

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 1

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 15:02.

The Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

NEW MEMBERS

(Announcements)

The Speaker announced that the vacancy which occurred in the National Assembly owing to the resignation of Dr Z Luyenge had been filled by the nomination of Ms G B Fanta with effect from 21 February 2019. [Applause.]

The vacancy which occurred in the National Assembly owing to the resignation of Mr M S Motimele had been filled by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 2

the nomination of Mr N E Seabi with effect from 21 February 2019. [Applause.]

The vacancy which occurred in the National Assembly owing to the resignation of Mr K M N Gigaba had been filled by the nomination of Ms N Maqubela with effect from 21 February 2019. [Applause.]

The vacancies which occurred in the National Assembly due to the passing of Ms B E E Molewa and Ms N A Mnisi, had been filled by the nomination of Mr A V Mahlangu and Ms M M Khayiyane, respectively, with effect from 21 February 2019.

The members had made and subscribed the oath and affirmation in the Speaker's office. I welcome you, hon members. Welcome to the National Assembly, welcome to Parliament even though we have now only a few weeks left.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Speaker, we know that the Minister ... oh! There he comes.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 3

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you are welcome to the House. We were just missing you. We already invite you to deal with the answer to the first question, please.

QUESTIONS TO MINISTERS

GOVERNANCE - CLUSTER 3

Question4:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Madam Speaker, hon members may I apologise for my late entry. I am very sorry about that.

The SPEAKER: Apology accepted.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Can I go to Question 4 of 2019.

The SPEAKER: We are dealing with Question 4, yes.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Correct, thank you. Let me start by saying hon members, Cabinet imposed section 100 intervention on the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 4

North West province and took over the oversight of the province, including local government sphere through the appointment of the interministerial committee. The basis of section 100 (1) (a) in the case of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, was to build capacity in the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and the Department of Human Settlements. Therefore, we signed the protocol between the MEC and the Minister.

I must say that both the MEC, the previous and the current MECs, have been co-operative and also submitting monthly reports without any obstruction. Both the premier and the executive committee have also been very supportive in the effort to restore good governance. So, we have not had a problem dealing with North West Provincial Government. We identified eight municipalities for intervention, Ditsobotla, Ramotshere Moiloa, Maquassi Hills, Kgetleng, Kagisano-Molopo which were put on section 139(1) (b), and Naledi, Mahikeng and Ngaka Modiri Molema, which we put on section 137 of the Municipal Finance Management Act. Four of the eight municipalities

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 5

have been in the same section 139 before, namely Ditsobotla, Mahikeng, Ngaka Modiri Molema and Naledi. Then, of course, Mahikeng has been four times under this section. So, we have put up administrators and appointed them to ensure that they run these municipalities. We actually have the municipal recovery plans developed and they are being implemented and adopted by the council to improve governance.

Councillors have been trained about their oversight role and local labour forum meetings are taking place. Senior management teams have also been established. Work is being done to deal with the mayor, speaker and Chief Whip in terms of their own relationships amongst themselves. Municipalities have also been assisted with strategic plans and the working of ward committees and also to promote local democracy. Appointment of key critical staff has also been looked at. So, when we looked at them, we think that there's quite a bit of an improvement. That is showing we have sent engineers and various other town planners and other professionals. Some of the progress, for example indicate Kagisano Molopo

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 6

where we have restoration of water to 4 000 households; Ditsobotla where we have Lichtenburg wastewater plant is 90% complete and the Coligny water treatment plant is also being completed. Teams have been set up to deal with maintenance in Itsoseng, Blydeville, Boikhutso, Coligny and Biesisdvlei.

Again in Ditsobotla we have been proud to see how they have moved in the expenditure of the Municipal Infrastructure Grant, MIG, funds. This area is where you had sewerage spilling over the streets, but now they have been able to spend about 73% of their MIG allocation which means they have actually improved quite a bit. In fact, Ditsobotla is now the second fastest municipality in the expenditure of the Municipal Infrastructure Grant.

Then the other challenges were being sorted out like high mast lights and Lotlhakane sports facility and then in Mahikeng approximately 70 000 people are benefiting from the lighting projects in the same area. Ngaka Modiri Molema District municipality have spent over 42,% of their MIG. This again is an improvement because without

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 7

that they will fail and it will need to be taken away. So, we have looked at all of this. As far as we are concerned, we believe that is going to be possible to turn a number of these municipalities around, but there is quite a bit of work that needs to be done to deal with the political instability. That's a bigger part, which I am aware of and the ruling party is dealing with all of those issues. We have been involved in a number of meetings with the councillors, mayors and the MECs to ask them to also deal with exactly the same issues.

I left out the issue that deals with VBS Mutual Bank specifically, but I am just talking about this, because these are just general issues. We can talk about the VBS ones ... may I just hold it there, Madam Speaker. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: I have been informed that the hon Dubazana will take charge of the Question 4 in the place of hon Shabalala.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 8

Ms Z S DUBAZANA-DLAMINI: Hon Speaker, thank you for the reply from hon Minister. Minister, the ANC appreciates the efforts done thus far and we also appreciate that you ensured that there is capacity. However, we would love to know whether the monitoring instrument is in place or is it going to be developed regarding the Memorandum of Understanding, MOU, that has been signed between you and the department and the recovery plan. I thank you, Speaker.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Firstly, the monitoring instrument is part of the protocol. We receive monthly reports from the MEC. We send our team to go into all of these municipalities to deal with issues so that by the time we get the reports, we are able to align the challenges as seen by the provincial and the national Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and as well as Treasury. All of these actually are subjected to the interministerial committee, an interministerial task team, which is led by Dr Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma, where all the monitoring of the intervention is done. We do

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 9

this regularly and therefore we submit all our reports at that level.

It operates on two levels, on the one side, the technical officials will sit and go through these reports and then submit them to the interministerial task team. Beyond that point, we also have a responsibility to report this to the NCOP. In addition, the NCOP has conducted its own site visits and then they came back to compare their findings with those of the interministerial task team and therefore we will resolve if there are any issues. I think that there is adequate monitoring over the imposition of section 100 into North West. I think there is a lot of lessons which will be learned when we have to intervene into any other province because of what has been done in the North West. Thank you. [Applause.]

Ms N K F HLONYANA: Thank you Speaker. Khabazela, the reason why municipalities in the North West were placed under section 139 intervention is because they were unable to deliver basic services, but this is not a problem only in the North West. It is a problem

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 10

throughout a country. In KwaZulu-Natal, Free State and Limpopo, communities have been without water for months and years. They faced countless service delivery challenges. So, my question is: Are there communities in other provinces that you think need to be placed under section 139 intervention, if yes, which municipalities, if not, what makes the North West municipalities fundamentally different? Thank you, Speaker.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE KAHULUMENI WOKUBAMBISANA KANYE NEZINDABA
ZEZENDABUKO: Ngiyabonga Somlomo, ngiyakuvumela lungu
elihloniphekile ukuthi baningi abanye omasipala abadinga
ukufakwa ngaphansi kwalesigaba soMthethosisekelo.

English:

We have the list. I'll have to ask that during the course of the session, I will get the list. I have probably 27 municipalities ... [Interjections.] ... which are under section 139(1)(b). Most of those municipalities were put under that section that during the course of the year. There are others that have been put into that section

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 11

after North West. To be able to impose the section on municipalities, we should be in a constant monitoring process. The last one which was imposed recently is Abaqulisi, and someone asked the question about that. So, we agreed that there are others that would have needed the same level of attention. North West is not different, but we also have gone into details of sorting out the protocol of the imposition of the section 139. What do we need to do? In the last Minister and Members of Executive Council, Minmec, meeting, we have actually done a monitoring process that will tell us when to intervene. We should know what we need to check and how we should then impose the various recommendations that are based on either the law or the Constitution so that we can then have a uniform approach into the various municipalities.

At the end of the day, when municipalities are not able to perform, the Constitution empowers both the provincial and national government to intervene. We will not hesitate to intervene when it is necessary and it does not matter what the situation is. But when we think that the situation calls for intervention, we actually do so.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 12

We will give you the list and then the hon member will be able to see where else in this section has been implemented. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Mnu X NGWEZI: Ngiyathokoza kakhulu Somlomo, mhlonishwa Khabazela siyabonga kakhulu ukuthi eNorth West uhulumeni wagcina angenelele ngale section 139 komasimapala abathize kodwa okusikhathazayo kakhulu ukuthi cishe nithatha isikhathi eside ukungenelela ...

English:

... when the warning signs are there. You did take a long time to intervene ...

IsiZulu:

... kuMkhandlu wasoTugela.

English:

Warning signs were there. You took a long time to intervene in Newcastle - warning signs were there. When I

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 13

look at these municipalities most of them are ANC led and I tend to understand that you take long to intervene ...

IsiZulu:

... komasipala abahola yiqembu elibusayo kodwa kwabahlolwa ngamanye amaqembu uma nizwe nje ngathi kunentushana yokungahlali kwekomidi lesiShayamthetho kuZwelonke ...

English:

... you quickly do that as you did in Abaqulusi. [Interjections.] Warning signs again, Khabazela, are there in uMhlathuze Council. For the first time uMhlathuze Council obtained a qualified audit opinion. Those are warning signs. In fact, Bab'uMbatha who is a former mayor actually wrote to Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs saying there is nepotism and corruption. That report has not been given. Are you willing to actually address that matter of taking too long? We want you to be quick even in municipalities that are led by the ANC. Thank you, Speaker.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 14

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon member, thank you very much. Can I just remind the hon member that almost all the municipalities, probably except for one or so, where there has been intervention, are run by the ANC. So, if you accuse us of being slow, but we have actually intervened in so many municipalities, I don't know how you measure your speed. [Laughter.]

In our case, when someone reports nepotism and irregularity, it calls for investigation. It doesn't call for section 139; it calls for investigation. You have to follow the criteria of inability to perform functions despite the national government having brought in section 154, which is the programme to generally support municipalities before you can intervene with the harsh instrument such as section 100 or section 139, etc, depending on what the situation is. So, we take your encouragement to move quickly, but we think your judgement is probably faster than what can be done practically. I don't think that just by someone reporting that in uMhlathuze he thinks that there is nepotism and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 15

it has not been investigated, one must then come with an axe of section 139. I think that you are concerned about Abaqulusi or Nquthu. In Nquthu the municipality was paralysed. It was not operating. [Interjections.] Of course, there was a standoff there between the various parties. Let's not make too much noise because all the politicians behave the same in the municipalities irrespective of whether there are DA members or not. [Interjections.] When people have a standoff there if they are not doing anything illegal and it's just political contestation. You have to understand that the approach you start by persuading, warning until you can then intervene. When it's paralysed, it's paralysed. [Interjections.] It doesn't matter if it is run by the IFP. [Interjections.] There must be an intervention. However, where there are problems that need to be intervened upon, we must agree with you that if you think there needs to be an intervention. We will follow up and act accordingly. So, in this case members must continue with their oversight, raise the issues, but let's never forget that it is not the duty of Co-operative Governance

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 16

and Traditional Affairs to go and run a municipality.

[Interjections.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: What about Durban?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Durban is being investigated where there are complaints. [Interjections.] In any other municipalities where there are complaints we investigate them. Let's deal with it like that. [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

Ningajahi, dlulani okhethweni. Sikwazi ukubona ukuthi kucaca kwenzekani. [Ihlombe.]

English:

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon Speaker, on a point of order. Hon Speaker, this side.

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon member.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 17

Mr P J MNGUNI: Shall we request that in principle the cameras are not allowed in the gallery. There is a member who is very actively taking pictures, but with due respect, that is not allowed.

The SPEAKER: Secretary to the National Assembly, can the gallery staff deal with that issue, please!

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Thank you, hon Speaker. Minister, you've alluded to the proceedings against certain municipalities. Can you tell us if the Zululand District Municipality where corruption is rife, underspending on water was R25 million, which is a basic necessity of the people who are being affected, maladministration, infighting in the Zululand District Municipality, are you considering putting this municipality under administration? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Thank you very much, hon member. Firstly, I want to suggest that when there are questions, concerns if you submit to us the report. We will follow the matter up.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 18

Currently, we are waiting for a feedback from the provincial Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs to be able to appraise us of the situation in the municipality. I have been in communication with the mayor who has also indicated that they have certain challenges. They need support. We will look at what the situation in that municipality requires. I must say that the challenge of water is a bigger issue. Last week, I was invited by Mondlo community to go and raise the concerns they have regarding water problems. It's an issue that has been going on for a while. It will require us to find ways to intervene in that kind of situation.

In relation to whether there must be intervention under section 139 from the provincial government. We will wait for the province to give us its assessment of that situation. [Interjections.] I thank you.

Question 24:

Ms M S KHAWULA: Bible verse 5!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 19

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon Speaker, we have been involved in lots of discussions to resolve this particular matter. Our position has been, in relation to the resolving the problem of debts that municipalities owe Eskom and the water boards, that we need to find lasting solutions to this problem with the strengthening of municipalities as short-term solutions and make sure that litigation is not the way that we resolve this matter because we are all part of the same government. The debt owed by the municipalities was R17,7 billion as of 31 July and it has gone up to R24,3 billion by 31 December 2018. We made progress last year in dealing with the issue of the dispute particularly between the SA Local Government Association, Salga, and Eskom with regard to the jurisdiction with regards to the reticulation of electricity. Our Inter-Ministerial Task Team was set up to deal with these and they then presented a framework of resolving these matters which were then tabled to Cabinet at the end of last year. To us it was quite an achievement to arrive at unanimity between Eskom and the municipalities so that we adopt a binding and co-

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 20

operative approach in resolving a huge debt owed by municipalities to avoid those court battles that were looming.

This is our recognition of the constitutional mandate of municipalities for the reticulation and supply of electricity. This means that the interpretation of the Constitution will require us to have service delivery agreements to be drawn up between municipalities and Eskom. These have to take into account the infrastructure investment made by Eskom and obligations of Eskom as a business to ensure that services are supplied to realise returns. At the same time, all of these are part of an operation of a business and therefore its integrity has to be maintained and also its balance sheet protected. It was agreed that there will be a need to restructure the Eskom debt. That has to be looked into and that we need to ensure that we manage the defaulting municipalities and ensure that all of them honour their debts. We also have a recommendation of the installation of prepaid meters to improve on the rate of collection as evidence indicates that much higher returns accrue from prepaid

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 21

meters as compared to conventional meters. The implementation plans that has to be tabled in the next few weeks by the chief executive officers, CEOs, of the water boards and Eskom as well as the director-generals have to take all of these issues into account and ensure as well that there is a protection of the indigent population using free basic services and that the different situations applicable to Eskom and water boards must be analysed to avoid one-size-fits-all.

Ultimately, fixing municipalities is critical. The Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, CoGTA, and Treasury have to continue to prioritise the municipal recovery plans to ensure that municipalities are turned around on issues of governance, administration, financial recovery, infrastructure, service delivery, as well as fraud and corruption. Well-functioning municipalities are capable of collecting revenue and paying debts. The culture of payment must be promoted by all levels of government and communities must be encouraged that the payment for services is important as part of their responsibilities as citizens. We have to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 22

deal with the illegal connections which must be dismantled and make sure that our communities actually protect the assets of the state. We are also therefore making progress of dealing with the issues of litigations that have arisen between the municipalities and Eskom and we are hoping that the particular implementation which we hope has been refined for submission to Cabinet will help us and take us a long way towards contributing, stabilising this area and reducing the debts in the long term and making the supply of electricity sustainable. But also improve the relationship between Eskom and municipalities and avoid the need for us go further into litigations in the future. Thank you very much.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Minister, with the greatest of respect, you didn't answer the question or maybe you did. You answered and you said that the debt has gone from R17 billion owed by municipalities to R24 billion. That is not progress. That is going backwards. That is getting worse. [Applause.] Now, a minute ago you spoke about section 139 interventions and one of the criteria for a section 139 intervention is where a municipality is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 23

unable to meet its financial obligations. Minister, would you agree that all these municipalities that have been owing Eskom for a number of years should be placed under administration, and if not, why not? Minister, frankly, you have stated a whole lot of promises and airy-fairy flowery talk about what you intend doing but the question is, what have you done? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: I think the hon member must face reality. This issue of Eskom and municipalities had an impasse. We have moved past that point. That is progress. Secondly, a number of the municipalities that owe Eskom the most are all under administration. Well, they are under administration and therefore you can mention any one. The ones that have got the highest debt amongst those are under administration. But, what we are also saying is, we are sending teams to deal with all of them. At the end of the day this process is a lengthy process. We cannot expect that there should just be a turnaround within a few months. We expect that we must work on a sustainable plan. That plan is going to come from Cabinet and Cabinet

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 24

has got the first phase thereof and I have given you the principles of resolving the matter. It is for the first time that we have had to go through it like that but, at the end of it, we agree that this is not sustainable. We agree that debt has to be resolved but we must also say that a number of these municipalities are in a debt trap no matter what they do. A number of municipalities take their equitable share to pay Eskom. There has to be something done with that debt itself. So, if we want a solution, which must just come overnight, I'm afraid that we will not be able to provide that. But the fact that we are working now on everyone co-operating to try and reduce the debt is the way to go. So, I do not think that we must expect just by a swing of a hammer you can actually change this situation. It is not going to change like that. It has been there for a long time. It is something we have to deal with.

In some of the instances we must know that part of the problem has got to do with the fact that there has been a huge expansion of these services on to communities that are not able to afford them. And that situation is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 25

something that you will need to work very hard on to actually turn it around. It is not only just the communities; even in some areas some industries are not necessarily honouring their payments. So, it is an overall turnaround programme that we have to involve everyone to deal with this kind of programme. But, the municipalities are going through challenges and I do not think that we must deal with it as though it is something that somebody can wave a magic wand and actually turn it around. We must know that it is going to take us a long time to deal with it and we must face up to how long it is going to take us to do it. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Usolwazi N M KHUBISA: Mhlonishwa Somlomo, mhlonishwa Khabazela ...

English:

... notwithstanding the fact that there were discussions that were going on between your department, Eskom, Treasury and also Salga there were municipalities that were in distress and were owing Eskom huge sums of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 26

money. However, they ceded the government's fiscus through the VBS. Is it possible at this juncture that you reflect on those municipalities specifically which were in distress yet they took the government's fiscus and ceded it to the VBS. What is the status as of now? Thank you very much Speaker.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon Speaker, I would need to just be given a bit of time to deal with that because I do not have it here directly. I have got it though in the notes somewhere to be to go through those municipalities but the number of the municipalities had actually been acting in terms of dealing with the mayors, municipal managers, in some cases chief financial officers, CFOs, to act against those who are directly involved in the issue of the VBS. Now, I will have to give you the specifics which mean that I cannot give them to you as I am standing here now.

But we have a challenge in all of them which we are working on with the various provincial CoGTAs and Treasuries to look at what is it that needs to be done in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 27

the instances were it is now showing that they have lost certain amounts of money whether it was for service delivery or for infrastructure. That is something that we have got teams looking at them so that we can see whether there is any intervention that is possible or that is needed. At the moment there has not been any need. We did say earlier that we are not going to bail anyone out. They needed to submit to us progress reports to show us how they have adjusted their budgets to fit the situation that in which they are in and also how particular projects that they had in place would be affected. So, they also need to go out and talk to the communities and explain what the implications are of their decisions. Thereafter they can approach us so that we can deal with it like that. So, if you we have to give you the specific names, I will have to actually just refer because I do not have them with me. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Mnu X NGWEZI: Somlomo, Khabazela, enye yezinto eyenza ukuthi omasipala bangawukhokheli u-Eskom ukuthi la

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 28

kwisiGungu sesiShayamthetho sakho kuneminyango
engayikhokheli kwayona ugesi ...

English:

... and many others and industries as you have
mentioned. Now, we cannot continue to preach ...

IsiZulu:

... ukuthi abanye abakhokhe ugesi kodwa thina impela
esihola uHulumeni sibe singabakhokheli omasipala ...

English:

... because where are they going to get the money to pay
Eskom? Now, what is it that you think really needs to be
done other than encouraging, as you know encouragement is
not enough, but I think something, you now, drastic
measures must be taken against government departments
which are not paying municipalities the sum of monies
that they are owing local municipalities. In fact, this
is a problem of local municipalities with most government
departments. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 29

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Speaker, I am going to need a bit of your guidance here. I have question 30 which reads as follows, whether the department has put any measures in place to remedy the situation of the government departments that still owe monies to municipalities. If not, why not? If so, what are the relevant details? It is coming from hon X Ngwezi from the IFP.

The SPEAKER: So it is the same question?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Yeah! It is the same question. I want to suggest that we deal with it when we get to that point. Thank you. [Interjections.]

AN HON MEMBER: No! Do this now. Now!

The SPEAKER: No! We will deal with it as question 30 as submitted in the Question Paper.

AN HON MEMBER: If we don't get there?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 30

IsiZulu:

Nk H O MKHALIPHI: Somlomo, Ngqongqoshe Khabazela,
uyayibona lento yezikweleti zakwa-Eskom ...

