

**WEDNESDAY, 18 SEPTEMBER 2019**

---

***PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY***

---

The House met at 17:26.

The House Chairperson, Ms M G Boroto, took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS** - see col  
000.

**QUESTIONS TO MINISTERS**

**GOVERNANCE**

**Cluster 3**

MINISTERS:

**Working together with National School of Government to ensure its syllabus and curriculum focus on strengthening**

**service delivery in communities and improving  
competencies of public servants**

126. Ms V P Malomane (ANC) asked the Minister of Public Service and Administration:

In view of September marking the Public Service Month in the Republic (details furnished), how will his department work together with the National School of Government to ensure that its syllabus and curriculum focus on (a) the strengthening of service delivery in communities and (b) improving the competencies of public servants?

NO2010E

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Chair, the reply to the question by the hon member, Ms V P Malomane, is as follows: The National School of Government developed a course dealing with citizens-centred service delivery. This programme focuses on instilling developmental values based on citizen's rights and re-invoking commitment and zeal among public servants to enable them to prepare, implement and monitor effective relevant service delivery.

This programme will also help them re-engineer their relationship with the public and reflect on how they are

delivering service to the citizens. So, the school is rolling out project Khaedu which is one of the programmes in the public service. The action learning programme is presented over 10 days that they will be taken through. Now, this is divided into two, five days each. During the first five-day module, public sector managers on middle and senior management level develop the core skills required to resolve service delivery problems in a systematic and sustainable manner through interactive engagements, group challenges and case studies. This is followed by another five days. I won't give details. The answer is there. Then the National School of Government designs, develops and quality assures curriculum for programme courses which are aligned to this. Therefore, I am presenting this; it's a comprehensive response to question number 26. Thank you.

Ms V P MALOMANE: House Chair, my follow-up question will be as follows: Thank you very much, Minister, for outlining that you have a curriculum that will deal with the issues of public servants. My follow-up question is that there has been a significant interest in the syllabus and curriculum that deal with communication and customer-focused strategy. How has the National School of Government ensured that action learning programme to

empower managers is reinforced on an ongoing basis, and it does not end, Minister? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: The National School of Government receives funding ...

[Interjections.] Pardon!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, continue Minister, ignore the noises. [Interjections.] Continue, Minister. [Interjections.] Ignore the noises, Minister, and continue with your response.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Thank you very much. As said above, the National School of Government develops or identifies the need first, and then they develop courses that are relevant, especially in terms of the frontline services and they quality assure them. They start investing money and running these courses all over the Republic. I think that should suffice for now.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): The next follow-up question will come from the hon member Van Damme. But I cannot see her in the House. [Interjections.] You removed her? She was the first person. [Interjections.] Okay. I will move to the hon Motsepe from the EFF.

Mr D BERGMAN: Chair, sorry, point of order. What actually happened is that we did inform the Table staff that the button was pushed incorrectly. It wasn't the hon Van Damme. It is hon Clark. So, if hon Clark could at least ask her question, we will appreciate that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members, please let's not do that. The Table staffs have already informed me that they removed her name. So, I am not going back there. Hon Motsepe? [Interjections.]

Ms M O CLARK: Hon Chairperson, just for assistance, it's her first question session. She has just pressed the wrong button by mistake. Can we ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay, hon member, actually this is why I started with that. If you had stood up immediately before they confirmed what was happening, I would have allowed that. Can we please pass for now? Thank you. Hon Julius?

Mr J W W JULIUS: Chairperson, on a point of order: I informed the Table staff that they must remove hon Van Damme and put on hon Clark way before the follow-up questions came on and they did that. So, I don't know why

you were not informed about that. But, I did it well in time. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay.

Unfortunately, hon Julius, the Table staff only informed me that her name has been removed and I must continue with the next one. I am sorry for that.

Ms C C S MOTSEPE: Thank you, Minister. I have a question but you have not properly answered it the way you were supposed to answer it. So, I would like you ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, hon members. Order! Continue, hon Motsepe.

Ms C C S MOTSEPE: Minister, may you please answer this question again? There is a general view in South Africa that public servants are not willing to offer the public quality services. What qualitative differences has the National School of Government made since the establishment to change the general state of apathy amongst civil servants? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Well, it sound like the hon member who is asking the question

already knows the answer. So, I don't know how I must answer a question that is already known. [Interjections.] It's also known how it should be answered. But to make your job easy, let me repeat what I said. The National School of Government identifies the need from time to time, sometimes with the intervention of the executive authority i.e. the Minister, to look at the period and challenges, and then look at our modules and the quality of what we are offering at the moment. Let's also look at the budget and all those things.

When all those things have been designed and put together, we then roll out relevant training. That's my honest response. If there is a better response from any of the members, I am sure it can be filled up and we can go forward with that.

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Through you, House Chairperson, Minister, it has become a common cause in the country that public servants have a lacklustre attitude towards the performance of their jobs. We often read in newspapers and on social media as well as watching TV about public servants taking to the streets in protest of this and that and others abandoning their posts. These include, amongst others, school teachers, nurses, Home Affairs as well as Department of Social Development

officials. My question is: Has this department been implementing the Batho Pele principles successfully, and if so, how? If not, what are the biggest challenges?

Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Thank you very much, hon member. There are eight principles of Batho Pele. Over the years, there has been an effort to implement them. This is a subjective issue which operates in a particular context. So, it would be true that at any given time, there would be a civil servant or a group of civil servants somewhere in the country who would do their jobs in a fashion that is less than expected. Now, where we come across such incidents and we become aware, we act via a relevant line function Minister to say, this is what we have been made aware of. Could you take action?

But generally, our job is to offer any assistance that we can to public servants and we do it through the National School Government, NSG. We do this through encouraging all civil servants across to observe the principles of Batho Pele. One of those is just during this period, the Public Service Month, where we are all over the country just to say to public servants, you are employed, you are paid and here is the expectation of the public and

ourselves, please do your job. So, we encourage, guide and intervene where necessary and it's an ongoing thing. But there will be a problem here and there and we will intervene as necessary.

Ms M O CLARK: Minister, the reason why we need the NSG to improve the competencies of the public servants after they have been hired is because the ANC has allowed the public service to be captured through cadre deployment. What measurable impact has the training provided by the NSG had on improving the quality of services delivered by the public service? Or, have we as government spent millions on the NSG without any measurable outcomes? Thank you. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Well, I can't claim to have heard everything that you said because at some point, especially the last part of your question, there was a lot of people who responded to your question. If you are asking me how the National School of Government is set to improve, the school for sometime has not been with the principal. In other words, they had a vacancy and there have been people who were acting. Now, we are on course and want to make sure we appoint the principal with suitable qualifications just to make sure that the quality of the courses that get developed, not

only are they relevant to our problems and challenges, but the quality thereof is assured at the required level.

But standing here, I have reasonable happiness that efforts are made on a yearly basis by the management at the NSG to make sure that they always improve. But every five years, naturally, they would review what they would have achieved in the last term, look at gaps and seek to close those particular gaps. Just before the next term begins next year, we will make sure that we have identified some of those gaps and some of the areas of improvement. We hope that in that way, the school will improve its service to the public servants.

**High rates of substance and alcohol abuse amongst youth and collaboration with other relevant departments to eradicate the problem**

120. Ms C N Ndaba (ANC) asked the Minister in The Presidency for Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities:

(a) What is her Office's role in addressing the high rates of substance and alcohol abuse amongst youth and (b) how does her Office intends to collaborate with other relevant departments to eradicate the

problem as it is impacting negatively on the lives  
of youth?

NO2003E

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: The National Youth Development Agency, NYDA branch in our department is responsible for coordinating youth development and to ensure reporting by various stakeholders that we work with. In particular, and in this regard on the abuse of substance, there is collaboration with the Department of Social Development as the line function department primarily responsible for offering programmes that address the high levels of substance abuse including amongst youth, as highlighted in the National Youth Policy.

Earlier on, his Excellency the President spoke at length on this matter of substance and alcohol abuse, and that this mixture is really exacerbating the challenges that we have. Nevertheless, we also work with the Central Drug Authority, CDA, together with Department of Social Development to make sure that we monitor the work that this Central Drug Authority does. I just wanted to highlight that, what is also equally important is that we should never leave out collaboration as it's the department's coordination with the communities.

Ka gobane tlogatloga e tloga kgale, modiši wa kgomo o tšwa natšo šakeng. Bana ba rena ga se ba swanelwa ke go ba ditagwa, ba be balemadi ba diokobatši ba sa le ba bannyane. *(Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.)*

[A stitch in time saves nine. Our children are not supposed to indulge in alcohol and become drug addicts while they are still young.]

They will exacerbate the challenge that we had debated earlier through the President. Thank you, hon Chair.

Nk C N NDABA: Masibonge Ngqongqoshe ukuthi uwuphendulile umbuzo wethu ngalendlela besiwubuze ngakhona kodwa-ke Ngqongqoshe kuyabonakala ukuthi, uma ubhaka izibalo ebezikhishwe wuMnyango Wezamaphoyisa kulamaviki adlulile ukuthi, kunamalanga okubonakala kahle ukuthi ukusetshenziswa kwamanzi amponjwana nezidakamizwa kungeminye yemithelela yokuthi abantu bakithi bashone kakhulu emigwaqeni ngenxa yezingozu kodwa futhi neminye imithelela yokuthi abesimame badlwengulwe nasemakhaya futhi kungahlaliseki kahle, kungabi nokuthula.

Umbuzo wami ukuthi, ucabanga ukuthi akusiyiso yini isikhathi sokuthi manje sikhuphule umkhawulo weminyaka, ezindaweni zokucima ukoma ukuthi abantu kumele babe

neminyaka emingaki ngaphambi kokuthi bangathengiselwe utshwala?

Bese futhi ucabanga kuthi akusiyiso yini isikhathi esibalulekile ukuthi mhlawumbe kufanele sikhuphule izinhlawulo ukuthi mhlawumbe ... izindawo zokucima umoya nezindawo esidayisa utshwala azothengisela izingane zethu alo ... [Ubuwelewele.] Hhayi mani! Yekela ukungiphazamisa wena. [Ubuwelewele.] ... senze imithetho ezokwenza izinhlawulo khona abantu abadayisela izingane zethu utshwala kufanele bakhokhe izinhlawulo ezithize.

[Ubuwelewele.] Yebo! Ngiyabonga, Ngqongqoshe. [Ihlombe.]

*(Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)*

[Ms C N NDABA: Thank you, hon Minister for answering our question the way we put it. But then, when one looks at the statistics that were released by the Department of Police in the last few weeks, it is evident that there are days when alcohol and drug abuse are some of the contributory factors to the road deaths of our people, women being raped and a lack of harmony and peace at home.

My question is, Do you not think that it is time for us to raise the age limit before children can access the taverns to buy alcohol?

And also, is it not the right time that maybe we raise penalties paid by taverns and liquor stores when they sell liquor to our children? [Interjections.] No man! Stop distracting me. [Interjections.] Is it not the right time maybe to pass laws that will make the tavern owners pay certain penalties if they sell liquor to our children? [Interjections.] Yes! Thank you, hon Minister. [Applause.]

TONA YA BASADI, BASWA LE BATHO BAO BA SA ITEKANELAGO  
 OFISING YA MOPRESIDENTE: Ke a leboga, Leloko la Palamente. Mopresidente o šetše a re dumeletše go lekodišiša melawanalawana yeo re nago le yona mo yeo e tlilego go re thuša go ntšha tlhohlo yeo ya go hlakahlakantya bana ba rena ka botagwa le go šomiša diokobatši. Mopresidente o ile a fetša a re file mehlala ka tše dingwe tša tšona. Ke dumelelana le wena leloko leo le hlomphegilego gore tlhakahlakano ya diokobatši le botagwa e re senyetša setšhaba. Ye nngwe tšhišinyo yeo re ka e dirago ke go fokotša dinako tša kgwebo tša go rekiša bjala. Ge e le taba ya ... *(Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.)*

[The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Thank you, hon member. The President has given us permission to consider a number of

policies currently in use, and this will assist to alleviate the effects of alcohol and drug abuse on our children. The President gave examples of some of the matters connected therewith. Hon member, I agree with you on the effects of drug and alcohol abuse on the nation. One other submission I put forth is to reduce the opening times of places that sell alcohol. Regarding the issue of...]

... drug abuse, make sure that we catch the kingpins. The President has said earlier in his inputs that in the Western Cape, as much as we have deployed soldiers, we have not as yet caught one single drug kingpin ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (MS M G Boroto): Hon members please, can you lower your voices.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES ... to make sure that we liberate our children from this scourge which leads to femicide. Thank you.

Mr W M THRING: Minister, there is sufficient empirical evidence to show that there is a causal relationship between alcohol and substance abuse and gender-based violence. Substance abuse in our opinion includes the

abuse of marijuana, which impairs the reasoning abilities of its users where many then proceed to perpetrate harm and violence against women and the vulnerable of our society. The question is, What measures then are in place to improve and increase the number of safe houses for our women and children who have been harmed or abused? What measures are also in place to address some of the root causes which include the expansion of the number of drug rehabilitation centres in our communities? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Since the earlier debate, we have been receiving offers from different stakeholders starting with the hon Minister Lamola, that by the end of this year, we would have increased the number of Thuthuzela Centres. The hon Minister of Public Works also said that they will help by donating underutilised buildings to make them safe houses, so that we try by all means to mitigate these challenges that we have.

Like I said earlier on, to deal with this scourge of gender-based violence, we need to start by socialising our people in the communities correctly and then deal with these other additional measures as mitigating factors. I just want to say once again, women have said enough is enough but government and in particular the

criminal justice system should continue to lead in finding alternative measures that could take us somewhere. Secondly, the other Members of Parliament have been saying here that we should also review our legislation.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (MS M G Boroto): Hon Minister, please wrap up. Just a reminder to all who will be coming, that the member who asks the first supplementary question can take two minutes but for the responses to supplementary questions by the Ministers, it is two minutes. Thank you very much.

