

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 1

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

PROCEEDINGS OF HYBRID NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

The House met at 15:00

House Chairperson Mr M L D Ntombela took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.

PROCEEDINGS OF 15 NOVEMBER 2023

(Announcement)

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, may I kindly draw your attention to the following, I have received information that a number of Ministers are not available to answer questions of the Social Service cluster being taken in the House today. Rule 138(3) and 138(4) do, however, provide for a Minister to authorise his or her Deputy Minister to reply to your question directed at that Minister, or if a Minister and his or her Deputy are absent for another Cabinet

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 2

Minister to respond to the question. So, Deputy Ministers and Acting Ministers are authorised by the Rules to respond to the questions. Thank you very much. Hon member?

Mr D W MACPHERSON: House Chairperson, while we certainly have had a better run of legs of Ministers coming to questions from the House. I'd please ask you through the programming committee to reiterate the importance that this only happens once in a five-part rotation and the Ministers need to arrange their diaries to be in Parliament ... [Interjections.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Order, hon members!

Mr D W MACPHERSON: ... to answer questions that our constituency wants them to answer. Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Order, hon members! He is raising a concern. Please, just listen. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: House Chair, to be in Parliament, what does it mean? You can be in Parliament physically here. You can be in Parliament virtually, not unless the member is saying here now, let's cancel the hybrid session and force everyone to be in the House, but if they are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 3

... [Interjections.] ... no wait, Madam, you wait, if the Chair is saying they are going to respond, some on virtual, some are here but if they are not responding, be it on virtual, be it physically, then it's something else, then we'll support you that let's talk about that. So, it must not be them coming physically here but they must respond.

[Interjections.] No. That is not what he said.

[Interjections.] No, you should have listened. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Mnu K P SITHOLE: Hhayi, uSotswebhu Omkhulu ngathi uvika into ekungafanele ayivike.

English:

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon members, shall we start with the business of the day?

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, I have my hand up. I don't know if you've noticed that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Oh! Hon Singh?

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson ... [Interjections.] ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 4

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Order, hon members!

Mr N SINGH: ... thank you for providing the information to us, but it is a normal practice that either at the Chief Whips Forum or any other forum, the Chief Whips are informed whether certain Ministers will be available or not available to answer questions, and unfortunately no information was given to us earlier on. We will have no problem if a Minister is answering from Timbuktu or Canada, or watching the cricket in India or whatever. We have no problem with that, but if a Minister is not available to answer at all, that will be a problem and that is information that should have been given to us, and I hope next time that is done timeously. Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you so much, hon member, I think your concerns are noted. Shall we start with the business of the day?

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

CLUSTER 2: SOCIAL SERVICES

Question 661:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 5

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND INNOVATION: Hon House Chairperson, the response to the question is as follows, the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, has not submitted to the Auditor-General statements for the financial year 2022-23, which is the current financial year and, yes, the reasons why that has not been done is precisely because of the delays in finalising the audit for the financial year 2021-22. The NSFAS has since entered into an understanding with the Auditor-General that they will submit the 2022-23 financial statements by 15 February 2024. We cannot, however, ascertain when the statements will be made public because that's the purview of the Auditor-General upon receiving and auditing the statement. Thank you, House Chairperson.

Ms C V KING: Deputy Minister, the Auditor-General had this to say on general audits of the Department of Higher Education and Training and its entity, by the time we audited the financial statements of auditees and reported on adverse findings, multiple failures have already occurred along the accountability value chain. After our audit, other steps are required to complete the accountability value chain. The revelations from the auditor's investigation were substantiated by the advancement of the incorporated

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 6

investigation highlighted irregular appointment of the direct payment service providers, which will amount to irregular expenditure, supply chain management irregularities, and the colluding of the NSFAS officials for tenders.

Besides the report on the investigation into the direct payment saga, the NSFAS is also ignoring the three-month tender given to Futgenx Technology of R4 million to supply a digital tool to calculate student allowances which was not completed and Futgenx is also linked to the Services Seta. All of this unfolding while students have to beg for their allowances ghost students receive funding and accommodation, and service providers find themselves in financial distress due to nonpayment for services rendered since February this year. No wonder the NSFAS is not willing to present its 2021-22 and 2022-23 audit outcomes. This is a disgrace, Minister, to come here and tell us by 15 February 2024, we will only see the 2022-23 audit outcome, while we still await the previous years. So, Deputy Minister, what measures were put in place to ensure that the board adheres to the financial requirements of the Public Finance Management Act, PFMA and that they do not undermine the Auditor-General's role in auditing their outcome, and what have you been doing with your Minister to ensure that the NSFAS is being brought to book?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 7

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND INNOVATION: House Chairperson, I think firstly the question is related to the financial statements of 2021-22 and 2022-23 and I think we have responded to that question. That's the first thing. The second thing is that we are not undermining or the NSFAS is not in any way undermining the Auditor-General. They have entered into an agreement with the Auditor General that the financial statements for 2022-23 will be submitted by 15 January 2022, and also that this delay was caused by the delays which we have explained both to the Auditor-General and also to the portfolio committee which were necessitated by the transition from having the NSFAS as a loan dispensing scheme into a bursary or grant dispensing scheme.

There is nothing untoward and all of this is not in any way related to the matters the hon member is trying to ventilate.

What I can say is that the Minister has received the report from Werksmans and through his legal advice he is looking into that report and that anything else that emanates from that report, the Minister will make a statement and over and above that, the chairperson of the NSFAS, on behalf of the NSFAS board, has also made public statements on the actions that they will be taking in implementing the Werksmans Report.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 8

We believe that these are sufficient measures which will necessitate stability in the NSFAS and over and above that we, yes, have had a few challenges with some of the students not receiving their student allowances, but in general, we believe the disbursement of allowances to students have been going on quite well for the majority of our institutions and students. Thank you, House Chairperson.

Ms J S MANANISO: Thank you, House Chair, hon Minister, for recognising the interventions to combat the mismanagement in the NSFAS, first by the law enforcement agencies such as the Special Investigating Unit, which found a scam where more than R5 billion in NSFAS money was possibly allocated to students who did not qualify to be funded by the institution. This includes investigations which led to repayments to the NSFAS from some universities and colleges. The NSFAS CEO has recently been dismissed for matters related to the payment system. What consequence management interventions have the Minister and the NSFAS management implemented in relation to the NSFAS disbursement challenges? I thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND

INNOVATION: House Chairperson, I think we the chairperson of the NSFAS in an elaborate statement indicated what the NSFAS

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 9

will be doing in terms of consequence management. Firstly, the action that has been taken towards the former CEO, is based on the recommendation of the Werksmans investigations. Secondly, the chairperson has also indicated that they will be taking further action against senior managers who may have been involved or implicated by the Werksmans Report and I think a progress report to that effect will be furnished to the portfolio committee.

Thirdly, the four ... [Inaudible.] ... companies that were appointed to disperse the grants to the students. There is a process, I have been assured by the NSFAS, that is in place to ensure that they follow through the recommendations of the Werksmans Report in that regard. It is not a decision that can be taken easily, that of determination of the contract, because we have to take into consideration the fact that they are responsible for the payment of students allowances currently, but also that there are legal implications in terms of the termination of such contracts and I think, until such processes have been concluded, the details will be given to both the portfolio committee. This House and to our country.

Mr M SHIKWAMBANA: House Chair, the National Financial Student Aid, Scheme did not submit their financial statement for the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 10

2022-23 financial year. To us as the EFF, this does not come as a shock because we know that the National Financial Student Aid Scheme board and its leadership do not take accountability seriously and all this happened because they know very well that they have a Minister for their protection. Recently, we heard a lot of corruption allegations implicating the leadership of the entity. Companies have been appointed unlawfully to disburse allowances to the students. The CEO of the entity has been fired and he made serious revelations of corruption happening in the entity.

Since they did not submit the financial statement again with their corruption allegations, which are implicating the board members. As the EFF, we can safely say this noncompliance was done deliberately. It was done deliberately so because there is a report, Minister, that was supposed to be sitting in the ... [Inaudible.] ... of the people.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon member, you are exceeding your time, could you please pose a question?

Mr M SHIKWAMBANA: Yes, my question is when are we receiving the report of Professor Yunus Ballim that was having implications for people from the NSFAS board who were the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 11

reasons for the problems we are sitting with today in the NSFAS? When the report becomes public. It is a public report that is for the people for them to have that report because this corruption is happening. [Time expired.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you very much, hon member, your time has lapsed.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND INNOVATION: Hon House Chairperson, I think the member needs to familiarise himself with the details and reasons why the financial statements for 2021-22 were not submitted, which mainly has to do with the transition between the NSFAS dispensing loans into the NSFAS dispensing grants and the confusion that existed between the transfer from the NSFAS to the universities and the universities paying back that money to the NSFAS and the universities, the Auditor-General and the NSFAS are working around the clock to make sure that we finalise all of those details. As it relates to all the other reports that the member is demanding, I think we'll get more information on that, but as far as I'm concerned, all the reports concerning whatever challenges that the NSFAS has faced in the past have been made public and I suppose that's

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 12

why the member is aware of it and if not we will try and furnish the member with the report.

Mr S S ZONDO: Am I audible now?

IsiZulu:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Mnu M L D Ntombela): Uyazwakala baba, qhubeka

Mnu S S ZONDO: Ngithi kuyishwa nje mhlonishwa osesiHlalweni ukuthi uNgqongqoshe anqume ukungaveli lapha enkundleni ukuzophendula mayela nalezi zindaba esikhuluma ngazo ngoba sesikutholile ukuthi u-CEO we-NSFAS ...

English:

... is just a scapegoat to cover up for...

IsiZulu:

... abaphathi ngale nselela abayenzile yokuqoka izinkampani ezingekho esimweni nezingafanelekile ukuthola imisebenzi laphayana e-NSFAS. Kodwake alukho usuku olungafiki. Uyohamba hambe aze afike sizibuzele mathupha ukuthi simuthembe kanjani ukuthi usengaqhubeka ahole lo mnyango uma kwenzeka izinhlekelele ezinje phambi kwakhe futhi zenziwe ngabangani bakhe abathunyelwe nguye ngokuthanda kwakhe.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 13

English:

The Deputy Minister reiterated the commitment of the NSFAS to accountability, transparency and adherence to audit standards. What are the assurances that can be provided to the public and stakeholders regarding the steps being taken to improve the financial governance within the NSFAS?

IsiZulu:

Siyacela usiphendule ngokucophelela ngoba mhlawumbe sesithembele kuwe ukuthi ungaba ikusasa kulezi zinyangana ezisele nisekuHulumeni ukwazi ukuhola lo mnyango ngoba usehluleke wancama uNgqongqoshe. [Kwaphela isikhathi.]

English:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND INNOVATION: House chairperson, I think as details have been given to the House, the Minister is attending a UNESCO Conference on Education, which is currently taking place. It's a biannual conference and I think it's important for our country to be represented in that conference, so it is in no way a disrespect to this House and it is part of complementing the work that has been done by us in this House. So that's the first thing. The second thing is that we cannot entertain

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 14

gossip and rumours and based on that, decide that people should be prosecuted.

I think if there is evidence that anybody either in the Ministry or in the department is implicated in any form of malfeasance in the NSFAS, then that evidence should be presented. The process which we recognise, which was agreed to even at the portfolio committee level, was the appointment of Werksmans as a forensic company that has conducted an investigation and that report, I think the details that of has been presented to the public and people who have been implicated in that report are being brought to book.

I think anything else outside of that. We cannot entertain, and finally, this coming Tuesday, the Minister will be making a public statement as it relates to our readiness, in terms of the reopening of universities and TVET colleges and the entire Post-School Education and Training, PSET, sector, and I think we will provide more details in terms of how smooth we are expecting the reopening process to be for the academic year 2023-24. Thank you very much, House Chairperson.

Question 693:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 15

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon House Chairperson, greetings to you. I am not going to repeat the question because it is known. I will go straight to the answer.

The transformation of basic education system ...

[Interjections.]

... I am not even listening to him.

The transformation of the basic education system from the 18 apartheid education departments, to a single democratic system followed the prescripts of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. Therefore any legislative and policy framework that was developed anchored such a transformation process including the decolonisation of the basic education system in general. The apartheid hon members will remember that there was Bantu education in which black people were given a sour dust. And then there was another education where teachers even given ... [Inaudible.] Then black teachers were walking to a school. There were 18 fragmented education departments. So we had fragmented apartheid education departments. As we started in 1994 we had to bring all of them together into a single education system which talks to the Constitution at that time.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 16

We had a National Education Policy Act of 1996. We then came up with the SA Schools Act of 1996 also, then the Employment of Educators Act of 1998 and the National Curriculum Statements with accompanying assessment policies. In that apartheid education in South Africa, the pass percentage - remember those of my age they know - that there was a higher grade, and a standard grade and a lower grade that was at 30%.

So the new education system has done away with all those grades, to a lower grade which was a pass mark. Thank you

Mr B S MADLINGOZI: Thank you Deputy Minister for the answer.

Hon House Chairperson, for the last 25 years, South Africa has seen university graduates in the streets having placards written and I quote, "I am a graduate, I am looking for a job, *noma yini*. [Anything]."

Is that not clear enough to see that the mediocre pass rate is generating low quality degrees that are useless in our real world.

What kind of questions did your department engaged the public during the fact finding mission or the collection of data that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 17

eventually informed your conclusive decision to come up with the 20% or 30% pass rate that is the lowest in the world and what science your department has seen to understand that there are those in the education system and of course there is ... [Inaudible.] ... in the process? Thank you, House Chairperson.

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon House Chairperson, since we came up with the National Curriculum Statement, we have done away with what is called 30% pass rate, but we allowed learners not to be held back by one subject that a learner is not good at. If a learner for a bachelor's degree, they must get at least four subjects at 50%. Those subjects are key subjects that determine the path of that learner what do they want to do.

So if there is a subject that the learner is not good at then even if they can pass that only subject at 30% not 20%, then we allow that child to pass because we cannot keep the child to repeat the grade just because of this one subject. That is why there is this notion that other people who were part of the apartheid who say the pass rate in South Africa is 30%. There is nothing as a pass rate of 30% in South Africa, House Chairperson. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 18

Oh maybe I need to conclude the question. That is why I said for them to reach the bachelor and be accepted at the university - that is why we have a national bachelor, we have a diploma and we have a National Senior Certificate for those who may not want to go to university and want to go and do any other skill other than going to a university. However, I can elaborate that even now we have introduced the three stream model that is vocational, technical and academic to not to hold children and our young people who do not want to do the academic route but, want to do a particular skill. That is what we are doing Curriculum Assessment Policy Statement, Caps, is addressing that. Thank you, House Chairperson.

Ms N G ADOONS: Hon House Chairperson, I thought that the Deputy Minister has responded to the question I was about to ask, but anyway the multiple interventions are required to improve the education system and some internal and some are external.

Ms V S SIWELA: [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Sorry about that hon Adoons.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 19

Can I address the hon Siwela.

Hon Siwela, please mute. This is the first warning. Yellow card. The second one is red.

Hon member, you may proceed.

Ms N G ADOONS: Hon Deputy Minister, what interventions is the department driving to ensure key determinants of quality education are addressed in improving learner outcomes of the education system? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chairperson, I was a bit disturbed by that noise. I did not get the first part of the question, unless I answer the second part that I heard.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr N S L Ntombela): Hon Adoons, you are welcomed to repeat the question.

Ms N G ADOONS: Hon House Chairperson, thank you again.

Multiple interventions are required to improve the education system and some are internal with the other ones that are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 20

external and relate to the environment in which the education system should function.

Hon Deputy Minister, what interventions is the department driving to ensure key deterrents of quality education are addressed to improve learning outcomes of our education system? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon House Chairperson, we are using the benchmarking. We bench marked with many countries in Africa. We found that it is not helping the department. Then we are now benchmarking with the outside countries to see where our education system in the country is.

So, all the international bench marks we are doing are helping the department to plan to come up with quality. If you can look at the performance of our learners in the recent years, the quality is increasing. We see the quality due the number of distinctions that they get and that it even goes to the rural areas. Most of the learners in the rural areas are doing the subjects that are needed by the economy of the country. Your Mathematics, Science and Technology, MST, we call them Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths, Stem, subjects

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 21

which will help them respond to all of us to respond to the needs of the economy.

The retraining of teachers on the content knowledge. We work together with higher education. For when they come, they are good in pedagogy but, the content sometimes there is a gap on the content. We retrain them on the content. Thank you.

Mr B B NODADA: Hon House Chairperson and hon Deputy Minister, the ANC manifesto states that the governing party would prioritise policies and strategies targeting the achievement of quality education and learning outcomes. However, you have focussed more on quantity over quality as we have seen in presenting the Matric results. Given that 31% of Grade 4 learners in public schools cannot read for meaning and half of Grade 6 learners cannot read for meaning when tested on Grade 4 levels, as well as the fact that 37% of Grade 5s and 41% of Grade 9s have no required numeracy skills that are required by the system, while only three in every 10 Grade 5 and Grade 9 learners have acquired basic subject knowledge and skills in science. Would the Deputy Minister say her department has failed or her failure lies in the development of policies and strategies to improve learning outcomes or the implementation of such policies, which one is it?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 22

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon House Chairperson, the Department of Basic Education in South Africa has achieved its mandate. Those learners that are not reading for meaning, in Grade 4, but they pass in Grade 12. I am saying we are working all of us to look at the performance of the learners then come up with the strategy to improve. There is no way where we will say we are only focusing on quality and leave the quantity. The numbers are increasing unlike during the apartheid era where you find that - "Ja!" We come from there. Unlike that time of apartheid, hon House Chairperson that we were even told that this year we need to curb and only 20 black learners must pass Matric. Now all learners are free as long as they study and teachers are teaching them, they all pass. Those that are supposed to pass. There is no curbing.

We really want to thank the ANC with its very good policies that has changed the education landscape in the country and all our learners and most members of the society are very happy about the education system in South Africa. Thank you, House Chairperson.

Dr W J BOSHOFF: Hon House Chairperson and hon Deputy Minister, I must agree that only somebody who has never filled ... [Inaudible.] ... schedules would think that 20 or 30% is a

pass rate, but also just somebody who has never worked with a cohort of school leavers would believe that the school system prepare students for the life after school. At least after one leaves school you know how to go to school very well.