English:

... from your municipalities ...

IsiZulu:

... kuze kuthелеleke ekutheni abantu abampofu
abangathathi entweni bese kuthiwe mabakhoke izikweleti
zikagesi okungezona ...

English:

... e.g. the eThekweni Municipality, the one that you
are protecting very much when we ask you about it. You
know, we have confronted them and asked them why they are
billing our people wrongly and they admitted it. And when
we ask for intervention from your department, there is no
help at all. We are being referred from pillar to post
only for them to say, go there without any feedback. Even
if go to the eThekweni Municipality, you go to the Durban
Station to the Department of Electricity; there is no one

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 31

who is prepared to give to the people of eThekwin. So therefore hon Mkhize, what is your department doing to intervene because our people are suffering on the ground. The fact of the matter is that electricity is very expensive. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Madam Speaker, I think that we must agree with the hon Mkhalehi that wrong bills are wrong bills and they cannot be accepted. That is straightforward. So there is no one who is going to protect or defend a municipality which gives you wrong bills. So your suspicion that we are defending that is misplaced. There is no way. There is no way that we are going to defend anyone. I am not aware though of what requests you have made so that the department can intervene. I want to invite you to give us the specific issue so that we can deal with it. It is the hon Khawula who came here with two notes about that problem and we have actually got a team from my office in the Ministry to call eThekwin to ask them to give us more information about it. We will give her a response. So, I am not aware that you might

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 32

have had the misfortune of someone not responding to your request but I want to ask you, I am not arguing that it did not happen, I am saying, give us the information, we will deal with it.

But the reality is, where the municipalities are having wrong bills we need to go and intervene and help them to correct them. It is not the only place. I have been to a few other areas where I came across this kind of problem where you find people complaining about this. I was in Breyten just a few days ago, the big fight that the people were raising there was the bills particularly in relation to electricity but also in relation to their concerns on the prepaid meters as to what amount of electricity they get in relation to what they have paid. All of these issues are the weaknesses that when we talk about dysfunctionality and we talk about needs for intervention that is exactly what we are trying to solve. So, when you raise it, you are going to be helping us so that we are aware where else we need to be focussing on. But, do not get tired of raising such a problem because that is how we get it corrected. If you go into the area,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 33

and we sent people to go and help them to sort out the billing system and everything, you find that we understand that the problem is solved until somebody comes to complain to you then we know it is not solved and we must go back, we cannot say that we have been there.

This one in particular in Breyten, I actually had to call both the provincial and national CoGTAs and Treasury to send people there to sort out the billing. It has to be dealt with. It happens everywhere. Johannesburg had the same problem and other municipalities also got this but we must deal with it every time it happens, it must be corrected. We will not protect anyone that does that.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I will take another question as a follow-up question given that we have postponed hon Ngwezi's supplementary question. Hon Dlamini-Dubazana!

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 34

Nk Z S DLAMINI-DUBAZANA: Somlomo ohloniphekile, mhlonishwa uKhabazela, ngisacela ukuthi ngazi ukuthi njengoba sazi thina ngala kuKhongolose ukuthi kunomasipala ngenxa yokuthi abakwazi ukuqoqa izimali ngokuhlinzeka ngezinkonzo abazinikeza umphakathi, ngalokho-ke bazithola besenkingeni yezikweletini, sikubonile lokho kumbiko woMcwaningi Mabhuku Jikelele. Uthi umbuzo-ke la Khabazela, zithini-ke izingxoxo phakathi kwakho noMgcinimafa Kazwelonke ngoba phela yikho sizohlezi sithi uwena noMgcinimafa Kazwelonke kufanele ukube niyabasiza laba omasipala ngenxa yokuthi abakwazi bona ukuzakhela izimali zabo ukuze baphume ezikweletini.

English:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon Speaker, it is true that there are municipalities which by design, by structure, are nonviable. These are municipalities which constitute of small towns with no rates base and rural, farming areas and so on. This we have accepted as one of the serious issues that are predisposing municipalities to nonviability and as a result will struggle in providing

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 35

services. And one of the issues that we have then said is that, firstly, when it comes to their challenges in relation to the problems of governance, financial management and revenue collection, we sent teams to deal with them. We will be reinforcing all of those teams with more permanent interventions so that they can be assisted with the capacity to solve those problems.

Secondly, we have also identified these as area where service delivery is difficult to ensure because they have got a lack of technical capacity and therefore when, through our municipal infrastructure support agent, we have actually sent engineers, regional and town planners to reinforce capacity at district level to create district support capacity. We were precisely at these particular areas. But, we have also said that, in the long term, it requires us to focus on a deliberate strategy of the redirection of investments because it is going to be in a long term, our ability to bring investment into some of those small towns that you can only then begin to build their capacity raise revenue and also create employment in those communities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 36

That will help us as we move forward to creating a sense of more viability. So, all of those municipalities were very conscious of their lack of capacity, revenue base and we are working towards that process. When the Minister for Trade and Industry was announcing about the revamping of industrial parks and also looking at some of the other investments, part of the challenge is to address those particular areas where we know that employment levels are very low, that revenue generation is very low and where some of the major companies cannot even go because they feel that the services are not reliable.

So it is a programme that we must take as part of the overall programme of transforming the whole country to make sure that we have decentralised centres of economic growth which will help some of the municipalities to be able to stand on their own. It is going to take a while but I think it is important for us to relook that. Some other work that is being done is to also look at whether in fact the municipalities, local and district, should be maintained as they are, seeing that there is this problem

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 37

of nonviability. This is part of an ongoing debate that we must engage on as we refine our local government sector. Thank you very much.

Question 31:

The SPEAKER: Hon members, we now come to Question 31 asked by the hon Xalisa to the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs. Hon Minister! Although the question was asked by the hon Xalisa of the EFF, hon MkhaliPhi will then take charge of the question as a follow-up question. Hon Minister! Order!

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon Speaker, I'm sorry my papers were playing a bit of jumble sale ... [Interjections.]

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Woza Khabazela!

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUBUSWA NGOKUBAMBISANA NEZINDABA

ZENDABUKO: Wazi ngani?

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 38

The SPEAKER: Hon Khawula, please allow the Minister to answer the question.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: On these issues of interventions into the 87 municipalities that were identified, we had actually worked on a particular programme of how to attend to them. We had a memorandum of understanding signed between the National Treasury and Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta. We then dispatched teams to various municipalities from national and provincial departments. These municipalities were instructed to correct budget as were not cash-backed. We also had to get the basic revenue recovery plans adopted by their councils.

Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs also identified a number of municipalities needing longer term interventions on governance and financial management. We have put up adverts to get expression of interests by individuals and companies with relevant expertise to be deployed to those municipalities to take over where the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 39

officials of the various governments had already been to intervene. So, we are in the process of finalising these teams for rapid deployment.

We have also addressed issues relating to issues of Eskom and water boards, the problem of the municipality that invested with the Venda Building Society, VBS, Bank and the impact on the service delivery challenge and revenue collections. These were the factors that made us put those municipalities under the list of dysfunctionality. Beyond promoting good governance we also focus on improving service delivery so that our people can have water, sanitation, electricity and other important services.

In August 2018, through the municipal infrastructure support agency, we then deployed eight engineers and town planners in 55 of those municipalities identified. Last Tuesday we welcomed about 90 young graduates and professionals who have joined me as engineers and town and regional planners and other environmental specialists. They are being deployed to various

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 40

municipalities to reinforce those municipalities. The 55 municipalities we targeted for technical support were due to severe challenges in relation to delivery of municipal infrastructure for basic services and failure to spend their Municipal Infrastructure Grant, MIG, grants.

Therefore, hon members, we are pleased to indicate that interventions are beginning to bear some fruits. There are some of those municipalities which were identified as distressed that have proved and which in our view have to be removed from that particular list. A total of 24 municipalities have significantly improved in terms of their performance since the deployment of those district support teams. The table that I have here indicates those: In the Eastern Cape, six; Free State, two; Gauteng, two; KwaZulu-Natal, seven; Limpopo, one; Mpumalanga, one; Northern Cape, one; North West, two; and Western Cape, one; so that it gives us a total of 24. When I supply I will give you the names because I think that it is going to take a bit of time to take you through the names.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 41

The municipalities that made improvements with regards to the issue of the spending of the Municipal Infrastructure Grant allocations, filling up of the critical technical posts and those of senior management, improvement of revenue collection, introduction of revenue enhancement strategies, even though we are not at the level which we require, but they are showing signs of improvement, development of an implementation of water conservation and demand management plans in some of the municipalities. I have got a list here. In Matatiele Local Municipality, Kukama, Moses Kotane Local Municipality, Mafube Local Municipality, Letsemeng Local Municipality, uMzinyathi District Municipality, Ugu District Municipality, and Abaqulusi Local Municipality.

Then the issues of rightsizing of municipal establishment and removal of unaffordable super numeral employees, removal of inappropriate qualified officials and taking a firm stand on corruption including consequence, management, particularly ensuring that the m-packs are working properly, the Auditor-General's report mentioned a number of contributions to this problem of distressed

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 42

municipality which we have sought to address. These include vacancies and instabilities in key positions and inadequate skills levels. Another key factor has been the issue of political infighting in council levels and interference in the administration with weekend oversight and service delivery. A lack of consequence management, I've also been personally as Minister meeting a number of leaders to address the issues of political instability as a cause of the challenge.

Therefore, we will supply with the response the list of those municipalities where there have been interventions, for example, on the improvement of MIG expenditure. We have been to Alfred Nzo District Municipality, Enoch Mgijima Local Municipality, Makana Local Municipality, Dr Beyers Naudé Local Municipality, Port St Johns Local Municipality and Matatiele Local Municipality. I've got the list here which I think that it is better if we just make the members read it. We have seen improvement in some of those municipalities, in particular, those in the areas of North West. We spoke about the area of Ditsobotla Local Municipality and I did indicate how.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 43

They have actually improved their own MIG expenditure process. And so, we have also found that in the process many of the municipalities that would have lost their MIG grant we have been able to relocate to do the districts because districts can now oversee them and actually help them with the implementation.

In addition, we have actually sat down with all other municipalities and relook at those that were beginning to fall back and put them on our watch list and we want to make sure that we intervene before there is a need for the MIG grant to be taken away from them. In general terms, we think that the amount that is being reallocated is less now and it has never been in the past, and also we believe that the level of expenditure of the MIG grant is going to be much better this year because of the tight oversight, then it might have been in the past few years. So, we think that we have found the formula of very tight oversight and supervision that we will make sure that we can at least rescue more municipalities from being described as dysfunctional or distressed. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 44

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Hon Speaker, through you to the Minister, it is clear that you have failed dismally as your department because when I'm listening to you, you are mentioning a long list of interventions, you are telling us about town planners, but we are asking you specifically because now it is going to be a year since you have made promises about these 87 municipalities. Therefore, in your long list of thesis that you are mentioning there, you are not even touching on the issue of corruption and your government that is very good to deploy incompetent people that is why we are in the state affairs now. So, you are not telling us anything that what you are going to do to intervene because if 87 municipalities are collapsing, it means that there is no local government which our people will go and complain if there is no service delivery.

So, please tell us your short-term and a long-term plan instead of telling us about this long thesis that is not helping us. Please, focus Minister. You wanted to be the President of the ANC.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 45

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUBUSWA NGOKUBAMBISANA NEZINDABA

ZENDABUKO: Unokuphapha uyazi!

English:

Okay. Firstly, hon member, there were 87 municipalities that were recorded as distressed. I've mentioned that 24 have been removed from that. That is progress and that is focus. Secondly, the others that we have spoken about are municipalities that needed this list of interventions. I was here when I was explaining what the problems that caused distress are. Therefore, the issues of, yes, corruption and fraud ... [Interjections.] ... Yes. I've mentioned that there is now activation of m-packs because when the investigation is done by the police, police will act. When it is done internally in the forensic and the forensic reports are being done.

We were here when we passed an amendment to the Municipal Systems Act which was ensuring that no report would lie in the files and in the cabinet. Those reports will be acted upon. That is focus. When we talk about the ones on

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 46

the VBS I said that I was going to give a list. There is already been action on those. That is why they were put under the list of distressed municipality. It was because of the VBS issue. The issues that are part of this list are necessary to be done. On governance I went to lots of details to explain the issues of rightsizing of the establishment of filling of the posts and of using our database to exclude people who have been involved in corruption from being appointed somewhere else. In the NCOP I gave them example of already four municipal managers that were actually disapproved on appointment on the basis of this blacklisting, this is necessary.

When we talk about the issue of financial recovery, we spoke about municipalities that we have stopped from getting to adopt budget that are not cash back because that was the concern from the Auditor-General, that is focus. When we talk about getting all of them to adopt basic financial recovery model, that is also focus. When we say that escalate it to beyond just section 154 to 139, again that is focus. So, there is actually focus here. However, if you have a concern about anyone, we can

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 47

deal with that one specific, but that is both I've just explained to you. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M L SHELEMBE: Minister, some of the municipalities are not adhering to the service delivery budget and implementation plan. Therefore, as we know that municipalities are expected to ensure that they adhere to that in order to control their expenditure. Now, my question is, what plan do you have in place to enforce compliance by those municipalities that are not adhering to the service delivery budget and implementation plan? I thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon Speaker, we have a team both on the basis of the Cogta oversight responsibility and Treasury oversight responsibility. That actually oversees and looks at how the municipalities are performing in terms of their expenditure pattern. We sent these teams to go and have a look and then come back with reports, and wherever necessary we had to then deal with those specific municipalities on the issues of how they have deviated.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 48

Ordinarily, what they were supposed to do earlier on this year is that we sent them a letter where we asked all the mayors to provide us with what they call service delivery budget implementations plans which will not only talk about how they will be implementing their services in line with their budget, but we also want to make sure that some of the issues which have been neglected such as the issues of maintenance, the issues that make us find the grass not being cut on the side of the roads, potholes, electricity not properly fixed, water leaks and all of these things.

We have actually insisted that they must follow all of those in your plans that they done so that at the end of it they can then ensure that the services rendered by the municipalities how often acceptable level. There is no other way other than the general oversight to make sure that when there is a concern, we just send a team to go in and deal with them at that kind of level. Once we go in and find that the issue is now based on lack of capacity that's when we have to intervene. However, what has been a strong support in this case is that with the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 49

new amendment to the Auditor-General' Act, now there's going to be a way of being able to go in to look at how the irregular expenditure was incurred. That's where I think that we are going to be able to be tightening the matter because that new legislation allows the Auditor-General to be able to institute that action.

I've already had a meeting with the Auditor-General. We have agreed that for that section to be implemented both Treasury and Cogta are going to be working very closely with the AG to ensure that we follow the deadlines that when there is an explanation expected that all the municipalities respond within the due deadline, and that all the necessary legislative checks and balances are followed so that ultimately action is taken on those that need action to be taken. I believe that with all of these together we will be able tighten up on the governance of the municipalities where everybody knows that there will be consequences where they have not behaved in the right expected way. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 50

Mr K J MILEHAM: Speaker, through you to Minister, it was very interesting to hear you saying that where a municipality has paralysed you will take action and intervene. That didn't happen in Amahlathi Local Municipality which was paralysed by the ANC in parting for more than six months and has only just had an intervention there. [Applause.] It doesn't have any money to pay the salaries by the way. The reality is that in many, if not most, cases even where there are interventions these municipalities revert to the failing ways in a very short space of time and you used the example of Mahikeng which had four interventions.

It was also interesting to hear you talking about the appointment of the National Energy Regulator, Nersa, engineers and town planners to assist municipalities and I quote, "to recover revenue." This is big part of a problem that the wrong experts are being sent to municipalities to assist them, we should be sending accountants and auditors to assist with billing and revenue problems. Another major issue ...

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 51

The SPEAKER: I suggest that you start asking a question, your time is almost over.

Mr K J MILEHAM: I would ... [Inaudible.] ...if you had not interrupted me, Speaker. So, another major issue, the municipal regulations... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You see your time is over now, but please go ahead and ask a question.

Mr K J MILEHAM: The municipal regulations on a minimum competency levels we approved in 2007, since then the deadline has been extended several times. Minister, when are you going to get rid of the incompetent municipal officials who do not need those minimum competencies? Who are you protecting, Minister? [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon member, I don't think you should get too excited. You see, in the first instance in Amahlathi Local Municipality there was a problem, there has been intervention and you should credit ... [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 52

... yes, you should credit. There has been intervention in Amahlathi Local Municipality. It happened just recently.

An HON MEMBER: Too little too late.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: "Too little too late" is your judgement, but there has been action. Therefore, don't talk as though there has been no action. If you don't like it, it is too bad, but it has happened. Therefore, there is no one that we are protecting there. Secondly, I also think that you are distorting it quite purposefully. Technical support is for technical capacity. District technical support is for infrastructure and technical support.

The issue of revenue, it is Treasury and Cogta teams going to the municipalities. They - I have mentioned at the beginning - have started the work since we started intervening. Then because we are seeing in some of the areas we need longer presence, those are the ones where we have sending experts, I've said earlier and I didn't

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 53

say which ones. However, here we are looking at people who have got experience and in governance, in financial management and in all of those issues. They are the ones that they are going to deal with it on a longer term basis, which means in a several months we are going to outstation teams there. That is the team that is dealing with issues of financial management and recovery and revenue generation. Those are already being done by Cogta and the National Treasury.

Therefore, let's separate the two. We don't want engineers to go and help people to generate the income. We want them to help them with infrastructure planning and implementation of the projects. That is what we are doing. In general terms, I say that weak municipalities do need to be given support because if they are not able to have their own infrastructure, they will not be able to provide the services that can attract other investments so that in the long term that municipality can be more viable. I think let's separate the issues.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 54

Prof N M KHUBISA: Madam Speaker, hon Khabazela, it is true that one is persuaded to think that there is a lot of challenges that are facing municipalities. Therefore, chief, among those are technical, but also we have the breakdown of systems, like the governance, administrative, communication and financial which you have alluded to. Now, Khabazela, with the report at your disposal, are you confident that such individual reports or the bigger report puts you in the good stead to deal with the whole horse of challenges facing municipalities broadly. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Madam Speaker, just also to add that the issue of minimum competency is actually being addressed that in every municipality now we check whether the executives or the officials appointed aren't keeping with those competencies and where there isn't such, we would then object and in some instances we require the member of the executive council, MEC, to take the municipality to court to nullify the appointment. Therefore, it is already being dealt with. We receive regular reports and I can

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 55

say that literally in every municipality and those which are distressed more frequently to get progress report.

Therefore, I believe that we have got enough information to be able to deal with the municipalities which require some attention. Now, some of the issues that were raised in relation to the VBS municipalities, let me just say that those municipalities were actually mentioned that they must develop the financial recovery plans and adjust their budget according to how much money they have. They would still be coming to us on a regular basis whenever they come across challenges. The adjustment budget period then elapsed around February 2019.

Therefore, in collaboration with Treasury, we will then be looking at them and looking at verifying to see whether the amount of money that still recorded in their budget is, in fact, available in cash. That is when we will only be then acting at that particular level. In Mafikeng Municipality as we have been aware, there is also been putting section 139 and that's part of the intervention as a result of our following up on the issue

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 56

of both distressed municipality as well as the VBS issues. Six of those municipalities did submit those recovery plans as Madibeng Local Municipality, Moretele Local Municipality, Greater Giyani Local Municipality, Collins Chabane Local Municipality, Fetakgomo Local Municipality, Greater Tubatse Local Municipality, Ephraim Mogale Local Municipality and so those plans are already with us and they are being analysed.

The West Rand District Municipality is in the process of finalising its financial recovery plan and also Cogta and Treasury are working with them. On all of them we have already looked at the forensic reports of these municipalities about six of them have got their mayors have stepped down and most of them have got either the municipal manager or the chief financial officer, CFO, already having been suspended. In some of the instances the Hawks now are already investigating this matter. Therefore, there is quite a lot of movement in so far as these matters are concerned. Thank you very much.

Question 10:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 57

THE MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Madam Speaker, the reasons for the delay in the 30-day payment policy, we found that there were a number of reasons, some are general, but some are specific to the Health Department. I will specify the Health Department because it is the biggest contributor to none payment.

In the health sector, we found that they have challenges which stem out of medico-legal claims. They also have challenges with internal and external migration - so, having patients that were not necessarily budgeted for in this country. Then the budget allocation has not kept up with the pace, with health inflation and also outpaced the consumer price index, CPI, inflation. There are also insufficiencies stemming from poor procurement processes and failure by hospitals to ensure that patients who can afford to pay and have medical aid do pay, they don't collect.

In the other departments, there are general problems that include, poor internal controls and poor budget

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 58

management, lack of consequences for people who do not do the right thing and also ... [Interjections.] So, these are the reasons. The question is saying what are the reasons? These are the reasons. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

Ms L D MESO: Thank you hon Minister for your response. I just want to check with you, what strategy is in place to ensure an effective and sustainable implementation of consequence management? I thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Hon member, the Department of Public Service and Administration will be giving us consequence management guidelines for departments to discipline officials who failed to pay invoices within stipulated framework. Thank you.