Ms N P SONTI: Minister, one of the interventions that the EFF has made in the form of a Private Members Bill is that there must be a blanket ban of alcohol advertisement as this encourages alcohol consumption amongst the youth. When that Bill is tabled in the House, will your department support it? What do you make of the accusation that a ban on alcohol advertisement will lead to loss of jobs? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon member, I think you will find us ready to support this because many countries that are manufacturers of very expensive alcohol or alcohol

mixtures do not advertise in the streets. You will not see any billboard of alcohol in New York or Kuala Lumpur or anywhere else. That is why they do not have this mad rush of getting them young and confused. In many other countries they do not have that. As the President has said, we need more dialogues with the private sector to make them realise that they can make their profit, but not at the expense of our young people. Vulnerable people in particular become more vulnerable because of this. Thank you.

Ms Z MAJOZI: Minister, I would like to ask this, Is the Minister's department willing to conduct a study on the effect of the mechanisms that detect when children get involved in alcohol and drugs at an early age, identify them in particular in the rural communities, provide support and break the stigma that they are suffering from? Thank you.

TONA YA BASADI, BASWA LE BATHO BAO BA SA ITEKANELAGO  
OFISING YA MOPRESIDENTE: Ke hlalošitše pele gore re fihleletše boitemogelo bjoo. Ke nnete bana ba rena ba fepša ka diokobatši le dinotagi ba sa le ba bannyane. Ke ka lebaka leo re rego re tlile go dira kgopelo ya gore re šomišane le ba Tlhabollo ya Leago gore re fokotše dinako tša kgwebo ya go rekiša bjala. Re tla be ebile re

lebeledišiša le mengwaga ya bana bao, le go nyakišiša batho bao ba thekgago gona moo go rekwago mabjala. Bana bao ba tagwago e sa le ba bannyane, ge ba ka ima e sa le ba bannyane, bana ba bona ba tagwa pele ba belegwa ...

*(Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.)*

[The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: I have explained before that we have achieved this milestone. It is true that our children abuse alcohol and drugs from an early age. That is why we will request to work with the Department of Social Development to reduce the times of sale of alcohol. We will also consider the age restriction of such children, and the kingpins of alcohol sale. In cases where children who abuse alcohol fall pregnant, their children get intoxicated before birth ...]

... it is a mess and that leads again to the problem that we spent so many hours with the President on - gender-based violence and femicide. Thank you.

**Details relating to mechanisms in place through department's third mission to promote an ethical public service through programmes, systems, frameworks and structures that detect, prevent and combat corruption to**

**reduce the amount of irregular expenditure incurred by  
national and provincial government departments**

131. Dr L A Schreiber (DA) asked the Minister of Public Service and Administration:

Whether his department has put any mechanisms in place through its third mission to promote an ethical public service through programmes, systems, frameworks and structures that detect, prevent and combat corruption to reduce the amount of irregular expenditure incurred by national and provincial government departments that has increased unabated from R95 billion in the 2015-16 financial year to R161 billion to date for the current financial year; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

NO2016E

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: House Chair, the question refers to some apparent contradiction between what DPSA and Treasury looked at in terms of public servants doing business with government. We just want to indicate first, that National Treasury is responsible or primarily mandated to address the reduction of irregular expenditure incurred by national and provincial departments through policy development and

implementation. The DPSA supports those, otherwise we are responsible for developing standards that ensure that the conduct of public servants adheres to what is envisaged.

[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Madam House Chair, on a point of order: Can we just get some clarity, if I may, on the question that the Minister is answering because it doesn't appear to be the one that is on the Order Paper?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): We are ... I actually said to the Minister that the question is 131. So, the Minister is responding. Continue, Minister!

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Yes, the response doesn't have a number. It doesn't say response no 131 but I am responding to the particular question. [Interjections.] Let me proceed. What then happened is that public service goes on to ... let me say Treasury uses what is called the central supplier of information on these particular matters. The mechanism put in place to promote ... oh yes, this ... You are quite right. [Laughter.] I realise that. [Interjections.] No, I realise that. Let me go back to the answer. Yes, let me go back to the answer.

The DPSA supports Treasury by supporting standards and norms to address the ethics and integrity of public service employees, and thus, the conduct. The mechanism put in place to promote ethical public service includes the abolition of implementation of Public Sector Integrity Management Framework in 2013 to address the issue of gifts, other remunerative work, public service employees conducting business with the state, and the declaration of financial interests by public service employees.

The framework resulted in the amendment of the Public Service Regulations, 2016 where the acceptance of bribes and gifts, which is Regulation 13(a) and (h) of the Public Service Regulations, 2016 was addressed and directives were issued to clarify the process of applying and approving requests from public service employees to perform other remunerative work. That's Regulation 24 of the Public Service Regulations, PSR. The personnel salary system i.e. Persal, was reconfigured to allow the capturing of applications for other remunerative work which creates a database in its reporting. But service employees were prohibited from conducting business with the state and processes were put in place to identify those employees contravening the prohibition, Regulation 13(c) of the Public Service Commission, PSC.

To improve the ethics management of departments, the regulations made the establishment of ethics infrastructure in all departments compulsory. The training of all public service employees on ethics was also made compulsory. For this purpose, the DPSA provided the National School of Government with content for a non-line ethics and code of conduct courses to support the functions of ethics officers, ethics committees and ethics infrastructure. The DPSA established the National Ethics Officer Forum which aims to capacitate designated ethics officers to promote good governance and ethics conduct in their respective departments.

The electronic financial disclosure system was also established to allow for all senior management and designated category such as supply chain management and so on, to make their financial declarations. It also includes whistleblowers which were also strengthened by the adoption of a reporting guide which aligned PSR with the protection of disclosures.

The proclamation of Public Service Ethics, Integrity and Disciplinary, Technical Assistance Unit on 01 April was undertaken to promote an ethical public service to explore the use of lifestyles and so on.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Minister, please wrap up.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Yes, I have come to the end of the response.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay. Thank you.

Dr L A SCHREIBER: Hon Chair, well, I think it is precisely the fact that we have ANC politicians like this who get confused between questions appointing our public servants, which is why the public service is in the mess that it is in. [Applause.] I was unable to understand the rumbling that we had but I am going to try to follow up on a question which was about irregular expenditure, Madam Chair.

In 2017, a forensic report indicated that tender fraud took place in the office of the hon Minister when he was the Premier of KwaZulu-Natal. That report did not indicate whether the hon Minister was aware of this or not. But frankly, why should we believe the rumbling assurances we just got from you when you couldn't even detect or be aware of fraud in your own private office when you were the premier?

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: This question has two parts if you look at it.

[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: No, it's one question.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: The first part deals with programme systems frameworks and structures ... [Interjections.] ...

An HON MEMBER: Answer a follow-up.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: ... that detect, prevent and combat corruption, which is what I have dealt with. But it also has another part that deals with those irregular expenditures that you are referring to, and I have answered that. I have answered exactly that but what you then do is to make reference, as you did, to irregular expenditure that has grown over time. However, that is just a reference. I have answered your question. If I can extend your references, what we have done recently to deal with the outcomes of the Auditor-General was to set up a team that deals with consequences of irregular expenditure and consequences of wasteful expenditure, and we are waiting for outcomes of

that particular team to deal with those matters. That is what we have done. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: When? [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, with respect, the Minister answered the original question again and didn't answer the follow-up that the hon Schreiber put. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: On the tender fraud in his office.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: On the tender fraud in the Minister's office. Perhaps we can ask hon Pandor to respond. We may get something coherent today. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, can we proceed? You know very well ... think even last week the Speaker did say what should happen in case where you are not satisfied. Please, let us continue! Hon Wessels, it's your time.

Mr W W WESSELS: House Chair, the hon Jordan will take the question, please!

Ms H JORDAAN: Hon Minister, does the department have effective consequence management measures in place against or for officials in the department who are responsible for the incurrence of irregular expenditure in the department? If not, why not? If so, could you please elaborate on what these measures are? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: I have just said it now, that we recently held a committee of Ministers wherein there was a presentation that was done exactly to deal with that particular problem. The presentation was done by the Auditor-General, indicating what has been happening in the last financial year on irregular expenditure, wasteful expenditure and other leaks in the fiscus, which fall under the responsibility of the Auditor-General. Seeing what has happened, we then appointed a team led by Treasury, which includes the DG of our department, the Office of the Auditor-General, and someone from litigations - the office that deals with litigations. That committee of officials is at work. We are awaiting their outcome so that we are able to say, what does it mean to have irregular expenditure in a department or any other sphere of government? What measures must be taken over and above the known and usual ones which, in our view, are not adequate because we have been having all these in various departments without any

specific consequence? So, at the moment, we don't have any specific thing until the outcome, over and above what has been the practice all the time.

Inkosi R N CEBEKHULU: Hon Minister, it has become a common practice or habit for employees in high positions in government departments to bypass advertising which is required in acquiring the service providers, and this results in irregular expenditure. Does the department have a policy to deal with these culprits?

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Any act of bypassing regulations in terms of procurement must have a consequence. This is going to be part of the outcome of this committee that I am taking about. What we are looking at are all those issues that you are talking about as a package to say, in a case where irregular expenditure results from the bypassing of regulations that have already been agreed to, what must be the consequence where such cases are clear? Of course, we intend tightening up on that and we intend ensuring that such officials don't escape scot-free when they have bypassed certain regulations.

Mrs C C S MOTSEPE: Hon Minister, most of the corruption in the public service particularly in the granting of

tenders and business opportunities to businesses, is exerted on officials by politicians themselves. What sort of protection measures are you putting in place to protect officials from implementing illegal and corrupt instruction from their political principals? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Well, I would, in my response, firstly ask the hon member to give us such known cases of executive authorities, EAs who have done what she says they have done so that we are able to action that. [Interjections.] But, even before she does that, we want to indicate that we are doing a study at the moment to see, and to try and separate very much distinctly the responsibilities of the EA or the executive member vis-à-vis those of a DG or HoD. This is because we find that in some cases issues tend to overlap or there is a blurring of responsibilities. Therefore, we want to try and clearly distinguish these responsibilities so that we prevent such overlaps where we think they may result into exacting of such powers. But the second thing is to train officials who are responsible such that they are strengthened in terms of upholding those rules.

The third thing that we are saying is that we also need to provide them with some form of protection so that they

execute their duties without fear of the executive that is above them. So, there are a number of measures that we are looking at so that we strengthen that particular area in order that EAs are prevented, either by perception or in actual deed, to do what you are complaining about. However, if you are aware of such instances, please submit them.

**Interventions in place to ensure that all municipalities perform their basic responsibilities and functions and put the citizens of the Republic first**

143. Mr W M Thring (ACDP) asked the Minister of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs:

In light of the report of the Auditor-General of South Africa on the state of the municipalities, where only 19% of the 257 municipalities that were audited, could give financial statements without material misstatements while the remaining 81% incurred irregular expenditure amounting to R25,2 billion, what interventions has her department put in place to ensure that all municipalities perform their basic responsibilities and functions, and put the citizens of the Republic first?

NO2029E

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, the department in collaboration with the National Treasury and our provincial counterparts support municipalities to strengthen and enhance internal controls on procurement processes, unauthorised, irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure, which amongst others include the issuing of guidelines to assist municipalities to address gaps in financial management and related aspects of Municipal Finance Management Act, MFMA compliance. MFMA Circular 68 provides guidance on the procedures to be followed when dealing with unauthorised, irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure. A further Circular 62 has been issued which is related to supply chain management and enhancing compliance and accountability. A further Circular 96 relates to procurement of goods and services under contracts secured by other organs of state.

These circulars intend to guide municipalities to submit documents to their internal audit units to provide assurance on compliance prior to the awarding of contracts. The department in partnership with the National Treasury and SA Local Government Association, Salga have also developed an impact guide and tool kit to

assist our Municipal Public Accounts Committees, Mpacs, to perform their oversight and other related responsibilities which include reviewing and recommending to council actions relating to the expenditure and conclusion of unauthorised, irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure.

Moreover, measures to address root causes are contained in Municipal Audit Action Plans and the department and our provincial counterparts regularly review these action plans for adequacy. The department has support packages to ensure that municipalities perform their basic responsibilities and functions and in this regard have established Back-to-Basics units to support municipalities in the execution of their executive responsibilities. Thank you very much.

Mr W M THRING: Through you, hon House Chair, I think, Deputy Minister, you have very clearly and correctly indicated that there are sufficient laws and systems in place to prevent municipalities from unauthorised, irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure. Sadly, the systems and structures that we have in place, including MFMA and Supply Chain Management Acts are not sufficient to prevent our municipalities from continuing to incur huge irregular expenditure.

Hon Deputy Minister, our municipalities are the coalface of service delivery. As initiators and implementers of local economic development, their role in growing employment, reducing poverty and inequality in our communities is fundamentally important. Sadly, the role has been undermined by political infighting and essentially poor governance as indicated by the Auditor-General's report 2017-18; only 18 municipalities managed to receive a clean audit. The Auditor-General lamented that, "the quality of the financial statements provided to us for auditing was even worse than the previous year".

Irregular expenditure remains high at R25,2 billion. Road sanitation and water infrastructure within our municipalities are in a state of crisis. How many municipalities are under administration or on the verge of being placed under administration, under investigation and how many officials and councillors have been investigated and arrested for corrupt behaviour as required by our consequence management policies? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, I can confirm that

currently 40 municipalities are under section 139(1) (b) in terms of intervening to ensure that municipalities undertake the executive obligations. I can also confirm that working with the Hawks, SA Police Services and the National Prosecuting Authority, NPA, a number of initiatives have been undertaken to investigate and prosecute offenders both political and administrative, and we would be able to provide the hon member with the numbers if so required. Thank you very much.