However to me the essence of this question is the decolonisation of education. A country like ours with cultural diversity can best be served by educational pluralism.

A colonial mentality is to regard another land or another culture as the centre and your own as the periphery. Therefore the single undifferentiated curriculum in this country will always affirm one group and colonise another. However, section 235 of the Constitution provides for self-determination for communities with a shared language and cultural heritage. government ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Boshoff, what is your question?

Dr W J BOSHOFF: It follows. It starts with the word, can. Can we count on the government to facilitate colonise education

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 24

for all by allowing pluralism in education as also provided for in the education - in the Constitution? Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Hon Deputy Minister, I do not know whether you managed to pick that question up, but you are welcomed to respond.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Hon House Chairperson, what I heard is decolonisation of education. That is the answer I gave when I started answering this question asked by the hon Madlingozi. I said,

IsiZulu:

Konje yini le esayiphasisa ngo-1956?

English:

Freedom Charter.

We responded to the Freedom Charter to say the doors of learning - education shall be opened for all. Unlike during the apartheid system where doors of learning - education were not opened for all. Thank you, House Chairperson.

Question 701:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 25

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: House Chair and good afternoon to hon members all the way from India. Chair, the win extends beyond the rugby field. It symbolises unity and reconciliation in South Africa and is the core ingredient for South Africa's journey to nationhood. The victory serves as a source of national pride and it gives a nation's hope, thereby boosting the nation's morale. Moreover, it promotes diversity, and sportsmanship while fostering a sense of identity and belonging among South Africans.

The diverse team that represented Springboks with diverse perspective, talents and skills also represents the whole country. The Springboks #Stronger Together was the campaign emphasising the importance of togetherness and unity in the face of diversity, representing all South Africans working as one. Of course, the second part of the question is participating in sports is a wonderful way to promote social cohesion and nation building. It helps to build relationships, develop teamwork, brings people together, and it breaks down barriers and foster a sense of unity and pride.

Therefore, we will continue as the department to encourage communities to participate in mass participation, recreation activities for fun, for enjoyment and physical activity. We

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 26

have seen the success of these events in promoting diversity and inclusion in sport. Therefore, for us, that's a very critical point.

IsiZulu:

Siyabonga Sihlalo. [Thank you Chair.]

IsiXhosa:

Nksz B N DLULANE: Sekela Mphathiswa, ndiphakama ndifuna ukubuza ukuba ingaba yinyani kusini na le nto ithi apha eMzantsi Afrika, ezemidlalo zisamile ngokwembali yethu yocalulo, apho iintlobo ezithile zemidlalo zingafikelelekiyo kwezinye iindawo ngenxa yezizathu ezithile ezahlukeneyo phaya ezilokishini, emaphandleni nakwezinye iindawo ezisezidolophini. Njengoko usitsho, ingaba nenza ntoni nilisebe ukuphuhlisa ukuze kubonakakale kwaye kucace ukuba akusenjalo? Siyabulela Sekela Mphathiswa.

USEKELA MPHATHISWA WEZEMIDLALO, UBUGCISA NENKCUBEKO: Sihlalo weNdlu, mandibulele kuSihlalo weKomiti yeMicimbi yeSebe lezeMidlalo, ubuGcisa neNkcubeko. Into eyenzekayo kwisebe, kukho le kuthiwa kweli sebe lethu yi ...

English:

... Conditional Grant Framework. Chair, the Conditional Grant Framework ...

IsiXhosa:

... yimali esiye siyithumele kuwo onke amaphondo olithoba. Le malik e iya kumaphoindo olithoba ijongana nemidlalo efana nale nto siyibiza i...

English:

... school sport, club development, sport academies, sport confederations and what we call active recreation.

IsiXhosa:

Kufanelekile ukuba ibe ngamaphondo aqinisekisa ukuba ezo nkqubo ziyenzeka kuzo zonke iindawo apho abantu bahlala khona, ezilalini nasezilokishini kuba kaloku isebe lona kundlunkulu alikwazi ukufikelela kwezo ndawo zonke. Into eyenzekayo yile yokuba, siyayazi ukuba iindidi zemidlalo esiye sazibeka phambili zili-16 kwaye zezona sizaziyo ukuba ziyathandwa kwaye zidlalwa kakhulu emakhaya. Kukho ke nale midlalo siyibiza ngokuba zii...

English:

... indigenous games.

IsiXhosa:

Le midlalo ijongene nathi phaya apho sihlala khona saze sabeka phambili ezilithoba saqinisekisa ukuba esi sibonelelo siyazixhasa ezo nkqubo.

Ngokwazi kwethu ke Sihlalo, phaya ezilalini amaphondo neenkosi zasemakhaya ayasebenzisana. Umzekelo, phaya eQwaqwa kuye kwasetyenziswa kakhulu naBatlokoa ba Mokotleng ukuqinisekisa ukuba ezi nkqubo ziyenzeka phaya besebenzisana neenkosi.

Siyazi kananjalo ukuba phaya eMoletjie ePolokwane zenziwe ezi nkqubo. Siyazi ukuba naphaya eKuruman eMntla Koloni zenziwe ezi nkqubo kusetyenziswa nobuKhosi bakwaJantjie.

Nangona siyazi ukuba ingangabonakali ngokupheleleyo into esiyenzayo, kodwa kunzini esikwenzayo. Umzekelo, kuphuhliso lwamaqela ezemidlalo, siyazi ukuba le nkqubo ifikelele kumaqela angama-402 phaya KwaZulu-Natal. Ukanti phaya eLimpopo amaqela athe axhamla kule nkqubo angama-535. Izikolo ekuthe sakwazi ukufikelela kuzo zingama-4 400. Ngumyinge omncinane ke lo ekuyazini kwethu into yokuba ezemidlalo kufuneka sizibone zifikelele kumntu wonke. Kodwa ke ezi nkqubo ziyawenza umyinge wokuba wonke umntu abone kwaye abeninxaxheba. Ndiyabulela Sihlalo.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 29

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D NTOMBELA): Thank you, hon Deputy Minister. Hon Mamabolo are you rising on a point of order?

Mr J B MAMABOLO: No hon Chairperson it is not a point of order. Hon Chairperson we can see that the Deputy Minister is wearing a Proteas jersey, but we can only see the collar. So, I am asking her to lean a little bit back on the chair so that we can see the full shirt because tomorrow the Proteas are going to moer [clobber] Australia. Proteas is fire. Thank you very much Chairperson. [Laughter]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (MR M L D NTOMBELA): That is not a point of order hon Mamabolo. The second supplementary question will be asked by the hon W Mhlongo.

Mr T W MHLONGO: Deputy Minister SA Rugby Union serves as a role model for numerous sporting federations in South Africa, because it has remained free of the ANC government interference, which is why it is so successful. It is so important for the ANC government not to interfere with the development initiated by SA Rugby Union, Saru. It is within different sports that they must take charge, that instead the collaborating approach should be used taken with the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 30

government partnering with Saru to gather valuable insight of sports administration.

Deputy Minister, does the government accept that federations like Saru are far better than place where they drive players' development based on merit as opposed to ANC style of quotas? Should the different sporting codes copy from Saru for them as they succeed in their approach. Deputy Minister, given the global status of Saru, will the government support Saru's initiative to bid for the next opportunity when it comes? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: Hon Mhlongo, you would remember very well that in this country until ANC government came into power, sport started to thrive. You will also remember hon Mhlongo that, before the ANC took over this government, all sport bodies were not in a position to participate in international competitions. And therefore, it was very difficult to actually see how much they could shine. So please, give the ANC its flowers, please hon Mhlongo. Because you are able today to see that rugby is doing well because of the government of the ANC.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 31

Remember, one of the things that the ANC is very clear about is that we passed a policy that says, politics must never interfere with sport, because we have seen what politics has done during the apartheid in the sports. It is the policy of the ANC, nobody else has taken that policy. And because of that policy, we are able to see federations thriving.

Hon Mhlongo, the government of the ANC has always been clear that it is important to support federations, so that we are able to be seen in the international space that we've got, firstly the skill and secondly, the talent of South Africans which was not seen for the longest of time.

Therefore, all the time and anytime, any federation that comes to the department showing interest to actually bid, the first person and the people that support them is this government because we understand the importance of that. Thank you very much.

Mr E MTHETHWA: Deputy Minister, do you have any intention of replacing the Springbok emblem that reminds some of us about the yesteryears of apartheid, such as statutes that were removed and in line with redefining our path through reconciliation and socially cohesive society? Those who are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 32

who have chest pains when we mentioned apartheid must live with it. We will never stop referencing to apartheid. Thank you Chair.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: Remember hon Mthethwa ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Order hon members. Please proceed Deputy Minister.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: Remember hon Mthethwa, when we speak about nation-building and social cohesion, we are actually talking about all South Africans, black and white, being able to feel being part of this country. Of course, the importance of nation-building and social cohesion is for all of us to feel that we do not actually make one to make others uncomfortable because of their colour. That's one important thing. It is also important that when you talk nation-building and social cohesion, you understand the history and understand where we come from and be able to accommodate all of us to build this nation called South Africa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 33

Now, on your question about the emblem. Remember, as government we don't take decisions for South Africans. If South Africans in their majority come out and say we do not want to the Springbok emblem because of a, b c, d, and send in petitions, the government then we look at that. It is not for government to interfere with things that we see that they actually unite to this country. For now, the Springbok emblem has shown that South Africans are comfortable with it. For now, with the Springbok emblem, South Africans are happy. But, if at any stage they feel that it needs to be removed, a process has to be followed. Thank you very much.

Question 687:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chair, as I indicated earlier, I'm not going to repeat the question. I just go straight to the response. The writing of the 2023 National Senior Certificate Examination commenced on the 30th of October 2023 and will terminate on 6 December this year, 2023. So far, no incidences have been reported, except very few, that maybe a learner got sick during writing, maybe a parent refused a child to go writing because of pregnancy and some notes that were confiscated, yah, from our children.

Siswati:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 34

Ngabe ngiyikhulume ngeSiswati, ngabe ngimnandzi njani, kutsi lamanotsi latsetfwe ebantfwaneni lebebawabhalile, ehhe. Ngako-ke ngileto nje tigameko ...

English:

... that were reported. But all incidences of irregularities, whether administrative errors and omissions or behavioural offenses, and the acts of dishonesty will be dealt with by the provincial examination irregularities committees and presented to the national examination irregularities committees for ratification in January 2024, prior to the release of the results.

This will ensure that cases are speedily dealt with, and candidates' results are not withheld coming the day of the announcements of the results, but so far examination has been running smoothly. Thank you, House Chair.

Mr S L NGCOBO: Hon Deputy Minister, there is an observation here that there are serious irregularities that continue to take place. I'll give an example in in KwaZulu-Natal, KZN, from just one circuit, five invigilators have been suspended for wrongdoing, and that shows how bad this situation is, and therefore the question to the hon Deputy minister is: Has the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 35

department offered quality practical training to educators and invigilators in particular to ensure that past incidents of cheating and any other wrongdoing do not happen again? If not, why not, hon Deputy Minister? Thank you, House Chairperson.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chairperson, hon Ngcobo knows very well that the issues that maybe were not reported to the department, they have a right as members of the portfolio committee to report them. But in this instance, the invigilators have been suspended. And they were trained, we prepared learners, we trained invigilators, we trained chief invigilators, everybody was trained.

Here we deal with a human being and not the child, it was dishonesty on the side of invigilators, not the children. Our children are ready to write examination, and they were thoroughly prepared by the teachers. That's why in even in the past, it was not the fault of the learners. It became the fault of some adults, somewhere who want to bring the credibility of the examination down, in the country. Thank you, House Chairperson.

Ms N G ADOONS: House Chairperson, today the 15th of November is the Palestinian Independence Day. We express solidarity

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 36

with the innocent people of Palestine. And we are in support to free Palestine.

Hon Deputy Minister, noting that the risk of cheating occurs in various forms such as creep notes, viewing of other learners' papers, exchanging notes in exam times, or having access to the examination prior to writing, what measures have been put in place to ensure exam papers do not leak as experienced in the previous years? Thank you very much, House Chairperson.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chair, I think we all sympathize with all learners of the world whose rights have been deprived by others or the other way round. And we wish and we make a strong calling that those who have superior powers to hold the children of this world not to have the rights to live, must refrain from that.

We have the examination irregularities committees. We have it at the provincial level and at the national level. At the provincial level, we call it provisional examination irregularities committee, and that reports to the national examination irregularities committee, to deal with all matters of irregularities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 37

There will be those learners who were not maybe attending or who will feel that they may not make it. Then we'll make creep notes and this. And all those things are getting confiscated from them, we take them from them.

And our invigilators like I said, they were trained. They are able to check. That's why even cell phones are not allowed into the exam room.

So, on all those matters we have structures in place to make sure that they make our examination to have the quality and the integrity that it deserves. Thank you, House Chairperson.

Mr A M SHAIK-EMAM: House Chairperson, yes, indeed, we are talking about children, and they should be at school, writing examination, reminds me of a little boy this morning, whose been crying profusely, wanting to kiss his father for the last time in Palestine. That is the life of our children who ought to have been in school, wanting to say goodbye to his father was brutally murdered by Zionist State of Israel.

House Chairperson yes, my question is this: On the 2023 National Senior Certificate Examination, mathematical literacy Paper One, the term "Mandatory Palestine" was used in question

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 38

5.2 of the said paper as this was insensitive cognizance of the fact that colonialist Britain, used this term as a subjugation of the Palestinian people. What is your department doing to investigate this? Have you identified who was responsible for this? And when can we have some responses in terms of this insensitive reference that was made in your examination paper. Thank you very much, House Chairperson.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chair, remember, we have professionals that are dealing with question papers. The question paper does not lend to the hands of the Minister or Deputy Minister. It ends with those professionals until at Umalusi. After we discovered that, that how can during this time, even if it's not this time, how can you call Palestine "a Mandatory Palestine"?

We find that this is not right. And even the question itself was saying, this person was going to Palestine because he's going to use the currency of Israel. And then from the dollar of America, why didn't the person just left America to Israel? And the story ends there? Because the issue was the about the calculation of the Israel's currency versus the dollar. That was the gist of the matter. Why was somebody became so naive and do all those things? We really don't know.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 39

We are investigating the matter, we checked, and we issued a statement to apologize to South Africans and all those who felt that this is uncalled for, and we are still investigating the matter, that those ... and we are even telling them that they must not use ... when we deal with calculations, let's deal with calculations and the currency, not necessarily writing stories that are neither here nor there. Thank you, House Chair.

Ms A M VAN ZYL: House Chairperson, with the Minister, that is barely present in the basic education committee meetings, and evidently this House to account, it is quite evident that consequence management is a swear word for the ANC and the Department of Basic Education.

Up until today, the portfolio committee has not received report on steps taken for the cheating scandal that happened in the national senior certificate examinations in 2022. Are you hiding something? Why does the Department of Basic Education continue to overlook and neglect consequence management for issues such as teacher misconduct, administrative failures, and cheating scandals in final year exams? What concrete steps have been taken to ensure accountability? Thank you as House Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 40

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chairperson, when we run examinations, we report all irregularities, at one central pot. At the national irregularities committee. If maybe in one province like Western Cape, they did not report, they hid it, we may not know, but those that were reported, we deal and consequence management is done in anyone, whether a teacher or a private company whose resources were used to produce papers. Because sometimes we outsource, like in the machinery which you don't have. Then those adults, they confuse the system. Then that's why some of them were reported to the SA Police Service, SAPS, and some are arrested. Some are still under investigation. There's nothing that was hidden, unless they know it's hidden in the Western Cape. We may not know. Thank you, House Chairperson.

Question 702:

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Chairperson, let me thank hon Gela for the question, which is to deal with the issue of food security or safety, rather, concerning fake foods. In reply, hon member, the norm for inspecting food premises is that there should be at least one visit to such outlets in every three months, or at least four times a year. The frequency of inspection is, of course, dependent on the resources available and more, especially, the relevant personnel who are the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 41

environmental health practitioners, ordinarily known as health inspectors.

The Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development, and also the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition, together with our Health department have regulatory roles in as far as food control is concerned. The three departments collaborate with each other at various levels of the food chain provision, from production, which agriculture has been involved, plant and animal health, genetic modifications, food quality and safety. When it comes to food quality, safety, labelling and food hygiene, that's where the Health department comes in, also in nutrition and consumer information, in as far as food is concerned, that's where the Health department comes in.

At the national level, we are responsible for providing the norms and standards and the regulations, in as far as the standards for safety on health and healthiness of the food. At the level of inspection, municipalities are responsible for enforcement of these regulations through these environmental health practitioners, and where there's evidence which has led to consequences such as harm to individuals including death, then this becomes criminal, and these matters have to be

reported to the SA Police Service, SAPS, and also where there is evidence of expired and fake foods, all these becomes criminal. They have to be identified by the Environmental Health Practitioners, EHPs, and then escalated to the SA Police Service for further action.

In this case, the police are also having the responsibility. They do have the capacity to do an inspection, seize and take criminal steps against such people. The real challenge, hon member, members and Chair is the fact that at the inspection level, which is the responsibility of local authorities, district authorities and metros, quite often there is inadequate environmental health practitioners, in some cases, especially at rural districts where there's just not enough or not even employing of the Environmental Health Practitioners, it is understandable because of the various pressures which the local authorities have on other basic services.

So, also, is the legal, the regulatory and environment at the current moment that, that function from the Constitution in terms of the municipal health services, which also include environmental health, is at the level of district authorities and also metros. So, we do work with them to provide support,

but at the end, that's where the actual practical inspection lies. Thank you very much.

IsiXhosa:

Ms A GELA: Enkosi Sihlalo weNdlu.

English:

My follow-up question, Minister, is that the government institutions have highlighted the risk of a counterfeit foods and arrests have been made and reported on factories which produces counterfeit food products such as alcohol and various foods which are produced under condition that do not meet health standards nor they have been certified by the SA Bureau of Standards, SABS. More research needs to be undertaken on the extent of counterfeit foods product. That what is the prevalence of medical cases due to the counterfeit foods, all other food brands and low-quality controlled productions?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Chair and members, hon member, the current situation is that we don't have a very clear process in terms of - because this is not notifiable - food poisoning is not currently a part of notifiable medical conditions. So, we don't have a reliable data in terms of the prevalence, it's a matter which, working together with our local authorities

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 44

and also colleagues at the provincial level, maybe going forward, we can look at the extent to which this is prevalent. So, at the current moment, it remains anecdotal in terms of various cases emerging in various places.