Dr S S THEMBEKWAYO: Minister, small businesses are collapsing because government refuses to pay service providers. The majority of these small businesses are black-owned. Companies are going under and families are going hungry because of the incompetence of government

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 59

officials. You have made commitments to deal with this issue, but there seems to be no real progress, government departments need to be held accountable for their failures and action. So, Minister, how are you holding government departments accountable and the officials responsible when they do not pay small businesses in 30 days? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: But I have just said that the department concern, the Department of Public Service and Administration, is developing guidelines for consequence management. Once those guidelines are there, departments will be able to hold officials accountable for not paying.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Minister, the issue of none payment within 30 days is a problem that has been going on from year to year. We have identified various reasons for that. One is, they only pay if they get a bribe. The other one is poor management. Is there any measure in place together with the National Treasury to ensure that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 60

small businesses do not suffer that funds allocated to municipalities that are not complying could be paid directly and that those responsible be named and shamed and that consequence management at least start somewhere? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: As you know, the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation was given this responsibility recently, and in the recent times, last year for instance, there were 20 departments. We identified those 20 departments that were not paying, but this year, 18 to 19. We found that at least there is some decrease but not sufficient because until every invoice is paid, it will not be sufficient. But now, there are 15 departments that are not paying. As I said, we need to tighten up on consequence management. But if you find somebody who says they were asked to bribe before they were paid, you must let us know because that is absolutely unacceptable that somebody will not be paid until there is a bribe. Of course, we will also ensure that the performance agreement of director-generals also put this matter and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 61

they will also be assessed on how they are paying the invoices to the service providers. If they are not, those who are not, their assessment will obviously reflect that and there will be consequences. Thank you.

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Minister, you are 100% right at the complete lack of consequence management, 211 companies that does business with government institutions closed down for exactly this reason and growth likely hindered on spending. Doesn't this make government and your department the biggest damper on growth? Doesn't it make government and your department the biggest cause of job losses in South Africa and once you agree that there is poor oversight from your department and weak policy irregularity and nothing but operation inefficiency from government and your department? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Our responsibility is to check who is paying and who is not paying. That's has been done. We have now said, director-generals must take responsibility, there will be consequence management. So,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 62

I don't know when you say its inefficiency. This was given to us not long time ago to do. We have done and we are determining that people must be paid because as you say, yourself, especially small businesses, if they are not paid over time, they are not able to take that shock whereas we are encouraging the small and medium businesses to grow.

So, we are taking responsibility. We are going to be very strict on the director-generals, in particular, because the director-generals are the accounting officers. They must then be strict on their officials. Thank you.

Question 30:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Madam Speaker, with regard to the question asked by the hon Ngwezi the response is as follows: The debts owed by the two municipalities and by the national and provincial government departments remains a serious matter that we are ceased with. The debt owed by the organs of state was R6,3 billion as of 31 December 2016. It went up to R9,7 by 31 December and this debt continues

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 63

to grow due to accruing interest and insufficient fund allocation by organs of states to service those areas.

Some of the reasons include insufficient budget allocations to the organs of state to service the current debt as well as historic debt and the generally inadequate budgeting for municipal services and property rates by the organs of state.

The Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs in collaboration with Treasury have put up structures in place to assist the municipalities to recover the amounts owed by organs of state and to facilitate the resolution of disputes between the organs of state and municipalities.

These structures include provincial Intergovernmental Department Debt Forums and sections which are run by the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and Provincial Treasuries.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 64

The Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs also participates at the National Public Works Steering Committee which focuses on the amounts owed by provincial and national public works. This team does what we call verification of all the bills. For quite often between municipalities and the ... [Excuse me.] ... quite often the issue is the dispute ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Quite often the issue is not whether the department owes the municipality, but it is whether the amounts are correct. That fight actually is something that requires us to continuously deal with the verification process.

We have tabled this issue at the Presidential Co-ordinating Committee, PCC, where the national and provincial government and municipalities are represented and we have urged all the departments to make amends and resolve these issues.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 65

On the other side, the Interministerial Task Team dealing with the debts owed to Eskom by municipalities and to the water boards has recommended that we focus on issues of installation of electricity and water prepaid meter infrastructure. We believe that those are some of the issues that will help us to deal with the problems in the long-term.

We urge all the organs of state to prioritise municipal services in their budgets. We then request the National Treasury team responsible for monitoring provincial and national budgets to ensure that the budgets do cater for this problem. These structures discuss the debt owed to the municipalities evaluate progress on the reconciliation and the verification of the debts undertaken by municipalities and then look at the issues of billing challenges, progress on payments to find amicable solutions.

Those are the ways we are dealing with these issues. Let me then say that I do have the list of those municipalities which are under section 139 of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 66

Constitution. Now, I have been asked to read them at some point.

So, I will indicate that in the Free State there is Mafube Local Municipality, Masilonyana Local Municipality, and Maluti-a-Phofong Local Municipality. In the Eastern Cape we have Walter Sisulu Local Municipality, Great Kei Local Municipality and Enoch Mgijima Local Municipality. In KwaZulu-Natal we have uMzinyathi District Municipality, eMadlangeni Local Municipality, eDumbe Local Municipality, Inkosi Langalibalele Local Municipality, Mpofana Local Municipality, uThukela District Municipality and Endumeni Local Municipality. In the Western Cape we have Kannaland Local Municipality. In Limpopo we have Modimolle Local Municipality and Mookgophong Local Municipality.

In Gauteng we have Emfuleni Local Municipality. In the North West we have Ditsobotla Local Municipality, Ramotshere Moiloa Local Municipality, Maquassi Hills Local Municipality, Kgetlengrivier Local Municipality, Kagisano-Molopo Local Municipality, Naledi Local

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 67

Municipality and Mahikeng Local Municipality, Ngaka Modiri Molema District Municipality. In Mpumalanga we have Emalahleni Local Municipality, Lekwa Local Municipality, Govan Mbeki Local Municipality, Msukaligwa Local Municipality and Thaba Chweu Local Municipality.

I can supply the list for the satisfaction of the members with all the details in terms of what has happened there and what is the nature of the problem. The question was asked as a supplementary question. I have the response. Thank you very much.

IsiZulu:

Mnu X NGWEZI: Somlomo, kodwa ngicela ulungisa ama-initials wami abhaleke kahle ngu-X, hayi u-N. Khabazela ngiyabonga kakhulu ngencazelo yakho kumbuzo ebenguwubuzile.

English:

In fact this has been an honest reply from you, Minister. It even gives us the figure of what is the total amount that is owed by government departments. I am also glad

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 68

that there is something you are doing because you mentioned what steps are being taken. However, also hon Minister, my concern is that: What is it that Ministers who come and head those departments, what are they doing? For my belief is that these departments, their accounting officers they report to those particular Ministers. What is their role if maybe there is any role they are playing? If there is no role, well I welcome this initiative that government is doing to actually address this matter because this becomes a burden to municipalities, for they are now taking monies that should be given to service delivery. However, otherwise thank you very much, Minister for the response you have given me.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hon Ngwezi, actually all the Ministers get ceased with this issue because when the reports come, the accounting officers report to the Ministers. It is just that the way this matter is, it can be pretty nebulas, because no Minister will sit here and check if whether: Did you pay that municipality today, tomorrow and so on?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 69

So, it is not possible for them to everyday deal with it. So, when you bring it to their attention they are going to take it back. However, when they do so, you will find that it is not lack of communication between the municipality and the particular department. It is quite often the question of how they came about with the figure that they are raising. We have even come to a point where we have generally said, alright, if there is a disagreement pay what you have agreed on and let us resolve what we do not agree on.

So, it is an issue of day to day relationship between different government departments and different layers of government. This is something that will always be with us, we must just work towards ensuring that. That is why we are saying now Treasury, when you look at the budget, do question the directors-general to say: Did you budget for the rates and those kinds of services? So, that you do not shift the burden to another department.

Now, it is just a matter of managing. It is not so much a question that there is any Minister who can sit there and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 70

say we are not paying such a municipality and we will not pay that one. It is really more about, you know, office to office communication. It can be pretty nebulous and it is not something that Ministers are always focusing on. However, once in a while when we then table the reports, everybody then goes to try and activate the process. I would like to say that it is a matter that we must just put on the agenda so that everyone keeps getting reminded to act on it. Thank you.

Mr K J MILEHAM: Deputy Speaker and Minister, I am sure you will agree that it is difficult and unethical for municipalities to enact credit control against places like schools and hospitals. In some instances there are no offices of the relevant department within a municipality. Would you support the implementation of credit control measures against any department or entity of national or provincial government given that they are all part of the same government - to use your own words - in the event that another department fails to pay. In other words, if there is a hospital in areas, and there are no Department of Health offices in that municipal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 71

jurisdiction, could the municipality for argument sake issue credit controlled measures against the Department of Transport? Would you support that?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Yes, now he is just trying to set a trap for me on that one. [Interjections.] However, the truth of the matter is that there have been very difficult situations where the municipality attaches a school, and raises the issue on the basis that the school should have paid rates for that and so on. I think that we must find ways of you know, mediating between various aspects of government, so that we can find ways of resolving it.

Where I have a difficulty, is where a department simply ignores any indication that they need to service the debt and does not show why or maybe even ignores that and prioritise something else or maybe there might be even irregularities in that particular department. Then I have a problem in those kinds of situations. In the rest of the others, I think there is a way that government departments should be able to mediate amongst themselves

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 72

or they could be mediated so that they could resolve the issue. What is most problematic for us, is when we have a situation where a municipality suing a department in fact instead all of them coming to one meeting and then sit down look at how they are going to resolve the matter. I do not think that taking action through some court is actually the way government is supposed to work. We suppose to operate co-operatively.

However, there might be instances where there is a need for harsher stand to be taken, but I think that those who are in charge of the departments must be the ones who must take the responsibility and say, but you here have not behaved properly, so this and that needs to happen. As a sense of discipline by those who are in charge.

The issue between government departments is that even if you went to court, the court will first ask the question: Was the court the first area where this matter could be brought for resolution? That is why we have an Intergovernmental Relations Framework to be able to deal

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 73

with this issue. It needs to be made to work better and that is the way I would like to deal with it.

IsiZulu:

Mnu M R MDAKANE: Sekela Somlomo, okokuqala nje ukuthi uNgqongqoshe uphendule kahle kakhulu kulokhu esinenkinga ngakho mayelana neminyango kahulumeni eyahlukene ehluleka ukukhokhela izikweletu zayo ikakhulukazi enazo komasipala.

Okunye ke Ngqongqoshe engicela ukubuza ngakho ukuthi le nkinga lena isithathe iminyaka eminingi kangaka ingaxazululeki, ingabe kukhona yini okusha okucabangayo noma izindlela ezintsha ozicabangayo ezingasisiza ukuxazulula le nkinga, ngoba ayiqali manje lenkinga, isinesikhathi eside ikhona? Kanjalo futhi nemizamo osuyenzile siyayikhuthaza, futhi yebo mihle, kodwa ke yize kunjalo abantu bayaqhubeka nokungakhokhi, phezu kwemizamo yonke oyenzayo. Yikuphi okunye ozamayo ukukwenza? [Ubuwelewele.]

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 74

UNGQONGQOSHE KAHULUMENI WOKUBAMBISANA KANYE NEZINDABA
ZENDABUKO: Ngiyabonga Sekela Somlomo. Ukuthatha lolu daba
lubekwe ezithebeni zekomiti eliholwa nguMengameli
elihlanganisa izifundazwe, iminyango ehlukenene kanye
nomasipala. Ngibona sengathi kuyigxathu elisha lokubeka
lolu daba phambi kwezandla noma phambi kwamehlo azokwazi
ukuthi aqinisekise ukuthi omasipala bayakhokhelwa.
Ngaleyo ndlela ngibona ukuthi kufanele senze isiqiniseko
sokuthi, njalo uma uhlangene lo mhlango oholwa
nguMengameli kubekwe umbiko ochazayo ukuthi kusukela
kwagcinwa ukuxoxa sekuhanjwe kwafikwaphi, ukuze uma
esephendula uMengameli ezingxoxweni zakhe noNgqongqoshe
kuhlinzekwe ngethuba lokuthi kuyobhekwa emuva ukuthi,
ngabe iyini imbangela yokuthi kungabikhona inqubekela
phambili ekukhokhelweni kwezikweletu zomasipala.
Ngiyabonga.

IsiZulu:

Nks N K F HLONYANA: Sekela Somlomo noKhabazela, [Deputy
Speaker and Dr Mkhize] the local government sphere has
been suffocated in many ways making it virtually
impossible for it to deliver services to the people. They

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 75

receive the smallest cut of the budget from the National Treasury and then your department do not pay them. One of the solutions we have proposed to deal with structural problems is that we must enact a constitutional amendment to do away with provinces and empower municipalities. Do you still see any future for the provincial spheres of government and is it really necessary for the country?

IsiZulu:

Futhi ngiyakucela Khabazela uwuphendule kahle lo mbuzo. Ungasabi. Ungamsabi nalo Thuma Mina, ukhulume nje iqiniso ulibeke lithi bha!

IsiZulu:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Hayi, ngiyayiqabuka ke le. [Hey, this is strange.] [Laughter.]

The provinces were part of the outcomes of a negotiated settlement. There were established as part of trying to create a balance in terms of the exercise of power between various layers of government. So, I think that as

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 76

a country, it is fair to continuously review where we are and whether in fact the role of provinces as structured, the numbers and whether the local municipalities, their numbers and their size are still suitable for the kind of a situation that we are in.

Now, I mentioned a bit earlier that the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs has right now started the whole question of reviewing literature and a number of available sources of information to be able to guide us in terms of what do we need to do to improve the efficiency of local government as the situation is now.

There has been the debate outside this House.

[Interjections.]

Yes, in the Ruling Party. That has been raised to say, we need to review all of this and then keep discussing so that we can come to the formula of what is there still a need to keep the provinces as they are structured? That

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 77

is a debate that we can all engage in. If we need to provide some of the background information for this House for the debate, we can certainly do that.

However, as we speak right now, we have the Constitution that is guiding us with the numbers of provinces as currently constituted. That situation is what we are going to have to work on. It would have to be after a thorough going discussion, review and proper analysis of all the issues that we can actually look at whether there can be a change on that one. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Question 1:

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI:

Ngiyabonga Sekela Somlomo ...

English:

Much as South Africa is a constitution-based country, which recognises gender equality, human rights, nonsexism and sexual orientation, our country remains patriarchal and women are dominated and discriminated against. The

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 78

persistent challenge of patriarchy that is seen in the three arms of the state needs a complete overhaul. Those who have to take radical decisions to change the quality of life of women bring the attitudes, norms and values of society to the workplace.

The institutions that are responsible for the strategic resources required to transform women's lives are influenced by the domination of men. The very institutions have people who embrace negative gender norms, stereotypes and harmful practices that promote the oppression, marginalisation and discrimination of women.

IsiZulu:

Awuyeke ukusimemeza ...

English:

... Ash Wednesday today. We also respect you. We don't want to shout at people. [Interjections.]

For example, the National Council on Gender-Based Violence ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 79

Mr N PAULSEN: Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take a seat.

Mr N PAULSEN: You know when you run out of ideas you mustn't resort to religion. I never said anything about religion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, take your seat. Go ahead, Minister.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Yes, we don't want to shout at anyone.

Ms H O MKHALIPI: You are out of order.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: Huh uh, I am not out of order. I am not.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please ignore that. Proceed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 80

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: The National Council on Gender-Based Violence collapsed due to a lack of funds. The implementation of the Domestic Violence Act is ineffective. The Maintenance Act is skewed in favour of men. The burden of proof with regard to a lack of means by men to the prosecution in maintenance matters lies with women. Should men in maintenance matters plead a lack of means as a defence to noncompliance with an existing maintenance order, women rely on maintenance investigators to establish whether the accused is telling the truth and has a valid defence.

Transforming the patriarchal consciousness of institutions requires a complete gender overhaul of societal institutions, primarily families, the school system and the curriculum.

We work in partnership with civil society organisations, faith-based organisations, youth and traditional leadership formations, and we must transform the discourse and attitudes of those at the top in these institutions.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 81

The Department of Women is implementing the framework on gender responsive planning, budgeting, monitoring, evaluation and auditing. This is to ensure that quality indicators and targets are included in all government plans to show what each department is doing for women's empowerment and gender equality.

The department is also strengthening the national gender machinery to ensure that it functions effectively.

Departments must have fully fledged branches that will ensure that legislation, policies and programmes are gender sensitive. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Minister, on paper everything looks good but in reality I think women in South Africa are going through a very difficult period. Let me give you some examples. If a father refuses to pay maintenance ... he is self-employed or has a small business ... and you know the weaknesses at the SA Revenue Service, Sars ... he doesn't pay tax. You cannot prove that. The mother will continuously run to the courts. She will run to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 82

maintenance departments. She will go to the investigators and very little or nothing happens.

Secondly, they go to Legal Aid. Even there they have challenges. They have to stand in long queues and very often told to come again and again and again.

It is our view that this thing is not being co-ordinated to ensure that there is enough protection for women and to ensure that those absconding fathers pay the ultimate price of ensuring they do the right thing and pay maintenance for every child because the child is innocent.

What measures do you intend to put in place to ensure that that parent that has a challenge is followed up until ultimately that child is paid for in terms of that maintenance, and that that father does the right thing, not only in terms of paying maintenance ... ensure that that child gets proper education, gets proper medical care and things. Can you please tell us Minister?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 83

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI:

Ngiyabonga Sekela Somlomo, uMongameli ukhethe ikomidi elibizwa ngokuthi phecelezi ...

English:

... advisory committee on gender equality and women's empowerment that will review progress that has taken place over 25 years, consult with various sectors and make recommendations on what we should do.

However, the issues that Emam is raising are a true reflection of what is happening in our country. There are laws that we have made that came from Parliament.

However, the way that they are done is now a burden to women. They are now eating women because men always find ways of turning around things that are supposed to empower women... and let those things bite women.

With regard to the issue of maintenance; all fathers are supposed to be present fathers, but they are now running away, using the law. It's the responsibility of a woman

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 84

to report, for instance when a man changes his place of work. She has to go and report that her partner has changed his place of work. Why is it not the man who goes to the maintenance court to inform the justice system that he has changed his place of work?

One other thing is that if we want to be honest about this issue, there must be stringent laws that will make civil servants pay for their children. You can't have civil servants that ... [Time expired.]

Ms T STANDER: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Sir, just before I ask my question, may I ask that this House supports the condemnation of a tweet against Karima Brown that was made public and where callers have since threatened her with rape and assault? [Applause.] She is being victimised. ... And that we join the media fraternity in giving our full support to esteemed journalist, Karima Brown.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Order, Deputy Speaker.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 85

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is the point of order?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: I'm calling a point of order because she is supposed to start from when Karima Brown sent an infiltration SMS to the EFF WhatsApp group.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member that is not a point of order. It's a political comment. Take your seat.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: So she must not do what she wants to do here because she is not going to have peace here. She must just pose her question to the Minister. She must not enter where she's trying to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat. No, hon member, that's not a point of order.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: She must not protect Karima Brown here ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon member.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 86

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, I would like to address you in terms of the rule of Order 142(5). It says very clearly that a member who asks a supplementary question may make a statement or express an opinion. The hon Stander has done just that. [Applause.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish ... Hon member, what are you rising on? What's your point of order?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: On the very same point, because the Karima Brown issue is the issue that emanated from the EFF WhatsApp group ... that she sent.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, this is not a point of order. You are politically defending this. Hon member, I'm switching off your microphone.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: So she must not ... [Inaudible] ... and use that one. We are going to defend the EFF here.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 87

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That's not a point of order. That's not a point of order. Hon members, let me advise you in advance ...

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: ... [Inaudible.] She's not going to do that here. [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, take your seat. Take your seat! You are out of order!

IsiZulu:

Nk H O MKHALIPHI: Hhayi nawe!

USEKELA SOMLOMO: Nami

English:

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think this is the most outrageous development in the House. [Applause.] I think this is absolutely irresponsible and I'm going to ask you to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 88

withdraw that statement now. If you don't hon member, you know what the consequences are. You do that now please!

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: What?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Withdraw your statement including me in this debate. In the first place I'm not part of this debate. [Interjections.] Hon member, you heard what I said. You have a choice and I'm not proceeding in talking about this if you don't withdraw that statement. You heard what you said yourself. How did I get into this thing? [Interjections.] Hon member, you withdraw the statement. If you don't I'm going to ask you to go. [Interjections.] Hon member, leave the House! Leave the House! Hon member, you leave the House! I have requested you ... [Inaudible.]

