

TUESDAY, 23 JULY 2019

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 10:00.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see col 000.

**SUSPENSION OF RULE 290(2) (a) RELATING TO DEBATE ON SECOND
READING OF A BILL**

(Draft Resolution)

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the House suspends Rule 290(2) (a), which provides inter alia that the debate on the Second Reading of a Bill may not commence before at least three working days have elapsed since the committee's report was tabled.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, we object and we would like to make a declaration in terms of Rule 108 of the National Assembly Rules.

Declaration(s) of vote:

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, it is quite appropriate that the lights are down today because this is certainly a dark day for Parliament. You know that we addressed some correspondence relating to what has once again become a fascicle process of amending a Money Bill here in Parliament.

The Money Bills Amendment Act is very clear on the process to be followed and what is supposed to happen in a process like this. Parliament is supposed to meaningfully engage with the Appropriation Bill. It must be given the opportunity to move amendments, all the Members of Parliament should be able to bring their ideas that should trigger a backwards and forth between the executive that then leads to a Bill which we can all hand and heart agree that it was well-considered, it was well-processed and represents the best interest of the will of this Parliament.

Every single year - you see the lights are coming on, this is an enlightening speech - every single year when we end up with a

dog's breakfast that is the processing of the Appropriation Bill, we hear the same promises from the other side that it will be different the next year. That it is going to be changed, we fix the procedure, we will make it a more meaningful process, we will allow more amendments from the Members of Parliament, we will ensure that the people of South Africa have inputs through their public representative in this Appropriation Bill. But here we sit again, another year without a proper process.

The scheduling of the Appropriations Committee ...

[Interjections.] ... I will come to the point. You see, I will come to the point and the point is that members like the hon Dyantyi, who just can't make the transition from the provincial legislature, think that we should just be a rubber stamp for what the executive wants. He doesn't want to do his duty as a public representative ensuring that people's views are raised here. He wants to be his master's voice. Yes executive - no executive - three bags full executive. Well, you may want to be a sheep; I don't want to be a sheep; I am a public representative and we are going to make sure that the people's voices are heard here.

Once again, public submissions simply not properly considered.

We put a number of amendments which are excellent amendments

which will ensure better health care, better service delivery, and help drive employment in South Africa. And yet, none of these got proper consideration in terms of this particular piece of legislation and that is a shame! It is an absolute shame that, that is the case. You can hear the howling from people who don't want to do their job. They just want a day to be over. They want to put their hand in the air and say yes, no, yes, no, yes, no. That's all they want to do. They don't want to do the work that is required of us as legislated.

So, I'm dearly sorry, Deputy Speaker, but your letter doesn't pass muster. The committee has misled you. Our amendments were never properly considered because we got a ridiculous legal opinion which said that there wasn't enough time. The reason there wasn't enough time is because the Appropriations Committee gave itself so little time for a meaningful, engaging process of amending a Money Bill to take place. Not good enough!

And it's little wonder why Deputy Chief Justice Zondo, a fortnight ago criticized this House for not doing its job. Just yesterday, the Deputy Chief Justice repeated his claims that this House is not doing its job and you can see why it's not doing its job because a prevailing view of the majority party is, we don't care about the law, we don't care about processes

and we don't care about ensuring that Parliament and us as Members of Parliament, do our job properly in amending legislation, giving it a proper scrutiny and ensuring we do right by the people of South Africa.

I want to put you on notice, Deputy Speaker, that we have given you three mulligans now over the cause of the last three years by not taking the Appropriation Bill on review because of procedural irregularities. The last two years we have had a sitter of a case. We could have reviewed the NCOP's adoption of the Bill precisely for the same impediments that we were witnessing here today but we gave you a mulligan. I am sorry, it's three strikes now and you are out. This Bill will be reviewed and you will be found wanting. Hon Dyantyi, I look forward to you choking on gin and tonic when we come and present that court judgment in this House. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Morning, hon Deputy Speaker, hon members and the Deputy President of the country. I just want to state categorically clear that the DA has never in any of our internal consultative structures raised any of what they just raised on this podium today. We have the Chief Whip's Forum where we consult one another; we also have the National Assembly Programming Committee, and they have never raised this.

So, the amendments the hon Steenhuisen is raising are neoliberal in nature. We are not going to take that. I also want to remind all South Africans that this has not been an easy year for all of us. We just came from the elections campaign, and we have been working under pressure to ensure that we pass this Budget at the stipulated time as we have a timeframe to pass a budget. So, for them to come to this podium and grandstand, my friend, is uncalled for and cheap political points scoring.

Sifuna kutjela bantfu bakitsi kute bavisise kubaluleka kweku phasiswa kwe lwabiwo mali, nekutsi kubalulekile kutsi ematiko ahulumende asebente. Singu Khongolose sitakwenta loko.

Ngiyabonga, Sekelasomlomo. (*Translation of Siswati paragraph follows.*)

[We want to tell our people that it is important to support this Budget Vote, and that it is also important for government departments do their work. As the ANC, we will do that. Thank you, Deputy Chairperson.]

Question put: That the motion moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party be agreed to.

Division demanded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please take your seats. We request you to do so, so that you are in your allocated seats. When requested to do so, please simply indicate your vote by pressing the appropriate button below the yes, no or abstain signs.

If you inadvertently press the wrong button, you may thereafter press the correct button. The last button pressed will be recorded as your vote when the voting session is closed by the Chair.

The question before the House is that the motion moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party be agreed to.

Are all members in their allocated seats? Voting will now commence. Those in favour should press the 'yes' button; those against press the 'no' button and those wishing to abstain should press the 'abstain' button. Have all members voted? The voting session is now closed.

The House divided.

AYES - 207: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; August, S N; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo,

B T; Boroto, M G; Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, N;
Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Creecy, B D; De Lille,
P; Dhlomo, S M; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlakude,
D E; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N;
Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Frolick, C T; Gantsho,
N; Gela, A; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M;
Hendricks, M G E; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M D;
Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F;
Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Kibi, M T;
Kiviet, N; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M; Lamola,
R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L;
Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D; Magadzi, D
P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehllala, T; Mahlalela, A F;
Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D;
Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majenzi, Z; Malatji, T ;
Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B;
Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ;
Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K;
Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M
R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D;
Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M;
Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbinqo-Gigaba, B P;
Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, E S; Mchunu,
T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N;

Mkhatshwa, N T; Mkhize, Z L; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z;
Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng,
J M; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R;
Morolong, I K; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A;
Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A
H; Mthethwa, E N; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni,
E T; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L;
Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi,
B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D;
Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T;
Nxumalo, M N; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Peacock, N
P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-
Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A
M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P;
Sihlwayi, N N; Siwela, V S; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G
J; Skwatsha, M; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B;
Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N;
Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete,
B; Tshwete, P; Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Sisulu, L
N; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D;
Xego, S T; Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M;
Zwane, M J.

NOES - 68: Abrahams, A L A; Bagrain, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chetty, M; Cuthbert, M J; De Villiers, J N; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khanyile, T A; King, C V; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Masipa, N P; Mazzone, N W A; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Mey, P ; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder, F J; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; Van Staden, P A; Waters, M; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

ABSTAIN - 13: Arries, L H; Chabangu, M M; Chirwa, N N; Khawula, M S; Komane, R N; Matiase, N S; Mohlala, M R; Mokause, M O; Moteka, P G; Ngwenya, D B; Siwisa, A M; Thembekwayo, S S; Tito, L F.

Question agreed to.

Motion accordingly agreed to.

SPECIAL APPROPRIATION BILL

(Introduction)

There was no debate.

The Minister of Finance introduced the Bill.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly, Deputy President of the Republic of South Africa, the leader of the opposition in absentia, the leader of the EFF in absentia, other leaders in absentia, including those who shout the loudest, I stand here before you to present the Special Appropriation Bill aimed at providing additional financial support to Eskom for the current and next financial year.

I stated before, during the Budget Vote 7 for National Treasury that Eskom presents the biggest risk to the financial fiscal framework because of its financial difficulties and its negative impact on the lives of ordinary South Africans. Given the risks to the economy of the systematic failure, if Eskom were to

collapse, the government is urgently working to stabilise the institution whilst developing a broad strategy for its future.

Eskom faces serious financial and operational challenges which, to a large extent, were caused by the governance challenges which are playing themselves out at the Zondo Commission and the entity previously experienced many challenges which resulted in a decline in investor confidence. As it stands, Eskom is not financially sustainable based on its current high levels of debt and its inability to generate sufficient revenue to meet its operational and capital obligations, which expose the entity to high levels of liquidity and balance sheet risks.

Therefore, without major changes to Eskom's business model and financial assistance being provided by government, the company will be unable to meet its financial obligations through the 2019-20 financial year. At a strategic level, we must thus face the reality that a large, vertically integrated energy company is an outdated model in a changing industry, both domestically and internationally.

Hon members should also be reminded that the fiscal support we are announcing today will come at a significant cost to the fiscus and to South African taxpayers. In addition to the

financial support to Eskom, there is also a preliminary indication that tax revenue could be significantly lower than budgeted for in the 2019-20 Budget. This could substantially increase the government's borrowing requirement for 2019-20, which will require government to revise its funding strategy and current weekly bond issuance at levels beyond what we had planned. Let me repeat this; this will substantially increase the government's borrowing requirement for 2019-20, which will require government to revise its funding strategy and current weekly bond issuance levels before the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS in October. What I am trying to indicate here colleagues, is that we are facing a very serious financial situation.

It is important that the House notes that Eskom's debt is reliant on its liquidity position and that has worsened. Although government has committed R23 billion to be allocated to Eskom over the next three years in the current fiscal framework, Eskom's funding plan is dependent on their ability to raise additional finance from the market, which in turn requires them to be a going concern.

It is therefore important to note that the proposed financial support for 2019-20 and 2020-21 financial years, addresses the

going-concern status and enables Eskom to honour its obligations. Therefore, the request for Special Appropriation Bill's approval for additional financial support for Eskom is as follows; an additional R26 billion in 2019-20 financial year; and R33 billion in the 2020-21 financial year. However, the future sustainability of Eskom will have to be addressed, and its debt levels restructured and sorted.

My colleague, Minister Pravin Gordon and I have been in conversation about the appointment of Chief Restructuring Officer and pending finalisation of consultations, we should be able to announce that Restructuring Officer later today. Deputy Speaker, I therefore introduce the Special Appropriation Bill for consideration by this honourable House. Thank you very much.

[Applause.]

Special Appropriation Bill referred to the Standing Committee on Appropriations for consideration and report.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF AD HOC COMMITTEE TO ALLOW MEMBERS OF
THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY TO BE BRIEFED PRIOR TO THE DEBATE ON VOTE**

NO 7: NATIONAL TREASURY (STATE SECURITY)

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON APPROPRIATIONS

- APPROPRIATION BILL

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Motion agreed to (Democratic Alliance and Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

APPROPRIATION BILL

(First Reading debate)

Mr S N BUTHELEZI: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Deputy President of the Republic of South Africa, hon Ministers, hon Deputy Ministers, hon members, compatriots, fellow South Africans, ladies and gentlemen, first thing first, the ANC supports the 2019 Appropriation Bill. [Applause.]

This is the month in which we are celebrating the life of the first President of the Democratic South Africa; the first commander-in-chief of the People's Army Umkhonto WeSizwe. It is the year in which we are commemorating 40 years of the hanging of comrade Solomon Kalushi Mahlangu for having followed the clarion call by Madiba to fight the system which dehumanized and denied the black majority of our country democratic rights in the country of their birth.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as we celebrate these giants of our struggle, let's not forget our other heroes and heroines who perished in a similar fashion for the rights you and I are enjoying today. This includes the right to stand here and debate about the type of Budget which will service all the people of our country, irrespective of race, gender or creed.

I am referring to Thabo Motaung, Nokuthula Simelane, Phinda Ndwandwe, Semano Mosolodi, Thelle Mogoerane, Andrew Zondo,

Jameson Mngomezulu, and many other known and unknown martyrs of our struggle. They were either guillotined or murdered by the people who sometimes stand on moral high ground pedestals and want to lecture us about democracy and justice. They died trying to correct the apartheid mess visited upon our people in defence of narrow white privilege.

With the democratic space that their blood opened for us, we are continuing to clean the mess of Bantu Education, economic exclusion, homelessness, and Group Areas Act. We need to ensure that their death was not in vain. This Appropriation Bill attempts to do that, and hon members it is not easy; the forces of resistance are hard at work.

Hon members, allow me to thank members of the Standing Committee on Appropriations for their diligence and hard work in ensuring that we are able to table the report in this house within the time prescribed by the Money Bills Amendment Procedure and Related Matters Act, before the end of July. Also, let me appreciate the assistance from the support staff, National Treasury, Financial and Fiscal Commission and Parliamentary Budget Office, who all ensured that we hit the tarmac running. The Committee had less than a month to complete its work, and that it did.

Let me just add here hon members, that the report was unanimously adopted by the committee. Deputy Speaker, let me briefly share with this august House the process that this Bill went through. The Bill was referred by the Speaker to the committee at the beginning of July after it was revived by National Assembly at the request of the Minister of Finance for consideration. The Appropriation Bill proposes to appropriate, that is to allocate from National Revenue Fund for the requirements of the state and to prescribe conditions for the spending of funds withdrawn.

For service delivery to continue, it is critical that the House today passes the Appropriation Bill 2019. Hon members, this allows Parliament, through the committee to effectively play its oversight role. More importantly, this being the people's Parliament, it allows South Africans of all colours, all classes and strata to have a say in their Budget. This is critical for the Budget and Finance to be demystified. Budget is about people's life, and our democracy is a participatory one. It cannot be, and it should not be seen to be something for the chosen few. Our forebears correctly declared in Kliptown, to our country and the world that, "People shall govern".

Hon members, we should find ways of enabling our people, especially the poorest of the poor, the biggest victims of that obnoxious apartheid system and colonialism of a special type to also participate in the budgetary process that affects their lives. We need to be creative and allow people from Dlebe, Cofimvaba, Okhukho, Malamulele, Marapyane, Kuruman and Ga-Matlala to be part of this critical process. These are far-flung areas where services are needed most.

However, we were encouraged by Mr Khanyile from Melmoth who made a very important input about what government must do with restituted farms. Please refer to our report for further details. We were also happy to receive input from Mr Guy Harris who requested the committee to focus its resources on Early Childhood Development. Novak Djokovic, number one men's singles tennis player is correct when he says:

Building a solid foundation in the early years of a child's life will not only help him or her reach their full potential but will also result in better societies as a whole.

Job creation is very important and the initiatives from the jobs summit convened by His Excellency, the President last year must be supported. Equally important is the need to save jobs. We

agree with Cosatu that jobs must also be protected. We call upon all the employers, public and private to do everything to prevent job attrition. The economy of our country has been ailing for about a decade now, since the global economic crisis which did not spare anyone, both the developed and developing world.

The Q1/2019 economic growth results which showed that our economy contracted by 3,2% further complicates the work of government. Hon Deputy Speaker, economic growth is positively related to revenues, as the Minister has just indicated. If the economy does not perform, do not expect miracles from Sars. Revenues also shrink, but people's needs do not shrink. This partly explains why our Debt to GDP is worsening towards 60% because the government should go and borrow. The deficit of R215 billion or 4,3% of GDP must be borrowed. That's no rocket science.

The committee is therefore both appreciative and sympathetic to National Treasury and executive in the balancing act they have to execute under very trying economic conditions. The committee is happy that the bigger expenditure is still directed at education, health and social welfare. There can therefore be no doubt that this Budget continues to be pro-poor and is concerned

about providing the proverbial safety net to our people. We do that to try and realise Madiba's dream when he pronounced at his inauguration:

We pledge ourselves to liberate all our people from the continuing bondage of poverty, deprivation, suffering, gender and other discrimination.

Hon members, public sector expenditure on infrastructure stands at R864,9 billion over the 2019 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF period. It also reminds us of the backlog that the democratic government inherited in 1994 and must be dealt with. The backlog deliberately created to forever make the majority of South Africans spectators in the economic activity of their country. It is important to always remember that the social catastrophe we are dealing with today was not a natural disaster but it was man-made.

The infrastructure spend is meant to address centuries of deliberate neglect of black people. As far as this allocation and the whole Budget is concerned, we would like to make the following comments. Firstly, this needs proper project planning and execution. Examples of overspending are too many, the Transnet Pipeline, Gautrain, Medupi, Kusile and many others.

Secondly, public infrastructure is not an end itself, but it should be considered a necessary but not sufficient condition for economic growth; it should serve to also crowd in private sector investments. In delivery of these infrastructure projects let everyone be involved; in this regard, the black professionals who are forever crying and correctly so, that they are marginalized.

It cannot be right that black engineers, architects, lawyers, auditors, etc. are spectators in the rebuilding of our country; also, a deliberate strategy that ensures that women and youth also get a share of this pie. If we exclude women and youth from economic activity, we can be rest assured that all the lofty ideals we are talking about will be stillborn. We urge portfolio committees to monitor this area. It is wrong and cannot be defended.

As His Excellency, the President of the Republic, Cyril Ramaphosa said: "The democratic dividend must be shared by all". The myriad of excuses that are used to perpetuate economic marginalization should be stopped. Still on infrastructure, hon members, it is important that we get value for money. As they say, once beaten, twice shy.

Singaqhuzulwa itshe elilodwa kabilil. (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[Let us not trip over the same stone twice.]

The corruption of construction companies, whitewashed as collusion in overcharging the state, as it happened during the construction of stadia in 2010, should not reoccur. It does not make sense for somebody who steals R1 million to go to jail, and for those who steal billions to pay their way out, not even blacklisted. We need to live by the Freedom Charter which unequivocally states that: "All shall be equal before the law!"

The committee agrees with the Financial and Fiscal Commission that going forward more resources should be directed to those sectors identified for stimulus. Agriculture and Tourism were scientifically identified as critical and important in reigniting the economy. The multiplier effects in terms of economic growth and employment creation are huge, especially to low-skilled workers who are hit the hardest by poverty.

We are therefore saying, going forward, it is important that these sectors be better resourced. The committee agrees with the invoking of section 16 (1) of the Public Finance Management Act,

PFMA by the Minister of Finance when he authorized R17,652 billion for Eskom. Failure to do so, would have had untold consequences to the debt structure of not just Eskom, but other SOCs due to cross-default and the national fiscus.

The technical amendments due to the reconfiguration of departments were not just unavoidable, but necessary. There is no doubt that this exercise would lead to efficiency gains and better alignment. Hon Deputy Speaker, we would like to stress that the utilization of appropriated funds by departments is important. But what is even more important is whether we get maximum impact and returns from those resources - Value for Money!

The Speaker of the National Assembly, hon Thandi Modise argued, and correctly so that:

We must now increase our ability as Parliament to scrutinize, evaluate, and monitor the availability, the quality and frequency of the services, to ensure that there is value for money and there is positive impact on the quality of life of South Africans.

The answer to many of our problems is to get our economy firing from all cylinders. It is thus an incontrovertible truth, as the President argues that,

We cannot turn our fortunes around without a relentless focus on economic growth.

It is important therefore that we mobilize every citizen to see this as his or her responsibility to work towards that goal. Let us unleash the brainpower of our intellectuals, workers, business, young and old, civil society and our international friends to come up with ideas and strategies to achieve that objective. It is only then that we will avoid what Minister Ayanda Dlodlo call, "dithering at the gate of white privilege" by the majority of our people.

The existence of poverty and squalor on one side, and opulence and wealth on the other, as is the case with Sandton and Alexander, is not just unwanted, but it is also unsustainable. We should commit ourselves to efficiently use the appropriated resources to attack that inequality. Let us therefore all commit to growing South Africa together, as the ANC calls. In case you missed it at the beginning, the ANC supports the Bill.

[Applause.]

Mnr D JOSEPH: Agb Adjunkspeaker, ek lewer hierdie toespraak vandag ter ondersteuning van die Khoisan-organisasies in Suid-Afrika. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.*)

[Mr D JOSEPH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I deliver this speech today in support of the Khoisan organisations in South Africa.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, Ministers, Leader of the Opposition and members of the public, we must be honest with ourselves that our country is in financial trouble and we need to urgently find a solution for this. But before we speak about appropriation, we must be reminded that income of the state should guide our expenditure. It is very important to look at the income of the state.

On behalf of the DA, I thank all those who pay their taxes on time. To the people who participate in the growth of our economy, your contribution cannot go unnoticed. Deputy Speaker, it is also important to show appreciation to all the individuals and organisations that do voluntary work, charity work and serve communities on a daily basis, without expecting anything in return. We salute you and thank you. [Applause.]

Deputy Speaker, in order for our country to move forward, the inequalities of the past must be addressed by all in this House without delay. The past I refer to is apartheid, a time characterised by the absence of human dignity, great poverty and various forms of inequality. Let us create a future that is better than our past.

Now, the President has asked us to give his 'new dawn' a chance. I say, this 'new dawn' is nothing more than an admission of guilt that the ANC has failed South Africans. Under the Zuma administration, South Africa stopped working. The DA started the Stop-Zuma campaign in 2009. South Africans from all walks of life joined ANC Veterans and until that time, the ANC realised they had messed up and had to recall President Zuma.

The DA has campaigned for 10 years on behalf of the people of Cape Town to call for the national government's assistance to protect innocent people from dying in their thousands on the Cape Flats due to gangsterism. The ANC only responded 10 years later. We need peace, security and stability, not only in Africa, but in South Africa, our country, as well.

The DA warned the Minister of Home Affairs about the government's policies relating to visas, which have a negative

impact on tourism and job creation. Why does it take the ANC so long to understand that the opposition parties, which are part of multi-government, can also make a contribution for a better South Africa?

The DA also raised questions about the former President here in this House debates, media reports, and even court cases, while the former President stood on this podium and arrogantly laughed at members and South Africans. Today, it is now the responsibility of the Sixth Parliament to fix the mess for the sake of our future generations.

The Appropriation Bill is very important and we will not support it. But it is important that we support women and children. We do support certain sections and Votes but we will not support this Bill. What we need is the political will of the ruling party and good policy for investor confidence. That is what we need in this country. I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms M O MOKAUSE: Deputy Speaker, the EFF stands here today to inform the House that we will not support anything which does not speak to the poor masses of this country. [Interjections.] If as lawmakers, as Members of Parliament, we had a greater appreciation for the Constitution and the work we do, we were

supposed to engage more meaningfully with the Appropriation Bill than what we are doing now. The process to amend the Appropriation Bill is there. The Money Bills Act is there. Section 10 (7) , which says, "Parliament must pass, with or without amendments, or reject the Appropriation Bill", is there. But since the passing of the Money Bills Act, not once, not the Appropriation Bill, or not the adjusted Appropriation Bill was ever amended to respond to issues we agree, as Parliament, needs funding.

We are raising these issues of Parliament powers to amend the Appropriation Bill because in the mini plenaries, we all agreed that the National Director of Public Prosecutions needs more money to avoid public prosecution being auctioned to the highest bidder; and the Office of the Chief Justice needs resources to safeguard our democracy. We all agreed that we must fund Statistics SA because failure to fund such an important institution's decision-making amounts to failure to govern and is reckless.

We agreed that the Office of the Public Protector needs serious capacity and is extremely underfunded. The fact that it is the National Treasury that tells the Office of the Public Protector there is no money for security in her office, is a problem. But

when the Public Protector wanted money to investigate state capture, all of a sudden there was money.

We also agreed that Cabinet is still largely bloated and we do not need Deputy Ministers and some of them are seated here. We don't even know them and what they are doing but they are earning huge sums of salaries. [Interjections.]