We will need to develop systems through which such information can be properly documented and recorded, but we are following up with colleagues in in in provinces, working through our food security at national level and also our environmental division, to make sure that this happens. Of course, we are also working with the law enforcement. Already, we have a process where we are working with the SA Police Service and Home Affairs, we're working together to intervene in terms of stopping the scourge of this fake food and also expired foods, which has caused quite a lot of distress, including even death of innocent young people. So, that is the kind of intervention we are already working on. Thanks, Chair.

Mr P A VAN STADEN: Hon Minister, last week it was reported in the media that around 300 children have been treated for food poisoning across South Africa, and more than 200 of these were reported in the Eastern Cape. In the recent months, we have also seen more than nine children being admitted to hospital in the Northern Cape, as well as children who died presumably

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 45

of food poisoning from food that they bought from taxi ranks and spaza shops in Gauteng.

Minister, it is standard practice for a toxicology test to be carried out in cases of food poisoning, especially when people die. The Eastern Cape and Gauteng Health departments could not confirm if these test reports were available to establish if the illness or death of these children were caused by poison or bacteria. Hon Minister, can you indicate if the toxicology tests were done in all of these cases, if yes, what are the relevant details, if not, why not? Thank you, Chair.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Chair and hon member, indeed, it is a requirement if or any unnatural death firstly, that if there is suspicion or evidence of unnatural death that a postmortem needs to be done and where there is suspicion of food poisoning that stomach contents collected and be submitted to the laboratory for analysis. As to whether in all circumstances, I am hastened to say, not only in as far as death is concerned, but also even where the person has survived and recovered, if there is suspicion, it is a requirement, clinically, that samples need to be collected.

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 46

One would have to check whether in all circumstances that has been done. It might, especially, be that when you have big numbers, that they will prioritise those that were seriously ill. First of all, you need to save lives, and then for those who are seriously ill, possibly the tests including the toxicology would have to be done. Sometime because of the pressure on the chemical laboratories, it does take some time because in analysing those, there is a lot of steps that needs to be followed to finally arrive at which chemical can be identified as being causative in terms of those stomach contents.

At the current moment, hon Chair, I am not in the position to confirm to the hon member how many of those have been done and what was the results. It's a matter which we will gladly come back to the House to give a report in terms of tests done and the results which emanated from such tests. Thank you, hon Chair.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Minister, why a reactive approach? The issue of fake goods and expired goods has been going on for many years, prior to your time. We've made many visits to flea markets and spaza shops, we have found them selling expired goods and contaminated goods, yet nothing gets done. I know

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 47

that the previous Minister dealt with the issue of health at a local level, which is a local mandate, and you have the health departments that they were supposed to deal with it and the health city officials that have nothing gets done. Now, some of our children have died.

Now that they have died, have your department gone there to investigate, like you say that every three months you must do an inspection, whether indeed the inspections were done? If not, why they were not done? What was the problem as a result of that? How can we ensure that there's some level of oversight, Minister, over these health issues? Leave the rural areas and go into the every -I'll take you now to Durban, and you look at the shops from outside, they are selling expired and contaminated goods, it's a free for all. How can we be able to do this appropriately to prevent our people from dying? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thanks hon member. Chair, as I've indicated, this is a multisectoral, multidepartmental and multisphere responsibility. As I've said, in terms of food quality and also the health quality of the food, the regulatory norms and standards are indeed done at the national level, but where actually it affects the ordinary person and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 48

our children, it is in an area where the local authorities, especially your districts and metros, legislatively, have that responsibility. I've already mentioned that we are aware that in many cases, it is that capacity it's very limited, but you cannot say nothing has been done, maybe not enough.

There have been various interventions, and as I've already mentioned, we also have teams which are working together with SA Police Service, the Home Affairs and also with the local authorities to make sure that the issue of inspections can be improved. One of the things which I have raised with our colleagues in the National Health Council, NHC, which constitutes the ministry and MECs of provinces is that we probably have to relook at the legislation as it is now because, the responsibility for providing that on the spot actual service is at the local authorities and we do admit the fact that because of these other pressures of water, electricity and sewer systems, they don't provide enough capacity in that regard, and that is in terms of the National Health Act.

So, it's a matter which we want to review and see whether it can't be brought into a concurrent responsibility, so that where local authorities have not invested enough in this

capacity, provinces can also have a legislative capacity that can also employ the necessary qualified people to support the local authorities, but we still have to work also with the law enforcement and still with the local authorities. It also goes to the issues of licensing. Some of those outlets are not even properly licenced, that's why I'm saying, it's actually multifaceted and it needs all of us within government, I mean, not only at national and provincial, but also at local level. Thank you, Chair.

Question 658:

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you, Chair. I now think where the question of hon Nodada comes from. When he made a follow-up of hon Madlingozi's question, he jumped into his question. Now I'm saying, I have answered and sit down.

In order to improve reading outcomes in schools, the Department of Basic Education has put in place support programmes that are being implemented across the different levels of the sector. First, the National Integrated Reading Sector Plan that is being implemented in all nine provincial departments. They have developed reading strategies, the National Integrated Reading Sector Plan has been reviewed and reading literacy strategy has been drafted to ensure that

teaching and provisioning of culturally relevant and age-appropriate reading resources literacy and nonliterary are developed.

Secondly, the reading literacy strategy focuses on other areas of effective implementation, and they include parental and community engagements including societal issues and capacity building programmes for teachers. The Department of Basic Education is in consultation with the higher education institutions to ensure that initial teacher training programmes are aligned with reading literacy strategy. Various literacy programmes to help improve reading and learning outcomes that are evidence-based from early grade reading study, have been designed and are being implemented in schools. This includes the early grade reading programme and primary school reading improvement programme.

Fourthly, these programmes have included the structured learning programmes approach, that is material provisioning on scripted lesson plans for all the languages, charts, word lists, videos to demonstrate how to teach certain language skills, phonics, charts, graded readers and books. On teacher capacity building programmes, teachers are trained on utilisation of the resources that have been provided and in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 51

schoolteacher coaching and support by the departmental heads. Out of school coaching and support is provided by the district and subject advisors.

In addition, weekly hours are dedicated to literacy. In terms of adding more hours dedicated to reading, it should be noted that language and reading in particular have the biggest allocation of contact time in the school time table - unlike in the past where we focus on other content subjects. Now we have put more time on the language for learners to be able to get it right. Thank you, Chair.

Mr B B NODADA: Thanks, Chair. Deputy Minister, my question has two parts in it. You have just responded to the last one. The reality of the situation is that many developing countries and countries that are first world that have good quality education have put together two to three hours per week additional for reading for meaning. We have just come back from Finland now as a study group as the portfolio committee and you find that it has a meaningful impact. For example, the Western Cape has tested the same model. They have put together R111 million towards reading for meaning and extra two hours. If you look at the statistics from the Progress in International Reading Literacy Study, Pirls, it tells you that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 52

double the number of children read for meaning in the Western Cape. Would you really consider that as the first part? The second component is that the reality is that teachers cannot teach learners to read for meaning when they themselves cannot read for meaning or comprehend what they are reading. In fact, they fail the very same subjects that they teach when they are tested. Let's give you some percentages: 27,8% of teachers could not read analytically while only 64% had critical reading skills at Grade 6 level. These are regional tests that were done. Only 32,4% of teachers had concrete problem-solving skills when tested at Grade 6 level, and only 35% of them had abstract problem-solving skills. These teachers, 1 575 of them have been protected by the SA Democratic Teachers Union, Sadtu, while delivering poor quality education to the most poor children in our country. I wanted to check with you, Deputy Minister, how are you ensuring that freshly qualified teachers have the skills needed to ensure that they can teach learners to read for meaning and deal with the problem of unemployed graduates that are qualified to teaching instead of protecting those that are destroying our children's education? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC: House Chair, I have answered that question when I said materials provisioning, scripted

lesson plans for all the languages, charts, word lists, etc. I said in teacher capacity building programmes, teachers are trained on the utilisation of the resources that have been provided. In schoolteacher coaching and support. I think I have answered this question adequately.

On the Pirls, the Pirls that the hon Nodada is talking about ...

Xitsonga:

... hi Xitsonga hi vula leswaku a swi bohi. A swi nga bohi leswaku hi tipimanisa na ...

English:

... other countries. We are the only African country that is benchmarking with the first world - we are the only one. We want to learn from the people we are competing with as to how did they get it right. Some people think that Pirls is something that we were compelled to do. It is a benchmark, it's an international benchmark standard that has been set. It is something that we took a concerted and deliberate action as the Department of Basic Education to want to benchmark and see how we could compete with the best of the bests like what we

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 54

are doing. And indeed, we are the best of the bests in Africa.

Thank you, Chair.

IsiXhosa:

Nksz B P MBINQO-GIGABA: Siyabulela kakhulu, Sihlalo.

English:

Deputy Minister, countries that have high levels of performance of children who read with meaning at the age of 10 is due to the fact that they use their mother tongue education. Russia is the top country due to the fact that it uses mother tongue education in reading culture. In the context of South Africa, many children need to learn two languages which delays their development of speech and reading, and you cannot blame Sadtu for that. The question that I am raising to you, Deputy Minister, is, which strategies do the Department of Basic Education have to implement mother tongue education in the medium to long-term? Thank you very much, "Sihlalo" [Chair].

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chair, in South Africa we have 12 official languages and we come from the past that compelled us to speak ... I did Afrikaans and ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 55

Afrikaans:

... geskiedenis, aardrykskunde en ... [Onhoorbaar.]

English:

... at that time. Doing geskiedenis in Afrikaans and I was speaking Seswati and now to school and I have never heard of this language called afrikaans and now you are told to do geskiedenis, aardryskinde, wiskunde and all these.

As a department, we are constantly reviewing and evaluating our existing policies and practices to ensure that where there are weaknesses they are addressed. As the chairperson of the portfolio committee says, we have established that language is a fundamental barrier to learning amongst the larger percentages of African learners who are taught either in English or Afrikaans which is not their mother tongue.

The department has embarked on a programme of mother tongue bilingual education. We call it mother tongue-based education, MTBE, which is currently being piloted in the Eastern Cape. Since we started this pilot where learners are taught physical science in IsiXhosa and mathematics in IsiXhosa because they speak IsiXhosa at home, they are doing exceptionally well. It tells that we need to roll-out to promote all other languages

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 56

rather than to take two languages to think they are more important when the majority of South Africans are speaking the majority of other languages which were taken as inferior languages in the past. Thank you, Chair.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Thank you very much, hon House Chair. It was very comforting to listen to the Deputy Minister that there are a range of interventions so that learners can read for meaning. But what I want to know from the Deputy Minister is, are we having success, are we in a better position than we were than in the Bantu Education? Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chairperson, we are extremely better than the Bantu Education. In Bantu Education, girls were not allowed to do mathematics, science and technology. Only boys were allowed and in Bantu Education we were only taught to read the Bible and nothing else. Women were forced to do home economics when boys were doing agriculture.

Now we have programmes to make sure that girls do, mathematics, science and technology. We have programmes that support a girl-child. But now seeing that girls have almost reached that level because they are not prejudiced, we make

sure that all learners now, because the girls when we compare now the participation versus the boys in mathematics and science all the science, technology, engineering and mathematics, Stem, subjects, girls are now exceeding the number of boys. Now, we are taking them together but making sure that girls are not disadvantaged. So, we cannot be compared to apartheid. We live in a new democratic era that is headed by the ANC.

IsiZulu:

Mnu E M BUTHELEZI: Ngiyabonga, Shlalo, Sekela Ngqongqoshe siyathokoza ngezimpendulo zakho obuzibekeli kule Ndlu kulo mbandela kodwa iqiniso lithi njengoba usho ukuthi ziyishumi nalunye izilimi ezisemthethweni kodwa kusetshenziswa izilimi ezimbili isiNgisi nesiBhune kuphela lapha ePhalamende. Kufanele kubhekwe ngoba asikwazi ukuba yisibonelo zonke izilimi zingasetshenziswa kule Ndlu.

Usuchazile kabanzi ngezingenelelo zoMnyango kusukela ekuqeqesheni othisha nokubandakanya abazali njalo njalo.

Umbuzo wami uthi: Senike nalwenzu ucwaningo olujulileyo ukuthi le nto idalwa yini ngoba ngesikathi esedlulile nangesikhathi senu Ngqongqoshe kulamabanga la benikwazi ukufunda niqondisise. Yinto yakamuva le. Yini idalwe ukuthi le zingani

zingasakwazi ukuqondisisa kodwa ngaphambilini bekungenjalo uwufakazi balokho.

IsiZulu:

USEKELA NGQONGQOSHE WEMFUNDO EYISISEKELO: Le ethi izingane zethu azikwazi ukufunda ngokuqondisisa yingoba ...

English:

... we benchmark internationally.

IsiZulu:

Izinto ezisetshenziswayo, nami angikaze ngayibona Ingwane[octopus]. Uma bezobuza ingane ngeNgwane nokuthi yiziphi izimo ezenza Ingwane ihlale ematsheni, izingane aziyazi Ingwane. Azikaze zayibona. Nami angikaze ngayibona, nabo othisha okuthiwa abaqondisisi abakaze bayibona Ingwane. Ngikhuluma ngombuzo owawubuziwe uma kuthiwa lezi zingane azifundi ngokuqondisisa ngoba zibuzwa ngezinto ezi ...

English:

... applicable internationally.

IsiZulu:

Ngakho kuthiwa ...

English:

... what are those conditions that will make the octopus to come out of the stones?

IsiZulu:

Nabanye khona la kule Ndlu uma singababhalisa lo mbuzo ubuzwa zona lezingane zethu, abazukwazi ukuphendula ngoba uzobuzwa ngesilwane ongakaze wasibona futhi ongazazi izimo ezijabulisa lesilwane. Yingakho ke kuthiwa izingane zethu azifundi ngokuqondisisa kodwa wazibuza ngento eziyaziyo neziyibonayo zizokwazi izimo zaleso silwane. Uma ubabuza ngenkomo, bayayazi ukuthi ikhala uma kwenzenjani. Kepha uma uzobabuza nge-Ngwane ...

Lo mbuzo owenza kuthiwe abayazi le nto yayikhuluma ngeNgwane. Kwamina ngifundile nginguDokotela kungithathe isikhathi ukuthi ngiqondisise ukuthi yini le Ngwane ngoba angiyazi. Izingane zethu ezifunda iBanga lesi-4 sizokwazi kanjani. Yizinto zabelungu lezi akuzona izinto zabantu.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Thank you, hon Deputy Minister. The octopus is fascinating.

Question 703:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 60

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Good afternoon, House Chairperson, it is the Minister in the House who is answering questions. I did not put an apology. The Department declared 136 priority human settlements and housing development areas and within the current MTSF period, 94 has been targeted for development. To date, a total of 98 integrated implementation programs have been completed correspondently, the provincial breakdown, are as follows: Eastern Cape its seven, Free State 10, Gauteng 26, KwaZulu-Natal nine, 11 in Limpopo, eight in Mpumalanga, 14 in Northwest, Northern Cape four, Western Cape seven. An additional 14 integrated implementation programs are to be developed by the end of 2023-24 financial year.

One of the ways of monitoring special transformation within the PSHDA's is through financial investment for various human settlements program. In this regard, hon member, the provinces invested a total budget allocation of R9,642,766,965 in the PSHDS between 2021 and 2023 financial years. Notably, the KwaZulu-Natal province invested the most in the PSHDS amounting to R2,657,803,157. The Gauteng province was second most in terms of investment and the human settlement programs and the PHS HDAs mainly include the integrated residential development plans, which refers to phase one in terms of planning and services and phase two refers to top structures

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 61

that are constructed. Peoples housing programs that we have in the rural areas as part of rural subsidy, other programs are communal, land rights, social and economic amenities, social and rental communities, rental units, informal settlements, upgrading program and land procurement. Thank you very much.

Sepedi:

Mna C N MALEMATJA: Ke a leboga, Modulasetulo. Tona, mmušo wola wa peleng o re gobaditše gomme wa boa wa re šia re se na selo. Go a hlokagala gore re šomišane le ba lekala la praebete, e lego babeeletši, gape le bahlabolli ba praebete. Naa le tla kae ka lenaneo la gore le bona ba tsentshe letsogo - ka ge bobedi bo bolaya noga, mo tabeng ya kabo ya dintlo le kabo ya naga go bao ba ka kgonago go ikagela. Ke a leboga.

TONA YA BODULO BJA BATHO: Ke leboga Modulasetulo, ke boe ke leboge mohl Malematja. Ge re lebelela seo re se dirago ka mo go Kgoro ya Bodulo bja Batho, ke gore ge re šoma, re šoma le bao ba nago le dikgwebo, bao ba sego ka gare ga mmušo. Re šoma le bona go ya ka mananeo ao a fapanego. La pele ke le re bolelago ka lona, moo re dirilego gore batho bao e lego la mathomo ba reka ntlo, re ba thekge ba reke ka tlase ga mmušo go lenaneo leo re le bitšago First Home Finance.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 62

Re boa gape go mošomo woo re o dirago wa Lenaneotlhabollo leo le Kopantšhitšwego la Bodulo bja Batho - Integrated Human Settlement Development Programmes. Re na le go bitša borakgwebo ba tle ba tsentšhe letsogo. Gape re tsentšha le mphiwafela wa kgoro gore ba kgone go tšwela pele, gagolo boradikgwebopotlana bao re ba thekgago. Re dira gore ba kgone go tsena ka gare ga mananeo a bahlabolli ba mantlo - ke ka mokgwa woo re šomago ka gona. Re a kwešiša gore ge re šoma ka tsela ye, re swanetše re tsene ka gare ga metse le metsana, le metsemagaeng. Seo re ilego ra se dira ke gore bao ba nago le setifikeiti seo se bitšwago tumelelo ya go dula, efela ba se na ditokumente tša thaetlele, le bona ba ka kgona go dira dikgopelo gore ba hwetše mašelang ao a ka ba thušago go aga, go ba go oketša dintlo tša bona. Ke a leboga, Modulasetulo.