Mr T RAWULA: Deputy Speaker, the microphone is off. How is she supposed to respond to you? Her microphone is off. You have switched off the microphone but you want her to speak.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 89

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you can't ...

[Inaudible.] Hon member, I am listening. You have no right to speak. I didn't ... [Inaudible.]

[Interjections.]

Mr T RAWULA: Her microphone is off! Her microphone! Her microphone!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Rawula, take your seat. You are out of order. You had no business talking. Hon members, there are rules in the House. Hon MkhaliPhi ...

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: But Deputy Speaker, I'm asking you which one I must withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I expressly answered your question and you are continuing to deny it.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Which one? I don't know.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I've asked you to go anyway.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 90

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: No, for what? Why must I go?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, go out hon member!

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: But you must clarify why I must go out.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have told you what I said you should do.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: What did you say?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I said you must leave the House.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Why?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Because you have literally included me in this. Despite me asking you to withdraw you are refusing to withdraw after I expressly told you to go. {Interjections.} Hon member, please leave. I'm not going ahead with this thing.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 91

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Deputy Speaker, Deputy Speaker, calm down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, go out!

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Deputy Speaker, calm down. I want to understand why I must withdraw. Is that a crime?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Serjeant-at-arms, can you help the member to leave please?

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Is that a crime? Deputy Speaker, follow the rules. What must I withdraw? Why are you taking this thing emotionally? I want to know what I must withdraw ... to say this member must not opportunistically ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Serjeant-at-arms, help the member out please. [Interjections.] Help the member out please.

IsiZulu:

Nk H O MKHALIPHI: Hhayi suka!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 92

Mr N PAULSEN: Deputy Speaker! Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes hon member?

IsiZulu:

Nk H O MKHALIPHI: Wena ucabanga ukuthi ...

English:

... this is your own house, wena. And this is the last time you are chairing this Parliament.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Serjeant- at-arms, ask her to leave please.

Mr N PAULSEN: Deputy Speaker, you are being too hasty here. No, you're being too hasty.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Paulsen, what's your problem?

Mr N PAULSEN: No, you're being too hasty. Deputy Speaker, she's asking you for clarity on what part you want her to withdraw.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 93

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Paulsen ... [Inaudible.] ... you have no ... The rules say that when a presiding officer has made a ruling, if you want to challenge it write to the Speaker.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: You, Deputy Speaker, you think this is your house. This is not your house. And you are aging.

An HON MEMBER: Leave the House ...

IsiZulu:

... wena phuma!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please leave, hon member.

[Interjections.] Hon members, you will play by the rules of the House. There is no question.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: But you are not applying the rules of the House! You are applying your own rules!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon MkhaliPhi, I name you!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 94

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Anarchist!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I name you!

IsiZulu:

ILINGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Phuma wena! Phuma wena doti!

Phuma!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I name you! [Interjections.] Hon members ...

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: You can name me 100 times! Anarchist!

IsiZulu:

ILUNGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Suka, hamba wena.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... I would like to warn you. Anyone who stands up to proceed with this ruling when they know they should write to the Speaker to challenge it will be ruled out of order and will also be asked to leave because you will be deliberately violating the rules of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 95

the House and that's not going to be accepted here.

[Interjections.]

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon Deputy Speaker, like I asked yesterday, I'm asking that the incidents of gross and unbecoming behaviour be looked at via Hansard, and you make a considered ruling. It's there in the rules. Many incidents, other than the one that you actually addressed, have subsequently occurred, including the anarchist label and many other things. If you go through the record with the support of the NA Table then you can make a ruling.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It's alright. Hon member, I am attending to it. I just didn't want to rush it. What are you rising on hon member?

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, cha mina okwami Sihlalo akuhlangene nalokhu. Bengiqonde ukuthi ilungu elihloniphekile uMnguni uyashabasheka lapha ngaphakathi wenza imithetho kodwa akabheki ukuthi uma ngabe

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 96

owangakubo we-ANC enza amaphutha ... [Ubuwelewele.]
Kuyimanje uNgqongqoshe ubize u-Emam ngaphandle kokuthi
lungu elihlomiphekile.

USEKELA SOMLOMO: Lungu elihloniphekile Khawula! Lungu
elihloniphekile Khawula, ngicela uthule uma ngikhuluma
nawe.

English:

Hon Khawula, you have no right to determine what any
party in the House must do and who must speak on its
behalf on these matters. So please ... Unless they have
broken rules. You must point out which rules they've
broken. Otherwise you are not allowed to repeat what you
are doing now. Thank you very much.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngesihle, ngesihle ngiqonde ukuthi mina
ilungu elihloniphekile uMnguni uma ngabe kunento athatha
isinqumo ngayo akenze ukuthi kufanane. Angaqinisi
umthetho uma kungabanye kuthi uma kuyibona angaqinisi
umthetho. Yilokho.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 97

USEKELA SOMLOMO: Lungu elihloniphekile ngicela uhlale phansi ngoba awunalo ilungelo lokutshela ilungu elihloniphekile ukuthi kufuneka likhulume kanjani, ngaphandle kokusitshela ukuthi liphule umthetho ngayiphi indlela.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Kodwa angakhethi iphela emasini.

USEKELA SOMLOMO: Lungu elihloniphekile hlala phansi!

English:

You are out of order! You are out of order, hon member! You are arguing with me. That is out of order! Hon Bhengu? Hon Minister, my apologies. You have to respond to the question. Did you? Sorry? You didn't ask your question? Please complete it. I see you have 31 seconds. Complete it.

Ms T STANDER: Hhayi bo! [Oh, no!]. Minister Dlamini has blamed many for the abuse, oppression, marginalisation and discrimination, yet she and the ANC Women's League are quoted as saying, women are too emotional; men are experts; there are ANC men worse than Manana; they have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 98

"smallanyana" skeletons; Ramaphosa has participated in violence against women; Khwezi protestors are politically motivated tea girls; Khwezi should feel lucky to have been raped by such a handsome man; and she must burn. We also know that ANC women were raped and abused by senior ANC men in exile camps. Will you tell us who these ANC men are and what are you going to do about them?

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon Deputy Speaker, point of order: There are two issues here. The first one is that reference to any member of the House, including the President, should not be in name only. It's there in the rules. The second one is that the hon member has now cast serious aspersions on His Excellency the President. She has got to do so by way of a substantive motion. I thank you hon Deputy Speaker. [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will look into Hansard and rule on that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 99

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, I think if you look at the question in Hansard ... the hon Stander prefaced it with a quotation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, that's fine. I will look into the Hansard. There are rulings that have been made on this matter before and we will do that.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI: Uyazi kuyinkinga kabi ukuthi njalo makukhulunywa izinto zabantu besifazane kubekhona osomathuba abazijikisayo bafune ukuxoxa izindaba zabo. Uma ngabe sifuna ukuxoxa ngo-Verwoed nango-Flock nangemikhuba yabo sidedeleni senze njalo. Ungalokhu wenza le nto oyenzayo lapha.

[Ubuwelewele.]

Okwesibili, mina anginawo amahloni ngokuthi ngiyazwela ngoba ngingumuntu, ngiyaphila, nginemizwa. [Ihlombe.]

Futhi vele uma ngabe ungumuntu kufanele ube nozwelo.

Ngakho ke angizisoli ngalokho. Ngakho ke angezi uzoma lapha ukhulume nge-Women's League. Khuluma ngamakhosikazi

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 100

lapho kunina ukuthi nenzani. [Ubuwelewele.] Nimenzani uSotswebhu Omkhulu owahanjiswa wayiswa le-Eastern Cape ohlezi khona le. Nimenzani? Nibenzani laba abahlukumezwa ngokocansi. Nibenzani laba abanobuhlanga enibhamuka kube ngathi niwumlilo wamaphepha uma ngabe benze into kanti isinqumo enizosithatha isinqumo esingekho. [Ihlombe.]

IsiZulu:

Nk P BHENGU-KOMBE: Ngiyabonga Sekela Somlomo, mhlawumbe kufanele sazise i-EFF ukuthi lapha kwa-ANC kunoSotswebhu Bomsebenzi [Duty Whips.] abenza umsebenzi wabo ukuqondisa zonke lezi zigwegwe zabo abazenzayo abanjenge lungu elihloniphekile uMnguni, ngoba bona kuyacaca ukuthi abanabo oSotswebhu Bomsebenzi. [Ubuwelewele.]

Lungu elihloniphekile Ngqongqoshe umbuzo wami uthi amalungelo esifazane abukelwa phansi uma kuza ekusetshenzisweni komthetho. Bangingi abantu besifazane abagcina sebeyekile ukulokhu behla benyuka ezinkantolo bencengana noyise bezingane ukuthi bazondle. Kulesi sikhathi nalapha kuleNdlu kumele kwenziwe uhlolo lokuthi bangaki abangazondle izingane zabo bebe behlezi lapha

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 101

eNdlini benza imithetho. [Ihlombe.] Futhi okubonakala kuyibona abakhuluma kakhulu lapha. Abesifazane bagcina bethembela esondlweni sabantwana abasinikwa nguhulumeni, naso esinganele kulesikhathi lapho intengo yokudla yedla yenyuka zonke izinsuku. Ngakho Ngqongqoshe ngabe uMnyango Wezomthetho uyasebenzisana nawo ukusiza izinkatolo zemindeni asiza abantu besifazane? [Ihlombe.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bhengu, your time has expired. In future you must time your question please. You can do that. You've done it before.

IsiZulu:

Ngakho ngicela singeqi esikhathini esisinikiwe.

English:

We mustn't add to it because it's inappropriate. You agreed with the allocation of time. We have to enforce it here. We don't make up that time. [Interjections.] So it's important that we do that. Hon Minister?
[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 102

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE WABESIFAZANE EHHOVISI LIKAMONGAMELI:

Ngiyabonga lungu elihloniphekile, Iminyango
iyasebenzisana mayelana nezinto ezithinta abantu
besifazane. Kodwa futhi kungumbono ohamba phambili ukuthi
nathi la sibheke ukuthi siyabondla yini abantwana bethu,
ngaphambi kokuthi siyokhuluma nabanye abantu abangekho
lana ukuze sihole abantu sibe yisibonelo. Ngiyabonga

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Yako?

Ms Y N YAKO: Deputy Speaker, I seem to have Question 12
which is different on my paper to the one from the
Minister. It's the one from Minister Dlamini-Zuma.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. No, we are going to proceed
beyond that now. We go to the next question which is
asked by hon Z S Dlamini-Dubazana to the Minister in the
Presidency for Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation.

Question 12:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 103

THE MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Deputy Speaker, the 14 chapters of the National Development Plan, NDP, are being implemented through the 14 outcomes of the Medium Term Strategic Framework, MTSF. The current MTSF measures the first five years towards the 2030 NDP goals and the commitments are already in the MTSF, which reports to Cabinet biannually through the programme of action.

The proposed planning resource allocation framework is also known as the Budget Prioritisation Framework, which was submitted to and approved by Cabinet in June 2018 for the financial year 2019-20 Budget.

The Budget Prioritisation Framework, through analysis of performances of the economy and government programme proposed priorities for the Budget 2019-20, set out criteria for reprioritisation of nonperforming programmes, identified areas for efficiency or savings and identified growth inhibitors for urgent intervention.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 104

The seven priorities outline and include the following.

[Interjections.]

IsiXhosa:

Ms N P SONTI: ...[Inaudible] ... Asikuva!

isiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISINI LIKAMENGAMELI: WEZOKUHLELA,

UKULANDELELA KANYE NOKUHLOLA (Dr N Dlamini-Zuma):

Ngiyabonga Sekela Somlomo, mhlonishwa siyabonga ukuthi umnyango wakho ophathiswe wona ubone kubalulekile ukuthi uke ucubungule lezi zinqubo esathi zizothathwa ukuze kuthi kufika u 2030 zibe sezithathiwe lezi zinqumo, futhi kube khona isabelomali esibekiwe ngokwe-iMTF.

Umbuzo wami ke uthi ngoba ngikuzwile uthi kunezithiyo ezimvimbela ukukhula komnono eziningi, ezinye zalezi izinto ezifana namaVisa, umbuzo wami ke usuthi, ingabe lelizwe lethu lona lizohlomula kanjani kubavakashi abeza kulo?

IsiZulu:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 105

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISINI LIKAMENGAMELI:WEZOKUHLELA,
UKULANDELELA KANYE NOKUHLOLA (Dr N Dlamini-Zuma):
ngiyabonga lunga elihlonikile uma ngabe abantu befika
bezongcebeleka, bezovakasha kuleli, okuqala bafike bafune
izindawo zokuhlala bakhokhe, uma bedla bayakhokha,
ezokuthutha bayaziyakhokhela futhi nalapho, uma
bevakashela izindawo ezibalulekile bayakhokha, kushukuthi
ngaleyo ndlela baletha imali kanti nezindawo abasuke
bekuzona kwakheka imisebenzi, ngoba lapho bekhona
bayasilekelela ekwakhiweni kwemisebenzi.Kusho ukuthi
abantu abavakashayo batshala izimali kuleli.

Uma siba phathe kahle, babuyela emuva emazweni abo bafike
batshela nabanye ukuthi siphatheke kahle ngoba kuhle,
futhi baphathe kahle ebese sebebathshela nabanye ukuthi
nawe uma ucabanga ukuvakasha, vakashela eNingizimu Afrika
Ngiyabonga.

English:

The first is to direct job creation and small business
support. So, that is the priority with strong focus on
youth and women. The second priority is economic and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 106

community infrastructure, including water, energy, knowledge and ecosystem infrastructure. The third is land reform, restitution, human settlements and agricultural support. The fourth is students, ECD and of course higher education and basic education. The fifth is health, including the National Health Insurance. Sixth is integrated, enhanced and efficient service delivery, accountability and modernising systems. The seventh is integrated plan to fight crime and ensure territorial integrity.

All these priorities are of course meant to ensure that we have a strong and inclusive economy that will enhance the capabilities of South Africans. We have a capable state with protection and services that will create jobs and increase incomes in livelihoods; that the growth is inclusive; and that we can we can reduce inequality and poverty.

It helped to guide the Medium Term Expenditure Committee, deliberation on the Budget. So, this has been taken into account in the 2019-20 Budget. Now, when it comes to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 107

economic inhibitors, and of course when we address issues like infrastructure and the proposed infrastructure fund, it is to ensure that we deal with those inhibitors because the absence of infrastructure is a growth inhibitor.

Policy certainty is some of the measures that have been taken to make sure investors certain of what policies we have and they can invest. We have also looked at issues that can enhance tourism, like visas. We are looking at the spectrum, which has been one of the issues. You know that there is an ongoing work on Eskom, to ensure that energy in this country is available so that economic growth is not inhibited.

The support of support of SMMEs, education and skills - because skills are important in the economy - township and rural economy, of course the stimulus that the President announced, the job summit and investor conference are all to do with inhibitors of the economy. Thank you. [Applause.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 108

IsiZulu:

Ms Z S DLAMINI-DUBAZANA: Ngiyabonga Sekela Somlomo,

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISINI LIKAMENGAMELI: WEZOKUHLELA,
UKULANDELELA KANYE NOKUHLOLA (Dr N Dlamini-Zuma):
Ngiyabonga kakhulu ngaleli Phalamende elihloniphekile

Ms Y N YAKO: Deputy Speaker, to the Minister, the NDP
promised all its lofty promises for South Africa on the
assumption that the economy would at least grow by 5%. We
have barely grown over 2% in the last 10 years. Is your
government still confident that the NDP will take the
country to accelerated economic growth? If so, what has
been the major failure of the past ten years? And, would
you agree, with your President as well as your Finance
Minister, that the past nine years were wasted under
Jacob Zuma? [Applause.]

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISINI LIKAMENGAMELI: WEZOKUHLELA,
UKULANDELELA KANYE NOKUHLOLA (Dr N Dlamini-Zuma):

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 109

Nginyabonga kakhulu lunga elihloniphekile. Okukuqala nje siyavumelana ukuthi uMnotho awuzange ukhule ngendlela ekade silinde ngayo. Y

Yikho sithatha zonke izinyatho esizithathayo zokuthi siwukhulise uMnotho kangcono kune ndlela okade ukhula ngayo, njengoba kade ngizibala nje zokuthi abantwana bakwazi ukufunda mahhala kusukela emazingeni we Childhood Development, ECD, futhi kube nemfundo yamahhala kwezemfundo ephakeme kulabo abangenawo amandla okuzikhokhela ngoba amakhono nobuchwepheshe kuyadingeka ukuze ukhule umnotho waseNingizimu Afrika. n

Ziningi ke izinyathelo njengoba ngike ngasho, isibonela, kamuva nje kade sinenkomfa, iSamithi yemisebenzi ebiholwa nguzakwethu yokuthi singawakhulisa kanjani umnono, kungakho sixoxisana nosomabhizinisi ukuze sazi ukuthi sizoyakha kanjani imisebenzi.

Ngakho ke zonke lezi zinyathelo ezokuthi kwakheke futhi kukhule umnotho walapha eNingizimu Afrika, ukuze abantu balapha emzantsi abahluphekayo bakwazi ukuphuma

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 110

enhluphekweni, ukuze sithole imisebenzi abantu angangasebenzi basebenze. Yonke lento esiyikhulumayo izama ukwenza lokho.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Stander! Hon members, there are two slots for supplementary questions. Is there anybody with a supplementary question that they wish to present? Go ahead, hon Motau!

Mr S C MOTAU: Hon Speaker, I was beginning to think that somebody is sabotaging me here. Minister, let's take off where we left this morning. Everything you say is what we have been saying in this House about ten years ago. We adapted the NDP. It is a great plan. You and I agree on that!

All these reviews that are being done every year - the plans and everything - are fine, but it is going nowhere. We are not anywhere near getting the targets met. I said this morning that we need a champion - either the President or the Deputy President or you, Minister, to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 111

make sure that these things that we have agreed on get done. Somebody must take accountability!

Are you prepared to be the champion to drive the NDP so that we can get those jobs and the money that you are talking about? [Applause.]

THE MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: The NDP is the programme of the country: Not of government; not of Parliament; but of the entire country. Business people, civil society and all of us must champion the NDP. However, we have a President in the country who is championing it. We have Ministers who are championing it. [Interjections.] I don't think you and me are in a position to appoint a champion - one champion. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Morutoa! Hon Morutoa!

[Interjections.] Okay, I will check that. Ja! Go ahead, hon member!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 112

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, I am sure that the hon Minister will agree with me that one of the major impediments to the implementation of the NDP over the course of the last five to 10 years has been abstinence on behalf of the ANC's alliance partners, like Congress of South African Trade Unions, Cosatu and the SA Communist Party, SACP. [Applause.]

So precisely, the point you made is absolutely right: We don't have champions in the SACP; and we don't have champions in Cosatu! The sad part is that they are sitting around the same Cabinet table with the so-called champions. What is the President and yourself doing to bring your alliance partners, like SACP and Cosatu, on board so that they stop road-blocking the NDP and open up that road for development? [Applause.]

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Hon member, for the record, I didn't say there are no champions in the SACP or in Cosatu: That is your assumption! That being said, if you look at what

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 113

happened at the Job Summit and who was there, you will find that all the partners were there. Cosatu was there.

In the Job Summit, both Cosatu and SACP, business people and government agreed on what needs to be done to try and stimulate jobs in this country as well as the economy. There were 77 programmes that were identified. It was all modelled and we could see how many jobs were feasible if proper implementation is done. So, I think to say that Cosatu is not part of championing the NDP is not accurate.

You must also remember that Cosatu is a federation for workers' unions. So, they have to ensure that workers' rights are taken care of. They have to ensure that workers earn decent salaries. So, the ANC is in alliance with Cosatu but we have different responsibilities. It is the responsibility of Cosatu to ensure that workers' rights are respected. Thank you.

Question 19:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 114

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The next question is asked by the Hon Bhengu-Kombe but hon Morutoa will take the supplementary question on her behalf.

The MINISTER OF WOMEN IN THE PRESIDENCY: His Excellency President Cyril Ramaphosa convened the summit in 2018. The summit was attended by more than 1 200 delegates from all the provinces representing victims and survivors of gender-based violence. All relevant government departments were fully represented.

The resolutions of the summit are comprehensive and cover all key aspects of gender-based violence and femicide. They resolutions provide an important platform to galvanise and act as a foundation that will see South Africa addressing this scourge. What is most important is that the outcomes of the summit are co-ordinated in the Office of the President under the able leadership of Dr Olive Shisana.

An interim steering committee is in place and is co-chaired by a member of civil society and a representative

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 115

from the Office of the President. The committee is to undertake a comprehensive review of all legislation, policies and programmes in relation to gender-based violence. The Department of Justice is reviewing the Criminal Procedure Act.

The summit delegates endorsed the President's call to all people living in South Africa to prevent and respond to gender-based violence and femicide. Firstly, to establish a multisectoral co-ordinating structure to lead and give oversight in all interventions; and secondly, for government to allocate the necessary and adequate budget and to develop a national strategic plan. We must highlight that the implementation of the summit resolutions is based on an ongoing partnership between government and civil society.

