

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES
TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 1

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

The Council met at 14:01.

The Chairperson took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

The Chairperson announced that the hybrid sitting constituted a Sitting of the National Council of Provinces.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The CHAIRPERSON OF THE NCOP: In accordance with Council Rule 229(1), there will be no Notices of Motion or Motions Without Notice.

At this point, I would like to indicate the presence of Ministers and Deputy Ministers, and to welcome the Ministers from the Economics Cluster, specifically, the Minister of Tourism and the Ministers from the Governance Cluster,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 2

especially the Deputy Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and the Minister of Public Service and Administration, permanent delegates, MECs and all special delegates to the House. If the Minister is not here, the Deputy Minister, of course, then becomes in charge in relation to specific areas of work.

Perhaps before I proceed, I should also indicate that the vacancy created by the late hon Apleni's passing has been filled by a new delegate representing the EFF. This delegate comes from the Eastern Cape and her name is - we add hon evert time we talk about a Member of Parliament - hon Noluvuyo Tafeni. [Interjections.] You are welcome!

Further, I would like to remind delegates that in terms of Rule 229 of the Council Rules ... We always try to repeat this in the House, so that the Minister and Deputy Minister take note, apart from just reminding members of the House. It is fairly routine now, but I just want to repeat it so that the point is not lost.

The points that I want to make are the following: That the time for replies by the Ministers to a question is five minutes; that only four supplementary questions are allowed

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 3

per question; that a member who has asked the initial question, will be the first to be afforded an opportunity to ask the first supplementary question; that the time for asking supplementary questions is two minutes; and that the time for a reply to a supplementary question is four minutes. I would say even more important in terms of emphasis that the supplementary question must emanate from the initial question. Members just put questions after question but then you can see that the question has got no relation whatsoever with the initial question that was asked. So, we would really like to emphasise that.

QUESTIONS TO MINISTERS

CLUSTER 4C - ECONOMICS

Question 75:

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Good afternoon, hon Chairperson, hon members and hon Ministers and Deputy Ministers that are here. It's my first time that I'm answering questions here as the Minister of Tourism. Therefore, don't be too hard on me. Hon Chairperson and members, the Tourism Transformation Fund provides a combination of grant funding, debt financing and equity contributions to facilitate capital investment in the tourism sector by prospective black entrepreneurs. The Tourism

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 4

Transformation Fund, TTF, is housed and managed and administered by the National Empowerment Fund. While the TTF only focuses on tourism specific investment, it is linked to all existing debt financing products of the National Empowerment Fund. The grant funding component is kept at 50% of the total funding required, up to a maximum of 5 million first successful applicants. The balance is made-up of equity contributions to the National Empowerment Fund, NEF, development, and since the inception of the TTF in May 2018, up to December 2022, a total of 18 projects were approved for funding under the TTF. The total value of support approved amounts around R290 million, of which almost 64 million is grant funding and the balance is debt and equity contributions by the NEF.

Ten of the 18 approved TTF projects are at various stages of completion and have funds disbursed to them this far. Four of the approved projects are in the process of finalising their legal agreements, while another four of the approved projects have signed their legal agreements and are yet to have funds disbursed to them and to begin with construction, and the Department of Tourism will endeavour to speed this up. The average grant funding approved by the TTF applicants is around R3,5 million per applicant. Therefore, in addition to the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 5

approved projects, there are currently 16 applications that are at various stages of assessment for compliance and eligibility for the NEF funding and the TTF criteria.

I have been informed by the department that it typically takes around six months to finalise the applications that have been received. The 16 applications were mainly received between May and June of 2022, the date of completion of the application depends on various factors, including the completeness, the application outstanding documents, and any ... [Inaudible.] ... due diligence processes. The department has contributed a R120 million in grant funding for the implementation of the TTF and as of March 2023, around R81 million was left in the fund for new and existing applications. Thank you, hon Chair.

Mr K M MMOIEMANG: Thank you, National Chairperson, for affording me an opportunity to make a follow-up on the initial question. Therefore, allow me to express an appreciation from the Minister for the manner in which she has responded in clarifying where the Tourism Transmission Fund is located and the degree to which the implementation is taking place. Now, the question that I want to pose, hon Minister, is in relation to the monitoring and evaluation to the extent that as the department we are able to satisfy ourselves that there is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 6

value for money. What are the processes in place and mechanisms in place to monitor the success and what is the level of success in relation to the investment that the department is making in partnership with National Employment Fund?

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon Chairperson, in terms of the monitoring and evaluation of the disbursements, hon Mmoiemang, the department received a quarterly report from the National Empowerment Fund. The National Empowerment Fund is responsible for the implementation, the administration and the monitoring of the disbursement. Therefore, we do it together with them and we receive quarterly reports. I also have that, and I will attach to the written reply, a list of the 18 applicants that applied that will show the hon members exactly how much was disbursed and where we are in the process. And I will also provide a list of applicants that were declined through the applications by 31 December 2022. Therefore, we do get quarterly reports from the National Empowerment Fund. Thank you, Chairperson.

Mr T J BRAUTESETH: Hon Chairperson, through to hon Minister, welcome back to the House and luckily, I know you can't ... [Inaudible.] ... a new experience being the mayor of the best

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 7

city in South Africa, Cape Town. And I'm sure you will bring a lot of view to your tourism experience from the City of Cape Town today in your work as you have obviously learned from the best example. My question to you today, Minister, is that, can the Minister provide evidence that the France criteria for project selection and financial support, ensure the most effective allocation of resources to achieve the desired outcomes as juxtaposed to compared to other potential approaches or strategies such as public-private partnerships, low interest loans to all qualifying entrepreneurs, regardless of their background or targeted capacity building programmes for new entrance to the tourism sector. Thank you, Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon Chairperson, like I said in my reply that this transformation fund is a combination of funding. Therefore, the R120 million that comes from the Department of Tourism goes towards the grand component of the application. Then there's also another component debt financing from the banks, and then there are also equity contributions from the National Empowerment Fund. So, it's a combination. In terms of the criteria for applications, the fund is well-managed and well-run by the Economic Empowerment Fund, and we work closely with them. I can assure hon members

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 8

that because this fund must assist us to deal with transformation in the sector, that all criteria that we use is fair and it is there to assist to transform the tourism industry. Therefore, we are very open to show also where applicants did not qualify for this, and I will provide the list of applicants that did not qualify up till December 2022. However, I can provide the criteria to the hon member that the National Empowerment Fund is using to make decisions around allocating of the resources. Thank you, hon Chair.

Mr N M HADEBE: Hon Chairperson, through you to hon Minister, I would like to know whether the department has conducted a proper study in terms of the Tourism Transformation Fund to determine where the biggest impact will be in terms of funding, in order to achieve the most value for its funding, and what guidelines have been set out in relation. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon Chairperson, yes, indeed, it's a very good question and I will certainly make sure that we do a study of what the impact of the contribution of the department is, the total contribution from private equity and from the National Empowerment Fund. I'm not certain whether the department has done such an impact study, but I will certainly

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 9

request them to do an impact study and then forward it to the hon members.

Ms B T MATHEVULA: Hon Chair, my apologies for not opening the camera I've got the low network coverage in my area. Minister, what steps has the Minister taken to ensure that the application and assessment process is accessible for black investors living in township and rural areas? What assistant has the Tourism Transformation Fund provided to existing black-owned tourism business? Which one to start out in tourism but do not have the capital to do so that everyone eligible is able to benefit from this fund and not only black economic empowerment, BEE, elite? Thank you, Chair.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon Chairperson, I will, indeed, have to get the details for the hon member. You know, I'm also new in the department and learning as fast as I can, but we must also remember that this is the Tourism Transformation Fund. There's another fund called the Tourism Equity Fund. The Tourism Equity Fund has been stuck in a legal process for almost two years. We have been able to unlock that R1,4 billion will now become available for equity towards transformation and towards the tourism sector. We are busy looking at the concept to be in line with existing legislation

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 10

of the broad-based black economic empowerment, BBBEE, and I'm hopeful that in the next month or so we will announce that and make that fund available for the tourism sector. Thank you very much.

Question 67:

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Thank you, hon Chairperson and hon Boshoff, the Department of Tourism doesn't have any influence over the airline prices as this is a commercial matter. The South African travel industry is going through a variety of challenges and the closure of several domestic routes has added pressure onto the market. Further, the rise in global oil prices has also impacted on prices of airline tickets due to the higher fuel prices. Furthermore, that the department of tourism is not mandated to deal with the fuel shortage but does engage with the industry as and when needed to support the tourism sector.

The issue of fuel shortages is dealt by the relevant institution, the airports company, the Department of Transport Airlines Association of Southern Africa, and it's recommended that if hon Boshoff need more information that the question be directed to the Department of Transport. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 11

Ms H S BOSHOFF: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson, good afternoon, Minister, as you know, the domestic traveller has, since COVID-19, kept the tourism industry alive and ensured that many businesses were able to operate again and retain their staff. Would you not therefore agree with me that the current situation with the Russian Ukraine war has impacted drastically tourism travel, both domestically and internationally? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon Boshoff, I think we have just seen the exact opposite because we are promoting tourism now for people to do domestic tourism and instead of flying, we say why not drive. So, I invite all South Africans to be part of the South African Tourism campaign that's called Sho't Left Travel Week that provide discounted deals to South Africans and offering a discount of up to 50% off during the week starting from the 4th to the 10th of September, now this year. South African tourism is encouraging South Africans to travel our beautiful, vibrant and diverse country.

South African tourism will also promote the Sho't Left Travel Week deals and various marketing platforms to make sure nobody misses out on the chance to meet your product services. So, we are appealing to all South Africans to take up the discount

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 12

offers. But what we found is that many more South Africans with the closure of flights and the cancellation of flights, many South Africans are now exploring our own beautiful country, and that is certainly a very good sign, and it's continued to grow. We must support the local guest houses, and the local tourism institutions. We are now busy looking at all the tourism heritage sites, together with the Minister of Dirco to make sure that our tourists can have a safe experience in South Africa. So, we are very hopeful. We are not yet at the pre COVID-19 levels. We are still 21% below the 2019 levels. But hon Chairperson, we are doing everything to promote domestic tourism in the continent. The continent is growing very fast. America, Europe, all of our source markets are working. Indeed, Africa is doing the best. Last year, out of 5,7 million tourists that we received, just over 4 million came from Africa. The first quarter of this year, again between January and March, we received 1,2 million tourists and most of them came from Zimbabwe, Mozambique, Lesotho. So, the SADC visa in the SADC countries that can be used is certainly being used by the continent and the region, and we've seen tremendous growth in that area. I thank you.

Mr M J MAGWALA: I will take it, Chair. How are you, Minister? Minister, airline ticket prices are so high that they exclude

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 13

the poor from the travels. Has the Minister considered introducing a system of accumulating coupons so as to subsidise and provide discounts for the poor? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Minister, thank you, hon Chairperson, unfortunately, hon member, that is not within the mandate of the Department of Tourism. That is why, as part of our strategy to grow the domestic tourism we are offering together with the industry, these discounted visits where people can drive there and like I said in the previous ... input. I think that this question would be best put to the Department of Transport, which deals directly with the airlines. Thank you, Chair.

Mr M I RAYI: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson and greetings to the Minister, whilst we accepted the campaign, the domestic campaign Sho't Left, but we also encourage the use of airlines, ... [Interjections.] ... but I would like to find out as to whether you have engaged the airline sector or industry on the issue of prices, and regarding the availability of the jet fuel whether you have engaged, the Department of Energy and Mineral resources?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 14

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Thank you, hon Chairperson, we have engaged the airlines both local and international. But the reason is different because we want to get more air access and air lift to our country. So, you've seen Chinese airline has returned. We will see in September the airline Latam from Brazil will also be returning. We are signing an agreement with Saudi Arabia in September that will bring back seven days a week flights from Jeddah to South Africa and we have now been instructed by the economic cluster that we need to do more to get airlines to South Africa. You see in the City of Cape Town, we've got two united airline flights from Newark and also from Washington, and it's growing. But the airlines want us to prove to them that before they start flying to South Africa, that there's a market. Therefore, we are also engaged with business - what we call business to business - to look at bringing more investment to our country, because most of the airlines rely on the income from business class seats. So, it's a joint strategy with business to also increase investment in our country. We've seen, ... I've just recently had a meeting with the airline from Belgium and they complain that we are bringing people to South Africa, but we are leaving empty. So, we have to get the growth from South Africa so that the airlines can move back then.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 15

We will be establishing air access entity. We are looking at the PFMA to see what schedule we can use because currently it's a bit fragmented. You've got an air access team and KZN. You've got one in the Eastern Cape; you've got one in the Western Cape and we're trying to put together a national air access as a strategy.

I will also be convening a meeting with all the Ministers of Tourism through the African Union so that we can also put our heads together to ease the flights which are very difficult to fly around Africa and we want to see how we want to improve air access also within the continent. That's where tourism is and involved with, but I will certainly engage with the Minister of Transport and the Minister of Energy to get more information on the air travel and the cost of air travel. Thank you, hon Chair.

Mr M A P De BRUYN: Thank you, Chairperson. Hon Minister, are there any measures in place to ensure that the regulation of airfare tickets does not take place? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: I didn't get the last part of the question.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 16

Mr M A P De BRUYN: I was asking: Are there any regulations or any measures in place to ensure that the regulation of airfare tickets does not take place? In other words, that the prices are not regulated by government.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: I am aware that the Minister of Transport, early in the next month, she'll be hosting a one-day Summit to engage with the aviation industry, and I'm sure that the regulations to regulate the air industry is with the Minister of Transport. I'm not certain where the regulations are, but I will be attending that conference to also learn more about the aviation industry, and how we can grow our tourism numbers using the aviation industry. Thank you, hon member.

Question 76:

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon Dangor, yes, the department is implementing the tourism sector recovery plan. It's a three-year plan that was approved by Cabinet in March of 2021 as well as the economic reconstruction and recovery plan approved by Cabinet in 2020. Those are the two key plans that we are implementing.

The tourism sector recovery plan also includes interventions to address COVID-19 and the impact of COVID-19 on the tourism sector; it was one of the worst affected sectors by COVID-19. And it's really anchored on three strategic themes, namely: protecting and rejuvenating supply, reigniting demand and strengthening and enabling capability for long-term sustainability; and it's implemented under three pillars.

Under the first pillar, to protect and rejuvenate supply, it's the implementation of norms and standards for safe operations across the tourism value chain to enable safe travel and rebuild travel confidence and support the protection of the court orders and business.

Under pillar two, to reignite the demand, stimulate domestic demands through targeted campaigns and activities and execute a global marketing programme to reignite international demand.

Under pillar three, the strengthening of enabled capacity, investment and resource mobilisation programme to support supply, tourism regional integration and the review of tourism policy to provide enhanced support for the sector and development.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 18

Having outlined all of these actions it's also important to remind the House of the identified key enablers for successful recovery of the sector, which amongst others, the formation of partnership between the industry and government, partnering with the relevant departments to ensure improved travel facilitation like with the Department of Home Affairs on visas - I'm in constant contact with Minister Motsoaledi - and then, of course, population vaccination ... [Inaudible.] ... COVID-19, and also stimulate demand through government consumption expenditure.