English:

Mr L MPHITI: Thank you, House Chair, regarding the five-year plan on the priority human settlements development areas, the department had announced that in its first year it would deliver 470 000 housing units, 300 000 serviced sites, 30 000 social housing units and would upgrade 1500 informal settlements. However, in its first financial year alone, the department managed to achieve only 126 informal settlement upgrading plans against an annual target of 300. This was less

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 63

than half of the annual target and zero informal settlements were upgraded to phase three against the target of 300. The department also announced the rezoning of 17 000 hectares of land in priority development areas, but in the first year alone only 2800 hectares, amounting to 17% were rezoned, which is a slap in the face of South Africans living in indignity. Hon members, what we have seen since 2019 is a continued failure by this government to deliver dignity to South Africans who need housing. Minister, though you were not responsible at the time for Minister Lindiwe Sisulu for destroying the department. What has your department done in recovering from the failure of meeting its annual targets? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, hon Mphiti, just to indicate, I don't think you have your figures correctly. We have done an analysis of our MTSF performance as a department on a number of houses that have been delivered in this current MTSF and my report to that, I'm looking at it. I can tell you because we monitor this, as the department. This is the report I tabled in the Minmec on May 2023, where we were giving the provinces in terms of their performances and also the areas that we were not doing well. I can safely say to you the area that we have not been doing well, it's in the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 64

area of issuing title deeds and that's why you have heard me talk about title deeds Friday as part of recovery from that area of performance.

Maybe just to indicate to you because we do monitor per province, in terms of performance in areas of informal settlements, what we have been able to do in all the areas that is why I am telling you that. For example, informal settlements upgrading for phase one, we have got 305 projects; for phase two we have got 789 projects; for phase three, we have got 175 projects. It is not correct that there is nothing, only formal settlements. On community residential units, what we have achieved out of the target of 5000, we have got 1675. But as we speak, when I looked at the report that we are tabling next week at the Minmec. Actually, we have moved surpassed 60% in this area. On the residential rental housing units delivered in the PDA's alone, 18 000 was our target. Actual program in May was sitting at 9746, which was at 54% and as we look at revising the targets and provinces reporting, that is the area that we are improving, and we see we have passed as well 60%. So, there is constant monitoring from our side and the figures that you have are not correct hon member. Check our MTSF targets and check against what we

have achieved. You measure us against our target, nothing else on the streets. Thank you very much.

Ms M MAKESINI: Thank you, Chair, Minister, the most crippling issue with the development of your department post 1994 is that you have largely stacked to apartheid special planning in terms of which blacks and poor people are still confined to the peripheries, while the rich people these areas that are nice and beautiful are reserved for them, do you have any plans to bring our people closer to this area also?

IsiXhosa:

Nabo bafane nabanye abantu.

English:

Why have you given legitimacy to the apartheid special planning over the past years? Thank you, Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson.

IsiXhosa:

Sihlalo weNdlu, mandizame ukuyiphendula ngolwimi lwethu kuba siyavumelana ukuba ngokoMthetho, kuvumelekile ukusebenzisa

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 66

iilwimi zethu apha eMzantsi Afrika. Mandiqale ngokuyiphikisa indima yokuba siye saqhubeka...

English:

... to perpetuate the apartheid spatial planning.

IsiXhosa:

Sikwazile njengeSebe lezokuHlaliswa koLuntu ukuba sithenge umhlaba phakathi apho siza kwazi ukuba sakhele khona abantu. Xa sithetha ngee-CRUs, (Community Residential Units - programme supports the upgrading of government owned communal rental accommodation otherwise known as hostels), sithetha ngee-Social Housing Units (Social Housing - rental or co-operative housing option for households earning between R1 850 - R22 000 per month) - kwaye siyakwazi ukuthetha ngomsebenzi esiwenzayo. Xa unokujonga ngoku apho abantu sibathengele khona umhlaba, sabakhela izindlu, uya kufumanisa ukuba sibakhele kufutshane nalapho basebenza khona. Apha eKapa ndivule izindlu ezininzi ezithe zasondeza abantu abaninzi kwiindawo abasebenza kuzo.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 67

So, we do not perpetuate the continuation of the apartheid spatial landscape. I can tell you, in terms of the work again, if ...

IsiXhosa:

... uyaqaphela kule nyanga, ungazimanya nathi siza kube siseGoodwood, sivula enye yeeprojekhthi yezindlu kwaye ikufutshane nalapho abantu basebenza khona kuba ngaphambili abantu bakuthi bebengakwazi ukufumana iindawo zokuhlala ezilungileyo. Sithi abo singurhulumente abenza ezo zinto.

Abantu siyabafaka kwizindlu ezirentwayo, sibancedise ngesibonelelo, siphinde sibathobele imali yerent. Oku sikwenza sicacelwe mhlophe ukuba ayingobantu bonke abafika ezidolophini, abakwaziyo ukufika bathenge izindlu okanye bazakhele. Siyayazi ukuba abanye bazele ukusebenza, babuyele emva emakhaya. Yiyo loo nto sibalungiselela ngokuba bafumane iindawo zokurenta ngamaxabiso aphantsi kakhulu. Xa ujonge le mali yerent uya kufumanisa ukuba iphantsi kakhulu nto leyo echazayo ngokuphandle ukuba ngurhulumente weANC kuphela okwaziyo ukwenza ezi zinto.

Ayikho inkqubo enje ngale siyenzayo kwelinye ilizwe ngaphandle kweyenziwa yiANC. Musa ukutsho ukuba thina...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 68

English:

... as the ANC-led government perpetuated the continuation of the apartheid spatial planning. If you read the South African National 2022 Census it says the government of the ANC has done so much to upgrade the lives of the people, especially in human settlements.

Ms S A BUTHELEZI: Hon Minister, thank you, Chairperson, as we have all come to know construction and development projects in South Africa have become a breeding ground for corruption, theft and fraud. I am reminded of one specific example back in 2020, when a R15 million COVID housing project in Limpopo was never completed because of fraud on the part of the contractor. Considering this, I would like to know what pre-emptive safeguards your department has put in place to ensure that housing projects in priority human settlements and housing development areas are not derailed? Thank you, chairperson.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, House Chairperson. Hon member needs to try and get the numbers right, but we will correct as we go. The project in Limpopo was mainly in terms of what the former Minister was doing in terms of decanting, when there was an acknowledgement that in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 69

a congested areas people would be unable to social distance as it was required. I think it was a good program. Unfortunately, marred by corruption. What we are happy about is that the SIU has attacked the companies that have been involved are before courts. Their assets have been seized and the officials that were involved, some left because we started putting them through the DC process. So, consequence management has been affected in that regard and we are getting money, and we did not lose our money in that area because we had paid less than 10% and the money was safe. But that one was also recovered in that regard in terms of what we have done just to indicate how we continue to work, we monitor from the department nationally to be able to see if there is value for money. We do that through our process in terms of our Minmec. We meet bi-monthly where tabling of reports is usual, and urge MEC, together with their teams can account and the metros can account against their grants. We do monitor in terms of our grant system, because these ADORA grant systems, so we are able to ask them to recover to give us and then we went together with the AG, who does an audit finding. Where there are challenges and if they are, where we feel that things have gone wrong and, therefore, we need to bring law enforcement agencies. I have been able to write either to the Hawks or to the SIU

specifically to bring those matters to the attention of law enforcement agencies, Thank you.

Question 684:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION (Mr M D Mahlobo):

Thank you for the question that has been asked. Firstly, let's indicate that our country is endowed with rich biodiversity and the relative high production ecosystem services. These services are under threat which has a consequence for the transformation of South Africa in terms of more just resilient and sustainable society.

In terms of the ecosystem our country in our own laws there is a provision that water is one of the most important aspects of the human rights and the sanitation including the environmental issues. There are four aspects which is the provision of service in terms of this ecosystem. Our country over the last 30 years have been able to provide more than 90% of South Africans with access to water that they were denied including the benefits in terms of the socioeconomic and environmental. Therefore, most of the rural communities in terms of our own funding were provided a lot of water to rural communities.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 71

Nevertheless, we are the first to admit that there are number of rural communities that we still have to reach, hence our provision even this financial year, of the R14 billion the majority goes to rural municipalities and also the use of groundwater. There is also the component of regulatory services. We use water use authorisation as you find them in the National Water Act including the issues of the provision of a reserve which is for the aquatic use, for human consumption and international obligation. That is how we protect those particular communities.

We also look at supporting services around ...[Inaudible.] ... of nutrient cycling where they use rainwater harvesting, work with the Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development to revive issues of irrigation and lastly, cultural services that will include the recreation, spiritual and cultural benefits. In other words, those dams are used by communities closer to them either for agriculture, for other issues that you can do to be able to develop. More importantly, we have taken the decision that our water resource infrastructure next to those neighboring communities they will no longer proceed in a manner that apartheid did that these communities next to our infrastructure does not benefit. I thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 72

Mr B N HERRON: Deputy Minister, environmental scientists tell us that the most cost efficient and sustainable ways to conserve and free up fresh water by looking up to the natural landscape starting in the catchment area and all the way down the river to the river mouth. We know that the uMzimvubu River is one of the largest river systems in Southern Africa and one of South Africa's strategic water source areas. It runs over 2 million hectares supplying water of hundreds of kilometers to regions as far as Port St. Johns.

Matatiela is one of the regions where the World Wildlife Fund Green Trust has been supporting catchment areas and natural resource conservation through projects like charcoal-from-wattle and grazing management. The Council for Scientific and Industrial Research, CSIR, calculated that in the Matatiela area we are losing about 2 million liters of water per hectare per year as a result of the uncontrolled and rapid growth of black and silver wattles. The trees are not just using up rainwater they are also using groundwater too.

Hon Deputy Minister, South Africa needs to actively address payments for ecosystem services such as freeing up of water. The payment for ecosystem services would have the potential for multiple spinoffs including water security, increase

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 73

livelihoods and employment for young people. People are employed through the working for water or other like the Expanded Public Works Programme, EPWP, to clear invasive alien plants. However, why not extend this to communities and organisations doing the same in our country's strategic water source areas? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION (Mr M D Mahlobo): I fully agree with the hon Herron. There is a lot that we are doing but we must admit that there is more to be done, for an example, the issues of deterioration of water quality and the ecosystem on the basis of human activity and industry, we have produced those particular reports of blue drop and no drop. We must attend to them because many of our water management areas are affected, the example we can give of Hartbeespoort and the integrated Vaal River system. When you go to Hartbeespoort you could see our implementing agents in the Department of Forestry, Fisheries and Environment. That is why we have the working for water programme.

In that working for water programme you could see those high ... [Inaudible.] ... are being removed. They are converted into a biomass that will be used for other activities creating jobs. The other examples you know, the working for fire that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 74

we are able to remove the alien vegetation especially the wattle trees where you can produce byproduct like coffins, tables and all these other issues that you could do. Those are the programmes that you must be able to massify. There is a programme about adopt a river by all of us as leadership and communities.

However, in terms of institutional mechanism we know that the irrigation boards that were there overtime, now we are converting them into water use association that were predominantly for white farmers. Now, our own black people in rural communities around those areas are participating. We are concluding now appointing the Catchment Management Agencies, CMAs, the boss for the Vaal/Orange River, uPongola, uMzimkulu and many of them, so that the participation at the local level is more meaningful.

Lastly, on the question of incentive, the issue of the polluter pay principle in terms of water use charges, the waste discharge charge system will be implemented very vigorously and we have started to the pilot. Therefore, we must also be able to deal with these other polluters because the environmental premium in terms of economics that you must be able to place on the impact of the damage to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 75

infrastructure especially the social and environmental infrastructure is very high. However, our compliance and prosecution services around those who are polluting and those who are not actually complying with our water licence, there has been a lot of good progress we are making. Thank you.

Ms G K TSEKE: Deputy Minister, Mahlobo, noting that South Africa is a water scarce country and that climate change will impact water supply in the future. How does the department advance the conservation of water culture in South Africa such as water harvesting and recycling to ensure that water is used without waste? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION (Mr M D Mahlobo): Our view is that our country will not run out of water but our country will face a situation where the water will not be fit for use. How do we increase the mix? Is that groundwater must be explored. Our ground national water systems, we know, many parts of our country where groundwater must be used. We need to be able to manage the issues of pollution because of human activities.

To be able to ensure that the aquifers they don't actually run out of water, we are promoting issues of water recharge. In

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 76

other words, recharging the aquifers because it is one of the things that you could be in a position to do. The other issue is that there is too much affluent that we produce. We have to go through the process of reuse, recycling and reclamation. When we go to Pietermaritzburg you will see a wastewater treatment plant where we have the capacity to treat the water to a standard that the water that goes to work in Durban, eThekweni, they don't have to pay more money to be able to treat that water.

Nevertheless, we also use that water for other uses for industries. Then, the waste in terms of the sludge is processed because the quality is so good that you can be in a position to produce fertilizers. So, you can be able to contribute to energy consumption. We are, however, also dealing with the question of production of hydrogen gas so that we can be able to produce one megawatts in terms of electricity production. We can do them in many parts of our country where there are metros. Then, the issues of water harvesting by our own communities is an important aspect but at the very same time the issues of the technology we use for human settlement around the apparatus that are there, we have to implement those that are energy efficient.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 77

Lastly, the issues of civic education and the responsibility that citizens must take; those who don't save water we must be able to hit them in their pockets in terms of the bylaws and be able to make it punitive cost because we can't continue to use more than 300 per capita per day when the world average is about 178 in a country that is water scarce. Thank you.

Mr W M THRING: Hon House Chair, I will take it on his behalf. It is hon Thring here. Deputy Minister, the ACDP acknowledges that the ecosystem approach to water takes into account biodiversity conservation and therefore prioritises the protection of biodiversity, as well as the sustainable use of water resources and the associated ecosystems.

In this regard, the Millennium Ecosystem Assessment which you have alluded to in your responses analyses the impact of human actions on ecosystems and human wellbeing. Deputy Minister, noting that our water systems are under stress with acid mine drainage and municipalities using our rivers for sewage disposal and human settlements and businesses disposing their waste into our water sources, what has your department done to address these abuses via embracing the Millennium Ecosystem Assessment Model in meeting and protecting the water needs of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 78

the indigent amongst us particularly within our rural areas?

Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION (Mr M D Mahlobo):

Well, we are one of the countries that are signatories to the Paris Agreement, including the mitigation factors in the entire ecosystem. The issues of the deterioration of water quality is because of the issues of the management of the water system in term of the Integrated Water Resources Management but then there are issues of regulations. We have strengthened our regulatory mechanism including putting special conditions around water use. That is why we are working with the law enforcement agencies. We are spending more time to ensure that we deal with that particular problem.

The reference that you are making around the activities of the mining sector which has been added backbone of the economy of our country, we must admit that there has been irresponsible mining over sometime where some of these mines are abandoned and billions of litres of water are contaminated underground. That is why we adopted the programme of reclamation but also the programme of acid mine drainage. The technology is there, you can go to Gauteng especially around the eKurhuleni, you

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 79

will be able to see that water is being treated to the highest standard that can be provided to the communities.

In Mpumalanga you can go to Middelburg and eMalahleni, you could see that working with the mining sector we are addressing those particular issues. However, we have a firm commitment that we must pursue. Some of these mining houses that have left our water in conditions that are unacceptable, especially the issues of the sinkholes. The other pollution that is caused by industries is caused by municipalities themselves. That is why in as much as we are supporting municipalities out of the processes of the green drop but we are also using the punitive measures.

Therefore, their implementation of the policy that have been supported around the waste discharged charge system is about that polluters will pay. Nonetheless, our message is that, please, don't do pollution because you will impact on the water resource for the next generation. I thank you.

Ms P MARAIS: Sorry, Chairperson. Chairperson, you have just jumped the EFF member that was supposed to speak before the member that spoke before us.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 80

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): The EFF member? I don't have an EFF member here.

Ms P MARAIS: You did not mention the EFF member, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): No. From the list that I have here, I don't have the EFF member.

Ms P MARAIS: Okay.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Okay.

Mr N G MYBURGH: House Chair, I would like to ask the Deputy Minister with reference to the importance of ... [Inaudible.] ... system services in rural communities which have difficulties in accessing water supply, whether the Minister believes that municipalities should be spending more money on water resources instead of, for instance, municipalities like Theewaterskloof Municipality where senior politicians, for instance, from the ANC and from Good, are known to have used scarce resources to attend the Rugby World Cup final in France. Does he believe, put differently, does he believe that water for the people is more important than tickets for politicians? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 81

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION (Mr M D Mahlobo):

It is better that when you deal with issues of water you appreciate the philosophy of water. It knows no boundaries and it has no ideology. Therefore, if you live in a glass house don't throw stones. Go to Tshwane run by yourselves where you hired a company of more than R260 million, that company instead of cleaning up the Rooiwal, they don't attend to the matter. Those communities of Hammanskraal they too are not less than human. However, let us address the issue because we don't politicise water.

The freshwater ecosystem, you have to appreciate that it is vital in terms of ensuring a range of benefits and services such as the drinking water. Drinking water is at the center. That is why the Constitution and the National Water Act makes a provision for a reserve which is a domestic use, the core high keys in terms of the ecosystem and international obligation. It talks about recreation. I have spoken about access to the economic benefits; environmental, social and cultural benefits around the water resources but it also talks about water for agriculture.

We need to set aside certain hectares for water for those people that want to have full security on agriculture because

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 82

there is a nexus between water, energy and agriculture. The issues of habitats for aquatic life forms a natural solution, promotes the wetlands systems and promotes those issues of biodiversity.

Hon Chairperson, that is why we have the programmes of working for fire, working for wetlands and all those particular programmes, they do make issues of difference on local communities. More importantly, let us deal with the issue of purification and climate resilience. If you do not understand the meaning of ecosystem itself, your participation is meaningless and you will mislead us. Thank you.

Question 704:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION (Mr M D Mahlobo):
Thank you very much, Chairperson, and thanks to hon Sihlwayi for her question. The Census Report 2022 demonstrates that there are advances the ANC has made around the provision and access to water to millions of South Africans, especially in provinces that were deliberately excluded by the apartheid government when it came to the delivery of infrastructure, where they chose to build dams around these communities and water was pushed into the mineral complex of Gauteng to support the apartheid regime.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 83

The fact of the matter is that there were Bantustans in the Eastern Cape. There were also Bantustans in certain parts of Limpopo and infrastructure was not developed and the population of those provinces had grown, and our view is that since we have been in the position of power, we must be able to act and act decisively because ...