In the state of the nation address President Ramaphosa committed to "make funds available to combat gender-based violence" and have allocated funding in the current budget to support the decisions taken at the summit. The President specifically made reference by government to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 116

expand and dedicate more funds to Thuthuzela and Khuseleka Care centres.

The Department of Women has been allocated a budget of R244 million. Out of this R12 000 is allocated to gender-based violence programmes that will focus on #365Days campaign and 16 Days of No violence Against Women campaign, which will focus more on #HearMeToo campaign. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Nks M R MORUTOA: Sekela Somlomo, ngibonga kakhulu Ngqongqoshe ngempendulo yakho, yokuthi senihambe kangakanani mayelana nokuthi senihambe ngakanani ngokwezingumo zesamithi ekade ibanjiwe njengokusho kwakho. Siyayibonga imizamo yenziwe futhi noMengameli simzwile enkulumweni yakhe yesizwe ngokuthi uhlose ukwenzani, kepha usekusihlupha kakhulu ukubonakala kokudlondlobala kodlame lwasemakhaya ikhalukazi phakathi kwamakhosikazi nabayenu babo.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 117

Sithe uma silubuka lolu daba, sasebuza ukuthi iyiphi imizamo yokufundisa imiphakathi esingayenza? Siyifundise kusukela ebuntwaneni, siqale ECD, early childhood development, ukuthi abantu bazi ukuthi bangaphila kanjani ngokuhloniphana. Siyayibonga imizamo eyenziwayo futhi noma kunjalo siyafuna ukuthi sengeze kosekwenziwe. Siyabonga kakhulu Ngqongqoshe.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISINI LIKAMENGAMELI: Lunga elihloniphekile, siyavumelana nokuthi amakhosikazi nabantwana bamantombazane bahlukunyezwa ngabantu abasendolene kakhulu nabo, yingakho kungekho lula ukuxalula kalula lolu daba.

Kanti okwesibili, lolu daba lokuhlukumezeka kwabantu besifazane akulona udaba esulwenze lwaba ngundabamlonyeni, lapho luxoxwa khona nasemakhaya. Emakhaya abantu abaxoxi ngalolu daba, uma ngabe kukhona isehlakalo esenzekile kuvele kuthiwe udaba lo mndeni, akumele kugxambukele abantu bangaphandle futhi kugcine kuthulekile nje kunjalo.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 118

Ezinqumweni ezathathwa kwiSamithi kukhona isinqumo esithi uMnyango Wezenhlalakahle, iminyango yezemfundo zamabanga aphantsi naphezulu kanjalo nomnyango obhekelela ezabesifazane kumele ziphume nomhlahlandlela ozolandelwa nguwonona wonke umuntu eNingizimu Afrika wokugqugquzela wonke umuntu ukuthi aqonde ukuthi luyini udlame olubhekiswe kubantu besifazane kanti futhi kumele kuphinde kufundiswe ngamamalungelo kanjalo nenhlonipho abasifazane okumele banikezwe yona, kusukela emazingeni abantwana okubizwa ngokuthi “early childhood development”. Ngiyabonga kakhulu

IsiZulu:

Mnu S C MNCWABE: Ngiyabonga Sekele Somlomo, mhlonishwa Ngqongqoshe Dlamini, ngikuzwile uchaza uthi kukhona izinhlelo zokubeka izimali ukuze kwenziwe imikhankaso yokuqwashisa efana no 16 days of activism nakho konke okunye, kodwa ngifuna ukuthola ukuthi ingabe emnyangweni wakho niyasebenzisana yini noma zikhona yini izinhlelo ezibizwa ngokuthi izithangami zamadoda ukuze nisebenzisane nazo? Njengo mhlaka 24 januwari, eThekwini, KwaZulu-Natal, uNgqongqoshe Wezokuthuthukiswa koMnotho

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 119

ubesungula i-Men's Forum ebizwa ngokuthi iSouth African Men's [Inaudible.] Vision.

Izinhlelo ezifana nalezi ezifana nalzo ngoba ngempela izinhlelo ezifana nalezo ngicabanga ukuthi ziyalekelela ekufundeseni nokubuyisa isimilo kumuntu wesilisa nokumfundisa ukuthi umndeni uphathwa kanjani. Singakwenza konke kepha uma singenazo izinhlelo zokulungisa isimilo somuntu wesilisa. Ngicela ukuthi ukubheke ukuthi ubambisana kanjani nezinhlaka ezinjenga lezi

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISINI LIKAMENGAMELI: Lunga elihloniphekile, bonke abantwana, abafana namantombazane, kumele sibabheke ngokulinganayo. Okwesibili sesibe nazo izingxoxo nabo besilisa ezokuqala zazibanjelwe eQwaqwa, sabanamahloni nabanye ozakwethu ngesikhathi sikuleya ndawo abantu besilisa bengafuni ukuzwa ukuthi abantwana babo bamantombazane sebehlukunyezwe kangakanani.

Babengale kwezinkulungwane ezinhlanu abaselisa ababekhona baphuma bagcwala igceke saze sahamba sayobalanda sathi

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 120

kubo wozani nizolalela kanti siyasebenzisana nabamadoda nabafana, kanjalo namaKhosi kakhulu.

Okubalulekile ukuthi abantu ofuneka bangene babe yingxenye yomkhankaso abantu besilisa ngoba ibona abanenkinga. Sinane robhothi futhi labantu besifazane esaqala ngalo, laphe abantu besifazane abasebasha bathi khona cha akuthina abanenkinga la abantu besilisa abantu abanenkinga ngakho asisize bona ngerobhothi lokuthi bakwazi ukuzibheka uma ngabe sebenothuthuva. Siyabonga.

Nks N K F HLONYANA: Ngiyabonga Sekela Somlomo.

English:

Ms N K F HLONYANA: Our justice system is failing the women of South Africa, from police stations where they are turned away to courts where they get humiliated by lawyers who force them to re-live their trauma. It is obvious that the justice system needs to be transformed and your department should be at the forefront of this fight. So, we want to know what you are doing and what proposals you have made so that we can transform our

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 121

justice and ensure that it is capacited to deal with gender-based violence. Minister ...

IsiZulu:

Nks N K F HLONYANA: Siyacela Ngqongqoshe ukuthi uwuphendule kahle lo mbuzo, usinikezele ngemininingwane yokuthi lokhu kuzokwenzeka ngubani, nini kanjani? Siyabonga.

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What are you rising on, Member?

IsiZulu:

Nks M S KHAWULA: Uxolo, sekela Somlomo, bengithi uNgqongqoshe ake achaze kabanzi ngerobhothi ngoba asazi ukuthi yini irobhothi?

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon Khawula, you have no business to be rising. No, that is not a point of order. Please take your seat.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 122

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISINI LIKAMENGAMELI: Ngomhlaka 9 ku Agasti, uMengameli wasungula umkhankaso werobhothi okusho ukuthi uma kubomvu uma ungumuntu wesifazane osemusha phuma uphele kulobo budlelwane ngoba uzofa. Izimpawu zokukuqwashisa okungumbala oqanda yilapho eseba nomona ekunqabela ukuthi uphume athimbise ukuthi uzobulala abantu bomndeni wakho. Uma ngabe kuluhlaza yilapho kusazwana khona ebudlelwaneni, futhi kusahamba kahle. Kanti futhi njalo uma sinemicimbi ekuseni ngo 6h00 uzosithola sisemarenki sikhuluma ngalo leli robhothi, sikhulumisana nabantu.

Okunye okulandelayo siyavuma ukuthi kunezinhla zikahulumeni ezingakaqali kahle ukulungisa izinto ezithinta abantu besifazane kodwa nje amaphoyisa asenezindaweni noma amagumbi lapho othi uma ufike khona izinto zakho bazibambe kahle.

Akuyona iNingizimu Afrika kuphela okwethu ukuthi sisho uma ngabe kukhona izindawo ezinenkinga ngoba sisonke lana simele bonke abantu baseNingizimu Afrika. Ukukhombana

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 123

ngeminwe esikhathini esiningi kuyafuneka, kepha asithi sikhomba ngeminwe sibe sibheke phambili.

Nasezinkantolo imbala, thina sifuna imithetho efana neye-Sexual Offences Act kanye nowe-Domestic Violence Act ibuyekezwe ngoba ikhona nje kodwa ayisebenzi kahle, ngakho ke yizo kanye lezi zinto esizibhekayo ezihambisana nohlelo lokulinganiswa kobulili, ehambisana nesithunzi sakho njengomuntu, wazi ukuthi unelungelo emzimbeni wakho, futhi akekho umuntu okumele uthole imvume kuye uma uthi awusamfuni. Ukwazi ukuzimela ngisho nakwezomnono.

English:

Dr P MAESELA: Minister, in view of the fact that we have the scourge of gender-based violence throughout the country especially young men against young girls, what is it that you'll do to try and ameliorate this situation because the root cause of this is definitely power relationships, especially the economic power? We think that young children can be trained for fit so that they can be useful members of society and be productive; and be taught what it means to be a patriot. We are not

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 124

teaching our children patriotism hence there is no cohesion. We ask you to concentrate on this call by trying to eliminate poverty among our people. Thank you.
[Time expired.]

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISINI LIKAMENGAMELI Ngicabanga ukuthi okugala nje kuyajabulisa ukuthi uzwe iPhalamende lixoxa ngezindaba zodlame lwasemakhaya, ukuze sibone ukuthi wonke umuntu uyathinteka.

English:

... we must remember that violence did not just erupt in South Africa and it is not automatic that we can't control it. We are from a violent past. But, the destruction of the family as the basic unit of communities has also contributed a lot to violence against women and children.

IsiZulu:

UNGQONGQOSHE EHHOVISINI LIKAMENGAMELI: Kodwa enye into okufanele siyazi ukuthi iyenzeka, ukunxenxana kuyenzeka

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 125

ngoba imithetho singayishaya kepha uma singaxoxisani, iqiniso nje ukuthi konke lokhu kumayelana namandla nokulawula kungakho nje emisebenzini abanye abaphathi emuva kokunikezela ngocansi umsebenzi ukhokhelwa ngokunikwa isikhundla, nothisha ngokunizela ngocansi umfundi ukhokhelwa ngamamaki, nakwezinye izindawo abantu besifazane emuva kokunizela ngocansi bakhokhelwa ngokuthile. kungenxa yokuthi asigxili ezintweni eziyiqiniso ezenza kube khona udlame futhi lungalawuleki, lubhebhetheke nsuku zonke.

Abantu besilisa nsuku zonke ngisho nabafana abancane bazizi ukuthi bangaphezulu kwamantombazane ngokwengqondo nangayo yonke into okwedlula abasedifazane. Ngiyabonga

Question 23:

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION:

Deputy Speaker, the question is whether I have proposed any amendments to the Ministerial Handbook to Cabinet, and that is currently under review since my appointment in this position? The answer is yes, I have proposed quite a number of amendments and there's a lot of work

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 126

that has happened with regard to the review of the Ministerial Handbook thus far.

The president has returned the amended version and asked that we incorporate the work that the department is currently ceased with, which includes amongst others, the work on the micro-configuration of the state.

The proposed amendment on the handbook based on regulation 66 of the organizational structure and the staff establishment in the offices of Ministers, Deputy Ministers, Premiers and MECs; and that the role of Cabinet, the parliamentary function, the executive and legislative offices as per the imperatives of our Constitution and the appropriate nomenclature for each function.

Ms D VAN DER WALT: Deputy Speaker, we would note that this reviewed Ministerial Handbook is been - some way for years ... I'm glad that the President has given it attention and returned it; now let's see how quick we move.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 127

However, it is also common knowledge that the serious austerity measures should be included and of course, implemented in the revised Ministerial Handbook. After all, the people's money should be spent on the people and not on the executive's offices, cars, homes, travelling and security.

Chapter 8, specifically, has been grossly violated by your predecessor, Faith Muthambi, as the final investigation report of the Public Service Commission, PSC - which we received about a week ago - highlight it. For example, the allowed 10 posts were exceeded by 100%, the awarding of salaries above the minimum notch to at least five employees and the approval for deviation from certain salary levels of certain posts were all found to be irregular.

Now, Minister, what action has been taken, either by you or be recommended by you to the President and the Speaker since this ex-Minister is still sitting as a Member of Parliament, MP? Will this then ... this type of transgression be accommodated in the revised Ministerial

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 128

Handbook so we don't have this? But we need action, and I'm sure you would agree that this cannot be allowed.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION:

Deputy Speaker, the hon member has gone on to a question that she has already asked with regard to my predecessor, hon Faith Muthambi. But what we have done as a department is that we have looked at all of the issues that you are raising.

As I said earlier on, the President has brought back the amended version of the Ministerial Handbook for us to incorporate quite a number of things, including those issues that you have raised. For instance, regulation 66, clearly stipulates how it is that you need to appoint, as an MEC or as the Premier or Minister or Deputy Minister, and it also talks about a number of individuals that can be appointed and over a period of how long.

The amendment that we are proposing is that the part that speaks to three years at the appointment of the people

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 129

that are in Minister's offices should fall away and it should be linked to the term of office.

One of the other things that we are also considering is that for those functions that I have outlined, which are your Cabinet and your parliamentary functions, those individuals must be appointed on the establishment of the organisation, rather than offices of Ministers. Thank you.

Mr D H KHOSA: Deputy Speaker, thanks hon Minister for that response to that question. However, one would want to understand as to what are really the proposed areas for such amendments? Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon Deputy Speaker, amongst those areas that we have proposed amendment to is the processes in areas including air travel by members, the procurement of official vehicles for members, to cater for members with special needs due to disability, support staff and cost associated with travelling abroad by members, the use of official and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 130

private residences and the obligations of the state in this regard.

Ms T C MEMELA: Deputy Speaker, my question to the Minister is: Whether she has been able to meet with the Minister of Justice and Correctional Services to address issues pertaining to the functioning of various specialised units such as family violence, child protection and sexual offences unit and what is her intended plan of action in this regard?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, it doesn't look like it's relevant to you. [Interjections.] Yes, yes.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION: No, you are so right, Deputy Speaker. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you must wait to be recognised. I know the zeal. [Interjections.] Yes, yes. That's a different question.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 131

Hon members, there are two slots. Anybody, any takers?

Hon Paulsen!

Mr M N PAULSEN: Deputy Speaker, I did press the button here but I think because it is hon Mkhali's button you didn't recognise it.

Minister, given that the President and the Cabinet weren't granted any increases in salaries, is there an undertaking that the amended handbook won't try to compensate them via new benefits, at all? You can't trust the ANC; you guys are sneaky like that. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon Deputy Chairperson, the member is missing [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No Minister, the Deputy Chairperson is next door.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION:
Deputy Speaker.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 132

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION:

Deputy Speaker, the member himself is sneaky. He knows very well that this matter will not find a place in the Ministerial Handbook. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any other political party? I see hon van der Walt but we usually would like to spread it. If there's no one [Interjection.] Sorry? No, no, no, wait, wait, there's no one ... hon member, proceed. I'm only doing it because you are colleague from arts and culture. [Laughter.]

Ms D VAN DER WALT: I'm so glad, Deputy Speaker. We come a long way. We are sort of veterans now. [Laughter.]

Chairperson, can the Minister pleased be very specific, did she make any recommendations on the transgressions of her predecessor? And you cannot have the same rules for the same department; some departments should not even

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 133

exist but they have the same privileges as a major department. Can she please answer these two questions?

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon Deputy Speaker, Question 22 by the same hon member says: What steps will be taken against Ms A F Muthambi by her department? On the very same issues that she raises on the number of people that were appointed and the irregularity in the way that people have been appointed? So, I will answer that when I get to Question 22.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Wait, let's wait. Let me see. What question is that? Which question are you referring to, Minister, that you'll answer when that happens?

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION:
Question 22.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 134

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I don't have Question 22 here, let me just see. No, I don't see that, I don't see that. Hon Minister, just answer it. You will ignore it when we get there.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION:
Deputy Chairper ... Deputy Speaker, my apologies again.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It's okay.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND ADMINISTRATION: The responsibility to take action against any Member of Parliament is not the responsibility of the Minister of Public Service and Administration. Thank you.

Question 5:

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: Deputy Speaker, the question refers to the informal traders. Our response is that the informal sector provides employment and income to millions of people who otherwise would have no other means of survival. The sector has become the breeding ground for

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 135

entrepreneurship, with families passing the practical skills from one generation to the other. In terms of the informal business sector, it needs to be nurtured and supported and we are doing just that, as government.

In order to ensure that maximum support is provided to informal traders, the Department of Co-operative Governance has lodged a few programmes. Municipalities are encouraged to develop clear realistic policies on supporting and developing informal enterprises, to ensure their welfare and growth. This matter was discussed in the last Ministers and members of the executive council, Minmec, meeting with the MECs responsible for local government, and the South African Local Government Association, Salga.

These programmes are the Revised National Framework for Local Economic Development 2018 to 2028, the formalisation of the Informal Economy Programme and the discussion on street trading, operations, spaza shops and the development of bylaws.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 136

The Department of Co-operative Governance, in collaboration with the Department of Small Business Development has launched a programme to formulate national guidelines on street trading, the operation of spaza shops, the development of bylaws, and how to protect South African informal traders.

We have noticed a policy gap and government must move an extra mile to protect the informal business sector, support it and provide dedicated and targeted access to finance, which small businesses can utilise.

The programme seeks to address a few issues. One is the lawlessness in the sector where everyone operates a spaza shop or without applying for permits, and also respect for other bylaws and laws of the land. There is either weak or no municipal bylaw enforcement, which causes chaos in some towns and cities.

We need to ensure that bylaws and regulations promote entrepreneurship, while preventing lawlessness and proliferation of illegal businesses and trading of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 137

illicit goods. Obtaining trading licenses for our citizens should be simplified and reinforced by regular inspections to ensure compliance.

There is a lack of a uniform approach to the promotion of legal street and township trading and also the protection of South African traders

Government has been confronted with complains by local traders about being driven out of the sector in townships and other central business district areas in many towns and cities. Government takes this matter seriously and is looking to find ways to regulate this sector, while strengthening local traders, as it is done in other countries.

There is currently no national approach to support municipalities in regulating and developing this sector. We also need to clarify the role of provincial Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, departments in this new policy proposed direction. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 138

Mr J J DUBE: Deputy Speaker, in view of the current challenges, how will the department ensure that the municipal police are bound by the said policy, to ensure compliance with the bylaws?

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: I think this is a matter of communication. It is also a matter of ensuring that we interact with all the municipalities to ensure that their bylaws are in keeping with the spirit that we have just expressed. We must also ensure that, when the different municipalities deal with the area of local economic development, the informal business sector is a bigger part thereof that always needs to be supported.

Therefore, we will always discourage the police from brutalising the informal traders. It is important to just guide them in terms of where they should trade, how they should get their permits and then oversee that process.

There is no need for them to be very harsh to this particular sector.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 139

At the same time, we need a lot of communication between the municipal officials and the informal traders, to eliminate any form of corruption, bribery, fraud, particularly, to get access to the licenses and trading spaces.

It is also important to make sure that illegal activities are actually prevented, not just by the police and municipal officials, but the traders themselves. So, you need a platform or forum that ensures that everyone co-operates, so that they weed out illicit trade and goods as well as illegal activities. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Sekela Somlomo, bengizocela kube imina ozodlulisa umbuzo egameni lo mfwethu.

SEKELA SOMLOMO: Akocela ngaphambi kokwenza kanjalo, Kodwa kulungile qhubeka, Nkosi yami.

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Ngiyabonga Sekela Somlomo, Ngqongqoshe Mkhize, umhlonishwa uzwakala kahle

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 140

encazelweni ayibekayo, kepha umuzwa okhona, mhlonishwa yilowo wokubuka ukungcola okukhona emigaqweni yasemadolobheni akhithi ngenxa yokwenza kwalabo esisuke sikjabulela ukuthi bayaziphilisa.

Uma uKhabazela ethi ke akube khona ukubambisana koMasapala nabo ngokwabo, mhlampe uma isandla sithambe kakhulu kuzoqhubeka lokhu kungcola kakhukazi uma ubuka ukuvikelela kwemvelo la khona omakhenikha bekhandela khona izimoto onqengemeni lo mgwago, bashiye uwoyela okuthi uma kunetha izimvula ziyongena emapayipini nasemifuleni wamanzi okugcina kufa izilwane emanzini, ngakho ke kungakuhle Ngqongqoshe Khabazela ukuthi embonweni omuhle kangaka nokubavikela kodwa kube khona ukuthi kulandelelwa ukuthi kuqinise isandla ekuvikeleni lezi zinto, okungenani kube khona lezi zindawo ozishoyo ukuthi bakhelwe izindawo zokudayisela.