We agreed on these and many other issues in our Budget Vote debates, but we still come here to pass the Appropriation Bill without the smallest amendment to what we agreed on. It took almost 10 years to have legislation that gives effect to Section 77 of the Constitution that allows Parliament to amend Money Bills, yet we agree on much-needed changes but it all ends in a talk shop here with the ANC-led government. We rubber-stamp everything that the Minister comes and presents here.

Those who drafted the Constitution were mindful that Money Bills by their very nature are at the centre of the entire governance system. If we don't take responsibility as lawmakers, that amounts to us being constitutional delinquents ourselves.

There is nothing new. There is no new dawn. There is no renewal. This is just a dream. We are just continuing with the same

Appropriation Bill from President Zuma's era. This happens because the Standing Committee on Appropriations lacks capacity and since its formation, the Parliament Budget Office has added little or no value to it. Let's start the process to build Parliament Budget Office properly instead of the current Parliament Budget Office that conducts its business as if it is a division inside the National Treasury stationed in Parliament.

Let's also agree as the National Assembly that we are going to align the process of passing the Appropriation Bill and other Money Bills to ensure that we do not pass these Bills after the fact. As things stand, we pass these Bills when departments are already spending the money.

On Eskom, what is clear for all to see is the fact that efforts to stabilise the power utility have failed dismally. The first mistake was to get friends who know nothing about electricity to revive the collapsing Eskom. We warned President Ramaphosa about Sifiso Dabengwa, and now we know he was appointed as a reward for his fund-raising efforts of the CR-17 campaign. [Applause.]

We also warned him about Jabu Mabuza and all his conflicts and proximity to the Ruperts family. But because the intention is to collapse Eskom, make it dysfunction and sell it for nothing to

benefit the likes of Rothschild and Investec. Whatever money we put in Eskom, is being looted. And we know your attitude towards SOEs, Minister. We must commit to state ownership of Eskom. Let's allow Eskom to build its own renewable energy capacity. Let's appoint competent and qualified people to run Eskom. Any attempt to privatise Eskom will be met with the contempt it deserves. We reject this Appropriation Bill. [Applause.]

Mr E M BUTHELEZI: Deputy Speaker, hon members, Ministers, we find ourselves in this position on Eskom once again. When they tell us to jump, we continue to ask how high?

This time around, the Minister has just told us that very soon we will be required to jump for R17,5 billion. It's totally unacceptable that we continue to throw money at Eskom. We cannot be told to throw financial resources to nonfinancial problems.

Eskom is like a car leaking fuel, yet we pour and pour more fuel when we have not fixed what is broken.

Transparency is essential in ensuring that South Africa knows exactly where her money will be spent, how much of it and where she is able to save.

Fiscal management and strict financial controls within the National Treasury are commendable. However, the culprits are the departments which, year-on-year, underspend their budgets, and gross amounts of irregular, fruitless, wasteful and unauthorised expenditure is incurred.

What is of concern is that there is no consequence management for those who are implicated in mismanagement of funds and corruption.

If you find someone else's hand in your pocket, you react immediately, but when it comes to someone taking from the state's coffers, there is little to no reaction and that is a major problem.

Fruitless and wasteful expenditure within all departments must become something of the past when we rise to this podium over the next few years.

That is an ideal which will see our people receive value for their hard-earned money.

Municipalities have become a headache for the state. It appears that municipalities continue to compromise standards in the most critical positions.

Incompetence seems to prevail across the spectrum from managers, CFOs and internal risk and audit committees.

Evidence to this is the fact that every municipality outsources services and audits and makes use of consultants. Internal positions are filled and exist, yet these people are unable to do their work.

Supply chain management and procurement are flouted and this affects the poorest of the poor because tenders which may benefit the communities go to friends of those who work for government departments.

Positions which are advertised are mere formalities as cadres are already lined up to fill those vacancies.

In some instances, you find that a minimum requirement is a degree for a position, yet the advert would require a mere matric, because the person earmarked for that position is

unskilled for that position. So, the IFP said this must stop. We do support this Budget. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr W W WESSELS: Hon Deputy Speaker, this Appropriation Bill is not aimed at development but rather at sustaining poverty, people's dependency on government, government's interference in the economy and government's policy uncertainty.

The hon Buthelezi, the chairperson of the committee says we are cleaning a mess. The mess you are trying to clean is a mess that you made yourself, a mess that you are responsible for. The mess we are facing, hon Buthelezi, you are correct, it's not a natural disaster or caused by natural disaster, but it's a disaster caused by the ANC. It's ANC-made.

I am very worried, hon Deputy Speaker, when the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Appropriations blames the economy as if it's isolated. It's your fiscal policies. It's your Appropriation Bills. It's your priorities. It's your state capture which created the economic crises we are facing. It's not the economy out there. Wake up and smell the roses.

Hon Deputy Speaker, who allowed the exploitation of government by contractors? The hon Buthelezi says we must address that and

not allow it. Again, It's you who allowed it. This Appropriation provides for a department and departments which have no rights to existence. These departments, Ministries and Deputy Ministries are only Black holes for taxpayer's money but no actual reform. It provides for failed policy directions and wrong priorities. It places Higher Education as a higher priority than Basic Education. It provides for wrong policy directions such as the National Health Insurance which will create more poverty, more lack of access to health care and will create a total mess which, in 10-years' time, you again are going to stand here and say we must clean.

Following its June mission to South Africa, the International Monetary Fund, IMF, called for structural reforms to the labour market and intervention to reduce the cost and difficulty of doing business. The Reserve Bank repeated this call for structural reforms. Does this Appropriation Bill provide for any structural reforms, Deputy Speaker? It does not. It's a shame, Deputy Speaker, that we must stand here and hear that our state-owned enterprises are failing and that we need Special Appropriation Bill.

Why is the power utility financially unsustainable? Is it the lack of demands for its products? Is it the lack of clients? No,

Eskom supplies more than 90% of the country's electricity and the demand for electricity supply is increasing daily.

The need for financial assistance is not because of a lack of demand but because of the ANC, and your cadre-deployment committee which appointed incompetent CEOs and people to run the utility. It's because of this Parliament and the ruling party's lack of oversight over the utility and all state-owned enterprises that we are facing these crises. You must take responsibility. It's your municipalities which are collapsing. It's you, who allowed local government to collapse and service delivery not to take place. We can never be above the economy whilst there is no service delivery.

Local government must be addressed. Our state-owned entities must be addressed and we need structural reform. I thank you.

Mr S N SWART: Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP notes the dramatic change in the country's economic prospects since the Appropriation Bill was tabled in February with a 3,2% contraction in economic growth for the first quarter of the year, caused largely by Eskom's load shedding. Economic growth estimates are being revised downwards to below 1% for the year. This, in turn, as the Minister indicated, will affect revenue

collection projections and place greater strain on state finances.

Now those revenue estimates were already down 42,8 billion in February's Budget and the reduction will be even worse given the low economic growth projections.

With the budget deficit set to rise from last year's 3,5% to far higher than February's substantial increase of 4,5%, this will result in a staggering R242,7 billion budget deficit. However, the issue is: What does it cost to service that budget deficit? The estimate was R202 billion and that is just to pay interest. That is set to increase to service a gross loan debt of R3 trillion and how much is that? That is R3 000 billion.

Minister, the ACDP agrees with you. We are facing a very serious financial situation. However, we do note that there have been significant baseline reductions totalling R8,3 billion for this financial year and R50 billion over the medium-term. So, there are attempts at fiscal consolidation. One of the largest reductions is R4,2 billion for the Passenger Rail Agency of SA, Prasa, allocation.

Now, as the ACDP, we appreciate the attempts on fiscal consolidation that would impact the passenger rail system. And we know the Minister of Transport will also be looking closely at that as it will further adversely affect the already-deplorable state of our passenger rail system. We, as the ACDP and other Members of Parliament, MPs, need to focus on and watch this.

Minister, you referred to the commissions and evidence there, and from our perspective sitting on the Portfolio Committee on Justice and Correctional Services, action needs to be taken. Those who are implicated need to be prosecuted and stolen funds need to be collected.

However, why don't we make use of the Al-Capone option? Al Capone was the gangster as you know Minister; he was arrested for tax evasion. The process of recovering tax and penalties on ill-gotten fruits of state capture is far simpler than obtaining a conviction in a criminal court. The SA Revenue Service, Sars, can raise estimated assessments based on the evidence at the Zondo Commission and other commissions of enquiry, and charge a 150% penalty. They can obtain a civil judgment, appoint banks' agents and recover those monies from those state capturers. This will help balance the books and also deprive those state

capturers of funds to fight criminal cases. This is a win-win situation. I thank you. [Applause.]

Mr A N SARUPEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, we cannot stand here today, and say that Parliament has adequately considered the Appropriation Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please let us allow speakers to speak. Your noise ... no, no, no, no! Hon members, you are out of order, when you refer to the hon member ... This is out of order. Hon members do not do that. That is bad! You are not supposed to be referring to people about their personal features. It is irresponsible. "Ja, ja." [Yes, yes.] [Applause.]

Mr A N SARUPEN: Deputy Speaker, I did not realise that we discriminate on height, but the ANC seems to be willing to discriminate on any basis these days. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, we cannot stand here and say that this Bill has been properly considered. The reality is that, due to time constraints created by this Parliament, the report that was adopted did not even consider the amendments proposed by the DA.

However, what is worse we hear platitudes about public participation and about agreements on Early Childhood Development, ECD. However, not a single amendment was moved by anyone agreeing with those points apart from the DA on adjusting the budget and the reality is, it is just lip service; we have failed in our duty as this Parliament and that is an indictment on the governing party.

This Budget, hon Deputy Speaker, is a bailout Budget. The outcome of state capture is that all South Africans now have to endure public service cuts to bail out what was stolen from Eskom and other state-owned enterprises, SOEs. Commuter trains are being cut by R4,2 billion, municipal infrastructure loses R1 billion, Special Economic Zones face cuts and this is what a fiscal cliff looks like - when you cut public services to balance what the Guptas have stolen. That is what is happening.

The R17 billion in this Bill allocated to Eskom, the emergency bailout with more on the way does not have any known conditions. Minister, we were told in the committee you would announce these conditions. You stood here and delivered a special appropriation earlier and we do not know what these conditions are. All we know is that South Africans are paying twice for electricity through their energy bills and again through their taxes. The

burden of state capture and paying back the money is not falling on to the looters; it is falling on to ordinary South Africans.

[Applause.]

When a parent buys a textbook for his child, the VAT on that textbook is now being used to bail out a failing SOE because of state capture. That is morally wrong.

Now, those entrusted to administer this Budget as well, leave much to be desired. Ace Magashule, of *Gangster State* fame, is being described by the President - not here today - as his boss. If this is the case, then this government is asking for Parliament to allow R1,4 trillion of peoples' money to be spent by a criminal syndicate masquerading as a governing party. And 70% of this appropriation, R630 billion, are transfers and subsidies, with very little oversight. Let me use local government to illustrate this point. Fourteen municipalities illegally deposited R1,5 billion into the VBS Mutual Bank. Some of this was transferred from national government. The greatest act of political irony we have ever seen, this VBS Mutual Bank promptly took this public money deposit by the ANC and gave it to our friends in red. [Interjections.]

Now the reaction to VBS Mutual Bank being placed under curatorship and the assault on the independence of the Reserve Bank, demonstrates that there is a war going on against our economic institutions by criminal syndicates masquerading as political parties.

Our fight is for economic sanity and inclusive growth, and against allowing the President's boss to print unlimited amounts of money. And this is a fight we will continue *aluta continua*. Let me remind you hon members, that *aluta continua* means that the struggle continues and not the looting continues! [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon Deputy Speaker, Minister, Deputy Ministers, colleagues in the House, members in the gallery, the NFP welcomes the report of the Standing Committee on Appropriations tabled here today. Yes, indeed the NFP will support this Bill. [Interjections.]

Now, having said that I must agree with my colleague here that there is a problem in terms of timeframes and as a result, when we want to do amendments and particularly some of the amendments that were made by the DA, that could not be entertained, as a result of the timeframe.

However, what is very important is that we must not forget- I mean if you look at the things that we spoke about such as reservists for the Police Force - these things could be timeously dealt within the committees particularly in the Portfolio Committee on Police. Like that in many other committees, if we believe that there is a need to appropriate further funds for those particular for specific purposes, then of course we can do that.

However, Minister, I want to agree with my colleagues and you also would that yes, indeed there is serious challenge in the country; and that financially we have a crisis.

There is a whole lot of reasons for that. Maladministration, lack of capacity, corruption and there is a whole lot of things. The problem we have is that - and we find it repeatedly - you may have the solutions and you have identified the challenges; and you come here and talk about them. Ministers and departments are aware of them. There is no co-ordination to address them right to their root cause so that we can eradicate those problems. So, what happens is that year in, and year out, we are sitting with the same problem.

We have repeatedly said here that over R200 billion is lost at the local level. There is very little or nothing being done to address that challenge. Unless we start addressing that, it is going to continue.

You know, I have said before that we put in new Ministers and Deputy Ministers, but the problem does not only lie in there. The problem lies lower down, but we are not just addressing those problems at a lower level.

Now, the other thing is that we are talking about Eskom. I know we are talking about the restructuring officer. I do not know how that is going to solve the problem because basically, you are asking the restructuring officer to come and deal with the challenges.

Firstly, the unions are never going to allow him to reduce the staff complement. That is one of the things they have identified as the challenge at Eskom. Secondly, the problem is the capacity. I do not know if you are just pushing the buck here to this person, whoever he or she is going to be. I feel very sorry for them because really they are not going to achieve what they want.

However, what is very important Minister, is that there are problems and we need to address them, but we need to go hands on cutting down on costs, overseas travels. There is a whole lot that is going on; we talk about it, but we are not really getting to it.

Now, the other problem is this - and I am happy that I have heard - yes, indeed the tongue has no bones. I have heard people talking about the Ruperts earlier today, how they are friends with them, and how they are benefitting - so the corruption - you say one thing, but you do something else! [Interjections.]

I mean clearly it is the highest level of hypocrisy! So, clearly it shows that these people in red do not serve the interests of the poorest, but their own interests. Thank you very much. The NFP supports this Bill. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr X S QAYISO: Hon Deputy Speaker, the Deputy President, Ministers, portfolio committee chairperson, Members of Parliament and guests, the past 25 years show that we have made remarkable strides in meeting the aspirations of our people for a better life for all. The Appropriation Bill ensures greater focus on confronting problems facing the nation through the implementation of the programmes announced by President

Ramaphosa during his 2018 and 2019 state of the nation address speeches.

Implemented effectively, this Appropriation Bill provides a platform for renewal, inclusive growth and job creation; directs spending to our most pressing national priorities that of education, implementing the early childhood development, ECD, agenda announced by President, protecting the vulnerable and investing in enablers of inclusive growth.

The Appropriation Bill is in line with the 2019-20 financial budget designed by the ANC-led government to cure our country of the corrosive effects of corruption and to restore the integrity of our institutions. The budget moderates spending and raises the revenues required to contain the growth in national debt, whilst minimising the negative effects on growth.

The budget presents a roadmap to maintaining the integrity of our public finances, while protecting social services. As stated by the President, I quote, "As social partners, we are restoring the bonds of trust, dialogue and co-operation." The government spending is allocated to function groups according to their general purpose.

The largest function group is learning and culture, which receives an allocation of R1,24 trillion, or 24,1% of consolidated expenditure over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF, period. The learning and culture, social development, health and community development functions make up more than half of government expenditure.

The function with the fastest growing allocation is community development, which grows from R186,4 billion in the 2018-19 financial year to R243,7 billion in the 2021-22 financial year, at an annual rate of 9,3%. This includes funding for free basic services and human settlements. We acknowledge that the learning and education function receives the largest share of spending.

It provides access to basic education and higher education, develops skills, provides training and contributes to social cohesion. Priorities in this function include improving school and student-housing infrastructure, and providing bursaries for tertiary students from poor and working-class families. Spending grows from R354,8 billion to R442,6 billion over the medium-term, at an average annual growth rate of 7,6%.

Basic education accounts for the largest share of expenditure over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework period. On average,

employee compensation in provincial education departments absorbs 52,7% of the function's expenditure and 79% of total provincial education budgets. The Education Infrastructure Grant is allocated R34,3 billion over the three-year spending period to build new schools and maintain schooling infrastructure.

An additional R2,8 billion is allocated to the School Infrastructure Backlogs Grant to replace the mess which was created by apartheid and to replace pit latrines at over 2 400 schools. This grant will also replace 147 inappropriate and unsafe schools, and provide water to 352 schools over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework period.

An amount of R19 billion is provided for learner-teacher support material, and R3,9 billion is allocated to fund 38 000 Funza Lushaka bursaries for prospective teachers in priority subject areas such as mathematics, science and technology. About 9 million learners at over 20 000 schools will receive daily meals through the national school ...

We welcome the focus on youth, which reflects the largest allocation of resources towards government priorities on basic and higher education, and skills development training to contribute to social cohesion. Over and above the R30 billion

allocated to building new schools and maintaining infrastructure, R2,8 billion is allocated to phase out pit latrines in over 2 400 schools.

We support the phasing in of free education through the allocation of R111,2 billion which will ensure that our students from working-class families obtain their qualifications from universities and technical and vocational education and training, TVET, colleges. It is correct and definitely right for our country's future health outcomes, that the National Health Insurance, NHI, remains a priority of government.

National Health Insurance for the provision of universal health coverage remains a priority in this budget. It should be understood that in promoting this national priority, money was added to the National Health Insurance Indirect Grant, to be delivered on testing and preparation necessary for the roll-out of universal health coverage.

However, the reduction from the health sector's conditional grants are to the infrastructure grants, both the direct one, as well as the indirect component. This is to streamline resources allocations in the sector and prioritise the maintenance of existing health infrastructure. The health function aims to

ensure access to health-care services for all people in South Africa through a caring and quality health system.

Spending on this function grows by an annual average of 7% over the medium term. Implementing health insurance is a policy priority. However, government needs to address problems of staff shortages in the public health facilities before the policy can be fully rolled out. Over the next Medium-Term Expenditure Framework period, R2,8 billion is reprioritised from the National Health Insurance Indirect Grant.

The grant is personal-services component to the new Human Resources Capacitation Grant to help provinces fill critical posts, including intern and community-service posts. In addition, R1 billion is added to the provincial equitable share in the 2021-22 financial year. In conclusion, as indicated through the 2019 Appropriation Bill and my points made earlier, the extremely tight macroeconomic and fiscal environment demands bold decisions to bring public spending in line with revenue available.

This Appropriation Bill, notwithstanding fiscal consolidation and cuts to budgets, continues to ensure productive spending and social spending that benefits the poor through the social wage

and other forms of social protection. The ANC, therefore, supports the Appropriation Bill as presented by National Treasury. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon Chair, it is not right for the African child to live in sewerage, eat in sewerage and even die in sewerage. That's why we welcome the extra money that is being provided to address that problem. It is not right for the poor to die because they don't have money and for the rich to live longer just because they have some money.

It was very nostalgic to hear hon Buthelezi of the ANC speak about the heroes in our heydays. Fifty years ago, another hero, Imam Abdullah Haron was arrested. Next month marks 50 years since he was murdered in detention at the Maitland Police Station. Just imagine how his wife, Aunty Galiema, feels. All the people that hon Buthelezi speaks about, Imam Haron, and those who are still living like Imam Ahmad Kasem, they expect this Parliament to make worthwhile the sacrifices they made.

That's why every bit counts and that is why Al Jama-ahAH will support this Budget. [Applause.] But we are concerned that the approach needs to change. The DA brags that it's antipoor; the ANC brags even more that it's antipoor - sorry I meant pro-poor

- when it's actually antipoor. I would suggest that we talk about antiviolenence.

The President wants violence to be halved in 10 years' time; the national commissioner says no, in five years' time. Therefore, we expect that all these monies allocated to the budgets of the Ministers here must be used now to start addressing the President's vision to reduce violent crime by half. You can't leave it to the Minister of Police and the Minister of Defence to do all the work.

It is up to every Minister to start putting their hands in their pockets and contribute to the first effort in reducing violent crime and that is the army being sent to the Cape Flats. Put your hand in your pocket and give out some money to make that effort worthwhile. You can't just leave it to Minister of Police and the Minister of Defence. I am not allowed to moan about my three minutes, but I know Denis Joseph moaned about his four minutes. Thank you very much.

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Deputy Speaker, Parliament has a duty to actually engage with the budgets it is asked to pass by the executive. But the fact is that Parliament has not taken this responsibility seriously this year.

We have spent a month on this Budget, 34 budget debates and 32 committee meetings. Collectively, we spent at 160 hours debating this Budget. In all of this time, Parliament has not come up with a single amendment - not one. After all of that, the position of all these Members of Parliament is that we agree with every rand of the executive's budget proposals. This is not the work of an active Parliament. It is the work of a rubber stamp.

Today, we are being asked to pass a bailout budget which includes deep cuts to basic services for the poor, in order to fund another bailout for Eskom. Let's look at where the money is coming from. When the ANC votes 'yes' today to this Budget, they will be voting 'yes' to: a R2,4 billion cut from public transport for the poor, to bail out Eskom; a R1,3 billion cut from social development, including cuts from the number of social workers, to bail out Eskom; a R918 million cut from the Municipal Infrastructure Grant; a R680 million cut from the Department of Health; a R312 million cut from the Police; and a R300 million cut from the Department of Human Settlements, all to bail out Eskom.

Therefore, next time you hear the ANC speak about its care for the poor, just read this bailout Budget to see what an absolute

lie that is. Nearly every basic service on which the poor rely in our country will be cut today.

The ANC in the Standing Committee on Appropriations also rejected the amendments offered by the DA to redirect money from wasteful and unnecessary programmes, back to basic services. We proposed an extra R2 billion for the Police, including R200 million allocation to Ipids to help fight corruption in the Police and build an honest Police Service; an extra R500 million for Visible Policing for rural areas; and R1,3 billion to the training of specialised units. The ANC rejected these amendments.

We proposed R1,5 billion for Basic Education to fund specialisation schools teaching science, technology, engineering and mathematics. The ANC rejected this amendment. We proposed R1,5 billion in allocation for the Labour Vote, with a dedicated fund to reskill workers who have lost jobs in the mining sector. The ANC rejected this amendment.

We proposed R3,4 billion for the Department of Health, including a dedicated R450 million fund towards a mental health programme to ensure that the horror of Life Esidimeni never happens again. The ANC rejected that amendment.

Finally, we proposed a R3 billion allocation for desperately needed equipment in hospitals. This would include incubators for new-born babies, radiotherapy machines for cancer patients, and other essential health equipment. The ANC rejected that amendment.

All of these would have been budget neutral, funded from taking money from wasteful and unnecessary projects, and redirecting it to the poor. So, how does that fit your description of these neoliberal amendments, hon Dlakude?

That is the truth of this Budget. It is a budget which takes directly from the services that the poor needs most, to fund the debts incurred by state capture of Eskom. It is a bailout budget and the poor are doing all of the bailing out. That is why this Budget should be rejected. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms E D PETERS: Deputy Speaker, Deputy President, Ministers and Deputy Ministers, allow me to salute the hero of our people, Solomon Mahlangu and pledge our loyalty to the cause for which he so bravely perished. We salute and pay tribute to the many heroes and heroines of our country, who have laid down their lives in our struggle for the liberation of this country.

We also extend our greetings to the leaders and activists of the democratic movement who, despite arrest, detentions and every form of persecution by the enemy, have stood firm and persisted in the common struggle to defeat and destroy the racist regime. Deputy Speaker, the Appropriation Bill or the Budget is the single biggest instrument that needs to give confidence and hope to the people of this country; and that their ANC-led government heard their pleas and requests. The ANC leadership saw and experienced, first hand, their pain of lack of services and the patience with which they have been waiting for services which reached others, but are still to reach many of them.

