

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 1

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 14:02.

The House Chairperson, Ms A T Didiza, took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

**CONSIDERATION OF REQUEST FOR APPROVAL BY PARLIAMENT OF
WORLD INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY ORGANISATION PERFORMANCES AND
PHONOGRAMS TREATY**

Ms J L FUBBS: Malibongwe! [Laughter.] Right. Hon Chairperson ... and I'm glad you were very specific. You spoke about the World Intellectual Property Organisation Performances and Phonograms Treaty, WPPT. Is that correct? That being the case, it doesn't matter what the specific name is. One issue commands all of the three

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 2

before us today, and that is the integrity of copyright, the integrity of the remuneration of the originators, the creators of that, whether it is fixed or unfixed, whether it is audio or copyright.

In this case it is the WPPT which is the second treaty that deals with the rights of performers, singers and musicians. Many of us know of musicians and singers who have died in poverty while those who sold and benefitted from their work actually coined a fortune.

What this does today is that South Africa – together with the fact that we have these Bills; a copyright and the protection of performers, in the NCOP – is now acceding to this World Intellectual Property Organisation, WIPO, treaty.

The phonograms ... and may I say to the Communications Committee in our Parliament, that I'm very happy that the SA Broadcasting Corporation, SABC, finally paid out a year ago what they owed for 15 to 20 years. That to me was, at least, leading through example ... that we owe

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 3

this money to the musicians ... to the singers that we have aired on air. That is really what ... This treaty grants performers moral rights on live performances and performances fixed in audio visual fixations.

Overseas, when they repeat something you've done, guess what? You get paid. In South Africa, it's actually a brand new issue. It's like, what is that? Is that a socialist issue? Is it a revolutionary issue? It is a plain commercial recognition of the work that has been performed.

The intention of this treaty is of granting moral rights to protect the personality of the performer over and above his or her economic interest. What often happens is that somebody decides to use that song in a jingle but never ever approaches the performer ... the singer to ask, do you mind if we use your song here? No, they don't! And that performer's integrity is destroyed by the mere use of it for the wrong reason.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 4

So on the issue of the WPPT, we are going to enable or promote greater innovation ... greater creativity through the protection of these moral rights.

Under the ANC government, South Africa advocates for the sustainable and continued remuneration of performers, given the country's economic context. As a committee, we believed in passing this ... in adopting the report that the WPPT is in the best interest of South Africa as it ensures that the protection of South African performers and producers of phonograms will keep pace with technological change, thus affording protection and economic benefits in the digital environment which is directly part of the Fourth Industrial Revolution which is here. Aluta continua!

Debate concluded.

Declaration(s) of vote:

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Madam Chair, without the customary 'Fubbian' hyperbole, let me get straight to the issue of the day, which is about the treaties.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 5

At the outset, let me say that it is indeed in the best interest of South Africa to sign the WPPT and the WIPO Copyright Treaty.

They deal with the rights of performers and producers of phonograms, particularly in the digital environment. The committee has agreed in principle to ratify the treaties so that there would be no misalignment between domestic and international law.

Much needs to be pointed out though. While South Africa signed the WPPT on 12 December 1997, a copy of the presidential minute authorising such signature is not in the Department of Trade and Industry's, DTI's, possession and could not be obtained from the Presidency. The Department of International Relations and Co-operation, Dirco, has advised that we express our interest to be bound by way of an instrument of accession rather than an instrument of ratification. It is incumbent on us to ensure that the appropriate provisions exist in our international laws to ensure effective enforcement of the rights of the treaty.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 6

As has been pointed out in the past, signing a treaty triggers a timeline within which the signatory must be compliant. Have we been able to domesticate our international treaty obligations in this regard into our international law? No, we haven't! Why? This should've been done over the past 15 years, but alas, we have prevaricated. The Standing Advisory Committee on Intellectual Property has been nonexistent for the past 10 years. It should've been overseeing intellectual property developments in law.

The approach of the DTI and the committee, which has been able to get the legislation in accordance with the relevant treaties and to sign the treaties ... was to sign the treaties ... rather than the other way round.

We should be aspiring to be a world-class performer's protection Act that is consistent with these treaties. Unfortunately, the Bills currently sit with the NCOP and they'll fall short of this goal. As a result, the DA has consistently pointed out that significant redrafting is required.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 7

The WPPT and the Beijing Treaty prescribe equitable remuneration for performers. However, the Bill does not follow international standards in order to achieve this goal. It undermines, if not completely obviates, the freedom of contract to the detriment of both performers and producers, making it very difficult for producers to make investment decisions.

The ANC in the committee and the DTI have proceeded with undue haste, on the pretext of redress, to saddle our system with substandard legislation. As I said, South Africa should aspire to a world-class performer's protection Act that is consistent with these international treaties. Accession to these treaties would give South African performers the benefit of national treatment of their rights in other respective convention countries.

They prescribe equitable remuneration for performers. However, given that this Bill does not follow international standards to achieve this goal, in its reliance on contract terms and remuneration prescribed by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 8

the government in the new section 3(a); prescribed remuneration in subsection 3(b)(2) which incidentally does not meet the requirements of article 15 of the WPPT which requires a single, equitable remuneration; and lastly, an onerous prescribed procedure for obtaining rights set out in new sections 5(1)(a) to (1)(d). Make no mistake, these chickens will come home to roost.

[Applause.]

Ms Y N YAKO: Madam Chair, for far too long the west has violently appropriated, not only people of African decent to grow Europe; they have also taken African innovations and African resources. Also vulnerable to this abuse has been the right of authors to protect their intellectual work and not have this taken from them by unscrupulous people.

It is because of this support to creative and intellectual work that the EFF government will promote home-grown development for our people's capacity to write their own stories.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 9

It is also for this reason that the EFF government will promote the study of South African material at our schools. It is also for this reason that the government of the EFF will pay royalties owed to living and departed musicians, including processing historical claims. This is because we respect intellectual property.

Furthermore, the EFF government will replace the Southern African Music Rights Organisation, Samro, with a state-owned entity which will be tasked with looking after the financial interests of musicians, song writers and composers, and to protect their intellectual property. So, we do support both these reports by the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry. Thank you.

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Chair, as we strive towards creating a just, effective and co-operative international order, cognisance must be taken of the fact that digital technology and the internet are part of everyday life for most people. In fact, as of June 2018, it was estimated that as much as 55% of the world's population had

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 10

internet access, which equated to approximately 3,2 billion people.

Both of the treaties that are before Parliament today for approval requires member state countries to provide frameworks ... legislation dealing with the basic rights that allow creators to control or rather be compensated for the various ways in which their creations are used. More importantly, to ensure that there is adequate protection of their work and that such protection of their rights continues. Technology protection measures have therefore been improved, and adequate legal protection and effective legal remedies incorporated.

Another important purpose of the treaties is both to update and supplement, primarily in order to respond ... developments in technology, new markets and new methods.

The aim should always be to maintain a fair balance of interest between the owner's right, the rights of the general public and to fair access. The IFP supports the approval of the House to both agreements. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 11

Mr S H MBUYANE: House Chair, greetings to the House. Our commitment as the ANC of building a better Africa and a better world enjoys the nation's advanced rule-based international system.

As the ANC we therefore support the request for Parliament to accede to the WPPT and the WIPO Copyright Treaty. These treaties, if acceded to, will have a positive impact on our Performers' Protection Bill and the Copyright Bill. These are Bills that are intended to protect the rights of performers, actors and other role-players in the creative industry.

The WPPT is administered by WIPO and it deals with the rights of two kinds of beneficiaries, particularly in the digital environment – performers, actors, singers, musicians and producers.

The treaty provides actors, singers, musicians with economic rights, equitable remuneration, protection against the circumvention of security measures, the right

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 12

of distribution and rental, national treatment and formalities of enjoyment of their right.

A total of 99 out of 191 member states ratified the ... performance and also the treaty, including Kenya, Namibia, Nigeria, Canada and Europe. Therefore, we support the treaty. Thank you. [Applause.]

Question put.

Agreed to.

World Intellectual Property Organisation Performances and Phonograms Treaty accordingly approved.

**CONSIDERATION OF REQUEST FOR APPROVAL BY PARLIAMENT OF
WORLD INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY ORGANISATION COPYRIGHT TREATY
("WCT")**

Ms J L FUBBS: Hon Chair, The Wipo Copyright Treaty, WCT, indeed this is a very special agreement that deals with the protection of works and authors, specifically on a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 13

digital platform. May I add, as an author of poetry myself, I understand the protection [Applause.] the WCT is in the best interest of South Africa as it ensures that South African Copyright Law, yes South African Copyright Law will keep pace with technological change, thus, affording an important protection against piracy for rights holders in the areas of computer programmes and databases.

The WCT grants authors the right of distribution. Thank heavens for that, the right of rental and a broader right of communication to the public. With respect to these treaties, the assertion, it will ensure copyright protection, performers' protection, exploitation of their economic rights in access to the digital environment.

The thing is hon Chair, when one uses term exploitation; it is never ever understood in the positive. It is often understood in the negative. One can exploit mineral rights and you go there to explore and so forth. In this instance we are talking about the originators, the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 14

creators of the copyright being able to exploit their economic potential.

It grants authors the right as I say to all of these things and communication to the public. What this does and a lot of members who came to the public hearings stakeholders were saying, can you ensure##### you know because what writers are etc. I mean we are creative people and do not want to be straight jacketed. This removes your straight jacket and you then have greater creativity and it also looks after the well being.

What the committee realised is that in essence creators and in one sense all of us sitting in this House, create. We do create but we often just do not recognise ourselves as that. When we do that as a profession, we target the talent that we have and we say we are going to create it through writing, through this or that or the next thing. At that point in time, we want to protect you.

Often creators have found that the economic benefits that they enjoy are far lower than others on the value chain.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 15

That has partly been because we have not effectively empowered people. We have not effectively communicated that this is a way that you protect that right. So, certainly what the committee did was to salute the Wipo Treaty and particularly the WCT that deals with the protection of works and authors specifically on the digital platform which is today is becoming the most important platform in any country. I thank you.

[Applause.]

Debate concluded.

Question put:

**CONSIDERATION OF REQUEST FOR APPROVAL BY PARLIAMENT OF
THE BEIJING TREATY ON AUDIOVISUAL PERFORMANCES, 2012
("THE BEIJING TREATY")**

Ms J L FUBBS: Hon Chairperson, in fact, I'm sure those members like hon J J who have been here for many years would know that we never signed the Beijing Treaty even though we went there - to Beijing. But when we ratify the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 16

treaty today, we will become the 25th member. And for this treaty to become operative internationally we need 30 signatories - three zero. As South Africa we will be 25th.

Why do I give that explanation by getting backwards? This is because indeed it is one of the most important treaties. It acknowledges broadly the intellectual property rights of performers. This Parliament has heard much about property rights. But I wonder whenever we spoke about property rights have we ever realised that property rights encompass intellectual property. And you know what happens in our country now this is very important for industry for industry and trade.

People work here, they establish companies and then when anything is discovered the copy rights the intellectual property is registered out of South Africa. We are not going to allow that any longer by strengthening the audio visual performance economic and moral rights. By strengthening these rights the Beijing Treaty grants performers great control personal individual control over

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 17

the use of their work and also the unauthorised use of their performances. The treaty grants four kinds of rights, and I will read this. The right of reproduction, and I can say no human reproduce this, that is my intellectual right; the right of distribution; the right of rental; and the right of making it available.

The treaty...and indeed, the workers fully support these treaties. Thank you, I'm glad you brought that up.

[Applause.] The treaty also grants performers moral rights on live performances. They have right to claim to be identified as a performer, and they have a right to object to the distortions that sometimes occur in their works. This is so important. These moral righties may not be what as fellow South Africans think of as morals or morality, but they are called moral rights because they are intrinsic to those persons in a creativity and integrity of the work.

South Africa has always under the ANC government, of course, supported the individuals' right to dignity. That was the first platform of the ANC and the church when it

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 18

was established. We see this respect to dignity recognised here again. May I say that the World International Property Intellectual Organisation, Wipo, in Geneva, applauded the work we are doing as, in fact, the vanguard of progression in this area.

But I do want to thank members of the committee who did some excellent work on the Beijing Treaty. In fact, we were surprised as a committee to learn that, oh, it is not operative because it needs 30 signatures. We unpacked it and we had no problem in agreeing. The ANC and the members of the committee at the time, who did not object, agreed. [Time Expired.] Thank you.

Debate concluded.

Declarations of vote:

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Madam Chair, a review of the 40-year-old copyright legislative framework is necessary to enable a balanced legislative regime cognisant of the interests of all stakeholders including consumers, owners and investors. Accession to the Beijing Treaty, which

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 19

grants protection to performers for a term of 59 years after the fixation of the audiovisual performance, will ensure that the law keeps pace with technological developments; there is protection for the right holders in the digital environment; there is a recognition of new technological methods of exploiting copyright works; position of performers, producers and authors in local and other markets is strengthened; and that access to copyright works specifically by the most vulnerable, is ensured. This is laudable.

The committee has resolved to approve accession to this treaty. The treaty though is nonself-executing and will not automatically become enforceable in law once Parliament has approved it. It will only become enforceable in law through the implementation of domestic legislation. Contracting parties have the obligation to ensure that appropriate provisions exist in their national laws.

Let's get down to the nitty-gritty. Some of us were not surprised that South had not ratified the Beijing Treaty

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 20

and it may well not accord with international law principles as various provisions of the Constitution which deals with international agreements. Additionally, certain procedural steps need to be undertaken prior to ratification. A cost-benefit analysis, socioeconomic impact analysis provided by a Cabinet framework to ensure suitability and adaptability of the treaty into international legislation.

A regulatory impact analysis did investigate the amendment of various legislations to implement the contents of international treaties, but we believe that the Beijing Treaty specifically merits more scrutiny. The negotiating of all international agreements is the responsibility of the national executive. An international agreement binds the Republic only after it has been approved by the resolutions of this House and the National Council of Provinces. We submit that caution is exercised in this regards and the necessary analysis are conducted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 21

Signature of the treaty constitute a preliminary endorsement by demonstrating the state's intent to examine the treaty domestically and consider ratification though signing does not create a binding legal obligation to ratify. Ratification or accession signifies an agreement to be legally bound by the terms of the treaty though accession has the same legal effect as ratification, the procedures differ. I know this is our game so just listen on.

In the case of ratification the state first signs and then ratifies the treaty. The procedure for accession has only one step and is therefore not preceded by an active signature. Most commonly the countries that supported the treaty sign it shortly after it has been adopted. They then ratify the treaty when all of their domestically required legal procedures have been fulfilled. States may begin with domestic approval processes and accede to the treaty once their domestic procedures have been completed without signing the treaty first. It is submitted that these procedures be assiduously adhered to. Thank to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 22

Ms Y N YAKO: Hon Chairperson, the EFF supports the intellectual property rights of performers in audiovisual performances. We are firm in our believe that artists must be given the rights of reproduction of their work and that they must have the rights to distribute their work, the right for rental and the right of making available their audiovisual work.

This is over and above our other commitments to empower all kinds of artists in the country. For instance, the EFF government will take creative arts practitioners with experience and place them at schools to develop the curriculum and to teach and peer review each other. The EFF government will also pass legislation for 80% of all adverts that are aired by public broadcasters to use local music and African artists, a 50% minimum of which must be owned by women and the youth. This will further strengthen the ideals of the Beijing Treaty.

No other party is capable as the EFF in advancing these ideals. We support the reports of the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 23

Xitsonga:

Manana L C THEKO: Mutshamaxitulu, i nhlekanhi lowunene.

English:

The ANC supports this ratification. The decision was taken on 26 February in the committee meeting that was held. The committee having have considered it and we submit it for approval for ratification by this House.