We've also identified and agreed with the President that the following are the key priorities for the remainder of the Sixth Administration: tourism infrastructure development and maintenance, implementation of the e-visa system working with Home Affairs, improve service levels with regard to tour operating licenses and unlocking and fast-tracking the implementation of the tourism equity fund, that I referred to earlier on.

So, the intended long-term achievements that can be yielded from the tourism sector, greater diversification of the supply side of the tourism market, increased quantum and focus on infrastructure investments, also protection and creation of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 19

jobs in the sector, a recovered sector characterised by greater inclusion and resilience, greater confidence in South Africa as a safe destination and improve the tourism brand for the country as a whole, and turning domestic tourism into an anchor of the tourism sector and increase international travel.

Those are the four pillars, hon Dangor, that we are implementing as we speak. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

Mr M DANGOR: Minister, thank you for a very comprehensive reply. It is evident that from COVID-19 experience that domestic tourism is an important factor in improving our tourism industry.

But when we are talking about domestic tourism, our definition of domestic tourism should be, in the first instance Southern African Development Community, SADC, the second instance Africa, and not limited to the Western Cape. Thank you very much, Minister.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon Dangor, yes, indeed, like I said earlier on, the continent is the key market, we see the growth in the continent. Out of the 5,7 million tourists last year,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 20

4 million came from the continent. We saw in the first quarter this year, out of the 1,2 million that almost 80% of that came from SADC. So, we must really encourage even South Africans to use this SADC visa system to travel around the continent.

As I was saying, we are working hard to improve the air access because that will allow us, both South Africans and people from the continent, to travel more in the continent; but there are great opportunities. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

Mr N M HADEBE: Hon Minister, the tourism was without doubt the hardest hit sector of our economy during the COVID-19 pandemic. Not only could the industry not trade when others were allowed to, under restrictions, large portions of their customer base was blocked from entering the country.

I would like to know: How the department has worked with municipalities in relieving the debt owed by businesses within the hospitality sector such as assistance with rates, water, electricity and other tax bills? Thank you, hon Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon Hadebe, I do agree with you that tourism was the worst hit. Many businesses have closed down, and especially small, medium and micro enterprises, SMMEs; and

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 21

the way we are assisting them now is going to be through the Tourism Equity Fund. We are also assisting them with an incentive to green their guesthouses and hotels; so, we got a Green Incentive Grant where we repurpose them to use solar panels and to reduce water. So, there is an incentive grant.

We advertised on the 2nd of May ... and open up for applications from the industry.

We are also working with the SA Township and Village Tourism Organization, SATOVITO, and we are doing awareness campaigns with them about tourism.

But the sector has not fully recovered. Yes, we see substantial growth, but it still going to take some time for us to go past our 2019 covid levels; we are not there yet.

But in terms of the municipal debt, no, I don't think that we've made an intervention there. I will certainly check with the department and see whether we are being requested to assist tourism guesthouses and hotels. But it's mostly governed by the by-laws of the cities and the municipalities. But it's definitely something that I will go and look into and see what is happening there.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 22

There was Tourism Relief Fund that was established by government and that fund was established at the time during covid to assist small businesses to survive during that difficult time. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

Mr D R RYDER: Minister, with your demotion you inherited a department that is being plagued by difficulties.

Now, considering the evident economic strain on the tourism sector, that you've referenced as well, due to the COVID-19 pandemic and a potential long-term impact on the industry: Has the department considered any comprehensive analysis on the efficiency of the current support measures in place? These were put in place by your predecessor.

So, has there been an analysis on the efficiency and the efficacy of those support measures for tourism businesses? And if so, what actions will be taken to address any identified gaps or shortcomings in these measures to ensure the sustainable recovery and future growth of the tourism sector, while also promoting inclusivity, job creation and innovation? Thank you, hon Chairperson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 23

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon Chairperson, we are working together with the Tourism Business Council of SA, TBCSA; they represent over 600 businesses in the tourism sector.

We must also remember that there is a tourism levy that's being paid and this money is collected by the Tourism Business Council, it's called a TOMSA levy, and part of that money is also used towards bringing relief for some of the businesses that were so badly affected by covid.

We do analysis and monitoring and evaluation on a regular basis, even where we have engaged the services of an implementing agent, there's constant monitoring and evaluation. And the tourism sector is bouncing back in leaps and bounce.

Government can only create the environment conducive for the private sector and big businesses and small businesses to grow. One example where we are assisting small businesses is the Tourism Grading Council, where we grade establishments in terms of Grade 1 or two or three stars. We have now decided that instead of charging small businesses to do the grading of the establishments, that the Department of Tourism is

contributing 80% of the cost and only 20% that we charge for the smaller establishments.

The partnership between the public and the private sector is fundamental because government cannot do it alone. We can create the conditions, we must make sure from government that we deal with the visa system, we must make sure that we deal with the problem around tour operator licenses, government must make an engagement like member said earlier on, on the aviation side, and that is the role that government is playing in partnership with the private sector to rebuild the tourism sector. I thank you, hon Chairperson.

Setswana:

Rre K MOTSAMAI: Tona, lephata la bojanala ...

English:

... is an important sector in the development of South Africa's socioeconomic development as it provides employment and entrepreneurship opportunities as well as foreign currency earning.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 25

Yet, the sector still faces a number of threats such as xenophobia, which then threatens the arrival of African tourists into the country.

What awareness campaigns have the Minister come up with in order to deal with xenophobia so that we can see more of Africans touring our country? I thank you, Chair.

Setswana:

Ke go utlwela bothoko.

English:

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon member, yes, certainly, xenophobia must be condemned wherever it's taking place. It should not be condoned in anyway because if you look at just the income and the spend and the jobs that are created, just for tourists that are arriving from the continent, it is a big contribution towards the Gross Domestic Product, GDP, of our country.

So, on the xenophobia side, once it turns into violence, as you know that the SA Police Services, SAPS, must intervene and the ... I just feel very sad when I sometimes hear how people fuel xenophobia, and also as political leaders we must also

tone down, and instilling and generating that fear that leads to xenophobia.

We must welcome every tourist in our country from anywhere in the world with open arms. And so, xenophobia, that will lead to our tourists not being safe in the country, we do have a safety strategy together with the police. We have a memorandum of understanding with the police.

From the Department of Tourism, in this financial year, we've put aside R174 million to train 1 800 young people to be tourism monitors.

I've just reviewed the training plan to make sure that the training at least gives them National Qualification Framework, NQF 3 level that they can use again.

We have identified all the hotspots in our country; they are about 59 and the priority is to deploy these newly trained young people to be tourism monitors there.

But xenophobia, unacceptable. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

Question 73:

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 27

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Chairperson, yes, load shedding is impacting on tourism. Therefore, the Department of Tourism introduced the Green Tourism Incentive Programme to privately owned tourism enterprises that meet the eligibility criteria of the programme regardless of who they are. The programme offers them assistance to adopt responsible tourism practices through the installing of solar photovoltaic, PV, for the sustainable management and using of water and electricity.

The nature of support that we offer includes a resource efficiency assessment with the recommendations for the retrofitting and installation of energy and water efficiency solutions. These recommended solutions are also addressing the impact of load shedding as it drives down the demand for electricity. The Green Incentive Programme also offers support to small tourism enterprises in the form of a partial grant funding support which are negatively impacted by continuous and increasing load shedding.

The first stage of the application process involved that ... [Inaudible.] ... I said the source efficiency. The cost of the resource efficiency is fully covered by the Department of Tourism. Then, followed by a second phase when applicant can then apply for funding of 50% to 90% up to R1 000 000 on the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 28

cost of installing the relevant technologies and equipment recommended in the resource efficiency ordered during the first stage. Now, the eighth application window just opened on 02 May and will run until 30 June. The programme aims to encourage and support private sector tourism enterprises to adopt more responsible tourism practices and move towards the sustainable management and usage of water and energy.

The programme is administered by the Industrial Development Corporation, IDC, on behalf of the department and all applications and approvals are also managed by the IDC. The previous seven window applications yielded 130 approved applications to a value of R76,1 million was disbursed to businesses to install energy and water saving measures at their tourism establishments. I thank you, hon Chair.

Xitsonga:

Man B T MATHEVULA: Ndza khensa, Mutshamaxitulu.

English:

Minister, small hospitality establishments are affected by load shedding the most as the most do not have power generating backup devices. Currently, the biggest problem is the expenses which are involved in setting up such over this

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 29

winter period. What forms of support has the Minister provided to small businesses that rely on the staple supply of electricity for their core functions such as the bed and breakfast, B&B, restaurants and hotels that are operating in townships and rural parts of Limpopo province? Thank you very much, Chair.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon Chairperson, I can certainly get the information to hon Mathevula in the province of Limpopo. Nevertheless, what I have seen is that even with the establishments like guest houses with four bedrooms and some restaurants, it is all part of the people that have applied and were successful. I can forward to the hon member the full list of establishments that we have assisted in Limpopo. They are certainly there and they are being helped. Thank you.

Ms C VISSER: Good afternoon, Minister. Minister, thank you for answering my question sooner. However, considering the negative impact of the frequent load shedding on international tourists regarding their safety and security while they are here with the challenges of load shedding and uninterrupted power supply, what are you going to do about the key tourist destinations to see that something like that do not happen in future? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 30

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon member, yes indeed, like I said that on 29 May we met with the private sector, government, all the members of the executive council, MECs, and also some of the city mayors to look at safety and how do we also use technology to assist with safety. There are many people who know about our country but don't want to come because they are concerned about their safety. We have to address that to show them what we are doing to address the issue of safety, especially with the sort of tourist establishments where people go a lot.

That is why there is commitment from the department, the R174 million to train the 1 800 tourist monitors. Over and above on the 01 July together with the private sector we will be launching an Application, App. The tourists can download the moment they arrive in South Africa. That Application has a GCS link so they will know exactly where the tourist is. It is linked to over 200 private security companies and it is also linked to over 100 medical hospitals and institutions. So, at a press of a button, they will be able to get help immediately. That is the partnership between the public sector and the private sector.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 31

The private sector has also offered to give the tourism monitors the Application. Currently, they are in discussions about the price. It is about R49 now but I think by the 01 July they would have announced a decrease of that price. So, we are doing everything. I will be briefing also all the embassies and all the high commissioners in our country very soon to inform them about what we are doing to safeguard our tourists while they are in South Africa. There is a good working relationship between local government, provincial and national government around the issue of safety.

The memorandum of agreement that we have with the SA Police Service, they also trained the tourist monitors on safety tips and all of that. We are very hopeful that we will be able to decrease the number of attacks on tourists. There is a special plan just for the Kruger National Park and I will be visiting them soon to see what we are doing there together with the provinces because that is one of the most visited sites in South Africa. Nevertheless, I can assure the hon member that we are working hard on making sure that our tourists have a good experience so when they go back to their countries they have all positive things to say about our country. Thank you, Chairperson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 32

Mr M A P De BRUYN: Hon Minister, what programmes are in place to ensure that the carbon footprints are not compromised by the use of backup power solutions such as generators, for example, especially with tourists' destinations that is out in nature and if there are such programmes in place, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon Chairperson, if I understand the question correctly, the hon member was asking around what we are doing about the carbon footprint. Yes, all departments in government, led by Minister Creecy, we all have got a role to play in reducing the carbon footprint. So, I will get the details for the member.

On the issue of generators, no, as a department we don't supply generators. We only give an incentive to tourist establishments to green their places. We give them the grant so that they can retrofit and reduce the demand on electricity and also help them to reduce their water usage. So, that is the only programme that we have but it is linked to reducing the carbon footprint. I thank you.

Ms M L MAMAREGANE: Let me thank you, hon Minister for the response. The Green Tourism Incentive Programme is a very

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 33

important programme that can assist small tourism enterprises. Hon Minister, how does the department and the Industrial Development Corporation ensure that the information reaches the small tourism enterprises? I thank you, Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Thank you, hon member. I made sure that the adverts when we open up for this window, I had a meeting with *South African Township and Village Tourism Association, SATOVITO*, representing South African Township and village tourism, and I said, please, use your database to advertise and let us help the smaller enterprises also to apply.

I am definitely monitoring this to make sure that we ... because in the end it is a benefit as it reduces the use of electricity and therefore it reduces also the input cost. Certainly, once we have concluded this ... the member asked me a question again about how many? I will be able to respond once we have seen the applications. Thank you very much.

Question 68:

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: I do have a table here, Chairperson, that I will submit also in a written form. I have been informed by the SA Tourism, the entity, that a total cost of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 34

travel for four board members to London to discuss the Tottenham Hotspur contract that include accommodation and meals are as follows: For the board chairperson, the total came to R149 482 25, for the deputy board chairperson, the amount came to R132 921 42, for the human capital and remuneration committee chairperson, R123 764 72 and then for the marketing committee Chair, R114 799 08. Then there was also visa applications. The total for visa applications came to about R27 000. So, the total amount spent came to R521 327 47.

Then the rest of the question, yes, I have seen the minutes were indicating the approval of the cost and the board chairperson's approval was received from the former Minister in line with the delegation of authority processes and for other board members, the approval was given by the chairperson of the board in line with the delegation of authority powers that he has got. So, that is the breakdown but I will give it in a written response also.

Ms H S BOSHOFF: Minister, once again, would you not agree that these four board members be held personally reliable to repaying these costs? As a short action we see it as a wasteful and fruitless expenditure seeing that your

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 35

predecessor even agreed to sending the chairperson of the board at a cost of R149 000 plus the visa costs. It is taxpayers' money that was used. And I think we really short see some cloud from the department and yourself going out to set and saying to them repay that money. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Hon Boshoff, yes, I have requested the internal audit to do a fully investigation around the expenditure. And then, of course, the Auditor-General will also do her auditing of the books of the South African Tourism, SNT. And once I have received the full report from the internal audit per in SAT that I have requested them to do I will be able to give some answers then whether that can then prove that there was wasteful expenditure or irregular expenditure. Thank you, hon member.

Mr M J MAGWALA: Minister, it is concerning that the Director-General found out about the Tottenham Hotspur deal through the media. Why was it easy for the board to bypass the Director-General? There are other cheap platforms such as zoom not considered not to spend such a lot of money. In what phase is that appointment of the new board siting now at the moment and would the service of those who applied made publicly? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 36

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: It is difficult for me to answer you, hon member because it happened before my time. That's why I have asked the internal audit to do an investigation then. And once that information is available, we will be able to respond to that.

Yes, the board must have dissolved in April. We have advertised four nominations for the new board. The nominations will close on 4 July. And then the process to appoint the new board, we will have to go to shortlisting, to screening, to the interviews, and then I also have to consult the time line to take it to Cabinet for approval. All the board members or nominated board members will have to go through a vetting process where the State Security Agency that will take another month. So, we are looking at getting the new board appointed towards the end of August or early October subject to all of these processes and subject of the approval of Cabinet. Thank you.