Ms T BREEDT: Hon Deputy Minister, you have now mentioned section 139 of the Constitution and I think you said 40 are currently under administration. Would you not agree that our councils and our municipal managers are not taking the MFMA seriously and are not actually enforcing and laying criminal charges? Would you not say that section 139 is not working specifically in the Free State and that our municipalities are actually worse off, taking into account section 139 administration? Thank you, Madam Chair.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, I think that there has been an overemphasis on section 139 (1) (b) in terms of interventions that are being made. Part of what we

have decided on, as a department, is to ensure that we look at the entire section 139, starting with, in the first instance, 139(1)(a), which provides that directives can be issued by the MEC if a municipality has not undertaken its executive obligations requiring that, that be taken so that you do not intervene at the point that the problem has become too big to handle, and you need to appoint an administrator. So, it would be issuing a directive that requires them to take appropriate action timeously.

Furthermore, we are placing greater emphasis on section 154 which is about providing support to local government in undertaking its executive obligations. In that way, we intend to ensure that we prevent a situation where we are forced to intervene through either dissolution or the appointment of an administrator. But that is in terms of changing the focus of what we do in all as government approach to support local government in undertaking the responsibilities. Thank you very much.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Hon Chair, Hlengwa is harassing me. Deputy Minister, what are the reasons for irregular expenditure from those municipalities except political instability which is caused by infighting within your political party which is the ANC, corruption and cadre

deployment? [Interjections.] Since you took over in this department as a Deputy Minister, which systems have you put in place to prevent this infighting which is collapsing our municipalities?

Ndicela singazimeli ngamagama amakhulu angoo ...

*(Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.)*

[Please do not hide behind big words like ...]

... mismanagement and so on and so forth.

You are fighting one another; one faction of the ANC is fighting with another faction and that is why we do not have municipalities in South Africa. [Interjections.] So, please come clean, Deputy Minister, and tell us what systems have you put in place because people are suffering on the ground? It is not the factions of the ANC that are suffering, you S-curl. [Time expired.]

[Interjections.]

Mr M HLENGWA: Hon House Chair, I do not mean to interrupt the Deputy Minister. Whilst it may have been jocular, I think something of such serious nature being read into Hansard is quite a serious indictment, and can she please

withdraw that particular part because she read it into the records!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Can I allow that? We are aware that it is on the records but the Table staff will deal with that. I just want the two of you to settle it. Thank you. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, I think in the first instance, it is important to indicate that the Back-to-Basics programme looks at, amongst others, improving governance and municipalities both in terms of the interface between the political and administrative components of the municipalities, but also the relationships amongst political office bearers to ensure that these are able to undertake their responsibilities judiciously.

The second point which I think is important to relate to, is that in terms of the District Co-ordination Development Model that was unveiled by the President yesterday, the intention is to establish hubs in all the districts that would be able to support and provide support both from governance, technical and financial

point of view to all the municipalities, over and above the other responsibilities that it would undertake. Thank you very much.

Mr M S CHABANE: Hon House Chair, we are not taking the question. It was a mistake, Chair. Thank you.

Ms P P XABA-NTSHABA: Hon Chair, the Minister deployed experts as part of the District Technical Support Teams to distressed municipalities supported by the rapid response technical teams, to focus on infrastructure planning, delivery and maintenance, financial management support, governance and administration issues. Hon Deputy Minister, which municipalities have positively responded to the intervention by the department? Thank you, Chair.  
[Applause.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chairperson and hon members, firstly to indicate that on the technical support side to ensure that there is implementation of the Municipal Infrastructure Grants, 42 of the 55 municipalities identified for improvement in capital expenditure have demonstrated results and the list of those municipalities will be provided, hon member. But also in relation to

revenue enhancement plans, revenue enhancement plans have been developed for municipalities and the list of those will be provided; and we are beginning to see improvement in revenue collection in those municipalities where such revenue enhancement plans have been developed. Thank you very much.

**Steps to resolve issue of municipalities owing money to Eskom iro Minister of Finance, department and Presidency being cited as respondents**

113. Mr G G Mpumza (ANC) asked the Minister of

Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs:

What steps does she intend to take to resolve the issue of municipalities owing money to Eskom as the government has received a number of applications by different business bodies against Eskom and certain municipalities, in which the Minister of Finance, her department and The Presidency have been cited as respondents?

NO1996E

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order! We move to Question 113, hon Deputy Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, as asked by the hon Mpumza. Hon Deputy Minister ... [Interjections.] Hon

Khawula, do you need assistance? [Interjections.]

[Laughter.] Thank you. Continue, hon Deputy Minister.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, an interministerial task team on electricity reticulation and distribution, led by the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, was established to deal with the challenges of debt between municipalities and Eskom.

In 2018, Cogta, as chair of the interministerial task team, appointed an advisory panel to look at challenges between Eskom and municipalities. After extensive analysis through an advisory panel, the interministerial task team resolved on the following key responses to assist municipalities in dealing with, amongst other things, bulk service debt: the installation of prepaid meters in all municipalities to curb further growth in the debtor's book; the appointment of independent revenue collection agencies for municipalities; a campaign to encourage a culture of payment for municipal services so that municipalities are able to pay their debts; the strict management of payment default with firm actions by government before court processes even come into effect; the fixing of municipalities to ensure the sustainability

of services, good governance and sound financial management practices in line with the current Back-to-Basics support model where a distinction is made between the municipalities that require intervention and those that require support; that municipalities have exclusive executive authority over electricity reticulation in terms of the Constitution since this recommendation is based on the Constitution and that Eskom has to sign a service-delivery agreement with municipalities, and that the restructuring of debt and establishment of a model that is linked to incentives for municipalities that service their Eskom and water-services' boards' accounts should be developed by a technical committee.

The implementation plans based on these recommendations will be submitted in due course to Cabinet for approval. Thank you very much.

Mr G G MPUMZA: Through you, Chairperson, hon Deputy Minister, the issue of municipalities owing Eskom is a socioeconomic matter and is political in nature, and it requires a political solution.

Deputy Minister, what steps have been taken to resolve the issue of municipalities owing money to Eskom as the government has received a number of applications by

different business bodies against Eskom and certain municipalities, in which the Minister of Finance and your Ministry and the President are cited? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, over and above the points that I have raised, I think it is important to emphasise that we have identified that there are systemic, structural and related issues that impact on debt by municipalities to Eskom. Some of these have to do with the structure of interest, and negotiations have been held with Eskom and the SA Local Government Association, Salga, to resolve this. Some of these include dealing with matters relating to the supply of electricity in Eskom-supplied areas and the impact this has on the municipalities and their abilities for effective credit control. Some of these have to do with the point that I made earlier about the service-level agreements, because we indeed believe that electricity is an effective means through which you can effect credit control; and, by improving collection by local government, you can ensure that they are able to pay their dues to Eskom and water services boards. Thank you very much.

Mr M H HOOSEN: Hon Deputy Minister, one of the reasons why municipalities are struggling to pay their debts to Eskom is because there are large amounts of money that are actually owed to the municipalities. In fact, Salga pointed out to us two weeks ago that there is about R127 billion owed to municipalities for electricity, and R128 billion for water.

Government departments owe municipalities about R20 billion, and municipalities owe Eskom about R20 billion. Do you realise, hon Minister, that if you get these government departments to pay what is owed to the municipalities, municipalities will be able to pay their debts to Eskom? [Interjections.] What steps are you going to take to sort this matter out?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, I agree that if government departments do pay, they would help municipalities meet their obligations, and that is a process currently underway with the respective departments, led by the Department of Public Works, to ensure that all government departments meet their obligations. Thank you very much.

Mr W W WESSELS: House Chair, the Deputy Minister did touch on it, but the fact of the matter is that the historic debt owed to Eskom is not being addressed currently. There are many disputes regarding the debt owed to Eskom by municipalities, such as the billing date and the penalties which resulted because of the nominated minimum demand that has not been revised for many years. Also, there is the offset of historic debt of Eskom to the municipalities that is being disputed. The question is: There was a process of facilitation more than two years ago. What is the current status? Is there any progress being made to get to a solution with regard to these disputes and to prevent historic debt in the future because of billing dates, nominated minimum demand and so forth? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, the matter of notified maximum demand constitutes part of the report that was provided by the advisory panel to the interministerial task team. The recommendations thereof were provided to Cabinet and Cabinet has agreed on a set of steps that need to be undertaken to deal with matters such as interest and compounded interest, notified maximum demand and other related issues that are

impacting on the ability of municipalities to pay their dues to Eskom.

The interministerial task team is being reconvened to ensure that these recommendations are taken forward, and a report in that regard would be provided. Thank you very much.

Mnu K P SITHOLE: Sihlalo, mhlonishwa Sekela Ngqongqoshe, engicela ukukwazi ukuthi njengoba kukhona iminyango ehlulekayo ukukhokhela omasipala, ngabe uyayazi yini ukuthi yimiphi leyo minyango? Ngabe ukuxhumana komnyango wakho naleyo minyango kungakanani nanokuthi-ke, uma kukhona, izimisele ukuthi izokhokha kanjani ukuze omasipala bakwazi ukukhokhela u-Eskom? *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Mr K P SITHOLE: Through you, Chairperson, hon Deputy Minister, do you know which departments are failing to pay the municipalities? How constant does your department contact those departments, and if there are any, how prepared are they to pay the municipalities so that they can pay Eskom?]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, my sense is that ...

... bese ngiwuphendulile lowo mbuzo. Iminyango ekumele sikhulume ngawo singa ... [Akuzwakali.] ... kuyo sisho ukuthi, nansi iminyango engakakhokhi, silungise lokho. Ngiyabonga. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[... I have already responded to that question.

Departments that we must talk about can ... [Inaudible.]

... to them we are saying that here are departments that are not paying and fix that. Thank you.]

**Mainstreaming of women, youth and persons with  
disabilities within policy and programming across  
Government**

122. Ms F A Masiko (ANC) asked the Minister in The Presidency for Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities:

How will her Office ensure the mainstreaming of women, youth and persons with disabilities within policy and programming across the Government? NO2005E

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Chair, the department developed a framework on gender-responsive planning, budgeting, monitoring, evaluation and auditing which has been adopted by Cabinet on the 27 March 2019 for implementation during the sixth administration of our government.

The framework advocates for the country and government-wide systems to be gender-responsive in its evidence-based public policy and result-based management approach. It is a tool for mainstreaming gender in government processes through putting on a gender lens and endangering plans for budget, monitoring, evaluation and auditing systems, in order to achieve gender equality and equity, and harness the gender dividend to promote inclusive growth and development.

So, we will be working with the Department of Small Business Development and others to make sure that women also get their space and are set aside, as President has raised earlier on, using this instrument, and the same goes for our youth. The purpose of this would be to ensure that youth development is mainstreamed across departments in all spheres of government to affirm this decision.

The Cabinet approved National Youth Policy 2020. A draft youth-mainstreaming guidelines for youth-responsive budgeting, monitoring, and evaluation and auditing, has been developed and it is currently in the consultation process prior to its presentation to Cabinet for approval. For persons with disabilities, with regard to mainstreaming their rights, the department is co-ordinating the implementation of the White Paper on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and its implementation matrix across government.

Furthermore, the department is required to submit progress-compliance report of the implementation to Cabinet. The department has been working with the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, in ensuring that disability is mainstreamed across the Medium-Term Strategic Framework, MTSF 2019-24. We have commenced with the domestication of the United Nations Conventions on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, a process which will be inclusive of rectifying and domesticating even the African Union, AU, protocol for the rights of the persons with disabilities in Africa, as well as the legislating key aspects in our department.

The development of national disability law will strengthen the enforcement of the obligation and the

commitments contained in this instrument, ensuring that disability becomes the business of every one of us, and that accountability and duty-bearers are resourced and for rights ... [Inaudible.] ... this does not happen without guidance. Thank you. [Time expired.]

MODULASETULO WA NGWAKO (Moh M G Boroto): Potšišo ya tlaleletšo e tla botšišwa ke Mme Zanele Nkomo legatong la Mme Masiko. (*Translation of Sepedi sentence follows.*)

[The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Ms Zanele Nkomo will ask a supplementary question on behalf of Ms Masiko.]

Ms Z NKOMO: Minister, what determines the targets you will set for the country? Are those targets scientific and evidence-based or have they been set without evidence-based planning? We need to ensure impact with resources and urgency of interventions. A monitoring framework is necessary, however, the targets determine the impact. Explain how the targets are reached. Thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: The targets are part of the MTSF seven priorities linked to the interventions by

several departments. And, they respond to the implementation which includes gender, youth and disabilities as cross-cutting. The targets are set through the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation process for the MTSF development with the department in response to the government priorities.

The targets for women, youth and persons with disabilities are extracted from the set MTSF targets through the process of ensuring that they are responsive to gender, youth and persons with disabilities. The Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities monitors performance of the indicators and the achievements of the targets towards the empowerment of women, youth and persons with disabilities. Thank you.

Ms N K SHARIF: Hon Minister, this National Gender Machinery Framework that you are speaking about, hasn't even been released for public comment yet, due to the delays on the cluster consultation. So, your department dismally, was unable to achieve the first quarter target that you have set out for this National Gender Machinery Framework. So, what steps will you and the department take to fast-track this framework and implement it across government? I thank you. [Applause.]

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Fortunately hon member, you sit in the committee and you know the resolve we have to work together and to make sure that the commitment we are making, we will implement, particularly in this sixth administration and also from the encouragement we got from the President in the morning that we must work as conjoined government with the private sector and other stakeholders in the communities. [Interjections.]