The Beijing Treaty on audiovisual performances was adopted by the Diplomatic Conference on the Protection of Audiovisual Performances which took place in Beijing in 2012 as some of the other members have said. The critical importance of this treaty was to grant audio performers moral rights, protect heir image and economic rights to their performance and therefore the Beijing has recognised all these important rights since audiovisual performers were left out of other key treaties such as the Performances and Phonograms Treaty, WPPT, and the Rome Convention.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 24

The main benefit of ratifying any treaty is to give South Africans beneficiary access to these rights in other member states including developing and developed countries. The benefits of this treaty will occur in a number of areas including from the viewpoints of economic development, improved status of audiovisual performers, the actors and cultural diversity. This is critical as South Africa has a vibrant film and television industry and according to the World Intellectual Property Organization, Wipo, study in study I the contribution of the creative industry, this industry contributes not only to the GDP, but to employment as well.

The Beijing Treaty will strengthen, and where necessary, help consolidate local audiovisual industry as they join international system of protection. Moreover, the audiovisual industry is labour intensive employing scores of performers, technicians, musicians and other creators. Audiovisual content is also known for being a powerful vehicle for the promotion of locally generated goods and services such as cars, food, beverages, clothing and tourism and is therefore perfect companion to export

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 25

industries. The treaty will contribute to safeguarding for international exchange and access for foreign markets. This will stimulate multiple sources of investment in local production.

The Beijing Treaty, as the chairperson of the portfolio committee, hon Fubbs, has alluded that it is only 24 out of 199 member states that have ratified this treaty and South Africa will become the 25th member state. By ratifying this treaty many more will ratify thereby entering into force.

Our activists in the area of arts and culture created a platform from which the world could tap into the apartheid South Africa of old. Our plight could be better pronounced in the songs of the artistic work of the artistic works of Mama Mariam Makeba, Letta Mbuli, Abigail Kubeka and Dorothy Masuku. The later have just left us and may their souls rest in peace. I am deliberately giving examples of women for a change. Ours is the history of battle against oppression where politics and arts merge like concoction. In the days

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 26

where political girls were jailed in Robben Island they could listen to that music and make sure that they are not depressed.

The ratification of this international is to help us to recognise these great daughters and sons of our country. Lest we forget what Nadine Gordimer wrote that, and I quote:

African writers choose their characters and their plots, but their themes choose them.

It is in this regard that we in the ANC will want to ensure that their struggles are not in vain.

We have for many years witnessed our artists within creative industry being exploited and due not benefiting from their royalties. Today, I also pay tribute to the actor and actresses who let into our homes every evening you watch you know, our favourite films and TV shows to the stalwarts of the industry like Florence Masebe, Charlize Theron, Terry Pato, Leleti Khumalo, Nambitha

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 27

Mpumlwana, Ally Skrief and countless others and all the new generation entering this industry, the ANC salutes you. We call on all South Africans to heed to the call by His Excellency President Cyril Ramaphosa to all grow our country together and go all out on 08 May to vote, and you vote correctly. When I say vote correct I mean you vote the ANC. A better creative a vibrant South Africa for tomorrow! Vote ANC! Thuma Mina! [Applause.]

The Beijing Treaty on Audiovisual Performances, 2012 accordingly approved.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON POLICE
ON CONFIRMATION OF RECOMMENDATION BY MINISTER OF POLICE
NOT TO RENEW TERM OF OFFICE OF EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF
INDEPENDENT POLICE INVESTIGATIVE DIRECTORATE**

Mr F BEUKMAN: Hon House Chairperson, hon members and fellow South Africans, thank you for the opportunity to introduce this report on behalf of the Portfolio Committee on Police.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 28

The crux of the matter is that the previous executive director, Mr Robert McBride, entered into a contract of employment for a period of five years. The contract between the Minister of Police and Mr McBride was from 01 March 2014 until 28 February 2019. The five year contract does not include a renewal clause.

We believe that all parties in the House agree that the contract was for a period of five years. There is no dispute about this important fact. The executive director post at level 15 of the public service scale at the level of deputy director general, the normal contract for a head of department is for a period of five years.

It is also important to note that section 63(b) of the Independent Police Investigative Directorate Act allows for one further term only, but the Independent Police Investigative Directorate Act is not clear on the procedure to be followed with respect to the renewal of the contract of the executive director.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 29

The standard process which kicks in after the lapse of a term of five years is that the post is advertised, there are interviews, there is short listing and the selection of a candidate by the designated panel. In the case of a vacancy of the post of executive director of Independent Police Investigative Directorate, Ipid, the process is initiated by the Minister and in the final instance, the successful candidate is confirmed by the portfolio committee.

In the matter that we are discussing this afternoon, the Minister informed the incumbent Parliament that is not intending to renew the contract of Mr McBride after the five year period. The former executive director was of the view that the Portfolio Committee on Police is empowered to consider the matter of renewal.

Mr McBride initiated an urgent application in the North Gauteng High Court where the Portfolio Committee on Police was cited as the second respondent in the case. The settlement order that was granted in the North Gauteng High Court authorised the Portfolio Committee on

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 30

Police to take a decision on the renewal before February 2019.

The Portfolio Committee on Police then embarked on a process inline with section 56 of the Constitution, Rules 176 and 227 of the NA Rules that empowers a committee to determine a procedure to be followed in dealing with a referral from the hon Speaker.

The methodology and programme was duly adopted by the committee on Thursday, 14 February 2019. As part of our deliberations, we requested further information and documents from the Minister and the former executive director.

Mr McBride, in his court papers, acknowledged that he has no right or entitlement to renewal and that the authority to determine whether the contract is renewed lies with the Portfolio Committee on Police. It is important to emphasise this point: The five year contract came to an end. The process of consideration by the committee was not a removal from the post - not.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 31

The previous executive director completed the five year term of office. The term expired. The committee have considered several substantive matters to determine the merits of the renewal or nonrenewal of the five year contract. We considered, for instance, the Independent Police Investigative Directorate Act, performance agreements, the Public Service Commission report, the Public Protector investigation and the independence of Ipid.

The committee also took note of the Case Law that is in support of non renewable contracts for institutions of a similar nature. The committee strongly endorses the constitutional provision of an Independent Police Investigative Authority that should strengthen accountability and oversight. The committee recognises the important work and function of Ipid to deal effectively with criminal and corrupt conduct of South African Police Service, Saps, members without fear or favour.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 32

We strongly commend Ipid, their management and their staff for their ongoing commitment to deal with systemic corruption in the South African Police Service. The Independent Police Investigative Directorate is a critical role player to ensure a police service that is trusted by the public.

We believe that the legislative framework of the Ipid should be further strengthened in the sixth parliamentary term. The Portfolio Committee on Police as the responsible oversight committee are also of the view that the leadership and stability at Ipid and adherence to the relevant accountability framework is nonnegotiable.

It must be put on record that the committee carefully considered all submissions and additional relevant documentation provided during our deliberations. The observations and findings are stipulated in paragraph 9(1) and 9(2)(5) of the report forms the basis for the decision.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 33

In conclusion, the committee has concluded that the appointment of the executive director of Independent Police Investigative Directorate should not be renewed for a further term. I thank you.

Debate concluded.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, we move that this House adopts the report as presented. Thank you very much.

Declarations of vote:

Ms D KOHLER: This particular bus was driven right over the cliff of parterres and non accountability. I have worked with various committees during my 15 years in this House. I have stood here on the podium many times usually angry at the levels of crime and corruption and criminality with the SAPS at the poor working conditions of our SAPS members. But, what I've never been is desperately ashamed to belong to what I have until recently believed as one of the premier committees in Parliament.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 34

What we sat through and witnessed was a political party turning on one of its own on I believe the orders of the Minister. So, the executives now are determining debate in a committee that according to legislation actually oversees that very body, the tail wagging and the dog.

I voted against the appointment of Mr Mc Bride as the head of the Independent Police Investigative Directorate (IPID) having carefully considered his actions post 1994. However, Mr Mc Bride pulled up his socks and did a damn fine job indeed. According to the ANC scope, a study group just six months ago it was pleased with a progress being made by IPID in its probe into cases. Mc Bride created a team, he survived a political attack by one of the three Ministers he worked under, the creator of "Fire Pull" the movie. And, when the charges were chucked out of court he returned and rebuilt what had all been destroyed by the SAPS and went out to route out massive State Capture corruption, the stealing of billions of rands from the SAPS budget. Our meetings were never about extending Mr Mc Bride's contract as allowed in the act or even about appointing a new IPID head. They were, I

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 35

believe about discrediting Mr Mc Bride so that when all is revealed to the State Capture Commission it will be discarded.

It was so obvious, I shudder to think what the court's reaction will be when they watch the footage of those three days when the committee all but eviscerated the man. He was called a liar, he was sneered at and he was demeaned all with no right of reply. I asked that to balance the negativity, they were obviously going to put him their report not ours. It'd include his successes, no, they wouldn't allow that saying it's various Ministers failed to sign the performance agreement that there was no proof that anything had been done.

The fact the he reported regularly to Parliament was totally ignored. At the outset, hon Marker said he was a lazy MP and hadn't read the documents anyway and now the ANC member said we were wasting the cost of juice and should just vote and throw him out. An ANC member twice called him a liar, someone whom they refused to allow

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 36

there to defend himself. Now, that's a definition of a kangaroo court.

Let's start with my particular favourite and quite possibly the reason why they now hate him with a visceral intensity rarely seen in Parliament. So, one in three investigations with a combined value of a R106 million, IPID prevented SAPS crime intelligence from implementing the fraudulent procurement of a cell phone grabber device at a grossly inflated price. IPID believes the R45 million extracted through the procurement was to be used to buy votes at the ANC national elective conference in December 2017. They were the complex, politically sensitive investigations, eight officers awaiting trial for Marikana, high level investigations, into R5 billion corruption in SAPS management arrested in...

[Interjections]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Can the hon member take a question?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 37

Ms D KOHLER: Absolutely not! The list goes on and on and what was the inevitable outcome in our parliamentary lexicon in relation to what happens when a cadre does a goo job, like the Scorpions did. Hon Carim who became a Deputy Minister once he ha destroyed that unit and I don't think he is one any longer in fact I gather he's out, did exactly that. They are attacked, their characters assassinated and they are disposed off. And, there is usually someone hype that this activity saves. There is no prima facie evidence of misconduct on the part of MR Mc Bride. Claims made against him are not evident, they are merely allegations. And the mere institution of an investigation on the receipt of the complaint does not render the allegations more credible. These allegations were withdrawn and have now been dusted off and taken to the Public Protector and I have no doubt that was with someone's encouragement. Meanwhile the new Minister has appointed an acting head of the IPID who has no security clearance and they were absolutely silent about that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 38

Finally, the head of the IPID does not answer to the Minister, he gives him reports. The Minister is there to act and speak for the police. Obviously his job is to protect them and their roles are at the serial. What if the next IPID head disagrees with the Minister finds out something that he would rather keep hidden, would you want to remove him too and the next one too? The act only says the Executive Director (ED) must do his job which he was doing and as I said when I walked out you should be ashamed of yourselves!

Mr N M PAULSEN: Chairperson, our position on this matter is quite straight forward. We respect Robert Mc Bride for the role he played during the difficult times of apartheid. His youth was abruptly taken away from him by the repressive racist regime of white supremacist. But, we can argue the same about many former liberators.

Mr Zuma was a liberator too who turned out to be one of the biggest hardest this country has ever seen. Robert Mc Bride's history as a liberation struggle hero does not however entitle him to any position in government. The

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 39

position of executive director of IPID is for a period of five years and even though it's renewable, the IPID Act is silent on the renewal process. So, it is disingenuous of Mr Mc Bride to think that he's entitled to the position as head of IPID. There are other credible candidates who will follow and do the same good work as Robert Mc Bride did, so should not think that because we've done a good job then we are entitled to renewal of our contracts.

What makes us even more uneasy about the braising attempts to force Mc Bride to this position in the support he has received from shoddy characters in organisations. Paul O'Sullivan has been unrepentant in his support for Mc Bride and we all know the role that he has been playing in our criminal justice system. The support from right wing organisations like the Helen Suzman Foundation is enough to raise long bars about what the agenda is here. The EFF supports the recommendations of the committee for very different reasons not to renew Mc Bride's contract. Thank you very much

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 40

Mr X NGWEZI: House Chairperson, the IFP would like to thank the services that Mr Mc Bride has offered to the county and to the department. However, there was no contractual obligation for the department or the Minister to renew the contract for the next five years and we would like to call on the department to actually begin the recruitment of the new director of the IPID as well as finalise the recruitment. We would also like to encourage the department to actually limit the political interference and root out the corruption that exists in some of the SAPS members. The IFP therefore supports this report.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon members, you are allowed to interject, but screaming at each other cannot be allowed.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, let me start off by saying to hon Kohler-Barnard, you came here, but not a single iota of the truth did you present here today.

[Interjections.] [Applause.] Why? Tell me honestly, why?

The matter must be judged on its merits and facts. You

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 41

deliberately misled this House here today. Let me tell you why. One, ... [Interjections.]

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, on a point of order: The member at the podium has said that hon Kohler-Barnard deliberately misled the House. That is unparliamentary. [Interjections.] It is unparliamentary.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member. I will check that one. Proceed.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair. What are the facts of this matter? The IPID Act says that you may extend it. It does not say that you must extend it. The contract is explicit; it ends on 28 February. There is no provision for an extension. It is not true that the Minister wrote to McBride. McBride wrote to the Minister in September. The Minister did not respond. He wrote again in November. The Minister then responded. In his letter to the Minister, he was telling the Minister: "I know that you are not going to extend my contract, so go and advertise it, so that IPID does not suffer." That is what he said.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 42

So, by implication, he knew that his contract is not going to be extended. That is the first thing.

Nowhere did he inform the portfolio committee that he wrote to the Minister. He misled the court. He misled the public into believing that the Minister wrote to him. Let us look at the facts. You report to the Minister. The Minister signs your contract. Your performance report goes to the Minister. Only the Minister, in terms of the Act, will nominate to this committee. If we reject it, the Minister will nominate again. So, how can you say that the Minister is not an interested party in it? He clearly is.

Let me go one step further for the benefit of hon Kohler-Barnard. McBride says that IPID will suffer if he leaves prematurely, but he applied for two jobs. If he got one of them, he was going to take the job and desert IPID. If he was going to do that, where is the interest in IPID? It is not there.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 43

Let us look at the allegations that he has made. They all, up to this day, have been allegations, no convictions. The NFP is still saying that if there are allegations and if there is evidence of any wrongdoing, you still have the necessary opportunity and channels to deal with that matter. Report it, and it will be dealt with.

So, you come here and you deliberately, and let me repeat, deliberately don't give the facts. Now, the relationship between the Minister and McBride is clearly not conducive. The Minister is going to have to nominate and we are going to approve. So, I think, everything that the Minister has done, other than maybe having responded to ... [Time expired.] ... is a challenge. So, we are saying that we have done the right thing and we support this report that McBride's contract should not be renewed. Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Shaik Emam, can you go back to the podium? I have just consulted. In terms of the former rulings that have been made,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 44

"deliberately misleading" is out of order. Can you please withdraw?

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, can I address you on that?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): "Deliberately misleading" has been ruled out of order. You can bring a substantive motion, if you want to do that, but when you say a person has deliberately misled the House, it is, in terms of our Rules, out of order.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chair, I just proofed the facts that she deliberately did not give us the facts that she should have given, which was right in front of her.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, can you ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 45

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Okay, if that is going to suit her, hon Chairperson, without any conditions, I will withdraw that. [Interjections.]

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Hon House Chair, we are not going to get involved in whether or not the contract of Robert McBride must be renewed, because the matter was about cadre deployment. That is what we said right at the beginning of the process when Robert McBride was appointed in the first place. More fundamentally, our issue is how independent ... I think a more critical and fundamental question to ask is: How independent is the Independent Police Directorate, if the Minister ... Remember, this body plays an oversight role over the police. Naturally, hon Kohler-Barnard is quite correct in saying that and because of the positions that the two people hold, the relationship is likely to be ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member! Order! [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 46

IsiXhosa:

Mnu N L S KWANKWA: Niyangxola. La masela.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Kwankwa, allow the Chair to make a ruling. [Interjections.] Hon members! Hon members, can you please be in order?

Mr Z M D MANDELA: Hon House Chairperson, on a point of order:

IsiXhosa:

Eli lungu lihloniphekileyo lithi siyangxola kwaye singamasela. Ndicela ukuba ayirhoxise loo nto.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, can I ask whether you ... The "ngxola" part is not unparliamentary, but did you mention "amasela", hon member?