The ANC, in its 2019 Election Manifesto, reconfirmed its mission to progressively address the backlogs in essential infrastructure like water, electricity, roads and housing as well as other social services. I want to say again here that the people of Musina, Keimoes, Kakamas, Galeshewe, Pampierstad, Harding, Howick, Njelele, Taung, Harrismith, Worcester and many other towns of this country, know that the ANC will never abandon them. The ANC has never abandoned them. [Interjections.]

In the 107 years of the ANC's existence, it has never let the people of South Africa down. Yes ...

... go ne go na le dingongorego le dingodiego fela
maitlhomomagolo e sa le e le a go naya baagi ba Aforika Borwa
botshelo jo bo botoka.

Maikaelelo ano ke kgolagano ya puso ya ANC le batho ba Aforika
Borwa. E tlhamilwe ke Rre Mandela a ikaegile ka moano wa Freedom
Charter a eme gone mo phodiaomong eno. (*Translation of Setswana
paragraphs follows.*)

[... there were complaints, however, the main intention is still
to give the citizens of South Africa a better life.

This intention is a contract between the ANC and the citizens of
South Africans. It was created by Mr Mandela, relying on the
value of the Freedom Charter, while at this very podium.]

Ek wil weereens sê dat daardie ooreenkoms nie eensydig is nie.
Totdat elke gesin van Suid-Afrika 'n dak oor hul kop het en elke
kind goed kan lees en skryf, en geen swanger vrou sterf, terwyl
sy geboorte gee aan 'n kind nie, is ons werk nie klaar nie.
(*Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.*)

[I, once again, would like to say that, that agreement is not
unilateral. Until every family in South Africa has a roof over

their head and every child can read and write well, and no pregnant woman dies while giving birth to a child, our work is not done.]

Deputy Speaker, it is important that we remember that agriculture is very central to the economy of this country. Equally so is tourism. And I want to say today, through you, Deputy Speaker, that the ANC's commitment to returning the land to the people stands. The ANC will revive the parliamentary process that began during the Fifth Parliament and it will conclude the process to clarify the conditions under which the expropriation of land without compensation will take place.

As stated by His Excellency, President Ramaphosa during his state of the nation address, agriculture is one those sectors that will contribute towards growing the economy and job creation. It was further stated by comrade Thoko Didiza, the Minister of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development in her budget speech, addressing the land question and its productive use. So, we want to say to the people of South Africa, hon Wessels stood here and said the ANC has created the mess, forgetting that the mess that this government has inherited is because of his forebears.

Jou oupagrootjie Verwoerd is die een wat antwoord moet gee.

(Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.)

[Your great grandfather Verwoerd is the one who needs to answer.]

We are saying to you that we are actually addressing the more than 100 years of neglect because of the policies of Verwoerd.

Hon Groenewald as well as hon Boshoff know that they have created Orania there. They will never succeed with that Orania.

[Interjections.] So, I want to say, Orania is the example of how they would want to see South Africa, lily white. That is what they want to see.

I want to say to the Minister of Agriculture, in South Africa there are young people who, on realising that they could not access the land although they had information, and had worked in the agriculture for many years, would want to go and contribute and benefit also from the programmes and incentives of government. When they go out of the department they would be the first line of people whom you started with as a Minister of Agriculture in early 1994.

You would know that there is a policy which says, if you are a public servant or your spouse is a public servant, you cannot qualify for the lease of government land. I want to say that is disadvantaging and in particular, the black child because it is these black people who are now starting to realise the benefit and would want to undertake agriculture. If we want to grow the agricultural sector, Madam Minister, let us relook at that policy.

However, I also want to say - hon Buthelezi spoke about the letter from B J Khanyile of KwaZulu-Natal. He is making a special plea to the Minister of Finance. Government has distributed farms among the residents of Melmoth in KwaZulu-Natal through the land restitution programme as administered by the department of Mme Thoko. Mr Khanyile expresses concerns that the said farms did not get any assistance from government though these were bought at high cost to the state. He says, why are the farmers not offered relevant training by government as the community believes those farms were government assets? He stated that the then department indicated to them it did not receive sufficient budget allocation to assist emerging farmers. So, we want to appeal to you, Minister, to work together with the Department of Rural Development and Agriculture to support people like Mr Khanyile and those people who are in the Northern

Cape like Mr Aslam Tawana who wants to enter this particular field. There is a lot of potential in the emerging black farmers and we believe there is opportunity in that particular space to enter.

Madam Deputy Speaker, it is also important for me to focus a little bit on tourism. If tourism, like the President said in his state of the nation address, stands the chance to create jobs, let us finance and give resources to the tourism sector so that they can then, through the incentives of government, increase the number of people who work in the sector. We are informed that 729 000 people employed in South Africa were working in the tourism sector, which is 4,5% of the 16,2 million people in the South African workforce. About half of those working in the tourism sector were employed in only two industries, the road passenger transport and the food-and-beverages servicing industry. So, as the ANC, we believe that through the instrument called budget, we can reassure the people of South Africa that their pleas, which they have given to the President, Deputy President and different parties during the elections, will make a difference in their lives.

I want to say that, as the committee, we also appreciate the interventions and the work that Minister Motsoaledi and Minister

of Tourism are doing to ensure that they address the issue related to the visa regime. We believe that these visa regulations, despite them having been relaxed, should not compromise the safety and security of children and women, especially in this challenge of women trafficking and women being used to traffic and transport drugs. So, as the ANC, we want to say to you today, we believe that this budget is the first line of response after 8 May to the people of South Africa. The ANC is serious about what you have said to us and about making a change to the lives of our people. Thank you very much. The ANC supports the Bill. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Deputy Speaker, thank you very much once again for this opportunity to respond very briefly to the contributions made by the hon members to the Appropriation Bill. So, having said everything else that you have said, having shouted and done whatever, let's come back home to the reality of the situation. The debt to GDP ratios is at unacceptable levels, thus providing a basis for a serious crisis in the country. Therefore, we need to approach this Bill against the background of these difficulties that we confront. Therefore, financial management issues at various levels need to be improved - local, provincial and national levels. The management

of the hospital in an urban or rural area is as important as ensuring that water and sanitation are available to our people.

We therefore need to approach the Budget with responsibility and focus. To that extent, Deputy President, may I once again appeal to the political leadership in this House from all political parties that we reach out to our people and enter into a compact with them that we appreciate and support the user-pay principle. We must go out to our people and say to them that we were the ones who led the rent and electricity boycotts and now is the time for all of us to pay for services rendered. [Applause.]

I listened very carefully to what the EFF had to say and I would like to invite them for a conversation. Some of the things that you said you were concerned about are actually being addressed. The support, for example, to the National Director of Public Prosecutions - that issue is being handled and quite a number of issues that you expressed concern about, are being handled. So, if I could invite you for a conversation we can solve that problem very easily. The ... but I won't get into that.

Once this Bill has been passed this afternoon, we would then be in the position to use the contingency reserve account to provide support to the SABC, Denel and SA Airways. But this

support ... let me get an indication there - SABC requests R3,2 billion. We would not just make that available tomorrow. It would be a mistake, but we would release in chunks as certain conditions precedent are met to ensure that there is progress in improving the organisation. Similarly, as of tomorrow, we will be announcing for each one of these entities the relevant chief restructuring officers, who will work together with the management of these institutions to get the institutions back on track.

Therefore, Deputy Chair, I conclude by thanking members of this House for their most constructive inputs into the debate. As always, I find their inputs extremely valuable. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the Bill be read a first time.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 226: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G;
August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H;
Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Buthelezi, N S; Buthelezi, E M;
Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S;
Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; De Lille, P; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M
C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-
Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P;
Dyantyi, Q R; Frolick, C T; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N;
Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, bM; Hadebe, B
M; Hendricks, M G E; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M D;
Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F;
Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M;
Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G;
Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M;
Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo,
M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza,
D D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehhlala, T;
Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P;
Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R; Majola, F Z; Majozi, Z;
Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V
T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Manamela, K B;
Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ;
Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K;
Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M

R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D;
Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M;
Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N;
Mbingo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E;
Mchunu, E S; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R;
Mjobo, L N; Mkhathshwa, N T; Mkhize, Z L; Mkhwanazi, J C N;
Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D
L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E;
Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motshekga, M A;
Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T;
Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A H; Mthethwa, E N; Munyai, T B;
Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-
Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X;
Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S;
Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D;
Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T;
Nxumalo, M N; Nzimande, B E; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A
H M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla,
M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A;
Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik
Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N;
Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M
S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E;
Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A;

Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tsenoli, S L; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B;
Tshwete, P; Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M
J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Zibula, B
T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 94: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L
J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K
Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; Cuthbert,
M J; De Villiers, J N; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I
M; Groenewald, P J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hill-Lewis, G G;
Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H;
Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; King, C
V; Kohler, D; Komane, R N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Lees, R
A; Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mabika, M S;
Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B S; Majola, T R;
Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ;
Matiase, N S; Mazzone, N W A; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc
Gluwa, J J; Meshoe, K R J; Mey, P ; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J;
Mohlala, M R; Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K;
Moteka, P G; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder, F J; Mulder, C P;
Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Nolutshungu, N J; Powell,
E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L;
Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers,
M E; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S;

Thembekwayo, S S; Thring, W M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M;
Van Staden, P A; Waters, M; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W;
Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a first time.

APPROPRIATION BILL

(Consideration of Votes and Schedule)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Let me start first by
thanking the parties for advising the staff on ...

[Interjections.] Hon Mam Khawula, why are you rising?

Nk M S KHAWULA: Uxolo Sihlalo, ngiyabonga mhlonishwa angazi lo
Mnumzane udayisani ngempela? uyangena uyaphuma, uyangena
namaphepha, kuvumelekile yini ukudayisa amakinati la?

(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Excuse me, Chairperson. Thank you, hon member.
I don't know exactly what this man is selling. He comes in and
out carrying papers. Is anyone permitted to sell peanuts here?]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that is not a point of order. Please, take your seat! Order, hon members!

Order! As I was saying, hon members, please let us be in the House. Can we please respect the decorum of the House. I wish to thank the parties for advising the staff on which votes they will make declarations on, on which they will record their objections and on which they intend dividing the House. This information will greatly assist the process today. I will put each vote and ask parties for declarations of the vote as they have indicated. Members may make declarations on a vote from the floor microphones if they wish. After this, I will put the vote for a decision.

Hon members are reminded that in terms of Rule 108(5), a global time for declarations of the vote have been agreed upon and that parties will be allowed to make declarations as per the agreed time allocation. The bells will be rung for five minutes for each division on a vote, but for only one minute for subsequent divisions or such other time as the presiding officer may direct.

Vote No 1 - The Presidency - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr M S MALATSI: House Chair, the Presidency's budget does not adequately address what its challenges face. Three of its entities are currently marred by high levels of vacancy; they are marred by acting appointments in the three critical vacancies, which is the Chief Executive Officer of Government Communication and Information System, GCIS, the Chief Executive Officer for Maritime Trade Department, MTD, and also for Brand S A, but it also doesn't outline how it aims to substitute the nonfunctional boards, some of which have been able to sit for over a year. So, this budget doesn't represent any strong reason, whatsoever, why we should support it. Until such time that there is a clear indication of how the Presidency seeks to achieve 100% compliance with financial disclosures and until such time that it puts measures in place that will promote 100% compliance with a 30-day payment of suppliers, we will not be supporting this budget. Thank you very much.

Mr N S MATIASE: Madam Chair, before we debated this Vote in the committee, we didn't have the Public Protector Report, and that, in a major way, has influenced our position. We want to state that it is clear that the President has misled Parliament, failed disclose donations as sponsors ... [Interjections.]

Mr D KOHLER: On a point of order.

Mr N S MATIASE: ...and as a result of that, he might have engaged himself in serious money laundering and rendering ...

[Interjections.]

Mr D KOHLER: On a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Matiase, please take your seat for a while. Please remember the minutes are not on there because we have a rounded allocation of minutes. They are looking into that. Hon Kohler, yes are you ok? What happened? Okay, continue.

Mong N S MATIASE: Hee banna, ho etsahalang? (*Translation of Sesotho sentence follows.*)

[Mr N S MATIASE: Good people, what is going on?]

It is clear that the President might have been engaged in possible money laundering and racketeering scheme. Before you ask for a substantiated motion, the report of Chapter 9 institution that was sent to the Speaker's office for consideration by this House is enough evidence for us to express our views on this matter. The EFF calls on the President to take leave of absence with the Public Protector Report being

subjected to judicial review process. We say this because as long as the court of law has pronounced on the report and is set aside, the President will remain conflicted because his conduct is not beyond reproach. [Interjections.]

Mr A H M PAPO: Point of order.

Mr N S MATIASE: No sitting President should be in direct conflict with the Chapter 9 constitutional ... [interjections.]

Mr A H M PAPO: Point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Matiase, please take your seat. Yes, hon Papo.

Mr A H M PAPO: Presiding officer, is it fair for the member to say the President must take a leave of absence?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, let us take it as a freedom of speech and allow him to continue.

Mr A H M PAPO: Malema is in court.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Papo, please take your seat. Continue, hon Matiase.

Mr N S MATIASE: It explains the reason why you have been relegated to this Parliament; you have been useless in Gauteng. No sitting President should be in direct conflict with the Chapter 9 institution. The fact of the matter is that the President has failed to declare millions of rand either to Parliament or to his office; it shows that President has carried himself not in a presidential way. even if this matter of the Public Protector is of a party, millions alleged in this matter renders the ANC and our country vulnerable to capitalist and imperialist influence to a point where our revolution is spread wide open for counter revolution. President Ramaphosa has just proven that he has got no interest in upholding the Constitution and the law; his conduct may very well render him impeachable.

If the President respects the Constitution and his office, he must take a leave of absence and allow others with integrity like his Deputy, Mr Mabuza, to lead and take us forward, because at least he is honourable; at least he has the guts to own up and stand up for his mistakes until he is cleared. We must not repeat the mistake of the Fifth Parliament and wait to be told by the Constitutional Court that we, as Parliament, have failed

to hold the executive accountable. As the EFF, we object and reject this budget with the contempt it deserves.

Rev K R J MESHOE: House Chair, even though the ACDP is concerned by the fact that South Africa has the highest debt to gross domestic product, GDP, in sub-Saharan Africa, we nevertheless believe that the President and his team should be given an opportunity to stimulate economic growth and investment in the country. This we believe is needed to address the very levels of public debt and escalating debt service cost which are contributing factors to South Africa having the highest debt to GDP in sub-Saharan Africa. The ACDP will support this Budget Vote.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. I still have the EFF Plus, are you still interested? No. [Interjections.] What is your problem, hon Mokaase, did I say something wrong?

Ms M O MOKAUSE: House Chair, we have got only one mighty Economic Freedom Fighters in this House, not 'Plus'. You just said, EFF Plus, and we are the only EFF here ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Oh, ok I know. Oh, don't worry about the ...

Ms M O MOKAUSE: Don't confuse us with ... [Interjections.]
[Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Don't worry about, maybe is just the tongue; its fine.

Ms M O MOKAUSE: You need to apologize.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, no, please take your seat. The ANC.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon House Chairperson, firstly, let me start by saying that, what hon Matiase has just said on this podium was misleading. It is clear that the President took that report for judicial review. He has a right to do that as a South African citizen. He is also protected by the Constitution. So, you cannot come here, grandstand, mislead the nation out there and start discussing something that is under judicial review. That is uncalled for and the hon member was grandstanding.

To come to the next point, the Presidency has two departments. In those departments there are two portfolio committees overseeing those departments. So, like all the departments in the South African government, those portfolio committees are responsible to deal with the strategic plan of the department, the budget, everything and that was dealt with in the Budget Vote. So, to say that the Presidency Budget Vote cannot be agreed to, is very, very superficial of other political parties which are saying that.

The Presidency has the responsibility that is bestowed upon it; the Presidency has a responsibility mandated by the Constitution to ensure that there is peace in South Africa, Africa, and all over the world. There is a need for this department. As the ANC, we support.

Yekelani kutenta ngcwelengcwele nikhulume ngetintfo leningatati.

(Translation of Siswati sentence follows.)

[Desist from making yourselves holier than thou and speaking about unfounded things.]

Question put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 241: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G;
August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H;
Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Buthelezi,
N S; Buthelezi, E M; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B
H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; De Lille, P;
Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A;
Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N;
Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Frolick, C T; Gantsho,
N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Groenewald, P J; Groenewald,
I M; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hadebe, B M;
Hendricks, M G E; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M; Hlengwa,
M D; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F;
Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M;
Jordaan, H; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N;
Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J;
Kula, S M; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W
T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P;
Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E;
Magwanishe, G; Mahambehhlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D;
Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R;

Majola, F Z; Majosi, Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P;
Malatji, T ; Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo,
J B; Manamela, K B; Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M;
Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ;
Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-
Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V;
Masiko, F A; Masondo, T S; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M;
Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N;
Mbinqo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E;
Mchunu, E S; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Meshoe, K R J; Mey, P ;
Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhathshwa, N T; Mkhize, Z
L; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M; Modise, M;
Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L
E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K;
Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M S; Motshekga, M A;
Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T;
Mthembu, A H; Mthembu, J M; Mthethwa, E N; Mulder, C P; Mulder,
F J; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba,
C N; NdabeniAbrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L;
Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi,
B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D;
Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N;
Nzimande, B E; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein,
S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C

M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Swarts, B; Thring, W M; Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tsenoli, S L; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P; Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Van Staden, P A; Wessels, W W; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 76: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; King, C V; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Lees, R A; Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B S; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Masipa, N P; Matiase, N S; Mazzone, N W A; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; McGluwa, J J; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mohlala, M R; Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Moteka, P G; Mpambo-Sibhukwana,

T G; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Powell, E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Thembekwayo, S S; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; Waters, M; Weber, A M M; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 2 - Parliament - put.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 3 - Communications - put.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Ms Z MAJOZI: House Chairperson, on 10th July, the Minister of Communication and Digital Technologies, Stella Ndabeni-Abrahams said in her Budget Vote that the policy directives for spectrum will be issued within seven days to Independent Communications Authority of SA, Icasa, and today is 23rd July, yet dololo [nothing] policy directive has been issued.

South Africans continue to suffer due to high data and telephone cost. Will the Minister tell this House when she actually intends to issue the directive? When can we see the fruits of her labour? A failure to do so will continue to hamper economic growth and drive away foreign investors. The hon Minister still continues not doing her stellar job even after I had warned her. Thank you, Chair.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF MINERAL AND ENERGY RESOURCES: Hon Chairperson, the Budget Vote on communication fulfils the department's mission to develop communication services for all our people primarily through the strengthening of the state-owned enterprises.

We are pleased that the department has engaged with National Treasury to find a lasting financial solution to the challenges facing the SA Broadcasting Corporation, SABC. We also support the stance of both departments that our public broadcaster needs to meet all the conditions set by the National Treasury to support its turnaround effort.

We note the DA's desperation but futile attempts to seek attention by inserting itself in SABC Board and management matters and pretending to represent the Parliament. We support

the department's commitment to roll out broadband service to additional site in the medium-term and the process towards licensing of unassigned high-demand spectrum. As the ANC, we support the Budget Vote. Thank you, Chair.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 4 - Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs - put.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Mr I M GROENEWALD: House Chair, government is in total distress of a total irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure over all departments and entities and local government of R68,5 billion. To put it into perspective, 5,4 million young South Africans could have studied through University of S A, Unisa.

Mafube Local Municipality closed the doors with no equipment or even bank account left and it is the first of many to come if

drastic action isn't taken. This dire situation of government is not that of apartheid fault. It is the fault of the ANC and the ANC cadres plundering and stealing the money from hardworking citizens. It is the ANC-led government's fault that services can't be rendered. It is ANC's cadres and the Black Economic Empowerment, BEE, tenderpreneurs' elites who are draining municipality's money through corruption. This is witnessed at local government which has been captured and services expropriated without consideration. Government is in ANC's failed state. Thank you.

Ms S G N MBATHA: Chairperson, the Vote appropriates finance to core functions that the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, has the constitutional responsibility to perform. The Vote finances critical programmes that have resulted in strengthening local government. Key challenges in terms of strengthening financial, technical and administrative capacity are to be addressed by this Vote.

It will also help to improve the lives of millions of people in ensuring that they receive quality and all the basic services that they deserve. The Vote addresses the challenges that we have in municipalities.

We also acknowledge the fact that we do have municipalities that are dysfunctional and distressed and through this Budget Vote, we will be able to deal with those challenges. It also acknowledges the fact that we also have hardworking councillors and officials in the municipalities. However, we understand that we do have challenges and this Budget Vote seeks to address those challenges that we are facing. Therefore, as the ANC, we do support this Budget Vote. Thank you.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 231: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Buthelezi, N S; Buthelezi, E M; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; De Lille, P; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Frolick, C T; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hadebe, B M; Hendricks, M G E; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M D; Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S

P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Mahambehhlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Majosi, Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Manamela, K B; Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D; Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N; Mbingo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, E S; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhathshwa, N T; Mkhize, Z L; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G;

Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A H; Mthethwa, E N; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N; Nzimande, B E; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M; Semanya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P; Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 90: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; Cuthbert, M J; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M; Groenewald, P J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W;

Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W;
Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; King, C V; Kohler, D; Komane, R N;
Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Lees, R A; Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J
R B; Lotriet, A; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W;
Madlingozi, B S; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais,
S J F; Masango, B S ; Masipa, N P; Matiase, N S; Mazzone, N W A;
Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Meshoe, K R J; Mey, P
; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M;
Montwedi, M K; Moteka, P G; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder, F J;
Mulder, C P; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Nolutshungu,
N J; Powell, E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J;
Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Spies, E R J;
Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N
I; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Staden, P
A; Waters, M; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G;
Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 5 - Home Affairs - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 238: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G;
August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H;
Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Buthelezi,
N S; Buthelezi, E M; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B
H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; De Lille, P;
Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A;
Dlakude, D E; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlulane, B N;
Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Frolick, C T; Gantsho,
N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Groenewald, P J; Groenewald,
I M; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hadebe, B M;
Hendricks, M G E; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M D;
Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K
L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Jordaan, H;
Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G;
Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M;
Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli,
B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D
D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Mahambehhlala, T; Mahlalela, A F;
Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D;
Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Majosi, Z;
Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V
T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Manamela, K B;

Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ;
Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K;
Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M
R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D;
Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M;
Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N;
Mbinqo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E;
Mchunu, E S; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mey, P ; Mgweba, T ;
Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhathswa, N T; Mkhize, Z L; Mkhwanazi,
J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P;
Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M
A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K; Motaung, A;
Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A;
Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A
H; Mthethwa, E N; Mulder, C P; Mulder, F J; Munyai, T B;
Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-
Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X;
Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S;
Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D;
Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T;
Nxumalo, M N; Nzimande, B E; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A
H M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla,
M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A;
Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M; Semanya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik

Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N;
Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M
S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E;
Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A;
Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P;
Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Van Staden, P A;
Wessels, W W; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P;
Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A
S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 77: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Basson, L J; Brink, C;
Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N
N; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hill-Lewis,
G G; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H;
Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; King, C
V; Kohler, D; Komane, R N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Lees, R
A; Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mabika, M S;
Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B S; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S;
Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Matiase, N S;
Mazzone, N W A; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J;
Meshoe, K R J; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mokaue, M O;
Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Moteka, P G; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T
G; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Nolutshungu, N J;
Powell, E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithloho, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M

L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H;
Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O
S; Thring, W M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; Waters, M;
Weber, A M M; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 6 - International Relations and Cooperation - put.

Declaration of vote:

Rev K R J MESHOE: House Chair, the ACDP once again urges government to remain committed to meaningful and positive engagement with all stakeholders, particularly when dealing with the Middle East conflicts. Government should attempt to not only remain impartial at all times but also to convince those in conflict that peaceful negotiations are the only way to restore peace, reconciliation and stability in their land.

