out the speaker.

Dr L A SCHREIBER: Public money is meant to create prosperity for the people, not to buy Porsches for politicians. Secondly, we must wipe cadre deployment from the face of the earth. It not only breeds mediocrity, but also lies at the root of corruption. I am glad that the hon Minister mentioned the Zondo Commission, because cadre deployment is the original state capture. Therefore, I will be writing to the Zondo Commission requesting them to launch a dedicated investigation into the ANC's cadre deployment committee.

[Interjections.]

To eradicate the practice once and for all, the DA will also be proposing a Private Member's Bill to amend the Public Service Commission Act. A key reason why we still have teachers who are not in class and police officers who do not protect is because the leaders of these institutions are appointed not on the basis of competence but on the basis of being loyal ANC cadres. Our Private Member's Bill will take the power of appointments of directors-

general and all other senior government positions away from politicians and give it to the Public Service Commission.

The Bill will also take direct aim at corruption which fuels the wheels of the ANC's patronage state. Over the years, the Public Service Commission has made countless recommendations, which were roundly ignored because they don't have the power to enforce them. The amending Bill will consequently enhance the Public Service Commission to punish offenders by making it a criminal act to defy its recommendations. Parliament recently enacted similar powers for the Auditor-General, and it is high time that the Public Service Commission got its own set of sharp teeth.

Now, rather than catching the next bullet train to the hon President's cloud cuckoo land, the third step we need to take is to tackle the public sector debt crisis head-on by restructuring and privatising where required.

It's time to be honest about this. The job of a leader is not to cower in fear of public sentiment; sometimes the job is to tell hard truths. This is one of those times. The hard truth is that South Africa's public sector, as it currently exists, is not sustainable. Currently, R5,83 out of every R10 that's paid in taxes goes to servicing public debt and paying wages for public servants.

Last year the government granted R30 billion more in wage increases than what had been budgeted. This means that only R4,70 out of every R10 that we take in taxes is actually available to spend on the people. Despite all this, during the debate on the state of the nation address - and as we have heard from the Minister today - the hon Pravin Gordhan and the Minister tried to pretend that South Africa is not in some kind of crisis.

The hon Pravin Gordhan desperately tried to convince us that our public sector was not bloated and inefficient, and this on the very same day that Denel, the Passenger Rail Agency of SA, Prasa, and a lot of municipalities had to beg lenders for money just to pay salaries. Restructuring must happen, and it must happen in a responsible manner. We must aid workers with severance packages, jobs, placement and reskilling.

But while the hon Gordhan and his colleagues do not shy away from using the lives of thousands of workers as a political football, the question he failed to ask is: What about the impact on millions of citizens if we fail to restructure and privatise? What about the millions of South Africans who are already forced to pay exorbitant taxes and have less money left to build wealth and prosperity?

Without fundamental reform, public servants will be jobless, the state will be bankrupt and taxpayers will be left destitute. This is the hard truth, but the sooner we face it, the better. Hon Chair,

unlike the ANC, the DA is not escaping to the fantasy land of "Ramakandla". We are not afraid to look citizens in the eye and acknowledge the socioeconomic catastrophe in this country, and that we cannot keep on doing the same things that got us into the mess in the first place.

Real leaders don't escape into dreams; real leaders face up to reality. We need to implement the plan I outlined here today, to curtail expenses on luxuries like the ministerial handbook, build a professional Public Service through ending cadre deployment, give the Public Service Commission real power and undertake fundamental structure reform. This is the only way to ensure that patronage for some is replaced by prosperity for all. Thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, we make hon members aware of those members that are making their maiden speeches so that they are not disturbed during their first speeches.

[Interjections.] Order! order! However, we also need to advise that members making their maiden speeches should not go on the offensive first, because they open themselves up for attack as well. So, this is just a simple piece of advice. Thank you very much.

Hon members, order! I welcome the next speaker, the hon Motsepe. You're welcome, ma'am.

Mrs C C S MOTSEPE: Chairperson, the EFF rejects the Budget Vote of the Department of Public Service and Administration. If this country is going to build an effective and efficient Public Service, which will drive economic development and provide quality Public Service, two things must happen. Firstly, the responsibilities and capacity of the state must be increased; and, secondly, employees of the state must be skilled, fairly compensated and inspired. That is why the EFF will be reintroducing a Private Member's Bill in this new Parliament, which will compel all spheres of government, including state-owned entities, to insource all workers.

We are introducing this Bill, the Insourcing Bill, because neoliberal economics adopted and implemented by the ANC and the DA have seen the collapse of our Public Service and its ability to deliver services. Every sphere of the state from national government and municipalities to state-owned entities outsources basic government functions and services worth billions of rand every year, but these billions of rand do not go into the hands of the exploited workers. They only see a small fraction of it. The money goes to the labour brokers, middlemen and companies subcontracting these workers to government. This is exploitative, fuels corruption through the tendering process, and only serves the interests of small elites.

Once our insourcing Bill is passed, the government will have no choice but to directly employ all those currently outsourced across

all spheres of government, finally putting an end to these exploitative and wasteful practises.

The City of Johannesburg, under the direction of the EFF in council, has already begun the process of insourcing workers, and more will follow. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Order! Order, hon members!

Mrs C C S MOTSEPE: This is how the city saves more money than when this was outsourced, and the workers are now getting paid more than double what they were earning when they were subcontracted. This has changed the lives of thousands of families, lifting them from a poverty wage to a wage that has allowed them to live in dignity. This is an example. Government as a whole will soon follow.

Insourcing will also help bring an end to the corruption we have seen engulf the tendering system - where we see government officials giving their friends and comrades contracts to provide workers for gardening, cleaning, security and maintenance services. This is how companies like Bidvest made billions ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela) Order, hon members!

Mrs C C S MOTSEPE: ... off government contracts which directly and indirectly benefited members of this Cabinet and who have served on the Bidvest board. When we talk about insourcing and increasing government capacity, we are not only talking about cleaning, security and maintenance services that the state requires, but we are also talking about the services the state delivers. We are talking about plumbers, builders, electricians, engineers, mechanics, software designers and all other workers currently outsourced by government to provide services the state is meant to deliver.

If the government does not have to pay companies' inflated fees for these services and, instead, paid them directly, the state could build its own roads and hospitals, develop its own software, repair its assets, and still pay decent salaries, medical aid and all other benefits given to state employees. This will lead to an improvement in government's service delivery as workers will be energised and motivated to provide quality services.

Minister, if your government wants to realise an effective Public Service in an economy that is growing and is able to meet the needs of its citizens, you will support our Insourcing Bill and begin to increase state capacity. However, you most likely will not do this. Instead, you are doing the exact opposite, and you are threatening to cut the size of the Public Service, which will negatively affect service delivery. But we want to warn you that government must not

cut the size of the Public Service and must not think about freezing salaries. This is the exact opposite of what needs to happen.

Instead, the salaries of teachers, nurses and police officers must be increased as a matter of priority.

Minister, before I close there is one other issue I would like to raise with you. And this is the failure of a number of government departments and entities, including the Department of Labour and the SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, to comply with the 2012 ruling of the Public Service Co-ordinating Bargaining Council that all assistant directors in the Public Service must have their salary level upgraded from level nine to 10, and all deputy directors must have their salary level upgraded from level 11 to 12.

It is now seven years later and there are still government employees to whom this ruling applied who have not seen their salaries upgraded. We have written letters to your predecessor and the departments that are not complying, but we have received little or no response. We hope that while you are in office, you will commit yourself to dealing with these issues once and for all, and that all government employees who are owed salary upgrades receive them now. So, the EFF rejects this Budget Vote. Thank you. [Applause.]

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: House Chairperson, hon Minister, hon Deputy Minister and hon members, the role of this department is to oversee the performance of government departments and public entities. By

doing so, it should promote the levels of socioeconomic development we require in order to achieve the aims and objectives set out by the National Development Plan 2030.

Ukuba sikubone lokhu kwenzeka mhlonishwa ingxenye yako odabeni lwabasebenzi siyadinga ukuba abasebenzi kube abasebenzi abaqondayo umsebenzi wabo, abaqeqeshekileyo futhi abanenkathalo ukusebenzela isizwe. Singaboni njengoba nje sibone kulezinsuku ezedlule, omunye womame ebelethela egcekeni enganakiwe. (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[We need to see this happen, hon members. We need to have trained employees who understand their duties, and who have a passion for working for the nation. We can't have incidents like the recent one of a lady who delivered a baby in her yard and no one paid attention to her.]

Furthermore, there is a need to develop capacity and a professional ethos in government employees from several departments. We believe that the reason people receive bad and poor services when they go to certain administrative offices, such as Home Affairs, Social Development, police stations and others, is because of poor morale and lack of love for their jobs.

Part of the responsibility of this department is to establish norms and standards related to integrity, ethics, conduct and

anticorruption. However, we are seeing more and more officials from various departments who do not exhibit the behaviour as set out by this department's code of conduct. We see issues such as the ill treatment of patients in public hospitals. We also see the large scale of corruption and looting by those who occupy highest offices in the various commissions that are run by our current government.

Chairperson, we hope that one day those who are involved in corruption are brought to book. We fear that there is a lack of commitment from the side of the political wing to punish those who are found guilty of having committed unethical behaviour, such as the cases of Cash Paymaster Services, CPS, and Sassa, to mention a few.

Chairperson, the erosion of accountability, though, and corruption remains a persistent cancer that will, if left unchecked, totally consume our Public Service. Our legislative and regulatory frameworks, our democratic checks and balances – these are all in order. The problem with corruption is the people that staff our Public Service.