[Applause.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: Yebo-ke Ngqongqoshe, Sihlalo, Ngqongqoshe, uma uthi uyabheka nje la eNingizimu Afrika intsha yonke ifundile. Intsha yonke ayisebenzi. Nesebenzayo ize iyithole imisebenzi ngabangani bayo. Iningi layo ubona isigcina ingena kwizidakamizwa notshwala.

Yingenxa yokuthi Ngqongqoshe loHulumeni okhona akayinakile. Kanjalo, ngifuna ukwazi ukuthi, khona la okhuluma khona ngokubathuthukisa, yikuphi la ozobathuthukisa khona ngoba kuyimanje intsha ihambile kwathiwa ayiqale ama-co-operatives kodwa namanje ayiqashwa, ayiwutholi umsebenzi.

I-National Youth Development Agency, NYDA, Ngqongqoshe, siyakutshela ngisho nalapho sinenkinga, lento enikhuluma ngayo eyenu njengo-ANC futhi nayo le esondelene nani. Ngqongqoshe, yinini la esiyobona khona intsha yethu ikwazi njengoba siyifundisile ibuye izothuthukisa emakhaya. Ngicela impendulo eqonde ngqo. [Isikhathi siphelile.]

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Siyabonga mama! Siyabonga mama! Isikhathi sakho siphelile, sengiyacima manje. [Ubuwelewele.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: Kwabakhubazekile namanje anibanakile, abanazo ngisho izxindawo zokusebenza kumabhilidi aHulumeni. Phendula! (*Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Yes, hon Minister! Hon Minister, when one looks at the South African youth, one notes that they are educated. But they do not have work. And even those who are working, got those jobs through their friends. One finds that most of them end up using drugs and alcohol.

That is because this government is not taking care of them, hon Minister. Therefore, that when you spoke about

developing them, I want to know where will we be developing them from, because as it is now they have been asked to start the co-operatives but they are not employed. They cannot find work.

Hon Minister, I am telling you that we have a challenge even with the National Youth Development Agency, NYDA. What you are talking about is yours as the ANC and the youth that is associated with you. Hon Minister, when will we see our youth able to come and develop their homesteads as their parents had sent them to school to be better people? I request a straight forward answer. [Time expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, mama! Thank you, mama! Your time has expired, I am now switching off the machine. [Interjections.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: Even now, you do not take care of the people with disabilities, and they do not even have places to work in government buildings. Respond!]

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon Khawula, another respected member of our committee, we are in this together. Youth unemployment is a scourge that comes second after gender-

based violent and femicide, as far as the pain that our children are going through. As we consult and do advocacy work across the country, we come across the likes of the late Bavelile Hlongwa, who was an engineer. May her soul rest in peace. If she was not with the National Youth Development Agency, NYDA, and if she was not the Deputy Minister, I am sure she would have been unemployed with her qualifications.

In the past, we were made to believe that black children are unemployable because they don't have the requisite skills. Now, since we know that they have, we have these thousands that we have to work with and employ in partnership with government and private sector. But we must also make the programmes that we run real with trade and industry and small-scale business. This is what we should be implementing in this sixth administration.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Umama uHlengwa.

[Ubuwelewele.]

Nk M D HLENGWA: Kunjalo! (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Mrs Hlengwa.

[Interjections.]

Mrs M D HLENGWA: It is true!]

Minister, are you satisfied that all government buildings and workplaces are accessible for persons with disability? Here I am speaking about physical building restrictions which may limit or restrict a person with disability, mentally, sensory or as regards mobility functions, to undertake or perform work or task in the same way as a person who does not have disability? I thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: You are reminding that here in the Western Cape, we have a case pending in court, just outside Cape Town, in a small OK Bazaars, where a mother tried to walk into that stall and was pushed back because she was pushing a child in a wheelchair and she was told no, they can't get in there because it was not accessible. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Shameful!

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: So, even between the aisles in the shop, she was told that there was no space for the wheelchair to move. They got a lawyer who was prepared to

take up their case and we joined in to make sure that we follow this up. Yes, government must move fast. In all our government buildings, there should be access for persons with disabilities. We should also make use of the 4IR, that people with disabilities ... [Interjections.] ... I said Fourth Industrial Revolution. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Minister, don't listen to him. Continue.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: I think he misses me. So, the Fourth Industrial Revolution will assist us in giving or providing support for people living with disabilities. People living with disabilities say that disability offers them the differentiation in their communities. They don't need our mercy. They need our support. So, yes, access to government buildings should not be a favour; it should be a must. And, as we do advocacy work, this is one of our priority areas, particularly for persons living with disabilities. [Applause.]

**Total number of forensic investigations into fruitless and wasteful, unauthorised and irregular expenditure incurred by her department and total amount of fruitless**

**and wasteful, unauthorised and irregular expenditure  
recovered as a result**

127. Mr C Brink (DA) asked the Minister of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs:

What (a) total number of forensic investigations into fruitless and wasteful, unauthorised and irregular expenditure incurred by her department since 1 April 2016 have been concluded and (b) total amount of fruitless and wasteful, unauthorised and irregular expenditure incurred has been recovered as a result?

NO2012E

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, there were two forensic investigations that have been concluded for the period from 1 April 2016 to date, pertaining to irregular expenditure. The department is implementing the recommendations of the investigation in collaboration with relevant role-players, including the SA Police Service and other law enforcement agencies.

To date, the department has recovered R13,4 million from implementing agents as a result of financial loss on

asset management. The department is seeking clarity with regard to the interpretation of the approval granted by National Treasury pertaining to the contracting of two Non-profit organisations, NPOs, through a transfer model, which the Auditor-General of SA has deemed as irregular.

A meeting has been scheduled with National Treasury, in particular the Chief Procurement Officer, the Budget Office and the Accountant-General, together with the Auditor-General and the department, to deal with the interpretation impasse. Thank you very much.

Mr C BRINK: House Chair, the annual reports of the department make it clear that the bulk of this irregular expenditure comes from the Community Work Programme - in fact, the two financial years preceding. The Deputy Minister made reference to the irregular tender to so-called non-profit organisations, but the other issue is the payment of Community Development Workers. It wasn't justified in terms of supporting documentation. So, we don't actually know what they did or if they did anything.

Chair, under the ANC-led government, the so-called nongovernmental organisations have been allowed to commit gross misdeeds. [Interjections.] In a Life Esidimeni

tragedy, money wasn't only lost; the lives of more than 100 vulnerable people were lost at the hands of unlicensed, irresponsible non-profit organisations working with government money. [Interjections.]

In respect of the more than R1 billion in the preceding ... [Interjections.] ... two financial years in the ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order!

Mr C BRINK: ... Community Work Programme: Can the Deputy Minister confirm whether any officials responsible for the irregular tender and irregular expenditure have been charged with misconduct and fired? How many of them were involved; and how many civil claims have already been instituted to recover money that has not yet been recovered? Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Again, hon members, let's remind ourselves about Rule 142 (7). Continue, hon Deputy Minister.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, I am certain that hon Brink is not suggesting that NPOs in South Africa, in

their existence and of themselves, are an irregularity. They have an important role to play in the provision of services and indeed can be partners to government in the implementation of particular programmes. As an NPO-approach to partnerships with community-based organisations, where we have identified irregularities, let us deal with the irregularities, but not, in fact, attack NPOs. [Interjections.]

Now, coming back to specific issues, I can state that there is a process currently underway, that deals with corrective action against the officials in the department if such have been identified to have acted irregularly; but also against the NPOs because some of the irregularities are happening inside these organisations. [Interjections.] I think I have responded. I am not sure if this is going to assist in terms of response. [Interjections.]

Mr J W W JULIUS: Point of order, House Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Oh, hon Julius. Yes, what is your point?

Mr J W W JULIUS: The question was direct: Was anyone fired? [Interjections.] We can't keep on the whole dodging questions in the House? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon member, what is your point of order?

Mr J W W JULIUS: The Deputy Minister did not answer the follow-up question. Thank you! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you very much. You know what to do in that case. Thank you!

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Through you, hon House Chair, Deputy Minister, in line with serious challenges at municipalities, on 23 March 2020, there is an invitation from Umvoti Local Municipality for your department and the provincial department of KwaZulu-Natal. The NFP is having a march and wants to hand over a memorandum in terms of the corruption in that municipality. Are you aware of it? Are you going to be attending it? If not; why not? That is the first thing. The second thing is: How many of these people that you are dealing with are repeat offenders from the previous financial year?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Shaik Emam, I just said please refer to Rule 142(7). Thank you very much. I am not going to say what it is because I want members to go and read that Rule. Hon Deputy Minister!

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): With regard to the march, I am not aware of it. Therefore, I cannot indicate whether, in fact, we will attend such a march. It is referred to 23 March 2020; so, we will wait and find out what the march is about and engage with you.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Sorry, I meant 23 September 2019!

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Oh, sorry! Thank very much, hon House Chair. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, hon members! Allow the Deputy Minister to respond.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, to the best of my

knowledge, when we are dealing with irregular expenditure in particular, we do not have a list of repeat offenders and it is something that we'll have to look at. Thank you very much.

Mr M H HOUSEN: Deputy Minister, one of the forensic investigations that were conducted - you might recall - is a report in the eThekweni Municipality which is titled the Manase report. It was a forensic investigation into billions of rand of fraud and corruption, which fingered a number of officials, including the former Mayor Obed Mlaba. You will remember that he was eventually given an appointment as a High Commissioner of South Africa in the UK, where he continued his dodgy dealings.

Nothing has happened to anyone of them up until today. There has been no accountability for the billions of rand that have disappeared in that municipality. I want to ask you, Deputy Minister, if you are serious about cleaning up corruption in municipalities. That Manase report is sitting with the NPA; nothing has happened. Are you willing to resurrect that report and make sure that the NPA takes action against those officials? Please give us an answer. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, I have not read the Manase report myself, and it certainly was not part of the original question. So, I would not have been able to prepare accordingly. Thank you very much. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon Deputy Minister. The last supplementary question will come ... [Interjections.] That is also in the Rules, for your information. Hon Mente!

Nksz M V MENTE: Sekela Mphathiswa, siyayiva impendulo yakho ekuqaleni ethi abantu babekwa amatyala abanye basiwe kwinkqubo yezobulungisa. Ingxaki yam ...  
*(Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)*

[Ms M V MENTE: Hon Deputy Minister, we hear your response at the beginning which says that people are charged and others are taken to the justice system. My problem ...]

... is that what the department as a mother to municipalities portray, is what the municipalities practice. Recently, we faced 48 municipalities that have

been receiving adverse findings from the Auditor-General

...

... akukho nto yenzekayo kwaba bantu. (*Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.*).

[... nothing happens to these people.]

And, they are at the coalface of service delivery! Now, can we get a timeline where the report is going to be finalised? Because, spending money on forensic investigation and then we spend another time for this term that you are in office - I don't want to say pretending to be doing something ... [Interjections.] But, when are we finalising the disciplinary cases? And when are we getting court dates, so that we can also go and see those people ... [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for the Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, I can confirm that a number of criminal cases have been opened and, in fact, prosecutorial action is being initiated in many of these cases. As to when such will be concluded by the criminal justice system, it would not be within my competence to be able to provide that answer. Thank you very much.

**Steps department intends taking to comprehensively  
address the problem of femicide and rape in the Republic**

137. Ms N P Sonti (EFF) asked the Minister in The  
Presidency for Women, Youth and Persons with  
Disabilities:

What steps does her department intend to take to  
comprehensively address the problem of femicide and  
rape in the Republic, in light of the recent  
publication of attacks on and murder of women over  
the past few weeks?

NO2022E

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS  
WITH DISABILITIES: Madam House Chair, the President had  
dealt with this question at length this afternoon. Let me  
just repeat that indeed the women of South Africa had  
come out in their numbers and again this afternoon, all  
parties have indeed said "enough is enough". So, we have  
looked and we will continue reflecting on ... not to do  
nothing, given *Umkhombandlela* that starting from  
tomorrow, in the next six months, we must start showing  
that we are responding to the cries of the people in this  
situation of emergency. Starting from the role of  
legislation, that if there is a legislation which is now  
maybe moribund and becomes an obstacle, it needs to be

relooked at. On the creation of oversight on the steering committee, we are starting with the Emergency Action Plan, as soon as possible and we will be abandoning policies that no longer work, as I said. With the support of the steering committee and other partners, enhance the work that Parliament could do in fast-tracking the implementation of this emergency rollout plan.

We spoke at length also with the President on the role of the police service, the shortage of the DNA tests, and the challenges that come with drugs and alcohol. I think what is left is implementation, implementation and more implementation.

Nksz N P SONTI: Nyamezela Mphathiswa sesiza kugqiba.

*(Translation of isiXhosa sentence follows.)*

[Ms N P SONTI: Be patient Minister, we are about to finish.]

Minister, apart from policing of these violent attacks against women, have you considered what might may be the underlying causes of this hatred of women in society? If you have, what needs to be done to uproot the causes and not the symptoms of these crimes? Thank you.

TONA YA BASADI, BASWA LE BATHO BAO BA SA ITEKANELAGO  
OFISING YA MOPRESIDENTE: Ke thomile ka gore, "Tlogatloga  
e tloga kgale, modiši wa kgomo o tšwa natšo šakeng." A re  
godišeng bana ba rena gabotse. (*Translation of Sepedi  
paragraph follows.*)

[The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND  
PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: I started by saying, a stitch  
in time saves nine. Let us raise our kids well.]

The root cause is how we raise ... [Interjections.]

Ms N P SONTI: On a point of order, House Chair ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): What's your  
point of order, hon member?

Ms N P SONTI: ... can I proceed?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Yes, proceed.