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Well Madiba was quiet. I don't know why he raised a point of order. He did not make a noise.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 47

IsiXhosa:

Khange ungxole Madiba kutheni ngoku uthethelela
abangxolayo eklasini?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, your
time will be up. I am just asking you to indicate whether
you did make the statement that you ... [Interjections.]

Mr N L S KWANKWA: I was referring to my colleagues in the
opposition benches.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Thank you.
Proceed.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, it is
immaterial which members of the House the member is
referring to, he still has to withdraw because ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): No, can I advise
you, hon Chief Whip? If you are not referring to an
individual specifically, it is not unparliamentary. It is
when you say Zodwa, or so and so is this, that it is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 48

ruled unparliamentary. That is why I just wanted to understand the context.

IsiXhosa:

USEKELA MPHATHISWA WEZEZIMALI: Hayi bendifuna ukuthi Sihlalo weNdlu, asizizo iintanga zakhe. [Kwahlekwa.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, that is not the point of order.

IsiXhosa:

Mnu Z M D MANDELA: Ndiza kucela usinyamezele Sihlalo weNdlu. Xa esithi, la masela- eli gama likwisininzi- kwaye ubhekisa kuthi.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nks A T Didiza): Lungu elihloniphekile unyanisile kodwa ukuba akukhomntu obizwe ngegama loo nto leyo ayibizwa njengokuba ayikhosemthethweni. Ndifuna ukucela kuni malungu ahloniphekileyo ukuba sihloniphane zininzi izinto ezisilindileyo kwaye kukho nenqwaba yeengxelo apha. Qhubeleka lungu elihloniphekileyo.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 49

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Amasela!

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, can you please proceed and not continue with the statement that is going to turn us back.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: But House Chair, I thought that it was parliamentary to say that. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): No, but you cannot continue doing that. Can you please withdraw and continue.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: I beg you pardon. I withdraw. I withdraw.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, with due respect, the point that Inkosi Zwelivelile makes is very important. He has not referred to any party. Let us first start there. If his reference was to a party, we would not have had a problem. But he is referring to all

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 50

members in this House, including me. I am taking serious exception to being called a thief.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon member, can you take your seat. I do understand you very well. That is why I said that if you talk of a collective, ... However, if the Committee on Rules wishes to make that ... [Interjections.] Order, hon members! If the Committee on Rules wishes to make that specific, it will do so. Please, hon member, can you proceed with your speech?

IsiXhosa:

Mnu N L S KWANKWA: Eyi nina nisokoliswa yiBosasa ngoku ninochuku.

English:

Section 6,1 of the IPID Act provides that the Minister must nominate a suitably qualified person for the position of executive director and that the committee, on the other hand, must either confirm or reject the nomination by the Minister. [Interjections.] The view of the UDM is that, if you consider that IPID plays an

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 51

"oversight" role over SAPS and members of the Municipal Police, we are asking whether IPID is appropriately located to ensure that they account directly to the Minister, when, in fact, they have to ensure that they play an oversight role over the Minister.

[Interjections.]

We say this consistently because not only is it going to continue to create this adversarial relationship between the two entities, but if you allow the Minister to have a role to play in the appointment, it means that it is going to lessen the effectiveness and undermine the independence of Independent Police Investigative Directorate.

IsiXhosa:

Niza kuphinda nithi ngoku ningxolayo apha ingathi niseklasini niphinde nibuye apha ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Kwankwa, can you proceed with the speech?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 52

IsiXhosa:

Mnu N L S KWANKWA: Hayi, yintetho yam nje lena!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Don't continue to interject.

Ms N P SONTI: House Chairperson, on a point of order:

Mr N L S KWANKWA: They are interjecting me. I am not interjecting...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): You are not supposed to direct the programme on your own. Proceed with your speech.

Ms N P SONTI: House Chairperson, on a point of order...

IsiXhosa:

... asimva ukuba uthini la mntu phaya kuba bayangxola aba bantu. Bayangxola; bangxolise njengokuba uqhele ukusingxolisa nathi. Tyhini!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 53

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Take your seat.

IsiXhosa:

Mnu N L S KWANKWA: Ndiyabulela mama. Andithethi nabo, mabahambe bayekuzixhoma bona.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Kwankwa, can you please proceed with your speech?

IsiXhosa:

Mnu N L S KWANKWA: Hayi andiphendulanga mntu.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Kwankwa, can you continue with your speech.

IsiXhosa:

Mnu N L S KWANKWA: Ndiyaqhubeka ndifuna ukubaxelela iindaba zabo.

English:

Ms N P SONTI: House Chairperson, on a point of order: ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 54

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Sonti, when you ask for a point of order, you stand and allow to be pointed. So, you cannot just continue. And regarding your point of order with respect to the noise, I have listened to it and I am going to address it. So, can you please take your seat?

IsiXhosa:

Nksk N P SONTI: Ooh hayi andikuvanga xa uzama ukuyisombulula.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): I have also asked the member on the podium to conclude his speech and not ...

IsiXhosa:

Nksk N SONTI: Nceda ke uyisombulule siyive. Nceda vela uyisombulule siyive.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Take your seat!

Take your seat! Order, hon members. It is in all of our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 55

interest to proceed with the debate and I think all of us collectively should really honour the decorum of the House. [Interjections.]

IsiXhosa:

Mnu N L S KWANKWA: Sihlalo weNdlu, ndithi ndiza kubaxelela iindaba zabo yinyaniso emsulwa loo nto. Ukuba aniyilungisi le nto siyithethayo kuza kubanzima kuba xa kuphela esi sigaba kuza kufuneka sibe sixoxa lo nobenani sibe siteketa. [Uwelewele.] Kaloku kwalo mntu ugade amapolisa ukuba angenzi unothanda uphinda anike ingxelo kwakuloo mapolisa. Ingaba loo nto iyavakala na maqabane? Ingxaki yenu nina ngoku yeyokuba uBosasa unibonisile ukuba niyeba ngoku nina anifuni kuxelelwa loo nto apha kule Ndlu. La masela.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Hon Kwankwa, can you please listen to the Chair.

Mr N L S KWANKWA: I withdraw.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 56

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): No, no, not just on the withdrawal. When you are a speaker, allow the Chair to actually direct the meeting. You cannot direct when you stand as a speaker. Can you take your seat?

Mr N L S KWANKWA: But I did not direct ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Can you please take your seat?

Mr N L S KWANKWA: Thank you.

Mr J J MAAKE: Madame Chairperson, with everything having been said, I would like to say that the aim of the opposition in this House is to take over government and be the ruling party. This is done in many ways: Sometimes either by hook or by crook! What then stands on their way for them to reach this destination is the party that is ruling - the ANC!

Those that sometimes forget or are new or young, disorientated, confused, naïve, weird and black members

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 57

of the DA: ANC means African National Congress, if they don't know. [Interjections.] What it means then is that you have got to remove the ANC in order to rule. Who in the opposition - the DA in particular - has the qualities or capacity or even the bravery to engage in such an impossible and unachievable task? [Interjections.]

We are here dealing with a simple issue which seems to be complicated by some people with hidden agendas. In a simple society of honest people, it would simply have been a labour relations issue which would fall under the law of contracts. However, where certain people are involved, it becomes a matter of war because for them it is an opportunity to cause havoc within the ruling party, looking for trouble even where it doesn't exist.

When it comes to moral and legal issues, they are silent. When Comrade McBride was arrested for assault of his daughter, hon Mbhele here wrote to the committee, asking for him to be suspended with immediate effect!

[Interjections.] What is the DA saying today? That shows

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 58

lack of backbone. They are just chameleons.

[Interjections.]

Comrade McBride and Comrade Bheki Cele are senior members of the ANC, whether the DA likes it or not. Trying to drive a wedge between the ANC and its members, using them, won't work. That has been tried a long time ago, before anyone of us in here was born. [Interjections.]

Mr Z N MBHELE: House Chairperson, on a point of order!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Order, hon Maake. Can you take a seat? What is the point of order?

IsiZulu:

Mnu Z N MBHELE: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, Ngicela ukubuza, ...

English:

... if hon Maake is willing to take a question on his allegation about my media statements? [Interjections.]

Mr J J MAAKE: No! No!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 59

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Hon Maake, would you like to take a question?

Mr Z N MBHELE: Not willing to account to you; you need to meet us! [Interjections.]

Mr J J MAAKE: No! That's fine; I don't want to!
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Hon Mbhele, he has indicated that he is not taking a question!

Mr J J MAAKE: The ANC is the oldest organisation in this continent. It has its own internal mechanisms of dealing with its own problems and challenges. We are not to be told by the DA. The decision that was taken by the committee was based on the documents that were submitted to us as the committee. Of all reasons given, the most important of them was that there was a total break of trust between the two, which is a fundamental ingredient of working together, which happens anywhere!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 60

Independent Police Investigative Directorate, Ipid, is a very important institution in this country, taking into consideration the past that we come from, to fight corruption, mismanagement and impunity with the police service. By the way, it was established by the ANC-led government. It needs to be protected; it needs to remain independent for it to deliver these objectives. With a break in trust, this can't be achieved, especially because they are fellow comrades. It is therefore the duty of our organisation to remedy this situation for the sake of service delivery. The ANC is not a boy!

Sepedi:

Ga se mošimanyana, ga e apare šothi! [Tsenoganong.] ANC e apara obarolo.

English:

An overall which is a shirt, a jacket, a trouser and maybe - but I am not very sure - an underwear. It is everything! [Laughter.] [Applause.] This is where the ANC is!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 61

An old lady in my village called me, and asked me a question:

My son, this young man, Maimane, does he think right? Does he ever think he can be a chief or an induna of the whites? It means he doesn't know them! He must think again; he will never! He is dreaming. Go and tell him when you go back to Parliament!

I went to my personal secretary and they were playing moruba. My personal secretary said the same thing: That if he thinks that way, he is a moemish! [Laughter.] I went to kwaLanga and they told me: If he thinks that way;...

IsiZulu:

... kusho ukuthi uyaphambana! [Uhleko.]

English:

That is what my people say; not me! [Applause.] I only know him as hon Maimane. I tried to defend him but they said if you do that,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 62

Afrikaans:

... dan is jy ook 'n moegoe ...

English:

... and you are dreaming!

IsiZulu:

Uyaphambana! [Uhleko.]

English:

I then had to agree with every one of them! Though reluctantly, who would like to be a bhari [stupid] anyway? [Laughter.] Let the opposition leave us as the ANC to sort out our own problems. Almost every party in this House came from the ANC. [Interjections.]

Dr M J FIGG: Point of order, Chairperson!

[Interjections.] Chairperson, point of order!

THE HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (MS AT DIDIZA): Order! Order, hon Maake! What's the point of order?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 63

Dr M J FIGG: The member in the podium is referring to the leader of the party as being a moemish and a moegoe!

[Interjections.] I say that this is unparliamentary language!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Order, hon member. Did you say that ... [Interjections.]

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon Chair, can you hear us on the same order? [Interjections.] There is precedence! Yes! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Order, hon member! Can I please ask him first, because I have to ask the member to confirm whether he said what he is alleged to have said before I can take another point of order? [Interjections.] Order, hon member!

Mr J J MAAKE: I said the people of South Africa - I even said that I defended him! [Interjections.] [Applause.] That is what I said; I defended him.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 64

Sepedi:

Ba re le nna ke "bari" ...

English:

... so I had to agree with them! [Laughter.] That is what I said! [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIPERSON (Ms A T DIDIZA): Okay, proceed, hon member!

Mr J J MAAKE: Let the opposition leave the ANC alone. Almost every party in this House came from the ANC! Umntwana ka Phindangene [Inkosi M G Buthelezi] was a member of the ANC! The PAC comes from the ANC! Cope, EFF, AIC, UDM and even the Premier of the Western Cape was the member of the UDF if I am not wrong! [Interjections.]

In the ANC, you find professors, doctors, artists, kings, chiefs, workers, peasants, ...

Sepedi:

... le baloi re nabo ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 65

English:

... if you don't know! [Laughter.]

Sepedi:

Re ka le loya lena DA gonabjale. [Disego.]

English:

You will all find them in the ANC! Madame Chair, I withdraw if this is unparliamentary, ...

Sepedi:

... efela ba hlokomele!

English:

My comrade there, Nchabeleng, ... [Time expired.] ... is the chairperson of the board of indigenous aviation authority of Limpopo. [Applause.]

Declarations of vote concluded.

Question put: That the Report of the Committee on Police be adopted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 66

There were objections recorded.

Division called.

[BELLS RUNG FOR FIVE MINUTES]

Voting.

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES]

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC
WORKS ON STUDY TOUR TO FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF GERMANY**

Mr H M Z MMEMEZI: Madam House Chair, all the people of South Africa and hon members, the Portfolio Committee on Public Works undertook a study tour to the Federal Republic of Germany, from 9 to 13 September 2018. On our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 67

return we approved the report and we hereby tabling it for consideration and approval by this august House.

The study tour was an opportunity to observe and learn best practices on how the German government inter-relate ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, those members who are leaving the House, can they please do so a little bit quietly and those who are entering, so that we do not disturb the chairperson oat the podium. Proceed, chair.

Mr H M Z MMEMEZI: ... inter-relate with one another at multiple levels, namely, municipal federal states and national. The system of government is practically similar to that of South Africa that consist of municipal, provincial and national government.

The portfolio committee interacted with entities that work with the German government across these three levels

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 68

in the built environment, construction industry, the property management and maintenance sector.

The committee aimed and gained insides into how the entities that work with the German government provide infrastructure and built environment services and how private construction and professional built environment companies and government entities co-operate with one another to ensure well maintained green buildings.

As a developed country, the German example assisted the committee with insides into innovative developments in the sector of public works that encompasses the built environment profession, construction and infrastructure spheres.

The committee wanted to gather such knowledge to strengthen and deepen its oversight activities over the Property Management Trading Entity, PMTE, and the national Department of Public Works as a whole. The committee specifically focused to the need to plan construction and buildings that were sustainable and also

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 69

using bulk services such as water and electricity efficient ways that make them easy to maintain.

The delegation undertaking the study tour endeavoured to discover existing good practices and innovative approaches in the built environment, construction and public works sector, the manner in which innovative building material and built environment systems were developed and used.

We invite the hon members, the Minister of Public Works, the public, the department as well as you the people of South Africa to go through this report up to the committee observations, the findings and recommendations. The good news for the people of South Africa is that the Minister of Public Works and the department including the Department of International Relations are already moving and implementing our recommendations. In particular on more than 20 years neglected Bonn properties and other similar properties abroad.

IsiXhosa:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 70

Masiwucacise ke lo mba wezindlu eziseBonn. Indonga zaseBerlin zawa ngowe-1989. Kwakusaphethe wona ke kanye lamadlagusha selekhala ngoku. Ngoku urhulumente we-ANC ulungisa amanyala ela xesha lawo. Yinyaniso ke ngenene ukuba imoto ehambayo yiyo ekhonkothwayo. Loo nto siyibona apha kuthi njenge-ANC. Kungxola kanye aba babemoshe ilizwe laseMzansi Afrika iminyaka engama-300.

Bantu bakuthi i-ANC iyanisebenzela. Ngomhla we-8 kuCanzibe masiphume sonke siyoyivotela. Yondla abantwana beenkedama nempula zikaLujaca, banikwa nditsho nezindlu felefele.

Abantwana bendlu emnyama ndithetha nje, bangena ngobuninzi kwiiyunivesithi kwangale-ANC. Nditsho nasezilalini nasematyotyombeni kunamhlanje nje kuyakhanyiswa. Abantu bayacofa.

Mawethu votelani umbutho wesizwe uyazama kakhulu. Xa singekafuki ngakuwe, musa ukuba novalo. Yiba nethemba le mini iyeza nakuwe.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 71

English:

Mr M SHACKLETON: On a point of order, Madam Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon Mmemezi.
What is the point of order?

Mr M SHACKLETON: Chair, this is an election speech it has
no relevance to the actual item over here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member
take your seat. That is not a point of order. All members
have actually been since the beginning of this year,
throwing a bit of their campaigning in their speeches.
Continue hon member.