Mr N M HADEBE: Hon Minister, I would like to know what prospect in terms of local economy growth was anticipated through this contract? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 37

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Well, from what I could read in the documents that I was able to get the intention was as a marketing strategy to bring more visitors to South Africa that will then assessed and add to economic growth. That seem to be the rationale. But there was a feasibility study done as to what impact this would have. But that feasibility study has been disputed by marketing expects based on the team. And this was also a soul service provider based on the status of this team within the British Soccer League. They were really at the bottom. So, some people are disputing the marketing rationale why they wanted to bring this team.

But I haven't seen the impact of what values South Africa could get from this. But these things are all under investigation now. The Portfolio Committee on Tourism of Parliament was also concerned about where the budget was going to come from and the commitment of committing South Africa to a three-year intact cycle of paying of this R1 billion. All of those things are under investigation. But for now, it's all stopped. Thank you.

Mr M I RAYI: Hon Minister, in terms of the lesson learned, what measures are in place to avoid similar situation happening again in future? Thank you very much, hon Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 38

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Yes, indeed, the first lesson is that we have to comply with legislation. A deal of this size were not allowed to proceed unless it had the written approval of the executive authority. And they could only show a letter that they have written to the executive authority. But we couldn't see what was the response to that. So, that's the first lesson. We must stay within the framework of the law.

The second one is that, in terms of doing marketing for our country as a destination, I find that there is a lot of fragmentation of marketing the same destination. The private sector is doing that thing, the public sector is doing that thing, municipalities are doing their own marketing, metros and provinces.

So, what I am trying to do now is to bring all of us together. At least we need to have a message that we can agree on. Then you also have Brand South Africa, that's also doing marketing. So, there are billions out there for marketing. And I think that by pulling our resources together, public and private sector, we can really up again with marketing. So, that is the one lesson that I have learned because once SA Tourist decided to go with this deal, the private sector protest it by saying no they are not paying their 1% levies to government. So, we

have to consult with each other. That is the lesson. Thank you very much.

Question 77:

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Thank you, hon Chairperson. There is currently a Tourism Safety Strategy that was signed in 2018. That has not as yet been fully implemented, and that is what we are busy with now. According to the strategy, the following national departments have partnered with the Department of Tourism and the private sector to implement the strategy: The South African Police Services, SAPS, the department has a memorandum of understanding with the SAPS and has been working on the implementation of several initiatives and some of the initiatives are joint safety awareness sessions.

The SAPS also assisted the department with the vetting of the tourism and monitors. And also developed a coding system that will be provided to all police stations to use in capturing information related to crimes against tourism. The system will assist in providing a clear profile of the types of crimes against tourism. The SAPS has also developed a safety learning and development that they have offered to the tourism monitors.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 40

The Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Cogta, also drive tourism safety as a priority strategy at the local level and share knowledge and best practice models around tourism safety, collaborating and partnering with the provincial government and other relevant stakeholders on tourism safety initiatives, and co-ordinate tourism safety initiatives at the local government level, the planning, the programmes, the resources, mobilization, etc, establish structures for incident management as an aftercare programme. That is what Cogta is busy with.

The department was also instrumental in facilitating the process to establish provincial National Tourism Safety Forums in some of the provinces that did not have such structures. At the moment, all nine provinces have established National Tourism Safety Forums that Cogta helped to establish the Department of Home Affairs.

The Department of Home Affairs has placed the tourism monitors also at some key strategic ports of entry. And we have partnered with the Border Management Authority and the department will continue to place tourism monitors at some of these points of entry to assist with tourism safety and related information matter.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 41

The Department of International Relations and Co-operation, Dirco, also assists us to share knowledge and best practice model of tourism around the world. It also helps us to get what worked in the international space. So it is a partnership of the four departments that are leading the issue of safety. And like I was saying, we are now dealing with the implementation of the 2018 strategy that I can also at a later stage share with the members. But safety is key for the four government departments. Thank you very much.

Ms M L MOSHODI: Thank you very, hon Chairperson. I want to thank the minister for answering my question. My follow-up question is, what has impeded the full implementation of the tourism security strategy, and when will it be fully implemented?

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: As I was saying, this was agreed on and signed in 2018. Then 2019 and 2020, we were hit by covid, and then in 2021, there were some attempts to bring the forum together. Also some attempts in 2022. But we have now convened the forum for the first time on 29 May 2023. And all departments are committed now to meeting every quarter to make sure that we fully implement the 2018 strategy. I thank you, hon Chairperson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 42

Mr M A P De BRUYN: Thank you, Chairperson. Minister, you have covered my question to some extent in your response, but I will still ask. If Stats SA, SAPS and the Tourism Business Council of South Africa, TBCSA, if they work together to accumulate information on the crime committed against tourists, to compile a list of crime hotspots. And if so, what is done with the information to ensure there is safety and security of our arrest? And if not, why not?

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: I can assure the hon member that both TBCSA, the other one is South African Tourism Service Association, SATSA, and many hotel groups, are all part of this initiative. And they bring valuable input, but they also bring their resources to complement what the public sector is doing.

We have agreed now that all the tourism safety awareness programmes that the department has got, starting in Mpumalanga, I think on 19 June, will be done together with the private sector. So we are bringing the two sectors together. And you are correct that both TBCSA and SATSA have got all the data. And we don't need to go and try and get data ourselves because they've got the whole system.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 43

I will invite members on 02 July, when we launch this app for the security of tourists coming to our country. We are going to go to the operational centre where they bring all of the response teams together. The response teams from private security, and the response teams from SAPs and the medical profession. We even go as far as to assist the tourists when tourists are being attacked, we help the tourists to also contact the local embassies or the high commissioners. The app has also got translation services. It's a very good way of using technology. If members are free, you can join us on 02 July in Johannesburg, at the operational centre where we are going to launch the app. Thank you very much.

Mr M S MOLETSANE: Thank you, Chairperson. Minister, South Africa currently holds their reputation of having the highest crime rate in the world and is therefore regarded as a high-risk destination. What guarantees can the Minister provide that such programmes for tourists would be successful when the Minister of Police, Mr Bheki Cele has failed at guaranteeing the peace, safety, and security of local South Africans?

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Let me say that it is not only in South Africa where we have got a problem with safety, all over the world, you've got hotspots.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 44

There are certain places in certain countries where you just don't go. And that is why we have identified the hotspots so that we can alert tourists of these hotspots. So, South Africa is not alone in that.

We have learned lessons from Malaysia, and Thailand, and how they deal with this. And we could take from there and learn from them. So, it is a worldwide problem. It might be worse in some countries compared to others, but it is something across the world. Will it be successful?

The mandate of the Minister of Police is to ensure that the safety of South Africans, including our visitors, is guaranteed, and it's in that spirit that the SAPS works with us. It's part of their mission to ensure the safety of all South Africans, but also to help us protect tourism. I think we need not only the government but also the SAPS to protect tourists.

We will now also go into communities next to the tourist sites and engage with them and explain to the communities the value that the tourists are bringing to South Africa and what is the benefit for the local communities. Because we are going to recruit the tourism monitors and we are going to recruit them

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 45

from the local communities. So I'm very hopeful... You can't give guarantees at all. But I think with the co-operation of all the departments, Dirco, Cogta, Department of Transport, Department of Home Affairs, Department of Tourism, and Department of Police ... Now that we have started to look at all the plans in the 2018 plan, how are we going to implement it now? I feel very hopeful that we are going to put the safety of our visitors front and centre. Thank you.

Mr F J BADENHORST: Good afternoon, Minister. Welcome. Your last answer is a great introduction to my question. Thank you very much for that elaborate answer. You described the tourism safety plan from 2018 very eloquently, and there are lots of programmes and talk shops in the app. The plan has been in the making since 2018, and you have underscored how important the four inter intergovernmental department programmes that need to work together to get, to get this programme off the ground. But Minister, I would like you to elaborate specifically on the metrics and the thresholds established by your department to evaluate the effectiveness of these intergovernmental programmes and how these benchmarks then align with international best practices. If you take into account, the unique socioeconomic context of South Africa?

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 46

The MINISTER OF TOURISM: Thank you, hon Chairperson. I would like to assure the hon Badenhorst that the working relations at the intergovernmental level are very good. And that we will continue to work together and work very hard for the safety of tourists. In the plan that we are implementing, the government, the private sector and our communities have a role to play. And we just need to be more visible. But we all have a role and a responsibility to look after our tourists as we travel around the country to visit our famous heritage sites. And I can give you a breakdown, hon Badenhorst. Two hundred will be here in the Western Cape if you are from the Western Cape. And I can give you the numbers. Another 350 will be deployed in all our national parks to work with the Sanparks and we will give it a try. But you know, we all have got a responsibility at the end of the day to make sure that we work together. Thank you very much.

QUESTIONS - CLUSTER 3A: GOVERNANCE.

Question 129:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Chairperson, Ministers, Deputy Minister, Chief Whip of the NCOP, hon members, maybe I should start by indicating that the Minister is out of the country,

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 47

so Deputy Minister Burns-Ncamashe and I will share the questions in line with our respective portfolios. Thanks once again to hon Dodovu. Let me start by indicating on the successes with regards to the District Development Model, DDM. But a notable success is that the concept of the District Development Model and its intended objectives as an approach towards enhancing intergovernmental co-ordination and co-operation, is now well understood across government.

Intergovernmental relations structures are in place and functioning in the majority of provinces and the majority of districts across the country. This includes, of course, metropolitan municipalities. Sector departments through the support and guidance of the department, have actively started to set up their own internal DDM structures and arrangements and even heeded the call to identify in seconds, senior officials to be part of the various provincial and districts/metro intergovernmental relations structures. To date, 46 updated intergovernmental One Plans were submitted to the department. It is pleasing to note that implementation of certain catalytic projects identified in One Plans have commenced and are very close to being implemented.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 48

With regard to challenges, I think it's important to note that we have confronted challenges, particularly in instances where some departments or entities across government have not interfaced adequately with the DDM. A response by the department is to ensure that we institutionalise the implementation of the District Development Model through the gazetting of regulations in line with the Intergovernmental Relations Framework Act.

With regards to provinces complying or not complying, no, not all provinces are fully compliant. However, in most provinces the institutionalisation of the DDM approach as demonstrated to be well understood successfully and well internalised. Whilst the majority of provinces are implementing the DDM, the Western Cape provincial government is not at this stage implementing the DDM and they have what they consider an equivalent to the District Development Model, which is what is being implemented in the province. Thank you very much.

Mr T S C DODOVU: Thank you very much hon Deputy Minister for your elaborate plan. I think this is quite important. Given the fact that you want to gazette the regulatory framework for the DDM, when do you think, you are going to do that? What is your road map in that instance? And what is it that you are

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 49

going to do to ensure that all provinces, including the Western Cape that regard itself as an island, when do you think that this will help it and help all other provinces to ensure uniformity in approach?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Thank you very much hon Dodovu. The draft set of regulations have already been completed and are currently at government printers, and these would be published for a period of up to 30 days and the final set of regulations is expected to be gazetted by no later than the end of July this year. It is our intention that all departments and provincial governments will be engaged in the process of finalising these regulations and the processes of implementing the District Development Model. Thank you very much.

Mr C F B SMIT: Thank you, House Chair and hon Deputy Minister. In a recent reply to a question from the National Assembly, the Minister revealed that the national government has so far spent over R100 million from the District Development Model pilot sites. After this copious amount of money, there hasn't been any direct benefit to service delivery at the pilot sites, other than the inconsequential one plans and plans for new management system to monitor the DDM.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 50

Furthermore, the constitutionality of this model is highly questionable and not supported by any legislative framework nor any formal decision by Parliament. With this mounting evidence that the DDM is not bringing any direct benefit to residents, does the Minister agree that the R100 million spent on the presidential decree has been wasteful expenditure, and will the Deputy Minister consider terminating the programme through the Minister before any more taxpayers' monies are wasted?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Chairperson, I think it is a bit extreme to suggest that it is a decree. In fact, it is not a decree, it is a process of government interfacing with each other in line with the Intergovernmental Relations Framework Act to ensure that we improve co-ordination and alignment of programmes of purchase and policies across the three spheres of government, but also interfacing with civil society, business and other stakeholders. So no, it has not been a failure, neither has it been a decree. And yes, it is done in line with the Intergovernmental Relations Framework Act which establishes all systems of intergovernmental co-ordination and alignment. This includes the President's Coordinating Council, ... [Inaudible.] ... and other structures.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 51

What the DDM is, in fact, is a mechanism of ensuring that we decentralise intergovernmental relations and co-ordination so that we don't just engage at the level of national government with provinces or provincial government, with municipalities, but that all three spheres of government co-ordinate and align at the lowest possible level for purposes of co-ordination and intergovernmental relation. So it can't be that in fact it is a decree, neither can it be that in fact it is a useless initiative. Thank you very much.

Mr N M HADEBE: House Chairperson, hon Deputy Minister, considering that and the DDM aims to improve the coherence and impact of government service delivery, has your department considered the implementation of a local government helpdesk to facilitate service delivery shortcomings that involve the collaboration between the three spheres of government? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Thank you House Chair and thank you very much hon Hadebe. I think it's important to restate something that I did raise in the NCOP last week, which is that in fact we are setting up a results management office where in line with the pilot initiatives, we are now bringing

it into the department and creating capacity in the department to provide the necessary support. The DDM has always been intended that it would create district ... [Inaudible.] ... that become the centre and low ... [Inaudible.] ... of co-ordination and alignment. But these would be supported by a central office that we are establishing at Municipal Infrastructure Support Agent, MISA, which would be the central point of co-ordinating all the efforts of the implementation of the District Development Model. Thank you very much.

Setswana:

Moh S B LEHIHI: Tona, o ka dumelana gore diphitlhelelo tseo o buelang mo go tsone ga se tse di bonalang jaaka District Development Model e sa tshwaragane le dikgwetlo tseo di tlhagelelang mo puso selegaeng go tshwana le go tlhoka bokgoni le tlhokego ya di diriswa le bokoa jwa boetapele? Ke a leboga, Modulasetulo.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Thank you very much. I think it is important to state that the District Development Model is not a magic wand. It is a mechanism of co-ordination and collaboration at the level of district and metropolitan municipalities interfacing with provincial and national

government. To suggest, however, that it has not done anything and that services are not being provided, or that on its own would actually be an anomaly, because in reality, as a country, we continue to measure investment in infrastructure, investment in services, and addressing backlogs. But also, investing in infrastructure to enable the economy to thrive and prosper. These investments are continuous in the country. All we are doing is to ensure that there is greater alignment of these investments and optimise the value of the investments done. Thank you very much.

Question 137:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M F P Tau): Hon House Chairperson, the provincial executive councils have the prerogative to invoke section 139 in terms of the Constitution of the Republic and therefore appoints administrators. And it's important to restate that our Constitution is written in line with the principles of subsidiarity that assigns the responsibility in the first instance to intervene with provincial governments.

And therefore, these provincial governments necessarily appoint the administrators and are responsible for remuneration of the administrators, so we have to get detailed

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 54

responses per province, as to the levels of remunerations of the individual administrators.