Ms N P SONTI: Ndiyacela Sihlalo ohloniphekileyo, ukuba  
uMphathiswa andiphendule ngolwimi endiza kululandela. Oo  
a rha rha aba andibalandeli. Ndiyacela, ndiyacela,  
ndiyacela. (*Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.*)

[Ms N P SONTI: Please hon Chairperson, can the Minister answer me in the language that I will understand. I do not understand these words. Please, please, please.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you, hon member. Hon Sonti ...

... kukhona lo mshini oseduze kwakho lapho, ungawusebenzisa. (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[... there is a device next to you; you can use it.]

O ka no tšwela pele, mohl Tona. (*Translation of Sepedi sentence follows.*)

[You may continue, hon Minister.]

TONA YA BASADI, BANA LE BATHO BAO BA SA ITEKANELAGO  
OFISING YA MOPRESIDENTE: Ke tšwela pele mo ke feditšego  
gona, ke re a re godišeng bana gabotse ka malapeng a  
rena. Bana ba swanetše ba godišwa ka tsela ya maleba,  
bašemane ba tsebe go hlompha basetsana go tloga  
bonnyaneng bja bona, ba tlogele go rutwa go ba dipoo e sa  
le ba bannyane ... [Tsenoganong.] ... ke ka moo re tla

kgonago go tšwela pele re godiša setšhaba gabotse.

*(Translation of Sepedi paragraphs follows.)*

[The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: I continue from where I have stopped, and I say let us raise our kids well in our homes. Kids should be raised properly, and boys should respect girls from early childhood. They must stop being bullies from early childhood ... [Interjections.] ... that is how we can have a properly raised society.]

It takes a village because you grow from a home into a village, and that is why we say, "It takes a village to raise a child". So, if we have tolerance of drunkenness and drug abuse under watch, we will have a continuation of this problem. This challenge that we are faced with needs all of us, all of the society in whichever corner we sit. The government's stance in the national strategic plan is to end gender-based violence by allocating more resources. The President has announced R1,1 billion that should be utilized as we rise. So, we should stop hiding behind lack of resources and there will be no additional money. The stance is informed by article one and article 18 of the Summit Declaration on Gender-Based Violence, that are linked to 24 goals, which are nongovernmental organizations, NGO, lists focusing on prevention. So,

partnership between NGOs and government will start unfolding through the steering committee. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Nk M D HLENGWA: Hhayi! Ngidedeleni ngikhulume. Nami kade nginidedele. Sihlalo weNdlu, Ngqongqoshe, njengoba manje seluvame kakhulu udlame nombhedukazwe nendluzula ebhekiswe kakhulu kwabesifazane ngale, isitha, ikakhulu emakhaya. Uzobhekana kanjani nezizathu ezingumsuka walolu dlame nombhedukazwe?

Lokhu kubonakala kuwukulahlekelwa isimilo nokungagcinwa komthetho emphakathini. Lolu hlelo luyoqala nini ukuqoqa izimilo zabantu? Ngiyabonga. (*Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.*)

[Mrs M D HLENGWA: No! Allow me to speak. I have also allowed you to speak. House Chairperson and hon Minister, as violence is so common these days that it is becoming a crisis including gender-based-violence, especially in the rural areas, how are you going to deal with the root causes of this crisis?

This looks like the loss of morals and lawlessness in communities. When will the moral regeneration programme start to regenerate people's morals? Thank you.]

TONA YA BASADI, BANA LE BATHO BAO BA SA ITEKANELAGO

OFISING YA MOPRESIDENTE: Mma Hlengwa, taba ya semelo o e rutwa ka lapeng; ga o ithute semelo seterateng. Go ba le semelo goba molao go ra gore ge o le mošemane, go hlompha mmago le kgaetšedi ya gago - ngwana wa mosetsana, go tšwa ka lapeng, ga go tšwe seterateng ... [Tsenoganong.] ... ebile e ka se tsoge e bile mošomo wa mmušo. (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Ms Hlengwa, charity begins at home, and not in the street. A sound character or obedience implies that as a boy, you have to show respect for your mother and sister - that is your girl-sibling - and it starts at home, not on the streets ... [Interjections.] ... that will never be the responsibility of the government.]

Government is an enabler to support communities, but communities cannot relegate their responsibilities to government. Communities have to work in partnership with government.

Ge re be re sa gola, taba ya go kata le go bolaya basadi e be e le bohloa; e be e le seila. (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[When we grew up, rape and the killing of women was an abomination; it was taboo.]

We should all be wondering what the hell has happened to our people. Where does this self-hate come from? This misogyny that makes a man feel he can only be, if he can defeat a woman by maiming, raping and killing her, indicates that we are not properly socialized from childhood.

Ngakhoke mama uHlengwa, nibadala, siyanithanda. Fundisani abantwana bethu. Sisizeni khona bezokhula kahle. Bakhule ngomthetho. Singathi, bezoba bekushaya esikoleni ... bazokufundisa umthetho ... umthetho kumele uqale ekhaya ... *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Therefore, Mrs Hlengwa, you are our elders and we love you. Teach our children. Give assistance so that they can grow up as law-abiding citizens. We should not say to them, go to school, they will beat you up as they would be teaching you to behave well ... that must start at home ...]

... before we send a child to someone outside.

Ms A S HLONGO: Minister, we have heard the President's target of bail conditions and retraining of police officers, and these are actions and interventions after the incidents of violence have taken place in the past few weeks. What is the department going to do in preventing all these incidents of gender-based violence in the future? Thank you. [Applause.]

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: We indeed have listened to the President and all the other leaders who participated in the debate this afternoon and the call made to the criminal justice system was that they need to come to the party, and they will be assisted as we work in a conjoined government, as I said earlier on. Working together with the nongovernmental organizations that have made themselves ready have helped us to put up the steering committee that the President has been talking about, which should help us start the implementation of this emergency plan together. That, needs to be done, and all the Ministers have not disagreed. We, as a department, have a responsibility, working together with monitoring and evaluation, to make sure that we not only do advocacy work but we also monitor progress. We also take the offer of the Department of Public Service and Administration, that we work with Government

Communication and Information Services, GCIS, to go far and near to communicate with our people that the bug stops here; enough is enough, and there's no more death going forward. Above all, the bail conditions are going to be changed, and all the things that were beginning to make the perpetrators feel comfortable have been addressed by the President, including the matter of resources. [Time expired.]

Ms N K SHARIF: Hon Minister, last week the committee was presented with a list of the top 30 police stations that have the most rape cases reported. I then did oversight in my constituency in Soweto West and found that none of the police stations in my constituency have any rape kits. In fact, Dobsonville Police Station which is in the top 10 police stations in the country with the highest number of sexual offences reported, hasn't had a rape kit since March 2017. My question here is, What ... and please list the steps and not just rhetoric - What are the immediate concrete steps that you will be taking to collaborate with and hold the police accountable, and ensure that Thuthuzela Care Centres are resourced?

[Applause.]

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon member, this carnage is going to

be resolved because there is no finger-pointing but there is partnership. You had shared that information that you are talking about with us in the committee. The President spoke at length today giving details on how we are going to be dealing with these matters because we shared the information. So, this information that the President was utilizing this afternoon did not come from one department. This is because we had presented all the work that you also contributed to, as you rightfully said, when you did your oversight work. That's the results of the debate of this afternoon. So, I am pointedly saying, if you want me to repeat or state the points which the President made this morning, we don't have enough time but they are the outcomes of the work we have been doing with you.

**Steps against municipalities that fail to perform basic responsibilities and functions that promote good governance, transparency and accountability and ensuring citizens' rights to basic service delivery are upheld as contained in sections 152 and 153 of Constitution**

112. Ms M M Tlou (ANC) asked the Minister of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs:

What steps does she intend to take against municipalities (a) that fail to perform basic responsibilities and functions that promote good governance, transparency and accountability and (b) to ensure that citizens' rights to basic service delivery are upheld as contained in sections 152 and 153 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996?

NO1995E

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, government has recently adopted the district co-ordination development model, which will be implemented across the 44 district and eight metropolitan municipalities, where all developmental initiatives will be viewed through a district-wide lens, and where development will be pursued through single integrated plans per district. The model is a practical intergovernmental relations mechanism for all three spheres of government to work jointly, to plan and act in unison.

The model consists of a process by which joint and collaborative planning is undertaken at local, district and metropolitan sphere, together by all three spheres of government resulting in a single strategically focused

one plan for each of the 52 geographic spaces of the country. The one plan will consist of the objectives, outputs, roles and responsibilities, and commitments in terms of which all spheres, departments as well as partners will have to act, and against which they will be held accountable for prioritising resources and delivering results.

We have identified the Eastern Cape province as a good example of the need for an all-of-government intervention, and yesterday government launched the model in the O R Tambo District Municipality. As part of our interventions to strengthen and promote good governance in local government, we are in the process of finalising amendments to the Municipal Structures Bill; in this regard the Bill is currently before NCOP. Thank you very much.

Ms M M TLOU: Hon Deputy Minister, my question is in light of municipal objectives in section 152 and 153 of the country's Constitution. What are the reasons that have been advanced for noncompliance with these constitutional responsibilities? I thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for Provincial and Local

Government): I think it is important to state that, in fact, some of the reasons that have been provided relate to the financial viability of certain municipalities which inhibits their ability to perform the services that they have been assigned. The second issue relates to the institutional capacity of municipalities i.e. the ability to attract and maintain engineers, town planners and other technical capabilities, that are important in the execution of their responsibilities. Lastly, I think it is important to refer to the observation that, in fact, governance also plays a role impacting on the way in which our municipalities are performing. Thank you very much.

Mr C BRINK: House Chair, in line with the question of what the Minister can do to intervene in recalcitrant municipalities, I am sure the Deputy Minister is aware of section 57 (A) of the Municipal Systems Act which requires the Minister to keep a record of municipal officials dismissed for misconduct, as well as officials who have resigned before their disciplinary hearings have been completed. The question is: (1) Has that record been maintained and updated by the Minister and her predecessor and if so, how is it that Nancy Rampedi, former Chief Financial Officer, CFO of the Moretele Municipality in the North West province that invested or

deposited R50 million in Venda Build Society, VBS, Mutual Bank was allowed to resign from that job and is now a municipal manager of the Makhuduthamaga Local Municipality in Limpopo province? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for Provincial and Local Government): House Chair, in the current administration we have not reviewed the list of those officials who are responsible, at least to the best of my knowledge. Therefore, I am unable to provide a detailed response as to the status of the list and the most recent time at which it was updated. I will also struggle to give the response with regard to the specific official referred to. Thank you very much.

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Deputy Minister, you will work today, it was reported earlier this year that about 87 municipalities are completely dysfunctional in the country. So, my question is: Do you have the capacity as a department to do the monitoring on the municipalities as a department? The reason why I am asking this question specifically, is that when we had a strategic plan this year with the department, I specifically asked one of your officials who happen to be the deputy director-general, DDG, about the electricity in Kwazulu-Natal and

he said he completely did not know that there is that programme. So, I was so worried in the strategic plan that, if at the DDG level an official didn't know what was expected of him/her, and that there is that programme taking place, how do you ensure that the basic service is taking place if they don't have the capacity and don't know what is happening on the ground?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, I think it is important to state that in all provinces, Back to Basics teams have been appointed to ensure that they monitor and support the work of municipalities. What we have also said, which I indicated in my response, is that through the district co-ordinated development model, hubs will be established in all the districts. So, we are now decentralising to go to 52 offices throughout the country which will be established to oversee and support local government at the most basic level, which is the point at which they operate.

Parallel to that, the model will also enable co-ordination of national government plans, priorities and programmes together with those of provinces so that there is alignment between what the municipalities do but also

what the provincial and national governments do, including of course building partnership with important stakeholders. So, we believe that through establishing the 52 hubs, we will have a much closer relationship with the district municipalities but also with the local municipalities in particular. Thank you very much.

Mr B N LUTHULI: Minister, it has happened before that the smaller municipalities have experienced less issues where they were placed under the administration over the municipalities which were entirely shameful. Is the department consistent in the application of section 139 of the Constitution? I thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for Provincial and Local Government): Section 139 interventions are initiated by the provincial governments and we have observed inconsistency in the application of section 139 throughout the country. We will be presenting a bill to Parliament titled The Intergovernmental Monitoring Support and Interventions Bill that will enable uniformity to ensure that when intervention is put in place, there is at least a uniform criterion in the application of section 139. However, we agree with the

observation that there has been a degree of inconsistency in the application of section 139. Thank you very much.

**Working with National Youth Development Agency to enhance youth development**

119. Ms B Maluleke (ANC) asked the Minister in The Presidency for Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities:

How will her Office work together with the National Youth Development Agency to enhance youth development?

NO2002E

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon House Chair, the National Youth Development Agency, NYDA, is listed as a national public entity in the Public Finance Management Act, Act 1 of 1999. The agency is established in terms of the National Youth Development Agency Act, Act 54 of 2008. It reports to the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities and the Minister is the executive authority. As a result, the NYDA reports to Cabinet and Parliament through the department.

In order to enhance youth development, the department, through its national youth development branch, is responsible for developing national youth policies and legislation, thus creating an enabling environment for the agency to design its programmes; facilitating transfer of funds on a quarterly basis to enable the agency to fund its operations; quality assuring the plans and reports of the NYDA to ensure alignment with national strategic priorities; continuously conducting oversight of the NYDA documents to verify reported results; informing planning and generally improving operational efficiency.

All these are intended to enhance youth development and responsiveness, particularly in this time when we are dealing with this very serious challenge of youth unemployment in the country. Thank you, Chair.

Ms B MALULEKE: Hon Minister, in light your response, there are more than 3,2 million women who are unemployed. What exact new interventions is the Ministry proposing to reduce this unemployment amongst young women, and how is the department going to work in partnership with the Economic Cluster to ensure that young women are not left out of the mainstream economy beyond the sanitary towel project? Thank you. [Applause.]