The National School of Government must encompass an ethos and an anticorruption culture amongst our Public Service officials. We call for the budget to be utilised in a manner that promotes training and educational programmes that deal with ethics and professionalism.

Chairperson ...

... umhlonishwa ukhulume nge-Batho Pele ngiyafisa mhlawumbe kukekugxilwe kulena. Kuyalimaza ukubona indlela abasebenzi beMinyango abenza ngayo nxa ngabe kufike umphakathi uzodinga usizo. Ngenza isibonelo nje ngendawo yangakithi eMpangeni, idolobha lethu lapha emahhovisi wezaseKhaya abasebenzi bakhona ngehora lesithathu bavala iminyango bangasizi abantu ukuze baqede abangaphakathi. Abagaphandle kuthiwa ababuyele emuva emakhaya babuye ngakusasa bezosizwa. Kuyabalimaza abantu bakithi lokho ngoba uzoqonda Ngqongqoshe ngoba nawe usuka ezindaweni zasemakhaya. Abantu basuka ezindaweni ezikude ngamabhasi bezodinga usizo kufuneke bangene ezindlekweni nangakusasa sebuyela emahhovisi noma abanye ubafice belele emnyango. Lokhu kwenzeka ikakhulu emahhovisi wezaseKhaya eMpangeni ubafica belele emnyango abantu ngenxa yokudinga usizo uma ubuka nezinkalo abazihambayo Ngqongqoshe.

Siyadinga ke mhlonishwa ukuthi sibone uMnyango wenza kangcono njengoba uthembisile ukuthi kuningi uMnyango obona ukuthi kufuneka kugudluzwe. Uyasho nokuthi nobungani buzophuma eMnyanweni. Abantu basebenze ngeqiniso nokwethembeka esizweni.

Izwe lethu libeneshwa lokuthi abasebenzi abaningi babonakala bangakukhathaleli ukusebenzela isizwe kepha basebenzela izisu zabo. Umuntu esekushilo konke lokhu siyasixhasa isabelomali lesi ukuba loMnyango ukwazi ukusebenza kodwa okukhulu kuyabonakala ukuthi kukhona ukunqwebelana kwezinto eMnyangweni kahulumeni. Kuze kube neMinyango emibili noma emithathu enikezwa umsebenzi owodwa. Uyabona

nje lo msebenzi uMnyango wakho owunikeziweyo awuhlukene noMnyango ophethwe uNgqongqoshe uJackson. I-National planning and Evaluation ayihlukene ngempela ngoba uma ubuka bonke abasebenzi kufuneka ababuke ndawonye ukuthi kuqhubekani noma yena ebika kuMongameli. Ngiyathokoza kakhulu. [Ihlombe.] (*Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.*)

[... the hon member spoke of Batho Pele. I would like for us to focus on this. It's really hurtful to witness how government employees render services to our community members in need of those services. For example, in Mpangeni where I'm from, the employees of the Department of Home Affairs close their doors at three in the afternoon. They don't assist anyone who is outside after that time. Those who are outside will be asked to come back the following day. That affects the public as you know, Minister, since you are also from the rural areas. People have to travel long distances to get to the department. That would mean they have to spend money again the following day or you find some of them sleeping by the door, because they are in desperate need. Therefore, we need to see the department improving as you promised, and you said that there is a lot that the department needs to do away with. You also said that nepotism will be eliminated. People need to work faithfully and truthfully for the nation.

It is unfortunate that our nation has public servants who don't really care about serving the nation - they only care about their

stomachs. Nonetheless, we support this budget but it is clear that departments are sometimes given the same task. The work that your department has been given is no different to that of the department led by Minister Jackson. National Planning and Evaluation is really not different, because he has to monitor all employees. The only difference is that he reports straight to the President. Thank you.

[Applause.]

Ms H JORDAAN: Hon Chair, I quote the committee report on the following:

The Department of Public Service and Administration is expected to implement and co-ordinate interventions aimed at achieving ...

- and listen carefully now -

... an efficient, effective and development-orientated Public Service, which is an essential element of a capable and developmental state, as envisioned in the National Development Plan 2030. Furthermore, the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa envisages a public service that is professional, accountable and development orientated.

However, the current state of Public Service and Administration, hon Chair, is neither efficient, nor effective and definitely not development orientated. And the constitutional vision of a

professional and accountable Public Service is merely that: a vision, nothing more. The ruling party has not only failed to give effect to the provisions of the Constitution but also to their own National Development Plan 2030.

But let me give credit where credit is due. There are many public servants who still deliver excellent work and we would like to thank them for that. It is, however, not due to the leadership and government of the ANC but in spite of it. [Interjections.]

Gister het ons die Departement van Arbeid se begroting gedebateer. Dit was gemeensaak dat werkloosheid in Suid-Afrika 'n reuse probleem is. Die departement se mandaat is uitgebrei om werkskepping in te sluit, maar die regering verstaan nie werkskepping deur middel van ekonomies groei nie.

Dit is makliker vir die regering om bloot meer mense in die staatsdiens aan te stel. Vir die ANC-regering is staatsdepartemente werkskeppingsinisiatiewe en plekke waar hulle kaders, waarvoor daar nie plek in rade, wetgewers en die Parlement is nie, kan aanstel.

Daar is talle voormalige ANC-LPs wat nie na 8 Mei teruggekeer het Parlement toe nie en nou vinniger as wat hulle Akasiapark kan ontruim, in hoë poste in staatsdepartemente aangestel is.

(Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.)

[Yesterday, we debated the Department of Labour's budget. It was common cause that unemployment in South Africa is a huge problem. The department's mandate has been extended to include job-creation, but the government does not understand job-creation through economic growth.

It is easier for the government to simply appoint more people to the Public Service. For the ANC government, state departments are job-creation initiatives and places where they can appoint cadres, for whom there are no place in councils, legislatures and Parliament.

There are many former ANC MPs who did not return to Parliament after 8 May, and are now appointed in high positions in government departments faster than they can evacuate Akasiapark.]

Therefore, I foresee great difficulty with the initiative to trim the public sector wage bill.

Tans is die openbare sektor se salarisrekening 'n reuse probleem en las op die fiskus, met nagenoeg R8, agb Schreiber, van elke R10 wat deur die regering bestee word, wat na openbare amptenare se salarisse gaan. *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.)*

[Currently, the public sectors' wage bill is a huge problem and burden on the fiscus, with more or less R8, hon Schreiber, of every R10 spent by government, going to public servants' salaries.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms J Manganye): Hon member, will you please take your seat. What is the point of order, hon Khawula?

Nk M S KHAWULA: Mhlonishwa Sihlalo, nginephuzu lokukhalima okuphambukayo. Iqalile futhi inkathazo. Asikho isiZulu la, alukho nje ulimi lomuntu omnyama la, yisiBhunu, yisiNgisi, yisiBhunu yisiNgisi, senzenjani-ke manje? Akukho ngisho Ukhozi la, ngisho Igagasi, Ligwalagwala, lutho. Cha! Cha! Cha! Umhlobo Wenene lutho.

USIHLALO WESIHASHANE (Nk J Manganye): Sikuzwile MaKhawula sizoyilungisa. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)*

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Chair, I rise on a point of order. Trouble has begun once again. There is no isiZulu interpretation here. In fact, there are no African languages; there is English and Afrikaans only. What are we supposed to do? There is no uKhozi FM, no Gagasi FM or Ligwalagwala. No! No! No! not even Umhlobo Wenene.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms J Manganye): Noted, hon Khawula. We will get it sorted.]

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Agb Voorsitter, op 'n punt van orde ...
(Translation of Afrikaans sentence follows.)

[Dr P J GROENEWALD: Hon Chairperson, on a point of order ...]

Hon Chair, I understand that there are people in South Africa who are still in love with the colonial language. [Interjections.] They are very fond of English. It is their constitutional right.

[Interjections.] May I ask you to allow the hon member to keep on with the process of decolonising South Africa by speaking her indigenous language of Afrikaans? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms J Manganye): Hon member, take your seat.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sihlalo, ngeke sivume izilimu zabokufika kube yizona ezizodlala ngathi la eNingizimu Afrika. Sicela izilimi zethu. Azidlali. Izilimu zokufika asizidingi. (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Chair, we cannot let foreign languages take over South Africa. We want our languages. We don't need these foreign languages.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms J Manganye): Please proceed. Proceed, hon member.

Me H JORDAAN: Die staat se salarisrekening beloop 'n reusagtige R587 miljard. (*Translation of Afrikaans sentence follows.*)

[Ms H JORDAN: The state's wage bill amounts to a whopping R587 billion.]

I quote the Finance Minister, Tito Mboweni, when he said that if R8 of every R10 in the public sector went to salaries it would leave only R2 to fix a hospital, to rebuild a school that has been burned down, to ensure public safety ... and the list goes on.

Suid-Afrika se staatsdiens is groot en lomp en amptenare word volgens internasionale standaarde te veel betaal. (*Translation of Afrikaans sentence follows.*)

[South Africa's Public Service is large and clumsy and officials are overpaid by international standards.]

This is a result of the centralist thinking founded on the ANC's ...

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngokukhulu ukuhlonipha bafowethu ... [Ubuwelewele.]

USIHLALO WESIHASHANE (Nk J Manganye): MaKhawula, uma ngingakakukhombi ubophamisa isandla ngizokukhomba.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyaxolisa-ke! Ngiyaxolisa mhlonishwa. Ngicela ungikhombe.

USIHLALO WESIHASHANE (Nk J Manganye): Bengithi siphezu kwalo udaba, baphumile bayolilungisa ngaphandle. Ngiyabonga.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Uxolo, kodwa-ke kusho ukuthi makame ngoba la ...
(*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: With all due respect ... [Interjections.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms J Manganye): Hon Khawula, If I haven't recognised you, please put your hand up so that I may do so.