However as national government we have invoked section 1397, which provides that in instances where provincial government does not intervene or is unable to intervene, national government can intervene. And in line with this we have three municipalities where section 1397 has been implemented. And the costs are for one year contract of national Cabinet representatives which was provided for in the vote of National Treasury.

But just to respond to a specifically on what was provided ... Enock Mgijima a total value for the year was R12,956 170. This is inclusive of value added tax, VAT, and inclusive for the national Cabinet representatives, a governance specialist, a finance specialist, a service delivery specialist, and a team of support staff. A total compliment of this team is 12 people. And the few also includes disbursements of approximately R1,5 million.

In the Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality the total contract value has been R14,208 480 and also inclusive of VAT and is inclusive of fees for the national Cabinet representative, a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 55

governance specialist, the finance specialist, a service delivery specialist and a small support team and the Accident, Notice and Causal Relation, ANCR. I think it's important to emphasise in this instance, was procured through a tender process, that appointed a company that is constituted ANCR.

In Ligwa Local Municipality the cost national Cabinet representative was approximately four and a half million rand inclusive of VAT and the province assisted with deployment of resources to assist national Cabinet representative. Thank you very much.

Mr C F B SMIT: House Chair, Deputy Minister it's quite clear that your department don't really want to answer the question of cost. Because I've got a written question reply just came back PQ238 where everything that I asked was included except for the cost of the interventions.

So, but if we look at the general outcome of the section 139 intervention at Maluti-a-Phofung which is in worst condition today than before the intervention. We cannot come to any other conclusion that this translates to wasteful expenditure. Even the Auditor General, Ms Tsakani Maluleke clearly stated in her recent response in the select committee that the

section 139 interventions are always too late, and the municipalities are just too broken to repair in the three month period and that it extremely costly.

Minister, we know you are going to introduce a clear and specific framework to ensure that section 139 interventions are no longer abused to facilitate fighting, ANC internal factional battles or to overthrow the legitimate and democratically elected opposition governments by Member of Executive, MECs, in various provinces. Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M F P Tau): House Chairperson, hon Smit has propensity to love the word fruitless and wasteful expenditure and I would want to refer him to the regulations that define fruitless and wasteful expenditure, so that you don't just use the words generally, as a means of expressing views.

No, allow me to speak because in reality, truth it is described what fruitless expenditure is. The second thing is that in fact there is a particular provincial government that ensures that it intervenes in the manner that is particularly biased. And I think that it would be important that at some point in the debate to come to the House and demonstrate which

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 57

provincial government is actually biased and subjective in the interventions that it imposes.

In fact, literally keeping municipalities that are not under the DA government, on their toes, literally on every single decision. People will literally have to respond to the MEC every week. That's part of the job description of the municipal manager because those governments are not run by the DA. So, please don't try and throw stones when in fact you are living a glass house. Thank you very much.

Mr E MTHETHWA: Thank you Deputy Minister, my question is, now that we have learned from the House Chairperson about all these things that are happening all over. What plan do you have going forward in addressing these issues that the hon member Brauteseth is asking? Am I audible House Chairperson? My question is simple, is that now that Deputy Minister has been based in this House, do you have any intention to engage the relevant provinces and the Minister of Finance to get to the bottom of these issues that have been raised or do you have any plan about that? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M F P Tau): If I may proceed hon House

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 58

Chairperson, we continue to engage with the provincial government with regards to the implementation of the interventions and the appointment of administrators. So, it is the matter that we continuously engage with. It is our intention that at the next *Ministers and Members of Executive Councils Meeting*, MINMAC, that we should be reviewing amongst others all implementation of interventions and what results we have yielded.

But if I may also take the opportunity to respond a side show from hon Smit. You know hon Morero today Member of Mayoral Committee, MMC for finance in Johannesburg is presenting his budget speech, I can tell you the collapse that has been created in that municipality by the DA. But that I can demonstrate it on another day. Thank you very much.

Ms B T MATHEVULA: Deputy Minister, South African municipalities have for the longest time experienced financial failures with no solution offered. Can the Deputy Minister agree that such amounts spent on administrators each month amounts fruitful and wasteful expenditure. Thank you very much House Chairperson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 59

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M F P Tau): Thanks hon House Chairperson. No, we don't agree. Thank you.

Mr M DANGOR: House Chairperson, thank you very much Deputy Minister. Deputy Minister, looking beyond the cost and costs are important. What are some of the substantive benefits of appointing an administrator in these municipalities. Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M F P Tau): House Chairperson, I think it is important ambassador to indicate that interventions are instituted in line with the challenges that are confronted by municipalities. And in many instances, you'll find that it either financially issues and/or reporting issues that require an intervention. And it is focused on ensuring that those services that necessarily municipalities are unable to undertake successfully are being corrected.

And we have witnessed in many instances the situation where, either expenditure where with regards to capital grants has improved. Particular services improved in certain communities and/ or financial performance improved. This does discount the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 60

reality that in certain instances we have had challenges with municipalities that resist the role of the administrator and makes it difficult to implement but this we intent to resolve through the intergovernmental support monitoring and interventions Bill that is currently going through the Cabinet process and will be presented to Parliament soon in this circle ... [Inaudible.] Thank you very much.

Mr M A P De BRUYN: Deputy Minister with regards to the Mangaung Metro under section 1397 intervention. Deputy Minister despite the R14,2 million that is paid to an independent consultant for the conciliation of financial recovery plan and the administrative cost of the intervention. What are the additional costs for the support staff, as an example the security guards, the accommodation of them, transport and etcetera for the persons that is placed in Mangaung Metro by the *Department of Cooperative Governance and the Department of Traditional Affairs*, CoGTA, and who is responsible for these costs, is it the municipalities or the national government? And the reason I'm asking this is because it is alleged that the already cash trapped Mangaung Metro, they are the ones that are carrying these costs for the security staff of the people placed there by CoGTA and their administrators. Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 61

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M F P Tau): House Chairperson, I have indicated the amounts we currently are paying as the department for national Cabinet representatives and all other officials. If there are additional costs, I do not have the numbers right now. And we would have to get back to the municipalities to confirm those. We will come back with that response because I currently don't have that response, as to the additional security that is being provided would be separate from what you are saying. Thank you.

Question 130:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Through you, Chairperson, thank you to hon Bartlette. Since the announcement by the President in 2019, the Department of Co-orporative Governance developed the SA Smart Cities Framework, in collaboration with the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research, CSIR. The purpose of the framework is to guide municipalities on how to undertake and implement smart city initiatives, and to create a common understanding of the concept, particularly, in the South African context.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 62

Progress to date, the department is co-ordinating the development of a new African Coastal Smart City, commonly known as the Eastern Seaport Development, which was launched by the President in 2021. The Eastern Seaboard Development area is located in parts of KwaZulu-Natal and the Eastern Cape Provinces, but more specifically in the Ugu and Harry Gwala Districts, in KwaZulu-Natal, and O R Tambo and Alfred Nzo Districts in the Eastern Cape. Other spaces that are planning to advance the smart city development agenda include Lanseria and Musina.

The creation of a new smart city within the Greater Lanseria, quote note, emanated from a joint initiative of the Presidency, the Office of the Gauteng Premier, the City of Tshwane and the City of Johannesburg, Mogale City and their respective counterparts in the Province of the North West. One of the important deliverables to date, is the development of the Greater Lanseria Master Plan, GLMP, which is aligned with the Lanseria Regional Spatial Development Policy of 2017.

Similarly, in Musina, there are plans to re-engineer the town to become an industrial trade and economic hub, and the anticipated smart city will integrate the towns of Musina and Machado to become the premium in trade and industrial centre

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 63

of Southern Africa. The geographic location of the smart city which borders Zimbabwe and connecting into the rest of Africa, gives it is a critical comparative advantage.

Lastly, the department is engaging on the possibility of implementing a District Development Model, DDM, smart city approach with the University of Johannesburg, Sentech and Waterberg, such as Umgeni Water and Rand Water in supporting smart villages and cities. Thank you very much.

Ms B M BARTLETT: Through you, Chairperson. Chairperson, you can just excuse me for not switching on my video, Chair. Thank you very much, hon Minister, because your reply because shows that this is not a pipe dream, but forward thinking by our government. Hon Minister, can you please elaborate as to how this smart city approach will impact the quality of life for an economic development of the citizens in those localities? I thank you, hon Minister and thank you, Chairperson.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Firstly, I think it's important to talk around the issue of the Eastern Seaport Development, which focuses on what is primarily rural areas right now and identifying this as growth nodes in the country, in line with

the National Special Development Frame. This gives us the chance and opportunity to fully take advantage of, in fact, the infrastructure that we have available already, but also enhancing the economic value of the municipalities that have been identified.

If you think about it, we are targeting an estimated 17 local municipalities that would be impacted by the Eastern Seaport Development Initiative, and that deals with the Eastern Seaport Initiative. It is also intended that with regards to Musina, and with regards to the smart city, this would create an additional capacity for the country to attract investors. I know that these are cantered amongst others, around possibilities of the Special Economic Zones, SEZ, as catalysts for development.

The provinces have respectively identified these as opportunities from which to grow, but also to improve trade. The Musina development initiative is targeting to enhance South Africa's ability to interface with the Southern Africa region and take full advantage of the African Continental Free Trade Area, AfCFTA, agreement, and the opportunities that it provides. Additionally, I think it is important to state that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 65

we are currently looking at how we implement, because the first set of questions is related to new nodal developments.

The second set is about the implementation of the Smart City Framework that we developed and adopted. In line with this, we are engaging, as I have indicated, with the University of Johannesburg, amongst others, to introduce fourth industrial economies, initiatives and technologies in addressing some of the more fundamental problems that our municipalities are confronting and introducing technologies to improve the performance of this.

It is also important to restate something that is not always stated that, in fact, the University of Johannesburg is considered the leading smart city of the fourth industrial development technology university on the continent. This partnership enables us to drive a program that ensures that these technologies become available to our municipalities and that they function utilising smart technologies. Thank you very much.

Mr N M HADEBE: Through you, hon House Chairperson. Hon Deputy Minister, I would like to know, how much has been spent already on this vision of smart cities? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 66

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Through you, hon House Chairperson, I would not have the numbers before me right now. So, we should be able to provide a written response to hon Hadebe. Thank you.

Ms H S BOSHOFF: Through you, Chair. Honourable Deputy Minister, four years after he stood on a podium in a joint session of Parliament, your President's idea of smart cities has remained but a pipe dream. Nobody can deny that we haven't seen any smart cities. Instead of smart cities, South Africa's municipalities has been marked with poor service delivery and on the verge of collapse, except, of course, the well run DA municipalities.

Minister, you've now today said that you have no idea, you don't have what has been spent on hand, but if something has been sent and you are able to tell us, would you not agree with us that it's a prudent use of taxpayers' money when most of the South Africans don't have clean water to drink? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Firstly, a lesson in democracy is that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 67

the President was elected by the South Africans. He is our President. It's a very important lesson in democracy because, if you don't recognise democracy, then you can't be recognising democracy if, in fact, you disown the results of a democratic outcome. That's the problem. It's the problem of not understanding democracy. However, I'm not surprised that you don't understand democracy.

Now, another point to make that that's important here is that, well, you can't know democracy if, in fact, you can't recognise the democratic outcome of an election. It's a very simple thing.

Setswana:

O kare go a gana.

English:

I don't know how to start a workshop on democracy now. No, we can't do that, we can't start a workshop on democracy. Now, to suggest that it is not prudent to initiate the development of new economic and development nodes, is a fundamental misunderstanding of the spatial geography of South Africa, as created by, in fact, the apartheid South Africa. That spatial geography amongst others, has marginalised the people of these

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 68

municipalities that we have identified, and not optimally, taking advantage of the opportunities that these centres create.

Now, to redesign and recreate a new inclusive economic geography, can't be included. It is fundamental to the needs of this country that we redefine the spatial architecture of this country. I know that many people are comfortable with their current spatial geography, and that is why you don't want new nodes, because you are comfortable with the current special geography. Now coming back to the other question that you raised, we must be asking the people of Hammanskraal, in fact, what the DA has done to them.

We must be asking the people of Johannesburg today, what in fact, the DA has done to them. So, unless, in fact, all that you recognize is the Western Cape, which in fact, you inherited as is. Unless that is all that you recognise, and the damage that you are causing throughout the country does not matter to you, it certainly matters to us. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 69

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms W Ngwenya): Order, members. The fourth follow-up question will be asked by hon Mokause. Over to you, hon Mokause.

Ms N TAFENI: No, Chairperson, it's hon Tafeni. Through you, hon House Chair, greetings to the NCOP members. Minister, South Africa currently has one of the highest inequality rates in the world. In light of this, which measures have been put in place to ensure that smart cities will not further the digital and economic gap currently experienced in this country? Thank you, Minister.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): With regards to the nodes, it is intended that this would create platforms for inclusivity as I was trying to respond to the other hon members who don't understand the concept of inclusion. It is important that these nodes are created with inclusion in mind, and that these technologies become available to all the people of this country.

The second important point to make is that, when you read the Smart City Framework that we developed with the CSIR, it is specifically biased towards ensuring that it becomes an

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 70

empowering tool for both municipalities, but also for communities and the technologies are deployed in such a manner that develops and empowers in particular, historically marginalised communities. Thank you very much.

IsiZulu:

USIHLALO WENDLU (Nk W Ngwenya): Lungu elihloniphekile uTafeni njengoba kuyinkulumo yakho yokuqala bebebhale uMokause bengabhalanga wena. Kepha ngithi mangikulungise lokho sikwamukele. Sibonge futhi ukuthi ulitholile ithuba lokuthi nawe ubuze umbuzo kuNgqongqoshe. Siyabonga ntomb'ebovu. Siyaqhuba Ngqongqoshe.

Question 142:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): We as a department have not been formally informed that local municipalities in the Free State are deducting funds from employees and not paying them over to third parties. In terms of measures for implementation, the department will write to the Minister of Finance to encourage him to utilise the provisions of the Municipal Regulations on Financial Misconduct and Criminal Proceedings to force action on the part of municipalities to implement consequence management where appropriate.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 71

The department will also consider engaging, in fact, will be engaging relevant municipalities and pension fund administrators to determine the authenticity of these allocations and encourage them to initiate similar steps in terms of holding the accounting officers accountable. Section 65(1)(f) of the Municipal Finance Management Act of 2003 provides that the accounting officer must ensure that he or she takes all reasonable steps to ensure that the municipality complies with its tax levy duty, pension fund, medical aid, audit fees and other statutory commitments.

It is therefore clear that the legislative responsibility to ensure statutory commitments are versed with the accounting officer. In the event where accounting officers fail to meet these specific commitments, section 171 of the Municipal Finance Management Act of 2003, MFMA makes such an act a failure in terms of the MFMA and that's a criminal offence. The Pension Fund Administration Act also makes this failure by accounting officers to pay over pension fund contributions a criminal offence, and puts the responsibility to initiate proceedings, in this regard to the relevant pension fund administrator. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 72

Mr M A P De BRUYN: Hon Deputy Minister, you've just stated that the department hasn't been formally informed of these deductions being not being paid over. I find it hard to believe because I know for a fact that, we have been raising this issue with this department and the former Minister since 2019 through written questions, correspondence and so forth. So, I can't believe that the department doesn't get any knowledge about it.