IsiXhosa:

Mnu H M Z MMEMEZI: Xa singekafiki ngakuwe musa ukuba
novalo, yiba nethemba le mini iyeza nakuwe.

English:

The ANC supports this report.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 72

IsiXhosa:

Siyabonga. Siyabulela mawethu. Camagu.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, hon member. Your time is up. [Applause.]

Declarations of Vote:

Dr M J FIGG: Hon House Chair, the objective of the study tour to Germany was to educate members on best practices used by a First World country so that we can learn from the same and apply what we learnt in South Africa. While it was very interesting and informative, we were also exposed to more shortcomings of this ANC government.

Arriving in Munich on 9 September 2018, we were met by two console general officials. They briefed us and gave us information about the two lenders that they are responsible for namely Bavaria and Bardenwittenburg.

A number of agreements and partnerships have been signed with South African provinces and the two lenders. The

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 73

province of KwaZulu-Natal and Bardenwittenburg signed a twinning agreement in 1996 aimed at among other things the promotion of trade and economic relations. A joint statement of intent was signed in 1996, but was never implemented. There was also a twinning agreement with the Eastern Cape that collapsed as the Eastern Cape did not perform.

There is a partnership with Bavaria and the University of the Western Cape. This partnership is still in existence. There is a simple explanation for this situation; the Eastern Cape and KwaZulu-Natal are ANC-governed provinces, while the Western Cape is governed by the DA. [Interjections.]

The delegation visited the German Sustainable Building Council or *Deutsche Gesellschaft für nachhaltiges Bauen* DGNB, a diamond certified company on day three. The company operates from a renovated building. The Germans have very strict regulations and a lot of emphasis is based on safety and sustainability of buildings. Their

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 74

buildings are well-maintained unlike in South Africa, where people are expected to work in unsafe buildings.

The company's profits and human resources are increasing at an average of 20%. Their core business is building projects and they have offices in many countries, excluding in the African countries. They were asked as to why this is so. What a silly question and can only be asked by a member of the ANC.

You see, doing business in Africa and South Africa is risky. Investment is not safe due to the frequent corrupt activities by the ANC. The ANC is not serious about fighting corruption and President Ramaphosa speaks with a forked tongue. He says one thing and does just the opposite.

While the DA will send any body found guilty of corruption to 15 years in jail, the ANC sends corrupt individuals to Parliament.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 75

On day four an information technology, IT, firm housed in the DGNB certified building was visited. All buildings in Germany valued at over €2 million euros must receive the certificate of sustainability. After the presentation we asked, where they sourced their staff? The chief executive officer, CEO, said that most of their employees were recruited from local universities. The great advantage that youth is given employment opportunities reducing the risk of youth unemployment. The Germans create many opportunities for the youth, unlike the ANC who create employment for the elderly and the corrupt.

Towards the end of the tour, we visited South Africa, our own properties in foreign countries. We visited the embassy and the ambassador's residence in Berlin and two properties in Bonn. The conditions of these state assets are appalling and this was embarrassing to say the least. Buildings are not properly maintained and the reasons given were the ambassador has an expenditure limit of €1 000 euros, an expense above this threshold must be authorised by the South African head office. This sometimes takes up to one year to authorise.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 76

We visited Bonn where there are two state-owned properties. One is the building used when the embassy was still based there and the other the ambassador's residence. It was criminal to see that the embassy building was unkempt, vandalised and left to deteriorate. The building is in prime area and could be sold for a substantial amount. The house was even more dilapidated and has also been left to rot and be vandalised. It is like the embassy situated on the Rhine River, so this is prime real estate, but I do not think the ANC can comprehend this.

Overall the trip was an eye-opener and once again proved that the ANC cannot manage this country and safeguard its assets. The problem, we believe is that our assets are mismanaged and there are no consequences for management and nobody at the Department of International Relations or public works is held accountable for wrongdoing. Our once valuable assets in foreign countries are deteriorating rapidly.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 77

The DA is the only party that can bring about change that builds one South Africa for all. So, if South Africans want to see a change, vote the DA on 8 May 2019. I thank you. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order. Hon member, what your speech has just done I am sure it answered your member earlier who was talking about electioneering speech. The EFF.

Ms N P SONTI: Chairperson, the stated purpose of the Department of Public Works study tour to Germany was to observe how the three spheres of government, namely, local, provincial and national government relate to each other. When it comes to construction, property management and maintenance, but based on this report, it is clear that nothing was learnt and that little thought was put into plan in the study tour.

Going through the report of the study tour, it seems that a lot of time was spend inspecting South African properties in Germany and visiting a few middle

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 78

interesting institutions, campuses and other sites. But the reason I say that it was a waste is because the manner in which public works are managed in Germany offers many lessons to us as South Africa but these lessons were not reflected in the report.

Firstly, in terms of various spheres of local government in Germany, they are central to infrastructure development. Local government invest in infrastructure both for the provision of services and for the development of the local economy. In Germany, local government also plays a critical role in the maintenance and constructions of state building, whereas in South Africa local government has little or no role in this regard. That is why as the EFF, once we are in government ... [Interjections.] ... listen, 60% of the budget should be allocated to the local sphere of government.

It is a pity that the visit to Germany was not as educational as it could have been, but the reality is that even if this visit had been more educational, the current government is so stuck in its waste and blind to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 79

reason, that practical and implementable findings from the visit would not have changed the programmes and policies of the current South African government. We therefore reject this report but encourage South Africa to vote for the EFF on 8 May 2019. [Interjections.]

Mr K P SITHOLE: Hon House Chairperson, this study tour was a great reason to benefit checks and balances that are inherent in the system of government. This is very similar to what we have here in South Africa in terms of our three different spheres of government. The study tour interacted across all levels of the built environment, maintenance and construction sectors.

Agricultural projects were also visited with the view to replicate the process of the same success of Germany as well as our own embassy in Bonn, Berlin. Sustainable constructed building was a key, equally in this study tour as was the effective and efficiency use of water and electricity in these constructions. Best practices were investigated with the view to implement same homes as in South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 80

We indeed learnt a great deal in this regard. What was particularly important was the fact that there were strictly enforced ecological, economical, functional and technical aspects in the German model of built environment. A holistic approach in this regard as a best practice was very evident in the building method used. Eco-farms villages' ablutions at one particular instance, in 1991 have been by and large successfully operated.

Gender equality is practiced and skills transferred to youth and students are being successfully implemented at these farms. The elderly and disabled are also included in these community agrarian initiatives. Mission staff must be made true of the visit to our South African Embassy in Berlin and the former embassy in Bonn, which in our view is structurally unsafe. Maintenance is not being carried out by quality personnel and the mission staff advises that in the event of a fire, the building in Berlin would be a firetrap. Urgent maintenance is required at this building by Department of Public Works' Property Management Trading Entity, PMTE, in consultation

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 81

with the Department of International Relations and Co-operation.

IsiZulu:

Mnu K P SITHOLE: Isakhiwo saseBonn kufanele ngabe kudala sathengiswa ukuze kulungiswe esaseBerlin. Ngicabanga ukuthi uhulumeni uhlulekile ubhekana nalesi simo ngendlela, ikakhukazi uMnyango Wazengaphandle awukwazanga ukuthi ubhekelele lesi simo, ngoba akukwazi ukuthi isakhiwo esihle njengalesiyana sicekeleke phansi ngangokuba nozosithenga angeke esakhokha imali ebonakalayo. Ngaleyo ndlela uhulumeni kaKhongolose kulesi simo uhlulekile ukusebenza. ngiyabonga

Mrs E K M MASEHELA: Hon House Chairperson ...

Sepedi:

... e re ke thome ka gore re le ANC re thekga pego ye ...

English:

... that was tabled today. The study tour to Germany was very crucial in that, as a First World country renowned

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 82

for innovation and efficiency, it was important to learn from this country on how the public sector manages the public work portfolio do not only develop, maintain and manage the state-owned infrastructure, but also to learn how it interacts with other sectors in order to drive innovation and job creation.

The knowledge gained and recorded in this report from the visit will assist the Department of Public Works at national and provincial level but will also give insight into how to leverage the property management and trading entity, to manage state immovable assets more efficiently and effectively and achieve the goal of government infrastructure development and job creation.

Sepedi:

Sepedi se re lesogana le le sa etego le nyala kgaetšedi.
[Tsenoganong.]

English:

Hon House Chair, after the fall of the Berlin Wall in 1989, the capital city and government offices were moved

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 83

from Bonn to Berlin. Embassies like France, Belgium and others moved to Berlin, turning their embassy buildings into residential buildings that they rented out. The South African government that was led by the National Party in the apartheid regime did absolutely nothing to save those buildings and that is what they did.

Sepedi:

Le šupa batho ka menwana. Le tla mo la re šupa ka menwana. Ge o šupa batho ka menwana o mo tee, ye mengwe ye meraro e šupile wena mong.

English:

You did not do your work. [Interjections.] By the time the ANC-led government took over in 1994, the damage was already done. However, hon House Chairperson ...

Sepedi:

O se ke wa lebala gore Kgoro ya Dikamano tša Boditšhabatšhaba le Tirišano e tlišitše Molaokakanywa wa Ditirelo tša Ntle mo ra o fetiša. Ke molaokakanywa woo o dumelelago Tona ya Kgoro ya Dikamano tša Boditšhabatšhaba

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 84

le Tirišano go ba le maatla a go hlokomela dithotho kamoka tša kantle ga Afrika-Borwa, go ya ka molawana wa Kiama, ebile e mo fa le maatla a gore a ka kgona go rekiša tšeo di swanetšego gore di rekišwe, a boledišana le wa mphato wa gagwe wa Kgoro ya Mešomo ya Setšhaba. Ka gona bothata bjo, e tlile go ba taba ya maloba.

English:

In considering this report, one must remember where we come from. In 1994, when the democratic government, led by the ANC took over, there was no single immovable asset register after the apartheid regime was in government for more than 300 years – highly shocking! You did not have even a single asset register by that time.

Mr C MACKENZIE: May I stand on a point of order

Sepedi:

Moh E K M MASEHELA: Efela, e ka no ba e le gore di be di le gona, ba di lahlile gore ba kgone go ikhola ka dithoto tša setšhaba.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 85

English:

Mr C MACKENZIE: May I stand on a point of order

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order hon member, can you take your seat. What is your point of order?

Mr C MACKENZIE: Thank you, House Chair. The hon member is misleading the House, the apartheid government took over in 1948, so that is not 300 years. [Interjections.] So, if she could be historically accurate, it would be appreciated. Perhaps the colour she is wearing might have influenced her decision. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms A T Didiza): Order, take your seat. I am noting the point that you have just raised. The hon member maybe just in correction on the number of years of that regime, it would be good. You can continue.

Mrs E K M MASEHELA: You are mean. The government led by the ANC immediately commenced with projects to develop an immovable asset register and brought all properties registered in various names such as the Union of South

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 86

Africa and the former Bantustan governments into a single register under the Republic of South Africa. It has been a challenging task. However, under the leadership of the ANC and the current Minister who introduced a seven year turn around programme in the Department Public Works in 2012, which significantly accelerated the pace of the development of immovable asset register amongst other things. Since 2014-15, we have a credible immovable register which just needs to be updated when necessary. The department has done a stunning work, though we know that we are not yet there, continue doing the hard work.

Sepedi:

Ke nyaka gore go magagešo, go setšhaba sa gaborena, ge go na le thoto yeo e lego gona moo ga gabolena, ye le sa tsebego gore e ka ba ke ya mang, tsebišang mmušo o tle o lekodišiše, ge e ba ke ya rena ya mmušo, e tseneng ka dibukeng tša mmušo.

English:

Hon Chair, when we visited a Berlin, we also visited the South African Embassy. The chancery building was planned

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 87

and designed by four young South Africans, namely Gandhi Maseko, Luyanda Mpahlwa, Alun Samuels and Mphethi Moroje. Most of the buildings material used was imported from South Africa. As a result, the entrance welcomes visitors from South Africa as a symbolic place of protection where the delegations felt home away from home. Efficiently, this means that we have capable minds from the ANC government born from this country who will take the country forward. The ANC government is the only government that recognises and nurture these talents from our youth.

In conclusion, hon House Chairperson ...

Sepedi:

Ke nyaka gore go batho ba gaborena, ke nako! Ka di 8 tša May 2019, a re tšweng ka makata a namane re yeng go boutela mokgatlo wo mogolo, mokgatlo wo o re ntšhitšeng bokgobeng, mokgatlo wa go hlokomela batho, e lego mokgatlo wa ANC. Mohl Figg ...

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 88

... you will take control of the Western Cape until 7 May 2019. You will never govern it again. We are coming. [Interjections.]

Sepedi:

A re yeng re ye go bontšha batho ba mo dipela di nwago gona meetse ka di 8 May 2019. Ke a leboga.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON SMALL
BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT ON STUDY TOUR OT SPAIN FROM 15-22
SEPTEMBER 2018**

Ms N R BHENGU: Hon Chairperson, we present the study tour report to Spain to this august House for adoption. And for South Africans to vote for ANC on 8 May elections.

In 1969 the ANC resolved to use the concept of cooperatives to facilitate the establishment of workers-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 89

owned enterprises and community-owned enterprises as an effective pillar to transform South Africa into a mixed economic system which would serve the people of South Africa.

Fast forward to 2005, the ANC-led Parliament passed a Cooperative Act 14 of 2005 and the Cooperative Amendment Act 6 of 2013; and then deploy the resources to achieve this noble goal.

In 2009 the Department of trade and Industry, DTI, released a report indicating 88% failure rate of cooperatives, although government had invested in enormous resources to promote cooperatives.

In 2014 the Department of Small Business Development was established to champion development of cooperatives in South Africa and build the required capacity for cooperatives to flourish.

The South African government adopted a narrow approach in the development of cooperatives. As a result, the process

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 90

of development for cooperatives is slow. We then undertook a study tour to Mondragon to learn from successful models.

We had intended to visit Kenya, as a leader in Africa in the development of cooperatives.

Mondragon was in worse situation in 1954 than South Africa is today. Mondragon focused on two things: Firstly, it was the establishment of a college which was going to produce the skills. Secondly, it was to establish a cooperative bank which was going to finance the enterprises which were going to be owned by the people and also produce employment in order to reduce poverty.

That resulted in ordinary people who were poor, unskilled, therefore unemployable, becoming members, workers and owners of enterprises. That introduced a democratically managed type of business and distribution of resources and wealth to develop the entire community of Mondragon.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 91

The Mondragon motto is "Humanity at work." They focus on knowledge, skills, training, research and innovation, finance for cooperatives and also manufacturing and retail for jobs that are created and products that are manufactured.

As South Africa we separated a process of development cooperatives from a process of providing skills and a process of intervening in poverty. That then, created a situation where the process of developing cooperatives is not aligned to the process of developing skills which are required to develop the local economy.

Also, that situation resulted in a situation where the process of providing services is not linked to skills development.

What is then required [Time Expired.] Thank you.

[Applause.]

There was no debate.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 92

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of vote:

Mr R W T CHANCE: House chairperson, the purpose of this study tour was to visit the Mondragon Corporation; Spain's leading exponent of cooperatives as an organising principle of business, learnt from its success and failures and understand the role government plays in cooperatives and the social economy.

The Mondragon Corporation has its roots in a technical college set up in 1943 in the town of that name, by a Catholic priest, José María Arizmendiarrieta. He came equipped with an extraordinary mixture of idealism and pragmatic talent. His purpose was to instil a set of values in the community, based on sharing and participatory humanism, while training the youth in technical skills. It was all about "Socialising knowledge in order to democratise power."

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 93

In 1956 the five graduates of the college bought a small kerosene stove business and converted it into cooperative; which was followed in 1957 by the formation of the consumer cooperative and later by cooperatives in the finance, retail, insurance, engineering and consumer durables sectors.

Sixty years after its formation, Mondragon Corporation encompasses over 266 businesses and it's one of Spain's largest industrial groups with the turnover of €12 billion or about R200 billion and 75 000 employees.

Its philosophy is summed up by the slogan "Humanity at work" and an approach to business in which:

The generation of wealth has a single goal, the wellbeing of people and the community, achieved through competitive business and inter cooperative solidarity.