Ms M S KHAWULA: My apologies, hon member. Please recognise me.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms J Manganye): I thought we were resolving the issue. They went outside to sort it out. Thank you.

Ms M S KHAWULA: Excuse me, that means the speaker should stop because ...]

Ms M S KHAWULA: ... we are working. We came here to work.

Akukwazi ukuthi ngathi siyasebenza abanye kuthiwe mabame, cha, kufanele sisebenze sonke kanyekanye. (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[It cannot be that we are all here to work, but some of us must wait. We should all work at once.]

We are not fighting but ...

... nathi sifuna izilimi zethu ngoba mina uma ngikhuluma ngesizulu, bayalalela bona. Yindaba nithande ukuthi bona bezwe ukuthi sithini ngabo? Musani ukusidayisa nina.

USIHLALO WESIHASHANE (Nk J Manganye): Uzwakele mhlonishwa uKhawula. Thatha isihlalo sakho. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[... we also want our languages to be available, so that when I speak isiZulu they are able to listen and understand through the interpretation. Why shouldn't they be able to understand what we say about them? Stop selling us out.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms J Manganye): We've heard you, hon Khawula. You may take your seat.]

We will take two minutes to check what is happening.

Hon member, I didn't point at you.

AN HON MEMBER: I thought you were addressing me.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms J Manganye): No, I am not addressing you; I am addressing the House. Check ... [Interjections.] No, you cannot raise on a point of order whilst I am still addressing the previous point of order. Hon member, you may proceed and then check your Channel 3 ... isiZulu ... [Interjections.] You may proceed.

Ms H JORDAAN: This is a result of the centralist thinking founded on the ANC's communist ideology and is not the solution. The solution is also not to leave essential posts vacant while paying exorbitant

salaries to political appointees who are not qualified or have no experience in the relevant field. The solution does, however, lie in a smaller, more efficient state administration in which officials are appointed based on merit or held accountable and not merely appointed because they are cadres.

Besparings op die salarisrekening, wat deur 'n kleiner administrasie teweeg gebring word, moet van die hoogste tot op die laagste vlak deurgevoer word. Sleutelstaatsdienspersoneel soos verpleegsters, onderwysers en polisielede moet beskerm en bemagtig word.

(Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.)

[Savings on the wage bill, which is brought about by a smaller administration, must be implemented from the highest to the lowest level. Key Public Service personnel such as nurses, teachers and police officers must be protected and empowered.]

The power of trade unions to dictate to the Public Service regarding salaries and benefits and forcing the government to agree to unaffordable salary increases must be stopped. Budgets of departments should adequately provide for annual salary increases and the budgeted increase should, at the end of the day, be the increase regardless of what the alliance partners say.

Also, Minister, through you, Chair, the practice of automatic performance bonuses without there actually being any form of performance has always been unacceptable, and we welcome the fact

that the department now also realises this. It is, however, not good enough that it be phased out; it must be stopped immediately.

Die staat moenie 'n primêre werkverskaffer wees nie, maar moet eerder werkskepping stimuleer en bevorder deur eerstens af te sien van verkeerde prioriteite en skeefgetrekte beleidsrigtings en tweedens, die privaatsektor in staat te stel en te bemagtig om werk te voorsien.

Ek sluit af. Die VF Plus wens die agb Minister sterkte toe met die reuse taak wat op sy skouers rus ... *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.)*

[The state should not be a primary employer, but should rather stimulate and promote job-creation by first relinquishing incorrect priorities and distorted policies; and, secondly, enable and empower the private sector to provide employment.]

I conclude. The FF Plus wishes the hon Minister good luck with the huge task that rests on his shoulders ...]

... especially with regard to instilling an ethical ethos and achieving a clean Public Service and Administration by preventing, detecting and combating corruption. This will not be easy as the continued investigation being conducted by the Zondo Commission has illustrated thus far. I thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon House Chairperson, Minister of the Public Service and Administration, hon Senzo Mchunu, Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon Members of Parliament, in particular the chairperson and members of the Portfolio Committee on Public Service and Administration, esteemed guests, ladies and gentlemen and fellow South Africans, our very own National Development Plan Vision 2030 says:

Government begins in the home, grows into the community, expands towards the city, flares towards the province and engulfs the entire land.

This statement holds true as we are a government that puts people first so as to rectify the inequalities in the distribution of service, hence the Batho Pele principles.

It is the right of every South African citizen to be treated with respect and dignity and to receive excellent service from every department and institution of government. I must hasten to say that there are many public servants who deliver just that - service.

Hon Minister Senzo Mchunu has just elaborated on the achievements of the past 25 years ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms J Manganye): Hold on please. To our visitors in the gallery, you are not allowed to take photos in Parliament. You may proceed, hon member.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION ... hon Minister Senzo Mchunu has just elaborated on the achievements of the past 25 years and has also outlined the priorities we will be implementing, and I will be reflecting on other entities that support the work of the department. These are the Government Employees Housing Scheme, GEHS, the National School of Government, the NSG, the Centre for Public Service Innovation, CPSI, and the Government Employees Medical Scheme, Gems.

When delivering the state of the nation address, President Cyril Ramaphosa stated that:

While we have made great progress in providing housing, many South Africans still need land to build homes and earn livelihoods. In the next five years, we will accelerate the provision of well-located housing and land to poor South Africans.

The challenge of home ownership faced by many South Africans is a hardship which is also faced by many public servants, who are still confronted with the difficulty of owning homes of their own. In line with the Batho Pele principle of Access, we are working together with organised labour through the housing scheme to address this

ordeal. Measures that are being implemented include, among other things, the provision of a housing allowance for the purpose of home ownership, with those renting for accommodation being assisted to save towards home ownership; supporting, educating and advising employees on housing options; and assisting employees to access affordable home loans and housing products.

The 2015 agreement of the Public Service Co-ordinating Bargaining Council between government and organised labour established a housing scheme for approximately 1,3 million government employees. As at 30 June 2019, the Government Employees Housing Scheme has significantly increased the number of employees utilising the housing allowance for home ownership. For instance, in 2015 there were 355 000 eligible public servants using the housing allowance for home ownership. In 2019, the number has increased to 653 099. The number of those renting has also been reduced from 596 000 in 2015 to 289 088 in 2019. This is an investment that calls for appreciation.

In 2018, a total amount of R4,5 billion was saved through the individual-linked savings facility by public servants who are renting accommodation. This amount has grown to R7,2 billion as at 31 May 2019. The housing scheme will be looking into ways on how to utilise this financial muscle to bring more benefits to public servants.

We are also reviewing our product offering. We have taken a stance that financial institutions that would like to partner with us in providing home loans should be prepared to offer affordable interest rates at prime-minus against the strength of employees' payroll deductions. We know that this may be a tough call to those used to the status quo, but we insist on this for the benefit of our public servants.

We will also explore solutions that address public servants' indebtedness, which is currently a major hindrance towards home-ownership. We will continue with outreach campaigns to popularise the scheme to employees. A training manual is currently being developed and will be finalised in this financial year. The aim of the manual is to educate human resource units in government departments that are charged with the responsibility of assisting employees to access housing services as well as benefits.

One of the seven priorities of the 6th administration is to focus on education, skills and health. The future requires a state that is capable of playing a developmental and transformative role with skilled public servants who, in line with the Batho Pele principle of information, are knowledgeable about the services they have to deliver to our citizens. This is also the core mandate of the National School of Government. [Applause.] The school will be rolling out training and development opportunities through a suite

of 129 courses and programmes targeting all salary levels in the Public Service.

For the 2019-20 financial year, the school will target training a total of 53 283 learners in the four broad training streams of leadership, management, administration and induction. We are positive about achieving this target. Furthermore, in the 2019-20 financial year, the school plans to train 3 000 unemployed graduates and interns through the Breaking Barriers to Entry into the Public Service programme. [Applause.] This programme is being revamped to support the former Graduate Recruitment Scheme in the Public Service.

Hon members, to ensure the capacitation of senior management services, SMS, the school introduced a compulsory induction programme called the Executive Induction Programme to all newly appointed directors-general and deputy directors-general. The programme includes coaching by qualified and professional coaches and mentoring by experts. This Executive Induction Programme is critical in the current dispensation of macro-national organising of government.

For 2019-20, the budget allocations for the school is R189 million, and included in the allocation for this year is an amount of R10 million ring-fenced for the roll-out of the mandatory courses. The school has also projected the generation of revenue in the

amount of R143 million to augment the training trading account. The school will continue to collaborate and foster partnerships with both public and private sector training institutions domestically and internationally. In 2019-20, we will be looking into the overall functioning of the school in order to align its mandate and product offerings with the 6th administration priorities.

The Centre for Public Service Innovation is uniquely positioned to spearhead innovation across the Public Service in order to promote the Batho Pele principle of value for money. An innovative and Fourth Industrial Revolution-ready Public Service recognises its trailblazers - those young public servants who use their coding and data analysis skills to develop in-house solutions instead of producing off-the-shelf solutions that barely work. Some of these young coders are here today attending this Budget Vote debate.

Following the very successful first Public Sector Hackathon, #IgniteHack, hosted by the Ministry for the Public Service and Administration in 2018, the centre has identified three potential solutions developed by teams of young coders. One of the three solutions, VulAmanz, is a point-of-use water filtering solution using low-cost, cutting-edge materials to filter water. This has been successfully replicated in Limpopo. Solutions such as VulAmanz are critical to safeguarding our people against waterborne diseases where potable water is not yet available.