But nevertheless, Deputy Minister regarding the municipalities like Kopanong Local Municipality and Mohokare Local Municipality in the Free State for example, where hundreds of millions are being deducted from employees' pension funds over the years that hasn't been paid over. This has resulted in a situation where employees that are supposed to go on retirement, still staying on the municipal payroll for years and years without working or without going to work because they can't simply retire because the municipalities didn't pay their pension fund contributions.

In the meanwhile, these positions cannot be filled and that leads to lack of or no service delivery in many municipalities. My question Deputy Minister is: Will your department try to resolve these issues? Will you ensure that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 73

the municipality that is guilty of this conduct be reprimanded and how soon can we expect to see this happening?

At this moment, in the Kopanong Local Municipality they are now in the situation where their salaries have been postponed. Now it is two months that they did not receive salaries because the municipality took their salaries to pay the third-party providers. The same with Mohokare Local Municipality, they are now one month behind in salaries because their salary money has been taken to pay the pension funds. This is starting to get an issue and I really do believe this deserves serious attention. Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): In line with my initial response we are committing to follow up on these matters. I certainly would not come to Parliament and deliberately give you wrong or false information. So, as far as I know, we have not been officially informed. If you have evidence that we've been informed, I certainly can follow up on that. Thank you very much.

Ms D C CHRISTIANS: Minister now what you have done is you have simply read to us what the Municipal Finance Management Act of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 74

2003 says, which is basically that it mandates all municipalities through the accounting officers to take reasonable steps to ensure that they, among others comply with their pension and medical aid commitments. However, Minister you eluded the answer. Can you confirm whether corrective action will be taken against these municipalities. If in fact any investigations have been done or started that are currently in arrears over payment of their mandatory pension and medical contributions for staff and councillors.

Secondly Minister, as far as disciplinary action goes against the accounting officers, has any investigation being done? Will disciplinary actions be taken not only reprimanded as my colleague said previously, but seriously dealt with? When will this be done? When will investigations start on the matter seeing that the matter has been brought to your attention now? Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): My reply started with; the department will write to the Minister of Finance. That is a specific action hon member. It is a specific action that we will take to ensure that we say to the Minister of Finance, this matter has been brought to our attention in terms of legislation that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 75

is administered by yourself, we request that you do one, two, three. That's what my reply said.

So, to allege that in fact, I simply just restated the law might have been that maybe I was a bit lower when I said those sorts of things and you might not have heard. But I was saying specifically what action will be taken. Further action will also be taken in terms of engaging the municipalities that are alleged to be in this situation to ensure that corrective action is taken. We should be able to refer because this matter is now with us, we are undertaking to follow up and we will dully report on progress.

Mr M S MOLETSANE: Minister, now that the matter has come to your attention and you're going to write to the Treasury, we hope and believe that not only consequence management is going to take place. You must go further opening the case of fraud against those officials that are implicated in this matter. Thank you Chairperson.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): As indicated, we will take due appropriate corrective action where such is required and would

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 76

require that the municipalities also take due and appropriate action. Thank you very much.

Mr E M MTHETHWA: No, thank you so much hon Minister to answer this question. You have clearly said that there is no information that has come to your office yet. Maybe let me ask this Minister that: In case this information comes to be true, would do you have any intention to engage all the provinces and the Minister of Finance to and get to the bottom of this matter in case it becomes positive? I thank you Chair.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): We are equally concerned about these allegations that have been made about municipalities that are not paying in particular and undertake to have the necessary follow-up in line with the necessary legislative provisions that govern amongst others our colleagues in the Department of Finance, the Ministry of Finance and our provincial counterparts.

I can undertake hon Mthethwa that in fact, we will be able to put this matter before Minmec but also interface directly with the MEC of the Free State to ensure that those municipalities

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 77

that have been identified, the necessary corrective action is taken and the matters is resolved. Thank you very much.

Question 138:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Prince Z Burns-Ncamashe): Hon Chairperson and Hon members, maybe in responding to this question, the following must be registered to give context and perspective. One, traditional councils are responsible and accountable constitutional institutions classified as organs of state in terms of Section 239 of the Constitution of the Republic. Two, the heads of traditional councils are public office-bearers, just like all of us as Members of Parliament.

Thus, we must desist from the colonial, paternalistic and gaslighting demeanour of condescending when we engage with issues related to the institution of traditional leadership, including its incumbents. This orchestrated trend of casting aspersions on the integrity of its establishment is concerning, especially for those who have no clue about its operations and functionality. For the record, matters of traditional leadership fall within the ambit of Schedule 4, meaning concurrent constitutional competence. As the national Department of Traditional Affairs, we provide a framework of

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 78

norms and standards and provinces deal with operational matters. In this regard, the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Act 3 of 2019 provides that the premier in consultation with the relevant provincial Treasury must cause to be opened an account for each established traditional council into which all monies collected, including voluntary contributions and money derived from any property owned or managed by the traditional council, must be paid. It further provides that the Act stipulates that a traditional council must keep proper records, have its financial statements audited by a registered auditor as contemplated in the Auditing Profession Act 26 of 2005, and submit audited statements to the premier within two months from the date of receipt thereof.

Thus, we must, however, indicate, as the Hon member may know, that prior to the enactment of the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Act, there was a legislative lacuna, which impacted both the legal constitution of traditional councils and their effective functioning. That legislative gap has now been closed, and we are working with our provincial counterparts to ensure the proper constitution of the councils as provided for in the Act. Thank you very much, Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 79

Mr C F B SMIT: Hon House Chair, thank you, Deputy Minister, for the defensive answer to the question. As we all know, Deputy Minister, a lot of the monies are received for the sale of stands and whatever is received in cash. So in ensuring that goes into a bank account, I've asked in the select committee and you couldn't give me an answer in terms of whether systems are in place, but let it be.

My question is, are taxes paid on this income by the traditional authorities or leaders, and is this practice legal to sell stands for offers to purchase, OTPs, and collect monies for stands, as we know it happens? If not, what did you do to date to stop the illegal exploitation of communal and tribal communities? Thank you very much, Chair.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Prince Z Burns-Ncamashe): Hon Chairperson, the question by the Hon Smit confirms what I have just made as an assertion that the Hon member does not seem to have a clue of how traditional councils function. Perhaps we may have to give you an orientation. You can come to my traditional council so that you can see how traditional councils function, not a textbook or desktop analysis. Again, if there are instances of crime as you seem to suggest, the department is not the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 80

Department of Police. There is a Department of Police. A crime must be reported and anyone and everyone who commits a crime must face the law, and in this case, if you have evidence, I invite you to bring that to the security institutions so that anyone who has committed a crime must answer, it is as simple as that.

Mr N M HADEBE: Hon House Chairperson, the Hon Deputy Minister went far enough to satisfy the angle which I would've had a follow-up question. Thank you.

Xitsonga:

Man B T MATHEVULA: Ndza khensa, Mutshamaxitulu.

English:

Deputy Minister, which strategies have been put in place which are aimed at harmonising the financial practice of traditional leaders with those of the government in the provision of service delivery and development? Thank you, Chair.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Prince Z Burns-Ncamashe): Hon Chair, as I said, the legislation which is the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Act makes provision in terms of how monies are managed and all

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 81

the next necessary statutory responsibilities that go along with prudent financial management are all encapsulated in the law, including the Public Finance Management Act. So we have a prudent financial system which would ensure that there is full accountability at all levels. Thank you very much.

IsiZulu:

Nk A D MALEKA: Ngiyabonga, Sihlalo, siyabonga, Sekela Ngqongqoshe, futhi sicela ukwamukela ukuthuthukiswa kweziqondiso zokuphathwa kwezimali njengoba usuchazile wasinikeza imihlahlandlela. Awukho umbuzo engingawubuza. Ukucacisile kwaba sobala. Ongezwanga uyobe engathandanga. Siyabonga, Sekela Ngqongqoshe.

USEKELA NGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUBUSA NGOKUBAMBISANA KANYE NEZINDABA ZOMDABU: Ngiyabonga.

Question 131:

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Hon Chairperson, yes, there are two studies on the impact on the core of the Community Work Program, CWP, which were conducted. The first study was done in 2014 in collaboration with the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 82

In summary, the evaluation concluded that, and I quote:

"The CWP is highly relevant as a strategy to reduce extreme poverty by providing an income flow to the poorest and most marginalized. But since it is not universal, it can only do this for the participants that it reaches which at the moment falls short of the identified target of 1 million participants. It is hence well placed as a social protection program within the second economy strategy and in the National Development Plan, NDP, 2011 but cannot be considered universal social protection."

That's the first study that was done by the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation. A second study was done in June 2018 in collaboration with the non-governmental NGO Trade and Industry Policy Strategy, or tips to shorten it.

This review highlighted the useful work done by CWP through a multi sectoral mix of work activities, including care for the sick and elderly, food gardens to feed vulnerable groups, support to schools, community safety initiatives, public art and much more.

In 2020, the department started the process of a comprehensive review of the CWP implementation model. This culminated in 2021 in the adoption of a new CWP implementation policy aimed at addressing core operational shortcomings identified and to define the useful, sustainable and impactful work to be undertaken by CWP participants.

The department will undertake a review of the impact of the program during the period of 2023/24 financial year, which will include a cost benefit analysis. Thank you very much.

Ms S SHAIKH: Thank you Deputy Minister for that elaborate response. We understand that the programme is targeted specifically to uplift the livelihoods of the communities through the identification and development of nodal areas and corridors within the 17 local municipalities.

I'm sure that all of us in this House can agree that it is an important intervention. Deputy Minister, given the high unemployment rate in South Africa, what are the challenges or the reasons that the Community Works Program has not been able to reach its 1 million target? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 84

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Hon Chairperson, the critical challenge of course is a budget related challenge because the limitation has been that impact. We haven't seen an increase in the budget allocation towards the CWP. However, having identified operational inefficiencies, we're able to extract additional money from the current budget where an additional number of participants have been included in the programme, but we've also been able to increase the actual allowance that participants receive.

So ideally, we would continue to request Treasury for additional funding so that we can get more participants. Also, because in line with the revised implementation model there will be greater focus on skills development and creating capacity for participants to exit the programme because the CWP is not designed as a programme where participants come in and exit whilst they are still indigent.

Those participants that are inside remain part of the programme and if we can give them the necessary capability to exit the programme and find other opportunities that would increase the benefit and value of the programme. Thank you, hon Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 85

Mr M A P De BRUYN: Deputy Minister, the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs describes the Community Works Program as an offering from government to provide the job safety net for unemployed people of working age, and it also says that it's providing a breaching opportunity for unemployed youth and others who are actively looking for employment opportunities.

Deputy Minister, in light of the fact that some of these beneficiaries are stating that they have been working under this program since 2009 already, how many of these employees have been absorbed in permanent positions in government structures and what processes are in place to ensure that these employees are taken into consideration for permanent employment and how structures in place to ensure that these employees are considered for permanent employment and not just to stay in this and I can say, shamefully low pay positions for years and years on end, for example since 2009? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): As indicated earlier, we are currently going through a process of a new implementation model for the CWP with the intention that would increase skills and capacity of participants to be able to take advantage of other

opportunities and to be eligible for other job opportunities that are available in the market.

But we have committed to ensure that participants currently in place do not lose their membership to the programme if you wish, and it is the intention that those would be able to exit the programme into job opportunities, entrepreneurial opportunities and other opportunities going forward as we implement the new revised CWP model.

Is it a means through which would simply just say you were a CWP participant, you are eligible for the next general worker's job that's available? I think that it would be a bit of an extreme decision to take on behalf of the municipality not to undertake a transparently way of recruitment, but participants are indeed eligible to apply for jobs in the public sector. Thank you very.

Ms B T MATHEVULA: Minister, as I speak now, there are community programmes that are taking place in Ward 24 and Ward 25 in Dzumeri Greater Giyani Municipality, in Mopani, Limpopo. Those workers didn't get paid last month and don't have uniform to work with, they don't even have gloves pick up a

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 87

rubbish on the streets, they only use plastics to pick up the rubbish on the street.

Minister, I would like to know from you, what measures have you put in place to monitor such programmes to ensure that workers are not exploited and given necessary tools to work and get paid on time? Thank you very much Chair.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Firstly, I think that we should restate the fact that the contract with the implementing agents came to an end on the 31st of March this year. Only one implementing agent still has an eligible contract, or rather an active contract, and that's the National Youth Development Agency, NYDA, but all other implementing agents have ceased to be implementing agents in terms of the programme.

As is a department we have had to take over the responsibility for all services that were provided by implementing agents and this includes procurement of personal protective equipment, necessary tools of work and so on, and that process is currently underway.

Information that we have at our disposal is that all participants have been remunerated in the first two months of this year. A gap has been identified with supervisors who necessarily have to claim on the basis of a job scheduling or a worksheet have not been able to claim in line with the with the programme and have not been remunerated.

It is a matter that's receiving our attention and we are in the process of resolving it, because the remuneration of supervisors is done separately and differently from the remuneration of the participants themselves. But it is a matter that's receiving our attention.

Ms C LABSCHAGNE: House Chair, currently, the biggest public employment programmes in South Africa are the Community Works Programme under the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and the Expanded Public Works Program, EPWP, under the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure.

Both programs have a cumulative budget allocation of R3 billion for the 2022/23 financial year. Considering the substantial administrative costs that are involved in managing public employment programmes, one, will the Minister consider

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 89

getting into an interdepartmental partnership with your counterpart, the Public Works to consolidate budgets for this CWP and the EPWP to minimize resource wastage and ensure more money is sent to participants rather than to pay for administrative overheads and if not, what are the Minister's reasons for objection to it? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS (Mr M P F Tau): Hon Chair, there's no objection. It is a specific proposal that you're making, and we will note it as we go into the process of the revised implementation model. It will certainly be one of the options that are put on the table. Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Ms W Ngwenya): Hon members and special delegates, we have come to an end of our question to the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs. I would like to thank the Deputy Ministers for availing themselves to answer the questions. I would also like to invite my co-chair, House Chairperson Nyambi to take over the next question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Let me also welcome the Minister and thank the Deputy Ministers. They may leave if

they wish but if they also want to support the Minister, they are more than welcome to support the Minister. I will now call upon Minister of Public Service and Administration to respond to Question 125 asked by hon Mmoiemang

Question 125:

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon House Chairperson, let me also greet and acknowledge the Deputy Ministers in the House, hon members, on the first question from hon Mmoiemang on the key elements of the Professionalisation Framework, one needs to start from the point of view that the Professionalisation Framework for the public sector is anchored on five pillars, which deal with the processes of recruitment, selection, training, development, performance management and reviews, as well as consequence management.