As one of the Mondragon executives put it, the essence of Mondragon is not the alleviation of poverty but the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 94

creation and distribution of wealth in a fairer and more equal way.

Their laser-like focus on innovation, technology, internationalisation and human capital development has paid dividends.

Mondragon is the dominant business and employer in the Basque region, which boasts Spain's highest Gross Domestic Product, GDP, per capita at €37 000 and ranks top in Europe's human development index and seventh globally.

To see how they did it, the committee visited the Mondragon headquarters in three of its cooperatives; none of which can form to our preconception of what a cooperative is. In South Africa the failure rate of cooperatives is 88%, so we have a lot to learn.

The ULMA group makes a wide variety of capital goods including forklift trucks, conveyer components, handling systems and piping.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 95

Last year it had sales of €728 million, around R12 billion; 70% of its products are exported and it employs 4 685 people. Can anybody think of a cooperative in South Africa with similar numbers?

Fagor Arrasate, which makes die pressing equipment and machine tools for the home appliances, aerospace, automotive and engineering sectors, employs 868 people and had sales of €248 million in 2017.

As we toured these premises, we were impressed by their commitment to high-tech skills development, innovation and an export focus. It was as if everybody we spoke to was reading off the same script. This is hard-wired into their system and not forced onto them by some outside entity while government plays a supportive, not a directive nor funding, role.

What can we learn from Mondragon and the Basque country's achievements? First, at the cooperative level, success does not come from grants or handouts but from a rare combination of socio entrepreneurship, committed

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 96

leadership, cooperation and competitiveness. At the regional level success boils down to defining and relentlessly pursuing competitive advantage based on an educated and skilled workforce and a global perspective.

During our short stay in Madrid, we met an executive from the organisation representing Spain's social economy. It became clear that the social economy is taken very seriously in Spain; with over 43 000 social employers providing 2,3 million direct jobs and contributing 6% to the country's GDP. It is significant that it falls under the Ministry of Labour, with its primary aim being job creation.

While we cannot simply transplant these practices in South Africa, we must be prepared to examine how principles they are based on can positively impact our own policy-making process and culture. This is essential if we are to achieve both a sustainable cooperatives sector and prosperity in the wider economy. I thank you.

[Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 97

Ms N P SONTI: Chairperson, the Portfolio Committee of Small Business Development study tour to Spain was an opportunity to learn from the Spanish experience in the development and sustainability of co-operatives. Co-operatives are worker-owned democratically managed enterprises which can produce a variety of products.

Throughout much of Western Europe, as well as in the countries commonly referred to as the Asian Tigers, co-operatives have played an integral role in the development and growth of those economies. The largest co-operative in the world is based in Spain and it's called the Mondragon Corporation. The co-operative is based on both democratic and socialist principles. It is worker-owned, worker-controlled, productive and central to the economy of the Basque region of Spain.

Workers have the democratic say in the decision making of the corporative. They determine what happens to profits and decide where they need to invest in the production process. The co-operative was developed in response to high levels of unemployment and poverty in the region and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 98

provided alternative forms of work and economic activity to the people of the region. But there are many more such co-operative in Spain which includes everything from banking to farming co-operative.

Unfortunately, co-operatives have never gotten off the ground in South Africa because of the state's refusal to support them and because white monopoly capital continues to dominate the economy and all economic production and activity. There are many lessons to be learned from the co-operatives of Spain but because the Department of Small Business Development is useless and because the government continues with its implementation of neoliberal economic policies. The lessons learned from the Spanish co-operatives will not find expression in the programmes of the current government. Thank you.

Ms S J NKOMO: Chairperson, the IFP, unfortunately, did not form part of the delegation that went to Spain and this of course, is a matter that has to do with the limitation of the numbers in the committee. And we would like this to be addressed in the next government so that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 99

even smaller parties get an opportunity to visit all these places and they are not automatically cut off.

We would like to stress the importance of this tour because we went through the report and we read it thoroughly. We are actually encouraged that part of the issues which were addressed, were actually about the issue of co-operatives as well as to look at what one would term the Co-Operative Act and how we can try to enhance it. We are grateful that the report clearly states what actually will happen and how.

We are actually in agreement with the view that we need to broaden our perceptive as far as co-operatives are concerned. And looking at the history of the IFP in KwaZulu-Natal, we have championed the issue of co-operatives and I would to state for the record and for all to see and for all hear that on the 8 May, we are taking over KwaZulu-Natal again. I thank you Chair.

[Interjections.]

Xitsonga:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 100

Tatan X MABASA: Mutshamaxitulu, hi Xitsonga hi vula
leswaku rintihlo rin'we a ri nusi hove.

English:

South Africa is one of the most unequal countries in the world. Why - because of capitalism but more especially, because of apartheid and colonialism. The DA was one of those root causes and champions of colonialism, lest they forget. [Interjections.] Inequalities, unemployment and poverty ... [Interjections.]

Mr M WATERS: Chair, on a point of order, I think you can do better. The hon speaker at the podium is misleading the House by saying that the DA supported colonialism. We never did and if he has proof of that he must say so.
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Hon member, you know very well that is not a point of order. You are now debating with the member on the podium.

Mr M WATERS: He is misleading the House.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 101

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M C Dikgale): Continue hon member. [Interjections.]

Mr X MABASA: Colonialism has been the course of poverty and the backwardness of South Africa and it was racially informed. Inequality, unemployment and poverty are products of that colonialism and apartheid and they need to be ruthlessly uprooted. Big business should not lie to itself; it needs Small, Medium and Micro-sized Enterprises, SMMEs and co-operatives so that the whole country can thrive. The purpose of undertaking the study tour in Spain was to learn how they have mastered co-operatives. What are our historic experiences on co-operatives?

IsiZulu:

Thina izinkampani zokuphatha ngokubambisana ...

English:

... have been in our blood.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 102

Ukubambisana esikoleni kwabantwana bethu uma bethenga
isinkwa bethenga ne-atchar ...

English:

... that informs a co-operative principle. Ploughing the fields and planting and harvesting as a collective, unplugging the weeds and during harvesting - harvesting together, while singing and eating together, that is co-operatives. Even lions when they hunt, they hunt as a pride, in that way they can conquer a big buffalo.

Burial societies in spirit are co-operatives. It does not matter how poor the family is, through burial societies, the collected funds are accumulated and the poorest of the poor is buried with dignity and speedily. The only challenge is that burial societies must try to graduate from being specialists of burying. They must become specialists of economic growth through co-operatives so that ...

IsiZulu:

... singagcini ngokutshala amabhokisi omngcwabo ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 103

English:

... underground. Yes, a tombstone is better but ...

IsiZulu:

... hhayi! Lendaba yamabhokisi omngcwabo esiwatshalayo ukuthi eyobola ...

English:

... let's rethink it. The study trip tour to Spain meant to illustrate to ourselves that South Africans have this spirit. Building houses can be done through co-operatives. We have bricklayers in the townships and in the rural areas. They can be brought into a group through co-operatives. The only thing that has to be done is that they must be trained in the theory of co-operatives so that they are well informed as they execute.

Let's revoke the spirit of Ubuntu. Community members are at the centre of collective production. Government can support co-operatives by purchasing school uniform, feeding scheme school products, hospital linens as well as correctional services inmates units. All those can be

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 104

done through co-operatives. Co-operatives are not new in South Africa, even to some of the very conservative whites; it's just that they only kept it to themselves.

White Afrikaners as part of their recovery strategy from the disastrous Anglo Boer war, used co-operatives as an economic tool. In agriculture, they established organisations like VKB and NTK originating from Easter Cape and from Nylstroom, respectively. Services offered to farmers include financing, insurance, mechanisation, agricultural products and seed processing. In the banking sector, Volkskas was established in 1934 and later became a commercial bank. That is an example of a co-operative. The only disadvantage is that it was extremely discriminatory.

Father José María started co-operatives in Spain. He prayed, he led prayer but above that he worked. He led the nation to work. He did not make the nation eat snakes and grass. He did not pretend to raise the dead. That is why even Marxists will say religion can sometimes be opium of the masses. It is something that we must

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 105

seriously address. A great nation is a working nation. Praying is okay but working is even more glorious. Co-operatives are an opportunity to correct the evils of colonialism and apartheid, especially the inequality between black and white people.

Co-operatives go a state further in ensuring that economic development is spread as equitably as possible so that it does not produce super rich blacks at the expense of many working class and poor people. Mondragon now established world wide. It is the largest co-operative on the planet - the eleventh largest in Spain.

Mondragon comprises 84 000 workers. Mondragon is based on workers co-operatives and built on the concept of humanity at work. Mondragon seeks to establish a fairer and more caring company that respects the freedom, dignity and development of both individual and the community. Human values prevail over poor economic material ones.

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 106

Eningizimu sithi, ubuntu ...

English:

... in action. Access to banking and finance by creating own co-operative banks, one of them is called Laboral Kutxa. With 1,2 million clients. They have branches all over Spain, numbering 335. In joining co-operative commitments to contribution, ... [Time expired.]
[Interjections.]

Xitsonga:

Loko mi vhotela ANC hi 08 Mudyaxihi mi ta va mi vhotele mabindzu ya nhlanganelo.

Question put.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 107

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON TRADE
AND INDUSTRY ON STUDY VISIT TO FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF
GERMANY**

Ms J L FUBBS: House Chairperson, greetings to everyone in the House.

The report of the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry is on its visit to the federal republic of Germany. Why did we go there? Because as all of us are aware and that was one issue that all political parties were united around. It is important for us to get a better understanding of the Fourth Industrial Revolution because we have heard positives, we have heard negatives. We have heard that indeed this could result in a great loss of employment. Then we heard that it can lead to great competitiveness. What exactly is this about?

So we went along there. That is why we went and we began to realise that... Do you remember when an industrial revolution – I think it was the first one – was about water and steam to mechanise production? There were great

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 108

revolutionary fights against that because, indeed, jobs were lost. So now we didn't need the same experience yet we had to advance and what we were interested in was the developmental path Germany had embarked upon. How did they achieve this? What was the support of government?

Thirdly, the impact of that on actual employment, and fourthly was there anything else that they were looking at in this direction?

One of the interesting things we learnt as we went about this was "cobots". What are cobots? Well, cobots, as we learned, are robots that work with you. You have this robotic companion that helps you to work better. The other issue, though, was whether this would improve our economy, our inclusive economy. The interesting thing about Germany is that there is a mix of small and medium and large companies. It is not dominated as in some countries by only the large corporate companies. In fact, if anything, it is the medium-sized company and a large number of small companies that seem to work very well.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 109

Something else ... over lunch I spoke to a scientist who had designed these robots and he was an integral part of the system. I said, you know, you have been very good to us giving us all this information, bringing together the unions, manufacturers, companies, government, human resources, education. But tell me, what is it that we can really learn? We are concerned specifically about jobs. He said, well you should be more concerned about the young people because today most people think young people shouldn't be bothered with learning how to read. Because, ag, [oh] you don't need it. There's Google, there this, there's that, you can just check it all out there.

He said the problem is the robots will learn how to read and know how to read. And when the systems fail guess what? They'll tell the humans what do because the humans can't the manuals. Secondly, teach your young people to think, think! Allow them to use these systems and then use that information to reach a response to a problem. Thirdly, and that is logically and literally, encourage innovation and creativeness. I thought I heard all that before what else?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 110

He said something very, very interesting and I expect all of you are more interested in your own conversations but let me tell you what he said. He said the one thing that robots will not have that humanity has is compassion and that is what that will distinguish you. The ANC supports.

Declaration of vote:

Mr G K Y CACHALIA: Thank you, Chairperson. The committee went to Germany to learn about how to prepare for the Fourth Industrial Revolution and since then has done nothing to prepare for its effect. The ANC speaks about the Fourth Industrial Revolution like it's coming down the road. While in reality we are half way down that road already.

For the edification of the members on the right and for the Deputy President in particular, the First Industrial Revolution changed our lives and economy from an agrarian and craft economy to one dominated by industry and machine manufacturing. Oil and electricity facilitated mass production in the Second Industrial Revolution. In

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 111

the Third Industrial Revolution information technology was used to automate production.

Although each industrial revolution is often considered a separate event, together they can be better understood as a series of events building upon innovations from the previous revolution and leading to more advanced forms of production.

The ANC's view on this is best explained by my colleague Belinda Bozzoli's experience when she had the dubious pleasure of sharing a lift with some ANC members. One of them asked, wait for it! Does anyone know when the Fourth Industrial Revolution is starting? A bit like the national democratic revolution I suppose except that one is a reality and the other a mirage.

Still the trip should have been an eye opener as to how government business and labour work together to re-skill workers whose jobs are becoming progressively redundant. But you see in Germany business is seen as a partner to the country's success, while in South Africa business is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 112

treated as the enemy by the ANC and the unions. Here an opportunity is never missed by the ANC to shoot the country's economic prospects in the foot as they champion policies that have failed in history. Revolution after revolution!

The reality is that the poor are suffering grievously with children being born into desperate material and psychological poverty for whom the ideal of an equal opportunity for all is a cruel joke. But the Fourth Industrial Revolution presents an opportunity. It brings changes through the value chain of business by improving processes, increasing productivity and reducing costs.

Instead of focussing on expropriation of land without compensation South Africa has an opportunity to become an early adopter accelerating, for example, its agro-processing development. The Germans know this. The ANC, alas, has no clue. There is a complete policy coherency in Germany when it comes to the Fourth Industrial Revolution. We are not even close. Competing factions in the ANC compound this absence of coherence policy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 113

While the ANC occupies its time with talks of nationalisation and expropriation without compensation even when the finance minister and the deputy president sing from very different hymn sheets the German focus is about ensuring that companies understand government policy, grow their companies and create jobs. Germany, listen to this, has a vacancy rate of over 200 000 jobs per year. In short, they are creating more jobs than they have people to fill them. Isn't it extraordinary when you hear from the ANC that the Fourth Industrial Revolution will cost jobs?

Ultimately, as the Fourth Industrial Revolution gains traction available technologies will become simpler and cheaper, creating opportunities for smaller operators to take their place in the business value chain. The salient take away is help foster small businesses. These are the life blood and the hope of the economy. Put the social engineering and creation of a hundred black industrialists on the back burner. That's not the answer! The DA is the answer. Remember that on 8 May.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 114

Mr N M PAULSEN: House Chair, the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry study tour to Germany should have given South Africans or Members of this Parliament insight to some of the steps South Africa can and should take if we want to be innovators and producers in the Fourth Industrial Revolution and not just consumers.

In Germany, members of the committee experienced our manufacturing as becoming increasingly digitised and automated. An insight was given on the impact of Fourth Industrial Revolution we have on various industries and production processes. But well much can be learned from the Germans in the approach to the Fourth Industrial Revolution. We must be aware of the differences between the economies of Germany and South Africa as this plays a great in understanding what needs to be done for us to be participants in the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

Germany economy is highly developed with the manufacturing sector constitutes over 20% of the economic productivity. Here, manufacturing has been on the decline for 25 years. Think of here in Cape Town in the Western

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 115

Cape alone, the clothing industry, the textile industry and footwear that are closed down. So, while in Germany, it is about retaining workers, update in equipment and adapting the highly industrialised and developed Germany economy to the production message of the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

We in South Africa need to develop our manufacturing sector as a whole, at the same time that we are adapting technologies of the Fourth Industrial Revolution to the productive process. This would require for us to have inward state led industrialisation and must include policies and programmes. It will strengthen the role of SOEs, protection of manufacturing and infant industries, state banks to provide interest loans to small businesses, state ownership of strategic sectors of the economy and co-ordination between the needs of the economy and the skills produced by the education system.

While the study tour was useful and insightful, we must be aware that unlike countries such as Germany, we do not need to adapt our economies to the Fourth Industrial

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 116

Revolution. We need to develop the forces of production and economy. The only way for South Africa to unlock the potential benefits of the Fourth Industrial Revolution is to vote out the dinosaurs on my right, vote out the racists on my left. You must vote for the EFF on 8 May.

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Chair, the purpose of this report was for South Africa to consider how best to facilitate integration of the in depth into global market and to benefit from such industrial way. Was there really a need for this tour when the industrial revolution at a time of global financial turmoil trade wars and is more of a myth than a reality?