UNGQONGQOSHE WOZOKUBUSA NOBUHOLI BENDABUKO: Ngiyabonga kakhulu Sekela Somlomo, ngiphinde ngibonge kwilunga elihloniphekile, Ndabezitha, siyakuvumela kulokhu, iNkosi ekushoyo ukuthi uma kukhona izinkinga ezinjengokungcola

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 141

kanye nokuthi abantu benze noma inkanjani kuyahlupha kodwa into engayibona, sengathi iye isebenze yokuthi abantu bafundwe bese kwakhiwa izakhiwo ukuze basebenzele kuzo, kugwemeke le nkinga

Inkinga enkulu evamise ukuhlupha ukuthi uma kunezakhiwo abomthetho babambisane nathi futhi babatshele abantu ukuthi asikudinga uma kuyindawo engafanelekile, ngaleyo ndlela kubanjiswane futhi kukhuzwane. Ezindaweni eziningi lapho kukhona uthola ukuthi abantu basebenza ngendlela ehloniphekile bese kuba khona izindawo lapho uthola kukhona abantu abafuna ukuyenza ibe kwampunzi idla emini nje. Lapho uma esefikile uvele afake ixhokovana lakhe engabe esanaka ukuthi ungcolisa kangakanani.

Inkinga kodwa ehluphayo kakhulu ubuningi babantu kakhulukazi ezindawo eziphathelene nokudla, abantu bayahluba ngoba bahluba balahle phansi nje, ngakho ke kumele sifundise abantu bakithi ukuthi uma udayisa lapha umgqomo kadoti useduze, umuntu makahambe ayolahla kuwo, ebese kuvele kube khona labo abazilahlela phansi nje,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 142

bese ungasakwazi ukubona ukuthi kulahle umdayisi noma umthengi.

Kwezinye izindawo, kuyinkinga nokuzama ukuthi leyondawo ihlanzeke, akusebenzeki uma abantu bekhona, ngokwazi kwami kunamadolobha engaziyo ukuthi bake bafike abasebenzi bezoshanela bayihlanze indawo ekuseni kepha kuthi masekushaya izikhathi zokuphuma kwelanga kube sekungcolilel futhi ngenxa yalobo budedengu.

Ukusho ukuthi kumele sibambisane, ngoba into engiyibalekelayo ukuthi, akungathiuma abantu bezama impilo kodwa sibe singabalelekeleli kuna lokho sijahеле ukuthi umthetho awiqine kodwa singenayo indlela yokuthi baphile, ngoba phela inkulu le mboni kodwa ubukhulu sengathi kungaba khona ukuhlanzeka, kube khona ukuhlonishwa komthetho kodwa ubukhulu bayo, kube khona ukubambisana ngoba kukhona izindawo eziningi lapho uthola khona ukuthi abantu ngeke bakwazi ukuphila ngaphandle kokuthi basebenze kulawo mabhizinisi, siyabonga,

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 143

Mr K J MILEHAM: Deputy Speaker, I would like to thank hon Dube for asking a question that highlights the fact that even the ANC in Parliament is questioning the failures of ANC-led municipalities in the way they interact with informal traders.

In the Western Cape, DA-run municipalities are providing business skills training for informal traders. They are registering them and monitoring them and making them responsible for the maintenance and care of their trading areas.

When is the ANC going to copy the successful DA policies and programmes in dealing with informal traders, to provide them with those skills and with a trading environment and opportunities conducive to the growth of their businesses? [Interjections.] Thank you.

The MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS: I cannot take it away from you that you have to work for the sense of advantage of the DA, but what you are saying is not correct. The reality is that we have

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 144

been ... There are many municipalities where ... Let me give you an example. We have just talked about Ethekwini where we trained people in food hygiene and they got accreditation. They were given training so that they look after the space. You can sit under a bridge in a nice and normal restaurant with no problem.

Even the issues of food poisoning can be traced right to the person. We have those programmes there, but the towns are big and many. You can count any number. Even here, if you go out here in Cape Town, you are going to find this kind of problem to get people to clean areas where they operate from. You get a lot of those problems everywhere. It is happening in some of the areas and some areas need more attention.

What we are avoiding is what is happening here where there are suburbs where you cannot see traders because it is written, no traders and hawkers. That is not necessary because people can actually trade. All we need to do is to ensure that we regulate the thing properly. We must

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 145

also make sure that where people are able to sell, they manage the issue of refuse removal properly.

This is something you have to do everywhere, but it does not reflect the failure of ANC municipalities. Even here you have the same problem that you find in other municipalities.

IsiZulu:

Mnu S C MNCWABE: Ngiyabonga Sekela Somlomo, kunodaba lana mhlonishwa olumayelana nalaba abadayisa emgaqweni, ngaphambi kokuthi badayise kuye kumele babe nezimvume zokudayisa ezitholakala komasipala kuphela. Uthola ukuthi noma sebezifakile lezo izicelo zabo noma amalayisensi ukuze bakwazi ukudayisa kodwa kunokubambezeleka okuwundendende nje kuhle kokufa kwekati ngasohlangothini lukaMasipala ukukhupha lama layisensi.

Ngenkathi besalinde lokho uma kuqhamuka amaphoyisa kaMasipala babaleka kuchitheke impahla zabo zokudayisa kodwa inkinga ibe ikuye umasipala ngokungakhiphi

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 146

lamalayisensi ngesikhathi. Siyacela ukuthi umnyango wakho ungake ukubheke lokhu.

UNGQONGQOSHE WOZOKUBUSA NOBUHOLI BENDABUKO: Sekela Somlomo, ilunga elihloniphekile ngiyalivumela nalo, kungakho ukuthi kumele siqinisekise ukulandelwa kokunikezelwa kwezimvume zokudayisa kubona bonke abantu abadayisa ezindaweni ezimgaqweni ngoba inkinga ikhona nakubona oMasipala kanti kwesinye isikhathi akuyona nale nkinga yalaba inkinga yamabhizinisi ngendlela abasebenza ngayo ngokuthi bathatha isikhathi uma kumele kukhishwe izimvume, leyonto yenza ukuthi umuntu odayisa emgaqweni agcine edayisa ngaphandle kwmvume efunekayo.

Kwenye indawo bagcina bengazange bangena kwakungena nhlobo ngoba imvume abayidingayo ayitholakele, iyonanto okumele sibhekane nayo ngqo ukuthi oMasipala kube iyona nto abazwelayo kuyo, ukuthi uma kunesicelo esifakiwe sokudayisa sisheshe silungiswe ngoba lokhu kubangela ukuthi basukelane namaphoyisa ngento ngempela uma ibi gxiviziwe wanikwa yona bengeke imhluphe njengomdayisi.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 147

Njengoba sikhuluma ngalolu hlelo sizama ukulungisa zonke lezo zinto kodwa sifuna ukudlulela nasekutheni asifuni kuthi sizwakale sengathi labo abadinga izimvume ayisheshise itholakale abangafakwa amaphoyisa, ebese kuvuleka igebe lokhu nalabo abafuna ukwenza umkhonyovu bangene kalula, sifuna kube nomehluko lapho.

Nks M KHAWULA: Sekela Somlomo, ake ubatshela bathule ngoba nami ilungelo lami leli, bengicindezelile lana emshini kodwa angikhonjwa ngifuna ukwazi ukuthi kungani?

SEKELA SOMLOMO: lalala ke mhlonishwa Khawula.

English:

Hon members, there is no guarantee that when you press, you will be given a chance to speak. The decision about who gets to speak is the presiding officer's discretion to spread political parties, to spread male and female members and to have as much diversity as possible. That authority is in the Chair, ma'am. That is why you were not able to be spotted to speak. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 148

[Interjections.] Of course, we spread joy, hon Steenhuisen.

Ms N K F HLONYANA: Hon Deputy Speaker, you are so generous today, can you just ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, we are done. There is no generosity. It has ended. I have ... Hon member, no.

IsiZulu:

Nks MS KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga Sekela Somlomo, cha angisekho lapho. Angisekho lapho.

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, the answer is no. Please, take your seat.

IsiZulu:

Nks MS KHAWULA: Awazi ngizothini, uyakhumbula ukuthi nami ngeza ngazo funga

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 149

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, please, take your seat. We are done with that.

IsiZulu:

Nks M KHAWULA: Kanti uvele uthi cha nje ungasezwanga nokuthi bengifuna ukuthini

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Khawula, please man. I have said that ...

IsiZulu:

Nks M S KHAWULA: Ngicela ungilalele ukuthi ngifuna ukuthini.

Nks M S KHAWULA: Angilwi ngifuna ungilalele ukuthi ngifuna ukuthini, angikuphikisi okushoyo futhi angilwi nawe. Ngiyazi kufanele ngikuhloniphe kuleso sihlalo sakho. Mina nje kuphela ngifuna ukuthi uma ungitshela bese ngiyakulalela. Ukuthi ngifuna ukubuza okuncane nje

SEKELA SOMLOMO: Ufuna ukuthini mhlonishwa Khawula

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 150

Nks M KHAWULA: bengithi mina ngokuzayo anositshela ngoba njengamanje angazi noma ulwa nami ngoba nakhu ngingqoke izingubo ezibomvu yini. Kungoba kungakokuqala

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, you are not allowed. Take your seat. You are not allowed. No. Ignorance of the ...
[Interjections.]

Isizulu:

Angikwazi ukukufakazela lokho, ngiyaxolisa. Sibongile.

Nks M KHAWULA: Ngidedele ngibuze kancane

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, No, you are not allowed, you are not allowed, take your seat.

Isizulu:

Nks M KHAWULA: Kodwa ungowakithi njalo uMkhize

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 151

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ignorance of the law is not an excuse

Isizulu:

No, Mam Khawula, ngicela uhlale phansi, uyeke ukhuluma

English:

I am switching off now. What are you rising on?

IsiXhosa:

Nks N P SONTI: Ndicela ukubuza Sekela Somlomo, ingaba awuliva na ela qela labantu likwela cala? Awuliva ela qela likwela cala? Ukuze ulive iqela labantu kufuneka ulive kweli cala lempahla ezibomvu? Awuliva ela qela labantu lingaphaya?

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, what is your point?

[Interjections.]

IsiXhosa:

Nks N P SONTI: Yile nto ndikuxelela yona, yokuba awuliva na ela qela labantu lingaphaya? Unecala wena Sekela

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 152

Somlomo. Unecala wena. Uyaliva na ela qela labantu
lingaphaya?

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You have asked your question. Take
your seat then. [Interjections.]

IsiXhosa:

Nks N P SONTI: Ndiphendule ke, ndiphendule.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat. I would like to refer
this matter to the Chief Whips of ... [Interjections.]
Hon member! Hon Whips of all parties, I am going to refer
this to the forum of the Chief Whips. I don't think any
presiding officer is going to allow this to happen once
more. In the few days remaining, we are going to act, I
am afraid, in ways that are not pleasant. The Rules are
clear. The conduct of members in the House must be
according to the Rules. We will not allow this to happen
again.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 153

**CONSIDERATION OF 2019 FISCAL FRAMEWORK AND REVENUE
PROPOSALS AND OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE IN FINANCE**

Ms T V TOBIAS: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon members, the debate on the fiscal framework is an important pace setter for any government as it sets policy from a micro economic perspective. This policy framework is often challenged by opposing forces as they try to come with alternative policy positions. Moreover, the South African fiscal framework takes place in the middle of an election. Therefore, one would be not surprised by robust engagements which might be persuaded this evening. But, having said the above, the budget has outlined economic and fiscal measures for economic growth and management of our country's finances. This fiscal policy therefore, will be balanced between commitments and available funds. It will strengthen confidence, investment and growth and it also demonstrates revenue collected and it will avoid sovereign downgrades and will ensure sustainable economic recovery.

Sesotho:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 154

Setjhaba se ratehang, mmuso wa Afrika Borwa o nkile mehato ho tlosa bofuma ka hara setjhaba. Leano lena le fumaneha tokomaneng ya mokgatlo wa ANC eo eleng mokgatlo o busang e bitswang "manifesto". Mopresidente wa naha Ntate Ramaphosa, puong ya hae ya pulo ya palamente selemong sena, o hlalositse hore mmuso o tla potlakisa kgolo ya moruo wa naha ebile mmuso o tla etsa mesebetsi le ho hlabolla thuto le ho nehelana ka bokgoni eleng "skills development, ho ntshetsa maphelo a batho pele. Ebile o phetetse ho hlalosa hore mmuso wa Afrika Borwa o lwantshana le bobodu. Ke ka hoo re bonang ho ena le dikomishene tse bitswang "State Capture" ho lekola le ho tlosa bobodu.

English:

Having said this, the South African government should continue to restore policy certainty and structures of parliament needs to continue to hold the executive to account on policy imperatives presented by the State President.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 155

Policy formulation used to be balanced with policy implementation. The Parliamentary Budget Office emphasises the importance of implementation of policy actions that are aimed at ending uncertainty that undermines confidence. Therefore, constraining private sector growth is a key issue for accelerated economy growth and the budget had a R19.8 billion that has been allocated specifically for industrial business incentives as part of the above objectives.

A question was also raised whether as part of both our fiscal and monetary policy we should raise higher taxes. Some asked whether we should focus on real Gross Domestic Product (GDP) growth. Some even asked whether debt to GDP be at 100% to real GDP. And, some even suggested that we are on a fiscal cliff and allege that debt service cost will absorb all South Africa's revenue.

As the debate continues, the role and performance of State Owned Enterprises (SOEs) will be under the radar, especially Eskom and SAA. The Wage Bill will also be discussed and of course State Capture. The elephant in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 156

the room is the ballooning Wage Bill hon Minister, which at some point needs a frank discussion between all sectors but above all, the creativity of the public sector to engage private sector lies in the support that all will give to the noble ideas presented by our President.

One of the fundamental engagements during the public hearings was laffer curve but what people failed to take into account was the performance of both the Chinese and American fiscal frameworks. And the fact in both China and America has revised their fiscal frameworks down, which has an impact on the economies of the world.

One of the primary objectives remains to narrow our primary deficit by addressing challenges and our budget. The debt interest payment, revenue shortfall and tax. The new dawn has ushered in a new growth path which will increase GDP growth and now hon members, let's report the facts on revenue collection. Revenue collected is not adequate as the shortfall has increased to 42.8 billion for 2018/19. And this is attributed to the weak economic

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 157

growth and tax buoyancy. Hence the 1% ration between the economic growth and tax buoyancy. So those who understand the laffer curve will know what I'm talking about.

The allocation to Eskom of 69 billion is key driver to the above performance. We therefore raised concerns on the SOEs. Debt redemptions of 40 billion which continues to be high was also been raised. We are also concerned that returns on equities are declining and capital investment figures are negative, therefore a balancing act is highly met. We also applaud, I repeat, we also applaud the mitigation action taken by the President to reduce the size of government.

Spending has remained unchanged and therefore we need interest spending and budget revenue to break even. Therefore, a base line reduction of 50 billion over three years is off sated against provincial allocations of 75 billion. These are the facts. This is the action we are taking. Having provided this picture, let me pause and celebrate officials at National Treasury for raising contingency reserves which increased by R6 billion

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 158

Minister. Bravo to this team for being able to deal with a challenge that some will have not even envisaged. Never had I personally been excited amid these economic challenges that a department can avert a debt service caused by still saving for future consumption. We also understand that the expenditure ceiling is revised up by 16 billion over the medium term which primarily will be to address the demands of SOEs.

But, hon members all is not lost because the President in the SONA debate did indicate that Eskom has adopted a 9 point plan turnaround strategy, not only that, resources will be merged to plans and three entities will be established as part of forging partnerships namely: generation, transmission and distribution and I repeat, but the greed hon members, will continue to be owned by the state least they have interest to take all the South African resources.

Some today will argue that loans awarded to Eskom should be converted to equity. This will be an irrelevant suggestion as the President through the council has

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 159

appointed a council that will address what has already been indicated by the President as forging partnership.

As government continues competing demands, a sustainable reprioritisation on expenditure should be taken into account. This are not austerity measure hon members, hence the trade-off. The revised expenditure sealing and growth of debt to GDP is a typical example of this trade off. But, there's a need to raise taxes. I also need to applaud National Treasury for increasing social spending, the framework is pro-poor in terms of percentage terms learning and culture was increased by 7.6%, social development by 7.3%, health by 7% which the DA will never like when we ensure that Black people who are poor and uneducated are taken care of by the ANC led government. 1.5% percent growth rate is possible especially in the outer years, there is evidence that we'll be able to collect 2.1%.

And because I don't have time hon members, as I conclude allow me to quote Sun Tzu in his book The Art of War when he said "It is the unemotional reserved, calm, detached

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 160

warrior who wins, not the hotheaded seeking vengeance and not the ambitious seeker of fortune." And also allow me to quote the Tao Te Ching that "Those who are good at night. I thank you

Mr R A LEES: Deputy Speaker, exactly a year ago to the day, my colleague hon Maynier and I, welcomed the then new Minister of Finance, Nhlanhla Nene, back to Parliament. Here we are a year later and we have yet another new Minister of Finance. Last year we quoted the Minister of Finance, Derek Keys, from 28 years ago who confronted the Cabinet at the time with what he called filthy pictures, illustrating the fact that the economy was, in his words, "buggered."

Last year we pointed out that the economy on the 6 March 2018 was also "buggered" and that a huge task lay ahead for Minister Nene. Well a year into Ramaphosa presidency and two new Finance Ministers ... [Interjections.]

Mr N PAULSEN: Deputy Speaker.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 161

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes hon member. I am sorry hon Lees, can you please take your seat?

Mr N PAULSEN: Since when is the word "buggered" become an acceptable in this Parliament? That is very vulgar and rude. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Alright, go ahead hon member.

Mr R A LEES: Deputy Speaker, well a year into Ramaphosa's presidency and two new Finance Ministers, the economy has got worse, job losses have persisted and the task facing Minister Mboweni is an even bigger one than it faced by Nhlanhla Nene a year ago. Despite the economic hardship faced by millions of our people this Parliament spent the better part of two hours yesterday bickering about the name of an airport.

Economic growth is weak, there are tax revenue shortfalls, expenditure, especially, state-owned entities, SOEs, bailouts increased despite revenue shortfalls and the budget deficit have increased for the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 162

10th year in a row. For the last 10 years, every budget has forecast that in the outer year the primary balance will show a surplus and that borrowing will slow down and allows debt to gross domestic product, GDP, levels to fall.

For 10 years those forecasts have been wrong. For the first time in post 1994 the debt to GDP level is predicted to breach the 60% level at 60,2% in 2023-24. The fact is that South Africa will pay all the interest on debt over the next three financial years by borrowing more instead of cutting expenditure.

What the inaccurate growth forecasts have enabled the government to do is to spend excessively, initially on the basis of manipulated and false SA Revenue Service, Sars, revenue collections and in the past three years on the basis of nonexistent revenue. That is why national debt will balloon to a massive R4,1 trillion, of GDP in 2023-24

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 163

The fact is that debt service costs are skyrocketing and will cost R202,2 billion in 2019-20, R224 billion in 2020-21 and R247 billion in 2021-22. There can be no doubt that unless there is a radical reduction in expenditure so as to spend within our means, South Africa will fall over the fiscal cliff, hon Tobias, when the costs of the Public Sector Wage Bill and debt service costs consume 100% of the revenue collected.

We simply cannot go on spending more than we receive. If we are serious about attracting investment for job creation we simply can't increase taxes. At a 20% rate of Corporate Income Tax, South Africa is way above the rates of our major trading and investment partners with the UK at 19% and even China at 25%. This simply leads to base erosion and profit shifting.

Surely, the Minister will give serious consideration to our repeated proposal to implement a comprehensive spending review. A comprehensive spending review could be geared towards cutting spending by, for example, reducing the size of the executive, reducing the Public Sector

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 164

Wage Bill, far more than the marginal and very uncertain natural attrition amounts that are in the budget, scrapping the National Health Insurance, NHI, and focusing on fixing the existing dysfunctional health care system and running the provincial legislatures more efficiently.

A comprehensive spending review could also be geared towards selling off state assets, which include selling assets by privatising some of the 204 public entities with the first being - I think in agreement with the Minister, SA Airways, SAA. [Applause.] It will also include selling or leasing underutilised land parcels not well located, selling government's remaining shares in Telkom and selling the Gripen jets that are in shrink-wrap somewhere in the country.

Two vital areas that the savings identified by a comprehensive spending review could be allocated to are, hon Tobias, I hope you're listening, child grants and old age pensions. It is inconceivable that the child grant is not enough even to feed a child, let alone provide for

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 165

clothes and a place to live. It is inconceivable that South Africans who were not given the opportunities to fulfil their potential and have laboured for their entire lives, barely able to feed themselves and their families, are left to live on a state pension of only R1,800 per month, which is half the minimum wage rate.

It was heartbreaking to hear the plight of "ogogo" [elderly women] from Pietermaritzburg, who travelled all the way to Cape Town, to plead their plight with Parliament. They and all pensioners who have contributed to make South Africa great, deserve better. Surely, there must now be an understanding that we must spend within our means and must implement a comprehensive spending review, such as has been successful in Australia, Canada and in the United Kingdom. I thank you, Mr Speaker.