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon member, we have just concluded this afternoon a discussion on a memo on the matter of sanitary dignity or sanitary pads programme through Cabinet and we will share this with the hon members as and when you need that.

It has been quite an elaborate matter, but we are happy that we have followed the process and we will continue saying no to the R157 million that has been disbursed by Treasury to provinces to benefit big companies. However, it should benefit co-operatives and small businesses to assist young persons and women. [Applause.]

So, we are going to work with the small business development. We will work with Small Enterprise Development Agency, Seda, Small Enterprise Finance Agency, Sefa, SA Police Service, SAPS, Industrial Development Corporation, IDC, all the government agencies and all the interested departments, including the Department of Trade and Industry. We think it is also in the interest that we deal with this scourge of unemployment, particularly of young people especially women. [Applause.]

Mr M S MALATSI: Hon House Chair and hon Minister, more than half of the young people in the country are currently unemployed. Out of those, 31% of graduates are also unemployed. Given that one of the priorities of the NYDA is to provide training opportunities that will help young people find jobs, can you tell us how many young people found jobs as a direct result of the help they got from the NYDA in the last financial year? Thank you.

[Applause.]

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Well, the NYDA has opened more than 45 district offices particularly in the rural areas, so that young people who are educated and could not access the services of the NYDA, do so. However, the NYDA cannot be the beginning and end on how we should work together with you and all of us to provide jobs for our young people.

There are several initiatives undertaken by government like the Youth Employment Service, Yes, programme run by DTI and many others. The NYDA is an entity that is also trying to make a contribution and we are not complaining with the work they do.

Having said that, earlier on I said to you that we are aware that in the past we used to assume that young

people are unemployed because they do not have requisite skills, but they do. [Interjections.] We do have a legacy problem in this country which comes with what our children get taught at schools.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Order, hon members. Can we give her a chance?

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Our education system needs to be aligned to what the job market needs so that we are able to employ or educate people with requisite skills so as to get the jobs. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr M S MALATSI: House Chair, on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): What is your point of order, hon Malatsi?

Mr M S MALATSI: Hon House Chair, on a point of order: The Minister has misled the House. So, I just want to help her with the statistics. [Interjections.]

ELUNGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Hayi, suka wena. [No, go away.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, can I listen to what the hon Malatsi is saying?

Mr M S MALATSI: Yes. The hon Minister has misled this House by claiming that ... [Interjections.] ... the NYDA has 46 offices throughout the country. It is actually 50. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon House Chairperson, on a point of order.

Mr M S MALATSI: So, hon Mthembu, you can remind her that it is actually 50 and not 46. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon House Chairperson, on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): What is your point of order, hon member?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Hon House Chairperson, on a point of order: A member is allowed to ask only one follow-up question and not two questions. So, that hon member is the one who is misleading this House with the information he is giving. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you, hon members. Hon Cebekhulu.

Mr M N NXUMALO: Hon House Chair and hon Minister, people living in townships, urban developments and cities have an obvious advantage when accessing the NYDA offices. I would like to know from the Minister: What plans are in place to afford the youth from rural areas the NYDA opportunities with regard to the recent free trade arrangements in Africa? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Well, I think we will take note of the reference you have made and share this information with the NYDA, that it is also important to also look at opportunities that are being created by this African Free Trade Area.

However, as regards the debate about the new offices that have just been opened by the NYDA, almost half of the new offices are in the rural districts so as to ensure that rural and peri-urban youth are able to access them.

However, the NYDA also makes use of the information technology, IT, to support the youth to access their

services. However, there are far-flung areas that needed the NYDA to go and open offices in them.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Mhlonishwa Ngqongqoshe, inkinga ekhona la, emakhaya, lento ebizwa ngokuthi i-NYDA ayaziwa futhi aniyi nhlobo khona. Umangabe nithi niyaya, ikuphi la ozosho khona ukuthi, "Cha, sasiye endaweni ethize," mhlawumbe nibize ezinye zezindawo ezisemakhaya nize nisho nosuku kanjalo.

Futhi okunye okungiphatha kabi yilento yokuthi, Ngqongqoshe, intsha ayinawo amakhono, ibuhlungu leyonto. Kuyimanje niyabona ukuthi kukhona omakhenikha umhlaba wonke, bayakhombisa ukuthi banawo amakhona kodwa anikwazi ukubathuthukisa bagcine sebekhandela emgaqweni benethwa yizimvula. Futhi izimali zikhona niyasho, anikwazi ukukuveza.

Okunye Ngqongqoshe okungiphatha kabi yile yamabhizini amancane. [Ubuwelewele.] Lento yamabhizinisi amancane ... intsha inawo amabhizinisi amancane kodwa ayinikezwa amathuba ezimali. Ethekwini niyababona ngoba nibiza iTheku ... abadayisa emgaqweni nihlulwa nje ukuba lekelela, nibanike izimali ... babuye badayise. Ngiyabonga. Ninika iANC kuphela ... *(Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)*

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Hon Minister, the challenge that is experienced here in the rural areas is that the animal by the name of NYDA is not known because you do not go there at all. And if you say you do go there, which area did you ever visit? And don't say, "No, we went to a certain area," or maybe mention some of the areas in rural places and state the date.

And the other thing that troubles me is that, the youth lack skills, hon Minister, and that is a sad thing. As of now, you can see that there are mechanics all over the country, and they showcase their skills but you are unable to develop them where they end up operating along the pavements and being exposed to the rain. And you tell us that there are funds, but you cannot show them.

The other thing that troubles me, hon Minister, is the issue of small businesses. [Interjections.] The issue of small businesses is that the youth have small businesses, but they are not funded. You see them in eThekweni as you are referring to iTheku ...]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you, [Siyabonga.] hon member.

Nk M S KHAWULA: ... abadayisa emigaqweni, nihlulwa nje ukubalekelela, nibanikeze imali benze ubuhlalu.

*(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Ms M S KHAWULA: ... those who are selling on the street, you just fail to assist them, and to sponsor them with money to make beads.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you, hon member.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Nibanike izimali bakwazi ukulima umbila, babuye badayise. Ngiyabonga. Ninikeza i-ANC kuphela ...

[Ubuwelewele.] *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Give them money so that they can grow mealies and sell it to the community. Thank you. You give it to the ANC members only ... [Interjections.]]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, thank you very much. Thank you.

Ms M S KHAWULA: ... if you are not the ANC ...

... awuyitholi imali. Nina nikhohlakele. [Ubuwelewele.]

*(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[... you do not get money. You are corrupt.

[Interjections.]]

An HON MEMBER: Yes! Yes! Yes!

Ms M S KHAWULA: Hon Minister, you have failed.

Lo mnyango wenu awunamsebenzi. Kuphelile ngawo.

[Ubuwelewele.]

Nk N P SONTI: Yebo! Yebo! Nikhohlakele! [Ubuwelewele.]

*(Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)*

[Your department does not have work. It is finished.

[Interjections.]

Ms N P SONTI: Yes! Yes! You are corrupt!

[Interjections.]]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Khawula,  
hon Khawula, let us not do that. Please.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngizoxolisa. Yikuphi engikushilo mhlonishwa? [Ubuwelewele.] (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: I will apologise. What did I say hon member? [Interjections.]]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you very much. You can sit down.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Yikuphi baba? (*Translation of isiZulu sentence follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: What did I say, mister?]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): You can take your seat. Thank you.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Uxolo. Cha, yikuphi mhlonishwa ngixolise? [Ubuwelewele.]

ILUNGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Ukukhohlakala! (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Sorry. No, what did I say hon member so that I can apologise?

An HON MEMBER: Corruption!]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I am saying do not do that. You have exceeded your time.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Cha! Okay. Oh! Ukhuluma ngani, ngesikhathi? (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: No! Okay. Oh! What are you talking about? Are you talking about time?]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you very much.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngiyabonga mhlonishwa kodwa laba abanikeza i-ANC ... (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Thank you, hon member but these give the ANC ...]

... if you are not the ANC you get nothing.

I-NYDA nje eye-ANC. [The NYDA is just for the ANC.]

USIHLALO WENDLU (Mnu M L D Ntombela): MaKhawula, kuzofanele ngenze nje futhi. Yiyona indlela umaKhawula ayizwisisayo leyo. (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Mama Khawula, I must do this again. That is the only way mama Khawula understands.]

Hon Minister.

Thank you, hon Minister. You can continue, if you have heard the question.

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Yes.

Letšatši pele ga ge Mopresidente ... Se a šoma selo se? [Tsenoganong.] ... Letšatši pele ga ge Mopresidente a etla mo go fa polelo ya maemo a setšhaba ngwaga wo, re bile le dipoledišano le Hlaswa ... (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[A day before the hon President ... Is this mic working?

[Interjections.] ... A day before the hon President

delivered his state of the nation address for this year,  
we had talks with Hlaswa ...]

Ms M S KHAWULA: Point of order, hon House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Yes, Ms  
Khawula, what is your point of order?

Nk M S KHAWULA: Bengizocela njengoba ngikhuluma la, la  
ngimele abantu, ngicela ukuthi angiphendule kungcono  
okungenani ngesiNgisi-ke ngizosilalela, hhayi "ngaka"  
ngoba esho nje. [Ubuwelewele.] Indaba yejaji nje ...  
asikhulumi ngamajaji la. [Ubuwelewele.] (*Translation of  
isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: I would like to say that as I am  
speaking here, I am representing the people and I request  
her to at least answer me in English and I will listen.  
She should not say "ngaka" as she had just said now.

[Interjections.] What does a judge have to do with this  
issue? We are not talking about the judges here.

[Interjections.]]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you very  
much.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Mnu M L D Ntombela): Mhlonishwa Ngqongqoshe, unelungelo lokuphendula nangayiphi inkulumo ezwisiswa ngabantu. (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Minister, you have the right to respond in any language that is understood by the people.]

TONA YA BASADI, BASWA LE BATHO BAO BA SA ITEKANELAGO OFISING YA MOPRESIDENTE: Ke bolela ka taba ya gore baswa ba thušega bjang ka lebaka la Etšentshi ya Bosetšhaba ya Tlhabollo ya Baswa. [Tsenoganong.] Ke bolela ka baswa kua dinagamagaeng. Re kwa ka bona. Le nna ke kwele ka bona. Go ba le poledišano ka mo pele ga ge polelo ya maemo a setšhaba e ka fiwa ... [Tsenoganong.] (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: I am talking about how the youth benefit through the National Youth Development Agency. [Interjections.] I refer to the youth in the rural areas in particular. They are the ones saying these things. I heard it from the horse's mouth. There are official talks before the state of the nation address ...] [Interjections.]

Mof M S KHAWULA: O bua leshano. (*Translation of Sesotho sentence follows.*)

[Mrs M S KHAWULA: You are telling lies.]

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: ... across the streets.

[Interjections.] [Laughter.]

Ba be ba tlile go tšwa go dikarolokgetho tše di fapanego. (*Translation of Sepedi sentence follows.*)

[They came from various constituencies.]

Mr B A RADEBE: Hon Chairperson! Hon Chairperson!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Minister, can you just hold for a minute. Hon Radebe.

Mr B A RADEBE: Chairperson, I rise on a point of order, Rule 84. Someone cannot say an hon Member of Parliament is lying. Please, can they withdraw?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I am not sure who said the Minister is lying. [Interjections.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: ... [Akuzwakali.] Suka phela endaweni yami. *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Ms M S KHAWULA: ... [Inaudible.] Move away from my space.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Khawula.  
Hon Khawula.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Mahlobo, ngiya ... hhayi kahleni ukungiphaphela nina. [Ubuwelewele.] *(Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)*

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Mahlobo [clan name for the Ntombelas], I ... no, you do not become forward against me.  
[Interjections.]]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Khawula.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Mahlobo! Mahlobo!

USIHLALO WENDLU (Mnu M L D Ntombela): Awulalele kancane.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Cha, bengingazi mntakababa ukuthi kanti ukuthi "lishanu" uchaza amanga. Ngiyaxolisa. [Uhleko.]  
*(Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)*

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Mahlobo! Mahlobo!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Will you listen a little.

Ms M S KHAWULA: No, I did not know my brother, that "lishanu" means lies. I apologise. [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Alright, hon member. Thank you very much. Hon Minister, you can continue.

TONA YA BASADI, BANA LE BATHO BAO BA SA ITEKANELAGO  
OFISING YA MOPRESIDENTE: Ke re pele ga ge Mopresidente a e tla go fa polelo ya maemo a setšhaba mo Palamenteng, o bile le dipoledišano le dihlophahlophana tša baswa mo ...  
*(Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.)*

[The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES: I am saying that before the state of the nation address in Parliament, the President had official talks with a number of youth groups at ...]

... Marks Building across pre-state of the nation address engagement with the youth of the country.

Ke bona bao ba bego ba re fa bohlatse bja gore ba thušega  
bjang ka lebaka la Etšentshi ya Bosetšhaba ya Tlhabollo  
ya Baswa. (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[They are the ones who confirmed that they are  
benefitting from the National Youth Development Agency.]

They came from across the country even youth with  
disabilities was represented. That was just a few days  
after the President had a long-day engagement on 16 June  
Polokwane Cricket Stadium ...

... le baswa, moo ba ilego ba laetša gape gore ba leboga  
thušo le thekgo yeo ba e hwetšago go Etšentshi ya  
Bosetšhaba ya Tlhabollo ya Baswa. Ba be ba etšwa mafelong  
ao a fapanego go tšwa nageng ka bophara. (*Translation of  
Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[... and the youth who have shown gratitude for the  
support and the assistance they received from the  
National Youth Development Agency. They came from various  
parts of the country.]

Hon House Chairperson, in fact, the only thing which I  
did not know would come the way it did, was that the new  
offices that I was referring to, two or three of them are

actually in some real deep rural areas in KwaZulu-Natal districts. [Time expired.]