So, it is a carrot and stick approach, to ensure that we have a professional public service and the pre-entry talks to ensuring that we introduce pre-entry examinations for all levels in the public service and promote meritocracy in recruitment and selection.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 91

The second pillar talks to the induction and onboarding. You may now be aware that there are programmes that are a must for one to join the public service. That also includes the induction programme before you can assume duty, within the first 90 days of appointment. We also have reorientation programmes, which target all public sector employees. We also have programmes for formal coaching and mentorship and these are all aimed at induction and onboarding.

The third pillar is that of performance planning and management that talks to ensuring that the work of HODs and DDGs is linked to the mandate of the institution and we introduce independent triggers for exist of nonperformance. Therefore, we seek to improve competency of politicians to manage performance, as well as addressing the systemic challenges that result in instability, and we clarify the role of the PSC in performance evaluation of all HODs.

Pillar four talks to continuing learning and professional development, which is targeting and focussing more on skills audit, the methodology framework, which has already been written and is being rolled out, as we speak. This is the area of ... Skills audit is one of my primary areas of the agreement with the President.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 92

The last pillar is that of progression and career incidence that talks to managing the political administration dichotomy, the space of interface between the political heads and it seeks to ensure accountability and entrenches that important area of accountability.

Because the question is quite rich, I will be providing the full answer, but focusing on the second part of the question on co-ordination, we are working in a collaborative way with a number of departments as well as the National School of Government, NSG, the Public Service Commission, PSC, the United Nations Development Programme, UNDP, as well Salga, the District Emergency Co-ordination and Response Centre DECOC, the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, DPME, in rolling out this very important programme, because this is work that cuts across departments. Thank you.

Mr K M MMOIEMANG: Hon House Chair, Mr Nyambi, Minister Kiviet, allow me to express my appreciation in terms of putting emphasis on the importance of having credible and qualified public service and also for the emphasis on the capacity of the public service, in relation to the requisite skills, expertise, credible and patriotic people serving in the public service, which at the centre, thereof is the

Professionalisation framework. The question that I want to ask as a follow-up is the role that labour can play as one of the critical stakeholders in the public sector and the public service. The context is important, because as the select committee responsible for Public Service and Administration, it is important to have continuous efficacy in terms of labour relations, more so the platform, such as workplace labour forums, which are critical in establishing and also promoting the interests of employees in the workplace to ensure that there is consultation with employees around the Professionalisation Framework and other related matters. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon Chair, hon Mmoiemang, indeed, labour buy in is necessary, if the professionalisation programme is to succeed. It is against that background that a number bodies have been consulted on the Professionalisation Framework, which is organised labour, the local government bodies, academia, as well as organs of state supporting democracy, such as the Auditor-General.

There is generally a buy in, because every citizen wants to receive a professional service and thus far, we have not really suffered any resistance or nonsupport. All parties are

coming to the fore, precisely because of the importance of the programme in itself.

It is also important in that it offers a meaning to the constitutional precepts - the fact that we need to make every citizen to be the best they can be. And therefore, starting with the public servants themselves, who are in the public service and those who are receiving services from these officials, would want to ensure that the quality of service in itself is [Inaudible.] Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order. Can we make sure that all those on the virtual platform remain muted, please?

Mr W A S AUCAMP: Hon House Chair, Minister, given that your department has presided over extremely poor performance, planning and management, which has opened the door to unpunished corruption, coupled with the prioritisation of political over professional criteria in the recruitment of public servants, how will you overcome the challenges of resistance from partisan blocks, unions and civil servants to change and professionalise in a digital world changed by the Fourth Industrial Revolution? Thank you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 95

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon Chairperson, I think, as representatives of the public and as hon members, we also, in our own responsibilities, must not continue spreading that which is not true. The hon members know that it is not true that corruption goes unpunished. We would not be, in another question, talking about suspensions and discipline, when there is unpunished wrongdoing.

Therefore, let us start with it that the systems are there for punishing wrongdoing in each and every form it presents itself, whether it is through poor performance, through corruption, through any measure, our systems respond to those challenges that take place in the workplace.

In the Professionalisation Framework, we talk about change management, which is a programme we are driving with the whole host of partners – the NSG and the Public Service Commission because we understand the importance of driving a programme of this nature and ensuring that the framework in itself, its tenants, are realised.

We also need to ensure that, as we roll out, we are duty-bound to ensure that we have cheques and balances in place.

Therefore, yes, we will have systems in place that will deal

with any resistance, if we need it. However, as I have already indicated, when I dealing with first question, I have so far, not met any resisting party, because it is in the interest of the South African nation, to provide quality service and for the public to receive quality service.

So, there is no resistance so far, but the Professionalisation Framework in itself entrenches accountability, which is the last pillar that I have referred to when I was explaining the five pillars. Thank you.

Mr N M HADEBE: Hon House Chair, hon Minister, I would like to know whether operationally, the department has implemented e-learning modules to assist with the implementation of the framework across all provinces and local government.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: House Chair, hon Hadebe, let me indicate that e-learning is part of our lives these days. In the other questions that are to follow, we will indicate and you will find prove that we have quite a number of people who are registering for various programmes on e-learning, now, even more than for the physical one.

The National School of Government is hard at work. Currently, they are managing more than 60 000 people who are registering in various programmes on the e-learning platform. It is the way to go. Our universities are also now in that space and therefore, yes, e-learning is the way to go. And we also are trying to lead the charge, as the National School of Government, to ensure that public servants that are employed in the government are able to study, whilst at work. Thank you.

IsiXhosa:

Nks N TAFENI: Ndiyabulela Sihlalo weNdlu.

English:

Hon Minister, the deployment of cadres by the ruling party has led to a public service that is currently characterised by fully trained public servants, who are corrupt and waste billions of rands each year, enriching themselves and are not held accountable for their actions. Which initiatives has the Minister taken to end cadre deployment, so that we may finally see a ... [Inaudible.] ... by capable men and women who are professional, skilled and honest? Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Cele, please.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 98

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon House Chair, let me first start by indicating to the hon member that in government, there is no policy called cadre deployment. The Professionalisation Framework that we are discussing here does not even have anything that refers to cadre deployment.

In as much as I must educate the public when I am here, cadre deployment, yes, is a policy of the ruling party, outside of the public service, as an organisation. Any ruling party across nations will have its policies, which its government expects to roll out. And therefore, there is no sin or crime for cadre deployment, as part of the ruling party's policy.

All parties across the world do that, when they go into government, but in government, the policy for recruitment has nothing to do with whether you are a member of the ruling party or not. The criteria are set there. We follow the public procedures in line with the policy of recruitment and selection that has been adopted by government, in line with the prescripts of transparency, openness and ensuring that each and every South African that meets the criteria is given the opportunity to participate and to apply.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 99

Therefore, I would want us to differentiate between these two concepts and understand that, when we talk about professionalisation, there are prescripts that talk to meeting the requirements, both qualifications, the number of years in the service, the capacity of the individual. The test to be attracted into the public service is based on those prescripts that are in law.

Ms M O MOKAUSE: Chairperson, on a point of order: You are out of order. There were hooligans from the ANC benches who are howling hon Tafeni, and you never even called them to order. I do not know what type of a chairperson you are, who just preside over a House and hooligans attack a member in the House and you cannot even talk. What kind of a chairperson are you?

Ms Z L I CELE (KwaZulu-Natal): You are a hooligan yourself.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Mokause, we had some disturbances for the virtual platform. The first one was a staff member. It was attended to. The second one was the one of hon Cele and it was attended to. So, you are totally out of order. Refrain from doing what you are doing.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 100

Ms Z L I CELE (KwaZulu-Natal): She must apologise.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): And you must apologise for just casting aspersions for no reason.

Question 140:

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon House Chair, let me appreciate the question which talks to the disciplinary code and the number of precautionary suspensions. The question itself requires more data in terms of the numbers, which are available, but I would want to foreground it by indicating that currently the Department of Public Service and Administration has undertaken some initiatives to ensure that we deal with the challenge of long suspensions.

We are currently reviewing the disciplinary code to streamline processes and remove the red tape. We are also training initiators and chairpersons to increase the pool of available skills for these categories. We are also having bilateral meetings between the DG and the affected HODs where departments have experienced this issue of long suspensions.

We are capacitating departments through direct technical support to improve the ability of internal labour relations

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 101

officials to manage disciplinary processes. We are also engaging departments to update information on Personal and Salary System, PERSAL, of public servants undergoing disciplinary processes to improve accountability, and we are supporting appeal bodies such as the Public Service Commission, PSC, the Public Protector and the Public Service Co-ordinating Bargaining Council, PSCBC.

We are trying to streamline these processes because they have now become areas of abuse where people when running away from a discipline, they would exploit moving from one forum to the other. We are also leading the presidential priority of developing a public service-wide single database of public servants undergoing disciplinary processes, because we have also realised that because we don't have this single point of entry, when people see that they are at the tail end of the disciplinary processes, they jump to another department where they would not be known that they were undergoing disciplinary processes. Therefore, now we will have that single entry point for disciplinary processes. I have provided, in the written reply which I will avail to the hon member, the statistics that talk to this.

I do want to say that some interventions that have been held have yielded some results, but that is also another question that is to follow. The statistics in itself will show that the numbers are reducing in terms of disciplinary processes. As to the cost, I need to indicate to the hon member that as the Department of Public Service and Administration, we have access on the part of PERSAL as it affects the human resource management, but as it affects finances, that part would be handled by Treasury and therefore the data on the costs you will find from Treasury.

The data that I have given in the response points to those individuals that have been disciplined according to their positions, but as to what the effect in the sector is, Treasury may be better placed or the affected departments may be better placed to respond to that part of the question. Thank you, hon House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you, hon Minister. Indeed, I can confirm that you can provide that detailed information and that is in line with the Rules of the National Council of Provinces. The first follow up is from hon Brauteseth.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 103

Mr T J BRAUTESETH: Hon House Chair, soon to be chairperson of the House, to the Minister, I really appreciate that you want to keep this information intimate between you and I, and just right, but let's share with the House what the actual data is because I do have some of it.

So, Minister, there are currently 607 precautionary suspensions in South Africa's public service. Let me repeat, 607, and that is costing the fiscus R265 million per annum. That is why I asked you what it was per month and per week. I was hoping that you could break it down. Anyways it's R265 million per annum. This means that taxpayers are paying for a service that is not being provided. In a country with limited resources, this is frustrating and wasteful.

There is a case where an official was on suspension for an alarming 883 days, Minister – 883 days. It would also appear that the fault for delaying processes often lies with the departmental employer who is not fully capacitated to deal with disciplinary processes, and they are often forced to use external service providers to deal with disciplinary matters. I am sure you are aware of that.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 104

So, Minister, I want to try and give you a solution and maybe you can comment or respond to my question. Will the Minister commit, here and now, to holding senior managers financially and administratively responsible for the backlog of disciplinary cases in their departments, and to include this responsibility as a key performance area for senior managers in their contracts in order to force them to do their jobs properly? Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon House Chair, let me first indicate that senior government officials and managers do have performance agreements and those performance agreements are with the respective Ministers in the various departments. Therefore, I can't stand here and commit to that which I have no control over, which is other departments. I can only talk to the Department of Public Service and Administration with respect to the performance agreements.

Let me also indicate that is not only because senior managers are unable, but also our systems that are abused by those who commit wrongdoing that contribute to the long period of suspensions. When one realises that the time for this particular process is getting close to having them nailed,

they raise other issues and take another direction which holds the initial step. This is what we are saying now with this register of disciplinary processes.

We have conducted a study to find the loopholes in the system. We are taking legal advice in terms of how to close those gaps because some of the gaps are in legislation and some are in regulations. Therefore, there is no one individual that can be held accountable to say because of this long suspension of this official we hold you as accounting officer accountable. It would be unfair labour practice and one wouldn't want to find themselves having to answer on that, hon House Chair. Thank you.

IsiZulu:

Nks S A LUTHULI: Ngibonge sihlalo, Ngqongqoshe ngiyazi ukuthi wawungeke ubekwe kuloMnyango uma ngabe ubungenazo izibalo. Ngiyakuzwa futhi uyachaza ukuthi kuzothatha isikhathi ukubheka umniningwane ukuze ukwazi ukusinikeza. Mina ngiyazi ukuthi uNgqongqoshe angasinikeza ithemba siyi Ndlu ukuthi bangaki abasebenzi kahle kahle abamisiwe emsebenzini abasathola imihlomulo yabo? Ngibuza lo mbuzo ngoba kungukumosa kwemali yabakhokhi bentela ukuthi kube khona umuntu okhokhelwayo

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 106

ehlezi ekhaya futhi kube khona umuntu okhokhelwayo obambe isikhudla salowo muntu. Nokuthi ...

English:

... how many cases have been concluded within the prescribed three-month period? I thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon House Chair, I wouldn't know where the figures that were shared in the House come from, but the statistics that I have and sharing with the hon members indicate that the cases in 2018-19 were two, in 2019-20 they were 12, in 2020-21 they were 13, in 2021-22 they were eight and in 2022-23 they were 16.

For me, in a public service of more than a million public servants and almost 10,000 senior managers, those numbers are not that huge. Therefore, in as much as I did not want to engage on the statistics that the hon Brauteseth was sharing with the House, the numbers that I have been given officially talks to these numbers that I have given you. The data I am saying would take quite some time to go through is the part that deals with the number of days and all that. For me those numbers are insignificant if you look at the whole of the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 107

public service, which is more than a million people, and you have these numbers for those who have been disciplined.

Let us recall that these suspensions talk to a person who would have been found to have erred in the process of conducting his or her work, and where investigations must go through and then the person is suspended. At times the gravity of the charges does not allow the person to be brought back to the workplace. Therefore, we shouldn't treat this issue of suspension as if everybody is at home suspended, it's those people who have erred and must face the music.

I have given you the numbers that I have been given by the department and I don't find those astronomical in any order because there will always be those people who err in anyway. Thank you, House Chair.

Mr M DANGOR: House Chair, to the Minister, thank you for the figures. Is there something that can be done within the law to discourage and prevent delaying tactics that result in long suspension periods? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon House Chair, thank you to hon Dangor. Yes, this is why I'm saying

with the work of professionalisation there is this part that deals with accountability and in that there is the review of the code and the work that is being done in recording the disciplinary cases so that we have one single entry and not depend on all departments, but know who is being disciplined and for what at any given time.

The reviews that are currently taking place, whether you talk to the Public Service Management Act which is before Parliament in the National Assembly, the Public Service Amendment Act which is also before Parliament and the Public Service Commission Bill which is now being consulted upon, all those seek to deal with the professionalisation of the public service looking into specific areas where the law is weak and giving certain powers for example, to HODs and to executives where it is necessary to be able to deal with some of these weaknesses.

We need to understand that the decision to suspend somebody lies with the accounting officer as well as the executive authority – those two working together depending on the level of seniority of the person to be suspended. The disciplinary processes, in the sense, we agree that they are being abused and we need to narrow them and ensure that we take the

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 109

shortest time to get rid of those who would have erred in the process of their work. Thank you, hon House Chair.

Mr M A P De BRUYN: House Chair, to the hon Minister, what steps are being taken to ensure that people who are appointed into acting positions are qualified to do the work and do not have a legitimate expectancy to be appointed to full time post as permanent appointments since the suspensions are not limited to a three month period or any specified space of time and extensions of acting positions have to be extended over and over again?