THE DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lees, as you go to your seat, you are the second person speaking in the House, but let me rectify you that the Speaker is still Madam Baleka Mbethe, just remember that in the future. Hon Paulsen?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 166

THE CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

THE CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: We are the party of aspirations.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, but the truth is better than aspiration.

Mr N M PAULSEN: Deputy Speaker, the Fiscal Framework is a government policy on how much money we need as a country, where we will get this money and when we have it, how we are going to spend it. If the 5th Parliament has taught us anything it is the harsh reality that all the hush-hush, the secretive and the meetings taking place at night in Pretoria with the International Monetary Fund, IMF, the World Bank, and rating agencies, are evidence that South Africa is being sold to the highest bidder. That is Minister, if it has not already been sold. The pseudo communists - there is none of them here today especially, the little one that sits across there.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 167

Especially, those pseudo communists who have turned into swindlers, facilitators and stooges of Washington, Brussels and Davos.

To expect the very same people the National Treasury, Ministry and in the Ramaphosa led cabal to drive inward industrialisation, create jobs, grow the economy and maximise tax revenue collected is foolish and at best naïve. If the EFF and its 2019 manifest...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Paulsen, take your seat please.

Ms Z S DLAMINI-DUBAZANA: I rise on Rule no84. The member at the podium is using improper language in addressing the President.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ok, alright. Hon member, please address all members including the President appropriately.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 168

Mr M PAULSEN: ... I said "Ramaphosa led cabal". The EFF in its 2019 Manifesto has put forward... Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member! That is President Ramaphosa.

Mr M PAULSEN: ... in the President Ramaphosa led cabal. In its 2019 Manifesto, the EFF has put forward the most cogent, well researched and concrete plan of action to grow South Africa's economy, reduce the state debt and explore dynamic ways to industrialise South Africa. Instead of entertaining all the ideas that have failed and are exactly the reason why we are where we are today. We are going to put forward practical policy steps for the balanced fiscal framework and revenue proposal, not this nonsense of Canada, Britain and Australia where the indigenous people are oppressed and marginalised.

Deputy Speaker, the primary measure of fiscal framework must be to highlight employment targets to qualify as a fiscal framework. Any framework that fails to prioritise jobs and include clear concrete and commitment to a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 169

certain number of jobs as a result of fiscal framework is nothing but a self imposed International Monetary Fund, IMF, structural adjustment programme.

A minimum of 50% of funds allocated to local government must be used to deliver services. And 60% of all revenue raised nationally must go to local government for service delivery. Government must use a build, transfer and operate funding mechanism for all major infrastructure as a long term infrastructure financing model and emphasise state capacity building by training millions of artisans, engineers, technicians, so that when infrastructure is transferred to the ownership of the state there is no tender to maintain it but the state has capacity to maintain that infrastructure itself.

Government must immediately abolish tenders for services such as cleaning, security guards, construction, consultants, and procurement of all linen, IT service and the building of roads and other infrastructure. We must pass a special appropriation Bill to write off some debt in state-owned companies and a capable well position and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 170

competent board so that management or state owned companies can drive inwards state led industrialisation.

The fact that the ANC has increased Value Added Tax, VAT, to 15% is shocking given the high levels of unemployment, poverty and inequality. Government must bring back the 14% VAT. This is part of the fiscal framework that the EFF government will implement and will table here in after the 8th May elections. So you must go out there in South Africa and make sure that you deliver... [Time Expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired, take your seat. Hon members, I spoke about time. You can't increase your time unilaterally on your own. It is out of order.

Mr N SINGH: Deputy Speaker, I do not serve on this committee but I present these remarks in consultation with my colleague the hon Hlengwa. At the outset, I agree with the committee's observations that "The government has never before face such challenging circumstances to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 171

shape a budget that balances the need to contain expenditure and be reasonable pro-poor and developmental".

This then begs the question of how did we arrive at this state of affairs? Clearly, all that has been exposed at the Zondo Commission comes to mind. The startling revelations of deep rooted corruption to the nth degree leave a lot to be desired. To have allowed this situation to happen is an indictment on all of us but more especially on the governing party.

This state of affairs transpired on your watch. It is reported that the cost of "state capture" hovers at around R1, trillion over the second term of the Jacob Zuma administration. That is just short of the R1,8 trillion budget for 2019. That is dreadful to say the least. The revenue shortfall was mainly due to a combination of economic weaknesses, problems of poor tax administration by the South African Revenue Service, SARS, and higher than expected Value Added tax, VAT, refunds.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 172

The shenanigans at SARS have not forced that much confidence in the taxpayer. There is absolutely no more trust by taxpayers in the revenue service. It is mainly those loyal taxpayers who continuously face the burden of additional penalties etc, whilst mainly avoid paying tax at all. A case in point is those that are involved in the illicit tobacco trade.

The fuel levy is vulnerable to exploitation. This seems to be the case as the Minister has announced even further increases to it. The poorest of the poor bear the brutal brunt in the short to medium term. We cannot get our economy moving if we cannot get out people to work. We have in the past expressed our position on VAT and maintain that it should be revised down to 14%. I know it's a tall order, hon Minister. The additional fuel exemption are certainly not going to benefit the majority of our people.

I do not want to go on rant about Eskom. However, as one of the key State Owned Enterprises, SOES, of our state, Eskom must be turned around in order to inspire investor

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 173

and business confidence. And also to support small to medium enterprises.

As the IFP, we support the Report because we, just like many of you here want to see our economy thrive and more especially survive in this dire time. We submit that South Africa is awash with money. The problem is that it is not being spent effectively or disappears into people's pockets. South African taxpayers deserve better.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Deputy Speaker, the NFP will support. Let me start off by talking about economic growth, and we all know the forecasts made year in and year out are not accurate. The actual growth is much lower than what we forecast.

One of the challenges is that we talk about 200 000 jobs, but 500 000 people enter the job market every year. What we need to do is create job creators, not job seekers.

One of the things we should do immediately is clamp down totally on all fake goods in South Africa. You should deal with all the foreigners that own businesses in South

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 174

Africa and the illicit financial flows leaving the country daily where there is no control over them - a weakness in the Sars system. You should immediately reduce imports, particularly of any goods that we are capable of making in South Africa. If we don't do that, you are not going to create the jobs.

Minister, the issue of corruption is not only found at national level. What you don't know is that most of the corruption takes place at local level. Tenders are issues before they are even advertised. In a nutshell, that is what actually happens. When somebody budgets for a tender in a particular local municipality, it is already decided who is going to get the tender. I can tell you billions of rand are lost at local, provincial, and national levels. So, it is not only at the top. The question that arises is the following: How much of the money is actually being spent on services to the people on the ground? The answer is very little. If you take the compensation to employees, if you take the corruption, if you take tender fraud - the IFP, Zululand District Municipality, Nongoma, and the EFF in Limpopo province

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 175

that bankrupted the entire province in 2012, these are examples of corruption taking place on a daily basis. We don't talk about these things, but this is where the taxpayer's money is going.

Mr N SINGH: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: The hon member at the podium cannot come here and make unfounded statements. He must produce proof before he makes these kinds of statements that municipalities are corrupt in Limpopo and elsewhere.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, that is a political statement, not a point of order. Go ahead, hon member.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Let us talk about the state-owned enterprises. The NFP will not support the privatisation of Eskom or SA Airways, SAA, contrary to what my friends here want. Let us tell you what ... I think this is what I would like to hear you say in the 10 minutes you have today: You need to explain to us why it is that - and I have asked this before - when it is a private entity, it will make profits, but when it is a state-owned entity,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 176

it cannot make profits. I would like you to tell us what is happening about the Coleman guy who sold the entire fleet. The SAA is now renting our planes. Yet we have to pay, what, R2 billion or R4 billion a year in leases. You need to tell us exactly what is happening.

Let me talk about the issue of education. We spoke a lot about education. The problem is the quality of education. The NFP supports this, still. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Mr W W WESSELS: Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, order, please! Order! Stop screaming.

Mr W W WESSELS: The FF Plus supports the fact that the Minister announced that one of the steps to limit state expenditure is to place a moratorium on the salary increases of Members of Parliament and of members of provincial legislatures. The question is the following, though: Why are we not talking about the salary increases and the system of automatic performance bonuses to Senior

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 177

Management Service members of all government departments? Why are we not limiting those salary increases? That is where the actual biggest problem lies. We need a smaller Cabinet. We need fewer state departments. We need to address the ballooning wage bill.

However, we also need a definite expenditure ceiling where unauthorised expenditure does not occur. To actually limit state expenditure, growth must occur. Without economic growth, the majority of South Africans will remain dependent on social services and grants and will remain unemployed and poor. To stimulate the economy, we need tax relief for individuals and for businesses. We need to decrease the fuel levy. We need to do away with the mismanaged and corrupt Road Accident Fund and rather replace it with legislation that compels motor vehicle owners to have third-party insurance. We need to abolish e-tolls. Government should earn tax, not just collect it. We need policy certainty.

Afrikaans:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 178

Die ANC is egter bereid om voedselsekerheid en ekonomiese sekerheid op te offer met hul en die EFF se belaglike beleidsrigting van onteiening sonder vergoeding.

[Tussenwerpsels.]

English:

The best fiscal framework in the world, with the most wonderful plans, arrangements, procedures, rules, and institutions that underline the conduct of budgetary policies, will be useless if proper governance is not applied. We must start from the bottom and fix our municipalities. Local government is bleeding funds.

In order to start at the bottom, we have to begin at the top. Over a quarter of a century, the ANC-led government has proven that they cannot govern, that they are incompetent, that they are selfish, and that they are "skelm" [crooked]. We need a new government to actually grow the economy, to stimulate the economy, and to save South Africa. [Interjections.] On 8 May, South Africans do have that choice and do have that opportunity. I thank you. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 179

Mrs D CARTER: Deputy Speaker, numbers don't lie. The Budget sets out, in black and white, a stark reality – a narrative – a sad and disturbing account of how trust was betrayed, and of how the hope of building a united and prosperous nation, of realising a better life for all, was ruined.

The Budget begins to quantify and project the extent of this betrayal – of the damage that was done. It points to a difficult, painful, and uncertain future – that, if drastic remedial action is not taken and implemented right now, we are then heading straight into an ANC-made iceberg – a growing national calamity of serious economic, social and political strife and discontent that threatens our survival as a nation – a crisis that will sink us.

If we were a patient in hospital, we would be in the ICU in a critical and unstable condition, hooked up to life-sustaining machinery. Our oxygen supplies would be running out and we wouldn't know if and when the power

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 180

running our life-supporting machinery will grind to a halt.

The fact is that our nation has been looted, corrupted and mismanaged to the point of unsustainability and ruination.

In terms of economics, our economy continues to tank and stagnate. We underperform against average global growth and are growing at less than half the rate of other emerging markets. Without sustained and meaningful economic growth, we simply will not increase economic participation and inclusion, nor halt rising unemployment. Add to this the fact that, whilst the current governing party tries to feebly stimulate growth, we do so as the global economy enters uncertain times and begins to enter an era of drift, at best.

We are in an increasingly unsustainable and precarious position. Our growing debt levels are reaching the point of blowout. We are haemorrhaging, bleeding to death, as a consequence of the looting and corruption of our State.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 181

Our organs of government are bloated, inefficient and ineffective.

Cape has warned of the impending collapse governmentally, fiscally, and service delivery-wise of many of our provinces and municipalities.

Fellow South Africans, to you I want to say, today, as a nation, we face the gravest crisis ever in our country. The state has to borrow R6 billion a week. Of this, R5 billion goes towards servicing the interest on debt. Soon, the full amount borrowed will be consumed by interest payments.

This Budget is built on certain fundamental presumptions, such as the pretext that various reforms and structural adjustments will be made.

Cope questions the ability of the ruling party and its partners to agree.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 182

Re-arranging the deck chairs is not enough. We need a new captain and crew to avoid the ANC-made iceberg and to turn our ship around. To save South Africa, we need a fresh start. Thank you. [Time expired.]

Mr S N SWART: Deputy Speaker, hon Minister, the ACDP believes that the ANC-led government has failed dismally in its central economic policy goal of accelerating inclusive growth and job creation, and ensuring sustainable finances by containing the budget deficit and stabilising public debt.

We've seen that economic growth has been revised downwards to 1,5% of GDP. Of course, estimates of revenue collection have deteriorated further since October - down by R42,8 billion.

This results in an upward trajectory of the debt-to-GDP ratio, set to reach 60% in the outer years - something which is of great concern.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 183

The budget deficit - as other speakers have mentioned - is a staggering R242 billion, requiring R202 billion per year to service a gross loan debt of R3 trillion - that is R3 000 billion! This is hardly stabilising public debt.

Other speakers have also asked the question: How then did we land up in this situation?

I'm sure everyone in this House will agree that the main reason is that after 10 years of economic mismanagement and policy bungling under the Zuma administration - during which the country staggered under the dead weight of state capture - the economy just isn't globally competitive any more. Last year's technical recession and poor economic growth is evidence of the cumulative damage done to the country's competitiveness over the past 10 years.

As other speakers have mentioned, it is estimated that the country's GDP is about R500 billion - listen to this, Minister - smaller than it would otherwise have been over

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 184

the past five years. Tax revenue is estimated to be about R150 billion less. What is the most astonishing and disgraceful is that roughly 600 000 fewer jobs were created.

It is a shame that R69 billion is now to be given to Eskom. We in this House inquired into Eskom, and we exposed a lot of the fraud and corruption.

Minister, you quoted liberally from Scripture, and we are grateful for that. You stated that we are "walking through the darkest valley".

Minister, regrettably, under the ANC government, with widespread crime, state capture and corruption, we agree that we are walking through the darkest valley.

You concluded that, in the future, we "shall go out with joy, and be led forth with peace and the mountains and the hills shall break forth with singing, and all the trees of the field shall clap their hands."

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 185

We agree again. But this will happen on 8 May when South Africans turn out in numbers to reject the ANC and vote for the ACDP because "when the righteous are in authority, the people rejoice and clap their hands!" I thank you.

Ms N ABRAHAM-NTANTISO: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Ministers, members of this august House, the hon men of God from the ACDP must speak the truth and nothing but the truth. They must also decide whether they want a kingdom here, on Earth, or in the Kingdom to come.

Afrikaans:

Aan die VF-Plus, skaam vir u, as 'n leier, om hier te kom staan en in plaas van die arme mense te verteenwoordig, kla u oor u geld, u geld wat nie opgegaan het nie. Dis 'n skande om so aan te gaan. Jy is 'n leier.

[Tussenwerpsels.] [Applous.]

English:

Implemented effectively, this Budget provides a platform for renewal, inclusive growth and job creation. It

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 186

directs spending towards the country's most pressing national priorities, such as education, health, human settlements and investing in enablers of inclusive growth and job creation. We view this Budget as presenting a road map to maintaining the integrity of our public finances, while protecting social services. This is in line with the ANC's mission and vision of a corruption-free and clean government.

As stated by the President during his state of the nation address, and backed by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party, as social partners, we are restoring the bonds of trust, dialogue and co-operation. Indeed, as the Freedom Charter beckons, the people shall govern.

We support reforms to relieve policy uncertainty and blockages. These reforms are yielding results for investment in our country's economy. While we admit the projected GDP growth rate of 1,5%, in 2019, is still very low, at least it is an improvement on the 0,7% that was projected as an outcome of the implementation of these reforms. Growth in GDP is projected to strengthen

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 187

moderately to 2,1%, by 2021. The ANC believes that all stakeholders in our country need to work together, whatever our differences or affiliations, to strive to achieve this higher target.

The ANC welcomes the government's commitment to managing the budget deficit and containing public debt at sustainable levels. Changes to the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework result in the main budget deficit widening to 4,7% of GDP, in 2019-20; and then narrowing to 4,3% of GDP, by 2021-22. As a percentage of GDP, gross loan debt increases over the next three years and stabilises at 60,2% in 2023-24, which is marginally above the 2018 Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS, estimates.

We are also concerned, hon Mazambane, at the economic weakness. While administrative weaknesses in collection were also a contributing factor, the ANC welcomes efforts and urgent strategies by the President to address the challenges at the SA Revenue Service, Sars. Total tax collections for 2018-19 are estimated at R1,3 trillion.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 188

The large tax revenue shortfall and new expenditure pressures require further tax policy and spending interventions. In the context of economic weakness, the 2019 Budget tax proposals are designed to minimise the negative impact on growth. Over the medium term, tax policy adjustments will be made, as needed, to strengthen fiscal consolidation. According to the 2019 Budget Review, this year's proposals are estimated to raise tax revenue by R15 billion, in 2019-20. Further tax changes are proposed to raise an additional R10 billion, in 2020-21.

We note that consistent revenue shortfalls alongside new expenditure commitments, amongst them, free higher education, challenges in state-owned enterprises, SOEs, and the national health insurance, NHI, led to significant tax increases over the past four years. Notwithstanding these large tax increases, tax revenue as a proportion of GDP has started to decline.

To raise the revenue needed to fund its social and economic policy commitments, South Africa requires its

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 189

tax administration to be efficient, effective and impartial. Reports by the Sars Commission highlight maladministration. We know about this and we are doing something about it.

Amongst the commission's recommendations and other measures to improve our tax collection, there are the new Illicit Economy Unit and agreements between Sars and its international counterparts to fight cross-border tax-evasion schemes. The strengthening of Sars' IT systems, the revival of the Large Business Unit, the appointment of Judge Dennis Davis to deal with the issue of tax avoidance - which members know about but are not talking about - are a few of the recommendations of the commission. As the ANC's 54th elective conference resolved, government must urgently crack down on tax avoidance and illicit capital outflows.

We welcome the efforts by government to limit the negative impact on economic growth, as stated categorically by the Minister of Finance. Amongst the other democratic measures taken by the ANC-led government

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 190

was the introduction of the employment tax incentive to boost job creation. This has positive spin-offs, especially for smaller firms. In addition, older workers are not displaced here. This halts job losses. Employers tend to retain workers after the two-year eligible period passes because the employees have gained experience and on-the-job training.

The Budget has provided, as it has always done, for all vulnerable groups. The gogos [grandmothers] are acknowledging they did get an increase of R80 but they are also saying they want bonuses - which is funding that needs a budget. We listened to them. In the past, remember, the gogos were only able to get money after three months. Today, under the ANC-led government, there are a few vulnerable groups - children, elderly and disabled - and so many people are getting grants.

The focus is on young people - R30 billion has been allocated for building schools and R2,8 billion for pit latrines. So much has been added, like the R111,2 billion for students from poor communities. The ANC-led

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 191

government is working hard to ensure that South Africans have access to education from early childhood.

As we approach the upcoming elections, we remember the wise words of Madiba:

As long as many of our people still live in utter poverty, as long as children still live under plastic covers, as long as many of our people are still without jobs, no South African should rest and wallow in the joy of freedom.

We call upon the people of South Africa to go out on 8 May and vote ANC because the struggle continues for more freedoms. I thank you.

Ms G S A NGWENYA: South Africa is hemmed by crisis ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING:
Deputy Speaker, I think since we know what is in the DA's manifesto and their website and everywhere else, I want

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 192

to check with the hon Ngwenya if she is prepared to take a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Ngwenya, are you prepared to take a question?

Ms G S A NGWENYA: No, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Go ahead, hon member.

Ms G S A NGWENYA: South Africa is hemmed by crisis.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Ms G S A NGWENYA: We are hemmed because we cannot borrow our way out, we cannot tax our way out, and the needs of the indigent to circumscribe our ability to scrimp our way out. But we might, with the right policies and plans, be able to grow our way out. [Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 193

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, you can't be screaming, it's unfair.

Ms G S A NGWENYA: There has therefore never been a more pressing time ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! No! Order! Order! Go ahead hon member.

Ms G S A NGWENYA: There has therefore never been a more pressing time to get the economic growth right.

Unfortunately, details on economic growth drivers are given short thrift in this fiscal framework, and the ANC agrees. The committee report reads that:

"We agree, as raised in the public hearings, that there are very few if any economic drivers in the fiscal framework"

In other words, there is no coherent plan about how to get the country growing. The committee has suggested that such a plan be tabled at the first quarterly meeting of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 194

the next Parliament - in other words, after the election. It's a sad feature of politics that, at the very time when voters want to hear things that are bold but true, they are most likely to be given what is limp and false.

There is nothing, I have learnt, that arrests the testicles of politicians as much as an election. While we wait for the next Parliament to flesh out economic growth, the GDP outlook has been revised down from 1,7% to 1,5% due to weak employment and investment.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, that is really unfair. You can't be screaming like that. Whatever is happening, there is no justification for screaming and making a noise.