IsiZulu:

... abantu baseMpumalanga Koloni nabo ...

Sesotho:

... ba re, "Le rona re batho!"

English:

They are people themselves and they can't be left behind. In the R14 billion that we've made available for this year, I want to confirm that the Eastern Cape is getting about R2,8 billion just in this financial year to address the issues of water shortages, which excludes the issues of the funding from the municipal infrastructure grant, Mig, it excludes the funding from the water services infrastructure grant, WSig.

When it comes to Limpopo, more than R2,24 billion has also been made available and a number of projects are done in that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 84

particular area. In the province of Limpopo, you have the Nandoni-Nsami Regional Bulk Water Scheme and the water has started flowing into the system, and by March next year, more than 27 villages will have additional water. Already some of them like in Homu and others ... those are the people of Giyani that were denied water. The people of Sekhukhune, the Olifants-Ebenezer Water Supply. When it comes to Polokwane, we need to indicate that R4,5 billion has been made available. They have already started the project there. As we speak, you go to Mogalakwena, the partnership with the private sector Ivanplats, they are starting to put a top-of-the-range wastewater system. I don't want to discuss the issues of the people of Sekhukhune. They have started the Loskop Dam. The issues around the Olifants Management Model, OMM, that is there. When you go to the Eastern Cape, in the Eastern Cape, we must be able to mention Umzimvubu and a number of other projects that we're doing there to support, but we must admit there are still those communities who don't have water and the provision of water will remain intermittent.

The water tracking will be there and the use of groundwater in supporting those particular communities, out of the more than 700 water projects, about 128 of them are just Ministerial

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 85

interventions in a number of municipalities, including the two provinces we've mentioned.

IsiXhosa:

Nks N SIHLWAYI: Sekela Mphathiswa, kungenzeka njani ukuba amanzi aphantsi komhlaba, anceda amaphandle, angangangcoliswa lilindle kuba la manzi alithemba labantu basemaphandleni?

English:

Thank you.

IsiZulu:

USEKELA NGQONGQOSHE WEZAMANZI NOKUTHUTHWA KWENDLE (Mnu M D Mahlobo): Ngiyabonga lungu elihloniphekile lesiShayamthetho. Amanzi atholakala ngaphansi komhlaba akusiyo into entsha la eNingizimu Afrika. Okhokho bokhokho bethu bebesebenzisa amanzi esiyalo. Lawo manzi kufuneka aqoqwe ahlanzwe kabusha, basekwe abantu bakithi. Uma unikezwa amanzi atholakala ngaphansi komhlaba akusho ukuthi amanzi angekho ezingeni elingalungile. Esikucelayo ukuthi omasipala njengoba imizi isikhule kakhulu nemfucusa ikhona lapho, sicela ukuthi amanzi bawahlole ngasosonke isikhathi noma kuthiwa ngamanzi esiyalo ukuze babheke ukuthi akukho yini okufana namagciwane, uma ekhona bakwazi ukuwasusa.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 86

Uma bethola ukuthi anobuthi njengoba kukhona ezinye izindawo la uthola khona ukuthi anobuthi bawasuse. Kodwa siyabonga ukusebenzisana nabantu abafana no-Coca Cola South Africa, i-Gift of the Givers, ezindaweni eziningi siyakwazi ukuthi silekelele abantu ukuthi bawathole lawo manzi lawo. Esizokwenza futhi ngoba ngesinye isikhathi sisebenzisa imali eningi, uthola ukuthi amanzi ayaphela ngenxa yoguquguquko lwesio sezulu. Uma lina izulu sizobuya amanzi siwafake laphaya phansi kule nto ekuthiwa ...

English:

... water recharge of the aquifers, so that we are in a position to do that.

IsiZulu:

Ngaleyondlela uma izingqalasizinda zingekafiki ezikoleni nasezibhedlela ...

English:

... groundwater is one of the options that we could be able to utilize.

IsiZulu:

Ngiyabonga.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 87

Mr N G MYBURGH: Thank you, House Chair, hon Deputy Minister, given the large number of households in Limpopo and the Eastern Cape that are still without water, but also considering the poor state of service delivery, as illustrated by the most recent Green and Blue Drop Reports whereby almost 30% of all water treatment plants or almost 50% of sewage plants are either dysfunctional or in a critical state of disrepair and dysfunctionality. Given the fact that the World Bank has now identified water as one of the three biggest risks of doing business in this country, will the Minister advise, is the President to declare a state of national disaster for water and sanitation sewage plants to galvanise extra and additional state resources to revamp and restore the crumbling infrastructure? If not, can the hon Minister tell us what level of dysfunctionality, what level of disintegration, 60%, 80%, perhaps 100%? What level of dysfunctionality will persuade the government to spring into action and do something about the unfolding water crisis in this country?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION (Mr M D Mahlobo):

So many issues, it looks like, hon member, you've woken up Malandela and discovered a discovery. The report you are speaking about was produced by us the Department of Water and Sanitation. We fully understand the state of infrastructure.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 88

That's why when you speak about No Drop, No Drop is about the state of infrastructure and the infrastructure we know we have made a lot of massive investments, but we also appreciate that our investment has not matched the economic growth and the population growth in terms of the graph.

That's why President, in terms of the Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Plan just on major water infrastructure issues over the next 10 years, more than R104 billion and these are the mega projects. Whether you go to the Clanwilliam Dam here, you go to Umzimvubu, and you go to Loskop. There are many of them. This government is hard at work, but when it comes to Blue Drop, Blue Drop is about the state of the water in terms of raw water and the raw water in South Africa in the taps, I can still assure you, that you can drink that water in the tap, but there are issues of efficacy and efficiency on the basis of the standard operating procedures and these are the municipalities who are helping, but when it comes to Green Drop, which is more about wastewater and effluent, the reality ... the infrastructure has never ... [Inaudible.] ... even during apartheid, including here in the Western Cape. You never built to connect more households and most of these plants are over-capacitated. You are choking them. That's why the sewer is running down here and we must address those

issues of sewer spillages that are happening in these communities.

Therefore, to say we are doing nothing, those who have eyes and ears, will be able to see. They will also be able to do that. We will support these municipalities because they've been at the centre of the transformation of water delivery, but they do have challenges around institutional ... around capacity that the Minister of Water and Sanitation, the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and the Minister of Finance, are intervening in terms of section 154, and section 63 in those municipalities to turn the situation around. Thanks, Mpangazitha.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr M L D Ntombela): Members are kindly requested to confine themselves to one supplementary question deriving from the core question. Only one.

Ms M R MOHLALA: Deputy Minister, the ongoing water access issues in Limpopo and the Eastern Cape are a cause of concern for institutional governance and the functioning of water and sanitation projects in South Africa. The problems include persistent water access challenges, deteriorating wastewater infrastructure leading to river contamination, delays and

corruption in various projects. Projects aimed at addressing these issues.

Deputy Minister, is there a realistic prospect of rectifying these longstanding issues and ensuring consistent access to water and sanitation for the people of Limpopo, Eastern Cape and other areas experiencing water access disruptions given that these problems have persisted for 30 years and years prior despite the significant funds allocated for the construction of dams in Limpopo and the Eastern Cape provinces?

Why is it that the state has been unable to provide safe water and decent sanitation to the residents of this region? You are talking about the Loskop Dam now when you were speaking. There is the De Hoop Dam next to the people of Sekhukhune. Thank you. [Time expired.]

IsiZulu:

USEKELA NGQONGQOSHE WEZAMANZI NOKUTHUTHWA KWENDLE (Mnu M D Mahlobo): Manje umulwi u-Mohlala ugcine ngento ekufanele ngabe uqale ngayo ngo i-Sekhukhune sisenhliziyweni yakhe kakhulu. Manje uyayazi le ndaba ukuthi uMongameli uma ethi

asisebenzisane nosomabhizinisi akusiyo nje insumansumane leyo, Malandela.

Uyabona lapha e-Sekhukhune kudingeka imali ...

English:

... close to R25 billion ...

IsiZulu:

... futhi uHulumeni akanayo leyo mali. Sesihlangene nesimayini i-Olifants Management Model ...

English:

... system that is there, we've been able to get into an agreement with all those municipalities and we are starting to ensure that while the water will be moving from Sekhukhune, the Nebo Plateau, Peter Mokaba until Mogalakwena, those communities are going to benefit. On the other side, when it comes to the issues around Modimolle and others, we've already got more than R4,5 billion from the budget facility, so that the water from Middle Letaba and the Crocodile can be brought to these particular communities. Therefore, I've mentioned these issues because, hon Mohlala, would know in the Eastern Cape, we know that we are intervening in the Nelson Mandela in

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 92

terms of the Nooitgedacht in terms of the levels there, including the Lower Sundays River in terms of the government water scheme, there is an intervention and we've started in September this year and about 800 million is there. You go to the Greater Mbizana Regional Bulk Water Scheme, we are repairing and upgrading the Ludeke Dam so that the Nomlacu Water Treatment Plant can be increased from 10 megalitres to 20 megaliters.

IsiZulu:

Uye lapha e-Mnquma i-Ngqamakhwe Regional Bulk Water Scheme.

English:

It will provide more than 78 000 people especially 120 villages already that work is happening in Butterworth, Centane nase-Ngqamakhwe, and by April 2024 ...

IsiZulu:

... sizobe sihambisa lawo manzi kuleyo miphakathi. Uye e-Ndlambe ...

English:

... it's the very same thing, we are completing in December 2024 in Makana. The list is endless. It's endless because

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 93

together with the municipalities, we are going to leave no one behind as per the instruction of the President when it comes to water provision and decent sanitation.

IsiZulu:

Ngiyabonga.

English:

Ms S A BUTHELEZI: Thank you, Chairperson, hon Deputy Minister, as we are in the Budgetary Review and Recommendation Report period, we often see municipalities underspending on their allocated budgets, which directly impacts the provision of basic services to the local municipalities. Considering this, I would like to know whether you have any collaborative plans in place with the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs to ensure that funds from programmes that have underspent in municipal budgets, especially in the areas of Limpopo and the Eastern Cape, are ... [Inaudible.] ... for infrastructure for piped water. Thank you, Chairperson.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION (Mr M D Mahlobo): Thank you very much, Chairperson and thanks to Shenge for her question. Municipalities are at different levels in terms of capacity. There are those municipalities that have the right

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 94

technical capacity and are able to discharge their responsibility as water service authorities in terms of the law, but there are those municipalities that are struggling, irrespective of which political party is leading that municipality. It's going to be important. If municipalities are struggling, we and the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs have engineers that were putting at their disposal. Some of them can't put business plans. That's why they can't get funding. We're assisting them to put together their technical reports and business plans. Then there's a problem with implementation. We've taken a decision to bring our water boards, with their vast capacity, both in terms of human resources and their balance sheet to be at the disposal of these municipalities.

In the Eastern Cape, Amatola Water has been strengthened, they are able to assist those municipalities. That's why in KwaZulu-Natal, you could see Umgeni and uThukela are intervening in eThekweni around the wastewater problem that they're facing, and you can go to Gauteng, we are intervening in Tshwane where that water services authority can't provide water and the water is contaminated. You go to Emfuleni, it's the same issue. If you go to Limpopo, you can see that Lepelle Northern Water has been supported by us and the Development

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 95

Bank of Southern Africa, DBSA, to try to conclude the Giyani project from Vhembe to Mopani. The issues of the Ebenezer system.

Therefore, our support of the municipalities will continue and the co-operation is good. If they don't co-operate, we will implement section 63 and intervene. We'll discuss afterwards who is supposed to do the job, but our people will get water.

Question 694:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: House Chair, the response to the first part of question: The department is responsible for curriculum policy and implementation thereof.

Learners are encouraged to attend school on a regular basis and to meet the assessment requirements of all the subjects. If learners are absent from school for extended period time, the school management teams and teachers working with relevant officials at district and provincial offices can work out support programmes that are relevant to the learners and school context to readmit and re-orientate learners to schooling.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 96

The reasons for not attending school for extended period of time could vary from one learner to another. So, we cannot have a 'one size fits all', it depends upon a particular situation.

Then the second part, what programmes are there: The support programmes are the programmes that the school has, like your Learner Teaching Support Materials, LTSM, and some other resources that can be used to ensure that learners can catch up on schooling.

The programmes and tools used will be informed by the context and the extent to which the learner has missed out on education. If it's a severe case that will need psychosocial support then we work together with the Department of Social Development to rehabilitate them, then they bring them back to the department. If they missed for a period of about ten months, then we readmit them on the same grade the following year and support them. Thank you, Chair.

Mr B S MADLINGOZI: Chair, with all the children that are missing school for days and sometimes months, because they are taking care of their siblings and they acting as the parents to their grandparents. What mechanisms does your department

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 97

have to trace, find and assist these children with getting back to school?

Chairperson, what are the tools and mechanisms that the department has to retain students who are currently attending school with the difficulties mentioned above? And if you have, what actions do you take in following up on the progress of such initiative? Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): We agree, you asked four questions, hon Madlingozi? And you know what is the rule for supplementary question.

Minister, it's your prerogative!

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Chair, indeed, it's a very good question, it shows that he's concerned, especially for the vulnerable. The vulnerable, we work together with the Department of Social Development, they know all of them, that's why they are on social grants. The social workers within a community know and they link with a school.

So, in the school, the tool that we use for learners to stay at school, if they leave far from the school we use scholar

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 98

transport. If they are hungry, there's no food at home, there's school nutrition programme and now we have even introduced breakfast because we have seen that some rely only on that meal a day that they get at school; that's why we have introduced even breakfast that we keep them at school, then and the no-fee school they get LTSM, they get everything for free that there should be no situation that keeps them away from school.

But if the situation is severe then the Department of Social Development kicks in and work together. That's why when we issue results we first give the results to the Minister of Social Development on her children, that your children, Minister, the vulnerable, this is how they performed. And keeping them in school with all the tools that I mentioned, it makes them not to miss school and they pass, and we really appreciate that we are changing the lives of the vulnerable. Thank you, Chair.

Ms M L MOROANE: Chair, the Basic Education Laws Amendment, BELA, Bill has a clause which gives accountability to school management teams to follow up with learners who drop out. What is the mechanism and projected effect of the BELA Bill

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 99

amendment if passed by Parliament in relation to learners' drop out? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Chair, the BELA Bill aims at the total transformation of education; total transformation. That's why those who are not for transformation are extremely against the BELA Bill because they enjoy miscuedness of education. so, if that Bill can pass into a law we'll see changes. All learners will remain at school.

But I'm not saying that we shall have totally eradicated the staying away. We have things like substance abuse, we have so many things, the social ills within the society which need all of us to work together to make sure that we preserve the future of this country, which are the young ones of this country. Thank you, Chair.

Ms D VAN DER WALT: Deputy Minister, just yesterday the Commission of Gender Equality presented to the portfolio committee their findings on school drop out of teenage girls during pregnancy. You were there.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 100

Research revealed that 83 000 children between the ages of 10 and 17 gave birth, countrywide, during the 2019-20 financial year, according to StatsSA.

Thirteen point four percent of female learners dropped out of school due to family commitments which included getting married, minding children and pregnancy. And let's be honest, most of those female learners don't want to be pregnant at that age.

Only a third of teenage girls who become pregnant in South Africa return to school, and with every year that passes after giving birth decreasing the chances of ever returning to school.

Sixty percent of pregnant teenagers did not return to school after the two-year period, previously enforced by the Department of Basic Education, DBE ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, hon Van Der Walt. Thank you very much ...

Ms D VAN DER WALT: ... Chair, please tell us what you will do with those dropped out learners?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 101

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): ... hon Van Der Walt, your time is up. I thought you were making a statement or an opinion. Now you exceed because of your preamble.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Chair, the question I heard: What are we doing with those who dropped out?

We are offering a second chance. I've answered the question. we are offering a second chance to all the learners who do not have matric, all the young people, all of them, there is a second chance programme by the department.

But the issue of teenage pregnancy and the high numbers of 2020-21, and they were rife in 2021, the statistics of 2021, it was during the time of covid when they were at home. So, they were not at school, they were at home. When we opened schools in 2021 they didn't come back because they were pregnant, they were at home.

We encourage them that after giving birth, please come back. And we have a policy, Chair, of pregnancy management in schools because we don't want schools to do things differently. We say, if learners are pregnant and they are willing to stay at schools with their pregnancy, let them

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 102

stay, and we guide teachers how to treat those learners. And we are together with the Department of Health.

Yes, they are not everywhere, but there are clinics that are connected to schools. That even if the child can give birth today and feel that tomorrow is fit to can go to school, we allow them to ... [Sound cut off.] ... withholding them. It becomes difficult for a school to say 'bring them' if the parents say ... I even make an example of a child that is pregnant and is ready write matric but the parents said 'no'. So, how do we do that? What can ... [Sound cut off.] ... the drop out, Chair, it needs all of us, it needs the community, it needs the parents, it needs everyone. We cannot leave school now [Time expired.] ... [Inaudible.] ... Jesus to chase one ship. Thanks.

Ms M E SUKERS: Chair, the reason why children drop out of school, there are many reasons and pregnancy is but one of them.

When children re-enter the system they suffer various traumas and some of the reasons why in the first place they are out of school is because of a many times trauma and other negative social impact on them. They face emotional and psychological

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 103

impact when they return to school, they struggle with educational gaps, difficulty getting back to school routine, insecurity in reintegrating socially and they may lack access to updated textbooks, technology or other educational resources. They made need individualized attention and additional support to bring them up to speed. Individualized support, remedial programmes and a focus on social emotional learning can contribute to the successful re-introduction of children who have missed out on school for an extended period.

How ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Thank you, your time is up. Thank you very much. [Interjections.] No, a member is allowed to make a statement or express an opinion, and that's what she did.

It's up to you, Minister, if you just want to commend on the statement.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Ya [Yes], I want to agree with her. I agree with her. Thank you, Chair.

Question 706:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 104

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: House Chairperson,
firstly, I would like to start by indicating that Statistics,
Stats SA is very helpful in the sense that in their analysis,
they don't only just give us the facts and the figures. But
also, they do an analysis that cuts across a number of series
that also include areas which are related to the Department of
Social Development.

And this also includes the statistical advice, which they also
give us, which gives us an opportunity particularly to know
where our people are, what are the conditions under which they
live and they also give us a demographic analysis, which then
also helps us in appreciating and understanding, particularly
as far as the work that is related to the Department of Social
Development.