The committee found that the social compact that exists between government labour and the private sector has been critical in facilitating growth. We didn't know that. There is additional need for more basically digital skills at schools and more digital competence at all status in our basic education system, as if we also didn't know that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 117

There is a great need to develop and seek clarity on the right to use data and data ownership as well as the need for legal security around the utilisation of data for commercial and economic purposes.

The committee is trying to acknowledge that international, regional and domestic legal regulatory framework can either stimulate or inhabit the modernisation of the manufacturing sector through the distillation process.

Standardisation has also been found to be the key development to enabling into operation between companies and processes.

The automotive industry form a main integral part of South Africa's industrial policy and policy certainty in this regard remains critical. Thank you.

Mr A J WILLIAMS: House Chair, the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry, while in the Federal Republic of Germany engaged with, amongst others, the German Federal

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 118

Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy, the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development, the Association of German Chambers of Commerce and Industry and trade unions that are engaging on the effect of the Fourth Industrial Revolution in the work place.

In principle, the Fourth Industrial Revolution is the development of cyber physical systems where physical objects are embedded with software, micro computers and sensors to allow them to become intelligent and to interact with their environment and each other. This is led to digital manufacturing and smart production. The economic impact is increase digitalisation and the interconnection of processes that would allow for the optimisation, increase productivity and flexibility of products under conditions of mass production.

The use of smart production systems could increase company's competitiveness as well as lower cost to production. The growth potential for the Fourth

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 119

Industrial Revolution has been projected up to EUR 78 billion by 2025.

We as a nation must take advantage of this digital breakthrough and put ourselves ahead of the curve. These technologies must be taken and adapted to our environment and our circumstances.

South Africa has a water shortage and we need to combine all technologies with the new technologies and invent better ways to do things such as water and sanitation. We need our youth to embrace new technologies like aquaponics that was mentioned by the President in the state of the nation address. The aquaponics process is one that combines fishing plants in a close system to produce the same amount of food within a smaller area and with 90% less water than conventional farming. The aquaponics system can be established in the inner city because soil is not required in an aquaponics system.

The Fourth industrial Revolution will also come with challenges mainly how will it impact on the work place.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 120

Routine jobs are expected to be reduced or eliminated. As society revolves, work will also evolve. We must not be afraid of this. We must embrace and lead the Fourth Industrial Revolution. We must educate our people to be fully able to explore the opportunities that will emerge.

Let us not forget that one of the biggest companies that existed on the planet was the company that produced ice. At its peak at the end of the 19th century, the US ice trade employed an estimated 90 000 people in an industry that was capitalised then at US\$28 million, which is equivalent now to US\$1,6 billion. This whole industry collapsed when the refrigeration was invented, but the new technology absorbed those workers. So, we mustn't be afraid of new technology. We must embrace it and we must conquer it and move forward.

During the committee engagement with their stakeholders, it became apparent that the social compact that exists between government labour and the private sector in Germany has been critical to facilitate growth in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 121

manufacturing sector and is the migration towards the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

As a nation, we need to unite and pull together, business, labour and government need to build stronger ties and become a force of collective positive change. Let us grow South Africa together, vote ANC. I thank you.
[Applause.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, we move that the report be adopted.

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON CO-
OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS - ON STUDY
TOUR TO CHINA**

Mr M R MDAKANE: Hon House Chairperson, hon members, the Portfolio Committee on Co-operative Governance and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 122

Traditional Affairs undertook a study tour to the People's Republic of China from 2 to 9 December 2017.

The purpose of the study tour was to foster closer relations between the portfolio committee and the State Ethnic Affairs Commission of the National People's Congress and also sought to draw lessons from and share best practices on poverty eradication and economic development.

The portfolio committee observed notable best practices in creating prosperity for all. The committee drew much inspiration from China's eradication of poverty drive, its transformation of the fifty six different ethnic groups into a social and cohesive society, its pride and investment in the vast cultural heritage and its forward-looking urban planning.

China's approach to development was home grown and adapted for the country's unique circumstances. We noted that China adopted an experimental and incremental approach to reform, which, after many years of

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 123

experimentation, eventually established China as the world's second largest economy and a global leader in poverty eradication. With this approach China was confident of eradicating extreme poverty in all its quarters by 2020, which should be ten years ahead of the United Nation's goal of eliminating global poverty by 2030.

The Chinese government believes that essential prerequisites for successful poverty eradication is co-operation between the Chinese state and its private sector, a culture of accountability and consequence management, professional civil service and a central government and its responsibility for ensuring that provinces, regions and local government adhere to the country's poverty eradication targets.

It is also expected to apply appropriate sanctions where performance fails to meet expected standards for successful implementation of their strategies. They indicated that it was important to ensure central government has sufficient power and capacity to drive and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 124

inspire all other levels of government to embrace its poverty eradication vision.

China's economic growth in the main emphasises two points - promoting agriculture and key poverty eradication strategies in country's rural areas. China's development progress rests on choosing the right leadership and choosing a way of pursuing development that is right for China.

In conclusion, the portfolio committee left China with a profound respect and high regard for their organisation and administration of the country, the hospitality and administrative efficiency and State Ethnic Affairs Commission. The portfolio committee host for the duration of the trip in China was particularly outstanding. The committee support the report and we expect the House to approve the report after deliberations. Thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson, we move again that this report be adopted by the House.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 125

Declarations of vote:

Mr K J MILEHAM: Chairperson, China is an incredible country with a rich history and much can be learned from it but sometimes when we learn we need to learn from the mistakes that other people make.

Over the past ten years, China has made enormous strides in the fight against poverty and yet when one walks the streets or catches a train through the villages, there is still plenty of poverty to be seen. The presence of security in the form of police and military personnel was overwhelming. As was the presence of facial recognition close set television cameras and a near complete blockade of internet access and then as a fact that we only travelled on strictly controlled routes and with dedicated guides to keep us on the street and narrow.

There was a distinctive divide between the elite ruling class and the majority of Chinese citizens. The elite drive around in all the trappings of the western civilisation, BMWs and Maseratis and purchase high earned

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 126

designer labels like Gucci and Louis Vuitton. The poor scabble over the left over's.

The elite practice at the based capitalism that allows them to get progressively wealthier and more powerful while the poor are subjected to the oppression and mindless regulation of communism.

The Chinese government approach to dealing with ethnic minorities is interesting, because it is something that hon Mdakane was keen wish to emulate. There are select minorities into autonomous ethnic regions that are ostensive self governing but in reality fall under the control of the Chinese Communist Party and its central government.

Now, that sounds vaguely familiar it should. We had something like that here in South Africa except the apartheid government call that homeland. Perhaps, most famous of these homelands is Tibet. A country with fascinating history and I say country because from an international legal stand point Tibet has never lost its

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 127

statute. It is an independent state under illegal occupation and if it is under illegal Chinese occupation then the Chinese presence there is a matter of legitimate international concern. If on the other hand, Tibet is an integral part of China then these questions falls as China claims within its domestic jurisdiction.

The issue of human rights however including the rights of self determination and the right of the Tibetan people to maintain their own identity and autonomy are of course legitimate object of international concern regardless of Tibet status. China invaded Tibet in 1949 and 1950 and forced the then Tibetan government to sign the seventeen point agreement on the peaceful liberation of Tibet. They did this under the watchful eye of 40 000 armed Chinese troops and the threat of immediate occupation of the Tibetan capital Lhasa and the prospect of the total obliteration of the Tibetan state and the Tibetan culture.

Because it was signed under duress, it is void in terms of international law. Yet, the ANC government on my right

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 128

continues to cut out to China and ignore the plight of oppressed Tibetans. It is absolutely unquestionable that South Africa has on several occasions refused a visa to the Tibetan spiritual leader Dalai Lama mainly because China will be upset by him visiting this country.

So, if anything this study tour emphasise for me that China is not the solution to South Africa's problems. It is not a panacea to the racial ethnic and economic divides of our country. It is instead just another country with its own sets of challenges although is it of much better hidden than elsewhere largely because the Chinese people are unable to speak out against their ruling elites.

So, let's sort out our own problem instead of importing someone else's. It is past time that we implement solutions that build freedom, fairness, opportunity and diversity for all South Africans not tied ideologies of oppression imported from foreign countries and foreign clients. On 8th May, vote DA.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 129

Ms Y N YAKO: Chairperson, China is a country we as South Africa have a lot to learn from. In a period of forty years, China experienced unprecedented levels of economic growth and development and were able to lift 800 million people out of poverty.

The study tour primarily looked at how the Chinese government is able to manage ethnic difference amongst various ethnics, because while China doesn't have such a racial divide history as we have it. They have a clear ethnic difference amongst its people but the manner in which the Chinese government has gone about managing these differences and building a cohesive society is not through a mystical idea of a rainbow nation. It has done this by developing a force of production of the country and by economically emancipating its people. This is based on the correct Marxist assumption by that by addressing the economic differences amongst people, providing economic liberation and democratising the means of production the social differences amongst people slowly resolve themselves.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 130

The Chinese government has been able to economically liberate much of the country because of the role of communist party and the state and the economy. Firstly, the majority of the land is owned by the state and it is leased out.

In China, state-owned entities are central to the economy and in 2018 alone Chinese SOEs had revenue of four trillion dollars and generated profits of two hundred and fifty billion dollars more than our entire Budget.

The Chinese government has also put in place tariffs and subsidies to protect local industries and encourage industrialisation. China also has a number of state-owned banks which provide interest free loans making it easier for small businesses to start and develop.

The steps China has taken in an attempt to develop a sense of national unity and to address ethnic divisions is a lesson for us all as South Africans. It is only by addressing the root causes of economic inequality that we as a nation will be able to unite and in order to do that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 131

and in order for that to happen to South Africa, an EFF government is needed. So, in 2019 May 8th please vote for the EFF. Thank you.

Mr X NGWEZI: House Chairperson, I will deal with Paulsen's issues later. At the onset, the IFP would like to express its support of this report. I had an opportunity of being a part of the delegation that went on the study tour in China, last May, as the IFP representative serving in the Portfolio Committee on Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs.

Even though China is communist state, there are truly a lot we can learn from the way they conduct their government business. We could certainly benefit from their best practices. Their transport system is something to aspire as a nation - their road infrastructure, their railway infrastructure and even their housing is all the things we can surely learn a lot from. The manner in which they have organised their affairs as a nation is truly admirable.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 132

I was particularly impressed by the feats they have accomplished in their poverty alleviation drive and their ability to attain and maintain a socially cohesive society.

We found that the Chinese have impeccable long-term planning skills. They have foreseeable and attainable goals in place for their economy and society that spans well beyond 50 years and have plans in place to execute those goals, which we all know it is an era that we are found wanting as a nation. So, we can actually learn from the Chinese. They implement their plans as planned the previous years.

I would like to caution against our collaboration with China where it does not ultimately benefit our poor. They have the propensity to rely only on their own labour when they make use of business opportunities within the republic of South Africa. Even under those circumstances, we support this report. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 133

Mr M R MDAKANE: I thought that we are debating a report of the committee out of its visit from China. We aren't debating China. It is very important that we do that because China is a foreign country. We must also avoid one thing though ... I now understand why you have a problem in Gauteng - losing your votes. It is precisely because you are always taking a negative approach on matters of progress. In fact, you are gone. [Interjections.] You will never get Gauteng again. It is gone precisely because of the issue.

It is my view that ... you see ... if you can at least take care of your brand and follow positive liberalism, I think you can succeed. At the moment we have a problem of liberalism being under attack everywhere in the world because of your approach on development. You have no understanding of historical development of a South African society. I think to me, it is a bigger problem.

On 8 May 2019, you will be of course not ruling the Western Cape. [Laughter.] By that time, you won't be here

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 134

and we will be leading the Western Cape. Of course the ANC supports this report.

The relationship between ANC and China goes back long before 1994. Moreover, the current relationship is based on a memorandum of understanding, exchange programmes as well as based on China and South Africa's remarkable achievement in high-level exchanges on bilateral ties in the context of G20 and BRICKS countries. Also in the co-operation agreement flowing the 2013 summit held in Johannesburg.

However, we noted that there are many formal agreements between the two countries at various levels, the State Ethnic Affairs Commission had no agreement with any public institution in South Africa even though South Africa under the leadership of the ANC and the Chinese Communist Party share a common mission of improving the quality of life of their peoples, having similar long-term vision and plans geared at addressing socioeconomic conditions, poverty, unemployment and inequality for their respective countries.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 135

It is through the ANC's 2019 election manifesto which draws its influence from all positive contribution from all countries that we link with. Because the ANC is a learning organisation, we have learned many lessons from our in China. The DA never learns anything because they always think that they know everything under the sun, that's why you are losing the Western Cape tomorrow. Of course many of you will be in the opposition benches in the Western Cape, come ... in fact, all of us will be here. We will pose that question whether they will win the Western Cape or not. I think all polls are telling you that you are losing it. [Laughter.] That's the reason why even your leader is busy now busy in Gauteng because you are losing Gauteng too. There is nothing else that you are going to win. You must understand that it is going to happen.

It is therefore, against this background that the Portfolio Committee on Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs saw it fit to honour and invite the State Ethic Affairs Commission of the National People's Congress to share our experiences and draw lessons of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 136

best practices, local economic development, capacity development in areas; innovation, finance and organisational matters and targeted poverty eradication problems. It is a very important area that we learned from China that you won't get rid of poverty if you don't target poverty and all programmes must target poverty. In the Western Cape we must target poverty too and not leave the majority of our people in poverty.

In responding to these questions, the State Ethnic Affairs Commission of the National People's Congress, drawing from their experiences best governance practices emphasise the following: the right leadership; professional civil servants; and the right way to pursue development.

It is of course our view that China is a very important country. It is now number two economically in the world. They do have their own conditions that are unique to China but have developed beyond reasonable doubt. I think in the next 20 years, they going to be the number one economic giant in the world. In fact, hon Mileham, of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 137

course we call him inyathi emhlophe ... [white Buffalo] ... was extremely impressed and inspired by the Chinese experience. I am surprised that he comes here and starts lambasting China. In fact, he was the happiest man in China; he saw speed trains and said if we can go to Gauteng and start doing this, then we will be better off. Today he comes and grandstand on the country that is not here to defend itself. [Interjections.]

It is our view that the whole issue that the DA is doing ... of course May is not far, it's only one month to go. I am going to be proven correct when you are not here. In fact, you are going to reduce your majority even here. [Interjections.] You are not going to win anything. You are going to be defeated overwhelmingly precisely because you don't want to understand the challenges faced by our people on the ground. Every time you do ... you think that every part of South Africa is just Cape Town. South Africa is bigger than Cape Town. You must understand the dynamics of the country on the ground.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 138

Therefore we thought that the ANC, again as a learning organisation, have taken positive attribute from all countries all over the world. We have never said capitalism is bad. We never said that communism is good. We always say that we must the best attributes from any country in the world. We have done that and we are convinced that these areas of work will happen. Of course we support the struggle of the Palestinian people for their self-determination. Thank you very much, House Chairperson. [Applause.]

Question put

Division demanded.

House divided.

[TAKE IN FROM MINUTES.]

Motion agreed to.

Report accordingly adopted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 139

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF CHIEF WHIPS FORUM ON STUDY
TOUR TO GHANA AND UNITED KINGDOM FROM 16-26 JANUARY 2018**

There was no debate.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chairperson, good afternoon hon members, let me take this opportunity to introduce the Report of the study tour of the Chief Whips Forum on 16-26 January 2018 to Ghana and the United Kingdom. The decision was informed by the fact that our Parliament is in a continuous state of development and members should seek ways and means to improve their efficiency and effectiveness of the work of the whip.

The purpose of the study tour was to enable forum amongst others to; learn the best practices from these Parliaments, with regards to the relationship between the whips and the office of the presiding officers. The structure of their programme especially in relation to plenaries, how oversight over the executive is exercised and how in return the executive accounts to Parliament,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 140

mechanisms available or designs to oversee budget of Parliament.