We will further engage the National Treasury to mainstream such innovations in all spheres of government. A Fourth Industrial Revolution-ready Public Service requires funding mechanisms that would enable us to develop new solutions, many still in conceptual stages, to address some of our most persisting challenges.

Going forward as the Ministry, we will be looking at means and ways of harnessing the focus, research and development of the Centre for Public Service Innovation. In partnership with the United Nations Development Programme, the centre is strengthening government's foresight capacity by working closely with a number of government departments to plan for resilience, adaptability and agility. The centre has been allocated a budget of R38 437 000 for the 2019-20 financial year.

In carrying out these legislative responsibilities in terms of the health and wellness of employees in the Public Service and the Batho Pele value statement of "We Belong, We Care, We Serve", government established the Government Employees Medical Aid Scheme, Gems. The scheme emphasises prevention, screening and testing initiatives as an integral part of primary health care. The scheme, which had 705 192 principal members registered, as at 31 December 2018, covers over 1,839 million beneficiaries. This makes the scheme the second largest medical scheme in the country and the largest restricted medical scheme.

To sustain the affordability of Gems, the board approved an average weighted Gems contribution increase of 7,09% for 2019. This was one of the lowest in the medical schemes industry for the year. In addition, additional benefits for 2019 valued at R832 million were given back to members in the form of more benefits, concentrating mainly on the vulnerable groups mentioned in the National Health Insurance White Paper.

Furthermore, a new programme, the Service Management Programme, was introduced in 2018 to improve member experience and satisfaction. The programme is made up of 11 initiatives, including complaint management and initiatives to improve access to health care cover by members.

To this effect, Gems has established seven Client Liaison Offices, CLOs, in seven provinces, employing 155 young and previously unemployed graduates. In 2019, Gems will establish two more CLOs or offices here in the Western Cape and the Northern Cape.

The scheme reported a surplus of R4,02 billion for the 2018 financial year and increased its reserve ratio from 15,2% to 24,7%. The accumulated funds increased from R5,4 billion in 2017 to R9,4 billion in 2018. It is expected that the reserve ratio will reach the required level of 25% by the end of 2019.

The scheme's nonhealth care cost decreased from 5,6% to 4,9% which remains the lowest in the industry. We congratulate Gems for receiving unqualified audit opinions from the Auditor-General since its inception in 2005 to date. [Applause.]

Under the leadership of President Ramaphosa, we will work together as a nation as we seek solutions to the challenges facing our country. We will do so in order to keep the legacy of former President Nelson Mandela alive by ensuring that we build a nation where everyone will cherish being part of this country.

Chairperson, it is our vision as a Ministry that the service needs of our people will be our first consideration. And it is upon this vision, led by the hon Minister Senzo Mchunu and supported by Director-General Prof Levin, the staff of the Department of Public Service and Administration and the Ministry of Public Service and Administration entities, that we will endeavour to build an ideal developmental state that will provide services to our people as enshrined in the Constitution and the Batho Pele [Putting people first] principles, with a commitment ethos that says "Thuma Mina" [Send me], to deliver services for our people in a professional, ethical and optimal Khawuleza mandate. Chairperson, to this we are committed, and I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr C H M SIBISI: House Chairperson, hon Minister and Deputy Minister, hon members of the House, the NFP welcomes the budget

report on the Department of Public Service and Administration here today.

The National School of Government is a very important aspect of this department. The need to train and transfer the necessary skills to public servants to best serve the public is vital in achieving the objectives set out by the Public Service Act, particularly the need to uphold integrity, ethics, conduct and anti-corruption measures, and the need for there to be transformation, reform, innovation and any other way to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of the Public Service and its service delivery to the public.

However, the department must get these training courses accredited, and training courses must indeed respond to the Fourth Industrial Revolution. Not only would this increase productivity, but this would also empower those within the sector to become more innovative in serving the needs of the public.

If the department sticks to the following strategic priorities set out in the report, the department can meet all its objectives: a stable political administrative interface; a public service as a career of choice; efficient and effective management and operation systems; increased responsiveness; and improved mechanisms to promote ethical behaviour in the public sector.

Siphinde sikunxuse, Macingwane, njengoba uke wakhuluma uthinta uMnyango Wezasekhaya, usizi olubhekene nabantu basemakhaya lukhulu

ngalomnyango. Emnambithi abantu bafika ngothwalofu ebusuku bezongena ngakusasa belale emabhentshini. Sekukhona abafike bathi kumele ubaqashe bakubambeke ulayini ebusuku uzongena ngakusasa, uqashe ukuba kulayini ngo-R400. kuwukuhlukumeza abantu, siyofisa mhlonishwa uMacingwane ubalekelele abantu kuphele lokhu okwenzeka eMnyangweni Wezasekhaya. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[You spoke about the Department of Home Affairs Macingwane (clan name). We urge you to assist the people of Mnambithi who queue from midnight so that they can be assisted the following day, or who pay R400 so that someone may queue on their behalf. That is abuse. Please assist them. Such things need to come to an end from the Department of Home Affairs.]

We seek to improve the working environment of public servants and create a culture of development within our public spaces. We need to make sure that workers are well equipped, enthusiastic about their work, and have the passion to deliver adequate services to the people. Ethical leadership and ethical behaviour is the culture that we must adopt in all departments, but most importantly in the Department of Public Service and Administration. The services delivered must be done in an ethical manner that will create a healthy working system. Therefore, the NFP welcomes the budget tabled here today. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms M T KIBI: Hon Chair of the House, hon Minister and Deputy Minister, chairperson of the committee, all directors-general that are with us here, fellow South Africans ...

... molweni. (*Translation of isiXhosa word follows.*)

[... greetings.]

We as the ANC support this Budget Vote. [Applause.]

Yebo! (*Translation of isiZulu word follows.*)

[Yes!]

The ANC has made a conscious decision that South Africa become a capable and developmental state. The National Development Plan, NDP, gives specific attention to the capabilities of such a developmental state. The NDP suggests that the role of the Public Service Commission, PSC, be strengthened in order for the PSC to be able to champion the norms and standards - and monitor - recruitment processes. The PSC addresses some of the key issues highlighted in the NDP on strengthening its advisory and oversight role, which includes promoting the values and principles of the Public Service. The PSC, as a constitutional institution, needs to be capacitated financially and with technical expertise if the country is committed to building a capable and professional Public Service.

Through this oversight report, the PSC has continued to advise the government and Parliament on areas of progress and areas that undermine the ability of the state to deliver. The PSC has ensured that there is improvement in the timely submission of disclosure forms by senior managers with regard to the Financial Disclosure Framework. However, as the ANC, we can only accept a 100% compliance rate with the Financial Disclosure Framework.

The commission should speed up the analysis of information to detect if there are conflicts of interest before it is too late. The e-disclosure system should serve as the preferred option in disclosing what is faster and better.

We commend the Department of Public Service and Administration for the new regulations in the Public Service Regulations of 2016 on the prohibition of public servants from doing business with the state. This is a measure introduced by the ANC-led government to tackle conflicts of interest and corruption. However, the PSC needs to monitor this provision together with the Financial Disclosure Framework forms. [Applause.]

In promoting sound labour relations in the Public Service, in 2017-18 the PSC concluded 87% of grievance cases of which 560 cases were for public servants from levels 2 to 12, and 81% of those cases were concluded within 30 working days upon receipt of relevant information. Fifty-five cases were for levels 13 and above, of which

93% were concluded within 45 working days of receipt of relevant information.

In executing its constitutional mandate of promoting professional ethics during the period under review ... [Interjections.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sihlalo nginephuzu lokukhalima okuphambukayo.

USIHLALO WESIKHASHANA (Nk J Manganye): Angikasho ukuthi usungakhuluma mhlonishwa kodwa usungakhuluma manje.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, hhayi, ngikuthande izolo ugqoke izingubo ezibomvu. Kuvumelekile yini lana ngaphakathi ukuthi umuntu angaphuzi amanzi aphanthe okuthize okungathi yitiye, utshwala besintu into enjalo nje? Kukhona umhlonishwa la ophethe into enjalo, manje angazi ngempela ukuthi kwenzakalani. Uyifihlile nje kanjalo.

USIHLALO WESIKHASHANA (Nk J Manganye): Mhlonishwa uKhawula, awuthathe isihlalo sakho, ngiyacela.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Hhayi! Hhayi! Hhayi! Hhayi! [Ubuwelewele.]

(Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Chair, I rise on a point of order.]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms J Manganye): I didn't recognise you, hon member, but you may speak now.

Ms M S KHAWULA: Thank you, Chair. I liked it when you were wearing red clothing yesterday. Do House Rules allow one to bring liquids such as tea or traditional beer into the House? There is an hon member who is hiding such here, so I'm confused as to what is going on.

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms J Manganye): Please take your seat, hon Khawula.

Ms M S KHAWULA: No! No! No! No! [Interjections.]]

The CHAIRPERSON (Ms J Manganye): Continue, hon member.

Ms M T KIBI: The PSC conducted investigations aimed at improving public administration practices and good governance. In this regard, a total of 303 out of 360 investigations were finalised, of which 210 of 303 were finalised within their respective timeframes which ranged from 45 days to three months. In relation to cases lodged through early resolution, the PSC received 27 cases, of which 85% were finalised. We commend the PSC for doing a sterling job of closing cases within a reasonable time. [Applause.]

We welcome various strategic research projects and initiatives undertaken by the PSC, spanning from the assessment of the impact of

organisational restructuring, an audit of the qualifications of senior management service members in selected provinces, the monitoring of career incidents of heads of departments, to the conducting of investigations of procedure on incapacity leave and ill-health retirement application processes in identified provinces.

Senior managers got appointed to the Public Service without being subjected to competency assessments. This clearly indicates the need for continued monitoring, assessments and advice in many of these areas if we are serious about building a capable Public Service and professionalising the Public Service.