Just an example that I would like to make, in the demographic
analysis, we are told by the Stats SA that 50% of the country
is concentrated in just three provinces; Gauteng,
KwaZulu-Natal, Western Cape, which underscores then for us,
the urbanization and all the trends that then demand that as
we develop these policies, we must be conscious of that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 105

Furthermore, the data also reflects that more women attain higher education, which is very exciting for us at this point in time.

House Chairperson also, I want to indicate that these observation and insights they enable the Department of Social Development to stay abreast of emerging population trends and therefore we are happy that South Africa through Stats SA, they have in the past four times been giving us these statistics, that provide a new one's perspective on SA social and economic landscape. Again, that enables us as the Department of Social Development to be able to develop the right policies.

I also would like to indicate House Chairperson, that it is in the light of this that the DSD using this data is able to plan and provide wide range of social protection services that aligned to our mandate. And that is of provision of integrated comprehensive, sustainable, social services, which is at the heart of our mandate as the Department of Social Development.

I also want to say House Chairperson, that when you are a cook in a kitchen or wherever you are, you always need to have the right ingredients, you need to buy the right ingredients in

order for you to produce the right food. So, these statistics for us, they give us the chance to make sure that we develop the right policies.

However, if you look at the economic stagnation, which is our biggest problem and the high levels of unemployment, the Department of Social Development has had very specific approaches to this. One of those is the fact that the DSD portfolio budget allocation is R263 billion for the current financial year, and therefore we're able to reach and provide critical service to children, youth, persons with disabilities and the elderly.

And in terms of ensuring that we are also contributing to economic development. We have upscaled investment in youth development in many aspects providing developmental services that include ensuring that our youth participate in community developmental programs with ... [Interjection.]

[Time expired.]

Ms N Q MVANA: Thank you, Minister, we welcome the departments intervention in ensuring grant payments, not grossly interrupted. Noting that the department has reached introducing the big and recognizing the medium-term budget.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 107

Now the question is: What is the view of the department on the review out of all what has been said in terms of the medium-term budget? Thank you, House Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: House Chairperson, yes, the medium-term budget and we all know that it has been pronounced and we now know how much we have, which also includes the fact that we have been able to extend for instance the 350 for yet another year. Which would like the basic income grant, for instance, the 350 would like to make it as a stepping stone to the basic income grant. And the process is thereof of the basic income grant are in the pipeline and we've made these presentations to the portfolio committee.

But I can safely say that we wish for a time when the budget cuts that are currently happening now will be in the past, but that can only happen if we also contribute to ensuring that there is economic growth. Because without the economic growth, it then becomes very difficult for us to even ... [Inaudible.] ... more taxes so that we can be able to support those who are unable to support themselves. Thank you, House Chairperson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 108

Ms B S MASANGO: Hon Minister, a far cry from the ANC's manifesto of 2019, under the all-important subjects of advancing social transformation where the manifesto claims, among others and working towards ... [Interjection.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order, order, order, hon members. Sorry mama Masango.

Ms B S MASANGO: ...yes...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): The Minister cannot even hear you.

Ms B S MASANGO: ... exactly, should I start from the start?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon Minister, are you ok for her to proceed, or should she start? Yes, please, members, let's respect the House. Start from a fresh, hon Masango.

Ms B S MASANGO: Hon Minister, a far cry from the ANC's Manifesto 2019 under the all-important subject off, "Advancing Social Transformation" where the manifesto claims, among other things, that:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 109

And working towards a comprehensive social security system to protect the well-being of the people and society.

Millions of South Africans suffer the agony and indignity of hunger, with 81% of households struggling to put enough food on the table, 12 million people going to bed hungry every night, 30% of children below the age of five stunted in their development. Millions of hungry school children are unable to concentrate and learn.

With an increased population that the question speaks to, it means more South Africans are falling prey to these government failures. The question is: When will the hon Minister ensure that her provincial colleagues serve the poor as stipulated in the ANC Manifesto and pay nonprofit organisations, NPOs, doing her department statutory work instead of closing them, leaving the increasing number of their clients in the lurch. Thank you, so much, House Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much, hon member, for that question. We, as the ANC, we develop manifestos as by the way we are going to be finalizing the one for the next elections that's going to help us win the next elections. We developed the manifestos basing ourselves first

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 110

and foremost on the reality on the ground, number one, which is about the economic development, which is about the collection of resources, so that those resources, then we adequately distribute them to the different provinces.

If by any chance in the manifesto there are certain things that we have not been able to implement according to specific manifesto, we do go to the people and we say to the people, we did say, we were going to go this far in as far as the manifesto is concerned, but if we have not been able to do so due to reasons that are appreciated, particularly earlier on, I spoke about the fact that if the economy doesn't grow, it means we have a bit of a problem in ensuring that we'll fulfil that mandate.

But in this particular case, House Chairperson, not only the Department of Social Development has been working towards ensuring that provinces implement their programs, and they make sure that they spend on the budgets that have been given to them.

Our role and our responsibility as a department at national level is to make sure that we do everything to hold those Member of Executive Council, MECs, and those department

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 111

structures at provincial level to make sure that they must do their best to fulfil ... but I cannot deny the fact that in the implementation thereof, some provinces, we find that there are weaknesses in the implementation because of the challenges that I indicated earlier on.

But if we look at what the department has done in ensuring that despite these challenges of budgets, what we have been able to do, the hon member is one that I must say, is always in the in the portfolio committee. We have made those presentation as to where exactly have we succeeded, where have we not succeeded? And we are saying to the people of South Africa where we have failed you mark our words; we will improve on the basis of the weaknesses that we have seen in past six years. Thank you, House Chairperson. [Time expired.]

Ms P MARAIS: Minister, your National Development Agency mandate is to contribute towards the eradication of poverty. It is caused by granting funds to civil society organization for the purpose of implementing development projects of poor communities. What percentage of the budget is going to civil society organisations, CSO and how many job opportunities was created through this initiative? Thank you, House Chairperson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 112

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much on hon member and I must indicate to you that from myself as a Minister, and I think this is something that would be expressed even by the department as well as the National Development Agency. The budget of the National Development Agency is very small, two and something million to be able to then support your community-based organizations and in that view what we have done as a department together with the National Development Agency, is to say they need to reengineer themselves to a much more effective and less expenditure on administration and salaries and all.

It does have a turnaround strategy, which obviously we are going to ... we've brought it to the portfolio committee where we are expressing exactly what we are saying, that this amount of money that is allocated to the NDA and the responsibility is far too little. But at the same time, having said that, I have also said to the NDA, there are many other developmental institutions, finance development institutions that the NDA must go to and partner within order for them to augment this very little budget, that they have, number one.

Number two, I've also on ... by the way the good thing is that we now have a board of the NDA, because in the past we didn't

have a board and that created a very big problem for me because it means as a Minister, I needed to be looking at the department and also looking at the NDA from a deeper point of view than when you have a board. The amount of money they have is not adequate. And to that extent, we need more so that they cover.

But lastly, it will also be important for them to work with the Department of Small Business Development because some of the organisations they are dealing with, are people who are dealing with your small and medium enterprises, your cooperatives, they can be able to work with the Department of Small Business Development to get support.

The community based organizations, my plea is that those that do get the money, they must be accountable with that money because in some instances, they give money to cooperatives and when you go back to the cooperative that was handed a check of about three hundred, four hundred thousand, you go a year later, you find that there's nothing that can be show for the money that has been given to them. Thank you, House Chair.

[Time expired.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 114

Ms M E SUKERS: Minister, the department plays a pivotal role in enhancing the well-being of individuals and families amid the challenges posed by rapid population growth together with growing unemployment. What strategic planning and resource allocation has the ministry in hand to ensure that vulnerable segments of the population receive adequate support addressing issues such as poverty, housing, and healthcare access. Thank you, House Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: House Chairperson, I just want to clarify also for the member that, the ministry is a ministry made of myself and the Deputy Minister and the little staff that we have around us. The department is where the real work sits. And therefore, the allocation of the budget not only to the national structures that deal with poverty, unemployment, and inequality, it is also about the provinces, and the functioning of the systems of the provinces, as well as local government structures. Because as a Department of Social Development, we take the money that we get from national, and it is distributed equally to the different provinces.

And we follow with regard to the provincial departments as to what their plans are versus the overall strategic plan of the

department in terms of a provision of the specific projects and programs that we have.

I personally believe House Chairperson, that more work has to be done at a provincial level. More work has to be done at a local level and national should try by all means to focus particularly on policy development, on monitoring and evaluation, but enable both the provincial and local structures, who are much closer to the people to be the ones that deliver when it comes to issues of poverty, unemployment and inequality. Thank you, House Chairperson.

Question 656:

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE: Hon Hendricks, thank you very much for the question. The department already has and is implementing a recognition system based on strategic 8 of the nation Sport and Recreation. To quote the plan, it says:

"To acknowledge the achievements of individuals within the South African sport and recreation sector through an establishment of a recognition system."

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 116

Individuals who have made remarkable contributions to sport, current and former are recognised through the SA Sports Awards, in particular the Steve Tshwete Lifetime Achievement Awards category. In addition, since 2011 the department honoured and recognised sport persons whose contribution was not recognised because of oppressive apartheid rules through the Andrew Mlangeni Green Jacket Awards.

Of course, the sport sector is guided by the country's foreign policy and therefore takes heed and guidance from the decisions and principles as taken by the South African government on a particular country which would apply to all the sectors and not just limited to sport, arts, and culture. Thank you very much Chairperson.

Mr M G E HENDRICKS: Hon House chair, no question except to say that we are inviting the 100 legends at the ... [Inaudible.] ... welcome to attend. Thank you very much.

Mr D W MACPHERSON: Just a point of clarity because I think this is the first certainly in the last ten years where a member has post a question on the Order Paper and does not have a follow-up question. Is that how it should be?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 117

THE HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Let's proceed. Let's proceed. Hon Deputy Minister?

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT, ATRS AND CULTURE: Thank you very much to the hon Hendricks for that extension of the invite. As the Ministry we will await the invite and we will honour. Anything from us that is about honouring those that played a role in the country, we are willing to be there and assist. Thank you so much Chairperson.

Ms R C ADAMS: Deputy Minister, successful sports persons who leave a legacy in South African sports can also face economic challenges when they retire. How does the department ensure that all successful sports persons get involved in the sport sector to contribute to the development of various sports persons and sustain their well-being? I thank you.

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT, ATRS AND CULTURE: House Chair, of course, the Ministry had looked at this and we have started what we call a sports ambassadors programme which is not about recognising what they have done in the field, but what they can do beyond the field. What we are doing is to make sure that we are able to look at their skills and see how they can assist society.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 118

We are currently setting up about 23 sports ambassadors and we know that this is a drop in the ocean, but we're looking at making sure that each province has got its own sports ambassadors. This program was launched on the 9th of August last year, and it's just one year in action. But the importance about it is that we are looking at the diversity of the post players, the inclusiveness, for instance, people with disabilities, youth and gender, and make sure that they are able to plough back in schools and in clubs and make sure that they are exemplary to the young people on how they had looked after themselves and how they can impart that to the young people. Thank you, Chairperson.

Ms V VAN DYK: Deputy Minister, the hon Hendricks also in his question, refers to persons with disabilities. What supporting initiatives does the government have in place that promote the integration of athletes with the disability into mainstream sport as well as promote structured mass participation in sport for the disabled and how does sport and recreation services ensure that there is assistance and monitoring of recognised structures for sport for the disabled? Thank you.

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT, ATRS AND CULTURE: Hon van Dyk, you would know that in the country - even in terms of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 119

Olympics, you have what we would call the Paralympics as well because we try and make that we give enough time and recognition to the people with disabilities.

You will also remember that what we do might not be enough, but we try as much as we can that all sport codes know that they must have a programme for the people with disabilities, because at the end of the day, we need to make sure that their rights and the fact that they can also participate in sports is taken into account.

We might not be able to reach all of them, but what we want to suggest is that even bodies that are dealing with people with disabilities, provinces that are dealing with sports have got a critical role to play to make sure that people with disabilities, young people in particular are integrated into sports because as the national department, we might miss some. But, the system is there, the programmes are there and we make sure that all our programmes include people with disabilities. Thank you, Chairperson.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chairperson, Inkosi Luthuli is having network problems. May I take this question?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 120

THE HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Proceed hon Singh.

Mr N SINGH: Hon Deputy Minister, you indicated when you started answering questions that you are in India, and we know why you are in India. You must be in a very positive mood to ensure that our Springbok cricket teams wins not only tomorrow but wins the final. My question to you and your department is: Has the department considered or made any offers to the team to honour them for a World Cup win, either financially or in any other way as a motivation for them to do well and make us proud of them? Thank you.

IsiZulu:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk M G Boroto): Ama-Proteas, Lungu elihloniphekile Singh. Uyahlanganisa.

English:

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT, ATRS AND CULTURE: Thank you hon Singh. We will pass the message to the team. They are playing Australia tomorrow. A very important match but also remember what we do as the department is that we don't do offers prior, hon Singh. What we do is that once a team has done well, I know that South Africans will be flocking at the airport when

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 121

Proteas come back, whether they win the final or not because they have done so well so far in this tournament.

The fact that tomorrow they are playing in the semifinal is a success on its own. That's number one. But number two, the importance for us is that when we recognise excellence, it is not about offering the monetary value. We look at what we can do to make sure that you are able to improve the sports in the country beyond those that are playing at the moment.

That is why when the Proteas women lost at the final in March this year, what we then committed was to say, the Proteas women, the cricket women in the country, we are putting money to make sure that we professionalise the sport.

So, what we could be doing in cricket is to say, we offer that you go to the communities, to the poorest of the poor to improve cricket in those particular areas, it's not about giving monetary value to the players themselves. Thank you so much.

THE HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): And as we wish the Proteas well tomorrow, we wish for the Proteas to really come out victorious. Hon members, the time allocated for questions

has expired. Outstanding replies received will be printed on Hansard. I want to thank members of the executive for availing yourself for this session. Thank you very much.

**CONSIDERATION OF REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE ON
2023 REVISED AND PROPOSED FISCAL FRAMEWORK**

Xitsonga:

Nkul M J MASWANGANYI: Mutshamaxitulu wa Yindlu ...

English:

... Ministers, Deputy Ministers, hon members ...

Xitsonga:

... ri perile Ximokonkulu xa Vandlankulu. Xitsonga i xilungu.

English:

Thank you very much, House Chairperson. We are tabling the report of the Standing Committee on Finance on the fiscal framework that has been presented by the Minister. Subsequent to him tabling the report or the statement, the Minister briefed the committee. After that as the committee we conducted the public hearings. After the public hearings, Treasury responded to the issues raised by the stakeholders

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 123

and the committee members. What we have to acknowledge is that we are tabling this report against a very difficult situation in the global environment, the global economic growth is projected to fall. Why is it projected to fall? There are so many conflicts today in the world. It will fall as a result of the political tensions between Russia and Ukraine, and you know that South Africa is highly exposed to those economies. Now, we also have the problem of conflict of Israel and Palestine. These conflicts are having serious impact on the economy of South Africa.

Coming back home, we also table this report against the background of the release of the census 2022, by Statistics South Africa. Statistics South Africa is the authority on statistics. When they present the data, that data is validated and must be trustworthy. You don't have to throw around the statistics, according to Joe Maswanganyi this and that and that data is not trustworthy, it's not validated. Therefore, this is the statistics that have been validated and verifiable. According to these statistics, it says that under ANC government households that are residing in formal dwellings have increased to 88,5%. 82,4% of households have access to pipe water. The Deputy Minister spoke at length

about this issue. Access to electricity went from 58,1% in 1996 to 94,7% in 2022.

Therefore, the economy is growing because the real gross domestic product, GDP, increased for consecutive quarters. From 0,4% in the first quarter to 0,6% in the second quarter of 2023. We are also tabling this report against the backdrop of the release of the 2023 third quarter unemployment figures. We welcome the latest decrease, in the expanded unemployment rate and a net increase of 399 000 new jobs, hon Manyi. We also welcome the positive development in resolving the challenges of load shedding. Be that as it may, there are challenges that we all acknowledge. The challenge of debt is something that we have to confront. The debt as we speak, more especially the debt service costs are quite very, very high, and these have to be attended to.

Also, the other issue that we have to attend to is this notion of a bloated public service. We have to talk about this issue of a public service wage debt. Why do we say it's a notion? It's a belief because if something is not tested, it can't be said that it's a fact. Why do we say it's a belief? According to Stats SA census, the population of South Africa has increased to 62 million people, let alone the foreigners.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 125

Remember, foreigners also have human rights. When they go to Charlotte Maxeke, you can't turn the woman who's pregnant at the gate. They have to be taken care of. Therefore, our hospitals today have got so many foreign nationals. On this 62 million that we're talking about ... [Interjections.] ... no problem, Mhlekazi [Sir].

What we can say is that there were 208 police officers in 2023. Today, that number has reduced, it has gone down to almost 172 000 far below international ratio of the population. Therefore, these are the police that have to chase criminals who are highly armed with assault rifles. In 1994, there were one million public servants. Today is 2023, with 62 million population. We only have 1,2 million public servants. Therefore, you have to do the arithmetic, the ratio. If you have got 62 million population, you have 1,2 million public servants. What is the ratio? How many people does one public servant serve? You can break it down even in terms of sectors because what it means is that one doctor serves not less than 3 198 patients in terms of the ratio. You have got schools. There are more than 12 000 706 learners with far 105 teachers. Are they able to cope, let alone those who are almost four or five million who are out of school?

Therefore, we have to deal with these challenges as to ... if we have got nurses who are 200 or so plus they have to service 62 million people. Hence, we say that when you talk about a bloated public service, it's a notion, it's not a belief. It's not backed by statistics because these are the statistics, 1,2 million civil servants, 62 million population. What a problem is, is that as we speak the Wage Bill in actual sense has decreased to 31% of the budget within the National Treasury's parameters of 25% to 35%. The problem is to ... [Interjections.] ... you get the point ...

Sepedi:

O fihlile maloba. Wena o be o le motho wa go jaeva.

Xitsonga:

... u munhu wo jayivha wena. Laha a ku jayivhiwi. A hi jayivhi laha ...