**Steps to fight scourge of maladministration such as mismanagement of municipal finances, fraud and corruption, in view of urgent need to rethink the innovative ways of curbing corruption and other administrative malpractices within municipalities**

116. Mr B M Hadebe (ANC) asked the Minister of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs:

What steps is her department taking to fight the scourge of maladministration such as mismanagement of municipal finances, fraud and corruption, in view of the urgent need to rethink the innovative ways of curbing corruption and other administrative malpractices within municipalities?

NO1999E

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, to reinforce our efforts regarding the fight against corruption in municipalities, the department launched the revised Local Government Anti-Corruption Strategy on 18 November 2017.

The Department of Co-operative Governance in collaboration with key stakeholders revised the Local Government Anti-Corruption Strategy and also introduced the Integrity Management Framework with emphasis on the promotion of integrity. The department is rolling out the training programme on Local Government Anti-Corruption Strategy and the Municipal Integrity Management Framework to municipalities throughout the country.

Furthermore, the department is working with provinces and municipalities to ensure the implementation of recommendations emanating from forensic reports. Most of the forensic reports made recommendations with certain remedial or other corrective action that should be taken. The Department of Co-operative Governance will continue to collaborate with law enforcement agencies such as the Special Investigating Unit, SIU, the Assets Forfeiture Unit, the Hawks and the National Prosecuting Authority, NPA, to accelerate investigations and prosecutions.

I have since been advised, in fact, hon House Chair, that there are 93 cases that are currently in court to prosecute those who have acted in a manner that is corrupt. Thank you very much.

Mr B M HADEBE: House Chair, while we welcome the 93 cases that are in court, I think, hon Deputy Minister, you will agree with me that these figures are not enough given what has been published by the Auditor-General in the 2017-18 financial year, that R51,5 billion of irregular expenditure has not been dealt with by municipal council across the country and R38 billion of unauthorised expenditure has also not been dealt with by municipalities across the country.

The Auditor-General further states that political instability is one of the contributing factors or the root causes of maladministration and mismanagement of municipal finances. Therefore, I would like to get an understanding from you. Don't you think that it's high time for us to start shaking the tree without the leaves falling and dissolve some of the municipalities?

I raise this question precisely because, out of the municipalities that have been placed under section 139, some of them continuously receive disclaimers and adverse funding. I thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for Provincial and Local Government): House Chair, it's important to indicate that

indeed the 93 cases that are in court are those which have been prosecuted. It is also important to note that a number of these and others are awaiting proclamations from the SIU for further investigations or proclamations for the SIU to undertake specific investigations, and others are awaiting decisions for prosecutions.

So, the process of continuously dealing with corruption is a matter that is receiving attention. Coming to the matter that is raised, indeed, if the evidence is provided that we need to take action that includes dissolution, such action should be taken. However, this should be based on evidence before us and the decision should be objective.

We must ensure that such action yields the requisite results, so that you don't just act, but at the end of the day, you don't yield the results. All corrective action taken should ensure that we achieve the results. And if section 139 is the appropriate decision that needs to be made, indeed that would have to be made. Thank you very much.

Mr S N SWART: House Chair and Deputy Minister, whilst we appreciate the roll-out of anti-corruption strategies, we from the ACDP would ask you, would you consider the

Prevention and Combating of Corrupt Activities Act which places an obligation on officials to report any corrupt activities that they are aware of, as well as the Protected Disclosures Act which protects whistleblowers and, would you consider the implementation of lifestyle audits for senior officials? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for Provincial and Local Government): Hon Chair, I can confirm that we certainly would consider those. Thank you very much.

Mrs G OPPERMAN: Through you, House Chair, Deputy Minister, I am holding a letter dated April 2018. It is a letter from the MEC of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs in the Northern Cape to the Mayor of Karoo Highlands. It informs the mayor that the municipal manager, Mr Jonny Fortuin, a former ANC mayor and school manager whom they appointed, does not meet the minimum competency requirements. Thus, his contract is null and void and the post must be readvertised.

Today, a year and a half later, the MEC failed to remove Mr Fortuin, the mayor failed to remove Mr Fortuin and the council failed to remove him. Hon Deputy Minister, will you remove him and the errant ANC mayor for this

deliberate, conscious malpractice? If so, what consequence management action are you going to take to correct this? The DA will not rest until local government is fixed and professionalised. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, I am sure the hon Opperman will give me the privilege to be able to see the letter in order to determine what action would be appropriate to take. On the basis of her presentation, I am unable to indicate what action we will take as the department. So, we'll welcome the letter for further investigation. [Applause.]

Prof C T MSIMANG: Through you, hon Chair, hon Deputy Minister, thank you for giving us the information that a new strategy has been drawn up to deal with offending municipal officials.

What I would like to know is, whether a practice which was common before this initiative, which is the practice of transferring the offending officials to other municipalities, has been incorporated? If it is incorporated in the new strategy, the question is: Would

you consider that justice is done under the transfer circumstances? I thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for Provincial and Local Government): Hon Chairperson, I am really struggling to understand the question. So, if hon Msimang could further elaborate, I will be able to provide the response. Thank you.

Prof C T MSIMANG: Hon Chair, what has been very disturbing in the cases of offending municipal officials is that they will simply be transferred from one municipality to another, maybe with the brief that they can go on offending where they've been transferred to. The question is, has that consequence been removed now that there is a new strategy? But if it wasn't removed and it's still there, would you consider it justifiable? [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Responsible for Provincial and Local Government): Hon House Chair, certainly it's not justifiable to employ officials who have been implicated. The process is not necessarily a transfer. So, it can't

be that a municipality transfers its employees from itself to another municipality.

The process of appointment is the responsibility of the specific council that makes that appointment. So, technically it's not a direct transfer of an individual from one institution to another. It is about ensuring that we put in place mechanisms that are able to detect those individuals who have been found guilty, so that these are not employed in another municipality and a register in that regard has been developed.

The process is, as I indicated earlier, that we haven't currently reviewed that list in the current administration to ensure that in these instances, we have acted timeously. Thank you very much.

**Details of chief officers or executive directors of the National Youth Development Agency provided with personal drivers**

132. Mr L Mphithi (DA) asked the Minister in The Presidency for Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities:

Whether any chief officers or executive directors of the National Youth Development Agency are provided with personal drivers; if not, what is the position in this regard; if so, what are the relevant details?

NO2017E

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Chairperson, this matter was discussed at length in the Portfolio Committee on Women, Youth, and Persons with Disabilities meeting, when the National Youth Development Agency, NYDA, briefed the committee on their annual performance plan for 2019-20.

The question about the two drivers of the chair of the board and the chief executive officer, CEO, was raised by the hon chairperson of the committee. A discussion ensued. Following up on that, as the Minister, I instructed my department to urgently engage with the NYDA on this issue and upon receipt of the report, it will be shared with this House through the portfolio committee. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I am informed that the hon Ngcobo will take charge of the first supplementary question on behalf of the hon Mphithi. I therefore request hon Ngcobo do so.

Mr S NGCOBO: Hon Minister, it is totally unacceptable that the chief executive officers or the executive directors of the NYDA have drivers, when more than 50% of young people across the country are unemployed. So, with over 50% of our young people in the country unemployed, what is your department going to do to ensure that the NYDA spends far less on its chief executive directors and more on youth empowerment initiatives? Thank you.

[Applause.]

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: House Chairperson, I think I have already said that our officials are busy ...

[Interjections.] ...

An HON MEMBER: With what?

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: ... engaging the NYDA with the matter at hand and we shall share the full outcome of this exercise when it is concluded. It will not take long. I thank you.

Ms T S MASONDO: House Chairperson, the follow-up question is about the car or fleet management policy which should be interrogated to see whether it is suitable for

employees of state agencies. Is the NYDA willing to allow the National Treasury to advice on its policy? Thank you, Chairperson.

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: House Chairperson, I think we will be okay with that. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Minister, I didn't get you.

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: We would find that also helpful. Thank you.

Mr M S MALATSI: Minister, the NYDA spends R10 million on the office of the CEO and spends R6 million on the board of directors on travel and hotel space. They travel in business class, whether they are going to Port Elizabeth or Limpopo and they stay in five star hotels. It is like they want to be celebrities. So, we want to establish from you ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Order, hon members!

Mr M S MALATSI: ... in line with the Minister of Finance's call for government departments to follow austerity measures by spending money on necessary things, what are the immediate steps that you are going to take to make sure that taxpayers' money meant to benefit young people is not wasted on very important people, VIP, treatment for these people and not what is in the report? [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Mr J J MAAKE: On a point of order, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): What is your point order, hon member?

Mr J J MAAKE: There is no business class in Limpopo. [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Minister ... Order, hon members!

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: House Chairperson, well, earlier on, when I was responding to a question on the NYDA, I said the NYDA is a creation of an Act and also complies with the Public Finance Management Act, PFMA. So, they are audited yearly by the Auditor-General. So, I can't come

and start auditing an entity in Parliament ...

[Interjections.] ... when they are audited by the rightful authority. But as for the anomalies that have been identified, I am saying for the third time that we have requested our officials to look at this matter of the cars and come back with the report. Thank you.

**Safe houses to accommodate women and children who have been victims of violent abuse and who often have no choice but to continue to live with the perpetrators before cases are concluded**

138. Ms M S Khawula (EFF) asked the Minister in The Presidency for Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities:

Whether her department has considered establishing safe houses to accommodate women and children who have been victims of violent abuse and who often have no choice but to continue to live with the perpetrators before cases are concluded; if not, why not; if so, what number of safe houses does her department have throughout the Republic? NO2023E

TONA YA BASADI, BASWA LE BATHO BAO BA SA ITEKANELAGO

OFISING YA MOPRESIDENTE: Taba ya madulo a nakwana a bomme

ge ba le mathateng a go hlokofatšwa, re somišana le ba Kgoro ya Tlhabollo ya Leago. Le Mopresidente o boletše ka yona ka go naba kgapele ... (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: We are working closely with the Department of Social Development about the issue of temporary shelter for abused women. The President has earlier addressed the issue in detail ...]

... and so, it's a matter that, particularly at this very crucial moment when our platform is burning and when we are in a national emergency, we have to work together on to make sure that, as hon Lamola had said, we have more Thuthuzela Centres. And the Minister of Public Works said that we will have to find space in other buildings that are underutilised to create safe houses for our survivors. I thank you.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Mnu M L D Ntombela): Khulumelani phansi bahlonishwa.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Bafowethu asike sibeni abahlonishwa eNdlini sizosebenza. (*Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.*)

[The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Converse quietly, hon members.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: My brothers, let us be hon members in this House as we came here to work.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members! Hon members! Please ...

... khulumelani phansi bahlonishwa. [Converse quietly, hon members.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: Eyi! Ngiyabonga. Ngiyabonga. Ngqongqoshe, sinenkinga lana kubantu besifazane. Siyababona bayalimala, bayafa, bayadlwengulwa, abanye bayabulawa, uyezwa kuyimanje kukhona othola ukuthi babulewe ngokuthi bebesolwa ngokuthi bangabathakathi futhi lezi zindlu abahlala kuzona Ngqongqoshe uma uthi uyazibheka, azikho esimyeni esikhomnisa ukuthi ziyabavikela ukuthi bakwazi ukuhlala ngokukhululeka ngaphakathi kuzo.

Ngqongqoshe, kuyimanje ku-Ward 19 kwaBhekumthetho kunomndeni owahlukunyezwa ngamabhunu wakwaDlamini, awushaya kwaze kwashona umkhwenyana wakhona. Wasuka lowo mndeni wahamba wayocasha kwaBhekumthetho. Kuyimanje,

umkhwenyana wakhona ushonile, asimazi ukuthi ushone kanjani uMlungisi Phillip.

Manje ngifuna ukwazi ukuthi uzosiza ngani? Laphaya e-Dundee abantu besifazane njalo bayashayiwa ngoba ngikhuluma nawe nje. Kunamacala. Umhlonishwa lo ebewu-MEC eKwaZulu-Natal ubengafanele anikine ikhanda ngoba lezi zindaba engikhuluma ngazo ziyamthinta. Sinamacala laphayana, ama-case number, lapho khona abantu khona bebebulawa ngabelungu kuwo. Kukhona nezingane ezadla ushevu kodwa akukaze kwenziwe lutho.

Mina bengifuna ukwazi-ke wena Ngqongqoshe yini ozokhusela ngayo abantu. Lama-ward e-Dundee u-Ward 1 kunabafelokazi abenziwa ukhlukekumezeka. Kuyimanje abanazo ngisho izindlu laba bantu bahlala ezindaweni eziyingozi, nase-Ward 6.

Ngifuna ukwazi ukuthi, Ngqongqoshe, yini ozobasiza ngayo laba bantu ngoba ayikho into ebuhlungu la eNingizimu Afrika ... silokho sikhala ngokuthi abantu bayadlwengulwa, bayabulawa kodwa uma uthi uyabheka thina ... [Ubuwelewele.]

USIHLALO WENDLU (Mnu M L D Ntombela): Kuzwakele mama. Kuzwakele mhlonishwa.

Nk M S KHAWULA: ... njengoHulumeni ayikho into esiyenzayo. Izindlu azikho emthethweni. Ngiyabonga. [Ubuwelewele.] (*Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Hey! Thank you. Thank you. Hon Minister, we have a problem with regard to women. We see them being hurt, they die, are raped and some are killed. As of now, you heard that there are women who were killed because they are suspected of practising witchcraft and the houses they live in, hon Minister, are not in a secured condition for them to live comfortably in.

Hon Minister, as we speak, in Ward 19 in kwaBhekumthetho there is a Dlamini family that was harassed by the boers, where they assaulted them until their son-in-law died. That family left that area and went to find refuge in kwaBhekumthetho. Their son-in-law had died and we are not sure how uMlungisi Phillip died.