The committee system and how they are capacited, support given to members of Parliament and also their constituency work. Systems used to determine the remuneration, tools of trades and human resource needs of members and also how the chief whips and whips in Parliament operate with regard to their organisational, institutional responsibilities and political management of the parliamentary programme.

Relationship with regard to the administration of Parliament and maintenance of the decorum of the House, support for political parties and regulation of the political party funding. Upon our arrival in Ghana on 16 January 2018, we were welcomed by the South African High Commissioner, Ms Lulu Xingwana in Accra and it was agreed that the delegation will pay her courtesy visit on the following day. The high commissioner briefed the delegation on state of bilateral relations between Ghana and South Africa. She further confirmed that the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 141

relations between the two countries is very good and health with each country maintaining residential diplomatic mission in each other's capitals.

On the parliamentary calendar the Speaker of Parliament is empowered by their Constitution to determine where and when a session of Parliament will take place, further more once the Speaker is elected he or she vacates her seat as members of Parliament and the convention in the Ghanaian Parliament is that the Speaker vacates her or his office with regard to her party, though she remain a member of that party.

The structure of the parliamentary programme unlike in our Parliament where we have official structure where consult each other as chief whips, in Ghana they do so informally and operate more on a convention or as parliamentary practice. Sometimes this creates informal nature of consultation creates administrative...

[Interjection] [Time expired].

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 142

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY moved: That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of Vote:

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank very much House Chairperson for that. I know that a little while ago from this podium my right hon friend from NFP, had a lot to say about overseas trips and the fact that they wasted parliamentary money and we learn nothing from them, at time I did have some concerns at perhaps the fact he was going on these trips as a reason for the uncertainty about what the value was but non the less, I think these trips certainly... from all the trips that I have done as a member this House, was probably useful of all of them, because you really got to engage with Parliaments and two different countries to understand and appreciate some of systems that they have in place, but benchmark them against what we do here in our South African Parliament and to obviously give them some ideas about some of the good things we are able to achieve here... that they learn from over there, and certainly it was an interesting trip.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 143

Ghana was very interesting country and their Parliament was certainly fascinating to observe and interact with, and really beautiful country and really welcoming host that we had there, and system however was not the same as ours, they use the presidential system, with the president chooses ministers, there is far less parliamentary oversight and accountability, than in a traditional Westminster system, but non the less we able to hack up some good tips.

One of the great things I think we took away from Ghana, particularly was the multiparty nature of the procedural...so they have speakers and they have presiding officers from across the political spectrum in the House and their experience is being that this turns to lead to lot less conflict within the House, if you got presiding officers that come from all political spectrum. The same applies to committee chairpersons...where there is a spreading of representation, to ensure that every single party was certainly the bigger parties that are represented in the House, actually feel that they have a meaningful role to play in the parliamentary situation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 144

The trip to the House of Commons was also very interesting and was very interesting to see the parallels... obviously we both use the Erskine May manual as the basis for our parliamentary debating rules and the rules of the House...it was interesting to see a lot of parallels between the two and a lot similarity between their Parliament and our Parliament but bearing in mind they don't operate constitutional dispensation where the clear delineations are made, they don't have certainly a codify written constitution, which creates a separate powers, very distinct and clearly...and I think that some of the drama we seen playing out in their parliament as we speak is result of this tension now between the Prime Minister, her cabinet and the will of the legislature to exert itself.

We learnt some interesting things and one of things I particular enjoyed taking away... we got to consider when we come back for the sixth Parliament, those of us who are coming back unlike the hon Mdakane...these are things we need to implement here, in this Parliament, so they have dual debating chamber, so what it allows them to do

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 145

is while there is debate going on main chamber of Commons they got the debate going on Westminster Hall, what this does it allows through far more business than traditionally with all sittings just one chamber processing.

Debate around petitions, debate around proposals from members of the public, debate on motions and the like are held in the Westminster Hall, and actually going to be able to get a hearing and it gives members of Parliament far more opportunity to bring the peoples' business. The oversight model there was very good and I think there is lot to learn because there one thing I think we can say about this fifth Parliament is that the one area we have not been source of excellence as it is legislative processing. We process far too little legislation in this House. Our process has been too cumbersome; committees are sitting for far too long with legislation, sometimes delaying it unnecessarily and as result this fifth Parliament ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 146

I think is got lowest legislative output, out of any Parliament since the post democratic South African Parliament was established. What also we took away from there particularly was the issue of security, which has been a much vexed issue of this Parliament. One of the great things to see there was internal and both Ghana and in the House of Commons. The internal security is handled by a parliamentary security service that reports to the Speaker.

So it entrenches a separation of powers, where we have the South African Police Service, SAPS that are far too much involvement in this precinct and we need to start taking back control of the precinct and putting the security services under the auspices of the Speaker. So there was much to learn, to thank the Chief Whip for the camaraderie and the rest of the delegation and the officials that joined and all the hard work that went into it. We can have these reforms in Parliament; we can have activist-people centred Parliament, where the focus is on the people on the people's business.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 147

We can have all of that and so much more but we can't have it with the ANC, so vote DA on 8 May and then we will form Parliament for you.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).
Report accordingly adopted.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chairperson, the Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC must have had a horrible time she could even vocalise her experiences here, I can understand why. If we, as a country and society, want to decolonise and chart a new path for Africa, we have to begin to break away from our former colonial rulers. A good place to start is the culture of our institutions - places like this - Parliament for example.

The South African parliamentary system like many forms of colonies of Britain is a mirror image of the current United Kingdom, UK, parliamentary system. But unlike in the UK where the system was developed and evolved over a 500-year-period so tried and error - you must remember 500-years ago, these people established civilisation here

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 148

in Africa. Mapungubwe, we had it. These people were at war. We are speaking about people were savages intent on throwing each other. As a result, our institutions of governance need to go through a cultural revolution. We need to begin changing the rules, decorum and the very structure of the Parliament we want to have, as a legislature that is effective and speaks to the needs of our people. Look at ... little John was more comfortable speaking about that because that's him it's not you, Dorries. As African countries, we cannot continue to replicate ... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, I really not lost on Tom Thumb calling me little John. [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Is he calling you? Anyway, I don't know who he was talking about. Continue, hon Paulsen.

Mr P J NMGUNI: On a point of order, hon House Chair. The hon Paulsen is debating there, but then he refers to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 149

Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC and a member of this House by her first name only. He must apply the rules which I think he is getting familiar with and refer to her, as hon Dlakude or Mrs Dlakude, whichever he prefers. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Hon Paulsen, I call you, hon Paulsen, can you do the same.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Hon Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G BOROTO): Thank you, thank you. Continue.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I took little John from mighty mouse, Yunus Carrim yesterday. As African countries, we cannot continue to replicate Europeans forms of legislation if we want to have governance systems. There are people who can relate to that - the hon Dlakude can relate to - and understand so that they can be represented in the legislative process which determines the laws that govern our people. The South African Parliament and the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 150

institutions of governance need to undergo a cultural revolution and because of that we reject this report. Thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, on the point of process: Is it parliamentary for the EFF to reject the report when, in fact, their Chief Whip, spent most of his time on Regent Street and Bond Street, shopping?

IsiZulu:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G BOROTO): Ayifuni mina leyo lungu elihloniphekile Steenhuisen. Lungu elihloniphekile uSingh thatha umbhobho ukhulume.

English:

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, as the IFP we support the contents as expressed in the report and let me at the outset say one can never underemphasise the value of these study tours. Notwithstanding the fact that the hon member of the NFP comes here like a stuck record over and over again and saying that these trips are a waste of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 151

time. Yet, he himself participates in these overseas tours and so did the Chief Whip of the NFP, who is unfortunately not in the House. I believe that these trips provide opportunities not to only indirectly strengthen diplomatic relations with other countries, but also create opportunities for us to both learn and to teach. In essence, it provides opportunities for best practise to develop and evolve.

Hon Chairperson, I must say that this particular trip strengthens the bonds between the Chief Whips in our House. We did great things together formally and informally. I think that was very good for us to be out on this trip. [Interjections.] The year 2018 Chief Whips study tour to Ghana and United Kingdom was one such opportunity and I believe was extremely successfully on all fronts.

Just to turn to some of the things we learnt, an interesting development in the Parliament of Ghana, hon Deputy Chief Whip, is that a speaker has to be elected by a majority of 75% of the House. They have two Deputy

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 152

Speakers and one of the Deputy Speakers is the member of the opposition - interesting indeed - hint, hint. This initiative, as hon Steenhuisen has said aims to promote leadership and co-ordination of house related matters, which is great. However, what was quite interesting as well is that in Ghana the president does not answer questions in parliament, which is something we insist on. [Interjections.] In fact, we want more of in our Parliament. It's more open to that idea.

I saw hon members, Chairperson, running in for voting here. The British voting system is very interesting. You see nobody and then you see everybody like what is happening here. Those of us that watch the Brexit debate will see that happening. It's virtually empty in the House and suddenly there is no space for you to move, but voting of 600 members is not done electronically. It is done manually and it takes up to 14 minutes for a voting to take place. I agree with the mini-plenaries. We need to really get our act together on mini-plenaries.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 153

Another interesting arena while we met a well-known anti-apartheid activist Lord Peter Hain and I just want to quote what he said" International confidence in South Africa which used to be sky high post democracy is now at an all time low." There is a need to reinstate confidence, the change of the Finance Ministers being particularly problematic. So, we are being watched in this Parliament ... [Time expired.]

Mr N L S KWNAKWA: House Chairperson, ...

IsiXhosa:

... molweni anisebahle bethuna.

English:

House Chair, the United Democratic Movement supports the report because we would learn a lot of valuable lessons both from colleagues from Ghana as well as the United Kingdom. One of the things that we think is very impressive is how Ghana does things. It is that their constitution requires the president to appoint the majority of the members of the Cabinet, amongst the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 154

Members of Parliament, which is what we do here. However, the appointment is subject to prior approval of Parliament. How nice would that be if the new dawn people were to adopt that? Had we done this Malusi Gigaba, for instance, would not have returned last year as a Minister. [Interjections.] So, the case would also apply to hon Minister Nomvula Mokonyane. The other issue which is very important that was highlighted by my colleagues earlier is one of creating legitimacy in the institution of Parliament so that is not seen as a Parliament of the governing party. Firstly, the fact that the Speaker had to resign, he or she must resign from her position, especially the senior position that she holds in a political party. They may or may not retain their membership depending on the jurisdiction, but in this instance it would be much better if the Speaker did not hold a senior position in a political party.

Secondly, the fact that a second Deputy Speaker, especially in Ghana comes from the opposition is a critical issue that we should consider in this Parliament [Interjections.] so that when we go to sixth democratic

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 155

Parliament [Interjections.] ... remember this issue gives legitimacy. [Interjections.] You wouldn't have a situation where at times presiding officers come across as being targeted by the members of the opposition.

IsiXhosa:

Tyhini sisi Thoko awusemhle!

English:

You are wearing an African print dress, if I had known, I would not have given you hard time earlier. The second issue we think is very important in Ghana, in particular, is that if a Minister failed to appear on the date on which he or she supposed to answer questions the constitution provided the House with the power to pass a vote of a censure the Minister. We should do that considering how many times these benches are empty when people are supposed to be accounting the Members of Parliament and the people of South Africa in particular.

[Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 156

What is also very important from where we are sitting, we think what should happen here in South Africa, if you consider the UK example where if people want a matter of public importance to be debated in Parliament they can have a petition if it exceeds 10 000 signatures – an online petition. If it exceeds 100 000 signatures, for example, that compels Parliament to debate a particular issue. It means we will be true to the fact that we are Parliament of the people and we are informed by what happens outside in what we do inside this Parliament. There are lot of things that we have learnt form the trip. They are not a waste of time.

Our recommendation would be that at the beginning of each term, maybe Chief Whips should embark on these trips so that they can learn and have enough time ...[Time expired.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, thank you very much for the opportunity. Where is my time? ... [Interjections.] ... It is there. You know, as we mark 25 years of our young democratic dispensation as Chief Whip

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 157

in the National Assembly, we resolved on the need to embark on the study tour in an effort to learn from other countries who have traverse the democratic route longer than we have to learn from their laws, practices and conversions, in an effort to deepening our parliamentary democracy.

We chose the Republic of Ghana as our first case study because like South Africa, it is a former British colony which gained its independence in 1957, and has been able to entrench a fully functioning parliamentary democracy. We chose the United Kingdom for the obvious reasons that because we were a British colony, our parliamentary system borrows much of its conventions from their Westminster system.

One of the ... [Interjections.] ... we were, hee, madoda! [hey, gentlemen!] One of the notable features of both countries is the fact that their public representatives are elected based, firstly, on a presidential and a constituency system which other parties might be attracted to. As members would know, alliterative reform

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 158

has been under discussion in South Africa since 2003 with the release of the Van Zyl Slabbert Commission Report on Electoral Reform.

At its 2017 national conference, the ANC noted and reaffirmed the importance of the transparent election of public representatives, which bodes well for accountability. As it stands, South Africa practices a mixed electoral system with proportional representation, PR, at a national and provisional level, as well as a combination of both constituencies and PR system at local level.

There is no doubt that the direct election of public representatives through a constituency system entrenches accountability. However, given the history of racial, class and gender discrimination in South Africa, we must bear in mind the possible unintended consequences wherein those of a particular race, class and gender would dominate such a system due to their historic position of privilege and their spatial location under the apartheid system.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 159

Therefore, our motivation for a constituency-based electoral system must appreciate our unique history of segregation under colonialism of a special type. A practise we did find rather interesting, is the fact that in Ghana, opposition party members are appointed as second Deputy Speakers, with specific areas of responsibility.

Though this is something we used to practise in the past in this Parliament, we believe that this is an area we can explore going forward as a means to ensure that all parties are equally responsible for the functioning of Parliament as an institution representing the people of South Africa. The experience of mini-plenaries in the UK which has already been adopted by this Parliament as part of our Rules, must be fully implemented by the Sixth Parliament.

In terms of the programming of the work of Parliament, we found that both Parliaments could learn a lot from how as South Africa, we schedule our work of Parliament, through consensus of all parties, both in the Chief Whip's Forum

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 160

and the programming committee. Ours is more participatory and consensus building than what happens in these two countries, where the Speaker decides on the programme.

South Africa is also quite advanced in terms of electronic voting in Parliament, as opposed to the ancient means of headcounts practiced in both Ghana and the UK. In protecting their sovereignty, both Ghana and the UK have disallowed funding of their political parties from any foreign source.

The President has just accented to a Bill passed in this House, the Political Party Funding Bill, which also disallows funding of our political parties from foreign sources. The reasons thereof are obvious. We also have a lot of respect for our own sovereignty. We can safely say that we have achieved our aims and objectives of the tour that we undertook. We learnt a great deal from both Parliaments and trust that our recommendations as tabled here today will be implemented by the Sixth Parliament.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 161

We wish to thank our South African High Commission in Ghana and the United Kingdom for their gracious hospitality and support. We equally want to extend our gratitude to the Members of Parliament from both parliaments for opening their parliaments to us, and also their public spaces.

At a personal level, the two experiences which will forever be imprinted in my heart, is our visit to the Cape Coast Castle in Ghana and my visit to the ANC veteran, umama uNobhadula of the London ANC branch. The Cape Coast Castle in Ghana is one of about 40 slave castles built on a 500 km long coastline of Ghana. It was originally built by the Swedes for trade in timber and gold, but later used in the trans-Atlantic slave trade.

The dungeons of the castle were used to hold slaves before they were loaded unto ships and sold to far away foreign lands like the Americas, the Caribbeans and Europe. The slave dungeons which we visited were places of terror and death, where slaves will be tortured and stay without food or water for days on end. Many of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 162

slaves met their death right there. Those who were lucky enough to survive in the dungeons would be forcibly removed from their land of birth, and like pieces of cheap commodities, they would be loaded onto ships and routed to their slave destinations in foreign lands. Some of them did not even arrive at their slave destinations, they died at sea. Many of those who made it to their slave destinations never came back to their motherland.

Centuries later, the discrimination and segregation of indigenous African peoples continues to be a painful reminder of the terrible acts of colonialism all over this world. The fact that people like umama uNobhadula had to live for over four decades in exile, far away from their motherland, reminds us of how we have suffered as an African people, not to mention those who paid the ultimate price for fighting the human racist violent apartheid system.