If government remains biased against states such as Israel when dealing with the Middle East conflict, then we will not be able to create a better South Africa and contribute to a better and safer Africa in a better world as envisaged by the National

Development Plan. The ACDP will not support this Budget Vote.

Thank you.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Let me just remind members that we have a sacred space here; please do not cross the floor during this process. You can only do that when the bells are ringing or when we have stopped. I am told that there was such; I did not see it. Thank you for notifying me.

Vote No 7 - National Treasury - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr G G HILL-LEWIS: Hon Chair, the National Treasury has a relatively small budget. It has an outsized role and an extremely important role in ensuring the careful and prudent stewardship and management of our public finances. It is also the apex policy-making department in the national government along - obviously - with the Presidency. When we assess the

National Treasury's budget, we cannot only assess it for the relatively small budget allocations that it itself takes. We must also assess it for the policy role that it plays in the government more broadly.

The Treasury's primary responsibility is to ensure that our public debt does not become unsustainable. The Minister has himself spoken this morning about the unacceptably high levels of public debt and how those are only going upwards and the trend is certainly more and more concerning. In fact, according to the Treasury's own numbers, in just three years we will be spending R277 billion just on paying off the interest on our national bond. That is unacceptably high and it must come into consideration in this Budget Vote. The Minister and the department cannot claim success in their primary duty of stewarding our national finances.

Today he has introduced a Special Appropriation Bill of R59 billion over two years. This Bill has come after several weeks of extremely tough talk on Eskom and about the conditions that they will have to meet in order to get the new money. Today he has tabled a Bill with not a single one of those tough conditions reflected in the Bill itself. There are no conditions. The Bill makes vague reference to him maybe

introducing conditions in the future, but they are not in the Bill. For that reason and for the reasons that are outlined, we cannot support this Vote. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms Boroto): I am aware that the DA has called for a division. Are you still on that?

Mr J W W JULIUS: Yes, House Chairperson, the DA is calling for a division. [Interjections.]

Ms T V B MCHUNU: Declaration by the ANC, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms Boroto): Oh, I'm sorry! I jumped the gun. Thank you. You have your time, mam.

Ms T V B MCHUNU: Hon House Chairperson, the citizens of South Africa must just relax. [Interjections.]. The budget of our country is in the hands of capable captains. Those who reject it care less for the masses of our country. The ANC rises to support Vote 7, as it is in line with efforts of the ANC-led government to cure our country of the corrosive effects of corruption and restore the integrity of our institutions. Contrary to the belief of the opposition, government is overstretched but we say, talk is easy.

The budget moderates spending and raises revenues required to contain the growth in national debt whilst minimising the negative effects on growth. The budget represents a road map to maintaining the integrity of our public finances whilst protecting social services. The budget is creating the right environment for efforts to accelerate inclusive growth significantly increasing levels of investment and putting in place measures to create more jobs. We have a clear mandate. Fight poverty, create employment, and reduce inequality. The budget is unapologetically on the side of South African people.

Ubunzima bomthwalo budala ugxe kwano. Thina singumbutho olawulayo sinoxanduva lokuzisa utshintsho kwiimpilo zabantu. Siphinda sibulele inkxaso yabantu boMzantsi Afrika abasinike uxanduva kwakhona kule minyaka mihlanu. Abanye bayakugxeka, bajubalaze, kodwa thina siyaqhuba ngeemfuno zabantu. Siyaxhasa.

[Kwaqhwytywa] (*Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.*)

[The weight of the load creates tension. We as the governing party have a responsibility of bringing change in people's lives. We once again thank the people of South Africa for their support over the past five years. Some people will criticize and harass, but we are continuing with the needs of the people. We support it. [Applause.]]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 237: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Buthelezi, N S; Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, M G; Capa, N; Capa, R N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; De Lille, P; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Frolick, C T; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Groenewald, P J; Groenewald, I M; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Hadebe, B M; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M D; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Jordaan, H; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehhlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majozi, Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Malatji, T ;

Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B;
Manamela, K B; Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M;
Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ;
Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-
Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V;
Masiko, F A; Masondo, D; Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P;
Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F;
Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N; Mbingo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T;
Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, E S; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe,
S W; Meshoe, K R J; Mey, P ; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L
N; Mkhathswa, N T; Mkhize, Z L; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z;
Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng,
J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E;
Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motaung, N E;
Motshekga, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S;
Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A H; Mthethwa,
E N; Mulder, C P; Mulder, F J; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F;
Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T;
Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P;
Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M;
Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshavheni, K P
S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N;
Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N
P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Qayiso, X

S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M; Semanya, M R;
Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N;
Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J;
Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M;
Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Swarts, B; Thring, W M; Tlhape, M M E;
Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A;
Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P;
Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Van Staden, P A;
Wessels, W W; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P;
Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A
S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 75: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L
J; Bergman, D; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu,
M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; De Villiers, J N; Dlakude, D E;
Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hill-Lewis, G
G; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Joseph,
D; Julius, J W W; Khawula, M S; King, C V; Kohler, D; Komane, R
N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B;
Lotriet, A; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W;
Madlingozi, B S; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais,
S J F; Masango, B S ; Masipa, N P; Matiase, N S; Mazzone, N W A;
Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham,
K J; Mohlala, M R; Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K;

Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B;
Nolutshungu, N J; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J;
Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H;
Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Van Der Walt, D; Van
Minnen, B M; Waters, M; Weber, A M M; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E
R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 8 - Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation - put.

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, African Christian
Democratic Party, Democratic Alliance and Freedom Front Plus
dissenting).

Vote No 9 - Public Enterprises - put.

Declarations of vote:

Ms N W A MAZZONE: House Chairperson, the DA voted in favour of
the report for the Budget Vote on Public Enterprises because the
report ... [Inaudible.] challenges that in the internal
governance there was weak, inexperienced and compromised boards

and management, negligible sanctions for poor performance and corruption and limited direction, oversight and leadership from the boards.

Under the financial section it said that there were weak balance sheets with unsustainable debt levels, unenviable business models and financial burdens of unfunded non-commercial activities.

The fact of the matter is this, this department should not exist. State-owned entities are not the employment agency for ANC cronies. South Africans cannot continue paying for corruption. A free market grows the economy, not state-owned entities. Let the markets decide, give South Africans a choice, and privatise now.

The DA will not support this Budget Vote. [Applause.]

Ms R N KOMANE: Chairperson, let's note the objection of the EFF with the following declaration.

The Department of Public Enterprises is one of the departments which are not needed and you must do away with. [Interjections.] We should have closed this department and created a proper

oversight body that does proper oversight and provide strategic development mandate.

Minister Jamnadas has done nothing since his appointment. Things are just getting worse.

Eskom continues to be in a downward spiral and this is a deliberate collapse. And this is so that it can be sold for pennies.

Denel cannot pay salaries as we speak and Minister Jamnadas will go and borrow money from lenders - and we don't know - in secret meetings.

SA Airways, SAA, CEO resigned because of the continued ...

[Interjections.]

Ms A M SIWISA: House Chair.

Ms R N KOMANE: ... interference and failure to respect the rule of law and the basic principles of good governance.

[Interjections.]

Ms A M SIWISA: House Chair, House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Your speaker is on the floor.

Ms A M SIWISA: Yes, but the ruling party is disturbing our speaker here. [Interjections.] They must relax. Relax, relax.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that's not a point of order, please. And remember that your speaker is on the floor. Continue ma [ma'am].

Ms R N KOMANE: At Transnet competent and experienced managers were removed without the due process.

What is concerning is that all the state-owned companies and in all positions where Africans are removed without due process or fair hearing, it is the minorities, particularly Indians and whites who replace them, some without qualifications or experience.

Madam Chair, the message is very clear: We are being told Africans cannot manage complex, large and strategic institutions and this will in future be used to avoid transformation.

As the EFF, we do not support the Budget Vote on Public Enterprises.

Minister Jamnadas must know when he comes to Parliament, as long as he remains a constitutional delinquent, as long the Public Protector's Report has not been set aside, we will be here, and we are not afraid of anything. He cannot bring the shortcomings and his handlers including ... He might as well bring the SACP; we will attend to all of them, one by one.

We cannot bend the principles to suit political expediency. We must not allow Parliament to be turned into a circus by people who do not respect it and the Constitution. They go and establish rogue intelligence units and think that they are above the law. That cannot happen, Chairperson. Thus, we reject that.

Mr W W WESSELS: Chairperson, the hon member from the ANC says South Africans must relax. [Interjections.] South Africans will not relax when the electricity supply completely collapses because of your wrong priorities. [Interjections.]

Hon Chairperson ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, hon members. You cannot drown the speaker, please.

Mr W W WESSELS: ... [Inaudible.] and assumptions of debt will not solve our problems at state-owned enterprises and save them. We need fundamental reforms. Your cadre deployment committee is responsible for the poor decision in appointments. It is your party's poor local governance that's responsible for the huge outstanding debt to municipalities. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: Chair.

Mr W W WESSELS: We need reforms, we need fundamental reforms and we need privatisation. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Minister, why are you rising?

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY: The gentleman says we have a cadre deployment committee; we don't have such a committee.

Mr W W WESSELS: That's not what Jacob Zuma said.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you for the information but that's not a point of order, hon Minister, as we continue.

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, the ACDP fully appreciates the severe challenges that our state-owned companies present, not only to the fiscus with the guarantees but to the economy as a whole.

And we were given the impression that the massive amount National Treasury is to set aside each year for 10 years it would be approximately R230 billion in total, would be enough of a bailout for Eskom. However, we now know that this is insufficient and that Eskom will need a further R26 billion over and above this first year's allocation of R23 billion. This is deeply disturbing.

The question is, What are the conditions for such a bailout? and there will be few incentives for Eskom to change its way if it can access cash from National Treasury on an ongoing basis; it cannot have a blank cheque.

We do not support this Budget Vote. Thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Hon Chairperson, I stand here on behalf of the ANC to support the Budget Vote of the Department of Public Enterprises.

As the ANC, we have full confidence in the leadership of the Department of Public Enterprises led by the Minister. We fully support their efforts to stabilise our state-owned enterprises and clean out corruption, which some contributed directly or indirectly to with those in red overalls. [Interjections.] And repositioning these enterprises as catalyst for economic development. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chairperson, on a point of order. Khaya must not mislead the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Paulsen, why are you rising?

Mr M N PAULSEN: He is saying that the EFF contributed to the breakdown and the corruption.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, that's a point of debate and not point of order.

Mr M N PAULSEN: He must not talk rubbish. He must not talk rubbish here; he's misleading the House.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I'm going to switch off your mic.

Hon member, continue. That's not a point of order; that's a point of debate.

Mr K E MAGAXA: You know that you cannot do that to me.

We fully support the effort to stabilise our state-owned enterprises and reposition these enterprises as catalyst for economic development, growth and transformation in order to advance, deepen and consolidate National Democratic Revolution, NDR.

Therefore, to us it is important to continue the work we are doing with no intimidation.

The ANC supports the Budget Vote for Public Enterprises. Thank you.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 226: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G;
August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H;
Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Buthelezi, M G; Buthelezi, E M;
Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H;
Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; De Lille, P; Dhlomo, S
M; Didiza, A T; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini,
D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L;
Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Frolick, C T; Gantsho, N; Gela, A;
Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M;
Hadebe, B M; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M D; Hlengwa, M;
Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K
L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Kekana, P
S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G
W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M; Lamola, R O;
Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli,
B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Magadzi,
D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A
F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D;
Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Majosi, Z;
Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V
T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Manamela, K B;
Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ;

Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K;
Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M
R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D;
Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M;
Mathale, C C; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N; MbinqoGigaba, B P;
Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, E S; Mchunu,
T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N;
Mkhatshwa, N T; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N;
Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed,
H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R;
Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M S;
Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G;
Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A H; Mthethwa, E N; Munyai,
T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-
Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X;
Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M;
Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshavheni, K P
S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N;
Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N
P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-
Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A
M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P;
Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J;
Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M;

Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tsenoli, S L; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P; Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 89: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; De Villiers, J N; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M; Groenewald, P J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; King, C V; Kohler, D; Komane, R N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Madlingozi, B S; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Masango, B S ; Masipa, N P; Matiase, N S; Mazzone, N W A; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; McGluwa, J J; Meshoe, K R J; Mey, P ; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mohlala, M R; Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder, F J; Mulder, C P; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Nolutshungu, N J; Paulsen, M N; Powell, E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H;

Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; Van Staden, P A; Waters, M; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Mr MATIASE: House Chair, I'm not so sure if we must refer the number you've read out to Hansard because I'm not so sure if the numbers you've read out are accurate.

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): They are.

Mr MATIASE: Can you please repeat them in English.

Die HUISVOORSITTER (Me M G Boroto): Nee, ek gaan nie. Julle het my gehoor.

Mnr N S MATIASE: Kan jy dit in Engels herhaal, asseblief?

Die HUISVOORSITTER (Me M G Boroto): Nee, ek kan nie. Jy kan maar hier kom. Jy kan die papier kry.

Mnr N S MATIASE: Herhaal die woorde in Engels, asseblief?

Die HUISVOORSITTER (Me M G Boroto): Hoekom? Nee man, agb
Matiase, sit! (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.*)

[The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, I am not going to.
You heard me.

Mr N S MATIASE: Can you repeat it in English, please?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, I can't. You can come
here and get the paper.

Mr N S MATIASE: Repeat the words in English, please?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Why? No man, hon Matiase,
sit!]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon House
Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Yes, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: The members who are standing up; the time they are using must be taken from their minutes. [Interjections.] We cannot allow this to delay the process of the House. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you. That is not my decision to take, anyway. Hon Matiase ... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DJANTYI: Hon House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): ... no, there won't be a debate on this one, please. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DJANTYI: Hon House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DJANTYI: I hope, hon House Chair, you are observing that members in the red are voting for absent members. I hope you're observing that.

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, no. That can be taken from these gadgets here. I'm not observing that at the moment.

Hon members, let's not waste time.

Vote No 10 - Public Service and Administration - put.

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Democratic Alliance and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 11 - Public Works - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr W M THRING: House Chairperson, the ACDP acknowledges the total budgetary allocation of some R24 billion for the Department of Public Works and Property Management Trading Entity, PMTE. By its own admission, the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure, DPWI, has a weakened mandate due to mainly the absence of legislation which would enable it to properly act as the landlord of the state. Clearly, all is not well in the department.

Of the six entities, only one, the Council for Built Environment, received a clean audit. The worst performing entity, the Independent Development Trust, IDT, received a disclaimer audit opinion for 2017-18. The ACDP does not support this budget. Thank you.

Ms N L HERMANS: House Chairperson, the ANC supports Budget Vote 11. The objection of the ACDP means no expansion, no maintenance, and no employment creation for our people. The Public Works remain the backbone of developing and maintaining public works infrastructure and the budget goes a long way towards addressing maintenance and expansion. Thank you, House Chairperson.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, as you vote ... Learners, I am sorry I didn't do this earlier. We really welcome you to this Parliament. I hope you have learned a lot. [Applause.] Thank you very much. I didn't know you were going to leave so soon. Thank you very much for coming. Bye.

An HON MEMBER: Chairperson!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member?

An HON MEMBER: The gadget is not working.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Use another one. Why are you rising?

An HON MEMBER: The voting gadget is not working.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): They will check here.

AYES - 224: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Buthelezi, M G; Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; De Lille, P; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hadebe, B M; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M D; Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehhlala, T; Mahlalela, A

F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D;
Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Majosi, Z;
Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V
T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Manamela, K B;
Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ;
Mangu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K;
Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M
R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D;
Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M;
Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N;
Mbinqo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mchunu, E S;
Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N;
Mkhatshwa, N T; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Moatshe, R M;
Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L
E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K;
Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A;
Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A
H; Mthethwa, E N; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni,
E T; Ndaba, C N; Newhoudt Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X;
Nkabane, N P; Nkoana Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S;
Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D;
Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T;
Nxumalo, M N; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein,
S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C

M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siwela, V S; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P; Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M.

NOES - 88: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; De Villiers, J N; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M; Groenewald, P J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khawula, M S; King, C V; Kohler, D; Komane, R N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Madlingozi, B S; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Masipa, N P; Matiase, N S; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; McGluwa, J J; Meshoe, K R J; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mohlala, M R; Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Mpambo-

Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder, F J; Mulder, C P; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D
B; Nodada, B B; Nolutshungu, N J; Paulsen, M N; Powell, E L;
Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A
M; Sonti, N P; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E;
Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W
M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; Van Staden, P A; Waters, M;
Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R;
Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 12 - Statistics South Africa - put.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance dissenting).

Vote No 13 - Women - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: The NFP supports the amendment here today.

Let me start off by saying, and I think the department needs to
take cognisant of this: Despite all the efforts and mechanisms
that we have in place, women continue to be marginalised,

particularly in matters of maintenance. There is also the issue of the family violence courts. The services provided there are not sufficient and do not give women the protection they generally need.

I have an example of a particular woman in Johannesburg presently, where she is running to courts, leaving her work week after week, for protection orders. It clearly shows as a weakness in the system because if there is a protection order, you cannot go and get a new protection order every week.

What is happening is that there are unscrupulous legal teams that are protecting and representing these perpetrators of violence against women. I think the department needs to do something about this to give greater protection to our women and children. The NFP supports. Thank you.

Vote accordingly agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 14 - Basic Education - put.

Ms N P SONTI: Chairperson, Chairperson!

Ndicela ukubuza ukuba kuvumelekile kusini na ukuba umntu afote abantu apha kule Ndlu? (*Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.*)

[I would like to ask if it is allowed for someone to take pictures of people in this House?]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, no. Where do you see that?

Nksk N P SONTI: Nankuya, nankuya, uyasifota la mntu.
(*Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.*)

[Ms N P SONTI: There he is, there he is, that person is taking pictures of us.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, let us observe ... [Interjections.]

Nksk N P SONTI: Nankuya, nankuya! (*Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.*)

[Ms N P SONTI: There he is, there he is!]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member!

[Interjections.]

Ms N P SONTI: Nankuya, nankuya! (*Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.*)

[Ms N P SONTI: There he is, there he is!]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Sonti ...

[Interjections.]

Ms N P SONTI: Makayicime. (*Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.*)

[Ms N P SONTI: He must delete it.]

USihlalo Wendlu (Kkz. M G Boroto): Ngikuzwile. Akhe ngikhulume. Ngikuzwile, Mma. (*Translation of isiNdebele paragraph follows.*)

[The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I heard you. Let me talk. I heard you, madam.]

Hon members, order!

Ungikhombelani ke kwanjesi? (*Translation of isiNdebele sentence follows.*)

[Why are you pointing a finger at me now?]

Hon members, let us observe the Rules of this House. For those who do not know, please, you cannot use cameras and take photos in the House. You are not allowed. Thank you.

The DA has called for a declaration on this Vote which is Vote 14. The bells will be rung for 15 seconds. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Sorry, House Chair, we called to make a declaration, which should take place before division is called.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. Hon Marchesi from the DA. [Applause.] May I allow parties to say they want to make a declaration because I will make a lot of mistakes even if it is here? Allow me.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chair, I understand, but the whole point of us providing the schedule, which we spent a lot of time doing, was to prevent this situation.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): People change.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Well, I can assure you, Madam House Chair, we are sticking to this today.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. I just want to be fair to everybody. Hon Marchesi, continue.

Declarations of vote:

Ms N I TARABELLA MARCHESI: House Chairperson, Basic Education continues to receive a big chunk of the budget and yet we are not seeing the fruits of our taxpayers' investment. When we talk about violence in the schools, you burry your head in the sand, Minister. Frankly, South Africans cannot continue to pay for education where learners and teachers experience violence or threats of violence daily. Safety at school must come first.

We therefore ask you as the custodian of this department, Minister, to initiate the following: Show serious commitment in afterschool programmes to keep learners out of trouble; we need collaboration across national government with the Departments of Justice, Health, Social Development and the S A Police Service, Saps; we need to secure our schools with fences and security guards; train and develop educators on how to deal and manage

class discipline without corporal punishment; and finally, we call for the safe school call centres in all provinces so that learners, staff and communities can report acts of violence. We, therefore, as the DA, do not support this budget. Thank you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Chairperson, the IFP is ready to make a declaration.

Mr S L NGCOBO: The IFP calls for the commitment from the Minister of Basic Education to address issues that affect educators of this country but specifically Grade R educators. These educators are the first people a child will come into contact with, in formal education.

We have seen that Grade R teachers do not receive the same protection and benefits that teachers from Grade 1 upwards receive. Furthermore, they do not enjoy the same level of protection through any specific laws relating to employment within the education sector. Minister, we call on your urgent intervention to incorporate Grade R teachers into the current legislation and framework that educators from Grade 1 upwards benefit from, specifically the Employment of Educators Act 76 of 1998. Thank you, House Chair.

Mnr W J BOSHOFF: Agb Huisvoorsitter, die VF Plus beskou die gemeenskap as grondliggende werklikheid, met die staat, afgeleide daarvan, met die doel om ruimte en veiligheid te bied waarbinne gemeenskappe kan floreer.

Aangesien die staat tans die fiskale bevoegdheid het, volg dit dat dit die staat se verantwoordelikheid is om onderwys op 'n regverdige en gelyke manier te befonds, maar die inhoud van onderwys behoort by gemeenskappe te berus.

Die begroting wat die Minister van Basiese Onderwys aan die Parlement voorgelê het, daarenteen, is op staatsgesentreerde onderwys gemik.

Die staat poog nie alleen om minimumstandaarde te stel nie, maar verwag ook van skole om die ideologie onderliggend aan die huidige bedeling aan kinders af te dwing. Boonop slaag die department nie daarin om minimumstandaarde algemeen toe te pas nie.

Vroeë kinderontwikkeling kry nie die nodige aandag nie, terwyl oorspanne verwagtings aan tegnologie gestel word. Die VF Plus verwerp dus die begroting vir Basiese Onderwys. *(Translation of Afrikaans speech follows.)*

[Mr W J BOSHOFF: Hon House Chairperson, the FF Plus regards the community as a fundamental reality, with the state derived from it, aiming to provide a space and security within which communities can flourish.

Considering the state currently has the fiscal power, it means that it is the state's responsibility to fund education in a just and equitable manner, but the content of education should rest with communities.

On the contrary, the budget that the Minister of Basic Education presented to Parliament is aimed at state-centred education.

The state not only seeks to set minimum standards, but also expects schools to enforce the ideology underlying the current dispensation to children. In addition, the department fails in applying minimum standards in general.

Early childhood development does not receive the necessary attention, while exaggerated expectations are placed on technology. The FF Plus, therefore, rejects the budget for Basic Education.]

Ms M E SUKERS: Hon House Chair, the philosophy of learning is an all-important one and it seems from the response of the Minister to our budget speech that we are in this regard diametrically in opposition. The majority of South Africans want the education system to reflect the beliefs they hold dear. This means their faith in God and biblical moral should form part of the education system.

The introduction of comprehensive sexual education is an assault on the values of the majority of South Africans and an imposition by the state on the role of parents. The education system we are investing billions in is not yielding the results we, as a country, need. The state of our education from infrastructure to the quality of learning and the result, thereof, does not reflect the money we spend on it.

Belief underpins everything we do in life, hon Minister. Where and how we spend our money is a reflection of what we value and believe. Therefore, the ACDP does not support this budget.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chair, the NFP supports the Budget Vote. Let me start off by saying that I think the emphasis should be on quality rather than quantity. What we have found in our visits to many of the schools, particularly in the rural

areas, is that the quality of teaching is substandard and I think we need to address that.

The NFP calls for more training colleges so that our educators can get the quality training that they need to be able to go out there and teach. More importantly, if you look at the issue of sports at the moment, South Africa, in all spheres of sports, is not performing. We are calling on the Department of Basic Education to partner with Sports and Recreation and other relevant departments so that we can be able to give a one-stop education, including sports so that we too can perform like we have performed before. The NFP supports. Thank you.