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon House Chair, thank you to the hon De Bruyn. Let me once more clarify that not everybody who is in an acting position is because somebody has been suspended. Sometimes one acts because the incumbent would be ill and so on. There are various reasons as to why there would be a person who's acting in a particular post at a particular time. As I indicated, the decision rests with the HOD which is the Director General in national departments and HOD in provinces as well as the executive authority of that department.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 110

Our regulations are clear in terms of how long does one act, and it is each department's responsibility to ensure that it keeps to the minimum standards as they are determined and for us as a department is to monitor. We receive reports from various departments and it is against those reports that we always encourage departments to not allow one person to act over a protracted period because that in itself creates this expectation. However, it is truly up to the department because at times if you were to change the position in which one is acting on a three-month basis for example, you place another risk on the job itself. You can imagine if you were to do that with a person working in a financial position and you change frequently, that would be quite risky, and it will be difficult to track if something goes wrong. That is why you can't really regulate to strict terms to say a person can only act for this period because the job sensitivities also determine how one should manage that space. I think I have dealt with that question, hon House Chair. Thank you.

Question 126:

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon Moshodi, yes. Hon House Chairperson, the reasons for the delay, in finalising the high number of cases of employees that are on suspension, varies for the breaches of the Public

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 111

Service Code and various other prescripts. The reasons vary from the appointments of chairpersons of deceased. That in itself becomes a mammoth task because we have fewer people who are able to manage and chair a disciplinary committee, DC. As you would know, the regulations require somebody who would not necessarily be from that department. Many at times, you would find that when it is time for the DC to take place, either the chairperson is not available that time and the next time a date is set the person that is the accused will be ill.

All these matters have an impact on the delay. However, we also realised that the processes to appoint the chairperson are also tedious. That talks to us reviewing them. But also the capacity, and now lately, the risks associated with chairing a DC - just this week or last - I heard from the news one chairperson, who went out for a smoke break during a hearing was assassinated outside the venue in KwaZulu-Natal.

So, that is going to be another risk that is going to deter people from wanting or agreeing to chair disciplinary cases, which is why we are reviewing the whole process. We need stringent measures that can ensure that the process itself is short and dealt with by removing other gaps that people exploit in the processes so that the DC itself succeed. People

are held accountable, it succeeds and finished on time or timeously.

We have taken quite a lot of other measures. We have a unit in a department the Public Administration Ethics Integrity and Disciplinary Technical Assistance Unit, PAEDITAU. It provides technical assistance to various departments, to ensure that they look at the charges and what could contribute to a delay in a particular case. So, they are visiting departments and various provinces assisting and giving hands on support to deal with the cases especially the backlog. Ensuring that the chairpersons are trained so that we eliminate and minimise the delay incidents.

Hon House Chairperson, I think I am done on this one. Thank you.

Ms M L MOSHODI: Hon House Chairperson, let me also thank the hon Minister for the response. Hon Minister, my follow-up question is: I would like to know whether the hon Minister and the department are receiving support and co-operation from different stakeholders, including labour on this initiative to professionalise the public service? Thank you, hon House Chairperson.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 113

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon House Chairperson, even though I could not get the question in its entirety, but my understanding is that it seeks to check the support for especially the professionalisation. I think I have tried to answer that in my earlier response. That we are working with multiple stakeholders as the department, but also we have stepped up our engagement with the director-generals, DGs, through ... [Inaudible.] We provide them with reports that show how far each department is and we have realised that that works.

When you say in a team of directors and each department - this is how far you are and this is how you are performing. That peer review mechanism it does contribute to encouraging the DGs to work harder and smarter in addressing the issues of delays.

However, also we have been to a number of provinces such as KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern Cape, Mpumalanga and in fact we piloted here in the Western Cape in August last year. Therefore, House Chairperson, we are hard at work ensuring that both the professionalisation framework as it includes the discipline management strategy we implement those and work with our provinces together with the National School of Government to

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 114

ensure that we professionalise our workforce. Thank you, House Chairperson.

Mr N M HADEBE: Hon House Chairperson and hon Minister, this is a matter that the IFP has been raising Budget Votes debates. We are pleased that the governing party is starting to ask similar questions.

Hon Minister, I would like to know whether the department has a plan in pursuing the lost monies from the KwaZulu-Natal Department of Social Development regarding the R4,9 million tender for COVID-19 blankets and their subsequent bonuses that were paid to officials whilst on suspension? Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon member, even though I doubt that this question is originally linked to the original question, but I will leave it to the hon Minister to respond to it, hon Bhungane. The hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon House Chairperson and hon Hadebe, unfortunately this is a specific question, with specific information. I would not know everything happening in every department. Unfortunately.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 115

However, now that you raised it, all I can do is to try and ensure our team follow the case and monitor it. Thank you.

Mr T J BRAUTESETH: Hon House Chairperson, it is no disrespect to the hon Moshodi, but perhaps somebody in the House should take it up. Her question is remarkably similar to the previous question. It is about suspensions and disciplinary processes. I think it is just a waste of questioning in the House and maybe I do not know who prioritised the question. They should look out for another question.

[Interjections.]

Ms M L MOSHODI: Ask your question and forget to talk about me. Ask your own question.

Mr T J BRAUTESETH: I want to make it clear that it is no disrespect. I am making a point of order.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Brauteseth, you have two minutes. As your question.

Mr T J BRAUTESETH: It is no disrespect to the hon Moshodi.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 116

It is not her fault. It is the staff's fault.

Alright. Here we go.

Hon Minister, will you talk to other Ministers. You say that you are only responsible for your department. Surely you talk to them and ask them to make their senior managers for getting the disciplinary cases through their systems and then finally the question to you Minister is and you spoke about doing the review of the systems and closing the loopholes. I applaud you for that.

The question is: How long is that going to take? Or is it going to be like another 883 days, like it is officially hanging around like a bird stick? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon House Chairperson, the responses that one is giving here are steps reported in our annual performance plan, APP. Therefore, the hon members have all the opportunity and the ammunition that you said this in your APP and please give us a report.

However, I can safely say those areas of the professionalisation work one being the register of DC and one being the lifestyle audits - those are part of my current

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 117

performance agreement with the President. Therefore, in September, I must report the milestones of how far we have implemented.

As far as talking to other Ministers, to do that - I think I have responded to that question earlier on, hon House Chairperson. Thank you.

Mr M S MOLETSANE: Hon House Chairperson and hon Minister, in light of the lack of capacity which is inherited in your department, what measures has the Minister put in place to ensure that officials responsible for dealing disciplinary hearings are actually well capacitated to deal with the matters of discipline? Thank you, House Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon House Chairperson, I was wondering if I heard the hon Moletsane saying the inherent lack of skills in my department. For if he says in my department I would disagree with him especially in the space of human resource, HR, management. Remember I stood here and said it is the unit in my department that is assisting other departments.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 118

Now if they do not have capacity who then is doing that assistance and interventions? So, I would not agree with him, if I heard him correctly.

However, as I have already indicated earlier that in the Department of Public Service and Administration, we do have a unit dedicated to assisting departments across. They have a hands on approach and they go to departments. Yes, it comes at a cost because they have to be here, there and everywhere, but it is a necessary step.

Their interventions have yielded results. The number of backlogs in managing discipline and general HR issues where there were noncompliance and those kinds of challenges have unblocked and participated in training HR practitioners across departments and many provinces. So, yes that team is hard at work ensuring that as we try to steer the ship towards the right direction they are there to give that support and guidance. Thank you, House Chairperson.

Question 133:

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Thank you, House Chair. The question from the hon Mathevula talks to lifestyle audits which I have already indicated that this is

part of my performance agreement with the President. As we speak, I must report at the end of September with respect to the progress thereof. Therefore, as the Department of Public Service and Administration we are duty bound to ensure that our own house is in order. But remember, my work is to co-ordinate and ensure that departments are responding in a manner that is compliant to the guidance that we have provided them, the guides to implement lifestyle audits which was done in 2021.

Let me indicate upfront that as the department we are not responsible for public representatives. Public representatives have their own codes of conduct. As you may be aware that this Parliament and other houses or legislatures where public representatives are participating in, have the responsibility to have their own ethical codes as bodies.

But insofar as the sector wide lifestyle audit programmes the department has been, in terms of regulation 22 of the Public Service Regulations, it is duty bound to ensure that we conduct lifestyle audits given the challenges that have been observed by members of the various houses in the country as well as the various investigating bodies. Some provinces, I must indicate that last week or so we were with the Northern

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 120

Cape government in the National Assembly answering this very question because there were concerns around the outsourcing of the work by the government of the Northern Cape to the Special Investigating Unit, SIU. For us outsourcing, whether a department outsources this function or it does it in-house if it has the capacity. But what we would want to see is the results that the lifestyle audits have been conducted in line with the plan of each of the department. Ours is to ensure that departments have their own plans to conduct lifestyle audits and they have budgeted for the and they have the necessary resources to conduct the work.

But also, being co-ordinators of this work we have realised that, yes, it has started very slow. In the 2021-22 financial year we had about 24 national departments that have started working on conducting lifestyle audits. But in the 2022-23 financial year, the numbers of the departments have increased to 37. With provinces we started at 71 in 2021-22 and in 2022-23 they have increased to 89. The pressure that is there and the support that is done by the department is yielding the desired results because almost all departments now are charged with ensuring that we conduct lifestyle audits. Thank you, House Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 121

Xitsonga:

Man B T MATHEVULA: Ndza khensa, Mutshamaxitulu.

English:

Minister, why is there outsourcing of the lifestyle audits by some departments even though there is a budget in place to do this internally? Thank you very much, Chair.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Thank you very much, hon Mathevula. We are duty bound to manage public finances in a manner that is efficient, effective and that indicate some diligent and application of mind in decision-making. Where in a department you run the risk of your unit that deal with integrity being contaminated by the environment you would consider outsourcing so that you are sure that that work is credible at the end. Outsourcing in itself will be informed by how much you have budgeted for it. Therefore, there is nothing wrong having a budget in your department and outsource because you weigh the risks as you make your decision. An important issue which we must not lose sight of is that this work, the lifestyle audit, must not become a football in the department. It must provide credible results that can stand the test of time. Therefore, if your unit, your department you are not that strong and if your department is

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 122

huge, you may consider outsourcing. Or if your department is small, you may consider outsourcing because you will be having fewer number of people to deal with. But those departments that are big may also consider the fact that it is a big department the risk of contaminating and influencing each other is less, therefore you can take that decision to insource. This depends on the prudent management of funds. Thank you, House Chair.

Ms H S BOSHOFF: Thank you very much, House Chair and good afternoon, Minister. Minister, your predecessor advised in December 2022 that 27 national departments and 47 provincial departments had conducted lifestyle audits and that no red flags had been raised. At the same time it was publicised that at least 119 public officials were possibly conducting business with the state in contravention of the prevailing legislation. Minister, which connected cover up cadre is conducting your lifestyle audits if your department is missing this glaring discrepancy? Thank you, House Chair.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Thank you, House Chair. I didn't get quite clear the part of the question that dals with the discrepancy.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 123

Ms H S BOSHOFF: Minister, what I would like to know from you is, which one of your cadres deployed in your department who is conducting your lifestyle audits is missing this glaring discrepancy because it has been published that you keep on saying that there is nothing, nobody is found liable or whatever on the audit reports. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Thanks, House Chair. Let me start by the deployed cadre.

Unfortunately, I am the deployed cadre. I am the deployed cadre. I don't know any other deployed cadre except the Deputy Minister and I who are the deployed cadres in the department. When you talk about officials, officials are appointed in a manner I had explained earlier. They apply based on an advert that is out there. They compete in the panel, they are interviewed by a body and they are chosen on the basis of their qualifications and their performance in such an interview if they meet the criteria. Now I am not aware of any other deployed cadre in the department.

Therefore, I don't even understand what is glaring because the numbers you are referring to, I have referred to them.

Discrepancies, I don't know the discrepancies because I have not said that there haven't been people who have been found

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 124

wanting. I haven't said that here. Therefore, it is incorrect to say that I have said there are no people who have been found to be trading with the state. But there are processes for those who would be found trading with the state. We wouldn't just be going into finding who without saying what then must happen. Therefore, the responsible executives in those departments, the accounting officers, must deal with it. It can't be true because we conduct the processes in order for us to deal with the wrong doings where it is found. Thank you, House Chair.

Mr M A P De BRUYN: Hon Minister, would you agree that fraud and corruption could have been prevented or at least curbed if lifestyle audits were done earlier? Why are lifestyle audits only be done now and why didn't it started 10 years ago? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: I would like to thank the ANC for giving us democracy because we still don't know what was happening before 1994 in all departments of the state insofar as corruption is concerned. At least as the ANC-led government when we picked up that there is a wrongdoing, we acted on it. Why it was not done 10 years ago, we probably had not been able to find it then. Why it is only

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 125

done ow, it is because we have realised it is there and it must be dealt with and it must be confronted. We do not run away from problems. We confront them and deal with them. That is what we are doing even here. Thank you.

Question 141:

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Thank you hon House Chair and thank you to the hon Brauteseth. The question about what action the department has taken to initiate training on how public servants should deal with ethical challenges and dilemmas, let me start by prefacing that with the public service regulations of 2016 which provide for a code of conduct that outlines behaviour expected of public servants and all employees in the public service to fulfil their constitutional obligations, to be professional and ethical in line with the constitutional prescript section 195 of the Constitution which talks to the basic values and principles of public administration.

The Constitution envisions a public service with high standards of professional ethics and specifies that a high standard of professional ethics must be promoted and maintained. It envisions that abiding by these [principles will lead to human dignity, equality and freedom for the

people of South Africa. The NDP likewise, as well as the Medium-Term Strategic Framework 2014 to 2019, together with the state of the nation address of 2019, articulates the basic values and principles governing the public administration.

Therefore, there is an obligation on the department to actively manage ethics. This obligation received a boost in 2013, with the adoption of the integrity management framework. Each department is now required to establish an ethics committee to provide oversight of ethics management in each department and must have a designated ethics officers. Amongst the responsibilities, they are to promote the integrity and ethical behaviour in the department and advice employees on ethical matters. Grounding that background, the department is currently engaged working together with the Public Service Commission, have embarked on the development of an online ethics course to ensure that we move forward on becoming a truly values driven sector. And it is quite interesting to know the number of people who are registering in that course online.

We have to date more than 63 000 public service employees who enrolled and completed the online course. And as we speak, this financial year we have 1 406 who are currently

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 127

registered, because it is our belief that this must be easily accessible to public servants. And therefore the kind of modules that are there, it is quite easy to enrol and the modules have been designed with the expert assistance of the Code of Ethics for Internal Auditors in partnership with Treasury and the Institute of Internal Auditors SA. Professor Kato Plant was consulted to advice on the content of the course and therefore the National School of Government, NSG, has to date trained a group of about 4 149 people but because this is a compulsory course with respect to induction programme for officials, levels 1 to 16, which is all public servants.