South Africa has, under the leadership of the ANC, come a very long way, and again we say to our people, vote ANC on 8 May 2019. [Applause.] [Time expired.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 163

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): The motion is that the report be adopted. Are there any objections?

HON MEMBERS: No.

Motion agreed to (Economic Freedom Fighters dissenting).
Report accordingly adopted.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE ON HIGHER
EDUCATION AND TRAINING - STUDY TOUR TO RUSSIAN FEDERATION
FROM 14 TO 21 SEPTEMBER 2018**

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I recognise the chairperson of the committee. [Interjections.] Alright, Mr Kekana will address the House from his seat.

Mr C D KEKANA: Chairperson, thank you very much. Yes, we did go to Russia to go and learn lessons about how education can be used to grow the economy of South Africa and create the highly-needed jobs for our population, especially the youth.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 164

It was actually a trip to learn about the finances of education, how education is used for economic growth, how TVet colleges are used to contribute to the economy, how challenges in education are addressed in Russia, and to learn how to reach consensus with stakeholders, like students, parents, business, and government, when there are challenges in education.

The first thing we learned was that Russia finances 45% free education based on merit and excellent performance. To us, this was very important.

We are grateful that, during school visits in our constituencies, we saw one student in Gauteng achieve seven distinctions in the matriculation examinations. We saw Kholeka, a working-class girl, who got four distinctions in the second year of her BA degree. This year, she is in her final year.

We also saw the working-class Mbali, whose mother, a domestic worker, had a stroke. Mbali took care of her mother but has finished her B.Com degree and is doing

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 165

chartered accountancy. [Applause.] So, these are very interesting examples we have seen in our own community, and we realise we are also in line with what Russia is doing to address poverty and create jobs.

It is also very important that we had students from Bloemfontein and Mpumalanga studying in the fields of medicine and agriculture, in Russia. We were very impressed because we could see they are taking the opportunity very seriously and are working very hard. We think that whatever is happening there must be implemented according to our National Development Plan, because it is actually what the NDP is calling for, in South Africa.

I don't want to speak at length, today, because I want to go out and work for the ANC to win the election, after which to continue with all the good work the ANC has been doing. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Paulsen, you are making a noise! How can you shout like that?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 166

[Interjections.] You are disturbing the speaker, now.
Continue, hon Kekana. [Interjections.]

Mr C D KEKANA: We would like the ANC to take South Africa forward.

I was speaking to my neighbour who said he had heard a lot of disturbances but he was still going to vote for the ANC because he didn't think there was an alternative in South Africa. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

I call upon the House to adopt the Report. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

There was no debate.

The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the Report be adopted.

Declarations of vote:

Afrikaans:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 167

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agb Voorsitter, dit is 'n voorreg om vandag kommentaar te kan lewer op die verslag aangaande die Portefeuljekomitee op Hoër Onderwys en Opleiding se besoek aan die Russiese Federasie in September 2018.

Die komitee was verras oor die groot getal jong Suid-Afrikaners wat tans, veral oop voorgraadse vlak, in Rusland studeer. Die Suid-Afrikaanse ambassade in Moskou skat hierdie getal op sowat 700 leerders. Nie net verdien die Russiese Federasie waardevolle buitelandse valuta uit hierdie uitvoer produk, te wete, hulle onderwys en opleiding nie, maar dit is ook vir Rusland 'n wonderlike geleentheid om hulle land en kultuur aan buitelandse studente bekend te stel.

Dit was wel uiters kommerwekkend om te verneem dat 'n groep van sowat 100 studente wat met geldelike steun van die Vrystaatse Provinsiale Regering aan die Russiese Vriendskaps-universiteit, of te wel, RUDN, studeer eers twee jaar in China gaan studeer het. Eers nadat hierdie studente reeds in China was het die Vrystaatse regering

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 168

ontdek dat die Suid-Afrikaanse Mediese Raad nie hierdie mediese studies - hierdie graad van China - hier, plaaslik, sal erken nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Toe moes hierdie studente verplaas word na Rusland. Dit nadat hulle met groot moeite eers in Mandaryns moes studeer en nou moes hulle Russies bemeester om hulle studie in Rusland te kan voltooi. Pleidooie dat hierdie studente ten minste 'n mate van erkenning vir hulle voorafstudie in China moes kry, het op dowe ore geval. Hulle moes van vooraf hulle mediese studies in Rusland begin. In die proses is hulle studieloopbane met minstens twee jaar teruggesit en is 'n groot bedrag van die Suid-Afrikaanse belastings op hierdie wanaanwending gespandeer.

Dat hierdie leerders hierdie swak beplanning, ontwrigting en vertraging in die verwerwing van hulle mediese kwalifikasies so gelate aanvaar en dat die personeel van die RUDN-universiteit in Moskou hulle nog steeds as positief ervaar, is werklik bewonderingswaardig.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 169

Dit moet 'n les wees vir alle staatsdepartemente en vir alle sfere van regering wat in die toekoms sulke lofwaardige inisiatiewe wil onderneem om eers behoorlik navorsing te doen, om eers behoorlik te skakel met die professionele liggame hier in Suid-Afrika. Ons jeug is eenvoudig te belangrik dat daar so met hulle toekoms rondgedobber kan word. Dit is jammer dat ons Suid-Afrikaanse universiteite so sukkel om aan die vraag na hoër onderwys in ons eie land te voldoen, want met die uitstekende opleiding wat so baie van ons eie universiteite bied, sou ook Suid-Afrika waarskynlik baie waardevolle buitelandse valuta kon verdien.

Ek wil graag nog 'n paar van ons indrukke met die lede deel. Die eerste is die verskynsel dat sommige Russiese universiteite hoofsaaklik weens historiese redes in bepaalde studielevelde spesialiseer. Een voorbeeld hiervan is die Moskouse Universiteit van Vervoer met sy 93 000 studente. Hierdie universiteit het aanvanklik as 'n spoorweginstituut begin, maar spesialiseer nou in talle aspekte van vervoer en logistiek.

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 170

'n Tweede voorbeeld is die Moskouse Instituut vir Elektriese Ingenieurswese, wat weer spesialiseer in alle velde wat verband hou met elektrisiteit. Dit sluit in die opsies beskikbaar vir die opwekking en verspreiding van elektrisiteit, maar ook verwante velde, soos die prysbeleid en ekonomiese modelle ten opsigte van ander bronne van energie. Hierdie spesialisasie in bepaalde studierigtings stel die instellings in staat om 'n onderrigkapasiteit en 'n diepte van navorsing te ontwikkel, waarvan baie ander universiteite maar net kan droom.

'n Ander aspek wat opgeval het, was die invloed van die Russiese regering in die bestuur van en beheer oor openbare universiteite. Die hoofde van universiteite en lede van universiteitsrade word, byvoorbeeld, deur die Russiese President aangestel. Die vlak van akademiese vryheid wat so 'n trotse kenmerk is van Suid-Afrika se universiteite word dus nie deur hulle Russiese eweknieë geniet nie.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 171

Ter afsluiting, opvoeding en opleiding, vanaf vroeg tot op naskoolse vlak, geniet 'n hoë prioriteit in die Russiese Federasie. Vaardighede, en veral wiskunde en wetenskap, word hoog geag. In daardie opsig kan Suid-Afrika met vrug die Russiese voorbeeld navolg.

Die DA sal, sodra verkies, onmiddellik begin om Suid-Afrika se onderwysinstellings 'n prioriteit te maak, en ons het reeds gewys dat daar geld in die Begroting hiervoor gevind kan word. Jong Suid-Afrikaners het dus alle rede om op 8 Mei vir die DA te stem. Baie dankie.
[Applous.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Chairperson ... [Interjections.] ... Yes, it's me, again. I'm going to be a permanent feature of this Parliament after 8 May. [Interjections.]

The Russian education system has long been an example of the successes of a socialist education system. During the Cold War, the Soviet Union had some of the best mathematicians and scientists, and it was the Soviet Union which sent the first satellite into space.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 172

All of this was produced by an education system that was free for all. Still today, the higher education system of the Russian Federation is of a high standard and nearly 50% of the 4 million students receive free education from the state. Because of this, according to the chairperson of the Russian Committee on Education and Science, 60% of adults in Russia have a university degree. John, you should go there!

What the Russian Federation has also been able to do well is co-ordinate between the needs of the economy and the skills produced by the higher education system. The Russian equivalent of the Ministry of Higher Education works closely with various sectors of the economy to place graduates, once they receive their qualifications.

Members of the committee were also exposed to what Russians are doing with respect to information technology, with the Ministry prioritising the training and development of IT specialists for the Digital Revolution. The Russian government has put efforts into improving the research and development capacities of its

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 173

universities. This has been helped by large-scale funding from the state, as education and the development of science and technologies have been closely linked in Russia from the times of the Soviet Union.

Another interesting aspect was the insight members were able to gain on the importance of early childhood development and the role this plays later, when people begin higher education, with the Russian state both putting legislation in place and making resources available to ensure every child has access to quality early childhood development education.

All in all, the study tour was informative and many lessons were learned. To the hon members on my right, I love you all, but you're just not young enough, vibrant enough, or progressive enough to give South Africans the education system that the committee saw in Russia.

So, if South Africans want the best there is for South Africa, they must definitely vote out the ANC and vote for the EFF on 8 May. We will give you invitations to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 174

gallery for every sitting. We will even fly you ...

[Interjections.] ... We will give you due respect for what you've done for this country. We will honour your name - Peter, you must sit down; not you! - We will honour your name and for everything you've done, we will show you respect. We will show you respect.

So, on 8 May, you will come and all attend the inauguration of Julius Sello Malema as the President of South Africa. Amandla! [Interjections.]

Mr X NGWEZI: Chairperson, House Chairperson, I deliver this declaration on behalf of hon Prince M G BUTHELEZI who is an alternate member to this portfolio committee. Higher education in South Africa has been contentious for a long time. It is not a new problem yet it seems as though our government is only now rising to the occasion as if students have not been requiring funding for this entire time.

We do welcome each and every effort though because our main concern is always to ensure that all South Africans

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 175

have access to education as it is their basic human right. The IFP believe that the education, training and innovation system should cater for different needs and afford equal opportunities throughout the board, which is why we would like to emphasize that free education must first and foremost benefit the poor whose lives on a daily basis are punctuated by the struggle and inequality.

Our democratic rights are not for sale to be sold to those with deep pockets leaving the poor struggling and vulnerably languishing in a socio economic wilderness throughout hope and progress in life and unable to contribute to South Africa's economic growth and development because they do not have the money to buy education.

Graduates from tertiary institutions will be stepping out into a workplace that is virtually not ready to accommodate them. So, we are glad that this Report touched on ways to address this problem. We just hope that we are able to implement all that was gained on this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 176

tour and make us a better South Africa. The IFP supports this Report. Thank you.

Ms S MCHUNU: Chairperson, the ANC rises in support of this Report. The portfolio committee undertook a study tour to the Russian Federation on the 14th to the 21st of September 2018 with an aim of learning from their best practices in the Post-School Education and Training sector.

Hon members, many fundamental lessons were learned from this study tour. For instance, in their education system like in South Africa is prioritised from an early age and mainly funded by the state. All spheres of government contributes to the funding of education are responsible for infrastructure of schools and universities.

There is a massive injection to support universities to increase their research output and to develop specialisation in certain areas. Vocational education plays a critical role in training people for the economy. The curriculum is developed by the universities together

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 177

with industry, specialist and researchers so that the curriculum responds to the labour market needs. They also have an option of furthering their studies at secondary vocational educational and training after Grade 9 and their training is linked to industry. Articulation from secondary vocational education and training to higher education is seamless in the Russian Federation.

I do want to say though that our country also offers Grade 9 graduates an opportunity to study at a Technical and Vocational Education and Training College, TVET. So, most of the things that we have seen in Russia have been started to be implemented in South Africa. The member who was speaking of the EFF – it's just that he is not in touch with the matters of education.

In relation to free education, those receiving free education in Russia have the responsibility of ploughing into the public purse and to ensure that other deserving students are afforded the same opportunity. In relation to the Fourth Industrial Revolution, Russia is investing in training of 500 thousand Information and

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 178

Communications Technology, ICT, specialists by 2023 to produce relevant skills in the area of ICT.

There were challenges that are also experienced in the higher education. Those include the low enrolments in the Post School Education and Training, PSET, due to low birth rate. There were also cases of loss of scientists and researchers and highly skilled people due to out migration.

Consensus is reached through engagement by various stakeholders. These stakeholders have been brought into the vision of government and are working together towards meeting the priorities of government. Skills planning and focusing for future development of the economy remain central in Russia and there is also a skills planning unit. We thank our government for being part of the bridge network of universities despite funding challenges. This network provides an incredible learning experience for our students.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 179

We must thank both South African and Russian governments for providing annual scholarships to students from disadvantaged backgrounds. This has seen students from the Free State and Mpumalanga provinces taking part in the critical programmes such as health sciences and agriculture which are in high demand. There were also students from KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng. What was missing - there was no learner that said he or she was coming from the Western Cape and it was very disappointing. So, I think that is one thing that hon Van der Westhuisen forgot to mention.

In relation to the recommendations, we are saying that TVET Curriculum should be reviewed and made more practical and be aligned to the needs of industry and economy. There should be robust promotion of the TVET sector of the viable option of young learners. This is what the ANC has also resolved. The South African private sector should be more involved in education and training and implementation of National Skills Accord should be strengthened.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 180

Members, I must say this in the few minutes that I am left with. As we grow South Africa together, we must ensure that we continue prioritising education and skills development. Our PSET must continue to prepare our youth to contribute to society and the economy.

IsiZulu:

Malungu ahloniphekile, ngifisa ukuthi, sengiphetha nje, angike ngithathe leli thuba ngihalalisele uKhongolose waKwaZulu-Natal ngokujoyinwa ngamaLungu eSishayamthetho amabili, u-Comrade uNjabulo Mlaba obewusihlalo wophiko lwentsha lwe-IFP no-Comrade uSizwe Mchunu, uPhakade akagugi kuguga abafokazana, uJama kaSilwane, uNdabezitha. Umfowethu wasemzini lo. Ubeyilunga le-DA eliqavile nobe wumholi wayo isikhathi eside esifundazweni. Ngiyazi lokhu kuqonda noma kusho ukuthi bazolahlekelwa ngamavoti angakanani.

Akubona laba kuphela abashiye phansi ngoba beyibona ukuthi le nqola le ayihambi. Namanye amakhansela amathathu akuMasipala waseMsunduzi okungo-Comrade Claudelle Chetty-Naidoo obeyikhansela kwisigceme u-28,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 181

kube u-Renesha Jugmohan obeyikhansela lakwisigceme u-30
kuba u-Comrade Nalene Naidoo-Atwaru obekade eyikhansela
lesigceme-23 kodwa manje ubsebenza njengesikhulu
sezobudlelwane nomphakathi futhi ewusotswebhu khona we-DA
eMsunduzi. [Ubuwelewele.] Bonke bemukelwe ngezandla
ezimhlophe ngunobhala wesifundazwe saKwazulu-Natal u-
Comrade uMdumiseni. siwuKhongolose siyathobeka ngalesi
senzo sokukhombisa ukuwuthemba kangaka umbutho wesizwe.
Isango-ke lisavulekile. Isango lokungena ngu-ANC. Wozani
nonke. [Ubuwelewele.] Ungalilahli ivoti lakho. Votela i-
ANC. Impela kusewuwona lowaKhongolose owakhulula abantu
baseNingizimu Afrika. Kusewuyena loKhongolose oshintshe
izimpilo zabantu. Miphakathi yakithi, ngomhlaka-8 kuMeyi
asiphumeni sonke siyovotela u-ANC ngoba ayikho enye
inhlango eyazi izinsizi zabantu. Votelani i-ANC.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Sithokoze Mhlonishwa.

Siyabonga! Siyabonga! Siyabonga Mhlonishwa!

[Ubuwelewele.]

Question put that the Report be adopted.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, 14 MARCH 2019

Page: 182

Report agreed to.

The House Adjourned at 17:54

UNREVISED HANSARD