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon House Chairperson, Basic Education is one of the departments that are supposed to play a major role in bringing solutions to the problems that are faced by our country. With the big budget that has been allocated to this department, we hope that the issue of mud schools and pit toilets will be dealt with once and for all. The infrastructure should be looked into seriously this time around.

School safety is a very big challenge in our schools. We see learners stabbing one another and teachers dying from that. We

think we need to have an approach that must be looked into in order to bring an end to this problem in our schools.

Another issue is the no-fee schools that are making parents pay and reports being withheld by the school. I think this should be looked into, hon Minister. Most schools are doing this - being no-fee schools but they want parents to pay fees. It is really a problem.

I would also like to see how far it has gone with the summit that was convened by the President for businesses to assist in the issue of infrastructure. Perhaps that should be put under this Khawuleza campaign. Now that we are being given this money, it means that development and service delivery should now continue. Therefore, the AIC has no reason not to support this budget because it means service delivery to our people. Thank you.

Ms T R M ZUNGU: Hon House Chair, the ANC supports this budget. We see this budget as responsive and very progressive even though it is set out of difficult economic conditions. The R24,5 billion budget for Basic Education has notched an increase of 3,4% from the previous financial year. We must note that it is a reality that out of the R24,5 billion, almost R20 billion

is transfers and subsidies to provinces. Therefore, the national Department of Basic Education is left to use just over R4 billion for all its work, including monitoring and support. We support and approve the budget. Thank you, House Chair.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 228: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Buthelezi, M G; Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Frolick, C T; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hadebe, B M; Hendricks, M G E; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M D; Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo,

M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehhlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Manamela, K B; Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D; Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N; Mbingo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, E S; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mjobo, L N; Mkhatshwa, N T; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, A H; Mthembu, J M; Mthethwa, E N; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D;

Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T;
Nxumalo, M N; Nzuzi, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein,
S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C
M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M;
Seabi, A M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M;
Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K;
Siwela, V S; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M
S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E;
Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A;
Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tsenoli, S L; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B;
Tshwete, P; Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M
J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Zibula, B
T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 91: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L
J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K
Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; De
Villiers, J N; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M;
Groenewald, P J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hill-Lewis, G G;
Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H;
Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; King, C
V; Kohler, D; Komane, R N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Lees, R
A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C;
Madlingozi, B S; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais,

S J F; Masango, B S ; Masipa, N P; Matiase, N S; Mazzone, N W A; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Meshoe, K R J; Mey, P ; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mohlala, M R; Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder, F J; Mulder, C P; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Nolutshungu, N J; Paulsen, M N; Powell, E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; Van Staden, P A; Waters, M; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Business suspended at 13:01 and resumed at 14:00.

Vote No 15 - Higher Education and Training - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr B B NODADA: House Chairperson, we will not support a budget that seeks to continuously perpetuate an ANC-made national

crisis of unemployment and further entrenches dependency by widening the gap between insiders and outsiders.

Asikufuni ukukhongozela kurhulumente thina, siyaphela nini nilibele kukuphupha nje. (*Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.*).

[We do not want to beg from the government; we are dying while you are busy dreaming.]

We can't support a budget that pays no attention to developing quality but seeks to continue with this ancient, outdated and unlinked curriculum, unqualified lectures and poor infrastructure in Technical and Vocational Education and Training, TVET, colleges and previously disadvantaged institutions that seeks to send our brothers and sisters to the robots as jobseekers rather than the workplace. This process has been rushed where the R104 billion is not fairly appropriated so as to better fund Higher Education sector in its entirety which should be developing skills and training students as a mechanism of redress and socioeconomic prosperity especially in the TVET sector which seems to be the stepchild of universities to this government.

Furthermore, there has been poor allocation for proper infrastructure such as lecture rooms, libraries, ICT infrastructure, Wi-Fi and residences. No increase in the TVET budget which will continue giving students fewer allowances than those in universities, meaning, they eat and commute differently.

We also wanted to propose how Sector Education and Training Authority, Seta, funding can be better used to produce the much-needed quality skills training.

Lastly, there is a lot of savings and waste within National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, which could be used elsewhere to enhance quality access. This is why we cannot support a budget that perpetuates and worsens the status quo and destroys the future of this country by putting them through an education system that sends them to sit at home. I thank you.

[Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Okay, I have received a list of parties to make declarations. I am following this list. So, if you have any amendments, please inform the Table so that I don't call you unnecessarily.

Dr W J BOSHOFF: Agb Huisvoorsitter, die twee begrippe waar rondom die hele begroting vir Hoër Onderwys gaan is dekolonisasie en gratis toegang tot hoër onderwys.

Wat dekolonisasie betref het die ANC regering die proses amper voltrek om die enigste voorbeeld van suksesvolle gedekoloniseerde hoër onderwys in Suid-Afrika - naamlik die Afrikaanse onderwysstelsel van basiese onderrig regdeur tegnologiese en akademiese onderrig - nek om te draai.

Wat gratis toegang betref is dit goed om vir almal - ongeag die betaalvermoë - die geleentheid te gee om te studeer, maar die VF Plus is eerder ten gunste daarvan dat dit op 'n beursbasis gedoen word, sodat studente sowel as die regering verantwoordelikheid neem vir die studierigtings wat geneem word.

Op grond van hierdie twee diskwalifikasies kan die Vryheidsfront Plus nie die begroting steun nie. Dankie. (*Translation of Afrikaans speech follows.*)

[Dr W J BOSHOFF: Hon House Chairperson, the two concepts around which the entire budget for Higher Education are based are decolonisation and free access to higher education.]

In terms of decolonisation, the ANC-led government has almost completed the process of ruining the only example of successful decolonised higher education in South Africa - namely the Afrikaans education system of basic education through technological and academic education.

In terms of free admission, it is good for everyone - regardless of the ability to pay - to have the opportunity to study, but the FF Plus is rather in favour of this being done on a bursary basis, so that students as well as the government take responsibility for the fields of study taken.

Based on these two disqualifications, the F F Plus cannot support the budget. Thank you.]

Mr M G MAHLAULE: Hon House Chair, the ANC is committed to the fundamental vision articulated by the Freedom Charter of opening the doors of learning and culture. We believe that this budget advances that vision.

We are committed to transforming and making sure that Higher Education is free, quality and affordable to the poor. So, this is what this budget advances. We think that the policy instrument that we have been able to pursue over the past

period has been able to advance this vision of transforming the Higher Education.

We think that Higher Education progressively must be available for the poor and we make no apologies for that. As for the things that hon Nodada was saying from the DA, it's a broken record, and there is nothing new. There are no new ideas that we are being provided with. Therefore, we reject those submissions. The ANC support this Budget Vote. [Applause.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 201: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; August, S N; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Boroto, M G; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hadebe, B M; Hermans, J; Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T

M; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Koornhof, G
W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M; Lamola, R O;
Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J;
Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe,
G; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P;
Mahlobo, M D; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Majosi, Z;
Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V T; Malomane, V
P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Manamela, K B ; Mananiso, J S;
Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N;
Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P;
Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T
V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D; Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P;
Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F;
Mbatha, S G N; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, T V B;
Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhatshwa, N T;
Mkhize, Z L; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N;
Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed,
H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K;
Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A;
Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A
H; Munyai, T B; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Newhoudt-
Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-
Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ;
Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntshayisa, L

M; Ntuli, M M; Nxumalo, M N; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tsenoli, S L; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P; van Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M.

NOES - 78: Abrahams, A L A; Bagrain, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; De Villiers, J N; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M; Groenewald, P J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khanyile, T A; Kohler, D; Komane, R N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Langa, T M; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Madlingozi, B S; Mafanya, W T I; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Matiase, N S; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; McGluwa, J J; Meshoe, K R J; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mokaue,

M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G;
Mulder, F J; Mulder, C P; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B;
Powell, E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M
L; Siwisa, A M; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E;
Swart, S N; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Minnen, B M; Van
Staden, P A; Waters, M; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A
G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, you are reminded that in subsequent votes the bells will only be rung for a very short time. So, if you leave the House you will not be allowed to get in when the doors are closed.

Vote No 16 - Health - put.

Declarations of vote:

Ms S GWARUBE: House Chairperson, to support this budget would be to agree to the public health system being sacrificed at the altar of political opportunism and the ANC's insatiable desire for yet another state-owned enterprise. To support this budget

would be to give ANC-led government access to billions of public money to loot as they have been doing for the past 25 years. To support this budget would be destroying both the public and the private health-care sector. It would be to sentence millions more to a failing health system. It would do nothing to improve the current health system.

Abantu bethu baseza kuhlala bephila ubomi bentshontsho phantsi kwalo rhulumente. Yiyo loo nto singulo mbutho weDA sizimisele ukulwa nalo Mthetho oYilwayo we-Inshorensi yezeMpilo yeSizwe.

(Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)

[Our people will continue to struggle under this government. That is why we as the DA are determined to fight this National Health Insurance Bill.]

We want universal health care that will be affordable within the current health budget which will not lend itself to mass corruption.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Ms S GWARUBE: It must place the patient at the centre of its conception. Until then, we will make the principled stance to

stand against the nationalisation of health care and fight against it. We object to this health budget because it is not for the people of South Africa but it is for the political and ideological vanity project of Luthuli House. [Applause.]

Mr I M GROENEWALD: House Chair, the amount of R30 billion that is earmarked for launching the National Health Insurance plan can be put to better use elsewhere.

R30 miljard oor 'n periode van 11 jaar - want die regering wil hierdie plan teen 2030 ingestel hê - gaan sowat R2,7 miljard per jaar beloop van uit die gesondheidsbegroting.

Die VF Plus is van mening dat hierdie geld eerder gebruik kan word om sekuriteit by hospitale te verbeter, aandag te gee aan die herstel en aankoop van toerusting by klinieke en staatshospitale regdeur die land, en om infrastruktuur wat uitmekaar val, op te knap en te verbeter.

Dit kan ook aangewend word om die geweldige medisyne tekort wat ons tans ondervind by hierdie instellings aan te vul.

Die VF Plus sal wil sien dat die NGV dadelik gestaak moet word om 'n verval in 'n moeras van korrupsie - soos in die geval van die SAL, Eskom, Transnet en die SABC - te voorkom.

Die NGV is reeds besig om in duie te stort nog voordat dit begin het. Hierdie stelsel gaan die deure oopmaak vir verdere korrupsie en die uitdryf van hoogsbekwame medici uit Suid-Afrika. Hierdie stelsel gaan Suid-Afrika se gesondheidsdienste nog verder laat wegsink in die moeras as waarin hy tans verkeer. *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.)*

[R30 billion over a period of 11 years - because the government wants to implement this plan by 2030 - will amount to about R2,7 billion per year from the health budget.

The FF Plus is of the opinion that this money can rather be used to improve security at hospitals, pay attention to the repair and procurement of equipment at clinics and state hospitals throughout the country, and to renovate and repair run-down infrastructure that is falling apart.

It can also be used to supplement the tremendous medicine shortage we are currently experiencing at these institutions.

The FF Plus wants to see that the NHI stopped immediately to prevent a swamp of corruption - as in the case of SAA, Eskom, Transnet and the SABC.

The NHI is already collapsing even before it started. This system will open the door to further corruption and the driving out of highly skilled medics from South Africa. This system will cause South Africa's health services to sink even deeper into the swamp than it is currently.]

This government must go back to the drawing board. The FF Plus rejects this Budget Vote. Thank you, Chair. [Interjections.]

MR A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, the NFP supports this Budget Vote tabled here today. [Interjections.] Hon House Chairperson, I would like the Minister to address the community, particularly at large in the country in terms of the outbreak of swine flu and I think it will be prudent for you to allay the fears of our people on the ground. That is the first thing. The second thing is that the NFP is fully behind you in terms of the National Health Insurance, NHI, with universal health care which is now going to be a dream that is going to be fulfilled by all people in South Africa. All the people are going to be able to have access to universal health care.

The other issue is the issue of clinical health workers. We have in this House previously discussed that all clinical health-care workers who were temporal would be made permanent with full benefits. Some provinces have implemented them but others have not. So, Minister we would like you to intervene in terms of that. The other thing we would like to talk about is the nursing colleges. The NFP calls on you to use more nursing colleges. You would notice that what is happening in the country is that there are a lot of medical claims because of negligence, lack of passion in the nursing fraternity and nursing colleges. If you introduce nursing in basic education from Grade 10, you will have those with the passion that will join the nursing fraternity.

Clinical associates where we have spent a lot of money on training them and a lot of them are available. We call on the department to make use of the clinical associates. The NFP supports the budget tabled here today.

Mr S J BESANI: Hon House Chair, the ANC rises in support of the Budget Vote 16 on health precisely because it is aligned with our people's manifesto commitment. Health continues to be an apex priority for the sixth administration and put forward

progressive single unified health system called the National Health Insurance, NHI. As the NHI White Paper notes:

NHI represents a substantial policy shift that will necessitate massive reorganization of the current health-care systems and to address structural changes that exist in both public and private sectors. It reflects the kind of society we wish to live in, one based on the values of justice, fairness and social solidarity. Implementation of the NHI is consistent with the global vision that health care should be a social investment.

NHI's implementation is consistent with the National Development Plan, NDP Vision 2030 because that would provide access to an equal standard of care, regardless of the income, rich or poor, black or white. The sixth administration should undermine the conservative rightwing ideology and neoliberal agenda opposed to progressive pro-poor budget because they always advance Orania's subjective factors rather than the objective reality.

As the ANC, we are not surprised that there are wolves in sheep skin who project themselves as the pro-poor and Christians but yet they are in coalition to reject the very same pro-poor people's budget which is aimed to change the quality of people's

health for the better including the quality of health care system through the NHI. Whether you like it or not, the NHI will be adopted by the Sixth Parliament. [Applause.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 212: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; August, S N; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Boroto, M G; Buthelezi, N S; Buthelezi, E M; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hadebe, B M; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G;

Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Majozi, Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D; Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N; Mbuyane, S H; McDonald, L E; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, Z L; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A H; Munyai, T B; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F;

Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L
N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M;
Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B;
Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N;
Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tsenoli, S L;
Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P; Van Der Merwe, L L; van
Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P;
Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu,
T R M.

NOES - 92: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L
J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K
Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; De
Villiers, J N; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M;
Groenewald, P J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M
H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W
W; Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; King, C V; Kohler, D; Komane, R
N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Langa, T M; Lees, R A; Lekota, M
G P; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C;
Macpherson, D W; Madisha, W M; Madlingozi, B S; Mafanya, W T I;
Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango,
B S ; Matiase, N S; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J;
Meshoe, K R J; Mey, P ; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mokause, M
O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder,

F J; Mulder, C P; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Pambo, V; Paulsen, M N; Powell, E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; Van Staden, P A; Waters, M; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 17 - Social Development - put.

Declarations of vote:

Ms B S MASANGO: If our children are stunted, the future of our nation is stunted. Chairperson, these are the wise and apt words of South Africa's First Lady, Dr Tsepo Motsepe at the launch of the Grow Great campaign. According to the recent S A Demographic Health Survey, 27% of children under five years suffer stunting in South Africa, making South Africa number 70 out of 132 countries for stunted growth. The sad part about stunting is that its damage is largely irreversible.

It is for this reason and others in 2017 that the caring DA proposed no less than 405 budget-neutral amendments to the Appropriation Bill in the amount of R10 billion to fund, among others, assisting the poor by allocating an additional R5 billion to prevent malnutrition amongst children and assist people battling high food prices. These proposals were flatly rejected by the uncaring ANC-led government. [Interjections.]

We have also called for the registration of the Child Support Grant to happen as early as possible to ensure that the mother has nutritional food for her baby in the first 1 000 critical days in an infant's development to prevent stunting. These also fell on deaf uncaring ears of the ANC. As the DA, we will continue to fight for the children of this country because they deserve no less. As we support this budget, we would like these to be noted. [Applause.]

Ms M E SUKERS: Hon Chairperson, we wish to declare the following that we are united in our goals to eradicate poverty and address inequality. We are united in our pursuit to alleviate that hardships faced by the most vulnerable in our society. We are united in the pursuit of improved services and access to assistance on time and in time. We are united in our commitment to know what our people face and how we can better serve them.

In these pursuits, we are united and in these pursuits, we are ready to serve alongside you, hon Minister.

We request the department to ensure that it relooks its expenditure to reflect a strong focus on its core mandate. We wish to also add our concern for the proposed amendments to the Children's Bill and will engage the Minister on this very important issue. We look forward to working with this department on our common goal to empower our communities through responsive social services. We support this budget. [Applause.]

Mnu GUNGUBELE: Sihlalo weNdlu, singumbutho wesizwe sikwamkela ngezandla zozibini ukubaluleka kwenxaxheba nobulumko beli sebe, nohlahlo lwabiwo-mali olulungiselelwe ukuba luxhase abantu bakuthi abakwiimeko ezinzima ukuze bangahlali kwaNti. Olu hlahlo lwabiwo-mali luqwalasela ezi zinto zilandelayo: ukuqinisekisa ukuba kwiitasi zabantu bakuthi ikhona intwanana rhoqo ngenyanga ukwenzela ukuba iphango lingahlali apho kunzima khona; nokuqwalasela ngobulumko bokuqinisekisa ukuba inkxaso-mali yokujongana nophuhliso lwabantwana abasebancinci ihamba ngendlela ecacileyo.

Siyavuyisana noMphathiswa obonakalise ukuba iinjongo zakhe zokuya phambili kukugxininisa kuphuhliso ukwenzela ukuba le

nkxaso yepeyi kungajongwa yona kuphela ukuze abantu bakuthi babesembindini woqoqosho bangene ngezabo iinduku beziphethe zombini, eyokuhlanganisa neyokugalela. Enkosi. [Kwaqhwyatywa.]

(Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follows.)

[Mr GUNGUBELE: Chairperson of the House, we, as a national organization, welcome with both hands the importance of the participation and wisdom of this department, and the budget prepared to support our people who are in difficult situations so that they do not live very far. This budget takes into account the following things: to ensure that there is a small amount in the pockets of our people every month so that poverty does not stay where it is difficult; and considering the wisdom of ensuring that funding that deals with the development of young children goes in a transparent way.

We congratulate the Minister who has shown that his goal of moving forward is to focus on development so that this grant support is not only the source of income. That our people, who were in the middle of the economy, can come in carrying their own sticks of protecting and attacking. Thank you.]

Question put.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: Can you register our objection this time?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C Frolick): I will register your objection.

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 18 - Correctional Services - put.

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 19 - Defence and Military Veterans- put.

Declarations of Vote:

Mr L N MANGCU: Chair, the ANC for correctional services?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member. We are now with Vote No 19 of Defence and Military Veterans.

[Laughter.] Order, hon members! Order!

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION PARTY: Sorry House Chair, I think there was a confession.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I think the member didn't follow proceedings.

Mr L N MANGCU: Hon Chair, the ANC without any fear of any contradiction and the confusion that the opposition wants to bring supports the budget. We equally note that the department has made various achievements operating under very difficult circumstances or constraints of the budget. As the ANC, as much as we support the budget, we want to condemn the shrinking budget of the defence which reflects negatively on the state of the defence of the country.

The current budget as we note ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!
Order!

Mr L N MANGCU: ... as we note currently, it is under one percent of the GDP sitting at 0,97% which is below the targeted percentage of 1,8 where other countries' targets are around two percent of the gross domestic product, GDP. That said, we mustn't be defocused or deterred by agents of provocateurs who will try by all means to provoke us. We must remain focussed in delivering the important mandate that we are given by the people

because the opposition want to take shortcuts. It was the people of this country who have given the ANC a mandate.

[Interjections.] They didn't give anybody a mandate to come here ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Mr L N MANGCU: ... where they are in charge, we don't want to lead by negotiations. We are allowing them to lead freely and implement their policies. They must learn and do the same with us. The ANC supports this budget. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members I put the vote again. Are there any objections?

Mr N S MATIASE: We are still declaring, isn't it so?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Can you just repeat, hon member?

Mr N S MATIASE: We are still declaring. Is like we are ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, we are done with declarations. I have now put the vote so you can raise your objection if you want to.

Mr N S MATIASE: But you noted us. You are not.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Do you want to make a declaration?

Mr N S MATIASE: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Oh, hon members, may I ask the Whips of political parties and there is quite a few in the House. If you know you want to make a declaration, please inform the Table so that they can update the list. They requested that when we started the session, please. Give us your cooperation so that we can get through this process as smoothly as possible.

Mr N S MATIASE: Chair, the EFF object to the Defence and Military budget and the reason for that is an important historical lesson that the ANC ought to learn, although we welcome the deployment of the defence in Western Cape, particularly in Cape Metro.

The ANC must be reminded that the apartheid regime was defeated through its military insurrectionary offensive against the people and it was through the power of the people that the apartheid regime was destroyed. The ANC seem not to be taking any lessons from history. The lesson of history is that any form of war, whether it is against gangsterism, drug dealings or any form or ways in which people are terrorised, shall never be won until such war is won in the minds of the people. That war must be won amongst the people and it is by dealing with the socioeconomic factors that cause our people to resort to what they are resorting to.

The important historical lesson is that a war is won in the minds of our people before it is won on the battlefield.

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Democratic Alliance and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 20 - Independent Police Investigative Directorate - put.

Declarations of vote:

Ms R C ADAMS: Chairperson, the ANC will engage with robust discussions on the Independent Police Investigative Directorate,

Ipid, and we support the deployment of the army in the Western Cape.

The Ipid must investigate criminal offences ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Ms R C ADAMS: ... as stipulate in its governing legislation which includes serious criminal conduct allegedly committed by those who swore to serve and protect their communities and the citizen of this great nation. The ANC supports this Vote.

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Democratic Alliance and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 21 - Justice and Constitutional Development - put.

Declarations of vote:

Prof C T MSIMANG: Hon Chair, the IFP maintains that the people of South Africa feel and should be safe. This is one of the basic human rights also enshrined in the Constitution.

Unfortunately, many South African citizens feel threatened by violence, car hijacking and other crimes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, let us maintain the decorum of the House. Your pronunciation of English may be different but please let us respect one another.

Prof C T MSIMANG: Many of them have even turned their houses into prisons with electric fences and all sorts of bugler bars. Government is always assuring the citizens of this country that they are serious about combating crime yet crime is running rampant. For instance, the important department in the combating of crime is the National Prosecuting Authority, NPA. But this department is fraught with many problems and challenges. For instance, the IFP is concerned about 600 prosecutors all resigning at more or less the same time. No doubt, they had grievances and they were feeling that their grievances were not being addressed.

The number of vacancies in this department is shocking. Sometimes in certain programs it goes up to 25%. The IFP would like to strongly urge the government to prioritise the empowering of the NPA. In light of these needs, the IFP supports this budget. I thank you.

Mr S N SWART: House Chair, it is clear to us in the ACDP that the department, NPA, Legal Aid SA, the Special Investigating

Unit, SIU, Human Right Commission and the Public Protector are suffering severe financial challenges and this is impacting on service delivery in the criminal and civil justice sphere. This, as we know, is due to the constrained fiscal environment resulting in a R2 billion baseline cut on the department's budget over the medium term.

The baseline reduction for this department for this year is a staggering R667 million. The question I then posed in that committee is how we can expect the department, NPA, SIU and other entities to fulfill their constitutional obligations and deliver services when they are not properly funded.

Now, what is the solution to this? The ACDP proposed that the budget of the Asset Forfeiture Unit be increased possibly from Criminal Asset Recovery Account, Cara, funds. It is to me illogical that the NPA, Asset Forfeiture Unit and the SIU are underfunded given that they have the capacity to recover billions of rand. Double their budget and they will be able to quickly recover lost billions. Particularly now that the Special Tribunal has been established which will hear civil matters quickly. In view of the underfunding, we regrettably cannot support this budget. Thank you.