It was a resolution of the ANC's 54th national conference that, and I quote: "The merit principle must apply in the deployment of senior appointments based on legislated prescripts and in line with the minimum competency standards." The ANC-led government is concerned that public servants are getting recruited and employed wrongfully. They are not getting employed based on merit. We call on the PSC to intensify addressing incorrect appointments as a result of poor recruitment systems in the Public Service.

We commend the commission for progress made in respect of the prevention and combating of corruption in the Public Service. A total of 1 856 National Anti-Corruption Hotline cases, or NACH cases, that were lodged with the PSC, were referred to the relevant national or provincial departments. The PSC has observed an increase

in the public interest to use NACH as a reliable mechanism to report alleged corruption cases. With regard to NACH cases lodged telephonically, 1 374 NACH cases were referred to national and provincial departments or public entities, and 1 125 cases registered on the database were closed.

The National School of Government, NSG, has been responsive to the development of the youth for Public Service employment through the Breaking Barriers to Entry programme. The school trained a total of 3 163 youth graduates in the 2017-18 financial year. Access to employment opportunities is limited and competition for these posts is high. Therefore, there is a challenge. However, the training places learners at an advantage for employment opportunities.

The school continues with the development of our Public Service leaders, such as through the introduction of the Executive Induction Programme for new entrants at deputy director-general and director-general levels, and this includes coaching by qualified and professional NSG coaches and mentoring by former heads of department. We call on the school to make sure that the programmes continue to gain momentum across all salary levels in the Public Service.

Through the use of technology, the NSG can offer Compulsory Induction Programme training to officials in 13 remote training sites within the Free State province. The NSG needs to expand its

training within budgetary constraints to other remote rural provinces.

With regard to the Centre for Public Service Innovation, or CPSI, South African citizens, like most other global citizens, are looking for dynamic, creative and innovative solutions to their challenges. As the ANC-led government, we need to respond accordingly and be a vibrant government. This is why we have a vibrant organisation such as the CPSI, which is rising to the challenge.

Through the Public Sector Innovation Awards, innovative ways are inspired and developed in continuing to provide innovative solutions to help improve the way in which services are delivered to our people. We welcome plans by the centre to facilitate and support replications for two CPSI award winnings.

We urge the centre to consistently assist service-delivery-oriented departments in designing innovative systems that ensure efficient, effective and rapid service delivery. Queue management in various departments, such as in Home Affairs and Health, is a major concern, hindering efficiency and impacts on average time spent by clients before receiving services.

Thina ke singumbutho we-ANC, sizakuhlala ngamaxesha onke sizimisele ukukhonza abantu baseMzantsi Afrika, sitshintshe ubomi babo.

[Laphela ixesha.] [Kwaqhwyatywa.] (*Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.*)

[As the ANC, we will always be committed to serving the people of South Africa and changing their lives. [Time expired.] [Applause.]]

Mrs M O CLARKE: Chairperson, the core mandate of the Department of Public Service and Administration, DPSA, is to implement and co-ordinate interventions aimed at achieving - and, listen nicely - an efficient, effective and development-orientated Public Service, as enshrined in the Constitution of South Africa Section 195(1) and the Public Service Act, Act 30 of 1994. The department aims to ensure that well-skilled public servants are employed in government departments so that the state can deliver high-quality services to its citizens.

How successful has government been in achieving the DPSA's core mandate? We cannot be doing business as usual in the constrained environment we find our lives in, as a result of what the President described as the "lost decade". No New Dawn can be achieved if government is not prepared to take bold steps in change management and rooting out corruption in the Public Service.

The DPSA can only be successful in achieving its mandate if it fosters a politically independent, delivery-orientated civil service. The strategic roles in government have for far too long

been a reward mechanism for those who support the party as some sort of loyalty retainer.

Too many government institutions in South Africa are enablers for the rot to continue and to go unchecked. This was the order of the day under the leadership of Zuma. The New Dawn under President Ramaphosa has not yielded results, with many of these deployees still employed in the civil service.

The president highlighted in his state of the nation address and in his speech on 12 January at the Moses Mabhida stadium that he was committed to running a public service that was free from corruption and responsive to the needs of South African citizens.

Hon Minister, actions speak far louder than words. We need to see jail time for those public servants who are found guilty of corruption. [Applause.] Public government is a high risk in South Africa and during the last decade was a major site of capture. As a result, corruption and bribery thrive at central government level. Political patronage allows officials to engage in corrupt behaviour with impunity. No consequences are meted out due to low levels of law enforcement.

Under a DA government, we would ensure that any public servant found guilty of corruption receive a minimum jail sentence of 15 years. [Applause.] Where we govern, we foster an independent, professional

civil service. Sadly, this is not the case where the ANC governs. [Interjections.] Instead, the Public Service here has become a place to park senior party members who could not be deployed in political roles. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Order, hon members!

Mrs M O CLARKE: Government must be able to achieve an efficient and effective Public Service based on principles fit for purpose. The state cannot be a fail-safe mechanism for party members who cannot be hired elsewhere.

Health care is but one example that illustrates the key differences between a professional versus a deployed civil service. In the DA-run Western Cape, this has been very successful and effective. [Interjections.] It is the only province to digitalise patient records in the public health sector. The digital records span over 54 hospitals, 300 primary health care facilities, more than 100 pharmacies and 30 health laboratories. The system currently hosts 13 million patients spanning over 25 years. [Applause.] No records are deleted or archived from the system. This is a remarkable achievement. [Interjections.]

Sadly, this has not been achieved in the rest of the country. The Gauteng digital health system has not been completed. The system does not link up with the various sectors, and the consequence

thereof is that many patients' information and files are missing or cannot be found on the system. This causes huge frustration when patients visit hospitals in Gauteng.

This can generally be said in terms of nurses being trained to work within an efficient, effective health care system. The SA Nursing Council is in disarray as is not able to create accredited guidelines in order to ensure that nurses are fit for purpose in public health care. This is just the tip of the iceberg in terms of government inefficiency. Many more examples can be presented.

Let's take bold steps to reform the Public Service and action these steps as South Africa cannot afford to lose one more minute. We cannot be here next year during the budget period if there is no real reform and transgressions have been made. I thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr B M MANELI: House Chairperson, Minister and Deputy Minister, Commissioner of the Public Service Commission, administrative representatives here, the National School of Governance, the director-general from the Centre for Public Service Innovation, the portfolio committee chairperson and the portfolio committee members, hon members of the House, for fear of confusion about what our vision is, I would like to state that the Freedom Charter, as adopted on 26 June 1955 in Kliptown, makes clear in its preamble that our forebears have visualised a country where a government is

elected on the basis of the will of the people and that no government would claim legitimacy unless it would have been based on the will of the people as a whole. We made the claim that South Africa belongs to all who live in it, black and white, at that time.

I want to state that, we didn't only stop there. Section 195 of the Constitution, as it relates to the Public Service, goes further to indicate that we would have a public service that is a representative of the demographics of this country, that is ethical and that is professional. This is what we said is the vision.

Indeed, the President in his state of the nation address took this further to point out that we have areas of focus. Those areas of focus will include building a capable state that is ethical and competent. This will, in a way, ensure that the experience of a citizen at each and every point of service should be fulfilling from a service delivery point of view. I want to make this point, because there is confusion about 1990 versus a new vision of the DA.

Unfortunately, in the Western Cape, this vision doesn't exist, because the people of Khayelitsha and Gugulethu are still refugees in their own country. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, order!

Mr B M MANELI: ... when white privilege is still the case. In essence, I want to indicate that the ANC knows that a lot has to be

done to meet the needs of our people. It is against this background that we have put together the National Development Plan, NDP, and this plan talks to the capability of the state to resolve the complex problems that we have.

I want to state that it is unfortunate when you took over Tshwane and Johannesburg that you changed them from being municipalities of excellence, as confirmed by the Auditor-General, because we respect the Auditor-General as independent. It has been confirmed that Johannesburg and Tshwane, with Tshwane being number one, have now joined those that have unauthorised expenditure at the highest level. [Interjections.]

Allow me to indicate that, furthermore ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, order!

Mr B M MANELI: ... the NDP highlights the need to run to the state ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, could you please take your seat?

Mr B M MANELI: ... and I want to state that ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member! Hon Maneli?

Mr B M MANELI: ... those that believe that this has been about cadre development ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member! Hon Maneli? Could you please take your seat, sir?

Mr B M MANELI: I will squat.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Okay, just a minute. Uh, keep on standing. There is a question. What are you rising on, hon member?

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Chair, I want to know if the hon member is prepared to take a question? [Interjections.]

Mr B M MANELI: No.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): He is not prepared to do so. [Interjections.] Hon members! Wait a bit. Hon member, please, take into consideration your proximity to the speaker. You are too close on both sides. You are too close to the speaker and you are disturbing him. [Interjections.] The fact of the matter is that he is at the podium. Could you please respect that?

Khulumelani phansi bahlonishwa. (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[Lower your voices, hon members.]

Mr B M MANELI: Thank you, hon Chair. As I continue, we do indeed recognise that the unevenness in capacity has led to uneven performance in the Public Service, as admitted by our Minister and Deputy Minister. But we are doing something about it. We are changing the situation. Of course, we get accused that this would have happened because owing to party patronage and cadre development.

I want to remind you that in all the municipalities where you have taken over, you fired competent staff, because you thought they were linked to the party, and today the Auditor-General's reports are proving that you have taken those that are competent in order to reimburse the rented crowd from the townships that don't support you ideologically. They must be rented to do so. [Applause.]