To date, 85 509 officials have been trained. As to whether I participated in such training, I must indicate that ethics is not something you meet at the workplace, you start at home. And at home I was taught to be ethical. As a member of the Mothers' Union in my church I was taught, but as the offices that I have occupied being a speaker, a premier, a Deputy Minister, in all those steps in my growth, I have undergone each time, training on ethics. Thank you, House Chair.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 128

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you, hon Minister. The first follow-up question is from the hon Brauteseth.

Mr T J BRAUTESETH: It's the hon Brauteseth, yes. Thank you House Chairperson. Minister, you know earlier on in one of my other question, you said that the figure of 607 people on precautionary suspension was an insignificant number because the state employs a million people. We may have to put it to you that 81 000 is also an insignificant number out of a million people. So, only 81 000 have completed the ethics training - that's very concerning.

Minister, let me get to my question. You said that you haven't actually done form of ethics training, and that's quite clear. Minister, soon after your appointment, it was revealed that you are under investigation by the Special Investigating Unit, SIU, for degree fraud. The University of Fort Hare has stated in a sworn affidavit that you admitted to an honours and a master's degree despite not having requisite NQF level 7 qualification or importantly, an acceptable recognition of prior learning or RPL. This points directly to a collusion of the officials in the university to push your application through an irregular manner. In the circumstances, how can you

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 129

possibly hold yourself out as the standard bearer of professional ethics and why don't you just avoid the inevitable embarrassment and resign now. Thank you, Minister.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Brauteseth, I will leave it to the Minister. Your question is totally different to this original question, but I'll leave it to the Minister. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: You are correct, House Chair, that the question is different. But let me answer the question. Firstly, I will not resign. Let's start there. I am not embarrassed because I have done nothing wrong. I know ... [Inaudible.] ... me, those who have worked with me know it and generally, the public where I come from, know it. I went to school in broad daylight and I didn't go there at night. So, I have no qualms. But hon Brauteseth, I am not sure House Chair, because one would have thought that international protocols of Parliament conventions, do put a responsibility on all Members of Parliament not to be personal when asking questions in the House. I find it quite interesting that as members of the DA unfortunately again, manier times, in fact in all three instances that this question has been raised, unfortunately it has been raised by

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 130

white men, which makes me think ... Yes, unfortunately, it has been raised by white men and in three instances.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon members, you raised your question, so you must be ready to listen to the response.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Take your medicine, bhuti [brother]. [Interjections.] You raised the question and I am giving you a reply. This platform is a House of parliament which discusses matters that affect the people of South Africa. I have wronged nobody in South Africa. I haven't wronged anybody. So, coming to try and embarrass me, you are really doing nothing in so far as I am concerned.

As a public representative, we have institutions of government that are charged with the responsibility to investigate. I haven't interfered with any of those investigating bodies because they must come up with the truth. And you are raising this question time and again here. You put at risk the work of that body called the SIU because you don't know how I am going to respond here, and when I respond on the platform what impact that is going to have on that case. So, please leave the SIU to do their work where they are supposed to because they know best.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 131

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Brauteseth, you can't be doing that. Hon Brauteseth, no, no, no, you can't be doing that. You asked a question, the hon Minister responded to your question. The second follow-up question is from the hon Hadebe. Hon Hadebe?

Mr N M HADEBE: Thank you, hon House Chairperson. Hon Minister, it is well to have ethics training on public sector challenges and dilemma, however, if there is no enthusiasm by employees it will not reach the intended effect. I would like to know what incentives have been put in place to ensure that courses on ethics are a standardised feature when considering employment, bonuses and promotions. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Thank you, hon House Chair and thank you hon Hadebe. Let me indicate that indeed, it is important to ensure that we galvanise support from all public servants for this work because it's not just work, it is to ensure that "Mr and Mrs Public" out there receive what is rightfully due to them. And therefore, ensuring that there is access to this training because in training you need ... [Inaudible.] ... employees are mobilised and how the training is designed, it is designed to encourage and promote good conduct and it is also encouraged ...

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 132

We are currently discussing even the policy on whistle-blowing - protecting whistle-blowers because currently, there is no incentive to promote whistle-blowing. And we do need to protect those whistle-blowers. We are engaging with the police, with the Department of Justice, with all law enforcement bodies to see how we can structure our whistle-blowing protection policy such that employees are motivated.

But also, we are making it compulsory for some of the courses, especially those that deal with ethics in the Nyukela Programme which every public servant who joins the public service must have registered with. There is emphasis on this because we would want to attract into the public service people who are ready to defend the nation through ethical conduct. Thank you, House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you, hon Minister. The third follow-up question is from the hon Luthuli on the virtual platform.

IsiZulu:

Nk S A LUTHULI: Ngibonge, Sihlalo woSihlalo, Ngqongqoshe womnyango, ngicela ukwazi ukuthi wena nomnyango wakho yikuphi

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES
TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 133

enikwenzayo ukuseka nokuqinisekisa ukuthi iminyango iyakwazi ukwenza lento eniyishoyo ...

English:

... especially to strengthen the ethical competence of public servants ...

IsiZulu:

... ngoba siyazi iminyango ingakwenza okwayo kodwa wena njengomnyango wakho ikhona kuphi okuqinisekiso okwenza ukuthi iminyango iyakulandela konke. Ngiyabonga.

English:

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Thank you, House Chair. In the Department of Public Service and Administration, we lead by example. We have our systems in order. In fact, we go the extra mile to ensure that those other departments also have systems in place to ensure that ethical conduct is guaranteed in the workplace, in as much as it is difficult to guarantee it. We do that by ensuring that training is but part of it but we are working also with the NSG to ensure that the training that they offer throughout the public service does entail the question ethical conduct - the importance thereof, hence earlier I indicated that they have

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES
TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 134

designed and developed a module on ethics, which is a module that is compulsory for all public servants.

Therefore, as a department, yes, our own systems are in place as well as ensuring that we assist the whole of the public service to have their own systems in place. In fact, we are now extending to local government because we believe that people look at us as one government and therefore we are working with the SA Local Government Association, Salga, and the Department of Co-operative Governance on matters of ethics because they cut across. Thank you, hon House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you, hon Minister. The fourth follow-up question is from the hon Mamaregane.

Sepedi:

Moh M L MAMAREGANE: E re ke o leboge, Modulasetulo.

[Tsenoganong.]

English:

Thank you, hon Minister for the response. Let me just say that in the same breath we need to commend your department and the National School of Government for the work done to instil

ethics in the public service. Hon Minister, I had a question, but you have answered it partly.

IsiXhosa:

Ndivumele ndibulele Mphathiswa ngokuphendula umbuzo wam kakuhle. Ndiyabulela.

Question 127:

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: House Chair, in terms of lessons learnt from the recent wage dispute between government and organised labour, which resulted in the strike that engulfed the health sector. I must firstly indicate that, that strike which engulfed the health sector was so unfortunate because essential services could not be provided to citizens who were rightfully at our Public Service points to receive that care. The lessons learnt therefore are that, as government, the law provides that we need to have measures that govern the provision of essential services. One of those is the area of minimum service-level agreements and inadequate security within the facilities, which have made it difficult or have rendered the health sector vulnerable. In this respect, we need to ... I apologised to the people of South Africa when I addressed our budget.

However, in terms of our response thereof, we have already ...

Let me start here. The current agreement allows for two years and we are using this space to ensure that we negotiate and agree on this minimum service-level agreement, because we can't risk going into any other wage negotiations without that service level-agreement for minimum standards, especially in both the health and security sectors.

Therefore, we have already tabled the draft minimum service-level framework agreement at the Public Service Co-ordinating Bargaining Council, PSCBC, for engagement with organised labour with a view to conclude this agreement before the next round of negotiations, which we would want to see being finalised before the tabling of any budgets in future because it does affect how we work.

We also need a strike management agreement with the policing sector because the police also didn't help in this situation because they become part of organised labour in the negotiations. Therefore, as we speak there are engagements with organised labour to ensure that we handle issues in an open way and we wouldn't want to see a situation where those are left in limbo. We must be able to negotiate and agree,

with each party negotiating in good faith and implementing what has been agreed on in good faith.

Yes, whilst negotiating on salaries, we need to ensure that we protect the benefits of public servants but also protect the services that ordinary citizens must receive from government. So, that minimum service-level agreement will go a long way in ensuring that we minimise this effect, but also ... regular social dialogues are held. Thank you, House Chair.

Mr M I RAYI: The Minister has responded to two aspects of the question that I wanted to follow up on. First is the issue of the framework agreement, and also the issue of negotiations before the tabling of the budget, which would normally also have the allocation of the wage bill, which makes it difficult for the unions to negotiate because in the budget there is already a wage bill that is allocated as one of the items.

So, my question is, what has been the response by labour, both on the framework agreement as well as on the issue of negotiations before the tabling of the budget. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 138

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon Rayi, let me indicate upfront that this does not only affect labour and therefore we are not only engaging with labour. We have also had a government retreat where we met with the directors-general, provincial directors-general, the bargaining councils, as well as the SA Police Service, the SAPS, and the health and education sector leadership, so that everybody understands the importance of managing a strike to start with, because managers themselves must be able to manage the strike. Also, on the question of tabling the budget, it becomes important that wage negotiations are initiated and held early enough so as to ensure that by the time the Treasury ... the Department of Finance finalises the budget it encapsulates that which would have been an agreement. Therefore, there are these fora. When you are negotiating, it is difficult to say this one is saying this because that in itself creates problems, but I can safely say to you that the proposals are there and they are engaged. So far, the negotiations are carrying on well. Thank you, House Chair.

Mr M A P DE BRUYN: Hon Minister, knowing that the wage negotiations take place on a yearly basis and that the same modus operandi is used year after year, and also the fact that government does not budget for wage increases, have you

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 139

considered another type of reasonable negotiations that do not affect the employers and the public in such a negative way, because the fact is that the only ones that benefit from wage strikes are the unions, since the employees that strike and that work on a no work no pay basis never or very seldom recoup the salaries that they have lost as a result of these strikes. So, maybe if we can negotiate in a manner where everyone is a winner and not just the unions, that will be appreciated and that would be nice.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Hon members, let me indicate that the agreement that we have now is for 2023-24 as well as for 2024-25. It's a multiyear agreement. Therefore, it's not a yearly or an annual thing to negotiate. You can negotiate and agree now for a longer term on what will happen in the outer years. This is what we have done, so there won't be negotiations. In the following year, the negotiations will be for 2025-26. No, next year is 2024, so yes, it will be for 2025-26. That's but one way of ensuring that everybody pays attention to what needs to be done and not think about negotiations all the time.

In terms of recouping, the principle of no work no pay is forever there. It has been applied even in this case. The

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 140

agreement states quite clearly and categorically that where there was no work there won't be any pay and that has been settled. So, government does recoup what it would have lost. Thank you, House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thank you, hon Minister. Is there any member standing in for hon Dlamini who is not on the virtual platform? Okay, hon Moletsane is standing in for hon Dlamini.

Mr M S MOLETSANE: Minister, in order to prevent the inconvenience of services in the public sector, there needs to be ongoing engagements. Who does the PSCBC account to? How is there performance measured and how is it a guarantee to workers that there's is not to sanitise their legitimate concerns but indeed to ensure that the labour output meets the correct remuneration that is in line and fair with the correct economic conditions? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: Indeed, the multiyear agreement is to try and minimise any inconveniences for both ... We tend to treat workers on strike as if it's something they enjoy. Not all employees on strike enjoy being on strike because they know that the resultant issue is that

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 141

they are going to lose their pay. So, in as much as the public, in the case of the public sector, loses in terms of services, which is something that is not desirable, the employees also lose in terms of their own income. Therefore, we need to collectively ... This is why I'm saying there are engagements. We need to collectively ... from the employer's perspective as well as from the employee's perspective ... there has to be a meeting of minds to say, how do we eliminate and avoid the inconveniences at all cost?

Therefore, yes, there are ongoing engagements. There would be worker representatives that sit and participate in the PSCBC and other bargaining fora that are available in the Public Service, as well as employer representatives who are senior managers and who are not bound by the agreement that comes out, who must then represent the employer and who gets or receives a mandate from a cluster of Ministers as a mandating structure that meets to agree, and that gives the mandate to the employer's representatives.

So, the system is quite well designed. As to what happens inside is what we must deal with, which is to ensure that we inculcate this sense of understanding and responsibility that, when you deal with an employer in a public sector space, you

know what is in the kitty in government, unlike when you deal with an employer in the private space where you do not know what is in the kitty. Therefore, this cannot be treated in the same way. The majority of people who depend on public services are the have-nots. Therefore, we kind of have to inculcate that consciousness in the minds of those who lead in that space, both from the PSCBC, the facilitators who are managers in themselves, but also from the perspective of the role-players in the bargaining chamber that constitute the employer as well as the employee representatives to ensure that whatever is paid is fair to both the employers and the employees, especially in the public sector. Thank you once more, House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Thanks, hon Minister. The fourth and last question of the day is from hon Bara.

Mr W A S AUCAMP: If you allow me, House Chair, I will ask the question on his behalf.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): I will allow you on one condition. In future, make sure that you deal with the Chief Whip of the NCOP for this stand-in arrangement. However, I'll allow you.

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 143

Mr W A S AUCAMP: Thank you very much. It has been ...

[Inaudible.] Hon Minister, the health strike in March 2023 did not create an inconvenience. It created death. The Minister of Health, Dr Joe Phaahla, confirmed at the time that preliminary figures show that four people are believed to have lost their lives, he said: "in a manner that could be directly attributed to the strike". In a manner that could be directly attributed to the strike.

Minister, do you agree that culpable homicide charges should be laid against the senior officials at the *National Education, Health and Allied Workers' Union, Nehawu*, or do you prioritise the patronage of the unions over the lives of South Africans? Thank you, House Chair.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: I cannot answer for the Department of Health. The hon member quoted the Minister of Health in so far as what had transpired and what he said, and I would really say that for me that is not a matter for the negotiations. It's a matter for enforcing discipline in the Department of Health. Therefore, that question would really be relevant to the Minister of Health.

[Interjections.]

UNREVISED HANSARD

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES

TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 144

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order members! Let's allow the Minister to ...

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION: House Chair, I indicated that for me ... because the member said that he disagrees with me about the inconvenience. Truly, it is his right to differ with me. I can't stand here and respond to that. However, I'm saying that what he quoted is in the purview of the Department of Health and the Minister whom he quoted. That Minister can be called to this House and can best answer to that question. Thank you, House Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Hon Minister, let me allow you to take your seat. Thank you, hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: Malibongwe!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr A J Nyambi): Order! Hon delegates, I would like to thank the Minister, hon Kiviet, for availing herself to answer questions in the National Council of Provinces in this very important sitting today. Thank you, hon Minister. Hon delegates, that concludes the business of the day. The House is adjourned. Thank you very much.

UNREVISED HANSARD
NATIONAL COUNCIL OF PROVINCES
TUESDAY, 13 JUNE 2023

Page: 145

The Council adjourned at 18:31.

UNREVISED HANSARD