Adv H MOHAMMED: Chairperson, as the ANC, we support this Budget Vote 21 of Justice and Constitutional Development. In delivering the state of the nation address, our President said, and I quote:

The decisive steps we have taken to end State Capture and fight corruption including the measures to strengthen the NPA, SIU, Sars and State Security achieving important results but there is still much more work to do.

This follows the President's commitment to bring about stability to the leadership of the NPA. The NPA plays a critical role in the functioning of the criminal justice system. We are encouraged by the appointment of the new National Director of Public Prosecutions as well as the new Head of the Investigating Directorate.

This establishment of the investigation directorate is reflection of the ANC-led government's decisiveness in dealing with corruption. We therefore also encourage the NPA and the SIU not to relax on the efforts in combating corruption in the private sector. As we know corruption enriches a few, undermines good governance and the rule of law, and ultimately impedes service delivery. Therefore, we appreciate the work that the

Legal Aid SA is doing in providing access to justice to those who cannot afford legal fees. As we work towards a capable and developmental state as envisioned in our National Development Plan, NDP, we as the ANC, support this Budget Vote. Thank you.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 218: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; De Lille, P; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hadebe, B M; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D;

Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahlalela, A F;
Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D;
Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Majosi, Z;
Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V
T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Mananiso, J S;
Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N;
Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula,
N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego
Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D; Masondo, T
S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathale, C C;
Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N; Mboweni, T T;
Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, E S; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe,
S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhathshwa, N T;
Mkhize, Z L; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N;
Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed,
H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R;
Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M S;
Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G;
Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A H; Munyai, T B; Muthambi,
A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T;
Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P;
Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M;
Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshavheni, K P
S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N;

Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N
P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-
Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A
M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P;
Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T;
Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Tlhape, M
M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A;
Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P;
Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V
C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B
T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 83: Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D;
Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J;
Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; De Villiers, J N; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S
J; Groenewald, I M; Groenewald, P J; Gumbi, H S; Hill-Lewis, G
G; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan,
H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khawula, M S; King, C V; Kohler, D;
Komane, R N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Langa, T M; Lees, R A;
Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Mabika, M S;
Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B S; Mafanya, W T I;
Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masipa, N
P; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Meshoe, K R J; Mey,
P ; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M;

Montwedi, M K; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder, F J; Mulder, C P; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Paulsen, M N; Powell, E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H; Swart, S N; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Minnen, B M; Van Staden, P A; Waters, M; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 22 - The Office of the Chief Justice and Judicial Administration - put.

Declarations of vote:

Ms J M MOFOKENG: The ANC declares that the independence of the judiciary and the rule of law are the pillars on which the constitutional order is anchored. The mandate of the Office of the Chief Justice is to provide effective administrative and technical support to the Chief Justice as the Head of the judiciary and the Constitutional Court and was established as a measure to promote and reaffirm the principle of judicial

independency. The office is applauded for its work and is encouraged to continue making justice accessible to all.

We believe that the matters raised during the debate will be considered to ensure a seamless working relationship with the office, particularly with the Minister of Justice. We welcome the commitment made by the Minister of Justice in attending to the issue of Sign Language in courts. No one should be denied access to justice because they experience physical challenges.

We also welcome this announcement that legislation will be introduced soon to allow for permanent appointment of judges to the Land Claims Court. Until now, this court has been served by acting judges. This speaks directly to the important issue of land. Because we support an independent judiciary, separation of powers and respect for the rule of law, we as the ANC, support Budget Vote 22. Thank you.

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 23 - Police - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr M J CUTHBERT: Hon House Chairperson, the DA supports the hard-working and honest police officers who go to work every day and serve with professionalism and pride. However, the DA can never support the budget that does not support these officers who go to work every day and put their lives on the line for our country. This budget does very little to protect our officers and in turn our citizens from the rampant crime wave sweeping our country.

The DA has three main concerns with this budget. One, the SA Police Service, SAPS, Annual Performance Programme, APP, presented to the portfolio committee was incomplete. I asked for the addendums to serve before the committee prior to the budget debate but this did not happen. How can Parliament possibly approve the budget without having seen the complete plans for spending that budget? Two, the DA made realistic budget-neutral proposals to bolster Independent Police Investigative Directorate, Ipid, and visible policing at their appropriations committee. The DA believes that R2 billion can be redirected from the very important person, VIP, Protection Unit budget immediately to prop up investigations in Ipid and promote rural safety. This constructive proposal was rejected by the ANC. Three, the Treasury has announced that SAPS must cut R6 billion from an already overstretched budget. This announcement is a

devastating blow to SAPS and a resounding victory for the criminals that roam our streets for the impunity.

House Chair, the under-resourcing of SAPS and Ipid is a crisis. By way of example, Ipid in their half-year report tabled in Parliament last week revealed that they had only concluded 14,5% of investigations. The Independent Police Investigative Directorate, Ipid, still does not have a permanent head and pleaded with the committee for more resources. With this budget the President's dream of having violent crimes within 10 years has gone from a pipe dream to a bad nightmare. At the end of the day, one thing is abundantly clear in this budget, the ANC is not serious about winning the war on crime and keeping South Africans safe. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chair, the NFP supports this Budget Vote. Let me start off by welcoming the intervention by the department, particularly the deployment of the SA National Defence Force. However, Minister, the NFP has been very vocal about this. Unless there is a holistic approach to crime in South Africa and engaging with the other relevant departments in terms of the contributing factors to crime, the levels of crime in South Africa are beyond the control of the SA Police Service. We urge you to call on the relevant departments, the Department

of Social Development, the Department of Human Settlements, Water and Sanitation, the Department of Home Affairs and all the relevant departments.

An approach to this should be more holistic. I do know Minister, that at one stage you called an imbizo in Johannesburg which we welcome. However, most of the departments that contribute to the serious crimes in South Africa were not present at that imbizo. So, we are calling on you to urge these other departments to work together with you so that you can have a more holistic approach in dealing with crime in South Africa. It is really beyond the control of the SA Police Service. Thank you.

Rev K R J MESHOE: House Chair, it was reported today, that some gangsters on the Cape Flats attribute police corruption as a major reason for their success in their business. One gangster claims that the police do drugs, drink with them and even borrow money from them. In return, they ask the police to inform them of when and what time they will be conducting raids.

Could this be one of the reasons why police do not win the war against crime? The ACDP calls for these serious allegations to be investigated. Until crime is rooted out of the police service, the war against drugs and gangsterism will not be won.

Whilst the ACDP supports all loyal and dedicated police officers, we will not support this Budget Vote. Thank you.

Ms T M JOEMAT-PETTERSON: Hon Chairperson and the Deputy President, the ANC support this Budget Vote. In the wake of the ugly violence unleashed against our people by organised crime syndicates, it is imperative that we seek national solutions to one of the biggest threats to our country's democracy. We cannot fight a battle between province and national. We urge the Western Cape Department of Police to work side by side with the national Minister and the SAPS to fight the scourge of gang violence, drug abuse, gender-based violence and the trade of illegal firearms.

We will integrate the resolutions of recent crime summit in the Western Cape into government's plans for the next five years. We call on and urge the Minister to have such successful summits in all other provinces in the country. Our central message is that the political parties must work together. We cannot score political points by fighting crime. We call on the national departments to prioritise the 10 high murder and violence crime precincts in the Western Cape for national investments in order to alleviate poverty. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Pay back the money.

Ms T M JOEMAT-PETTERSON: Economic development can only prosper in a safe and secure environment. I thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where's the oil?

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 230: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Boroto, M G; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; De Lille, P; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Groenewald, P J; Groenewald, I M; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hadebe, B M; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Jordaan, H; Kekana, P S; Khalipha,

T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-
Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T
I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N;
Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D;
Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahlalela, A F;
Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D;
Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Majosi, Z;
Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V
T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Mananiso, J S;
Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N;
Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula,
N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M R;
Mashego Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D;
Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M;
Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N;
Mbingo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E;
Mchunu, E S; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mey, P ; Mgweba, T ;
Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle,
T N; Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M;
Mohamed, H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla,
P R; Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M S;
Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G;
Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A H; Mulder, F J; Mulder, C
P; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C

N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L;
Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi,
B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D;
Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T;
Nxumalo, M N; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein,
S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C
M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M;
Seabi, A M; Semanya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M;
Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K;
Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S
S; Soty, M M; Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M;
Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A;
Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P; Van Der Merwe, L L; van
Schalkwyk, S R; Van Staden, P A; Wessels, W W; Wolmarans, M J;
Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S;
Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M.

NOES - 74: Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D;
Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N;
De Villiers, J N; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube,
S; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W;
Hunsinger, C H H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khanyile, T A;
Khawula, M S; King, C V; Kohler, D; Komane, R N; Kopane, S P;
Kruger, H C C; Langa, T M; Lees, R A; Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J

R B; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B S; Mafanya, W T I; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Masipa, N P; Matiase, N S; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Meshoe, K R J; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Paulsen, M N; Powell, E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithloho, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; Weber, A M M; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 24 - Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries - put.

Declarations of vote:

Ms T BREEDT: Chairperson, not enough is being done to assist commercial farmers in South Africa. This budget should provide for drought relief to commercial farmers that are facing shutdown as a result of past and current drought. Furthermore, the government cannot prioritise subsistence farmers as the

answer to South Africa's problems. With the current rate of urbanisation, we cannot prioritise the way we do.

Voedselsekuriteit moet aan die orde van die dag wees en dit is nie tans nie. (*Translation of Afrikaans sentence follows.*)

[Food security must be at the order of the day and it just isn't currently.]

The government needs to ensure that the politically connected farmers are not the only ones benefiting from conditional grants like Ilima-Letsema. South Africa cannot continue feeding fat cats like the Guptas through what is supposed to be agricultural developmental programmes at the expense of fellow South Africans. The emerging farmers should be developed and empowered to become commercial farmers. They cannot stay as emerging farmers forever. Therefore, Chairperson, the FF Plus does not support this budget.

Dankie. [Thank you.]

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon Chairperson, as AIC we note the contribution that is made by agriculture towards GDP. This is also a financial contribution to the growth of the country.

Again, we note the financial and technical support that is given by the department to the smallholder farmers. This Agricultural Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment, agri-BEE, that is meant for the previously disadvantaged individuals - the blacks - this is also getting on, and we also note that.

Chairperson, food security and food safety should go along so that at the end we don't produce food that is poisonous and kill our people. We also advise that the local farmers who are producing something should be allowed to sell to schools so that they give something to the school nutrition and they in turn get something for their children. The Commercial Agriculture for Smallholders and Agribusiness, Casa programme that is supposed to help the smallholder farmers is also appreciated and I wish it could just be sped up.

Chairperson, most of the departments have a tendency of not achieving the targets. It is the same now with this Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries. Therefore, it is not good to set high targets that we know we will not achieve. The AIC supports this budget. Thank you.

Mr M K MOTWEDI: Chair, the lack of resolution to the land question over decades after the attainment of political freedom

remains an albatross throttling the country's progress. There can be no peace in this country without the return of land back to the people from whom it was taken. There can be no development while a tiny settler minority has all the resources, property and land while the majority have nothing.

Land ownership patterns must reflect the demographics of the Republic of SA. Everything that has been attempted from 1994 has failed. For this reason, the only viable resolution to the land question lies in changing the constitutional framework that has allowed things to remain as they are. Let us amend section 25 of the Constitution, let us expropriate land without compensation and let us redistribute land equitably amongst the dispossessed majority in South Africa.

To prevent embrangled accumulation of public resource let us make the state the custodian of all the land in this country on behalf of the people. Let us establish the office of the land ombudsman to mediate and resolve land disputes all around the country, particularly in areas where tenure security is precarious on farms and in areas under the jurisdiction of traditional leaders. Let us ensure that women, young people, farm workers and farm dwellers, emerging farmers and the urban poor are the biggest beneficiaries of land expropriation. Not

some fat cats in Luthuli House your "veli present" and others. We vehemently reject this budget as the EFF. Thank you very much.

Mr Z M D MANDELA: Chairperson, the ANC supports Budget Vote 24 on Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries. I wish hon Montwedi would have taken note that we are not on Budget Vote 39, of Land Reform. We do so, acknowledging the importance role that this department plays on our economy by providing food security, jobs and stimulating secondary industries critical for growing our economy and ushering in hope and the new dawn.

Hon members, agriculture is identified in the National Development Plan, NDP, as one of the key sectors through which increased employment and poverty alleviation can be achieved including the creation of approximately onemillion new jobs and the trade surplus are expected to be created from agriculture, agro-processing and related sectors by 2030. I thank you.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 271: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G;
August, S N; Bagraim, M; Bapela, K O; Basson, L J; Bergman, D;
Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Brink,
C; Buthelezi, N S; Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, M G; Cachalia, G K
Y; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cardo, M J; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H;
Chabane, M S; Chetty, M; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; De Lille,
P; De Villiers, J N; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C;
Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C;
Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q
R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; George, D T; Gina, N; Gondwe, M M;
Gordhan, P J; Graham, S J; Gumbi, H S; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N;
Gungubele, M; Gwarube, S; Hadebe, B M; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L;
Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Hoosen, M
H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T
H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Joseph, D; Julius, J W
W; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Khanyile, T A; Kibi, M T; King, C
V; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Kohler, D; Koornhof, G W; Kopane, S P;
Kruger, H C C; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Lamola, R O;
Lees, R A; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lorimer, J
R B; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Mabe, B P; Mabika, M
S; Mabiletsa, M D; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Magadzi, D P;
Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D;
Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R;
Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Majola, T R; Majozi, Z; Makhubela-

Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malatsi, M S; Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masipa, N P; Masondo, D; Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F; Mbabama, T M; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N; Mbhele, Z N; Mbingo-Gigaba, B P; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mc Gluwa, J J; Mchunu, E S; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Meshoe, K R J; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mjobo, L N; Mkhathshwa, N T; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mpanza, T S; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A H; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M; Nodada, B B; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M;

Patrein, S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J;
Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Powell, E L; Qayiso, X S;
Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Sarupen, A N; Seabi, A M; Seithlholo,
I S; Selfe, J; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M;
Shelembe, M L; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Siwela, E
K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo,
S S; Sotyu, M M; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E;
Swart, S N; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Tlhape, M M E;
Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A;
Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P;
Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; van Schalkwyk, S R; Weber, A M
M; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-
Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T;
Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S.

NOES - 23: Arries, L H; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Chirwa, N N;
Groenewald, P J; Hinana, N E; Jordaan, H; Komane, R N; Langa, T
M; Lekota, M G P; Madlingozi, B S; Mafanya, W T I; Matiase, N S;
Mey, P; Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Mulder, F J;
Mulder, C P; Paulsen, M N; Siwisa, A M; Van Staden, P A;
Wessels, W W.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 25 - Economic Development - put.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 26 - Energy - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr K J MILEHAM: Chairperson, this budget does not address the primary issue facing our country, namely, ensuring energy security. But we have a Minister and the department who are spending billions on projects like the Grand Inga and the South Sudan Oil deal, projects which are unlikely to do anything to ensure energy security in the short or even in the medium term if they come off at all.

We have a budget that has slashed the funds available to municipalities and Eskom for the Integrated National Electrification programme, a programme intended to provide electrical reticulation to the poorest and to the most marginalised members of our society.

We have a Minister and the Deputy Minister who have bought into the constantly repeated lie that renewable energy costs are more than fossil fuels. During the budget debate, the Deputy Minister stated as a fact that renewable energy cost Eskom on average R2,22 per kilowatt-hour in 2018. But this was a blatant falsehood. The figures she relied on and Eskom's presentation to the National Energy Regulator, Nersa, included all independent power producers, amongst them the gas independent power producers, IPPs, used to keep the lights on when Eskom's coal-fired plants couldn't keep up with the demand during load shedding.

In fact, the levelised cost of electricity produced by Medupi and Kusile, the two new Eskom coal plants, is forecast to be almost twice as high as the cost of the renewable energy in Bid Window 4.

It is clear that this Minister does not want to consider independent power producers as a potential solution to our energy crisis. This was evidenced yesterday by the sudden forced departure of Karen Breytenbach, the head of South Africa's IPP office with nine months remaining in her contract. Breytenbach has been instrumental in rolling out 112 IPP projects and ensuring at least \$15 billion of direct foreign investment. It

is for this reason that the DA will be tabling its independent system and market operator Bill to encourage greater competition in our electricity sector. The DA rejects this budget.

Mr M N NXUMALO: Hon Chairperson and hon members, South Africa remains primarily a fossil fuel-based economy deriving cheap energy from coal. In fact, coal-derived power usage is said to only reach its pick or in around about 2030. With our new coal-powered power stations situated at Medupi and Kusile expected to be operational for about the next 75 years.

Many South Africa's municipalities are indebted to Eskom who remains a chief not only as an entity where corruption is rife, but also in terms of maladministration and poor service delivery. Eskom also has a stranglehold on the grid which makes it difficult for IPPs to enter and assist with the supply-side deficits.

Chairperson, if South Africa is to reach its target for socioeconomic growth and its commitments in terms of international climate accords, it must not only explore innovative, clean and renewable methods of energy supply-side production, but also more importantly, open up the grid for a far greater number of independent power producers. This will not

only boost foreign direct investment but will also create employment and jobs. I thank you.

Mr M G MAHLAULE: Hon House Chair, energy, more especially electricity, is an essential input to all our economic activities. Our economy, therefore, needs reliable and affordable electricity, liquid fuels and gas. The Budget Vote aims to consolidate the governance of key state entities in order to achieve these objectives. The key focus of the department is gazetting the integrated resource plan which will set out a long-term energy trajectory for our nation.

The integrated resource plan, IRP, is being considered in the context of a global transition from fossil fuel to renewable energy. Unlike the DA, the ANC-led government does not approach this transition in a binary fashion. We do not see it as a battle between coal and renewables. Our government will work for a just energy transition and balanced resource plan. That is why the ANC supports this Budget Vote. Thank you. [Applause.]

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, African Christian Democratic Party and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Vote No 27 - Environmental Affairs - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, the NFP supports Budget Vote 27 tabled here today. However, allow me to express our concern which we have raised in this House many times before. I hope the Minister is here to listen to this - the high pollution rate particularly in the areas of Merewent, Jacobs, Bluff, Osterville and Lamontville by some of the big industries like Mondi, Sapref refinery and Engine refinery. The areas have the highest level of cancer, lung infection and tuberculosis. I think the Minister of Health is also here. We would like you to address this matter as a matter of urgency.

There was an investigation study done by the University of KwaZulu-Natal but for the obvious reason, it appears that it has not yet been released. The NFP supports the report. Thank you.

Ms N GANTSHO: Hon Chairperson, I rise on behalf of the ANC to declare support on Vote 27. This department is very crucial given the current onslaught by climate change and global warming. We all desire to live in healthy and safe environment. The environmental degradation caused by human activity and big corporates threatens our immediate survival. The department

needs more resources so as to improve working relations with other stakeholders and ensure that we lessen negative impact of global warming. Therefore, the budget allocation for this most important department is not sufficient.

The fruitful expenditure of this budget will ensure that the ANC-led government does not only contribute to the protection and perseveration of environment and all its natural resources, but ensures that natural resources are utilised for the full benefit and enjoyment of all South African citizens. Thank you.
[Applause.]

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance, African Christian Democratic Party and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Vote No 28 - Labour - put.

Declarations of vote:

Dr M J CARDO: Hon Chairperson, the Department of Employment and Labour's R3,34 billion budget does not work for the unemployed, and it never has. In 1994, there were 3,6 million unemployed South Africans, and today, there almost 10 million unemployed South Africans. In 1994, the official unemployment rate was 20%, and in 2019 it is 27,6%. The youth unemployment rate sits at

over 55%. This is a ticking time bomb that threatens to rip apart our social fabric.

Every single day, for the past 10 years almost 900 people join the ranks of the unemployed. The Department of Employment and Labour needs to put our over 10 million unemployed South Africans at the centre of its mandate. It needs to broaden its focus from workplace compliance to job creation. It must start to work for the unemployed. This R3,34 billion budget does not do the job.

We need to reform our labour policies and laws to stimulate job creation and to allocate the budgets accordingly. That is why the DA will prioritise first the implementation of our Jobs Bill which focuses on areas critical to economic recovery, foreign investment and small, medium and micro-sized enterprises SMMEs; second, key changes to the Labour Relations Act making it easier to hire new workers; third, strong recognition for temporal work; fourth, the exemption of small and newly created businesses from the thicket of regulations that inhibits job creation; and fifth, the democratisation of labour negotiations by taking on big unions with vested interests. Until this department's budget supports job creation and channels the funds accordingly, the DA will oppose it. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms H JORDAAN: Hon House Chair, during its visit earlier this year, the International Monetary Fund found that South Africa's subdued economic growth could be reignited if the pace of the structural reform implementation is accelerated. This can be achieved by, amongst other means, increasing labour market flexibility.

A focus on policy actions to remove long-standing structural constraints to growth and accelerating job creation is a must. Currently, the Department of Employment and Labour's budget is not aimed at creating jobs and stimulating economic growth by enabling the private sector to flourish. It is quite the opposite actually. Labour market flexibility is not attainable due to restrictive labour legislation that is implemented through the department's various programmes amounting to overregulation and it is always aimed at keeping the alliance partners and other trade unions happy.

Die Suid-Afrikaanse arbeidslandskap is een waar die stert die hond swaai - die vakbonde regeer, nie die ANC nie. Die mag van die vakbonde moet beperk word en beperkende arbeidswetgewing en beleide soos swart ekonomiese bemagtiging, SEB, en regstellende aksie moet afgeskaf word.

Die departement se prioriteite is verkeerd. Die VF Plus steun dus nie die begroting van die Departement van Arbeid nie.

Dankie. *(Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.)*

[The South African labour landscape is one where the tail wags the dog - the unions rule, not the ANC. The power of the trade unions must be limited, and restrictive labor legislation and policies such as black economic empowerment, BEE, and affirmative action must be abolished.]

The department's priorities are wrong. The FF Plus therefore does not support the budget of the Department of Employment and Labour. Thank you.]

Ms N P NKABANE: House Chairperson, it is worth noting that the budget priorities for Vote No 28 ought to be employed as instruments to influence policy directive as far as employment and labour is concerned. The South African government led by the ANC has made tremendous strides in addressing socioeconomic challenges that the county is facing of which we have inherited from the then government. However, there is a lot that needs to be done.

The Minister of Employment and Labour as well as the Minister of Finance reiterated that, and I quote:

There is a continued collaboration with social partners at the National Economic Development and Labour Council, Nedlac, to improve the country's investment ratings and to accelerate economic growth which will impact positively to job creation.