Allow me to indicate that as we deal with the Public Service as a career of choice, we support the Minister and his team in that we have to ensure that we have a competent Public Service and make the Public Service an interesting employer of choice. Allow me to indicate that, unlike elsewhere, others do analyse the problem like all other philosophers would have done without changing the world. They told us about the problems of a girl but they have not voted for a budget today.

I want to say that we support the budget because we know that it will ensure that the graduate recruitment scheme framework and the internships will continue to happen, giving an opportunity to young people for experiential learning, when others are still getting certificates from institutions of learning because they don't have this opportunity. Even the proxies of capital on my left have never given them this opportunity. [Applause.] Therefore, the state remains the only chance they have of entry into jobs.

Allow me to indicate this point once again ...

Ms M S KHAWULA: On a point of order, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Uh, what is your point of order, Ma'am?

Mr B M MANELI: Allow me to make this point again.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Uh, Mr Maneli. Hon Maneli, there is a point of order. Why are you rising, hon member?

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga mhlonishwa bengithi mina ilungu elihloniphekile alithi ukuhlala phansi kancane. [Ubuwelewele.] Hlala phansi. Akahlale phansi phela uma ngikhuluma. Isihlalo asikho yini? Ngiyaxolisa ke kepha ungaguqa kodwa ngamadolo. [Ubuwelewele.] Bengithi mina Sihlalo, umhlonishwa njengoba ekhuluma akazame ehlise

izwi kancane ngoba sekubuhlungu izindlebe. Asizwani nomsindo kanti futhi kukhona namaKhosi lapha phakathi kwethu azoze agule.

Ngiyabonga. (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Thank you, hon Chair. I was just saying that the hon member should sit down for a bit. [Interjections.] Sit down. He should sit down when I speak. Is there a seat maybe? I'm sorry about that, maybe you can kneel down then. [Interjections.] Chair, I wanted to say that the hon member should lower his voice when he speaks, because my ears are sore now. We don't like the noise and there are kings in our midst; they might get sick. Thank you.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): That is not a point of order. Continue, hon member.

Mr B M MANELI: Thanks Chair, at least it is an indication that she has heard. As I proceed, we are also very thankful that the Minister has addressed the part on corruption a long while ago and indicated the actions they were going to take.

Allow me to also welcome the point that the Zondo Commission has begun to deal with all the matters that relate to state capture. I understand the eagerness from the DA side to write to the commission on other matters. May I also invite you to write to the Zondo Commission about all the matters that are in the media. For instance, a councillor of the DA on the West Rand, the owner of

Blakes Travel, is cited in the Bosasa saga. The DA at this point in time has never done anything to that councillor. [Interjections.] Instead, they rewarded her as an alderman of the DA. If you could write about this, you'd know that you're a prisoner of your own convictions when it comes to fighting corruption. This is because it is Blakes Travel. We may also have to check whether they have not helped you financially as they benefited from these crooks. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

On that score, allow me to continue with my speech to say that on the part of responsiveness, we are very happy that the school of governance and the Centre for Public Service Innovation are doing everything possible to ensure that we change the situation with regard to using technology. I must say, though, that when you stand and don't support this budget, the little girl who has been identified as having problems at every level of service has been failed dismally and, probably, will think differently in terms of the vote going forward - whether you can be relied upon at this point in time. [Applause.] This is like the people of Tshwane being dumped without your telling them that you were leaving at the time, and who still expected the services that you wanted to give them.

May I also say that as I was coming here, I was motivated, because the ANC recognises South African talent. There is an esteemed South African whose music I listened to as I was coming here. I was very motivated. Of course, that musician would be none other than Ringo.

I like him: *Ain't that love*. He makes that point. I like the song *Shut the tears and grow*. He makes the point that these things will not just happen. He even quotes Biko in that: "God is not in the habit of coming down to resolve our problems." In fact, he goes further to say that we teach the children not to take freedom for granted. It is taking freedom for granted not to vote for this Budget Vote because ...

Ms M S KHAWULA: On a point of order, Chairperson.

Asinaye uRingo kule Ndlu sinelungu elihloniphekile. (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[We do not have Ringo in this House. We have an hon member.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member! Hon member!

Mr B M MANELI: ... a budget is a financial expression of priorities and programmes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member!

Angizukukulalela. (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[I'm not going to listen to you.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: On a point of order, Chairperson.

Mr B M MANELI: So, on that score, I hope Radebe ...

... siyophinde siyilalele sobabili le nto ukwenzela ukuthi ...

[Akuzwakali.]. *(Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.)*

[... we will listen to this again together so that ... [Inaudible.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: On a point of order, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member! Hon Maneli!

Mr B M MANELI: Allow me to indicate ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Maneli! I know that you are in top flight. There is a point of order called. Hon member, what is your point of order?

Nk M S KHAWULA: Bengicela ukuthi kungadlalwa la. Asinaye uRingo kule Ndlu sinelungu elihloniphekile uRingo ukuthi wena uyamdelela, uvotelwe ngabantu njengoba elana ePhalamende. [Ubuwelewele.] Kufuneka ukwazi lokho. Ungenzi into ongeke uyijabulele uma ibhekiswa kuwena. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Let's stop fooling around. We do not have Ringo in this House; we have an hon member. You are being disrespectful. He was voted to be in Parliament. [Interjections.] You need to understand that. Don't do something you wouldn't appreciate having done to you.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, that is not a point of order.

Ms M O MOKAUSE: On a point of order, Chair. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Maneli?

Ms M O MOKAUSE: On a point of order, Chair. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, order! Order, please! Hon member, why are you rising?

Ms M O MOKAUSE: I am rising on a point of order, Chair. The hon member at the podium must not patronise our benches. He mustn't quote one of us and then say that we are not supporting the budget. [Interjections.] We are not supporting the ANC budget, because of the corruption within the Public Service. That is the main reason why we are not supporting that budget. So, don't patronise us. Stick to your debate. Stick to your sweeping, otherwise we will attend to you. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members! Hon members, order! Hon members, stop shouting at each other.

Mr M A DIRKS: Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, stop shouting at each other. Could I make a ruling on that? Hon Mokaue, that was not a point of order. [Interjections.]

Hon member?

Mr M A DIRKS: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Perhaps for the sake of progress - as our member is dealing with issues here - he should just withdraw the issue about Ringo, because he is dealing very well with the issues here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I have already made a ruling about that.

Mr M A DIRKS: Yes, just to say we all love Ringo. We listen to Ringo's music. We love Ringo. I listen to Ringo. I love your music, but just call him hon member for the sake of the House.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, I have already made a ruling on that. The ruling was that there was nothing wrong with that. Hon member, could you continue?

Mr B M MANELI: Thank you, Chair. Of course, in increasing responsiveness of public servants and accountability to citizens ...

Mr M M CHABANGU: On a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): There is a point of order again. Just hold on, hon member. Hon member, what is your point of order?

Mr M M CHABANGU: Chair, my point of order is that we are not supposed to call each other by names here, and if you allow that we call each other by names, then we are going to do that. There is only one Ringo here and that Ringo is honourable, because he is a Member of Parliament. This hon member can't come here and refer to Ringo, and then you say he was talking about somebody outside. Otherwise, we are going to make it impossible to run the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you very much. Hon members, I made a ruling on that and if hon members have a problem with that, there are processes to follow so that we resolve the matter as soon as possible. There are processes that we can follow

to address that, but for now a ruling has been made. Thank you very much. Could we now allow the member to continue?

Ms M S KHAWULA: No, point of order, Chairperson.

Cha, Cha! Mhlonishwa Ntombela, siyakuhlonipha. (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[No, no! Hon Ntombela, we respect you.]

Mr M M CHABANGU: You can't do that.

Ms M S KHAWULA: You can't do what you want to do now to us.

[Interjections.] We are hon members here.

ILUNGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Ngizonikhombisa ngaphandle.

Mnu M M CHABANGU: Heyi wena asikhulumi nawe.

ILUNGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Ukhuluma nobani?

Mnu M M CHABANGU: Ngikhuluma nalomuntu. [Uhleko.] Hhayi mina awungazi. [Uhleko.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: Lalela mhlonishwa Ntombela. Uyabona nje ngisho noma ngilalela isibongo sakho, sikhombisa ukuthi ungumnumzane. Yabona

njengoba ungumnuzane nje kumele uhlonishwe. Ukuze uhlonishwe nawe kufuneka uqinisekise ukuthi awubukeli muntu phansi. Akaxolise kulento yakhe ayishilo ngoba yilungu elihloniphekile leli. Ningadlali ngathi la, asizile ukuzodlala lapha. [Ubuwelewele.] Yebo angasho njalo ukuthi lungu elihloniphekile Madlingozi [Ubuwelewele.] Angavele ambize ngegama. Ngicela nithule. Wena sizokhipha itiyi leli elingaphansi lapho kuwena. Lizokushisa itiyi ngiyakutshela [Uhleko.] Uphuza itiyi kule Ndlu ngoba ubona lo Sihlalo ovuma yonke into.

(Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[An HON MEMBER: I will show you when we go outside.]

Mr M M CHABANGU: We are not talking to you.

An HON MEMBER: Who are you talking to?

Mr M M CHABANGU: I'm talking to this person. [Laughter]. You don't know me. [Laughter.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: Listen here, hon Ntombela. Even your surname suggests that you are a man. As a man you ought to be respected. However, for you to be respected, you need to make sure that you don't look down on anyone. You should apologise for what you said. We are not here to play games. [Interjections.] Yes, he may say hon Madlingozi ... [Interjections.] ... he can't refer to him by his second name. Could you please be quiet? As for you, we are going to

take away that tea you have hidden away. [Laughter.] You are drinking tea in the House, because anything goes with this Chair.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, I do understand what you are saying, but in the midst of you saying that, you should also observe the Rules of the House. If you are aggrieved with a decision that I have taken, there are processes that need to be followed. It is a fact that all members here are expected to respect the manner in which they call on each other and the manner in which they refer to each other. We should always do that.