Ms T V TOBIAS: But, hon Deputy Speaker, Gwen is talking about the private parts of men!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! No! No! Order, hon members!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 195

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am talking, please! Can I appeal to you members not do what you are doing. It's out of order. It's indecent. You won't want that to happen to you when you are at the podium. [Interjections.] Go ahead, hon member.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, in terms of Rule 84 - on which the ANC jumps up every two minutes - the hon member for the SLOW Lounge referred to the hon Ngwenya by her first name. I'd ask that she withdraws that or calls her honourable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Who is that?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: The hon member for the SLOW Lounge.

Ms T V TOBIAS: Deputy Speaker, this is the second time that hon Steenhuisen accuses me of drinking and nothing

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 196

has happened to him before and I have raised it before.

[Interjections.] Hon Ngwenya was speaking about private parts of men in the House. That is why the ANC benches are protesting. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, did you mention anything about that? [Interjections.] I am not asking you, members. I am asking the hon member. Hon Ngwenya, I am asking you. Did you say anything about that? What did you say? [Interjections.]

Ms G S A NGWENYA: About what? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You heard what hon Pokolo said here. Why are you asking me that?

Ms G S A NGWENYA: What is the problem with the word "testicles"? [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, did you say it and are you asking me what is wrong with it? No! No! Wait, hon

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 197

Steenhuisen. [Interjections.] No, you can't decide that yourself.

Ms G S A NGWENYA: Deputy Speaker, in this context, it's akin to saying "spine".

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry?

Ms G S A NGWENYA: Someone has no spine - someone has no testicles. It's a well-known figure of speech.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I will come back to this. Hon member, what are you saying?

Ms G S A NGWENYA: I'm saying, similar to accusing ...

[Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Ngwenya, please hold on. Yes, hon member?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you, Speaker.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 198

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Deputy.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you, out-going Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That's more accurate!

Mr M N PAULSEN: Yes, I know that! We will never allow the ANC to ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, put your point!

Mr M N PAULSEN: You allowed the first DA speaker to use really crude terms like bugging and now this one is using men's anatomy. [Interjections.] So I can say "fokol" whenever I want to. [Interjections.] And you are doing fokol about it. [Interjections.] You are doing fokol about the use of crude terms and men's anatomy ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Paulsen, I think you are absolutely out of order. Hon members, let's be careful; don't deteriorate.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 199

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION: I think using the word spine is one thing but using the word testicles is a completely different ball game! [Interjections.] And I don't think that we should allow the speaker to continue with that line. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Wait! Hon members, come!

Ms D CARTER: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think we are all adults in the House. If we are not allowed to use that word in the House, why do we give it to Grade 4 children to learn at school? [Interjections.] [Applause.] At schools, Grade 4s are taught about testicles, penises and vaginas so why can't we use those words here? [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Hon members, I will attend to this thing and its context so that we can give you a considered view. You see, I am thinking here, hon Steenhuisen ... can you listen to me first. Hon members, this is on the boundary of decency and decent parliamentary discourse and is risky. The moment you

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 200

start doing it in your own languages in the House here, it's going to be inappropriate in a way that is not going to be acceptable, in fact, in any language. I will come back to it because I want to give it an appropriate ruling.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, with respect, I am still waiting for the ruling about hon Ngwenya being called by hon member on that side of the Table.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! That one is obvious, the hon member knows. Hon Pokolo, please, just do the correct thing and let us proceed with the business of the day. You know that we should do that.

Ms T V TOBIAS: Hon Deputy Speaker, it's amazing that I was called a member from the SLOW Lounge and nobody said anything about it. [Interjections.] And I don't go to the SLOW Lounge. And as for the hon Ngwenya, with due respect, I will never undermine her, she is hon Ngwenya.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 201

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Steenhuisen, you withdraw that reference to her as being from the SLOW Lounge. Now! [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I withdraw that I called the hon member ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] ... SLOW Lounge

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! No! Hon member, just withdraw unconditionally.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Ngwenya, proceed.

Ms G S A NGWENYA: If we perform poorly on growth, then what we can expect our collections to also suffer. The revenue shortfall has now increased to R42,8 billion compared to the R27,4 billion initial revenue shortfall for 2018-19. The clearing of the VAT refund backlog will also reduce net revenue collection. Some of the bold economic reforms we could take include; helping small

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 202

businesses by not extending bargaining council agreements to non-parties. We also need to pay them. For many businesses in South Africa, the government is an unreliable customer and if you understand the time value of money, then you will understand that the late payments equals either lost opportunity through investments that could have been made or perhaps even lost interest. Quite simply, late payments are theft.

We also need to listen to what investors say stand in the way of them investing. Our largest trading partner, the EU, in its business climate report indicated that Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment, BBBEE was their greatest legislative obstacle to doing business in South Africa. We could also cut loose unprofitable and uncompetitive SOEs.

The trouble is I could list a lot whole long list of reforms but you have actually heard all of them before. And some of you even agree with the some of the things that I am saying but unfortunately, we have not been able

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 203

to arrive at a politics where we in fact value the merit of ideas.

Jonathan Swift, the author and satirist said:

"It is useless to attempt to reason a man out of a thing he was never reasoned into"

That is true of the ANC for the fact that they were not reasoned to in many of their policies decisions. Some of the most pernicious policies ahead like expropriation without compensation, and the Banks Amendment Bill which will allow state owned companies to apply for banking licenses. These have been brought forward by the EFF and the ANC had agreed to them even though they are not sound but because they fear the EFF eating into its left flank.

So, one is left with the realisation that if we cannot tax our way out, if we cannot borrow our way out, and if we cannot save our way out, and now we can also not grow our way out because the ANC's "testes" are firmly in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 204

grip of the EFF, then South Africans must vote their way out of this economic crisis. [Applause.]

Mr Y I CARRIM: Comrade Deputy Speaker, comrades and friends. Let's be very clear; it's unusual, even in an established democracy for the Minister of Finance and the government on the very eve of an election to be so open about its economic and financial challenges. He laid it bare; maybe even annoyingly bare for some within the ranks of our party. But there it was, open and glaring under the full rise of the sun for all to see.

That, it seems to me, overall, is a feat. For one to overcome challenges, you have to fully grasp the extent and depth of it in the first place. That, most certainly, has been done by the Minister. Now, we have to decisively deal with those challenges and that, as we have repeatedly said in the committee, is not just the responsibility of the government but Parliament too; not just Parliament but private sector, the trade unions, civil society more general and the public, of course. Never mind our many differences and the fiercely

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 205

contested elections upon us. We can, and have to work together, we have no choice.

The President has done much to open the door to this inclusiveness. The challenge is for the opposition parties to enter it without fearing being swallowed. The private sector, the trade unions increasingly and civil society are doing so, that's the way to go.

So yes, there are indeed challenges, as Minister the set out so clearly, boldly and courageously, but it's certainly all doom and gloom. It's what we make of the situation collectively that will decide our collective future; and whatever our differences ultimately, we do have a national interest. If we don't, then it means we don't have a country.

We have Mr Lees saying, ah! Mr Keys ... I think the first Finance Minister used the word barged; said the economy is barged. What he forgets to mention, because of this doom and gloom approach, is some several years later growth was at 5%; before the 2008 global crisis fell on

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 206

the entire world. And let me say, no matter what the failures of the ANC and the government, which it has been open about; the fact of the matter is, it's inextricable linked to global down turns. Right now, as well know and members of the Finance Committee know, there is a dip in the economic growth globally. Europe is going down, the US too and so we gather from China that things are not anywhere near what they use to be. So, inevitably as a small open economy we're vulnerable.

It doesn't matter which party comes to power. If a thousand-two hundred years from now the DA comes to power, it will still deal with those issues. Now, the budget; we want to say, Minister, is aptly organised around the theme of: Risk, Renewal and Growth. It's wonderful theme, Minister, it's very well organised.

The Government has never, before, been faced with such challenging circumstance to shape a budget that balances the need to contain expenditure and be reasonably pro-poor and developmental.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 207

The Committee believes that the Government has managed this reasonably well. In particular, we welcome the fact, Minister, that pro-poor spending will once again grow despite the difficult circumstances you and government confront and we all do, in real terms, that's a fact.

We know it, for example, of R1,244 trillion for learning and culture; R7,17 billion for National Health Insurance, NHI, and health as a whole; and no, no, no we are not giving up on National Health Insurance, it will be done, over time, sensible and sensitively and being realistic, it will be done, there is no going back. [Applause.] Let's add the R894 billion for social development over Medium Term Financial Period, MTFP.

The committee welcomes, Minister, the R526 billion despite the difficult circumstances for infrastructure over the medium-term. We reiterate our support as a committee, the sensible members of the committee, meaning the ANC and on the odd occasions, the EFF, for the new approach to project planning, budgeting, preparation and implementation, and we welcome the progress, Minister, of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 208

the budget facility for infrastructure technical team. Long overdue, long overdue, this should have been done years ago, because ... I think we learnt that partly from the United States, US; if one of your deputy director-generals, DDGs is to be believed, three or four years ago, but it's great.

On the employment tax incentives, that's been covered.

Now, I want say too, while a budget is ultimately a set of political decisions and choices that a government makes, it is also a technical skilled drafting of priorities and getting the money that ... the Minister and government can say, "This is what we want" but you need the team to be able to do it adroitly, to be able to do it definitely.

Let me put this to you - you may not want to buy this but - many, many other governments confronted with similar set of challenges will not have delivered budget that contains expenditure on the one hand and is actually providing for the poor in real terms growth. It's a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 209

remarkable thing Minister. [Applause.] You have a department that is unusual, that in many senses is world class. Never mind that for variety of reasons, some of the people have regrettably fled and our view will be to reach out to them, Minister, they must be brought back, the country needs them.

Now, we want to say: yes, yes, we agree that the state-owned entities, SOEs, Eskom in particular, provide huge challenges.

Let me come back to the DA because these things are in our report for those who care to read. What has Mr Lees done except repeat statistics? There's no alternative.

What does Ms Ngwenya do? She bleats, whinges and whines; no alternative, right? [Applause.] [Interjections.] Worse with her, she has a superior university educated economics degree disdainful attitude to the rest of us, okay? That rules it out.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 210

Now, Mr Maynier is gone. Mr Lees, as formidable as Mr Maynier, with a different style and a give and take approach which is necessary on both our side as the majority and your side as the largest opposition party; that's fine. He is as formidable as Mr Maynier but he gets far more done than Mr Maynier ever did.

Now, let me say something about Mr Maynier, by the way. Last time we were looking at the proposed fiscal framework, knowing fully well that I am not taking part in that debate, as I often do; he presents a blatant distortion here. Let me make this clear, I do not ... he said "How can a communist serve on the Board of the Parliamentary Network?" Let me put this to you, he knows fully well that it's not the Parliamentary Network of the World bank, it's a Parliamentary Network on the World Bank. [Applause.] Parliaments must hold the World Bank to account. For too long governments have been dealing with World Bank, not so much in this country obviously but elsewhere Parliaments would have no role. We want to have oversight, that is why we have an International Organisation of Parliamentarians. And Mr Maynier knows

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 211

that I was asked to stand for elections - because I am thousand years older and they know me - I refused to. They co-opted me on the Board to assist them; my term ends - in any case whatever my future in Parliament is - on the 10th of April, I have to go and report back. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

What I am saying to you is, I'm unapologetic, precisely because I am a Marxist; which I'm unapologetic about. We have an alliance here. I am serving as a Board member co-opted on the Parliamentary Network on the World Bank and I am not going to tackle him on the five-star hotel. [Applause.] I have never done work in education in a five-star hotel. He knows fully well that when I go on my own I don't stay in five-star hotels, unless he accompanies us and we are going on a delegation.

Let me say to you, you know what? At the end of the day it's about this: you can say what you like, you can say what you like, but whatever the criticisms of the opposition parties' colleagues, the most significant test of the budget will be the polls on 8 May. All the signs

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 212

are that the ANC will get about the 60% of that vote.
[Applause.] [Interjections.] That crumbling, doddering
DA, confused as it is, will be walloped and the EFF will
discover that it's planets away from ever winning a
majority. In any case what is the EFF? We don't know?
It's all tactics and no strategy and certainly no
principle. They swing from one extreme to another.
[Interjection.] I am not taking a question, I have a
right to criticise you... [Interjection.]

Ms N K F HLONYANA: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order.
The speaker at the podium must not mislead the House ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, listen that is not the point of
order, that is not the point of order ... [Interjection.]

Ms N K F HLONYANA: ... he is busy here misleading the
House ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... and I am going to switch the
microphone, if you proceed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 213

Mr Y I CARRIM: Now you want to run government with members like that, right so, now really? [Laughter.]

Mr Paulsen, you claim to be a Marxist, right? But you are an idealist of the most extreme sort, right? Let me put this to you, there's a big difference from aspiring and dreaming; you dream against all the odds that you will be a majority party. Mr Paulsen, it's not going to happen because the voters need to know what your policies are. I don't know, I claim to be a Marxist and so do you. There is nothing Marxist about the right wing populism that you represent. It's an enormous threat [Interjections.]

[Applause.] It's an enormous threat not only to the national democratic transformation but to socialism too because you wear that red. As a Marxist you should know that there's a difference between appearances and content; that is one of the basic things about Marxism. You're all about appearance as the EFF but no content. You will never win majority in this country and on the 8th of May ... there is no need to argue Mr Paulsen, no need to argue, 8th of May, 8th of May. Let's see, just wait and see on the 8th of May [Interjection.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 214

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Carrim, just hold on. Hon Carrim, you've got 16 seconds. What are you rising on, hon member?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Deputy Speaker, we can't have a member stand up there, casting aspersions to my character. I am not right wing ... [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, hon member, this is a political statement ... [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: I am not right wing. This is the one [Inaudible.] sits [Inaudible.] in the [Inaudible.] and he calls me a right wing [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, this is a political debate and you will stop talking now, please, please.

Mr M N PAULSEN: ... [Inaudible.] Marxist [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 215

The Deputy SPEAKER: No, no, hon member. I warned you, I will switch off the microphone. It is inappropriate to react to a debate in manner you do when you know what the rules are. Please take it as you give.

No further order on this matter please. Hon member, what are rising on, what's your rule?

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sekela Somlomo, ayikho into ebalulekile njengokuthi umuntu uma ezokhuluma laphaya ukuthi akhohlwe yithina. [Ubuwelewele.] Akafunde ukwazi ukuthi ufuna ukwenzani. [Ubuwelewele.] Baphi abantu bako obamele lana? Yena unabo abantu bakhe abamele lana. Ungabosiphaphela la. [Ubuwelewele.]

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: This is not a point of order and I am switching of microphone, I told that. Hon Carrim, please proceed.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 216

Mr Y I CARRIM: Ya [Yes.] As I end I will make something clear to you Mr Steenhuisen. Ms Thandi Tobais-Pokolo does not drink at the moment. To suggest that she is doddering and so on, is what the implication of what you are saying ... it's just outrageous, outrageous, false and demeaning; it is not true, it is absolutely not true and you know it fully well.

Now, let me come back to the EFF [Interjections.] okay, fine [Interjection.] [Applause.]

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sekela Somlomo! Sekela Somlomo.

Bengicela, umhlonishwa uMnguni ake afunde ukuthi enze lento ayenzayo uma kwenzeka kuthina. Angavumi ukuzosihlaselisa ngalaba bantu bakhe la. Lalela Mnguni. [Ubuwelewele.] Qaphela weMnguni

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member that is not the point of and I am switching off the microphone. Take you your seat, it's not a point of order. Hon member, ngicela

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 217

uhlale phansi [please sit down]. You can't be pointing out at people that way. That's irresponsible and out of order, hlala phansi [sit down] hon member. You must obey the rules sit down please.

IsiZulu:

Nk M S KHAWULA: Kodwa Sihlalo, Cha! Cha! Cha! Awusithandi wena.

English:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please proceed.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly, hon members, thank you very much to the members of the committee for the hard work that they have put into the processing of the 2019-20 Budget. I have the report as produced and I found many interesting contributions there which I am quite certain that I will take into account. The interesting thing about coming back to this House after few years being away is to notice the depth and discipline that characterises the House. At times, it is very difficult to decipher what it

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 218

is being said. Nevertheless, it is a learning experience which I will obviously over time get used to.

The key issues that were confronting were the following: what do we need to do as we are confronted with a slow economic rate and higher demands on the expenditure side, that is what we have to deal with in a Budget like this; and what to do when confronted with slow economic growth, poor revenue collection, but higher demands on the expenditure side? Now, one must say these are basics Economics 001 questions.

However, it is quite clear that one of the contributions that this House could make is to walk along with us beyond Economics 001 into a much higher level of debate about the challenges that we confront. Let me give an example. In 2018, agricultural exports amounted to something like \$US11 billion. That on its own should be an indicator of what we need to be thinking about to further grow the South African economy. So, I would have expected the committee to amongst others say, in support of our efforts at agricultural production we need to do

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 219

the following things, so that after all the shouting is done and so on, we are able to decipher a contribution to the debate.

We should be asking about what we should be doing in agriculture to take advantage to this possibility. The next issue we have to confront is that we are looking at a greater burden on our shoulders as the debt to GDP ratio increases. That naturally should make us answer the question that we can't proceed as business as usual. We have to - in the words that we use - reconfigure the manner in which we conduct our operations. Whether it is about state-owned enterprises, whether it is about the perks in deeds, what about the benefits that might be there for the executive, the Whips and everybody else we all have to come to terms with the fact that we have to answer the question.

Things are different and therefore we can't proceed as usual. Neither can we proceed forward and behave like a crab - you know that fish - it thinks it is going forward but actually it is going sideways. We can't behave like

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 220

that. Therefore, we are called upon to act differently and strategically as we go forward. I heard some members mentioning the ratings agencies here. Deputy Speaker, it is very nice from this House to shout at the rating agencies. The fact of the matter is that you need them, whether you ideologically agree with them or not, you need them. You have to live with the fact that you have to enter into a debate and discussion with them to convince them of the path that you are taking.

Further of which, they have the power to downgrade you and the more you get downgraded your debt to GDP ratio will keep on rising in no time you will be in the hands of the International Monetary Fund, IMF, and you don't want to be in that position. Therefore, be careful of what you say against ratings agencies. Now that we have presented the Budget and we have received your support, what are the key functions that the Ministry of Finance will be following through is institutional rebuilding.

A lot of damage has been done to our public institutions and we need to change that. The work that we are doing as

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 221

the SA Revenue Services is meant to rebuild the institutions. I am sure you have already noticed that we are building capacity. There are number of visitations to businesses that are conducting their businesses to avoid tax. Those visitations are visible. I know people don't like it but that has to happen to rebuild South African Revenue Services, Sars. In the next couple of days we should be able to announce the new Sars commissioner and be able to proceed further with the work that needs to be done.

We have to reconfigure the Public Investment Corporation as a matter of extreme urgency for that institution to continue to be the engine through which the pensions of pensioners can be invested and benefit the South African economy. We have to strengthen the board of the Development Bank of Southern Africa so that the bank can be in a position to play a leading role in our infrastructure interventions. Finally, we will be working on rebuilding the SA Special Risk Insurance Association. All these should put us on a better footing as we confront the challenges that lay ahead of us.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 222

Let me conclude by confirming that one of the clauses in the new Bill that we have put before you, the Financial Matters Bill, has to do with facilitating the establishment of a state bank. That is true and that was a clear objective that we have set for ourselves. So, for most of our comrades out there, they must know that the idea for a state bank is alive and well. [Applause.] In fact, to some extent, we already have the African Bank which is 75% publicly owned. It is there. All that we have to do is for Minister Dlodlo to organise that the civil servants maybe get paid through the African Bank or we maybe negotiate for some assets here and there to be put in the African Bank. Voila! There you have it. As the Ugandan Minister of Finance would have said, "you will see it going bvrrrr". Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I now recognise the Chief Whip of the Majority Party.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 223

CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon Deputy Speaker, I
move:

That the House adopts the 2019 Fiscal Framework and
Revenue Proposals and the Report of the Standing
Committee on Finance thereon.

Question put: That the motion moved by the Chief Whip of
the Majority Party be agreed to.

Division demanded.

House divided.

Ayes - 199: [Take in from minutes]

Noes - 50: [Take in from minutes]

Abstain - 1: Raphuti, D D.

Motion agreed to.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 6 MARCH 2019

Page: 224

2019 Fiscal Framework and Revenue Proposals, and the Report of Standing Committee on Finance accordingly adopted.

UNPARLIAMENTARY LANGUAGE

(Ruling)

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, can you settle down for a moment. I do wish to make a Ruling right now on the language used by hon Ngwenya earlier on here. I want to suggest that, in my opinion, and sitting where I am, I found that language patriarchal and gender insensitive. This is especially so because it suggests that people who have courage, strength and determination are those who have testes. What about those who don't have testes? The language is patriarchal and I find it inappropriate. I will come back to it, hon member, and we will talk to you about it when you come back. However, that is my Ruling. It is inappropriate. Thank you. The House is adjourned.

The House Adjourned at 19:42.