The programmes as presented are very clear hence they are looking at the issues of administration, inspection and inspection services, public employment services and labour and industrial relations. The ANC supports the Budget Vote. I thank you. [Applause.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 218: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Buthelezi, M G; Buthelezi, N S; Buthelezi, E M; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; De Lille, P; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlamini,

D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L;
Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N;
Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hermans, J;
Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S
P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H;
Joemat Pettersson, T M; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T;
Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula,
S M; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T;
Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P;
Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E;
Magwanishe, G; Mahambehllala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D;
Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R;
Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Makhubela Mashele, L S; Makwetla,
S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B;
Mamabolo, J B; Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M;
Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ;
Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-
Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V;
Masiko, F A; Masondo, D; Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P;
Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F;
Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N; Mbingo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T;
Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, E S; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe,
S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhatshwa, N T;
Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M;

Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L
E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K;
Motaung, A; Motshekga, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A;
Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A
H; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C
N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L;
Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi,
B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D;
Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N;
Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N
P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-
Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A
M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P;
Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T;
Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M
M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou,
M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A;
Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P; van Schalkwyk, S R;
Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S
T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 82: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Bergman, D;
Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J;
Chabangu, M M; Chirwa, N N; De Villiers, J N; George, D T;

Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; Kohler, D; Komane, R N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Langa, T M; Lees, R A; Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J R B; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B S; Mafanya, W T I; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Masipa, N P; Matiase, N S; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Mey, P ; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder, F J; Mulder, C P; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Spies, E R J; Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Minnen, B M; Van Staden, P A; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 29 - Mineral Resources - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 225: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; April, H G; August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Boroto, M G; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, N S; Buthelezi, M G; Capa, N; Capa, R N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; De Lille, P; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Jordaan, H; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lekota, M G P; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N;

Mantashe, P T; Mantashe, S G ; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D; Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathale, C C; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N; Mbinqo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, E S; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mey, P ; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhathswa, N T; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A H; Mulder, C P; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E;

Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A;
Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P;
van Schalkwyk, S R; Van Staden, P A; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C;
Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T;
Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 68: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Brink, C;
Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chirwa, N N; De
Villiers, J N; George, D T; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Gumbi, H
S; Gwarube, S; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H
H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khawula, M S; Kohler, D; Komane, R
N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Langa, T M; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J
R B; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B
S; Mafanya, W T I; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J;
Marais, S J F; Masipa, N P; Matiase, N S; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele,
Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mokause, M O;
Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Ngcobo, S;
Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Sarupen, A N; Seitlholo, I S; Selfe,
J; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E;
Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W
M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; Weber, A M M; Whitfield, A
G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 30- Science and Technology - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr W M THRING: Chairperson, the ACDP notes the budget of some R8,1 billion for the Department of Science and Technology. This budget is divided amongst five programmes with three of those namely: technology innovation; research, development and support and socioeconomic partnerships receiving 93,5% or some R7,6 billion of the total allocation.

Chair, science and technology are key drivers of any economy and must be promoted at all levels. The ACDP supports this budget.

Thank you.

Ms N T MKHATSHWA: Hon House Chairperson and members, this month marks the 50th anniversary since humanity reached the moon and Neil Armstrong took those famous steps. The development of science and technology is intrinsically linked to the development of humanity as a whole, and thus, we support the prioritisation of the department to take science, technology and innovation to the people and bring the people to science, technology and innovation, STI.

Acknowledging the President's Sona, it is clear that the ANC government places science and technology central to its developmental goals. With the department acknowledging the few numbers of black women researchers as we try to ensure that the Fourth Industrial Revolution does not deepen gender and class inequities in our society.

We support the department's prioritisation to support women's participation in research, science and innovation. We welcome and believe that the 2019-20 budget of R16,5 billion for science, technology and innovation will be of good benefit to the development of our people, our journey towards the Fourth Industrial Revolution and an entrepreneurial state in breaking the gender, race and class inequities in our society. I thank you. The ANC supports. [Applause.]

Vote agreed to.

Vote No 31 - Small Business Development - put.

Vote agreed to (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, African Christian Democratic Party and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Vote No 32 - Telecommunications and Postal Services - put.

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 33 - Tourism - put.

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Vote No 34 - Trade and Industry - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr D W MACPHERSON: House Chairperson, the DA cannot support the budget for Economic Development and Trade and Industry as we have done earlier because they continue to focus on marginalising business and are big on advancing the politically connected and shutting down competition; that's why we need to scrap Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment, BBBEE, and put an end to the rent-seeking, cost-inflation and patronage network the system has become.

The budget does not seek to truly address the crippling situation in the sugar industry, which the majority of the

committee abandoned at the end of the Fifth Parliament by outsourcing its responsibility to the previous Minister because and I quote: "The ANC had no time." In truth, it's the thousands of workers losing their jobs that just never had the time.

It is a budget that does not seek to boost manufacturing, cut red tape or help the little guy but looks to advance those who have the inside track in the ANC and their friends.

It is a budget that seeks to protect corruption, maladministration and the Competition Commission by withholding reports on the outcomes of forensic audits despite assurances to National Treasury that this would be done by 31 May 2019.

And finally, it is a budget that provides no concrete hope or plans for the 10 million unemployed South Africans. In the end, should the department fail to deal with these issues, we will table the following Bills: a Manufacturing Bill to cut corporation tax to 15%; a Sugar Act that will define a new sugar industry into the 21st century; a New Gambling Bill, which will seek to recover the billions of rand which are illicitly gambled and provide no protection to punters; and finally, a National Credit Amendment Bill, which seeks to cheapen the cost of

credit, protect consumers from illegal lenders and assist in debt counseling. I thank you.

Mnr F J MULDER: Die Departement van Handel en Nywerheid is van kernbelang vir die groei van die Suid-Afrikaanse ekonomie. Suid-Afrika beleef tans 'n kritieke stadium van sy jong demokrasie, gegewe staatskaping, swak regering en korrupsie.

Die tyd sal ook leer dat die swart ekonomiese bemagtiging misluk het, om inkomste-ongelykheid uit die weg te ruim. Dit het bloot gelei tot die verryking van die politieke elite en die gemiddelde Suid-Afrikaner het eerder verarm.

Die ekonomiese groei het feitlik tot stilstand gekom en beleggersvertroue is op 'n ongekende laagtepunt. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.*)

[Mr F J MULDER: The Department of Trade and Industry is of key importance to the growth of the South African economy. South Africa is currently experiencing a critical stage of its young democracy, given state capture, weak governance and corruption.

Time will also teach us that black economic empowerment has failed to eliminate income inequality. This simply led to the

enrichment of the political elite, while the average South African got poorer.

Economic growth has practically come to a standstill and investor confidence is at an unprecedented low.]

The FF Plus therefore rejects this budget.

Mr W M THRING: House Chairperson, the ACDP welcomes the merger of the Departments of Trade and Industry, DTI, and Economic Development with a combined budget of some R11,1 billion. We welcome the comments made in the report of the Auditor-General for the department's 2017-18 financial year when he said, "there is a growing trend of clean audits within the department".

However, the ACDP raised concerns that the DTI audit outcomes excluded the entities of the SA Bureau of Standards, SABS, and the National Regulator for Compulsory Standards, NRCS.

We also raised concerns about as well as our opposition too, to the failure to maximize beneficiation and the failure of BBBEE. The ACDP does not support this budget.

Mr D M NKOSI: House Chair, the sugar industry issue was agreed upon as part of the programme during lunch time today. Most of the issues that were raised by the DA with regard to challenges were covered by our programme between now and end of this year.

The President has announced seven priorities for our government in this financial year, which include economic transformation and job creation. This is in line with views expressed by our people during election campaign, where they said we must address unemployment, poverty and inequality.

Our young people are looking for jobs and want to participate in the economic activities. The Budget Vote allocated both financial and nonfinancial support to entrepreneurs, especially young people, women and people with disability who are largely in the rural areas. Through programmes such as Black Industrialists Scheme, BIS, and Special Economic Zones, SEZs, incentives, we believe that we can open opportunities for our people to participate in the economy.

The Competition Amendment Act will also ensure that big businesses do not bully small businesses in our economy. This will ensure that we create an inclusive economy for all our people. The ANC supports Budget Vote 34.

Agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

Vote No 35 - Transport - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr C H HUNSINGER: House Chairperson, six out of the 12 transport entities pose an increased risk for the central fiscus. From an analysis of the past five years in audit outcomes, the DA noted with concern that there has been a regression in reliable performance reporting from the department. It is, therefore, no surprise that R640 million has not been spent and that no disciplinary steps were undertaken against officials who had incurred or permitted irregular expenditure of over R5,3 billion in the prior years. Strategies to reduce instances where the liabilities exceed total assets of the following entities, Cross-Border Road Transport Agency, C-BRTA, the Road Accident Fund, RAF, Ports Regulator and the SA National Roads Agency; Sanral should be implemented without delay, while the inclusion of Passenger Rail Agency of S A, Prasa, SA Maritime Safety Authority, Samsa and Air Traffic and Navigation Services, ATNS, should be considered, given their weakening inability to fund future obligations. The DA refuses to accept a R3 billion shift

in Prasa funding destined for service delivery to the train commuters which found its way to Sanral. Also, that R5,8 billion was taken from ordinary road service-delivery allocations to e-tolls. For these and other reasons, we do not support this budget. [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chair, the NFP supports this Budget Vote ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Swart! Hon Swart, would you just take your seat; I can't see the member.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: ... on Transport. Allow me to highlight a few challenges that we have identified. One of them being the risk of cell phones in South Africa presently. There appears not to be enough legislation in terms of people driving and using their cell phones simultaneously, and many accidents are caused as a result thereof. Allow me to also draw this House's attention to the fact that most of the heavy-duty accidents that take place in South Africa take place during the early hours of the morning and I think that is as a result of exhaustion by drivers that have to drive during the day and drive all night as well. So, I think it is another matter that needs attention. Over and above that is the challenge that we are facing with collusion and or

corruption with the licensing departments together with the roadworthy centres and I think that gives rise to the high crime rate particularly in terms of theft of motor vehicles and vehicles going across the border and things like that.

Lastly, and very importantly, is the issue of ... I know there is some legislation in terms of foreigners driving in South Africa, that they have to go to a licensing department and have a permit granted to them; they have to be tested but clearly this is not being followed and as a result, you find that people are coming into the country and driving without special permits whatsoever; again, a risk to our people on the streets. The NFP supports this Budget Vote.

Mr L E MCDONALD: Hon Chair, the ANC is committed to delivering a seamlessly integrated transport system that enables economic activity, stimulates growth and gives practical effect to our commitment to lowering the cost of doing business in South Africa. With this budget, the Department of Transport answers the call for the development of economic infrastructure as the foundation of social and economic development. To the ACDP, whoever oppresses the poor shows contempt for their maker but whoever is kind to the needy honours God. The ANC will ensure that corrupt companies like On Point Engineering of hon Malema

of the EFF will never be allowed to benefit while the poor of the poorest are suffering. [Interjections.] We understand and we are confident as the ANC to effective ... [Interjections.] ... management and utilisation of resources allocated through this budget ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Mr L E MCDONALD: ... will continue to transform the department ... [Interjections.]

AN HON MEMBER: Give back our land!

Mr L E MCDONALD: ... society and change the lives of our people for the better. The department has laid out clear plans to deal with issues of security on the country's passenger trains. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Order!

Mr L E MCDONALD: Commuters will benefit from the implementation including the people in the Western Cape whom the DA tried to mislead in its lame promises before the elections. The DA in the

Western Cape must take note that the Metrorail transport will ever be the proficiency of the province. We do not need another Orania. Hon House Chairperson, the ANC supports the budget.

Thank you. [Interjections.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 219: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Boroto, M G; Buthelezi, M G; Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Cele, B H; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D

D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehhlala, T;
Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P;
Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z;
Majozi, Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ;
Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B;
Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ;
Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N
N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-
Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D; Masondo, T
S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathale, C C;
Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N; Mbinqo-Gigaba, B P;
Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, T V B;
Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhathshwa, N T;
Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M;
Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L
E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K;
Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M S; Motshekga, M A;
Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T;
Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A H; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N
Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-
Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X; Nkabane, N P; Nkoana-
Mashabane, M E; Nkomo, Z; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ;
Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntuli, M M;
Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H

M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M; Semanya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P; Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 81: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; De Villiers, J N; George, D T; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M; Groenewald, P J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D; Keetse, P P; Khanyile, T A; King, C V; Kohler, D; Komane, R N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Langa, T M; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B S; Mafanya, W T I; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Masipa, N P; Matias, N S; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Mey, P ; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mokaase, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K;

Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder, F J; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B;
Nodada, B B; Paulsen, M N; Powell, E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithloho,
I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P;
Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Terblanche, O S;
Thring, W M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; Van Staden, P A;
Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R;
Winkler, H S.

ABSTAIN - 1: Lekota, M G P.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 36 - Water and Sanitation - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr X NGWEZI: Hon House Chairperson, hon members, climate change is upon us and it is therefore essential that words adaptation, mitigation and resilience become a common thread in our thinking and discussions when we talk about the conservation and sustainable use now and into the future of our natural resources. Water as a critical resource has only dominated our national discourse in the last few years due to the drought

crisis that our country experienced since late 2015. In the years 1994 to 2015, we were gripped by a complacency that left us unprepared to effectively deal with drought. Let this be a lesson for us to never be unprepared in this respect again. An immediate audit and maintenance plan for our ageing infrastructure and the conservation and protection of our strategic water resource areas and ecosystems are good places to start if we are serious about building resilience in today's ever-warming climate. We support this Budget Vote.

Kodwa siyacela Ngqongqoshe ohloniphekile ukuba udaba lokuhlinzekwa kwamanzi endaweni yaseMkhanyakude luphuthunyiswe ngoba sikhuluma nawe nje, Ngqongqoshe, akuhambeki uma usuka eMhlabuyalingana uye eJozini noma uya eMtubabatuba. Noma usuka eMtubatuba uya kwaHlabisa akuhambeki. Abantu bavale imigwaqo badinga amanzi. Ngakhoke siyacela ukuba kungenelelwe ngokushesha ukuze kuqhamuke izixazululo eziphuthumayo mhlonishwa. Siyabonga. [Ihlombe.] (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[We appeal to you, hon Minister, to please attend to the water provision in the Mkhanyakude area immediately. As we speak, it is not easy for people to travel from Mhlabuyalingana, Jozini and Mtubatuba. Even when one travels from Mtubatuba to KwaHlabisa, it's a challenge because protestors have barricaded

the road demanding water provision. We therefore appeal for your swift action and to come up with quick solutions, hon Minister. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr B S NKOSI: Chair, the ANC rises in support of Budget Vote 36, Water and Sanitation, for it is through this Vote that South Africa is able to pursue its objective of ensuring the availability of the water resource, facilitate equitable and sustainable socioeconomic development and ensure universal access to water and sanitation services. We urge the department to act with haste in resolving its financial and nonfinancial performance; ensures the War on Leaks programme is adequately budgeted for; and seeks to resolve issues around the monitoring of its implementing agents. The ANC welcomes the merger of the two departments, the Department of Human Settlements and the Department of Water and Sanitation as this will provide an opportunity to champion basic human rights and ensure that resources are adequately utilised to achieve this objective. I must say that earlier today in the morning we all adopted the minutes of all the committees and no party voted against that motion. Therefore, it is very economic ... for those who have objections here because they had agreed earlier in the meeting. The ANC supports Vote 36. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members! Hon members, there are too many members walking around when the speakers are making these declarations. [Interjections.] Please ensure that you do not move in-between the Chair and the speaker on the floor.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 212: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G; August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Buthelezi, M G; Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M; Lamola, R O; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli,

B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D
D; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehhlala, T; Mahlalela, A F;
Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D;
Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Majosi, Z;
Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V
T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Mananiso, J S;
Mandela, Z M D; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N;
Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa Ngakula, N N; Mapulane,
M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C;
Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D; Masondo, T S; Masualle, G
P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A;
Mbatha, S G N; Mbingo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H;
Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M
R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhathswa, N T; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z;
Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng,
J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E;
Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motaung, N E;
Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S;
Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, A H; Munyai, T B; Muthambi,
A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-
Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E;
Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela,
M L D; Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M
N; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein, S; Peacock,

N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P; Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 85: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; De Villiers, J N; George, D T; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M; Groenewald, P J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; King, C V; Komane, R N; Kruger, H C C; Langa, T M; Lees, R A; Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J R B; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B S; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S; Masipa, N P; Matiase, N S; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Mey, P; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J;

Mohlala, M R; Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K;
Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder, F J; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B;
Nodada, B B; Paulsen, M N; Powell, E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo,
I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P;
Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N
I; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B
M; Van Staden, P A; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G;
Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 37 - Arts and Culture - put.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 213: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G;
August, S N; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo,
B T; Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N;
Cebekhulu, R N; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D;
Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A;

Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N;
Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A;
Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M;
Hermans, J; Hermans, N L; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S
P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-
Pettersson, T M; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet,
N; Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J;
Lula, S M; Legwase, T I; Lekota, M G P; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W
T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P;
Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E;
Magwanishe, G; Mahambehllala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D;
Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R;
Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z; Majosi, Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S;
Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ; Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P;
Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B; Mananiso, J S; Mandela, Z M D;
Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N; Mantashe, P T;
Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P; Maseko-
Jele, N H; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A;
Masondo, D; Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P; Maswanganyi, M J;
Mathafa, O M; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N;
Mbingo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E;
Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N;
Mkhatshwa, N T; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Moatshe, R M;
Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L

E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K;
Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A;
Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A
H; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C
N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L;
Ngwezi, X; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M;
Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshavheni, K P
S; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G
N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters,
E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X
S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M; Semanya, M R;
Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Sihlwayi, N N;
Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J;
Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M;
Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Swarts, B; Thring, W M; Tlhape, M M E;
Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A;
Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P;
Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V
C; Xaba Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B
T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 82: Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Bergman, D;
Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J;
Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; De Villiers, J N; George,

D T; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M; Groenewald, P J;
Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W;
Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W;
Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; King, C V; Kohler, D; Komane, R N;
Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Langa, T M; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R
B; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B S;
Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango,
B S ; Masipa, N P; Matiase, N S; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc
Gluwa, J J; Mey, P ; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mohlala, M R;
Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T
G; Mulder, F J; Mulder, C P; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B
B; Paulsen, M N; Powell, E L; Sarupen, A N; Seithlholo, I S;
Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Steenhuisen, J
H; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Van Der Walt, D;
Van Minnen, B M; Van Staden, P A; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W;
Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 38 - Human Settlements - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mnr P MEY: Meneer die Voorsitter, die onwettige besetting van grond kan gestuit word, maar die ANC het nie die politieke wil om dit te doen nie. Plakkers val nie uit die lug nie. Gisteraand het hulle onderdak geslaap, môre is hulle besig om onwettige strukture op te rig.

Die afgelope vyf maande, langs KwaNobuhle in Uitenhage, het plus/minus 700 huise opgeskiet en oorkant Joe Slovo meer as 800. Daar is geen dienste van enige aard nie. Waarom is dit nie vroegtydig gestuit nie? Die ANC het niks daaromtrent gedoen nie. Wat is die probleem? Ons grootste probleem is dat daar nie na die mense geluister word nie. Ek was gister in KwaNobuhle en die inwoners is kwaad. Hoe gaan ons die probleem oplos?

Daar is net een manier: Die grond moet vinniger gehersoneer word en dit moet tot residensiële gebied verklaar word sodat daar beter beplanning kan wees vir die toekoms. Baie dankie.

(Translation of Afrikaans declaration of vote follows.)

[Mr P MEY: Chairperson, the illegal occupation of land can be stopped, but the ANC does not have the political will to do so. Squatters do not simply fall out of the sky. The previous night they slept under a roof, and the next day they erected illegal structures.]

Along KwaNobuhle in Uitenhage, approximately 700 houses had been demolished and opposite Joe Slovo more than 800 over the past five months. There are no services of any kind. Why was this not stopped in time? The ANC did nothing about that. What is the problem? Our biggest challenge is that the people are not being heard. I was in KwaNobuhle yesterday, and the residents were angry. How are we going to solve this problem?

There is but one way: The land must be rezoned at a quicker pace and it must be declared a residential area so that there's better planning for the future. Thank you very much.]

[Tussenwerpsels.]

\n AGBARE LID: Iemand moet vertolk! (*Translation of Afrikaans sentence follows.*)

[[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Someone must interpret!]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: House Chair, the NFP supports the Budget Vote tabled here today. [Interjections.] Hon Minister, allow me to address a few issues here. Firstly, are the RDP houses ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Firstly, it is the RDP houses where we found that the department doesn't really have a database because houses are being given to people and after two or three years, these very people sell or rent those houses. There are no control measures. I think this is one of the issues you need to deal with in the informal settlements. The other thing that we have pleaded with you to do, and I think you have alluded to in your last speech, was the issue of the moratorium on all evictions, particularly for farm workers. I think you also need to look at beneficiation for farm workers in the long run because after these people retire, they are back on the streets with no hope.

The other issue is about the new Human Settlements Development Bank that has been alluded to by the President and your department. The NFP said that over and above the establishment of the bank, we believe that you should be looking for private investors locally and internationally to assist in trying to alleviate the housing crisis that we have in South Africa. The NFP supports the budget. Thank you.

Ms M R SEMENYA: Hon Chair, the ANC rises in support of Budget Vote No 38 of Human Settlements. I must say to the FF Plus that the ANC inherited the backlog that was created by the apartheid. Therefore, the ANC has been consistent on the need for providing suitable and integrated human settlement that encourages social cohesion and is allocated in well-placed areas proximate to economic opportunity and social amenities.

Minister, we acknowledge the challenges of the backlog of issuing title deed, increase in land invasion instigated by certain political parties, and increase in the eviction of farm workers as hon Shaik Emam has indicated. We hope that with the calibre of leadership ... you have, you are going to deal with all these challenges. The ANC continues to honour its commitment to improving the quality of household life for the poor and the people in the gap market in line with the call made by the Freedom Charter as well as the vision of the National Development Plan. The ANC again rises to support this budget. Thank you very much.

Division called.

The House divided.

AYES - 208: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G;
August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H;
Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Buthelezi, M G; Buthelezi, N S;
Buthelezi, E M; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R N; Chabane, M
S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; Dhlomo, S M; Didiza, A T;
Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlamini, D D; Dlamini-
Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Dyantyi, P P;
Dyantyi, Q R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N; Gordhan, P J; Gumbu,
T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hermans, J; Hermans, N L;
Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S P; Jacobs, F;
Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M;
Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet, N; Kodwa, N G;
Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J; Kula, S M;
Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M L; Luthuli,
B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M D; Mabuza, D
D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehhlala, T;
Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G; Mahlo, N P;
Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P; Majola, F Z;
Majozi, Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P; Malatji, T ;
Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo, J B;
Mananiso, J S; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N; Mantashe,
P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane, M P;
Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashele, T
V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D; Masondo, T S; Masualle, G P;

Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A;
Mbatha, S G N; Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E;
Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N;
Mkhatshwa, N T; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Moatshe, R M;
Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L
E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K;
Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M A; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S;
Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A H; Munyai, T
B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-
Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X;
Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ;
Ntobongwana, N; Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M;
Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H
M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M
J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A;
Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Sibiya,
D P; Sihlwayi, N N; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siweya,
R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S;
Sotyu, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K
B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki,
M A; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P; van Schalkwyk, S R;
Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P; Xasa, F D; Xego, S
T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M;
Zwane, M J.

NOES - 84: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Boshoff, W J; Breedts, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; De Villiers, J N; George, D T; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M; Groenewald, P J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; King, C V; Kohler, D; Komane, R N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Langa, T M; Lees, R A; Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J R B; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B S; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Masipa, N P; Matlase, N S; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Mey, P ; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mohlala, M R; Mokaase, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder, F J; Mulder, C P; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Paulsen, M N; Powell, E L; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; Van Staden, P A; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 39 - Rural Development and Land Reform - put.

Declarations of vote:

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: House Chairperson, agriculture and rural development are critical if you wish to address poverty alleviation and reduce inequality in South Africa. Apartheid left us embattled with the challenge of addressing the legacy of exclusion. Functional, effective and sustainable agriculture in rural development are therefore essential if we wish to not only deal with past exclusion, but also create sustainable skills development, create empowerment and ensure food security.

The other critical issue is the urgent audit that remains outstanding in respect of all redistributed agricultural land and assistance via skills transfer and the like, provided to current owners of the land in order to restore them to their previous states of successes .

Lokhu indlela yokukwelekelela Sihlalo ukuba kubuyiswe ukusebenza kwama-extension officer ukusizana kwalaba amasafufusa noma abathuthukayo. Ngifisa ukusho Sihlalo udaba okufanele ukuba lubhekisiswe yilolo lwama-extension officer njengoba sengishilo ukuba abuye ukuzosebenza, asize umphakathi emakhaya ikakhulukazi emhlabathini osuzohlanganyelwa.

Abantu ababethengelwe umhlaba banikezwa abasizi phecelezi ama-strategic partners. Lezo zinhlelo iningi lazo zihlulekile.