Now, I want to know how are you going to assist them? Every time in Dundee, women are beaten up and as I am talking to you now, cases are being opened. The former hon MEC in KwaZulu-Natal was not supposed to shake his head, because what I am talking about affects him. We have case numbers for those cases, where people were

killed by white people. And there are also children who were poisoned and nothing was done about that.

I want to know, Minister, how would you protect these people? There are widows as a result of harassment in Ward I in Dundee. And as it is right now, these people have no access to houses as they are staying in very dangerous places, including Ward 6.

I want to know what the hon Minister is going to do to assist these people, because we always complain about people being raped, killed here in South Africa, but when looking at us ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): We got it, mama. We got it, hon member.

Ms M S KHAWULA: ... as government we are not doing anything. Houses are not up to standard. Thank you.  
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Minister ... [Interjections.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: Uxolo kancane weSihlalo.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Mnu M L D Ntombela): Cha! Cha! Cha!

[Ubuwelewele.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: Ngicela ungikhuzele laba abaphaphayo manje. Ibucayi lento esikhuluma ngayo.

USIHLALO WENDLU (Mnu M L D Ntombela): Siyakwazi lokho, awume. Kahle-ke, siyabonga mama. (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Excuse me, Chairperson.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): No! No! No!

[Interjections.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: I request you to ask these people to stop being forward now. What we are talking about is delicate.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): We know that, wait. Stop then, thank you, mama.]

Mr D BERGMAN: House Chairperson, I rise on a point of order. We've had to sit through some of the weakest answers from Ministers that we've ever had in the House for the last two terms. And now, we also have to sit

through questions. If people get five minutes to ask questions ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, please allow us to proceed. Hon Minister, can you respond to that.

TONA YA BASADI, BASWA LE BATHO BAO BA SA ITEKANELAGO  
OFISING YA MOPRESIDENTE: Taba ya go hlokofatšwa ga basadi le bana e bohloko. E re kwešitše bohloko kamoka ka mo Ntlong ye, le batho kamoka ba kwele bohloko - Afrika-Borwa ka bophara. Re fetša go bolela mo le Mopresidente ebile re kwane le yena ... (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Gender-based violence against women and children is an emotive issue. We were all deeply hurt in this august House, and the public of South Africa at large. We have just discussed with the President, and we reached the consensus with him ...]

... that this has caused a national emergency.

E akaretša le bona batho ba wate yeo o bolelago ka yona Mma Khawula. Ye ga se potšišo ye nkabego ke rile ke a e

araba ka gobane re šomišana le bona ba ba Kgoro ya tša Bodulo bja Batho gore batho ba rena ba fiwe dintlo tše maleba. Re tla fetišetša potšišo ye go Tona Sisulu - kgapele ke bone motlatši wa gagwe mo, Mahlobo, efela ga ke sa mmona. Go na le bothata bjo le bo tlišitšego mo, bjoo bo nyakago gore batho ba ba thušwe ka potlako. Nna nka tšea dintlha tšeo ka di fetišetša go Kgoro ya Bodulo bja Batho ka gore ka nnetenete taba ya batho ba go katwa kgafetšakgafetša, ba bolawa le ke balekani ba bona, ke taba ye bohloko - ga se taba ye re swanetšego re e kgotlelele ... *(Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.)*

[This also includes the people in the ward that Ms Khawula refers to. That is the question I was not supposed to respond to, because we are working with the Department of Human Settlements so that our people are provided with adequate housing. We will put forth the question to hon Minister Sisulu - earlier on I saw her deputy, hon Mahlobo in the House, but it looks like he is no longer here. This is a problem put before us, and it needs urgent attention. I can take the points and refer them to the Department of Human Settlements because this problem of repeated rape and killing of women by their partners is really an emotive issue - it cannot be tolerated ...]

... at this time or period of national emergency. It should be that ...

...re batamele kgauswi ga batho ba rena, re ba fe thekgo yeo ba e emetšego. Ke a leboga. (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[... we are more available for our people to give them the support they need. I thank you.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: Igama lomlungu u-Phillip, u-Els isibongo. Kukhona nama-case number. (*Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.*)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: The name of the white man is Phillip Els. There are case numbers.]

Ms T MGWEBA: Hon Minister, shelters are indeed funded by the Department of Social Development. However, the Commission for Gender Equality, CGE, report has outlined that they are underfunded, lack infrastructure and poorly run. What has the Department of Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities done to follow up the recommendations of the CGE report besides meetings to alleviate the pain of victims of gender-based violence, GBV? I thank you.

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon Chairperson, let me repeat that the President has listened to the CGE reports that you have just referred to now and he has responded on even helping us finding financial resources, so that we are able to reach out to our people - let me repeat - in this period of national emergency as far as gender-based violence and femicide are concerned. The question has been responded to in full and the allocation of resources, what should be done with that, what we should be doing with the expansion of the Thuthuzela Centres and how we should be supporting not just victims but also survivors beyond the acts. Thank you.

Ms M D HLENGWA: Minister, how will you reprioritise your departmental budget to provide for additional shelters and homes for people with disabilities and the survivors of gender-based violence?

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: House Chairperson, our department works with sister departments like social development, as I said earlier on. We are largely a department that focuses on advocacy. But as far as this sector of people that you have referred to now, they are now with us and we should continue working with the department that is

transferring to us to make sure that there is no gap. We also take advantage of the resources that have been made available in this House this afternoon to reach out to all our vulnerable people, women, youth and persons with disabilities.

Yesterday, before I came here, we met with a special envoy of the United Nations, UN, who is visiting South Africa and her role is to look at how we engage with people with disabilities particularly those living with albinism. We do not look the other way; we engage with all agencies, be it continental or African Union, AU, or from the UN to make sure that we not only account in the immediate household but that we also use these opportunities to share good practices. I thank you.

Ms N V MENTE: Minister, the initial question asked about safe homes. The question we have to ask ourselves given the status of the Thuthuzela Centres that most of them are nonfunctional and they are not even a quarter of the centres required in the country right now. So, the alternative is the nongovernmental organisations that have safe homes.

The question is as follows: Is there a relationship that exists between you, the Minister of Social Development,

the Minister of Police and the Minister of Health regarding the safe homes in South Africa to accommodate women and children who must be removed from toxic environments of evil and cruel men instead of the police sending them back home because Thuthuzela Centres are not everywhere? Thank you.

The MINISTER IN PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: I think your question is very important particularly after the debate we have had earlier on, mainly because this question comes from a woman; I can hear you are speaking from the heart and you are not politicking. Safe homes, in my experience from what I saw in Malaysia, where I was an ambassador, a safe home need not be treated like a Thuthuzela Centre. A safe home is not known. We don't pronounce it. And at a safe home, the victim does not spend more than two days. It's like a transit home because, if anything happens ... you are right ... safe homes are better managed by nongovernmental organisation, NGOs, because the minute we include them in government we are going to take other responsibilities.

A safe home is a transit home and we cannot do this alone. That is why we have a steering committee that deals with gender-based violence. It has the NGOs and

government in partnership because this has gotten us into this national emergency; it is actually a societal challenge.

We do have a relationship which the President had pronounced that it needs to be strengthened; you were listening this afternoon ... yes ... Our department listened to all these proposals. Ms Khawula can tell you that she was even raising this in the portfolio committee the other day. I have said earlier on, when others were asking the questions that all the issues that you raised, we deposited them where they should be because it is the President who owns the steering committee. We work under the President and we take instructions from him and implement that which he wants us to implement. Thank you.

[Time expired.]

**New National Youth Policy and related details**

117. Ms T Mgweba (ANC) asked the Minister in The Presidency for Women, Youth and Persons with Disabilities:

(a) By what date can Parliament expect the first draft of the new National Youth Policy, as the applicable period of the current policy is ending

in 2020 and (b) how is the youth being consulted in developing the new policy?

NO2000E

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Hon House Chair, the department has commenced with the process of reviewing the National Youth Policy. The current National Youth Policy is reaching the end of its lifespan in 2020. The first draft of the new National Youth Policy will be ready for presentation to various Cabinet committees by mid-October 2019. It is estimated that the final draft will be processed for Cabinet approval by March 2020. The department will conduct consultations in all provinces before the end of this calendar year.

The National Youth Development Agency, SA Youth Council and the offices of the premiers will be instrumental in inviting young people in urban, rural and peri-urban areas to be part of the consultation processes. Youth from diverse groups across all spheres will be targeted and they will include youth from business, civil society sectors as well as youth in institutions of higher learning. This is to enable broad consultation, integration of all inputs and refinement of the final draft policy. I thank you.

Ms T MGWEBA: Hon House Chair, through you to the hon Minister, the policy has not yielded results with youth unemployment over 50 levels in many provinces. How will the policy application differ in this period? I thank you.

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: The new draft will take challenges of the committee into consideration and this matter that you have referred to now. We need to learn from our own experiences and mistakes, that when we adopt new youth policies, there are certain things that we should not do - learning from experience.

Hon President said earlier on that where we have policies that have become moribund, we need to review, revive and make sure that what we adopt is new and relevant to what our people need now. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Sharif!

Mr M S MALATSI: Hon House Chair, we have notified the Table that I will take the question on behalf of hon Sharif.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Has the Table been notified?

Mr M S MALATSI: Yes.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Okay. You can ask the question, hon Malatsi. [Interjections.]

ILUNGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Buza. [An HON MEMBER: Ask the question.]

Mna M S MALATSI: Tona, a re kwane gabotse. Potšišo ye e re ka gore pholisi ye e ya fela ka 2020, le rerišane bjang? Potšišo ya ka ke gore ka ge re tseba gore pholisi ye e tlile go fela ka 2020, ke eng dilo tše tharo tšeo le ka rego le di fihleletše ka lebaka la yona? (*Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.*)

[Mr M S MALATSI: Hon Minister, let us clear this up. The question is: What is the plan of action since the policy is going to lapse in 2020? We know that the policy will lapse in 2020; what are the three things that you have achieved during its term?]

Therefore, in simple terms, can you just take us into confidence with the three most outstanding achievements of this policy to date?

Ke a leboga. [Thank you.]

TONA YA BASADI, BASWA LE BATHO BAO BA SA ITEKANELAGO  
OFISING YA MOPRESIDENTE: Nka se kgethelwe ke wena gore ke  
bolele gore ke dife tšeo e lego diphihlelelo. Re  
lebeletše gore ke eng tšeo e bilego ditlhohlo tša baswa  
... *(Translation of Sepedi paragraph follows.)*

[The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND  
PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: You cannot dictate to me what  
the achievements are and what they are not. We are  
looking at the challenges encountered by the youth ...]

... in this policy or during the implementation of this  
policy until 2020. We should learn from the mistakes or  
the challenges of the past because South Africa is a  
young country. A lot of what we had been collecting as  
information from here starts ... [Interjections.]

Ms N I TARABELLA-MARCHESE: On a point of order, Chair:  
With due respect, the Minister is not answering the  
questions.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, the Minister is answering the question. [Interjections.] You have posed the question and she is responding to it. [Interjections.] She is not quiet; she is standing on her feet responding to your question. Therefore, could you please give her a chance to complete what she wanted to say?

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: I am answering the questions, and I have answered the questions. I am saying that we will keep you updated as we conclude the new youth development plan as we go into March after we have done all the consultations. We cannot sit here on our own and say that we are happy with the following, when we still have to consult with the youth from different sectors, as I have listed areas that we will be going into. I thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr M S MALATSI: House Chair, point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I did not recognise you, hon member.

Mr M S MALATSI: That's why I'm rising.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Alright, yes, what is your point of order?

Mr M S MALATSI: Thank you, House Chair. When the Minister responded in Sepedi in the first part, she said ...

[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, I will not allow that. I will not allow you to now debate.

[Interjections.]

Mr M S MALATSI: No, I want you to get my point. I'm not debating.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): No, please, take your seat. [Interjections.]

Mr M S MALATSI: My point of order is that the Minister refused to answer ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Malatsi, please take your seat. [Interjections.]

Mr M S MALATSI: ... and she is embarrassing herself with the answers.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Malatsi!

Hon Malatsi, please don't. The next question here, the last one on this Question 117 is hon MkhaliPhi. Hon MkhaliPhi!

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Minister, since you assumed the office in your department, have you resolved on anything?

[Laughter.] [Interjections.]

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: The answer is yes. I thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you, hon Minister. [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chairperson, the follow-up question is what?

The MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENCY FOR WOMEN, YOUTH AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: Well, eh, oh. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you, hon Minister; I think you have answered the question. Thank you, hon MkhaliPhi. [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chairperson!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): No, no, I will not allow it. [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chair, no, but I have a right.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): No.  
[Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: No, but I have a right, Chair.  
[Interjections.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: No, no, no.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): No, hon  
Mkhaliphi. [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Chairperson, I'm a member of this House. I have a right to speak here. I'm rising on a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): No, no, I do not allow it. [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: No, why? Which rule?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Because you have been given a chance to pose your question and you did. [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: No, but you don't know why I'm rising now.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): No.  
[Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: No, Chairperson, you can't do that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): No, hon Mkhaliphi. [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Use the rules. What rule are you using?  
I want to raise a point of order, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Mkhaliphi,  
I will switch off the microphone. [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: No, why?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I will now  
switch off the microphone. [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Why?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): I will now switch off the microphone, hon MkhaliPhi.

[Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Why? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Last question!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you very much, hon members. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That concludes the business of the day. [Interjections.]

Ms H O MKHALIPHI: Conclude.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you very much, hon members. The time allocated for questions has expired ... [Interjections.] ... and the House is adjourned.

See also **QUESTIONS AND REPLIES**.

The House adjourned at 20:27.

---

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS**

**Please click on the following link to access the relevant Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports for this day.**

[https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-papers?sorts\[date\]=-1](https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-papers?sorts[date]=-1)