[Interjections.] If you are aggrieved with the decision I have taken, hon Mokause, please follow the correct processes.

[Interjections.] Hon Maneli, if it happens that you refer to the name of a person, please do so respectfully. Thank you. You may continue.

Mr M A DIRKS: Chair, whilst you were busy addressing the issue, the member from the DA there pointed to our member here and said, "Let the VBS continue." There is no VBS here; there is an hon member.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, that is ...

[Interjections.] Hon member, that happened while ...

[Interjections.] Please note that this happened while I was addressing this issue. So, I did not see that. Could I check with the member whether it is true?

Ms M S KHAWULA: What do you mean?

Uqonde ukuthi thina siqamba amanga? (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[Are you saying that we are lying?]

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Chair? What is the question? Are you asking me a question, Chair?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Yes. Did you refer or talk about VBS? Did you point a finger at them?

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: In the time-honoured tradition of heckling, sir, I did say VBS. VBS is particularly pertinent in this debate because the hon member here is talking about responsible and clean service, and VBS was a blot on a particular municipality that he was in charge of.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you very much, Mr Cachalia. On the list that I have here, hon member ...

[Interjections.] Let me finish first, hon Chabangu. On the list that I have here, hon member Cachalia, I have hon member B M Maneli. I do not have hon member VBS. What you did was that you pointed a finger at him and called him VBS. That is unparliamentary. No name to impugn the dignity of any member should be allowed in the House.

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Sir, if you allow me: I did not impugn the dignity ... [Interjections.] May I explain: I ... [Interjections.] Sir!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I did not allow you, and I will now allow for there to be a dialogue between us. I did not allow you, Mr Cachalia. I would humbly request you to withdraw.

Mr M S MALATSI: House Chair, point of order!

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Chair, I respectfully submit to you that what I said was in no way unparliamentarily. What I said in reference to VBS is a plain fact that is in the public domain and I raise it in these hallowed portals. Thank you.

Mr M S MALATSI: Chair, on a point of order.

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: And I did not mention his name, sir. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, I quote Rule 82 in that no name should impugn the dignity of any member. If you make an allegation of that nature, hon Cachalia, you should do that by way of a substantive motion in a process separate from this one. Otherwise, I humbly request you to withdraw what you said.

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Chair, I did not mention the hon member's name. I merely referred to VBS, which I said is pertinent in this discussion. I am not prepared to withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Then I am also making you aware, hon Cachalia, that pointing a finger at him was a gesture that is not acceptable. I will again request you to withdraw.

Mr M S MALATSI: House Chair ... ?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, I did not recognise you. I am addressing the hon Cachalia.

Mr M S MALATSI: But I am rising on a point of order, Chair.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I am still addressing him. I will come to you. [Interjections.]

Mr M S MALATSI: Okay.

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: A gesture which says let VBS continue refers ... [Interjections.] ... in context to the content of the discussion which we were having here and the debate we are engaging in. I did not refer - I repeat - I did not refer to the member by name; nor did I point at him and say that he was VBS. I referred to VBS

because it is pertinent and his activities in that regard are complicit. That's all I have said, sir, and I stand by that. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Cachalia, I am requesting you to withdraw what you have said about the member, and, if you do not find it possible, I humbly request you to leave the House.

Mr M S MALATSI: House Chair, you are being unfair to our member here. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Malatsi, I respectfully ask you to sit down. I am busy with a ruling, sir.

Mr M S MALATSI: But you are on the wrong path, Chair. You are on the wrong path.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I will give you a chance.

Mr M S MALATSI: When? When my member is out of the House?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): When I am through. When I am through with this Ruling, I will give you a chance, hon Malatsi. Hon member Cachalia, I have made a humble plea to you: Please leave the House so that we can continue.

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Chair, we may continue in my presence because I have done nothing wrong.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Cachalia, I have repeatedly requested you to leave the House. You will leave me with no option ... [Interjections.] Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The member thereupon withdrew from the Chamber.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Order! Order, hon members! Shall we continue, hon Maneli?

Mr B M MANELI: The Global Challenges Research Fund, GCRF, and the developmental programmes are responses to the plight of unemployed graduates and youth within the public and private sectors. Graduates and youth are already struggling to enter the labour market and should ...

Ms M S KHAWULA: Hello. Point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Maneli, there is a point of order.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Bengithi, Mhlonishwa, laphe ubumtshelile ukuthi makaxolise ukuthi akambizanga ngokuthi uyilungu elihloniphekile, kuyimanje ngoba laba abamhlophe nilokhu nibabelese ngokuthi

mabaxolise, lona wena oyilungu likaKhongolose anifuni yena ukuba ahoxise. Cha, musani okwenza sengathi lana kusebholeni, okuya ngokuthi iliphi iqembu ohambisana nalo. Okwesibili okumele kwenzeke, uma uzoba ngusihlalo ngicabanga ukuthi kumele kube nokuqeqesheka okumele kwenzeke ukuthi yini uyini umsebenzi wakho, hayi kuthi ube njengomuntu ozobheka abantu. Akaxolise ukuze sidlule kuleli phuzu. Umhlonishwa uMadlingozi nina nimthatha kancane kuleli Phalamende, uvotelwe njengoba elana, unabantu abamele njengoba elana nje, musani ukumthatha noma ikanjani. Sihlalo, ngicela wenze ubulungiswa.umhlonishwa laphaya ushilo wathi yinto elula nje okumele ayenze okuwukuxolisa nje. Akuzukungcola ngokwenza njalo, angazi nimthembeni lomuntu wenu. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Ms M S KHAWULA: You should have told him to apologise for not referring to him as an hon member. You have been nagging white members to apologise, but because this one is an ANC member you are letting it go. No, don't act like this is a soccer match whereby one becomes biased in respect of their team. Secondly, when you are elected as a chairperson you need to be trained so that you understand your role. You are not here to police people. Could you apologise so that we can proceed. The hon Madlingozi was voted to be here like any other member. Please stop undermining him. He represents a constituency. Please stop undermining him. Chair, kindly do the honourable thing. Apologising is the honourable thing

to do. You won't lose anything by apologising. One wonders why your party has trust in you.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Order! Hon member ...

Besengishilo ekuqaleni ... [Ubuwele-wele.] Besengishilo ukuthi uma ngabe isinqumo engisithathayo lapha asikugculisi, kukhona imigomo ongayilandela njengelungu, uma ngabe ubona iphutha kulento engiyikhulumile lapha, kunendlela okumele uyilandele. Kodwa okwamanje isinqumo ukuthi akaghubeke, uma ngabe kukhona iphutha elingavela singabuyela emuva sithi ngelanga elithile kwathathwa isinqumo esinje. Uma ngabe sasingalunganga leso sinqumo, kuzoshiwo ukuthi cha leso sinqumo sasingafanele ngakho ke kuhoxiswe, kuqhutshekwe nomsebenzi, okwamanje isinqumo sithathiwe. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[I did say earlier ... [Interjections.] ... that if you are not happy with any decision I have made, there are proper channels to follow as a member. For now, though, my decision is that he should continue. If any discrepancies come up, we can always refer back and say on this day this decision was taken. If that decision was wrong, then it will be withdrawn and life will continue. As it is now, the decision has been made and it stands.]

Mr M M CHABANGU: Point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Why are you rising, hon member?

Mong M M CHABANGU: Ntate Ntombela, ke batla ho bua le wena ka setho. O a dumela hore leloko le hlomphehileng le entse phoso fela o batla ho mmuella hore a tswele pele. (*Translation of Sesotho paragraph follows.*)

[Mr M M CHABANGU: Hon Ntombela, I would like to address you about the hon member. You agree that the hon member made a mistake, yet you want to endorse him to continue.]

It is wrong. Unacceptable!

O tshwanetse a re: ke kopa tshwarelo. (*Translation of Sesotho sentence follows.*)

[He ought to say: Please forgive me.]

There is nothing wrong ...

A ke ke a tswa madi ha a ka re: ke kopa tshwarelo - re tswele pele. Ho seng jwalo, re tlo ruta maloko ana a hlomphehileng a fihlang hore ba etse tjena. (*Translation of Sesotho paragraph follows.*)

[He will not bleed for saying, "Please forgive me"; and we then continue. Otherwise, we will instigate these newly arrived hon members to do the same.]

A Rule is a Rule; it can't be changed. Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you very much. It is in that context, hon member, that I made a ruling. Once I have made a ruling, it is a ruling that is binding according to the Rules that you have made. You made those Rules; you agreed to those Rules; and you must conform to those Rules you have agreed to as a House and as different parties. If you are not happy with the decision that I have taken, you have every right to take it to the Rules Committee. There is absolutely nothing that is ... [Inaudible.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: Point of order, Chairperson.

Sengifuna ukukuhlonipha: Ungumnumzana, unguNtombela, ngiyakuhlonipha kodwa into oyenzayo angazi noma wena ubusekugcineni kuhla lwamalunga eza ePhalamende, umhlonishwa wakuthatha wazokufaka lapha ePhalamende wafika wakukhetha ukuthi ube usihlalo manje usaba into elula nje, ungenile manje uyilungu eligcwele njengathi sonke, angeke uxoshwe. Kodwa ngikuhlonipha kangaka Ntombela yini lento oyenzayo, Sihlalo musa ukuchema. ... *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[I want to respect you: You are a man; you are Mr Ntombela. I have respect for you, but I'm not sure if you were last on the list of members who came to Parliament. You have been selected to be the Chair but now you are being a coward. You are in now and you are a fully-fledged member like all of us; you won't get fired. What is it that you are doing now, hon Ntombela? Stop being biased ...]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, I would humbly request you to refrain from doing what you are doing. It cannot be right. I humbly request you ...