Abahlomuli bahlukene phakathi ababekhethwe ukuba bahole uhlelo okungamakomidi amaCPA lokho kwaholela ukuthi umhlabathi obusuthengwe uhulumeni ebathengela bagcina bewubuyisele emuvabawudayisela laba ebebe ngabanikazi bawo ngaphambilini.

Kulezi zinsuku kunesiqubulo esithandwa kakhulu sokuthatha komhlaba ngaphandle kwesinxephezelo. Lokho kungukuhuha nje izakhamuzi nabavoti ngaphandle kokubhekela isikhathi esiningi esizayo kuba abantu basizakale ngentuthuko yeqiniso nefanelekileyo. Akulekelelwe abahleli emhlabathini ophethwe ngokuhlanganyela ngogandaganda bokusebenza umhlabathi. Ogandaganda ababethengwe uMnyango wezoLimo kuzwelonke ngesikhathi sePhalamende leSine, amashumi ayisikhombisa abo ogandaganda izifundazwe ngezifundazwe iningi labo bonke abaziwa futhi abalandeleki ukuthi baphelela kuphi, ngaphandle kwe-Western Cape kuphela eyaba nako ukuthi ibafake ama-tracker ogandaganda bayakwazi ukukhonjwa abalapha ukuthi bakuphi. Asazi ke ukuthi laba abangekho obani abasuthiyo, lezimbodla ezasizakalayo ngalabo bogandaganda nalamagwinsi akwazi ukuthi acebe ngokuthi ogandaganda bakahulumeni bayosiza bona bangasizi umphakathi. Namanje usahluphekile umphakathi odinga ukwelekelelwa ozintweni zokulima.

Kungakuhle ngegunya lakho Sihlalo ukuthi umhlonishwa
azibhekisise lezi zinto ngoba efika kuloMnyango njengoba
uMnyango uhlanganisiwe nje kusho ukuthiinselelo inkulu. Yebo i-
IFP iyakuxhasa ukuthi kube khona isabelomali salolu hlobo. Futhi
ke sibukeka singanele bekungaba kuhle uma singangezwa ukuze
abantu basizwe basondezelwe ogandaganda ukuthi bakwazi ukulima
emakhaya, bakwazi ukuphilisa imindeni yabo. Singabuke nje
kuphela labo abangabalimi abahwebayo ngoba ... [Kwaphela
isikhathi.] *(Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)*

[Chairperson, the bringing back of the extension officers would
assist the emerging farmers. Chairperson, as I have alluded to,
extension officers should be brought back to work to assist the
communities in the rural areas and especially in relation to the
land that would be co-owned.

People who were given the land were provided with what was
referred to as strategic partners. Most of these programmes have
failed. The beneficiaries are divided. Those who were selected
to lead the programmes, known as CPA, parted ways with the land
beneficiaries, and as a result, the land that was bought has
been sold to the previous owners.

There is a popular slogan these days of land restitution without compensation. It is just a campaign aimed at winning votes with no intention of helping people in future to get the sustainable development that they deserve. Let us assist people who co-owned the land with tractors to till it. During the Fourth Parliament, the national Department of Agriculture bought 70 tractors per province. The whereabouts of these tractors are not known and could not be traced, except the Western Cape batch because they had trackers fitted. We don't know these faceless beneficiaries - wild cats and mice who continue to derive benefits from these tractors meant to uplift the communities. To this day, communities need to be assisted with tilling resources.

Through you, Chairperson, I request the Minister to address these things, especially as a new incumbent of this department. The department has been merged with another, which shows that the challenges are big. The IFP supports the budget. The budget is not enough. I would like additional funding to be made available so that people will be assisted with tractors to till the land in the rural areas and be able to provide for their families. Our focus should not only be on trading farmers because ... [Times expired.]

Dr P J GROENEWALD: Hon House Chairperson, the Budget Vote is about rural development and land reform. The President himself said that according to predictions, by 2030, 70% of the population of South Africa will be urbanised. The image is created that the land is the problem when you talk about rural development. The fact of the matter is that it is just not true. There is enough land in South Africa for each and every one.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members.

Order!

As 'n mens gaan kyk na ... *(Translation of Afrikaans sentence follows.)*

[If one has a look at ...]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members.

Order!

Dr P J GROENEWALD: As 'n mens gaan kyk na verstedeliking, dan is daar normale prosesse wat gevolg moet word waar dorpe en stede volgens hul stads- en streeksbeplanning op 'n geordende manier grond bekom, sorg dat daar water is, en sorg dat daar sanitasie

is. Dit is hoe landelike ontwikkeling en grondhervorming behoort plaas te vind.

As die regering voortgaan met onteiening sonder vergoeding om die mense onder die indruk te bring dat dit die probleem gaan oplos, wil die VF Plus dit weereens op rekord plaas dat dit 'n leuen is, en dat dit vir politieke gewin misbruik word om stemme te werf, veral met die oog op die komende munisipale verkiesing, soos wat gedoen was met die nasionale verkiesing.

Die VF Plus sal hierdie proses sover as moontlik vertraag. Ek stel dit weer op rekord dat onteiening sonder vergoeding nie net Suid-Afrika gaan vernietig in terme van grond en volhoubare ekonomiese landboubedryf nie, maar ook die land se ekonomie in sy totaliteit. Ons sal dit beveg tot in die Grondwethof, en ons sal beslis nie hierdie Begroting ondersteun nie. (*Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follows.*)

[Dr P J GROENEWALD: When one looks at urbanisation, there are normal processes that have to be followed, in an ordered manner, where towns and cities acquire land according to their urban and regional planning, ensure water supply and ensure sanitation services. This is how rural development and land reform should happen.]

If government wants to continue with expropriation without compensation, in order to give people the impression that this will solve the problem; then the VF Plus once again places it on record that this is a lie, and it is being used for political gain to attract votes, in particular with the coming municipal elections in sight; as had been done with the national elections.

The VF Plus will delay this process as much as possible. I once again place it on record that expropriation without compensation will not only destroy South Africa in terms of land and sustainable economical agricultural trade, but also the country's economy in its entirety. We will fight this right up to the Constitutional Court, and we will certainly not support this budget.]

Mr W M THRING: House Chairperson, the ACDP calls on the Minister to finalise the organic policy within the next three months, as failure to do means the adoption of a private organic standard without a regulatory framework to support it. The ACDP has acknowledged the need for reformation and restitution on the land question.

The question is not "why" but "how". We have consistently said that the expropriation without compensation is not the panacea to the land question. If property ownership is not protected, chaos and anarchy will ensue. The ACDP does not support this budget.

Mr M K MONTWEDI: House Chair, the EFF rejects this Budget Vote. The budget fails to address key issues that emerging farmers are facing on a daily basis. Government has dismally failed to give post-settlement support to farmers as soon as farms were allocated to them. We have farms where there is no water reticulated into camps, and where there are no camps for rotational grazing. Now, you are setting our farmers to fail - no farmer should be allocated land and not be given any post-settlement support. Currently we have 20 000 hectares of land that is there. If you go to an area between Migdol and Schweizer-Reineke, and Taung in Orange Grove, Khaukwe, Choseng, Kuruman, and an area between Camden and Reivilo, land is there and it is not used because you have failed to give post-settlement support to these farmers who are occupying those pieces of land. There are farms that are operating on both livestock and crop production. Government must never try to proceed and chase numbers and separate this business model by saying that a farm must operate in both livestock and crop, and

give two beneficiaries to occupy that land because in that way, they will be setting up those farms to fail.

We have infrastructure on those farms that makes provision for farmers to do a feedlot. How does a livestock farmer start a feedlot on a farm where the crop production part of that farm has been taken from that particular livestock farmer? So, you must never separate the business model of a farm before any due diligence is done so that you know what it is you are putting in. This is setting our people up to fail. [Interjections.]

The other issue is that, clearly, the ANC-led government does not take young people and women seriously. Three weeks ago, there was a land recapitalisation project wherein not even 10% of 200 beneficiaries constituted young people or women. It was all beneficiaries who were selected from this network of patronage from the ANC-led government. It was where retired public servants were taken to go and farm. You can never create farmers; farmers are born, and you must allow them to farm.

The other issue that I want to speak about is the lack of funding in the Office of the Valuer-General ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Mr M K MONTWEDI: The lack of funding in the Office of the Valuer-General. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, can you just hold it there. Hon member, parties were allocated time, and it was up to the parties to decide how they want to utilise their time. The Table here in front will inform you once the member's time is expired. Continue, hon member.

Mr M K MONTWEDI: The lack of funding in the Office of the Valuer-General continues to impact the programme of land redistribution. Government fails to buy good farms because it takes a lot of time for the Office of the Valuer-General to evaluate those farms, and therefore, those farms are taken by other people.

In conclusion, like Franz Fanon said, it is out of relative obscurity that these 44 members of the battalion under the leadership of the commander-in-chief Julius Malema have discovered their own mission, and we commit to fulfil that mission of bringing the dignity of our people by making sure that land is restored to its rightful owners. [Interjections.] With that, the EFF rejects this Budget Vote. Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Let us be very clear, you can have land reform in South Africa; you can have land restitution in South Africa, but you can't meaningfully have each of these, with these ANC policies that are on the table. And that is the problem with this budget. What this budget fails to do is to address the key concerns identified in the High-Level Panel Report about why land reform has failed so dismally in South Africa. Elite Capture, Estina Dairy - we say no more! Well, there is lack of overarching legislation, and we still don't have coherent legislation here in South Africa. A lack of financial will to deal with this issue and we see that again reflected in the budget here today. So, we must just stop using the Constitution as a scapegoat for failures of government and start addressing the root cause of why this government has failed to have meaningful land reform and restitution in South Africa. It is not the Constitution's fault; it is the ANC's fault and their policy failures. This budget does not address that and until we get real about that, we should understand that this problem will never be resolved. [Applause.]

[Interjections.]

Ms J M MOFOKENG: Hon House Chairperson, the principles of restorative justice and transformation are enshrined in the Constitution. And as a collective, including hon members on my

right, we have the responsibility to advance together and strive to address the negative impact of poverty, inequality and unemployment.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Ms J M MOFOKENG: President Ramaphosa during the state of the nation address emphasised the critical nature of land reform mandate, hence the need for policy coherence to develop rural areas, speed up the implementation of releasing state land for redistribution, land expropriation without compensation in an orderly manner that is constitutional, and that does not upset economic investment and food security. We welcome the merger of the two departments in order to pull resources together.

The Budget Vote is responsive to the needs of farmers, women, youth and people with disabilities. The ANC supports Budget Vote No 39. I thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 216: Abraham, P N; Adams, R C; Adoons, N G; April, H G;
August, S N; Bapela, K O; Beukes, A J; Bilankulu, J H;
Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Boroto, M G; Buthelezi, M G;
Buthelezi, E M; Buthelezi, N S; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Cebekhulu, R
N; Chabane, M S; Chikunga, L S; Creecy, B D; Dhlomo, S M;
Didiza, A T; Dikgale, M C; Direko, D R; Dirks, M A; Dlamini, D
D; Dlamini-Zuma, N C; Dlodlo, A; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L;
Dyantyi, P P; Dyantyi, Q R; Gantsho, N; Gela, A; Gina, N;
Gordhan, P J; Gumbu, T T; Gumede, S N; Gungubele, M; Hermans, J;
Hermans, N L; Hlengwa, M; Hlongo, A S; Hlongwa, B G; Holomisa, S
P; Jacobs, F; Jacobs, K L; James, T H; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-
Pettersson, T M; Kekana, P S; Khalipha, T D; Kibi, M T; Kiviet,
N; Kodwa, N G; Koornhof, G W; Kubayi-Ngubane, M T; Kubheka, N J;
Kula, S M; Legwase, T I; Lesoma, R M M; Letsie, W T; Lubengo, M
L; Luthuli, B N; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabe, B P; Mabiletsa, M
D; Mabuza, D D; Magadzi, D P; Magaxa, K E; Magwanishe, G;
Mahambehlala, T; Mahlalela, A F; Mahlatsi, K D; Mahlaule, M G;
Mahlo, N P; Mahlobo, M D; Mahumapelo, S O R; Majodina, P C P;
Majola, F Z; Majosi, Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makwetla, S P;
Malatji, T ; Malinga, V T; Malomane, V P; Maluleke, B; Mamabolo,
J B; Mananiso, J S; Maneli, B M; Manganye, J ; Mangcu, L N;
Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapisa-Nqakula, N N; Mapulane,
M P; Maseko-Jele, N H; Mashego, M R; Mashego-Dlamini, K C;
Mashele, T V; Masiko, F A; Masondo, D; Masondo, T S; Masualle, G

P; Maswanganyi, M J; Mathafa, O M; Mathebula, E F; Mbalula, F A; Mbatha, S G N; Mbingo-Gigaba, B P; Mboweni, T T; Mbuyane, S H; Mc Donald, L E; Mchunu, T V B; Mdabe, S W; Mgweba, T ; Mhaule, M R; Mjobo, L N; Mkhathswa, N T; Mkhwanazi, J C N; Mlenzana, Z; Mmutle, T N; Moatshe, R M; Modise, P M P; Moela, D L; Mofokeng, J M; Mohamed, H; Molala, L E; Molekwa, M A; Moloi, B E; Moroatshehla, P R; Morolong, I K; Motaung, A; Motaung, N E; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Motsoaledi, P A; Mpanza, T S; Mpumza, G G; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, J M; Mthembu, A H; Munyai, T B; Muthambi, A F; Mvana, N Q; Myeni, E T; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngcobo, S L; Ngwezi, X; Nkoana-Mashabane, M E; Nkosi, B S; Nkosi, D M; Nontsele, M ; Ntobongwana, N; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshavheni, K P S; Ntshayisa, L M; Ntuli, M M; Nxesi, T W T; Nxumalo, M N; Nzuza, N B; Pandor, G N M; Papo, A H M; Patrein, S; Peacock, N P; Peter, Z J; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phiri, C M; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qayiso, X S; Radebe, B A; Ramadwa, M M; Seabi, A M; Semenya, M R; Shabalala, N F; Shaik Emam, A M; Sibiya, D P; Singh, N; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Siweya, R T; Skosana, G J; Skwatsha, M; Sokatsha, M S; Somyo, S S; Soty, M M; Stock, D M; Swarts, B; Tlhape, M M E; Tlhomelang, K B; Tlou, M M; Tolashe, G N; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseki, M A; Tsenoli, S L; Tshabalala, J; Tshwete, B; Tshwete, P; Van Der Merwe, L L; van Schalkwyk, S R; Wolmarans, M J; Xaba, V C; Xaba-Ntshaba, P P;

Xasa, F D; Xego, S T; Yabo, B S; Zibula, B T; Zulu, L D; Zuma, A S; Zungu, T R M; Zwane, M J.

NOES - 86: Abrahams, A L A; Arries, L H; Bagraim, M; Basson, L J; Boshoff, W J; Breedt, T; Brink, C; Cachalia, G K Y; Cardo, M J; Chabangu, M M; Chetty, M; Chirwa, N N; De Villiers, J N; George, D T; Gondwe, M M; Graham, S J; Groenewald, I M; Groenewald, P J; Gumbi, H S; Gwarube, S; Hinana, N E; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; Jordaan, H; Joseph, D; Julius, J W W; Khanyile, T A; Khawula, M S; King, C V; Kohler, D; Komane, R N; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Langa, T M; Lees, R A; Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J R B; Mabika, M S; Mackenzie, C; Macpherson, D W; Madlingozi, B S; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, B S ; Masipa, N P; Matiase, N S; Mbabama, T M; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Mey, P ; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mohlala, M R; Mokause, M O; Mokgotho, S M; Montwedi, M K; Mpambo-Sibhukwana, T G; Mulder, F J; Mulder, C P; Ngcobo, S; Ngwenya, D B; Nodada, B B; Paulsen, M N; Powell, E L; Seithlholo, I S; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Siwisa, A M; Sonti, N P; Steenhuisen, J H; Sukers, M E; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, O S; Thring, W M; Van Der Walt, D; Van Minnen, B M; Van Staden, P A; Weber, A M M; Wessels, W W; Whitfield, A G; Wilson, E R; Winkler, H S.

Question agreed to.

Vote accordingly agreed to.

Vote No 40 - Sport and Recreation - put.

Declarations of vote:

Mr L M NTSHAYISA: Hon Chairperson, let us first congratulate Proteas netball on reaching the finals during the Commonwealth Games. [Applause.] We must also congratulate the Springboks on beating the Wallabies, Australia.

Chairperson, sports brings about peace and social cohesion in our country so they should be appreciated. However, we have to encourage our schools to take part in sports because the schools' sports should be conducted in schools. The school is a place where identification of talent should be done. And again, we should encourage the community sport in our areas so that we prevent the use of drugs and crime in our areas.

This department has achieved 99% of their targets. So, this is a good department because it has achieved the targets that it has set itself. The department has also achieved clean audit and

that should be appreciated. So, we support the budget. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Mr W M THRING: Chairperson, as we consider this budget, the ACDP would like to congratulate all of our sportsmen and women who have proudly represented our country. As our Olympic qualifiers prepare for the 2020 games, we cannot allow the disruptive forces within Sascoc to derail their potential victories. In the words of Mr Mandela: "Sport has the power to change the world".

We must use this powerful potential in sport to meaningfully transform our society. All sports teams should be chosen on merit because any sportsmen and women worth their salt would be able to hold their own irrespective of the colour of their skin. And if we invest in developmental programmes in our underdeveloped indigent areas, the demographics will take care of itself. The ACDP supports the budget. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Mr T W MHLONGO: Chairperson, the Minister must sign a performance contract with the Director-General of Sports, especially at school sports because it must be one of the key issues that the Minister must do. Chairperson, there's funding allocated for sports which is R45 million and as the DA we

believe that this funding must be allocated to social development and health because LoveLife is obviously wasteful ...

... imali yethu ukuthi bathathe u-R45 million. (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[... for them taking our money which is R45 million.]

We want to make sure ...

... umnyango uyekele ukusebenzisana nabaluleki. (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[...that the department stops using consultants.]

They are using too many consultants and ...

... ikutshengisa ukuthi awekho amakhono kubabasebenzi.
(*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[... this indicates that workers have no skills.]

And above all, as we know that sports can unite us, I want to congratulate Netball SA for representing us at the World Cup.

Ngicela sonke sibashayeleni izandla. [Ihlombe.] (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[Let us applaud them, please. [Applause.]]

It can unite us.

Wathinta abafazi wathinta imbokodo. Basimele kahle abe-netball ... (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[You strike a woman; you strike a rock. The netball team represented us well ...]

... and I wanted us again not forget the player of the tournament at the Netball World Cup.

Igama lakhe lingu-Karla Pretorius, ngicela simshayeke izandla naye. [Ihlombe.] (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Her name is Karla Pretorius. Let us applaud her as well.

[Applause.]]

Thank you very much. Chairperson, one of the things that we are not going to tolerate with sports budget is that they don't pay invoices on time. This note of 90 days ...

... ukuthi bakhokhele abahlinzeki bezinkonzo ... (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[... to pay the service providers ...]

... in time, they don't do that. We want to call on the Minister to ...

... enze ukuthi umnyango wenze kahle. Wothi sikhulume nge-SA Sports Confederation and Olympic Committee, Sascoc. Uyazi kuNongqongqoshe olana futhi uMvikeli woMphakathi wathi uhlole umthetho walana ekhaya. OwayenguNgqongqoshe u-Mbalula ulana kodwa akukenzwa lutho ngaye futhi sithi kumele kwenziwe njengoba kwanqunywa ngoba kusetshenziswe imali yethu ukuthi ahambe nomndeni wakhe aye e-Dubai. [Ubuwelewele.] Ukhona la phakathi kwethu ... (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[... make sure that the department performs. Let me now talk about the SA Sports Confederation and Olympic Committee, Sascoc. The Minister who is present here, broke the law according to the

Public Protector. Minister Mbalula is here also, but nothing has been done though a decision was taken to do something after taking his family to Dubai, using our money. [Interjections.] He is in our midst.]

It is uncalled for ...

... ukuthi loNgqongqoshe abe la angalandelwa ngoba uMvikeli woMphakathi usekhulumile. Sithanda ukusho ukuthi i-Sascoc ayisebenzi kahle. (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[... that this Minister is here and no steps are being taken against him after the Public Protector has spoken. We want to say that Sascoc is not functioning properly.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Mnu T W MHLONGO: Enye yezinto nge-Sascoc ukuthi isebenzela abantu abafana noNgqongqoshe u-Mbalula ngoba bathatha imali okumele zisetshenziselwe intuthuko yezemidlalo nokuthuthukiswa abesifazane ngoba enye yezinto esifuna ukuziqhakambisa siyi-DA wukuthi i-callpay ibaluleke kakhulu ... [Kwaphela isikhathi.] Siyabonga. [Ihlombe.] (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Mr T W MHLONGO: One thing about Sascoc, is that it's working for people like Minister Mbalula who are using the money set aside for sports and women development. Some of the issues we want to put at the forefront as the DA, is the Callpay which is important ... Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]]

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Steenhuisen is going to fire you.

Ms B N DLULANE: Chairperson, the ANC rises in support of Vote 40 - Sport and Recreation. You know what, this is very strange that somebody must come to this podium and grandstand ...

[Interjections.] ... about hon Mbalula ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Ms B N DLULANE: As I am standing here, without this score card called transformation, we are not even supposed to have what we are having. In the policy of the ANC, we had the former hon Minister Mbalula who put this policy in order. So, the DA is rejecting transformation. [Interjections.] You want that today we must not have black and white people who are playing.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Order!

Ms B N DLULANE: Look at what the rugby did on Saturday. Look at that score card that you are rejecting. You cannot succeed. You don't want democracy to apply. [Applause.]

We are here so that this sport, which is the vision of cohesion in this country, is implemented, like it or not. Also, I must tell you that on the question of Sascoc, it was the same former Minister who put processes in place and said that Sascoc was not doing well and we did not sit down and as a committee; we called them to come and account. I don't know ...

... ukuba uthetha ngantoni kanye-kanye, ufuna ntoni. Wena uyinxalenye yekomiti... (*Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.*).

[... what exactly are you talking about. What do you want? You are part of the committee ...]

... that called Sascoc and we told them that they must account.

Ufuna ntoni lungu elihloniphekileyo? Awuyazi into othetha ngayo.

(Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.)

[What do you want, hon member? You do not know what you are talking about.]

You can try, but the Minister on Annual Performance Plan, APP told us what they have done about the days that the invoices must be paid. As we are talking now, the MECs have been cautioned that they are not going to money if they didn't pay people within 90 days.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Nksz B N DLULANE: Ufuna ntoni? *(Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.)*

[Ms B N DLULANE: What do you want?]

About our LoveLife, LoveLife has built so many sport recreation ... You know that yourself that we have been going all around and looking for those ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Nksz B N DLULANE: ... ayikho le nto uthetha ngayo. (*Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.*)

[Ms B N DLULANE: ... what you are saying does not make sense.]

You come here and distort things that LoveLife has done.

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Ms B N DLULANE: You know them.

I-ANC iyaluxhasa olu hlahlo lwabiwo-mali kwaye siseza kuhlala sisebenza sonke, sihamba nani. (*Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.*).

[The ANC supports the budget and we will continue working together; we are working with you.]

We support this Budget Vote. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Vote agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Democratic Alliance and Freedom Front Plus dissenting).

Schedule – put.

Schedule agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters, Democratic Alliance, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

APPROPRIATION BILL

(Second Reading debate)

There was no debate.

Bill read a second time (Democratic Alliance, Economic Freedom Fighters, Freedom Front Plus and African Christian Democratic Party dissenting).

The House adjourned at 16:11.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

Please click on the following link to access the relevant Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports for this day.

[https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-papers?sorts\[date\]=-1](https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-papers?sorts[date]=-1)