English:

... we deal with serious issues. Okay, let's come back to serious business. We have got serious challenges of state-owned enterprises, SOEs, but the Cabinet is dealing with this issue through a National Logistic Crisis Committee, which we believe will turn around Transnet. We are seeing Eskom where

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 127

there is a progress. As the committee we welcome Eskom's generation recovery, commissioning of Kusile and Medupi units and intervention under the energy action plan which are very crucial to addressing the energy capacity shortfalls.

We are also raising the issue of food inflation, which is very high. This has to be attended to and as the committee we are recommending that the zero value-added tax, VAT, rated food basket be expanded to household. Dr George, I'm not taking your issue, tomorrow we're debating this issue. Therefore, let me stop here. He's a very good colleague of us. Therefore, tomorrow he's bringing an item on food inflation ...

[Interjections.] ... Hi, Macpherson, yes, he's contributing. Yes, we have a very good committee. Even Wessels is here, I'm happy that he's here.

Afrikaans:

Agb ... hoe gaan dit? Ja. [Gelag.]

English:

He will come here and talk about cadre deployment. We are dealing with the issue of the budget balance and debt sustainability. I've spoken about the problem of debt, which Cabinet has developed a strategy to deal with it. We are also

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 128

raising an issue about the state reconfiguration. We are happy that the national government is intervening in municipalities which are distressed in terms of energy. We welcome the debt relief on municipalities. However, what we are saying is that there is a notion somewhere that Eskom can take over the electricity function of municipalities to recover debts, this can be allowed. We have got the co-operative governance chapter in the Constitution. National and provincial governments have a responsibility to follow section 154 to build capacity on municipalities. If you have to apply section 139, it can't be an entity. It can only be a sphere of government that intervenes in a municipality, not an entity.

Moving towards conclusion, stakeholders raised issues of gender that we must make sure that the budget is gender responsive. In this manner, the committee reiterates that National Treasury should integrate a robust gender responsive budgeting mechanism into future budgetary processes. This should involve a detailed analysis of how budgetary allocations contribute to addressing gender disparities and supporting initiatives that address the well-being of women and other marginalised groups, including gender sensitive fiscal policies that align with broader National Development Goals. And also, we received a submission from children who

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 129

were accompanied by the Commissioner for Children in the Western Cape, Johnny and Tara, who are 14 and 16 years respectively. Therefore, we took their inputs very, very, very serious to such that as a committee, we recommend the adoption of child centred governance and or budget practices to address concerns about intergenerational impact of government debt on children. The committee recommends a thorough assessment of the potential consequences of debt so that we don't push debt to the next generation.

Lastly, the issue of the Social Relief of Distress, SRD, grant, hon Zulu, Mageba, it's an issue that will be discussed seriously. It came as an intervention in 2019, but now it's a grant that is assisting society, more especially young people that are unemployed and so on. We know that in Cabinet you are looking at reviewing the issue of the grant regime. Therefore, look at this issue positively because it is like 2025, it will be faced out. We don't know what is coming and stakeholders are raising this issue very strongly that it should not be done away. I move for the adoption of this report, and hon Shenge will support me in this regard. Thank you very much.

Dr D T GEORGE: Chairperson, the revised Fiscal Framework reflects rapidly deteriorating economic prospects brought to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 130

us by a failing ANC government. The Budget revision is meant to be an adjustment to the February Budget that sets out government policy expectations for the next financial year. The adjustments to the Fiscal Framework this year are staggering and policy direction is uncertain. Revenue for 2023-24 is revised downward. In February, National Treasury projected economic growth of 0,9%. Now their projection is 0,8%, an 11% reduction. The SA Reserve Bank projects even lower growth at 0,7%. Our economy is lagging far behind the 3,3 growth forecast for the sub-Saharan Africa region. Our economy cannot grow with relentless rolling blackouts, the collapse of our rail infrastructure and failed race-based economic policies that have distorted our economy into unsustainability. Revenue from the mining sector in particular has fallen by 55% as a consequence.

Although government talks about public-private partnerships, there is no progress and our economy is running out of time. Promoting local economic growth requires market liberalisation, property rights enhancement, trade openness, regulatory streamlining and the cutting of red tape, labour laws that encourage job creation, the scrapping of exchange controls and visa systems that work.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 131

Government's inability to respond to the fiscal crisis it has created is also very clear. In these circumstances, with government incapable of accelerating economic growth, choices are limited. It can increase taxes to collect more revenue, borrow more to fund the widening deficit, cut expenditure or choose a combination. The revised Fiscal Framework reduces expenditure on service delivery and avoids the hard policy choices that government needs to make. State-owned enterprises, SOEs, will never become viable. The model is fundamentally flawed. Private-sector capital is required to keep our lights on and the wheels of freight trains moving. The bloated public sector wage bill remains out of control, while services to the people who pay for it deteriorates.

As government runs out of money, it will not be able to pay the millionaire cadres clogging up senior management without cutting back on front line personnel who earn far less and actually deliver services. No amount of borrowing can fix what the ANC has broken. Every South African household knows that there are limits to borrowing and that you cannot borrow your way out of a financial difficulty. The deficit is increasing despite promises made in February for its reduction. The Minister is now talking about fiscal anchors.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 132

The DA has already tabled a Private Member's Bill, the Responsible Spending Bill, that will introduce rules to contain excessive borrowing. In February, the Financial Action Task Force added South Africa to its greylist of countries that are under increased monitoring to address deficiencies in countering money laundering, terrorist financing and proliferation financing. The Minister declared that we would exit the greylist by mid-2024 and is now back to track this to 2025. Our greylisting has heavily impacted on individual and business cross-border transactions and a slowed investment. Our benefits from the *African Growth and Opportunity Act*, *Agoa*, are not secure either. The ANC has chosen its beneficial relationships with Russia and Iran above the interests of the South African economy. Although we have thus far avoided the carve out in the annual review, tough negotiations lies ahead as the Act approaches renewal in 2025.

Under this failing government, all South Africans are getting poorer in the midst of a cost of living crisis. The Minister never mentioned the cost of living in his statement, not even once. Instead, he has added to the uncertainty in his vague responses to questions on tax increases. Minister, why don't you look battling South African households in the eye and tell them how much more pressure your broken government is going to

pile onto their already overstretched household budgets with your tax measures to raise an additional R15 billion in 2024?

If government made the right policy choices that enabled our economy to grow, it could cut the taxes and levies on fuel and could immediately reduce the cost of transportation and food. It could very easily expand the zero VAT-rated food basket to include bone in chicken, beef, tinned beans, wheat flour, margarine, peanut butter, baby food, tea, coffee and soup powder. The Standing Committee on Finance has endorsed the DA's proposal to expand the zero VAT-rated basket. This will bring relief to vulnerable households. We need clarity on which items will be included and certainty that that will not be increased on other goods.

Minister, we also need to know where is the action plan that Cabinet mandated the Economic cluster to develop in order to enhance food security and accessibility. Thirty years after our first democratic elections, South Africa is teetering on the brink of collapse. Incoherent economic policy introduced unproductive rent-seeking through a black economic empowerment that has only enriched the political elite. Cadre deployment hollowed out the public sector and SOEs are conduits for the theft of the people's money.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 134

There is no surprise that the ANC government does not respond as the cost of living spirals upwards and households go hungry. It simply doesn't care. South Africans are struggling to pay their mortgages, school fees and to maintain the lifestyle they have worked so hard to achieve as everyone gets poorer. Tax is theft when government steals the people's money. Government needs to remember that it has no money of its own. It all belongs to the people and they can stop giving it to you. We do not support this Fiscal Framework. Thank you.

Mr M MANYI: Chair of the session, the EFF wants to put it on record that we reject the tabled Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement and the revised Fiscal Framework, and call on all Members of Parliament that are conscious to reject it as well.

It is telling that the Minister of Finance decided to table such as supposed budget ... I beg your pardon. It is telling that the Minister of Finance decided to table such a supposedly important policy statement and Bills related to adjustments, budgets and revenue, and other Bills, and thereafter decided to go on leave. He could not even wait to finalise the process with Parliament because the people of South Africa are not taken seriously. It was always assumed that whatever is presented by National Treasury is gospel ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 135

[Inaudible.] ... must just swallow and rubber-stamp. The EFF will not do any of that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Who is that? Hon Manyi, please take your seat. Hon Radebe?

Mr B A RADEBE: Chairperson, I think I'm rising on Rule 84, on unparliamentary language. I think the Minister of Finance was on sick leave. I don't think Parliament can endorse this reckless statement by the member on the platform. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I will follow up. I didn't get the part that you are talking about, unless you want to tell me what it is so that we know what to follow ... that he said.

Mr B A RADEBE: He said that the Minister tabled this statement ... could not wait to go on leave and that leave was not voluntary. It was the issue of health leave.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Okay, I will follow up on that one. I will come back with a ruling. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 136

Mr E MTHETHWA: Order, Chair. You mustn't allow him to speak.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Huh-uh! Hon Mthethwa, take your seat.

Mr E MTHETHWA: It's not fair, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Don't speak without permission, please. I have ruled on this matter. Proceed, hon Manyi.

Mr M MANYI: Chairperson, let's get to the meat of what we are here about today. It is now very undeniable that the ANC does not have a practical and believable plan to address South Africa's economic disaster. It is not a surprise that hon Maswanganyi focussed on the inputs of stakeholders and what they were saying instead of telling us about what the Minister had said, because there was absolutely nothing that was said there.

There is no mention of the unemployment crisis of more than 11 million people, at least in any meaningful way. It is only a fool who will celebrate creating one million jobs when 11 million people are unemployed and more than 28 million

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 137

people depend on social grants. We are talking about people who are willing to work, who are ready to work and who are desperate to work, but there is no work. There is no mention of practical solutions to address the scourge of unemployment which we have. ... absolutely nothing that is ready to deal with the economy. There's no mention of what solutions are put on the table to address the six billion budget deficit and the gross debt, besides irrational and misguided budget cuts. How do you cut more than 60 billion from a struggling economy year on year, and cut 150 billion over the medium term and not think that we are deliberately creating unemployment? You cut the education budget. You cut the health budget, You cut the police budget. You cut the salaries of public servants. You freeze spending on the infrastructure budget. Yet, you still think that there's any rational economic thinking in this mess of an economy.

Our people see the consequences of this when they go to clinics with dilapidated infrastructure and to police stations that are understaffed and overworked men and women that are there with no resources to do their job. There is not even a mention of tangible solutions to address the literacy crisis.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 138

The National Treasury imposed conditions on Eskom that are not even helping. The push towards a low-carbon economy was just a smoke screen. The plan was always to collapse Eskom and privatise generation. What is clear and undeniable is that there is no plan. It is madness to do the same thing over and over and hope for a different result. It is not a surprise that we are now stuck with a revised 0,8 economic growth. We know for a fact that the National Treasury has a very weak projection capability. The obsession there is purely just to cut and cut and cut.

We want to reiterate that the following is what needs to be done. One, we need to end this senseless austerity budget. It has failed and it will continue to fail. That memorandum that was circulated by Mr Ismail Momoniat, a man who should be on retirement, to stop spending on projects and the filling of vacancies, must be withdrawn. We need to do away with National Treasury's conditions on Eskom's debt and allow Eskom to use their money for maintenance and new generation. We need to introduce a conditional grant to metropolitan and major municipalities to explore on and off-grid generation solutions. This is the only way we'll be able to protect poor households and small and medium-sized enterprises, SMEs.

The fact that the National Treasury is refusing to expand the rooftop tax incentive to working-class households is another reminder that the fiscal policy prioritises the rich and the financially secure. We need to re-evaluate the Division of Revenue Bill as a matter of urgency, to allocate the majority of resources to local government if service delivery is the objective. If we are concerned about the lack of capacity and corruption, we can issue conditional grants. We need to strengthen measures to combat money laundering and illicit financial flows as a matter of urgency. We can't have another Phala Phala.

Lastly, as Parliament we need to take seriously the recommendation of the Parliamentary Budget Office and the Financial and Fiscal Commission to make the necessary adjustments to this Fiscal Framework. We have the power and we must use it. We can't continue with this not useful budget. Thank you.

Mr E M BUTHELEZI: Hon House Chair, I stand before you today inspired by this powerful metaphor, which epitomises the spirit of unity, resilience and the extraordinary heights we can achieve if we continue to work together to chart a common course. Minister Godongwana can perhaps relate to this, as he

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 140

used a similar metaphor in his speech a fortnight ago. The Springboks' journey to victory was not just a sporting achievement, it was a testament to a strength that emerges when diverse talent backgrounds and experience converge towards a singular objective. In that moment, our nation was united and witnessed what can be achieved when we stand together as a country.

This House must bear in mind that in direct contrast to the points I've mentioned earlier. The Minister has presented the most depressing budget policy statement this House has ever had. This unfortunate reality is a direct consequence of a party that fails South Africa, which is the ANC. The future of our country, as outlined by the budget is not looking good. With pressing concerns about escalating debt, the rising cost of servicing the same debt and the alarming debt to gross domestic product, GDP, and ratio threatens the very foundation of our fiscus.

The current budget poses a serious threat to effective service delivery by indiscriminately slashing funds across crucial departments. This jeopardises our ability to address the pressing needs of our people. Under the captainship of the ANC, Team South Africa has failed miserably.

This failure is starkly evident in the multitude of challenges that we are facing such as persistent load shedding, the ailing state-owned entities, rising unemployment, the scourge of crime and the distressing prevalence of gender-based violence all happening under the ANC and caused by the ANC. We cannot ignore these red flags for they signal the government's failure in its duty to safeguard ... [Inaudible.] ...

Mr K CEZA: Am I the only one who cannot hear the hon member? What's happening now?

IsiZulu:

ILUNGU ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Hhayi asisamuzwa. Engithi uhluleke ukubeka amaphuzu lana. Hheyi! Asizakuzwa lapho!

ILUNGA ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Uyakhuluma ubeka amaphuzu akhe, yithi esingamuzwa ngapha, hhayi ukuthi uhluleka ukubeka amaphuzu akhe. Hhayi Mapholoba!

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk. M G Boroto): Kwenzakalani?

AN HON MEMBER: We did not hear.

ILUNGA ELIHLONIPHEKILE: Asizwa!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 142

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): I can see that.

AN HON MEMBER: We could not hear.

AN HON MEMBER: The whole virtual platform is disconnected,
Chair.

Mr E M BUTHELEZI: ... It's not our fault. I can start from the
beginning.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order members. I can't
hear. Hon Tseki, can you please tell me, what is it that is
happening? Are you disconnected or what?

Mr N SINGH: Hon Chair, we can hear you but we can't hear the
speaker on the podium.

Mr E M BUTHELEZI: I will have to start afresh then.

AN HON MEMBER: Because the speaker cannot... [Inaudible.] ...

Mr E M BUTHELEZI: It's not my fault!

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 143

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order! Please? proceed and speak on the mic.

Mr E M BUTHELEZI: I was speaking on the mic. I think it is only fair that I am allowed to start from the beginning.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): No, no.

Mr E M BUTHELEZI: Okay, what I was saying therefore is that ... [Interjections.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Order members!

Mr E M BUTHELEZI: ... all this mess that we are in is caused ... [Interjections.] ...

AN HON MEMBER: Chairperson, please intervene, we can't hear anything.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Oh! Altogether?

Mr B A RADEBE: We can hear now, Chair.

Mr D BRYANT: No we can't hear.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 144

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk. M G Boroto): Hhayi, ningadlali ngami nina lapho.

Mr B A RADEBE: We can hear now, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members?

AN HON MEMBER: You being disruptive deliberately. We can hear now, that this thing has been corrected.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Hon members on the virtual platform, I don't get it. Is it that you have been disconnected or what is happening?

Mr D BRYANT: No, we can all hear.

Mr B A RADEBE: We can hear now, and everything seems to be okay.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): All right, thank you very much. Proceed Shenge.

Mr E M BUTHELEZI: ... Thank you, Chair. I was saying all this mess we are in was created by the same ANC on my right. We

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 145

cannot avoid these red flags, because they signal a government that has failed its people. As we stand here, we invite all South Africans to replicate the harmony and teamwork that has been shown by the Springbok. Together, let us remove the obstacle and the enemy that stands between the people from realizing their dreams, hopes and aspirations.

It is an undeniable truth that the current challenges we face here are clearly due to the three decades of the ANC-led government. After 30 years, it is quite clear that the ANC leadership has fallen. To lead our country to greater heights and economic recovery, national reconstruction and labour revitalisation, we call on every South African to realise that there is only one imperative. The time is now to decisively remove the ANC from power. The hon chairperson of the portfolio committee has invited me here and asked me to do the following. I will report to respect what you have asked me to do. The Inkatha Freedom Party is a party that stands for the people, that stands for the interests of the people and that understands the founding values of the ANC. We reject this report.

Dr K L JACOBS: Hon Chair, will the member allow a question maybe?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 146

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms M G Boroto): Unfortunately, he has left the podium. We normally do it when the member is still at the podium.

Dr K L JACOBS: But you were looking that way Chair. But it's fine.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms M G Boroto): I am sorry if I didn't recognise you.

Dr K L JACOBS: I just wanted to ask the member ...

[Interjections.] ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms M G Boroto): No, no. Don't proceed! Hon Thring, your hand is up. Is that a point of order?

Mr W M THRING: No Chair. It was just about the sound issue that we are having. So I'll remove it. Thank you, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON: (Ms M G Boroto): We will now proceed to hon Wessels.

Mr W W WESSELS: House Chairperson, there is a fiscal crisis.

The February budget was over-optimistic and got it completely

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 147

wrong. The budget was based on an overestimation of growth over-optimistic revenue projections, no provision for a cost of living adjustment of the government Wage Bill and the projections with regards to the budget deficit and debt requirements were wrong.

The Medium Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF, proves this. We have warned that the hymns of praise from the ANC benches for the February budget and the fiscal framework have not yet died down. And again today we hear from the hon Maswanganye that growth is satisfactory. How wrong were you then and how wrong are you not again today??

These spending cuts or so-called trade-offs proposed will not save the fiscal position. On the contrary, spending cuts to service delivery departments such as education, health and infrastructure development and maintenance will have a severe impact to the detriment. That was wrong and wasteful expenditure continues. Financial misconduct by public servants cost the fiscus R1,5 billion last year. While the government failed to recover the money and act against those officials. The government or construction State Information Technology Agency SOC Ltd, SITA, incurred more than R79 million in irregular expenditure. A R120 million has been wasted on

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 148

sending medical students to Cuba, at 136% of what it will cost in South Africa. This fiscal framework is nullified by an ANC President and his fat cat comrades who eat Lindt chocolates and drink expensive alcohol on the presidential jet, while South Africans are suffering. An amount of R600 000 is used for catering whilst more than 50% of South Africans are going to be food insecure by the year 2025. And for R24 000 for catering on your president's jet. It's a shame.