Ngiyacela kuwena maKhawula, ... *(Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.)*

[Please, hon Khawula ...]

... can you hold it there, hon member? I humbly request hon members to allow this process to continue and make the necessary presentations on the decision if you think my decision was wrong.

Ms M S KHAWULA: Thank you very much, hon Ntombela. From now ...

Uzoba uNtombela. Ngizozama ukungena lapha kuGoogle, ngithole igama lakho, ngizokubiza ngegama lakho, bese ungitshela ukuthi ngoba nifike nisinike imithetho uma sesithi siyayilandela le mithetho seniyishintshile ngoba ninalomkhuba wokubona abanye sengathi

bangcono kunabanye lana. Okokuqala kumele wazi ukuthi uRingo naye uwumnumzane, unonkosikazi nezingane unesithunzi, okumele nisihloniphe, futhi unewadi alimele ningamthathi kancane. Ukuthi nimazi ewumculi, ngoba wonke umuntu unalokhu nalokhu, ngoba awulazi ikusasa lomuntu, ngoba mhlampe njengoba nawe uhleli laphe phansi kusasa uzobe ungasahleli kuleso Sihlalo. Musa ukuzenza sengathi uNkulunkulu kusolokhu kukhona abantu abangahlonishwa. Kusukela manje sizonibiza ngamagama ... *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[You are going to be Ntombela. I will Google your name so that I may call you by your name. Then you will tell me why you make rules, but when we follow those rules it turns out you have changed them? You seem to think that certain people are better than other people. You need to understand that hon Ringo is also a man, with a wife and children. You need to show respect. He is representing a ward, so don't take him for granted. Knowing him as a singer doesn't mean anything. You are seated there today, but no one knows where you will be tomorrow. Stop acting like you are God and allowing for certain people to be disrespected. From now on, I will refer to you by your name ...]

Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, may I also advise that when you make a point of order, you substantiate your point of order. Do not make a speech. I humbly request you to

observe your own Rules. Secondly, hon members, be careful of your interjections. Your interjections should not disturb the House. Could you continue, hon Maneli?

Mr B M MANELI: Thank you, hon Chair. In assisting the meeting proceeding, I want to say that, indeed, I have not referred to the hon member ...

THE HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, do not touch that issue. Go on with your speech.

Mr B M MANELI: ... but if that is offensive, I have accepted that, Chair, in order that we proceed. As I said, Chair, the Graduate Recruitment Scheme Framework, the GRSF, and developmental programmes are responses to the plight of the unemployed graduates and youth within the public and private sectors. Graduates and the youth are already struggling to enter the labour market. Therefore, as I said, they should not find it harder to start a career in the Public Service, hence the GRSF programme and other internship programmes.

As I said, this is specifically to assist young people who must also get experiential training. This process will add value by minimising the already overburdened paperwork process and administration, and will enhance the service offering by introducing Technology Serve Youth, therefore co-ordinating and aligning any fragmented reporting and communication in dealing with poor service delivery.

I want to highlight, hon House Chair, that, indeed, we support this budget and are confident about it. It has already been shown by the National School of Governance that there are trained facilitators - 52 of them who rolled out a programme to 2 808 unemployed youth. This budget will help us to take it to the next level of 5 000 rural youth in the next two years. We think that is what the ANC is doing and not what it says it would do and not do.

The National School of Governance also signed a memorandum of understanding, as already stated, with the SA Local Government Association, Salga, in August 2016. In our view, this provides an opportunity for us to look at realising a single public service, which would ensure that the mobility within the state is finally realised. On that score, we will be able to share skills from the bottom to the top and from the top to the bottom, in terms of that upward and downward mobility.

Hon Chair, we need skilled and committed human capital in order to arrive at this vision. Some are professionals and some are not. However, the goal is common: to provide service that is impartial, equitable and without bias, irrespective of religion, colour and creed. Indeed, you would have seen in Johannesburg after the 2016 local government elections that Soweto was not the shining example we had before the 2016 elections, because ...

... bangenile emtshatweni, wapotyakala, baphinda bawuqala, kodwa uyancoma nanamhlanje ... (*Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.*)

[... they were in an alliance which broke up, and started it again, but you compliment that today ...]

... when our people are suffering.

We therefore call for government institutions to reinforce and collaborate widely and across sectors to collectively engage in innovation, and to share and exchange knowledge and experiences to make a difference in the lives of our people. The use of online learning encourages self-paced learning. The piloted and implemented open online courses by the National School of Governance have showed much success. As a result, there has been an intake of more than 25 000 learners accessing learning opportunities through this platform. As the ANC, we believe that innovation serves as a catalyst in ensuring effective state machinery.

Hon Chair, allow me to indicate that, whilst there may be a situation in which others look at us as though we are not looking at issues of competent people, it is the resolution of the ANC that we actually look at meritocracy so that people are brought in on the basis of merit and the competencies they have. I want to state that it is also opportunistic that when you get to a portfolio committee you are presented with a programme that already says that the Public

Service Commission is working with the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation and the Department of Public Service and Administration to ensure that a Bill does come forward that looks at how heads of departments and directors-general will be appointed. But you come here and plagiarise it as though it will a member's Bill that will be presented by the DA. Therefore, it would not be an issue.

Hon Chair, allow me to indicate that from where we are all these initiatives will naturally need sustained funding, as already accepted by all of us. Costs will add up with the expression of interest and increasing targets. Furthermore, the success, hon Chair, would need us to build a social compact that will put all stakeholders, especially labour, in a mode of patriotism in all spheres of government. When it comes to the working relationships the Minister referred to, we think it is important that we ensure they last, not only on this level but also on the local level. When we talk about the experience of a citizen at a public service point, we should be confident that even if we are in the Western Cape - if it is a single public service and there is only one government at a national level that seeks to address challenges faced by people - it will not take longer to get to townships when it is easy to get service on the other side of town.

We say this because, as I outlined before, we have been told of a vision that the DA has and that the ANC still keeps to an old

vision. For as long as blacks in general, Africans in particular, still feel excluded in this space, we will continue to force the integration of service, so that we can finally enjoy the fruits of our freedom.

Hon Chair, we are also in Mandela month, and the Public Service is at the centre of delivering services. Celebrating 18 July, which will also be done internationally, presents an opportunity not only for the political leadership, but for all servants in the Public Service to also contribute in their different ways to render service on the day. This day isn't considered, necessarily, a public holiday, but rather a day to serve.

Allow me to conclude by coming back to this point. We support that action must be taken. That is why we appreciate that cases get resolved within a reasonable time whenever they are picked up. In the same vein, when there are allegations that get made, it is always important to allow investigations to take their course and allow those to finish so that we do not pre-judge investigations.

I want to applaud the ANC in that, in the midst of an election, it did not revert to blocking investigations but allowed the investigations to go on. We understood that there were risks, but we took the risks because we do not put the party first. In our tradition, our policies and everything else - as Tambo would have said at the 48th conference - we have always been informed by

people. Even if, at the time, we believed that they were correct, we would change them if they did not resonate with the people. When the people of the country cried about corruption, we said that the commission would proceed irrespective of the elections.

We also know that getting to the era of hope and renewal is when we are prisoners of our own convictions in that we deal decisively with corruption whenever there is evidence of corruption. I say this deliberately because it very easy to smear the names of people and not want to own up. Motions must be put that can be tested and evidence must be presented. I submit, hon Chair. I thank you.

[Applause.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: House Chair, to conclude the debate, I must first acknowledge and express appreciation for all the participants and their contributions. They are valuable, indeed, and we appreciate them. Secondly, let me assure the chairperson of the portfolio committee and the committee as a whole that we noted your reports and the issues that you raised. We will be taking them further and taking them forward. We will work with you on all of them. We think they are not that difficult - issues of discipline, disciplinary cases, the ministerial handbook, acting appointments and ensuring opportunities for young people in terms of jobs.

Thirdly, in terms of reconfiguration: yes, we are pushing forward, and we hope that the whole process will be completed by December. But reconfiguration does not mean retrenchments in any way; it is not a tool to retrench. Where there may be difficulties of accommodating extra public servants, we will make an attempt to find mechanisms to deal with such situations if they arise. But reconfiguration shouldn't be confused with retrenchment.

The next point I want to make is the following. Yes, we did get different views on the cost of public administration. It is ongoing work, but we are committed to ensuring that the state doesn't sink as a result of the cost of public administration.

I listened quite carefully when one of the members was talking here. I took on board a point that, I think, is very important, which is that in the Public Service there are good people and there are good public servants. I fully agree with that, not just in this House but because out there it is borne out by facts. There are good public servants. Those public servants who are good are the ones we need to protect and that we need to support. We need to make sure that they consolidate their presence wherever they are. However, wherever we come across those that are not good, whether they are in Tshwane, Johannesburg or Cape Town, we will have to follow them and deal with them accordingly.

We want to express our appreciation to all our guests who respected us and who came here. We note that some of them have left, particularly the students - prospective employees of the Department of Public Service and Administration or just the Public Service as a whole. We hope that we shared with them what we needed to share with them. I want to submit, Chair, that you had a difficult session, but thank you very much for everything. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Order! Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, after very careful consideration of the concerns that members raised with regard to the issue of the hon Ringo Madlingozi, we will go back and look at the context of the whole thing and even visit the Hansard so that in the next plenary a ruling can be made. Thank you very much.

The mini-plenary session rose at 16:33.