Afrikaans:

Die ANC-kaders en -kamarade vreet die mense se geld, terwyl krane in die meeste dorpe droog is, terwyl daar nie genoeg hospitale is nie, terwyl daar nie genoeg skole en ondersysers is nie. U moet uself skaam.

English:

Taxpayers pay almost R3 billion to protect ANC Ministers whilst police officers are understaffed and under-resourced. That's a shame! The Department of Labour and the Unemployment Insurance Fund, UIF, have approved a tender to Thuja Capital of R5 billion while Thuja is not even registered with the Companies and Intellectual Property Commission, CIPC, and does not comply with the tender requirements. The problem is corruption, exploitation and luxuries.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 149

Hon Maswanganye gets it completely wrong, the bloated Wage Bill is not about the number of public servants. We have a shortage of nurses, almost 160 000 short and there is a shortage of teachers. It's about a small number of public servants who are administrators who do not contribute to service delivery and who are paid higher than market-related salaries. Those are the personal assistants to your Ministers carrying their briefcases. You pay them ... [Time Expired.]

Afrikaans:

Die enigste manier hoe ons hierdie land kan herbou is om van u ontslae te raak! Ons moet ontslae raak van almal van julle!

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Hon House Chairperson, the NFP, notes the report of the Standing Committee on Finance on the Revised Fiscal Framework for 2023 Revenue Proposals. Chairperson, the survival of this economy depends on economic growth, and economic growth must come with uninterrupted energy supply and of course, a very efficient transport system as well. I think both, currently are adding to the challenges that we face in the country with the interrupted energy supply that we are having, but more importantly, what is happening at all ports and Transnet, which is resulting in many of these shipping companies now moving to neighbouring ports.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 150

I think in, in addition to that, we need to look at realistically some of the problems. We are, to a very large extent not concentrating on the monopoly and strange enough many of my colleagues have spoken, but will not touch on these obvious reasons, the monopoly that exists in the financial sector. The food sector in South Africa, and that is the entire manufacturing, wholesale, retail sector, automobile section, the mining sector, the agricultural sector, the tourism sector, the health sector, amongst many others. So, this group of a few people that controls the entire economy, controls the prices even in the travel industry, we can see exactly what is happening. There are no measures in place to deal with this monopoly that exists among these conglomerates who control the economy.

That is why you would find, and as I hear my colleagues raise concerns about food prices, but nobody is addressing this with these manufacturers, wholesalers and retailers. Just walk into a supermarket around the 10th, 12th of the month and go look at the same product what the price will go up from after the 15th when, you know people are getting paid, then you know and understand what is happening in the country.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 151

But very importantly, you know we are missing an important point, the lack of delivery of service which many members are raising, particularly is the responsibility that is starting at local government and the corruption at local government, where KwaZulu-Natal is one ideal example, Chairperson. There is very little or nothing that is happening in KwaZulu-Natal and whoever governs wherever they govern, even if you go to the Western Cape for that matter, go and look at the life that the people live in the vulnerable or the poor areas. There is two continents in one province, one for the rich and one for the poor. We are not addressing these things. We are very selective in where our resources are directed.

So, over and above the fact that yes, indeed there is a revenue reduction and that is also contributed by the interrupted energy supply and other challenges. I think we need a more productive society to enhance the manufacturing industry rather than relying on import. I think the opportunities are there, but the stringent labour conditions that we have in the country chairperson, is making it very difficult for businesses to be competitive. That is why more and more smaller businesses are closing.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 152

So, I think we need a holistic approach unless there is going to be economic growth, the situation is going to get worse. We are now going to... [Time expired.]

IsiXhosa:

Nks P N ABRAHAM: Sihlalo weNdlu, singumbutho woluntu sinoxanduva lokudandalazisa ngokubanzi ukuba sakha urhulumento oluneenjongo zokuphuhlisa nokutshintsha impilo yabantu, sikhokelwa zizicwangciso zeANC eziqulunkqwe ngabantu, bethuma iANC ukuba mayikhokele. Sivuyiswa yintatho-nxaxheba ekhulayo minyaka le, kumaqela ezopolitiko esiza ngaphambili ukuza kudakanca iimbono zawo kwezi ngxoxo zohlahlo-lwabiwo mali.

Babonakalise ukuyichasa indlela ebekuqhutywa ngayo ntlandlolo. Okubalulekileyo, ayabonisa ukuba kufuneka kuyiwe njani phambili khonukuze nesebe likwazi ukuzamkela ezinye zezindululo zala maqela opolitiko.

English:

Batho Pele Principles are very important for the governing party.

IsiXhosa:

Isikhokelo sikandlunkulu weANC sithi...

English:

... we need supportive macro-economic support as much as we need macro-economic reform. Fiscal and monetary stimulus must be maintained where possible, and this must be supported by a coherent industrialisation framework. Stimulus will provide the necessary combination of economic drivers to give us the growth that is much needed.

IsiXhosa:

Ukukhula koqoqosho kuzisa utshintsho oluza nemisebenzi kucutheke indlala nokungalingani eluntwini. Kufuneka kuvele amashishini amatsha apho abantu abantsundu, oomama nolutsha beya kuxhamla khona.

English:

No matter how small the improvement is, we must acknowledge that there is significant improvement.

IsiXhosa:

Imisebenzi kwiKota-3 ikhule yafikelela kuma-400,000 kuquka nezolimo.

English:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 154

Members must learn to read so that you know what is happening. You must read, you must learn to read because, Chairperson on fiscal policy, when we talk about reducing debt, just that will not be sufficient for growth, a fiscal strategy with monetary policies that stimulate economic growth, focusing on capital projects remain critical for government funding while addressing quality and pace of project delivery.

A sustainable fiscal framework is not in dispute. It is in the context of the framework in which it has to be applied. Debt should be used for productive purposes to generate high growth, which will reduce the debt to GDP ratio. Not all debt is bad debt. Parties in this House must wake up and smell the coffee. Not all debt is bad debt. All the countries need debt to build their economy, and there is no percentage that has been put internationally for borrowing.

Fundamentally, how we create growth and where that will come from is our own orientation as the ANC. We cannot be led by what the opposition parties this side are proposing because they are in extreme poles, others are saying take it away from government, others, say, take it away from the private sector. The ANC says we need to have a proper understanding of the

political economy of our own country. That is important.

[Interjections.]

We need a productive economy regulated to ensure that wealth is spread for the greater good of society and not for a few like we saw when you were in power. Class, race and gender contradictions have to be addressed and consistent with these pillars, the ANC is working to construct an economy that creates decent, productive employment and thereby fight poverty, inequality and exclusion. It is also ensuring an increased ownership of participation. Do not drown me because I want to tell you that black people deserve to have businesses. Black people, black women, the youth deserve to participate in business. They deserve to do some kind of business, even in the villages and in the townships.

You made way for only a minority. The ANC is making way for everybody. So, industrialisation is very key and labour intensive. We know that about the issue of fiscal consolidation and cost containment measures and we agree all of us that that will have an impact. But as the ANC we are saying, just be careful that you do not impact on service delivery. Let the people get what they deserve. Our public finances must ensure that basic service and economic spending

are not affected. Therefore, we need to protect revenue and grow the revenue base fundamentally.

As part of the measures to do this, a comprehensive evidence-based review of the quality of expenditure needs to be undertaken across all three spheres of government as well as state-owned entities. We need growth and it is in the ongoing implementation of the economic plan, the Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Program that this will be found. Government and private sector spending will boost demand. This positively leading to economic growth with a positive impact on the country's Gross Domestic Product. The ANC supports the report. I thank you, Chair.

Ms W R ALEXANDER: Good afternoon, Chair. Having mentioned the government's deficit in plenary last week, I feel like a broken record. Over the medium term, the government will borrow an average of R553 billion per year due to the escalating annual budget deficit. By 2025-26, the gross debt will reach 77% of our GDP, surpassing R6 trillion. These amounts are thrown around without any real understanding about how much R6 trillion actually is. I'd like to make the following comparison: If we equate R1 to one second, a million rand would be 11 and a half days. A billion rand would be 32

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 157

years. A trillion rand would be 32 150 years and R6 trillion would equate to 192 901 years. Six trillion rand is a significant amount. However, we are not seeing a government that is responsive and focused on the real solutions to stimulate our economy and to get the debt deficit in hand.

Citizens feel the pinch when government squeezes. We need to implement an energy and logistics reformation swiftly in order to get our economy off life support. SOEs like Transnet and Eskom must add value to the economy and stop draining our finances with hefty bailouts. It is expected that the Minister of Finance will propose an expanded tax measure in 2024-25 to raise an additional R15 billion. National Treasury has a propensity for being over optimistic in projections. As such, more than R5 trillion will possibly be needed to be raised. Its these types of actions that ensure that South Africans are going to feel the pinch. The problem with food inflation and the low-income households who need assistance and relief due to the rising cost of living. We are pleased to see that the committee supports the DA's recommendation on zero VAT rated food items.

If governments are not responsive to potential crisis like we are seeing with the latest avian flu outbreak, we are seeing

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 158

the most vulnerable in being affected negatively. The farmers wait patiently for government to plan and fast track the use of vaccines to fight the avian flu and the poultry industry remains crippled. The Deputy President announced that the government will soon announce a support package for farmers that have been affected by the avian flu outbreak to curb financial loss. Sadly, in the aftermath's months of the 2016 outbreak, farmers are still awaiting compensation. Fuel prices and food prices have a direct impact on inflation, and we have all felt the R2,80 increase per litre this year.

We must all ensure that the economic policies are not biased towards a certain group and that the most vulnerable are not left behind. This approach must be prioritised, increase investment in infrastructure and social services, which in turn will create jobs and opportunities and provide better access to education and healthcare. The ultimate goal is to create an economy that is more inclusive and prosperous for everyone, which we are not seeing in the revised fiscal framework. Thank you.

Mr G P MASUALLE: Hon House Chairperson, hon Chief Whip, Ministers and Deputy Ministers, hon members of this august Assembly, thank you for the opportunity to take part in this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 159

important discussion. I must be foregrounded by saying, as the ANC, fully understanding what the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement, MTBPS, was meant for and what it serves to the rest of South African society. We fully accept it and support the report of the committee as was presented by the Chairperson.

Secondly, I would like just to take two minutes to deal with some of the elements. I think if left unattended, they tend to give an impression that where we ought to be going, we might miss that opportunity. With the greatest respect, hon Shenge, you do know that I'm very fond of yourself, but this time around, I must say that you fell very short in that where you correctly identified the effect of what the Springboks have done to the nation and continue to do the to the nation. That spirit of working together, instead of embracing it on one hand, you do say we should do that, and then you spring into another avenue of seeing enemies among ourselves. Exactly the problem that is pointed out that it is something that needs to be worked away. I've listened to a number of speakers here. We are all concerned about economic growth. Each one speaking once you make the case is if his or her anger into the matter is better than everybody else's. I think that is a mistake. We're missing an opportunity.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 160

I also want to say with respect, hon Dr George, these veiled attacks at transformation of the economy that are really couched in terminology about race-based policies, it's absolutely a problem because our country is where it is, and the majority of our people remain outside. Economic inclusion, and then therefore, it should be one of the priorities, and we're not going to really go back on it. We're not going to compromise on that matter. However, you speak about it. Thank you very much. Yes, it should not be used as a cover of a kind here to try and take us backwards. We need to move forward and forward together.

In the context of the demand side and supply side economic constraints which impact, not only our domestic economy but the global economy, it would require multiple interventions to achieve an economic recovery that advances our national objectives. The attainment of fiscal sustainability requires a growing economy supported by a macroeconomic framework underpinned by equitable redistribution, to ensure that all South Africans benefit from the economy.

Given the projections in respect of sluggish growth projected at 1,4% over the medium term, achieving a budget surplus and addressing our challenges of unemployment and inequality will

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 161

require economic growth of about 5,4%, as was envisaged in the National Development Plan. I am sure given the realities that we have, they too are seized with looking at that matter afresh, given the information at our disposal now. Inclusive economic growth is an imperative we should realise. The critical question we should grapple with, all of us, both government, business, civil society, all of us, and indeed some of the people who came before the committee to make presentation, did put across their views and it's important that we bring all those together so that we answer the question, where will this growth come from?

The economy has not experienced sufficient growth for over a decade, and this creates economic stagnation. In responding to supply side constraints, we must take urgent measures and this we agree about, all of us, from the speakers who spoke here. The issue of urgent measures to strengthen freight rail networks. We do of course recognise the progress in relation to commuter rail and appreciate further rolling out of the corridors as announced by the Minister. It goes a long way in terms of bringing money to the pockets of the workers and the poor because of the affordable transportation that is provided at that level.

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 162

Energy availability is another economic constraint. We welcome the measures taken to support Eskom's financial sustainability and, importantly, the heightened focus on improving the performance of our coal fleet. Increasing the energy availability factor and priming a focus on low-cost energy will improve the productivity of our economy. Structural constraints in our economy are having an impact on the growth of the economy, as the monopolistic dominance in different sectors of the economy ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms M G Boroto): Deputy Minister Moloi, please mute. Sorry for that hon Masualle. Proceed.

Mr G P MASUALLE: Thank you hon Chair. The monopolistic dominance in different sectors of the economy constraints competition and entry of new players. The challenges impacting small, micro and medium sized enterprises impact inclusivity of the economy. The economic reforms should also focus on addressing the anti-competitive behaviour and the supporting of SMMEs by the finance institutions and dealing with the barriers of entry as I've indicated.

As I conclude, the expenditure proposals sustained the social wage which protects the vulnerable and the poor, and also

contribute to stimulating household consumption. The review of the social protection expenditure should be geared towards increasing inclusion in the social protection system, including considering options of the implementation of the basic income grant. Hon House Chair, as the ANC, we fully support this and urge the hon members to reconsider. Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Chairperson, hon members of this august House, through this Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, we seek to strengthen economic growth - not only through stabilising public debt in order to provide services and employment, but we also seek to grow the economy and create jobs by supporting the stabilisation of electricity, rail and ports operations. The finalisation of the debt relief package for Eskom has enabled necessary investment in maintenance and transmission for energy.

This package has allowed Eskom to fully fund its maintenance requirements, as well as the first three years of the transmission development plan, ending many years of underinvestment in electricity infrastructure. Conditions attached to the debt relief package will ensure that Eskom does not repeat the same mistakes.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 164

Sepedi:

MODULASETULO WA NGWAKO (Moh M G Boroto) Mohl, ke kgopela motho yoo a nago le wena a tlogele go tšhentsha gantši khamera yeo. A se ke a dira tšeo - a e tlogele, go tšwelele wena fela. A se ke a dulela go e iša pele le morago. Re na le bothata ka mo, re bona diswantšho tše dingwe. Ke a leboga. Le ka tšwela pele, mohl.

MOTLATŠATONA WA TŠA MATLOTLO: Ke kgopela tshwarelo, ga ke tsebe gore e šuthišwa ke eng khamera ye. Ke kgopela tshwarelo.

English:

Regulatory reforms have enabled a massive boom in private investment in generation capacity, which will help to close the energy supply shortfall. A number of confirmed private sector generation projects has increased to 126, representing more than 12 GW of new capacity since the amendment of Schedule 2 of the Electricity Regulation Act to remove licensing threshold for generation facilities. Time frames have reduced significantly for regulatory approvals required by NH projects. For example, environmental permits are now issued in 57 days following the gazetting of renewal energy project as strategic infrastructure projects. The amount of rooftop solar capacity in South Africa has more than doubled

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 165

since the announcement of the energy plan to cover 4 005 MW, helping to reduce load shedding over the winter months.

The National Logistics Crisis Committee is working very hard to improve the operational performance of freight and rail. Government expenditure is aimed at growing the economy through spending on infrastructure. Government expenditure on building and other fixed structures will be above R416 billion the next three years. Of course, this amount is not enough, given the infrastructure deadlock we have as we'll be using institutional arrangements, such as front loading, public-private partnerships, to crowd infrastructure investment.

We fully agree with hon Maswanganyi that public debt is a major challenge. The total government debt rises from R4,8 trillion in 2023-24 to R5,2 in the next financial year. And we agree we should not trivialise public debts because public debt is costly. The debt service costs will be R386 billion next year and over the next three years, the debt service costs are estimated at R1,3 trillion. Servicing or paying interest on the debt consumes a larger share of public resources. Rising debt service cause severe limit development. These costs take a bigger share of the budget than basic education, social protection or health.

In time, reducing debt service costs will enable government to channel more resources into productive investment. Reducing public debt is also important for economic growth, because if government borrows a lot of money, the private sector and household will be without any capital available for their use. This limits the supply of capital necessary for economic growth to create jobs. Therefore, balance approach to fiscal consolidation includes spending reduction, efficiency measures across government and moderate tax measures.

The Minister will announce the tax revenue measures in the main Budget next year in February. Suffice to say that the 2024 Budget would propose R15 billion in revenue increases in 2024-25 to stabilise public finances. As hon Abraham correctly said, debt in itself is not bad as long as you borrow to support the economy and use the debt towards growth enhancing activities. Unfortunately, we've been borrowing to, amongst other things, bail out poorly performing state-owned entities. It is for this reason that any support towards Transnet liability solution must be based on strict conditions, which include operational efficiencies at Transnet, introduction of competition and new funding mechanism.

WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 2023

Page: 167

The South African government needs to get better value for money from its R2 trillion budget. To maximise the value of spending, we as government need to contain cost, exercise prudent financial management and eliminate wasteful treatment of public funds and resources. It is not true that the ANC government does not support the poor. South Africa maintains one of the largest social security programmes amongst developing countries. The budget policy statement protects the social wage, which receives 61,3% of the allocated noninterest expenditure over the medium term. Its significant expansion of social safety net needs to be funded by reprivatisation or new resources that should come from economic growth or both. I appeal to the House to approve this policy statement and all the Bills that the Minister tabled on 1 November 2023. I thank you.

Report agreed to.

Debate Concluded.

The House adjourned at 19:21.